Electronically Filed 12/09/2015 12:16:54 PM

**CLERK OF THE COURT** 

Electronically Filed Dec 18 2015 09:48 a.m. Tracie K. Lindeman Clerk of Supreme Court

**NOAS** 

DARREN T. BRENNER, ESQ.

Nevada Bar No. 8386

2 ALLISON R. SCHMIDT, ESQ.

Nevada Bar No. 10743

AKERMAN LLP

1160 Town Center Drive, Suite 330

Las Vegas, Nevada 89144

Telephone: 5

(702) 634-5000

Facsimile:

(702) 380-8572

Email: darren.brenner@akerman.com

Email: allison.schmidt@akerman.com

7

8

9

6

1

3

4

Attorneys for Bank of America, N.A., as Successor by Merger to BAC Home Loans Servicing, LP fka

Countrywide Home Loans, Inc., incorrectly sued as Countrywide Home Loans, Inc. and Nationstar

Mortgage, LLC.

10

#### EIGHT JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT

#### CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

IGNACIO GUTIERREZ, an individual,

Plaintiff.

VS.

SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC; NEVADA ASSOCIATION SERVICES, INC.; HORIZON HEIGHTS HOMEOWNERS ASSOCIATION; KB HOME MORTGAGE COMPANY, a foreign corporation; DOE Individuals I through X; ROE Corporations and Organizations I through X,

Defendants.

SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC, Nevada Limited Liability Company,

Counter-Claimant and Third Party Plaintiff, VS.

GUTIERREZ, individual: IGNACIO an NATIONSTAR MORTGAGE, LLC, a Delaware limited liability company; COUNTRYWIDE HOME LOANS, INC., a foreign corporation; DOES I through X; and ROES 1-10, inclusive,

Counter-Defendant and Third Party Defendants.

Case No.: A-13-684715-C Dept. No: XVII

NOTICE OF APPEAL

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27 28

	2
	3
	4
	5
	6
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18
	8
	9
	10
.330	11
SUITE 89144 02) 380	12
ORIVE, VADA AX: (7	13
TOWN CENTER DR LAS VEGAS, NEVA (702) 634-5000 – FA	14
WN CE S VEG. 2) 634-5	15
1160 TOW LAS TEL.: (702)	16
TE	17
	18
	19
	20
	21
	22
	23
	24
	25
	26

Nationstar Mortgage LLC, by and through its attorneys of record at Akerman LLP, submits its Notice of Appeal to the Nevada Supreme Court of the Order Granting SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion for Summary Judgment and Denying Bank of America, NA and Nationstar Mortgage, LLC's Motion for Summary Judgment that was entered in this matter on November 10, 2015.

DATED this 9th day of December, 2015.

#### AKERMAN LLP

/s/ Allison R. Schmidt

DARREN T. BRENNER, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No. 8386
ALLISON R. SCHMIDT, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No. 10743
1160 Town Center Drive, Suite 330
Las Vegas, NV 89144
Tel: (702) 634-5000; Fax: 380-8572
darren.brenner@akerman.com;
allison.schmidt@akerman.com

Attorneys for Bank of America, N.A., as Successor by Merger to BAC Home Loans Servicing, LP fka Countrywide Home Loans, Inc., incorrectly sued as Countrywide Home Loans, Inc. and Nationstar Mortgage, LLC.

27

28

### 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 1160 TOWN CENTER DRIVE, SUITE 330 LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89144 TEL.: (702) 634-5000 – FAX: (702) 380-8572 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this 9th day of December, 2015 and pursuant to NRCP 5(b), I served through this Court's electronic service notification system ("Wiznet") a true and correct copy of the foregoing **NOTICE OF APPEAL**, addressed to:

P. Sterling Kerr, Esq. LAW OFFICES OF P. STERLING KERR psklaw@aol.com Richard J. Vilkin, Esq. LAW OFFICES OF RICHARD J. VILKIN, P.C. richard@vilkinlaw.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff and Counter Defendant

Attorneys for Defendant and Counterclaimant Nevada Association Services, Inc.

Howard C. Kim, Esq.
Diana S. Cline, Esq.
HOWARD KIM & ASSOCIATES
eservice@hkimlaw.com
diana@hkimlaw.com
sarah@hkimlaw.com
tomas@hkimlaw.com

Attorneys for Defendant and Counterclaimant Nevada Association Services, Inc.

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this 9th day of December, 2015 and pursuant to NRCP 5(b), I deposited for mailing in the U.S. Mail a true and correct copy of the foregoing **NOTICE OF**APPEAL, postage prepaid and addressed to:

Anthony L. Ashby, Esq.
THE LAW OFFICES OF DAVID M. JONES
7455 Arroyo Crossing Parkway, Suite 200
Las Vegas, NV 89113

Attorney for Defendant Horizon Heights HOA

/s/ Lucille Chiusano
An employee of AKERMAN LLP

3

{36753118;1}

Electronically Filed 12/09/2015 12:17:26 PM

**CLERK OF THE COURT** 

**ASTA** 

DARREN T. BRENNER, ESQ.

Nevada Bar No. 8386

2 ALLISON R. SCHMIDT, ESQ.

Nevada Bar No. 10743

3 AKERMAN LLP

1160 Town Center Drive, Suite 330

Las Vegas, Nevada 89144

Telephone: 5

(702) 634-5000

Facsimile:

(702) 380-8572

1

4

6

7

8

Email: darren.brenner@akerman.com Email: allison.schmidt@akerman.com

Attorneys for Bank of America, N.A., as Successor by Merger to BAC Home Loans Servicing, LP fka Countrywide Home Loans, Inc., incorrectly sued as Countrywide Home Loans, Inc. and Nationstar Mortgage, LLC.

9 10

14

#### EIGHT JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT

#### **CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA**

IGNACIO GUTIERREZ, an individual,

Plaintiff,

Defendants.

VS.

SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC; NEVADA ASSOCIATION SERVICES, INC.; HORIZON HEIGHTS HOMEOWNERS ASSOCIATION; KB HOME MORTGAGE COMPANY, a foreign corporation; DOE Individuals I through X; ROE Corporations and Organizations I through X,

19 20

21

22.

23

24

25

26

17

18

SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC, Nevada Limited Liability Company,

Counter-Claimant and Third Party Plaintiff,

**IGNACIO** GUTIERREZ, individual: an NATIONSTAR MORTGAGE, LLC, a Delaware limited liability company; COUNTRYWIDE HOME LOANS, INC., a foreign corporation; DOES I through X; and ROES 1-10, inclusive,

Counter-Defendant and Third Party Defendants.

Case No.: A-13-684715-C

Dept. No:

CASE APPEAL STATEMENT

27 28

{36753105;1}

1

1160 TOWN CENTER DRIVE, SUITE 330 LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89144 TEL.: (702) 634-5000 – FAX: (702) 380-8572

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

Nationstar Mortgage LLC (Nationstar), by and through its attorneys of record at Akerman LLP, submit this Case Appeal Statement pursuant to NRAP 3(f)(3).

- 1. The appellant filing this case appeal statement is Nationstar.
- The order appealed is the Order Granting SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion for Summary Judgment and Denying Bank of America, NA and Nationstar Mortgage, LLC's Motion for Summary Judgment, which was entered in the above-entitled matter on November 10, 2015 by the Honorable James Bixler.
- 3. Counsel for appellant, Nationstar, are Ariel Stern, Darren Brenner and Allison Schmidt of Akerman LLP, 1160 N. Town Center Drive, Suite 330, Las Vegas, Nevada 89144.
- 4. Counsel for SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC are Howard Kim, Diana Cline Ebron and Jacqueline Gilbert of Howard Kim & Associates, 1055 Whitney Ranch Drive #110, Henderson, Nevada 89014. Appellant is unaware of whether trial counsel will also act as appellate counsel for respondent.
- 5. Counsel for appellant are licensed to practice law in Nevada. Counsel for respondent are licensed to practice law in Nevada.
- Appellant was represented by retained counsel in the district court.
- Appellant is represented by retained counsel on appeal.
- Appellant was not granted leave to proceed in forma pauperis by the district court.
- The date proceedings commenced in the district court was July 8, 2013.
- 10. In this action, appellant, servicer of the subject loan on the Federal Home Loan Mortgage Corporation's ("Freddie Mac") behalf and the beneficiary of record of the deed of trust, contended that the homeowners' association foreclosure sale did not extinguish the deed of trust, which at the time of the homeowners' association foreclosure sale, was owned by Freddie Mac. Respondent contended the homeowners' association foreclosure sale extinguished the deed of trust. The district court granted summary judgment in respondent's favor. Appellant appeals the order granting summary judgment in respondent's favor and denying summary judgment in appellant's favor.

