### IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEVADA

2

1

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17 18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28 || /

PUBLIC EMPLOYEES RETIREMENT SYSTEM, a public agency, a public entity and component of the State of Nevada,

Appellant,

VS.

SHAE E. GITTER, an individual, and JARED SHAFER, as Special Administrator of the Estate of Kristine Jo Freshman,

Respondents.

Electronically Filed Mar 03 2016 10:47 a.m. Tracie K. Lindeman Clerk of Supreme Court

No. 69208

Appeal from the Eighth Judicial District Court, Clark County, Case No. A697642

# ERRATUM TO THE STIPULATION FOR TIME TO EXTEND TIME TO FILE OPENING BRIEF AND APPENDIX

Appellant, PUBLIC EMPLOYEES RETIREMENT SYSTEM, by and through their counsel of record, hereby provide its Erratum to the Stipulation for Time to Extend Time to File Opening Brief and Appendix. Appellant's counsel inadvertently failed to attach Exhibits A and B, which are attached hereto. Exhibit A is the Notice of Entry of Order on the Respondent's Motion for Attorney's

///

1	Fees, and Exhibit B is the Notice of Entry of	of Order on Appellant's Motion to
2	Retax Costs.	
3	DATED this 3 <sup>rd</sup> day of March, 2016.	
4	DATED this 5 day of Watch, 2010.	
5		WOODBURN AND WEDGE
6	By:	/s/ W. Chris Wicker
7		W. Chris Wicker, Esq.
8		Nevada Bar No. 1037
9		Chris Nielsen, Esq.
10		Nevada Bar No. 8206 PUBLIC EMPLOYEES
12		RETIREMENT SYSTEM
13		Attorneys for Appellant
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		

#### 1 **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE** 2 I hereby certify that I am an employee of Woodburn and Wedge and that 3 on this date, I caused to be sent via electronic mail a true and correct copy of the 4 ERRATUM TO THE STIPULATION FOR TIME TO EXTEND TIME TO FILE 5 OPENING BRIEF AND APPENDIX to: 6 Dennis L. Kennedy 7 Kelly B. Stout **Bailey Kennedy** 8 8984 Spanish Ridge Avenue 9 Las Vegas, NV 89148 10 Chris Nielsen Public Employees Retirement System 11 693 W. Nye Lane 12 Carson City, Nevada 89703 13 DATED this 3<sup>rd</sup> day of March, 2016. 14 15 16 /s/ Kelly N. Weaver By: 17 Kelly N. Weaver 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27

# EXHIBITS TO THE ERRATUM TO THE STIPULATION FOR TIME TO EXTEND TIME TO FILE OPENING BRIEF AND APPENDIX

Exhibit A: Notice of Entry of Order (Motion for Attorney's Fees)

Exhibit B: Notice of Entry of Order (Motion to Retax Costs)

#### EXHIBIT A

		02/10/2016 08:05:38 AM
1	NEOT	
1	NEOJ Dennis L. Kennedy	Alun D. Column
2	Nevada Bar No. 1462	CLERK OF THE COURT
2	KELLY B. STOUT	CLERK OF THE COURT
3	Nevada Bar No. 12105 Mark Hesiak	
4	Nevada Bar No. 12397	
5	AMANDA L. STEVENS	
3	Nevada Bar No. 13966 BAILEY&KENNEDY	
6	8984 Spanish Ridge Avenue	
7	Las Vegas, Nevada 89148-1302 Telephone: 702.562.8820	
,	Facsimile: 702.562.8821	
8	DKennedy@BaileyKennedy.com	
9	KStout@BaileyKennedy.com MHesiak@BaileyKennedy.com	
	AStevens@BaileyKennedy.com	
10	Attorneys for Dlaintiffs	
11	Attorneys for Plaintiffs SHAE E. GITTER and JARED SHAFER, as	
10	Special Administrator of the Estate of Kristine Jo	
12	Freshman	
13	DISTRICT	COURT
14	CLARK COUN	TY, NEVADA
15		
16	SHAE E. GITTER, an individual, and JARED	C N A 14 (07(42 C
17	SHAFER, as Special Administrator of the Estate of Kristine Jo Freshman,	Case No. A-14-697642-C Dept. No. XXIV
	, and the second	
18	Plaintiffs,	
19	vs.	
20	PUBLIC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT	
21	SYSTEM OF NEVADA, a public entity and	
21	component unit of the State of Nevada,	
22	Defendant.	
23		
24	NOTICE OF ENTRY OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION F	
25	PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that an Order Gra	anting Plaintiffs' Motion for Attorneys' Fees was
26	entered on the 9th day of February, 2016, in the abo	ove-captioned matter.
27	111	
28	///	
	D <sub>2</sub> ~ 2	l of <b>3</b>
	Page 1	

	1	A true and correct copy of the Order is attach	hed.
	2	DATED this 10th day of February, 2016.	BAILEY <b>*</b> KENNEDY
	3		DAILE I WKENNED I
	4		Day /-/ W-11 D. Charat
	5		By: /s/ Kelly B. Stout  DENNIS L. KENNEDY
	6		KELLY B. STOUT MARK HESIAK
	7		AMANDA L. STEVENS
	8		Attorneys for Plaintiffs SHAE E. GITTER and JARED SHAFER, as Special Administrator of the Estate of Kristine Jo Freshman
	9		as Special Administrator of the Estate of Kristine Jo Freshman
	10		
	11		
702.562.8820	12		
	13		
	14		
	15		
	16		
	17		
	18		
	19		
	20		
	21		
	22		
	23		
	24		
	25		
	26		
	27		
	28		

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE** I certify that I am an employee of BAILEY & KENNEDY and that on the 10th day of 2 February, 2016, service of the foregoing NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER GRANTING 3 PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES was made by mandatory electronic service 4 through the Eighth Judicial District Court's electronic filing system and/or by depositing a true and 5 correct copy in the U.S. Mail, first class postage prepaid, and addressed to the following at their last 6 7 known address: W. CHRIS WICKER Email: 8 cwicker@woodburnandwedge.com WOODBURN AND WEDGE 6100 Neil Road, Suite 500 9 Reno, Nevada 89511 Attorney for Defendant PUBLIC EMPLOYEES' 10 RETIREMENT SYSTEM OF 11 NEVADA 12 Email: cnielsen@nvpers.org CHRIS NIELSEN **PUBLIC EMPLOYEES'** 13 RETIREMENT SYSTEM OF Attorney for Defendant PUBLIC EMPLOYEES' **NEVADA** 6693 West Nye Lane 14 RETIREMENT SYSTEM OF Carson City, Nevada 89703 **NEVADA** 15 16 /s/ Jennifer Kennedy 17 Employee of BAILEY KENNEDY 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27

then to before 1 **ORDG** DENNIS L. KENNEDY **CLERK OF THE COURT** Nevada Bar No. 1462 KELLY B. STOUT Nevada Bar No. 12105 MARK HESIAK Nevada Bar No. 12397 AMANDA L. STEVENS 5 Nevada Bar No. 13966 **BAILEY \* KENNEDY** 8984 Spanish Ridge Avenue Las Vegas, Nevada 89148-1302 7 Telephone: 702.562.8820 Facsimile: 702.562.8821 DKennedy@BaileyKennedy.com KStout@BaileyKennedy.com MHesiak@BaileyKennedy.com 9 AStevens@BaileyKennedy.com 10 Attorneys for Plaintiffs SHAE É. GITTER and JARED SHAFER, as 11 Special Administrator of the Estate of Kristine Jo BAILEY \* KENNEDY 12 Freshman 13 **DISTRICT COURT** 14 CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA 15 16 SHAE E. GITTER, an individual, and JARED SHAFER, as Special Administrator of the Estate Case No. A-14-697642-C 17 of Kristine Jo Freshman, Dept. No. XXIV 18 Plaintiffs, VS. PUBLIC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM OF NEVADA, a public entity and component unit of the State of Nevada, Defendant. ORDER GRANTING PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES 24 25 Date of Hearing: January 19, 2016 Time of Hearing: 9:00 a.m. 26 27 28 Page 1 of 5