- 11. This case has not previously been the subject of an appeal to or original writ proceeding in the Supreme Court.
- 12. This appeal does not involve child custody or visitation.
- 13. This appeal does not involve the possibility of settlement.

DATED this 9th day of December, 2015.

#### AKERMAN LLP

/s/ Allison R. Schmidt

DARREN T. BRENNER, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No. 8386
ALLISON R. SCHMIDT, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No. 10743
1160 Town Center Drive, Suite 330
Las Vegas, NV 89144
Tel: (702) 634-5000; Fax: 380-8572
darren.brenner@akerman.com;
allison.schmidt@akerman.com

Attorneys for Bank of America, N.A., as Successor by Merger to BAC Home Loans Servicing, LP fka Countrywide Home Loans, Inc., incorrectly sued as Countrywide Home Loans, Inc. and Nationstar Mortgage, LLC.

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this 9th day of December, 2015 and pursuant to NRCP 5(b), I served through this Court's electronic service notification system ("Wiznet") a true and correct copy of the foregoing **CASE APPEAL STATEMENT**, addressed to:

P. Sterling Kerr, Esq. LAW Offices of P. Sterling Kerr psklaw@aol.com Richard J. Vilkin, Esq. LAW OFFICES OF RICHARD J. VILKIN, P.C. richard@vilkinlaw.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff and Counter Defendant

Attorneys for Defendant and Counterclaimant Nevada Association Services, Inc.

Howard C. Kim, Esq.
Diana S. Cline, Esq.
HOWARD KIM & ASSOCIATES
eservice@hkimlaw.com
diana@hkimlaw.com
sarah@hkimlaw.com
tomas@hkimlaw.com

Attorneys for Defendant and Counterclaimant Nevada Association Services, Inc.

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this 9th day of December, 2015 and pursuant to NRCP 5(b), I deposited for mailing in the U.S. Mail a true and correct copy of the foregoing CASE APPEAL STATEMENT, postage prepaid and addressed to:

Anthony L. Ashby, Esq.
THE LAW OFFICES OF DAVID M. JONES
7455 Arroyo Crossing Parkway, Suite 200
Las Vegas, NV 89113

Attorney for Defendant Horizon Heights HOA

/s/ Lucille Chiusano
An employee of AKERMAN LLP

4

{36753105;1}

28

# CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-13-684715-C

Ignacio Gutierrez, Plaintiff(s)

VS.

SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC, Defendant(s)

Location: Judicial Officer: Filed on: Cross-Reference Case Number: Department 17 Villani, Michael 07/08/2013 A684715

**CASE INFORMATION** 

88888

**Statistical Closures** 

Defendant

05/09/2014 Stipulated Dismissal

Case Type: **Title to Property**Subtype: **Quiet Title** 

Case Flags: Appealed to Supreme Court

Automatically Exempt from

Arbitration

DATE CASE ASSIGNMENT

**Current Case Assignment** 

Case Number A-13-684715-C
Court Department 17
Date Assigned 07/08/2013
Judicial Officer Villani, Michael

PARTY INFORMATION

Plaintiff Gutierrez, Ignacio Lead Attorneys

Kerr, Po

Kerr, Preston S. Retained 702-451-2055(W)

Defendant Horizon Heights Homeowners Association Ashby, Anthony L

Removed: 02/14/2014 Retained
Dismissed 702-408-3800(W)

**KB** Home Mortgage Company

Nevada Association Services, Inc. Vilkin, Richard J.

SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC Kim, Howard C.

Retained 702-485-3300(W)

Counter Claimant Nevada Association Services, Inc. Vilkin, Richard J.

Retained 702-476-3211(W)

SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC Kim, Howard C.

Retained 702-485-3300(W)

Counter Countrywide Home Loans Inc Brenner, Darren T.

Retained 702-634-5000(W)

Gutierrez, Ignacio Kerr, Preston S.

Removed: 05/09/2014 Retained
Dismissed 702-451-2055(W)

Nationstar Mortgage LLC Stern, Ariel E.

Retained

Retained 702-634-5000(W)

### **CASE SUMMARY** Countrywide Home Loans Inc

Third Party Defendant

Brenner, Darren T. Retained 702-634-5000(W)

Nationstar Mortgage LLC Stern, Ariel E. 702-634-5000(W)

Retained

Third Party Plaintiff

**SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC** 

Kim, Howard C. Retained 702-485-3300(W)

DATE	EVENTS & ORDERS OF THE COURT	INDEX
07/08/2013	Complaint Filed By: Plaintiff Gutierrez, Ignacio Complaint	
07/08/2013	Case Opened	
07/12/2013	Notice of Service Party: Plaintiff Gutierrez, Ignacio Notice of Filing Affidavit of Service	
07/12/2013	Notice of Service Party: Plaintiff Gutierrez, Ignacio Notice of Filing Affidavit of Service - Nevada Association Services Inc	
07/12/2013	Notice of Service Party: Plaintiff Gutierrez, Ignacio Notice of Filing Affidavit of Service - Horizon Heights Homeowners Association	
08/01/2013	Notice of Lis Pendens Filed by: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC Notice of Lis Pendens	
08/02/2013	Answer and Counterclaim Filed By: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC Answer, Counterclaim and Third Party Complaint for Quiet Title and Injunctive Relief	
08/05/2013	Initial Appearance Fee Disclosure Filed By: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC Initial Appearance Fee Disclosure	
08/06/2013	Initial Appearance Fee Disclosure Filed By: Defendant Horizon Heights Homeowners Association Initial Appearance Fee Disclosure	
08/06/2013	Motion to Dismiss  Filed By: Defendant Horizon Heights Homeowners Association  Horizon Heights HOA's Motion to Dismiss Plaintiff's Complaint	
08/07/2013	Application for Entry of Default  Filed By: Plaintiff Gutierrez, Ignacio  Application for Entry of Default	
08/08/2013	Certificate of Service	

#### CASE SUMMARY CASE No. A-13-684715-C

	CASE NO. A-13-684/15-C
	Filed by: Plaintiff Gutierrez, Ignacio  Certificate of Service
08/12/2013	Answer and Counterclaim Filed By: Counter Claimant Nevada Association Services, Inc. Answer Of Defendant Nevada Association Services, Inc. And Counterclaim
08/15/2013	Answer Filed By: Plaintiff Gutierrez, Ignacio Answer to Defendant Nevada Association Services, INc. And Counterclaim
08/15/2013	Opposition Filed By: Plaintiff Gutierrez, Ignacio Opposition to Defendant Horizon Heights HOA's Motion to Dismiss Plaintiffs Complaint
08/19/2013	Answer and Counterclaim Filed By: Plaintiff Gutierrez, Ignacio Answer to Defendant SFR Investment Pool 1, LLC's Counterclaim and Third Party Complaint
08/21/2013	Affidavit of Service Filed By: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC Affidavit of Service - Countrywide Home Loans, Inc.
08/26/2013	Default Filed By: Plaintiff Gutierrez, Ignacio  Default
08/26/2013	Joinder to Opposition to Motion  Filed by: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC  Limited Joinder to Plaintiff's Opposition to Horizon Heights Homeowner's Association's Motion to Dismiss.
08/27/2013	Notice of Entry of Default Party: Plaintiff Gutierrez, Ignacio Notice of Entry of Default
08/27/2013	Certificate of Service Filed by: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC Certificate of Servce
08/29/2013	Notice of Appearance Party: Counter Defendant Nationstar Mortgage LLC Notice of Appearance
08/29/2013	Initial Appearance Fee Disclosure Filed By: Counter Defendant Nationstar Mortgage LLC Initial Appearance Fee Disclosure
09/05/2013	Affidavit of Service Filed By: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC Affidavit of Service
09/11/2013	Motion to Dismiss (8:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Villani, Michael) Events: 08/06/2013 Motion to Dismiss

# CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-13-684715-C

	CASE NO. A-13-084/15-C
	Horizon Heights HOA's Motion to Dismiss Plaintiff's Complaint
09/18/2013	Motion to Dismiss  Filed By: Counter Defendant Nationstar Mortgage LLC  Motion to Dismiss Third Party Complaint
09/19/2013	Notice of Change of Address Filed By: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC Notice of Change of Address and Notice of Change of Attorney
09/19/2013	Certificate of Service Filed by: Counter Defendant Nationstar Mortgage LLC Certificate of Service
10/09/2013	Opposition to Motion to Dismiss  Filed By: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC  Opposition to Nationstar Mortgage, LLC's Motion to Dismiss Third Party Complaint
10/14/2013	Certificate of Service Filed by: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC Certificate of Service
10/16/2013	Reply in Support  Filed By: Counter Defendant Nationstar Mortgage LLC  Reply in Support of Motion to Dismiss Third Party Complaint
10/23/2013	Motion to Dismiss (8:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Villani, Michael)  Third Party Defendant Nationstar Mortgage LLC's Motion to Dismiss Third Party Complaint
11/07/2013	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Transcript of Proceedings Re: Third Party Defendant Nationstar Mortgage LLC'S Moton to  Dismiss Third Party Complaint October 23, 2013
11/07/2013	Notice of Change of Firm Name Filed By: Counter Defendant Nationstar Mortgage LLC Notice of Change of Firm Name
11/12/2013	Order for Dismissal With Prejudice Filed By: Counter Defendant Nationstar Mortgage LLC (Vacated 11/25/14) Order Granting Nationstar Mortgage LLC's Motion to Dismiss Third Party Complaint
11/13/2013	Notice of Entry of Order Filed By: Counter Defendant Nationstar Mortgage LLC Notice of Entry of Order
11/22/2013	Certificate of Mailing Filed By: Counter Claimant Nevada Association Services, Inc.  Certificate Of Mailing
11/22/2013	Motion to Dismiss Filed By: Counter Claimant Nevada Association Services, Inc. Motion By Defendant Nevada Association Services, Inc. To Dismiss Plaintiff's Complaint And For Attorneys Fees And Costs

# CASE SUMMARY CASE No. A-13-684715-C

1	
01/02/2014	Joinder Filed By: Defendant Horizon Heights Homeowners Association Defendant Horizon Heights Homeowners Association's Joinder to Nevada Associations Motion to Dismiss
01/08/2014	Motion to Dismiss (8:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Villani, Michael) Events: 11/22/2013 Motion to Dismiss Motion By Defendant Nevada Association Services, Inc. To Dismiss Plaintiff's Complaint And For Attorneys Fees And Costs
01/08/2014	Joinder (8:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Villani, Michael) Events: 01/02/2014 Joinder Defendant Horizon Heights Homeowners Association's Joinder to Nevada Associations Motion to Dismiss
01/08/2014	All Pending Motions (8:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Villani, Michael)  Nevada Accosiation Services' Motion to Dismiss Plaintiff's Complant and for Attorney's Fees and Costs Horizon Heights Homeowners Association's Joinder
01/17/2014	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Transcript of Proceedings Re: Third Party Defendant Nationstar Mortgage LLC'S Motion to  Dismiss Third Party Complaint 10/23/13
02/14/2014	Order Granting Motion Filed By: Counter Claimant Nevada Association Services, Inc. Order Granting Motion By Defendants Nevada Association Services, Inc. And Horizon Heights Homeowners Association To Dismiss Plaintiff's Complaint
02/14/2014	Order of Dismissal Without Prejudice (Judicial Officer: Villani, Michael) Debtors: Ignacio Gutierrez (Plaintiff) Creditors: Horizon Heights Homeowners Association (Defendant), Nevada Association Services, Inc. (Defendant) Judgment: 02/14/2014, Docketed: 02/24/2014
02/14/2014	Judgment for Attorney's Fees (Judicial Officer: Villani, Michael) Debtors: Ignacio Gutierrez (Plaintiff) Creditors: Nevada Association Services, Inc. (Defendant) Judgment: 02/14/2014, Docketed: 02/24/2014 Total Judgment: 1,650.56
02/15/2014	Notice of Entry of Order Filed By: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC Notice Of Entry Of Order
03/28/2014	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Transcript of Proceedings Re: All Pending Motions January 8, 2014
05/09/2014	Stipulation and Order for Dismissal Without Prejudice Filed By: Plaintiff Gutierrez, Ignacio Stipulation and Order Dismissing Ignacio Gutierrez without Prejudice
05/09/2014	Order of Dismissal Without Prejudice (Judicial Officer: Villani, Michael) Debtors: SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC (Defendant) Creditors: Ignacio Gutierrez (Plaintiff) Judgment: 05/09/2014, Docketed: 12/08/2014 Debtors: SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC (Counter Claimant) Creditors: Ignacio Gutierrez (Counter Defendant)

# CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-13-684715-C

	CASE NO. A-13-084/15-C
	Judgment: 05/09/2014, Docketed: 12/08/2014
05/12/2014	Notice of Entry of Stipulation & Order for Dismissal  Filed By: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC  Notice of Entry of Stipulation and Order
10/08/2014	Initial Appearance Fee Disclosure Filed By: Counter Defendant Countrywide Home Loans Inc Initial Appearance Fee Disclosure
10/08/2014	Notice of Appearance Party: Counter Defendant Countrywide Home Loans Inc Notice of Appearance
10/08/2014	Answer to Third Party Complaint Filed By: Counter Defendant Countrywide Home Loans Inc
11/25/2014	Stipulation and Order Filed by: Counter Defendant Nationstar Mortgage LLC Stipulation and Order Vacating Order Granting Nationstar Mortgage, LLC's Motion To Dismiss with Prejudice and Entering an Order Denying the Motion To Dismiss
11/25/2014	Amended Judgment Vacated (Judicial Officer: Villani, Michael) Debtors: SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC (Third Party Plaintiff) Creditors: Nationstar Mortgage LLC (Third Party Defendant), Countrywide Home Loans Inc (Third Party Defendant) Judgment: 11/25/2014, Docketed: 11/19/2013
11/26/2014	Notice of Entry of Stipulation and Order  Filed By: Counter Defendant Countrywide Home Loans Inc  Notice of Entry of Stipulation and Order
12/22/2014	Joint Case Conference Report  Filed By: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC  Joint Case Conference Report
12/31/2014	Scheduling Order  Scheduling Order
01/12/2015	Order Setting Civil Non-Jury Trial  Order Setting Civil Non-Jury Trial
06/15/2015	Designation of Expert Witness  Filed By: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC  SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Rebuttal Expert Witness Disclosure
07/21/2015	Answer to Third Party Complaint  Filed By: Counter Defendant Nationstar Mortgage LLC  Nationstar Mortgage, LLC's Answer To SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Third-Party Complaint
07/27/2015	Motion Filed By: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC Motion for Pre-Trial Coordination on Order Shortening Time

# CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-13-684715-C

	CASE NO. A-13-684715-C
08/07/2015	Opposition to Motion Filed By: Counter Defendant Countrywide Home Loans Inc Nationstar Mortgage, LLC and Countrywide Home Loans, Inc.'s Response in Opposition to SFR Investment Pool 1, LLC's Motion for Pre-Trial Coordination on Order Shortening Time
08/11/2015	Motion to Coordinate (10:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Bare, Rob)  Defendant's Motion for Pre-Trial Coordination on Order Shortening Time
08/25/2015	Document Filed Filed by: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC Proposed Case Management Order
08/26/2015	Affidavit of Due Diligence Filed By: Counter Defendant Countrywide Home Loans Inc Affidavit Of Due Diligence
08/26/2015	Affidavit of Service Filed By: Counter Defendant Countrywide Home Loans Inc Affidavit Of Service
09/08/2015	Motion for Summary Judgment Filed By: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion for Summary Judgment
09/21/2015	Motion in Limine Filed By: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion in Limine to Strike Bank's Expert
09/28/2015	Opposition to Motion For Summary Judgment Filed By: Counter Defendant Countrywide Home Loans Inc Bank of America, NA and Nationstar Mortgage, LLC's Opposition to Motion for Summary Judgment
09/28/2015	Countermotion For Summary Judgment Filed By: Counter Defendant Countrywide Home Loans Inc Bank of America, N.A., as Successor By Merger To BAC Home Loans Servicing, LP fka Countrywide Home Loans, Inc. and Nationstar Mortgage, LLC's Countermotion For Summary Judgment
10/01/2015	Joinder to Opposition to Motion Filed by: Counter Defendant Countrywide Home Loans Inc Joinder To Opposition and Notice of Opposition To SFR Investment Pool 1, LLC's Motion For Pre-Trial Coordination on Order Shortening Time
10/08/2015	Opposition to Motion in Limine Filed By: Counter Defendant Countrywide Home Loans Inc Opposition to SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion in Limine to Exclude Expert
10/14/2015	Reply in Support  Filed By: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC  SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Reply in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment, Motion to  Strike Countermotion for Summaary Judgment, and Opposition to Countermotion for summary judgment
10/15/2015	Reply in Support

# CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-13-684715-C

SFR In     10/21/2015   Motion for SFR In     10/21/2015   Countern     Bank of Country     Judgm     10/28/2015   CANCELLY     Vacate     SFR In     10/29/2015   CANCELLY     Vacate     SFR In     10/29/2015   CANCELLY     Vacate     11/04/2015   CANCELLY     Vacate     11/10/2015   CANCELLY     Vacate     11/10/2015   CANCELLY     Vacate     11/16/2015   CANCELLY     Vacate     12/09/2015   CANCELLY     Vacate     12/09/2015   Case     Filed H     Notice     12/09/2015   Case     Filed H     Case A     Defendant     Total Chartotal Pay     Balance     Cancel     Case     Case	Claimant Nevada Association Services, Inc.	223.00
SFR In     10/21/2015   Motion for SFR In     10/21/2015   Countern     Bank of Country     Judgm     10/28/2015   CANCELLY     10/29/2015   CANCELLY     11/04/2015   CANCELLY     11/10/2015   CANCELLY     11/10/2015   CANCELLY     11/10/2015   CANCELLY     11/10/2015   CANCELLY     11/10/2015   CANCELLY     11/16/2015   CANCELLY     12/09/2015   CANCELLY     12/09/2015   CANCELLY     12/09/2015   CANCELLY     12/09/2015   CANCELLY     12/09/2015   CANCELLY     12/09/2015   Case     Filed H     Notice     12/09/2015   Case     Filed H     Case A	yments and Credits  Due as of 12/11/2015	223.00 223.00 <b>0.00</b>
SFR In     10/21/2015   Motion for SFR In     10/21/2015   Countern     Bank of Country     Judgm     10/28/2015   CANCELL     Vacate     SFR In     10/29/2015   Record     Record     11/04/2015   CANCELL     Vacate     11/10/2015   Order     Filed H     Order     Bank of     Cancel     Vacate     11/10/2015   Notice     Judgm     Countre     11/16/2015   CANCELL     Vacate     12/09/2015   Notice     12/09/2015   Notice     12/09/2015   Case     Filed H     Notice     12/09/2015   Case     Filed H     Filed	FINANCIAL INFORMATION	
SFR In	By: Counter Defendant Nationstar Mortgage LLC  Appeal Statement	
SFR In   SFR In	ice of Appeal  By: Counter Defendant Nationstar Mortgage LLC  e of Appeal	
SFR In	LED <b>Bench Trial</b> (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Villani, Michael) ted - per Law Clerk	
SFR In   10/21/2015   Motion for SFR In   10/21/2015   Countern   Bank of Country   Judgm   10/21/2015   CANCELLY   Vacate   SFR In   10/29/2015   CANCELLY   Vacate   SFR In   11/04/2015   CANCELLY   Vacate   11/10/2015   CANCELLY   Vacate   11/10/2015   CANCELLY   Order   Bank of Corder   Bank of Cancel   Cancel	ice of Entry of Order  By: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC  e of Entry of Order Granting SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion for Summary  nent and Denying Bank of America, N.A. and Nationstar Mortgage, LLC's  termotion for Summary Judgment	
SFR In	er Granting By: Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC  r Granting SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion for Summary Judgment and Denying of America, N.A. and Nationstar Mortgage, LLC's Countermotion for Summary nent	
SFR In	LED Calendar Call (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Villani, Michael) ted - per Law Clerk	
SFR In	orders Transcript of Hearing rder's Transcript of Hearing Re All Pending Motions October 21, 2015	
SFR In  10/21/2015 Motion for SFR In  10/21/2015 Countern Bank of Country Judgm	LED Motion in Limine (8:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Bixler, James) ted Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion in Limine to Strike Bank's Expert	
SFR In  10/21/2015 Motion for SFR In  10/21/2015 Countern  Bank of Country	Pending Motions (8:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Bixler, James)	
SFR In. 10/21/2015 <b>Motion fo</b>	motion (8:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Bixler, James) of America, N.A., as Successor By Merger To BAC Home Loans Servicing, LP fka trywide Home Loans, Inc. and Nationstar Mortgage, LLC's Countermotion For Summary nent	
	for Summary Judgment (8:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Bixler, James) Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion for Summary Judgment	
	Trial Disclosure Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC Investments Pool 1, LLC's Pre-Trial Disclosures	
Bank o Summo	of America, NA AND Nationstar Mortgage, LLC's Reply in Support of Countermotion for lary Judgment and Opposition to Motion to Strike	

# CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-13-684715-C

Total Payments and Credits <b>Balance Due as of 12/11/2015</b>	223.00 <b>0.00</b>
Third Party Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC Total Charges Total Payments and Credits Balance Due as of 12/11/2015	558.00 558.00 <b>0.00</b>
Counter Defendant Countrywide Home Loans Inc Total Charges Total Payments and Credits Balance Due as of 12/11/2015	423.00 423.00 <b>0.00</b>
Counter Defendant Nationstar Mortgage LLC Total Charges Total Payments and Credits Balance Due as of 12/11/2015	247.00 247.00 <b>0.00</b>
Plaintiff Gutierrez, Ignacio Total Charges Total Payments and Credits Balance Due as of 12/11/2015	270.00 270.00 <b>0.00</b>

#### CIVIL COVER SHEET

A-13-684715-C

Clark County, Nevada

XVII 

	(Mangirea	by Cierk's Office)	
I. Party Information			
Plaintiff(s) (name/address/phone):		Defendant(s) (name/address/phone): SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1,	
Ignacio Gutierrez		LLC	
Attorney (name/address/phone):			
Law Offices of P. Sterling Kerr		Attorney (name/address/	phone):
2450 St. Rose Parkway #120		Howard C. Kim, Esq.	
Henderson, NV 89074		400 N. Stephanie St, S	uite 160
		Henderson, NV 89014	
II. Nature of Controversy (Please chapplicable subcategory, if appropriate)	eck applicable bold	category and	Arbitration Requested
	Civ	il Cases	
Real Property		To	orts
☐ Landlord/Tenant	1	gligence	Product Liability
/ Unlawful Detainer	Negligence – Au		☐ Product Liability/Motor Vehicle
Title to Property	Negligence – Me		Other Torts/Product Liability
☐ Foreclosure	Negligence – Pro	emises Liability (Slip/Fall)	☐ Intentional Misconduct ☐ Torts/Defamation (Libel/Slander)
Liens	Negligence - Ot	• •	Interfere with Contract Rights
Quiet Title	Tregugence of		Employment Torts (Wrongful termination)
Specific Performance			Other Torts
Condemnation/Eminent Domain			Anti-trust Fraud/Misrepresentation
☐ Other Real Property ☐ Partition			Insurance .
☐ Planning/Zoning			Legal Tort Unfair Competition
Probate		Other Civil	Filing Types
	Construction De		Appeal from Lower Court (also check
Estimated Estate Value:	Chapter 40		applicable civil case box)
Summary Administration	General	J	☐ Transfer from Justice Court
General Administration	Breach of Contr		☐ Justice Court Civil Appeal
Special Administration	Insurance	& Construction Carrier	☐ Civil Writ ☐ Other Special Proceeding
Set Aside Estates	Commerci	ial Instrument	Other Civil Filing
☐ Trust/Conservatorships	Other Con	ntracts/Acct/Judgment of Actions	☐ Compromise of Minor's Claim
Individual Trustee		ent Contract	☐ Conversion of Property ☐ Damage to Property
Corporate Trustee	Guarantee		Employment Security
Other Probate	Sale Cont	raci Commercial Code	Enforcement of Judgment
	Civil Petition for	r Judicial Review	☐ Foreign Judgment – Civil ☐ Other Personal Property
		e Mediation inistrative Law	Recovery of Property
	☐ Departmen	t of Motor Vehicles	☐ Stockholder Suit ☐ Other Civil Matters
		Compensation Appeal	
III. Business Court Requested (Please check applicable category; for Clark or Washoe Counties only.)			
NRS Chapters 78-88	Investments (N		Enhanced Case Mgmt/Business
☐ Commodities (NRS 90) ☐ Securities (NRS 90)	Deceptive Trade Trademarks (NI	Practices (NRS 598) RS 600A)	Other Business Court Matters
7/8/13	_		
Date		Signatilite of	f initiating party or representative