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

On January 19, 2016, at the hour of 9:00 a.m., Plaintiffs' Motion for Attorneys' Fees came before the Court. Plaintiffs, Shae E. Gitter and Jared Shafer, were represented by Dennis L. Kennedy and Kelly B. Stout of the law firm Bailey ❖ Kennedy. Defendant, Public Employees' Retirement System of Nevada ("PERS"), was represented by Chris Nielsen of the Public Employees' Retirement System of Nevada and W. Chris Wicker of the law firm Woodburn and Wedge. I. FINDINGS OF FACT. 1. Kristine Jo Freshman ("Kristine") was an employee of the Clark County School District

- and a member of PERS.
- 2. Ms. Freshman was murdered by her husband, Walter Freshman ("Walter"), on December 6, 2009.
  - On December 17, 2009, PERS notified Shae "that there may be benefits available."
- 4. By December 10, 2010, the criminal proceedings against Walter were fully resolved, and Walter was adjudicated a "killer" for purposes of NRS Chapter 41B (Nevada's "Slayer Statute") and was deemed to have predeceased Kristine.
- 5. Believing that she was eligible for survivor benefits, Shae submitted a completed "Application for Survivor Benefits" on or about April 25, 2011.
- 6. On June 10, 2011, PERS denied Shae's application for survivor benefits contending that Chapter 286 disqualifies Walter as a beneficiary but does not expressly authorize payment to any other individual, whether or not designated as a secondary beneficiary.
  - 7. In addition to denying benefits, PERS:
    - Refused to confirm whether Shae had been designated as a secondary beneficiary, and
    - b. Refused to provide any documents or information related to Kristine's account.
- 8. In particular, Plaintiffs requested a copy of Kristine's "Survivor Beneficiary Designation" so that they could determine if Shae had been designated as Kristine's secondary beneficiary.
  - 9. PERS admits that a survivor beneficiary is permitted access to a member's records.

///

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

25

26

27

28

- 10. Based on its own determination that Shae was not a beneficiary, PERS refused to provide Plaintiffs (who are Kristine's sole heir and the Special Administrator of her estate) with any documentation regarding Kristine's PERS account.
- 11. Due to PERS' denial of benefits and refusal to produce any documents, Shae sought counsel.1
- 12. Following months of unsuccessful discussions and efforts at negotiation, Shae determined that nothing short of litigation would be sufficient to resolve the dispute.
- 13. First, Shae petitioned the probate court to obtain an order permitting access to the relevant documents.
- 14. The probate court issued an order requiring PERS to produce documentation regarding Kristine's PERS account on December 26, 2013.
- 15. PERS finally produced the documents pertaining to Kristine's account on January 30, 2014—almost three years after they were first requested.
- 16. Upon reviewing Kristine's "Survivor Beneficiary Designation," which identified Kristine's only child, Plaintiff Shae E. Gitter, as her survivor beneficiary, Plaintiffs filed this case on March 13, 2014.
- 17. Since Kristine's death, PERS has done everything possible to prevent Shae from collecting survivor benefits.
- 18. Once ordered by this Court to pay Shae survivor benefits—and having wrongfully withheld them for almost five years—PERS maintained that it was not required to pay any interest on the \$203,231.76 in past due survivor benefits.
  - 19. Throughout this case, the conduct of PERS and its counsel has been unconscionable.
- 20. All of the foregoing conduct has been committed by PERS with the active assistance of its prior counsel (the Office of the Nevada Attorney General<sup>2</sup>) and/or current counsel (Woodburn &

Originally retained in April 2012 (as evidenced by Bailey Kennedy's billing statements), Bailey & Kennedy agreed to represent the Plaintiffs on a contingency fee basis in October 2012.

PERS was represented by the Office of the Nevada Attorney General until it filed a Substitution of Counsel on August 25, 2015.

Wedge<sup>3</sup>).

1

2 II. **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW.** Plaintiffs' Motion for Attorneys' Fees was timely filed on November 9, 2015. 3 21. From the time of Kristine's death, PERS and its counsel have acted unreasonably and 22. 4 vexatiously in their dealings with Plaintiffs, which has significantly prolonged this case. 5 PERS' defense was maintained without reasonable grounds. NRS 18.010(2)(b). 23. 6 PERS' counsel maintained a defense that was not well-grounded in fact or warranted 7 24. by existing law. NRS 7.085(1)(a). 8 Plaintiffs' attorneys' fees related to reopening the probate case were necessarily 9 25. incurred because Plaintiffs could not assess the merits of this case without determining if Shae was 10 designated as Kristine's survivor beneficiary. 11 When contesting Shae's entitlement to survivor benefits, PERS raised numerous 12 26. arguments that were unsupported by any legal authority, violated established canons of statutory 13 interpretation, and/or were completely devoid of merit. 14 In opposing Plaintiffs' Motion for Pre-Judgment and Post-Judgment Interest, PERS 15 27. again raised numerous arguments that were unsupported by any legal authority, violated established 16 canons of statutory interpretation, and/or were completely devoid of merit. 17 PERS and its counsel, at all times, acted in concert and under circumstances 28. 18 justifying a joint and several award of attorneys' fees. NRS 7.085(1)(a); 18.015(b)(2). 19 The hourly rates charged by attorneys Dennis L. Kennedy, Joshua M. Dickey, Kelly 29. 20 B. Stout, Mark Hesiak, Leon Gil, and Amanda Stevens are reasonable given each attorney's number 21 of years in practice and the average rates charged by Las Vegas attorneys. 22 The hourly rates charged by Linda Thomas and Bonnie O'Laughlin are reasonable 23 30. rates for paralegals in the Las Vegas market. 24 The billing descriptions provide sufficient detail to assess the difficulty, intricacy, 25 31. importance, and skill required to perform each task. 26 27

Woodburn and Wedge first appeared on behalf of PERS on May 1, 2015.

The number of hours billed is reasonable in light of the time this case has been 32. 1 pending, the difficulty of the case, and the quality of work performed by Plaintiffs' attorneys. 3 ORDER. III. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED that Plaintiffs are awarded 4 attorneys' fees in the amount of \$96,272.50. 5 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED that PERS and its counsel, 6 Walter C. Wicker and the law firm of Woodburn and Wedge, shall be jointly and severally liable to 7 Plaintiffs for the award of attorney's fees. 8 day of February 2016. 9 **DATED** this 10 11 12 DATED this 1st day of February 2016. DATED this 2nd day of February 2016. 13 Respectfully Submitted By: 14 15 WOODBURN AND WEDGE W. Chris Wicker 16 KELLY B. STOUT PUBLIC EMPLOYEES RETIREMENT 17 MARK HESIAK **SYSTEM** AMANDA L. STEVENS 18 Chris Nielsen Attorneys for Plaintiffs 19 Attorneys for the Public Employees' SHAE E. GITTER and JARED SHAFER, as Special Administrator of the Estate of Kristine Retirement System 20 Jo Freshman 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28