Electronically Filed 11/10/2015 08:51:59 AM

ORDR 1 HOWARD C. KIM, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 10386 2 E-mail: howard@hkimlaw.com **CLERK OF THE COURT** JACQUELINE A. GILBERT, ESO. 3 Nevada Bar No. 10593 E-mail: jackie@hkimlaw.com 4 KAREN L. HANKS, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 009578 5 E-mail: karen@hkimlaw.com HOWARD KIM & ASSOCIATES 6 1055 Whitney Ranch Drive, Suite 110 Henderson, Nevada 89014 7 Telephone: (702) 485-3300 Facsimile: (702) 485-3301 8 Attorneys for SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC 9 DISTRICT COURT 10 CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA 11 IGNACIO GUTIERREZ, an individual, Case No. A-13-684715-C 12 Plaintiff, Dept. No. XVII VS. 13 SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC; ORDER GRANTING SFR INVESTMENTS 14 NEVADA ASSOCIATION SERVICES, INC.: POOL 1, LLC'S MOTION FOR HORIZON HEIGHTS HOMEOWNERS SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND DENYING 15 ASSOCIATION; KB HOME MORTGAGE BANK OF AMERICA, N.A. AND COMPANY, a foreign corporation, DOE NATIONSTAR MORTGAGE, LLC'S 16 Individuals I through X, ROE Corporations and COUNTERMOTION FOR SUMMARY Organizations I through X, JUDGMENT 17 Defendants. 18 SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC, Nevada 19 limited liability company, Counter-Claimant and Third Party Plaintiff, 20 VS. 21 IGNACIO GUTIERREZ, an individual; NATIONSTAR MORTGAGE, LLC, a 22 Delaware limited liability company; COUNTRYWIDE HOME LOANS, INC., A 23 FOREIGN CORPORATION; DOES I-X; and 24 ROES 1-10, inclusive, Counter-Defendant/ Third Party Defendants. 25 26

RECEIVED Summary Judgment ("SFR MSJ"), filed on September 8, 2015, and Bank of America, N.A., as

DEPT 17 ON OCT 2 9 2015

27

HOWARD KIM & ASSOCIATES

1055 WHITNEY RANCH DRIVE, SUITE 110 HENDERSON, NEVADA 89014 (702) 485-3300 FAX (702) 485-3301

This matter came before the Court on SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion for

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Successor by Merger to BAC Home Loans Servicing, LP fka Countrywide Home Loans, Inc. ("BANA") and Nationstar Mortgage, LLC's ("Nationstar")(collectively, with BANA, the "Bank") Countermotion for Summary Judgment ("Bank MSJ"), filed on September 28, 2015. The Bank filed an Opposition to the SFR MSJ on September 28, 2015. SFR filed its Reply in Support of its Motion for Summary Judgment, Motion to Strike Countermotion for Summary Judgment as being Untimely, and Opposition to the Bank's MSJ on October 14, 2015. This Court heard arguments on the SFR MSJ and the Bank MSJ on October 21, 2015 at 8:30 a.m. Jacqueline A. Gilbert, Esq. and Karen L. Hanks, Esq. appeared on behalf of SFR. Ariel Stern, Esq. appeared on behalf of the Bank.

#### FINDINGS OF FACT<sup>1</sup>

- 1. A Deed of Trust listing Ignacio A. Gutierrez as the borrower, KB Home Mortgage Company (KB) as the lender, Mortgage Electronic Registration Systems, Inc. (MERS) as the beneficiary and nominee of the lender and lender's successors and assigns, and First American Title Company of Nevada as trustee, was recorded on July 20, 2005. The Deed of Trust granted KB a security interest in real property known as 668 Moonlight Stroll Street, Henderson, Nevada 89015 (the "Property") to secure the repayment of a loan in the original amount of \$271,638.00 to borrower Ignacio A. Gutierrez (the "Deed of Trust").
- 2. On April 23, 2012, an Assignment of Deed of Trust was recorded, pursuant to which MERS assigned its beneficial interest in the Deed of Trust to BANA on or about April 17, 2012.
- 3. On November 28, 2012, an Assignment of Deed of Trust was recorded, pursuant to which BANA assigned its beneficial interest in the Deed of Trust to Nationstar on or about November 21, 2012.
- 4. On April 5, 2013, SFR purchased the Propertyat a public non-judicial foreclosure auction held by Nevada Association Services, Inc., on behalf of Horizon Heights ("Association Foreclosure Sale").

Any finding of fact that should be a conclusion of law is deemed a conclusion of law.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

- 5. On April 8, 2013, SFR recorded its Foreclosure Deed against the Property in the Official Records of the Clark County Recorder as Instrument No. 201304080001036 ("Foreclosure Deed").
  - 6. The Foreclosure Deed contains the following recitals:

Nevada Association Services, Inc. has complied with all requirements of law including, but not limited to, the elapsing of 90 days, mailing of copies of Notice of Delinquent Assessment and Notice of Default and the posting and publication of the Notice of Sale.

- 7. Prior to the Association Foreclosure Sale, Nationstar was the beneficiary of record of the Deed of Trust on the Property.
- 8. On September 18, 2014, the Nevada Supreme Court issued its opinion in SFR Investments Pool 1 v. U.S. Bank (hereinafter the "SFR Decision"), concluding that NRS 116.3116(2) gives associations a true super-priority lien, a properly conducted non-judicial foreclosure of which extinguishes a first deed of trust. SFR Investments Pool 1 v. U.S. Bank, 130 Nev. , 334 P.3d 408, 419 (2014), reh'g denied (Oct. 16, 2014).
- 9. The Association Foreclosure Sale was conducted pursuant to Horizon Heights' ("Association") lien, which contained super-priority amounts.
- 10. SFR argued that it should be granted summary judgment as: (1) all notices required by NRS 116 were mailed to the proper parties; (2) Nationstar, who was the beneficiary of record of the Deed of Trust, did nothing to protect its interest in the Property; (3) the Association Foreclosure Sale extinguished Nationstar's interest in the Property pursuant to the SFR Decision; (4) SFR can rely on the recitals in the Foreclosure Deed as conclusive proof that Nationstar was given notice of the Association Foreclosure Sale and failed to protect its interest; and (5) NRS 116.31166(1) and (2) do not apply against homeowners who are foreclosed in a manner that violates NRS 116.31162 through NRS 116.31168.