#### EXHIBIT B

Electronically Filed 02/10/2016 04:06:41 PM

then to before **NOTC** W. CHRIS WICKER **CLERK OF THE COURT** 2 Nevada State Bar No. 1037 Woodburn and Wedge 3 6100 Neil Road, Suite 500 Reno, NV 89511 4 Telephone: (775) 688-3000 Facsimile: (775) 688-3088 5 6 Chris Nielsen, Esq. Nevada Bar No. 8206 PUBLIC EMPLOYEES RETIREMENT SYSTEM 693 W. Nye Lane 8 Carson City, NV 89703 9 Telephone: (775) 687-4200 10 Attorneys for the Public Employees' Retirement System of Nevada 11 12 **DISTRICT COURT** 13 **CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA** 14 15 SHAE E. GITTER, an individual, and JARED Case No. A-14-697642-C SHAFER, as Special Administrator of the Estate 16 of Kristine Jo Freshman, Dept. No. XXIV 17 Plaintiffs, 18 VS. 19 NOTICE OF ENTRY OF PUBLIC EMPLOYEES RETIREMENT **ORDER** 20 SYSTEM OF NEVADA, a public entity and Component unit of the State of Nevada, 21 22 Defendant. 23 Plaintiffs, SHAE E. GITTER, an individual, and JARED, SHAFER, as Special TO: 24 Administrator of the Estate of Kristine Jo Freshman, and their counsel of record: 25 PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that on the 10<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2016, the above-entitled 26 Court entered the Order Granting Defendant's Motion to Retax Costs, attached hereto as 27 Exhibit "1." 28

## AFFIRMATION Pursuant to NRS 239B.030 2 The undersigned does hereby affirm that the preceding document does not contain the 3 social security number of any person. 4 DATED this 10<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2016. 5 WOODBURN AND WEDGE 6 7 /s/ W. Chris Wicker By: W. Chris Wicker, Esq. 8 Nevada Bar No. 1037 9 Chris Nielsen, Esq. 10 Nevada Bar No. 8206 PUBLIC EMPLOYEES RETIREMENT 11 **SYSTEM** 12 Attorneys for Public Employees' Retirement System of Nevada 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE** I certify that I am an employee of Woodburn and Wedge, and that on this 10<sup>th</sup> day of 2 February, 2016, I caused to be sent via electronic mail, through the Court's filing system, a true 3 and correct copy of the foregoing NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER, addressed as follows 4 5 Dennis L. Kennedy Kelly B. Stout 6 Bailey Kennedy 7 8984 Spanish Ridge Avenue Las Vegas, NV 89148 8 Chris Nielsen, Esq. 9 PUBLIC EMPLOYEES RETIREMENT SYSTEM 10 693 W. Nye Lane Carson City, NV 89703 11 12 /s/ Kelly N. Weaver By: Kelly N. Weaver 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27

## EXHIBIT TO NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER

Exhibit 1: Order Granting Defendant's Motion to Retax Costs, February 10, 2016.

### EXHIBIT 1

1	ORDR	
2	W. CHRIS WICKER Nevada State Bar No. 1037	
3	Woodburn and Wedge 6100 Neil Road, Suite 500	
4	Reno, NV 89511 Telephone: (775) 688-3000	
5	Facsimile: (775) 688-3088	
6	Chris Nielsen, Esq. Nevada Bar No. 8206	
7	PUBLIC EMPLOYEES RETIREMENT SYSTEM	
8	693 W. Nye Lane Carson City, NV 89703	
9	Telephone: (775) 687-4200	
10	Attorneys for the Public Employees'	
11	Retirement System of Nevada	
12		
13	DISTRICT COURT	
14	CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA	
15		
16	SHAE E. GITTER, an individual, and JARED Case No. A-14-697642-C SHAFER, as Special Administrator of the Estate	
17	of Kristine Jo Freshman Dept. No. XXI 24	
18	Plaintiffs,	
19	VS.	
20	PUBLIC EMPLOYEES RETIREMENT	
21	SYSTEM OF NEVADA, a public entity and	
22	Component unit of the State of Nevada,	
23	Defendant. /	
24	ODDED CDANTING MOTION TO DETAY COSTS	
25	ORDER GRANTING MOTION TO RETAX COSTS (Hearing Date: 01/19/2016 - Hearing Time: 9:00 a.m.)	
26	On January 19, 2016, Defendant, PUBLIC EMPLOYEES RETIREMENT SYSTEM	
27	OF NEVADA's ("PERS"), Motion to Retax Costs came before the Court. PERS was	
28 VEDGE	represented by W. Chris Wicker of Woodburn and Wedge and Chris Nielson General Counsel	