The Bank argued that summary judgment should be entered in its favor because: (1) Nevada Association Services, Inc., on behalf of the Association, failed to provide notice of the foreclosure sale to Nationstar; (2) Federal Home Loan Mortgage Corporation ("Freddie Mac")

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

was the owner of the first deed of trust at the time of the Association Foreclosure Sale; (3) that 12 U.S.C. § 4617(j)(3), which provides that while Freddie Mac is under the conservatorship of the Federal Housing and Finance Agency ("FHFA"), none of Freddie Mac's property, including any lien owned by Freddie Mac, "shall be subject to ... foreclosure ... without the consent of [FHFA]" and that FHFA did not consent in this case, therefore the Association Foreclosure Sale did not extinguish the First Deed of Trust, as determined by three United States District Court judges, see see Skylights v. Byron, No. 2:15-cy-0043-GMN-VCF, 2015 WL 3887061 (D. Nev. June 24, 2015); Elmer v. Fed. Home Loan Mortg. Corp., No. 2:14-cv-01999-GMN-NJK, 2015 WL 4393051 (D. Nev. July 14, 2015); Premier One Holdings, Inc. v. Fed. Nat'l Mortg. Ass'n, No. 2:14-cv-02128-GMN-NJK, 2015 WL 4276169 (D. Nev. July 14, 2015); Williston Investment Grp., LLC v. JP Morgan Chase Bank, NA, No. 2:14-cv-02038-GMN-PAL, 2015 WL 4276144 (D. Nev. July 14, 2015); My Global Village, LLC v. Federal Nat'l Mortg. Assoc., No. 2:15-cv-00211-RCJ-NJK, 2015 WL 4523501 (D. Nev. July 27, 2015); 1597 Ashfield Valley Trust v. Fannie Mae, No. 2:14-cv-02123, 2015 WL 4581220 (D. Nev. July 28, 2015), and (4) the Association Foreclosure Sale was commercially unreasonable and not made in good faith, given the price paid for the Property. The Bank also argued applying NRS 116.31166 in the manner advocated by SFR would lead to absurd and harsh results in cases where homeowners are foreclosed improperly by HOAs.

- At the hearing, the Bank also argued that it was an agent of Freddie Mac, but this 11. was raised late and without sufficient facts to support the claim. Neither Freddie Mac nor the Federal Housing Finance Agency ("FHFA") are parties to the litigation.
- 12. SFR disputed that Freddie Mac or FHFA had an interest in the Deed of Trust or loan at the time of the Association Foreclosure Sale and argued that, even if they did, Nationstar is not the proper party to raise any defenses on behalf of Freddie Mac or FHFA because FHFA has exclusive authority to enforce 4617(j)(3) as set forth in FHFA's regulations, 12 C.F.R. § 1237.3(a)(7).
- At the hearing, this Court made its oral ruling, at which time the Bank made an 13. oral motion to stay entry of judgment based on the alleged interests of non-parties Freddie Mac

14. On September 21, 2015, SFR filed a Motion in Limine to Strike the Bank's Expert. The Motion in Limine is currently scheduled to be heard on October 28, 2015 at 8:30 a.m.

#### CONCLUSIONS OF LAW<sup>2</sup>

- A. As recognized in the SFR Decision, "[a] trustee's deed reciting compliance with the notice provisions of NRS 116.31162 through NRS 116.31168 'is conclusive' as to the recitals 'against the unit's former owner, his or her heirs and assigns, and all other persons." SFR Decision, 334 P.3d at 411-412 (quoting NRS 116.31166(2)). NRS 116.3116 states:
  - 1. The recitals in a deed made pursuant to NRS 116.31164 of:
    - (a) Default, the mailing of the notice of delinquent assessment, and the recording of the notice of default and election to sell;
    - (b) The elapsing of the 90 days; and
    - (c) The giving of notice of sale,
    - Are conclusive proof of the matters recited.
  - 2. Such a deed containing those recitals is conclusive against the unit's former owner, his or her heirs and assigns, and all other persons. The receipt for the purchase money contained in such a deed is sufficient to discharge the purchaser from obligation to see to the proper application of the purchase money.
  - 3. The sale of a unit pursuant to NRS 116.31162, 116.31163 and 116.31164 vests in the purchaser the title of the unit's owner without equity or right of redemption.
- B. The Bank cannot introduce evidence to negate the recitals set forth in the Foreclosure Deed as to a purchaser at a homeowners association foreclosure sale, such as SFR. Commercial reasonableness is not at issue here, as price alone is not enough to set aside a sale as being commercially unreasonable and the alleged lack of notice of sale to Nationstar does not rise to the level of fraud, oppression, or unfairness required under a commercial reasonable analysis.
- C. While there is a dispute as to whether Freddie Mac or FHFA have an interest in the Deed of Trust, it does not change the outcome because, the Bank lacks standing to assert any

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Any conclusion of law that should be a finding of fact is deemed a finding of fact.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

claims or defenses on behalf of Freddie Mac or FHFA, when neither Freddie Mac or FHFA is a party to this action. Nothing herein shall be construed to prohibit Freddie Mac or FHFA from asserting in an appropriate action that 12 U.S.C. § 4617(j)(3) preempts NRS 116 to the extent NRS 116 would, under certain circumstances, otherwise allow Freddie Mac's Deed of Trust to be extinguished via the Association Foreclosure Sale without FHFA's consent.

Nationstar's interest in the Property was extinguished by the Association D. Foreclosure Sale.

#### ORDER

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED that SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion for Summary Judgment is GRANTED.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED that Bank of America, N.A., as Successor by Merger to BAC Home Loans Servicing, LP fka Countrywide Home Loans, Inc. and Nationstar Mortgage, LLC's Countermotion for Summary Judgment is DENIED.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED that the hearing on SFR's Motion in Limine to Strike the Bank's Expert, currently set to be heard on October 28, 2015 at 8:30 a.m., is VACATED as MOOT.

///

1	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED, ADJ	UDGED, AND DECREED that cross-defendants
2	oral motion to stay entry of judgment is hereb	by DENIED.
3	IT IS SO ORDERED.	
4	Dated this 5 day of Nov	, 2015.
5		MMMN
6		DISTRICT COURT JUDGE
7	Respectfully submitted by: HOWARD KIM & ASSOCIATES	Approved as to Form and Content:  AKERMAN LLP
8	Kan & dle >	
9	Jacqueline A. Gilbert, Esq.	Ariel Stern, Esq.
10	Nevada Bar No. 10593	Nevada Bar No. 8276 1160 Town Center Drive, Suite 330
11	Karen L. Hanks, Esq. Nevada Bar No. 9578	Las Vegas, Nevada 89144
12	1055 Whitney Ranch Drive, Suite 110	Attorney for Bank of America, N.A., as
	Henderson, Nevada 89014 Attorney for SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC	Successor by Merger to BAC Home Loans Servicing, LP fka Countrywide Home Loans,
13		Inc. and Nationstar Mortgage, LLC
. 14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		

(702) 485-3300 FAX (702) 485-3301

28

9

1 DIANA S. CLINE EBRON, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 10580 2 E-mail: diana@hkimlaw.com JACQUELINE A. GILBERT, ESQ. 3 Nevada Bar No. 10593 E-mail: jackie@hkimlaw.com 4 KAREN L. HANKS, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 9578 5 E-mail: karen@hkimlaw.com HOWARD KIM & ASSOCIATES 6 1055 Whitney Ranch Drive, Suite 110 Henderson, Nevada 89014 7 Telephone: (702) 485-3300 Facsimile: (702) 485-3301 8 Attorneys for SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC

**CLERK OF THE COURT** 

#### DISTRICT COURT

#### INTY, NEVADA

10	CLARK COU
11	IGNACIO GUTIERREZ, an individual,
12	Plaintiff,
13	vs.
14	SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC; NEVADA ASSOCIATION SERVICES, INC.;
15	HORIZON HEIGHTS HOMEOWNERS ASSOCIATION; KB HOME MORTGAGE
16	COMPANY, a foreign corporation, DOE Individuals I through X, ROE Corporations and
17	Organizations I through X,
18	Defendants.
19	
20	
21	SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC, Nevada
22	limited liability company,
23	Counter-Claimant and Third Party Plaintiff, vs.
24	IGNACIO GUTIERREZ, an individual;
25	NATIONSTAR MORTGAGE, LLC, a Delaware limited liability company;
26	COUNTRYWIDE HOME LOANS, INC., A FOREIGN CORPORATION; DOES I-X; and ROES 1-10, inclusive,
27	,

Counter-Defendant/ Third Party Defendants.

Case No. A-13-684715-C

Dept. No. XVII

NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER GRANTING SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND DENYING BANK OF AMERICA, N.A. AND NATIONSTAR **MORTGAGE, LLC'S COUNTERMOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT** 

# HOWARD KIM & ASSOCIATES 1055 WHITNEY RANCH DRIVE, SUITE 110 HENDERSON, NEVADA 89014 (702) 485-3300 FAX (702) 485-3301

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that an <b>Order G</b>	ranting SFR Investmen
Motion for Summary Judgment and Denying Ba	ank of America, N.A. a
Mortgage, LLC's Countermotion for Summary	Judgment was entered
November 10 <sup>th</sup> , 2015. A copy of said Order is attac	hed hereto.
DATED this 10 <sup>th</sup> day of November, 2015	
	HOWARD KIM & A
	/s/Diana S. Cline Ebro DIANA CLINE EBRON, I Nevada Bar No. 10580 JACQUELINE A. GILBER Nevada Bar No. 10593 KAREN L. HANKS, ESQ Nevada Bar No. 9578 1055 Whitney Ranch I Henderson, Nevada 89 Attorneys for SFR Inve

ents Pool 1, LLC's nd Nationstar N by this court on N

#### SSOCIATES

on Esq. RT, ESQ. Drive, Suite 110 estments Pool 1, LLC

# HOWARD KIM & ASSOCIATES 1055 WHITNEY RANCH DRIVE, SUITE 110 HENDERSON, NEVADA 89014 (702) 485-3300 FAX (702) 485-3301

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this 10<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2015, pursuant to NRCP 5(b), I served the following parties listed below via Eighth Judicial District Court electronic service, a true and correct copy of the foregoing NOTICE OF ENTRY ORDER GRANTING SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND DENYING BANK OF AMERICA, N.A. AND NATIONSTAR MORTGAGE, LLC'S COUNTERMOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT addressed to:

Contact	Email		
Akerman Las Vegas Office	<u>akermanias@akerman.com</u>		
Allison R. Schmidt, Esq.	<u>allison.schmidt@akerman.com</u>		
Darren T. Brenner, Esq.	darren.brenner@akerman.com		
w Offices of P. Sterling Kerr			
w Offices of P. Sterling Kerr Contact	Email		
Contact	Email psklaw@aol.com		
Contact P. Sterling Kerr	Email psklaw@aol.com		

<u>/s/ Tomas Valerio</u>
Employee of Howard Kim & Associates

Electronically Filed 11/10/2015 08:51:59 AM

**ORDR** 1 Hun S. Loh HOWARD C. KIM, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 10386 2 E-mail: howard@hkimlaw.com CLERK OF THE COURT JACQUELINE A. ĞILBERT, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 10593 E-mail: jackie@hkimlaw.com 4 KAREN L. HANKS, ESO. Nevada Bar No. 009578 5 E-mail: karen@hkimlaw.com HOWARD KIM & ASSOCIATES 6 1055 Whitney Ranch Drive, Suite 110 Henderson, Nevada 89014 7 Telephone: (702) 485-3300 Facsimile: (702) 485-3301 8 Attorneys for SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC 9 DISTRICT COURT 10 CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA 11 IGNACIO GUTIERREZ, an individual, Case No. A-13-684715-C 12 Plaintiff, Dept. No. XVII VS. 13 SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC: ORDER GRANTING SFR INVESTMENTS 14 NEVADA ASSOCIATION SERVICES, INC.: POOL 1, LLC'S MOTION FOR HORIZON HEIGHTS HOMEOWNERS SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND DENYING 15 ASSOCIATION; KB HOME MORTGAGE BANK OF AMERICA, N.A. AND COMPANY, a foreign corporation, DOE NATIONSTAR MORTGAGE, LLC'S 16 Individuals I through X, ROE Corporations and COUNTERMOTION FOR SUMMARY Organizations I through X, JUDGMENT 17 Defendants. 18 SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC, Nevada 19 limited liability company, Counter-Claimant and Third Party Plaintiff, 20 VS. 21 IGNACIO GUTIERREZ, an individual; NATIONSTAR MORTGAGE, LLC, a 22 Delaware limited liability company; COUNTRYWIDE HOME LOANS, INC., A 23 FOREIGN CORPORATION; DOES I-X; and 24 ROES 1-10, inclusive, Counter-Defendant/ Third Party Defendants. 25 26

This matter came before the Court on SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion for

RECEIVED Summary Judgment ("SFR MSJ"), filed on September 8, 2015, and Bank of America, N.A., as

DEPT 17 ON OCT 2 9 2015

27

HOWARD KIM & ASSOCIATES

(055 WHITNEY RANCH DRIVE, SUITE 110 HENDERSON, NEVADA 89014 (702) 485-3300 FAX (702) 485-3301

Successor by Merger to BAC Home Loans Servicing, LP fka Countrywide Home Loans, Inc. ("BANA") and Nationstar Mortgage, LLC's ("Nationstar")(collectively, with BANA, the "Bank") Countermotion for Summary Judgment ("Bank MSJ"), filed on September 28, 2015. The Bank filed an Opposition to the SFR MSJ on September 28, 2015. SFR filed its Reply in Support of its Motion for Summary Judgment, Motion to Strike Countermotion for Summary Judgment as being Untimely, and Opposition to the Bank's MSJ on October 14, 2015. This Court heard arguments on the SFR MSJ and the Bank MSJ on October 21, 2015 at 8:30 a.m. Jacqueline A. Gilbert, Esq. and Karen L. Hanks, Esq. appeared on behalf of SFR. Ariel Stern, Esq. appeared on behalf of the Bank.

#### FINDINGS OF FACT<sup>1</sup>

- 1. A Deed of Trust listing Ignacio A. Gutierrez as the borrower, KB Home Mortgage Company (**KB**) as the lender, Mortgage Electronic Registration Systems, Inc. (**MERS**) as the beneficiary and nominee of the lender and lender's successors and assigns, and First American Title Company of Nevada as trustee, was recorded on July 20, 2005. The Deed of Trust granted KB a security interest in real property known as 668 Moonlight Stroll Street, Henderson, Nevada 89015 (the "Property") to secure the repayment of a loan in the original amount of \$271,638.00 to borrower Ignacio A. Gutierrez (the "Deed of Trust").
- On April 23, 2012, an Assignment of Deed of Trust was recorded, pursuant to which MERS assigned its beneficial interest in the Deed of Trust to BANA on or about April 17, 2012.
- 3. On November 28, 2012, an Assignment of Deed of Trust was recorded, pursuant to which BANA assigned its beneficial interest in the Deed of Trust to Nationstar on or about November 21, 2012.
- 4. On April 5, 2013, SFR purchased the Propertyat a public non-judicial foreclosure auction held by Nevada Association Services, Inc., on behalf of Horizon Heights ("Association Foreclosure Sale").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Any finding of fact that should be a conclusion of law is deemed a conclusion of law.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

- 5. On April 8, 2013, SFR recorded its Foreclosure Deed against the Property in the Official Records of the Clark County Recorder as Instrument No. 201304080001036 ("Foreclosure Deed").
  - The Foreclosure Deed contains the following recitals: 6.

Nevada Association Services, Inc. has complied with all requirements of law including, but not limited to, the elapsing of 90 days, mailing of copies of Notice of Delinquent Assessment and Notice of Default and the posting and publication of the Notice of Sale.

- 7. Prior to the Association Foreclosure Sale, Nationstar was the beneficiary of record of the Deed of Trust on the Property.
- 8. On September 18, 2014, the Nevada Supreme Court issued its opinion in SFR Investments Pool 1 v. U.S. Bank (hereinafter the "SFR Decision"), concluding that NRS 116.3116(2) gives associations a true super-priority lien, a properly conducted non-judicial foreclosure of which extinguishes a first deed of trust. SFR Investments Pool 1 v. U.S. Bank, 130 Nev. , 334 P.3d 408, 419 (2014), reh'g denied (Oct. 16, 2014).
- 9. The Association Foreclosure Sale was conducted pursuant to Horizon Heights' ("Association") lien, which contained super-priority amounts.
- 10. SFR argued that it should be granted summary judgment as: (1) all notices required by NRS 116 were mailed to the proper parties; (2) Nationstar, who was the beneficiary of record of the Deed of Trust, did nothing to protect its interest in the Property; (3) the Association Foreclosure Sale extinguished Nationstar's interest in the Property pursuant to the SFR Decision; (4) SFR can rely on the recitals in the Foreclosure Deed as conclusive proof that Nationstar was given notice of the Association Foreclosure Sale and failed to protect its interest; and (5) NRS 116.31166(1) and (2) do not apply against homeowners who are foreclosed in a manner that violates NRS 116.31162 through NRS 116.31168.