for PERS. Plaintiffs, SHAE E. GITTER, an individual, and JARED SHAFER, as Special Administrator of the Estate of Kristine Jo Freshman ("Gitter"), were represented by Dennis Kennedy and Kelly Stout of Bailey Kennedy.

### **FINDINGS OF FACT**

- Gitter's Memorandum of Costs was filed on October 23, 2015. Pursuant to NRS 1. 18.005(5), Gitter requested costs for expert witness fees in the amount of \$5,000.
- Exhibit 26 of the Memorandum of Costs was presented as the backup for 2. Gitter's request, which included an invoice from financial consultant, JW Advisors, in the amount of \$5,535, with time entries. Also included was the Curriculum Vitae of Kirk Jacobson.
- 3. It was reasonable for Gitter to retain a financial consultant to review amounts calculated by PERS and calculate interest amounts. JW Advisors were qualified for the work they did.
- JW Advisors were not disclosed as expert witnesses, did not present any 4. testimony, did not present any reports or affidavits and were not deposed.

### **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

- The Nevada Supreme Court in Bergmann v. Boyce, 109 Nev. 670, 856 P.2d 560 1. (1993) was not clear whether expert witness fees in excess of \$1,500 can be recovered if the witness did not testify at trial as the Supreme Court did not differentiate between expert and non-expert witness fees.
- Gitter's financial consultant did not testify at trial, present affidavits or reports 2. and was not deposed so the factors described in Frazier v. Drake, 131 Nev. Adv. Op. 64, 357, P.3d 365 (Nev. App. 2015) to evaluate costs in excess of \$1,500 cannot be evaluated.
- Gitter was not required to establish the expertise of any staff at JW Advisors working under Mr. Jacobson.
- Even though Gitter's expert was not disclosed, did not present reports or 4. affidavits and was not deposed, Gitter is entitled to recover \$1,500 in expert fees.
- Pursuant to NRS 18.005(5), Gitter is not entitled to recover more than \$1,500 in 5. expert fees.

27

1	ORDER
2	IT IS HEREBY ORDERED:
3	1. PERS' Motion to Retax is granted in part by limiting expert witness costs to
4	\$1,500.
5	2. Gitter's cost recovery shall be reduced by the amount of \$3,500.
6	
7	AFFIRMATION Pursuant to NRS 239B.030
8	The undersigned does hereby affirm that the preceding document does not contain the
9	social security number of any person.
10	DATED this <u>5</u> day of February, 2016.
11	
12	By: Divise Constraint
13	District Court Judge – Jim Crockett
14	DATED this day of February, 2016. DATED this day of February, 2016.
15	SUBMITTED BY: APPROVED AS TO FORM:
16	By: Willie By: Kelly By Stat
17	W. CHRIS WICKER KELLY B. STOUT
18	Nevada State Bar No. 1037  Woodburn and Wedge  Nevada State Bar No. 12105  Bailey Kennedy
	Woodburn and Wedge Baney Reinfedy
19	Chris Nielsen, Esq. Dennis L. Kennedy Nevada Bar No. 8206 Nevada State Bar No. 1462
20	Nevada Bar No. 8206 Nevada State Bar No. 1462 Public Employees Bailey Kennedy
21	Retirement System
22	of Nevada Mark Hesiak
22	Nevada State Bar No. 12397  Attorneys for Defendant
23	Public Employees Retirement Attorneys for Plaintiffs
24	System of Nevada Shae E. Gitter and Jared Shafer,
25	as Special Administrator of the Estate of Kristine Jo Freshman
26	
27	
<i> /</i>	1