The Bank argued that summary judgment should be entered in its favor because: (1) Nevada Association Services, Inc., on behalf of the Association, failed to provide notice of the foreclosure sale to Nationstar; (2) Federal Home Loan Mortgage Corporation ("Freddie Mac")

2

3

4

5

б

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

was the owner of the first deed of trust at the time of the Association Foreclosure Sale; (3) that 12 U.S.C. § 4617(j)(3), which provides that while Freddie Mac is under the conservatorship of the Federal Housing and Finance Agency ("FHFA"), none of Freddie Mac's property, including any lien owned by Freddie Mac, "shall be subject to ... foreclosure ... without the consent of [FHFA]" and that FHFA did not consent in this case, therefore the Association Foreclosure Sale did not extinguish the First Deed of Trust, as determined by three United States District Court judges, see see Skylights v. Byron, No. 2:15-cy-0043-GMN-VCF, 2015 WL 3887061 (D. Nev. June 24, 2015); Elmer v. Fed. Home Loan Mortg. Corp., No. 2:14-cv-01999-GMN-NJK, 2015 WL 4393051 (D. Nev. July 14, 2015); Premier One Holdings, Inc. v. Fed. Nat'l Mortg. Ass'n, No. 2:14-cv-02128-GMN-NJK, 2015 WL 4276169 (D. Nev. July 14, 2015); Williston Investment Grp., LLC v. JP Morgan Chase Bank, NA, No. 2:14-cv-02038-GMN-PAL, 2015 WL 4276144 (D. Nev. July 14, 2015); My Global Village, LLC v. Federal Nat'l Mortg. Assoc., No. 2:15-cv-00211-RCJ-NJK, 2015 WL 4523501 (D. Nev. July 27, 2015); 1597 Ashfield Valley Trust v. Fannie Mae, No. 2:14-cv-02123, 2015 WL 4581220 (D. Nev. July 28, 2015), and (4) the Association Foreclosure Sale was commercially unreasonable and not made in good faith, given the price paid for the Property. The Bank also argued applying NRS 116.31166 in the manner advocated by SFR would lead to absurd and harsh results in cases where homeowners are foreclosed improperly by HOAs.

- At the hearing, the Bank also argued that it was an agent of Freddie Mac, but this 11. was raised late and without sufficient facts to support the claim. Neither Freddie Mac nor the Federal Housing Finance Agency ("FHFA") are parties to the litigation.
- 12. SFR disputed that Freddie Mac or FHFA had an interest in the Deed of Trust or loan at the time of the Association Foreclosure Sale and argued that, even if they did, Nationstar is not the proper party to raise any defenses on behalf of Freddie Mac or FHFA because FHFA has exclusive authority to enforce 4617(j)(3) as set forth in FHFA's regulations, 12 C.F.R. § 1237.3(a)(7).
- At the hearing, this Court made its oral ruling, at which time the Bank made an 13. oral motion to stay entry of judgment based on the alleged interests of non-parties Freddie Mac

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

and FHFA, and those non-parties' potential preference to litigate their interests in federal court.

14. On September 21, 2015, SFR filed a Motion in Limine to Strike the Bank's Expert. The Motion in Limine is currently scheduled to be heard on October 28, 2015 at 8:30 a.m.

#### CONCLUSIONS OF LAW<sup>2</sup>

- A. As recognized in the SFR Decision, "[a] trustee's deed reciting compliance with the notice provisions of NRS 116.31162 through NRS 116.31168 'is conclusive' as to the recitals 'against the unit's former owner, his or her heirs and assigns, and all other persons." SFR Decision, 334 P.3d at 411-412 (quoting NRS 116.31166(2)). NRS 116.3116 states:
  - 1. The recitals in a deed made pursuant to NRS 116.31164 of:
    - (a) Default, the mailing of the notice of delinquent assessment, and the recording of the notice of default and election to sell;
    - (b) The elapsing of the 90 days; and
    - (c) The giving of notice of sale,
    - Are conclusive proof of the matters recited.
  - Such a deed containing those recitals is conclusive against the unit's former owner, his or her heirs and assigns, and all other persons. The receipt for the purchase money contained in such a deed is sufficient to discharge the purchaser from obligation to see to the proper application of the purchase money.
  - 3. The sale of a unit pursuant to NRS 116.31162, 116.31163 and 116.31164 vests in the purchaser the title of the unit's owner without equity or right of redemption.
- B. The Bank cannot introduce evidence to negate the recitals set forth in the Foreclosure Deed as to a purchaser at a homeowners association foreclosure sale, such as SFR. Commercial reasonableness is not at issue here, as price alone is not enough to set aside a sale as being commercially unreasonable and the alleged lack of notice of sale to Nationstar does not rise to the level of fraud, oppression, or unfairness required under a commercial reasonable analysis.
- C. While there is a dispute as to whether Freddie Mac or FHFA have an interest in the Deed of Trust, it does not change the outcome because, the Bank lacks standing to assert any

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Any conclusion of law that should be a finding of fact is deemed a finding of fact.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

claims or defenses on behalf of Freddie Mac or FHFA, when neither Freddie Mac or FHFA is a party to this action. Nothing herein shall be construed to prohibit Freddie Mac or FHFA from asserting in an appropriate action that 12 U.S.C. § 4617(j)(3) preempts NRS 116 to the extent NRS 116 would, under certain circumstances, otherwise allow Freddie Mac's Deed of Trust to be extinguished via the Association Foreclosure Sale without FHFA's consent.

D. Nationstar's interest in the Property was extinguished by the Association Foreclosure Sale.

#### ORDER

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED that SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion for Summary Judgment is GRANTED.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED that Bank of America, N.A., as Successor by Merger to BAC Home Loans Servicing, LP fka Countrywide Home Loans, Inc. and Nationstar Mortgage, LLC's Countermotion for Summary Judgment is DENIED.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED that the hearing on SFR's Motion in Limine to Strike the Bank's Expert, currently set to be heard on October 28, 2015 at 8:30 a.m., is VACATED as MOOT.

///

	1	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED that cross-defendants		
	2	oral motion to stay entry of judgment is hereby DENIED.		
	3	IT IS SO ORDERED.		
	4	Dated this 5 day of Nov	, 2015.	
	5	**************************************	MMM NV	
	6	DISTRICT COURT JUDGE		
	7	Respectfully submitted by:	Approved as to Form and Content:	
	8	HOWARD KIM & ASSOCIATES	AKERMAN LLP	
	9	Jacqueline A. Gilbert, Esq.	Ariel Stern, Esq.	
	10	Nevada Bar No. 10593 Karen L. Hanks, Esq.	Nevada Bar No. 8276 1160 Town Center Drive, Suite 330	
	11	Nevada Bar No. 9578	Las Vegas, Nevada 89144	
		1055 Whitney Ranch Drive, Suite 110	Attorney for Bank of America, N.A., as	
	12	Henderson, Nevada 89014	Successor by Merger to BAC Home Loans	
1366	13	Attorney for SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC	Servicing, LP fka Countrywide Home Loans, Inc. and Nationstar Mortgage, LLC	
102) 402-33th Fra (102) 403-33th	14			
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	15			
03-33W	16			
	17			
	18			
	19			
	20			
	21			
	22			
	23			

Title to Property	COURT MINUTES	<b>September 11, 2013</b>
A-13-684715-C	Ignacio Gutierrez, Plaintiff(s) vs. SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC, Defendant(s)	

September 11, 2013 8:30 AM Motion to Dismiss Horizon Heights

HOA's Motion to Dismiss Plaintiff's

Complaint

HEARD BY: Villani, Michael COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 11A

COURT CLERK: Carol Donahoo

**RECORDER:** Michelle Ramsey

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Ashby, Anthony L Attorney

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- Mr. Ashby advised this matter is set for hearing on his client's Motion to Dismiss; however, he spoke with Preston Kerr, Esq., counsel for Plaintiff, and he has agreed to dismiss the case. Mr. Ashby will be preparing and circulating a Stipulation based on those representations. COURT ORDERED, matter OFF CALENDAR.

MATTER RECALLED: Only Diana Cline, Esq., is present. Court informed Ms. Cline that Mr. Ashby was present and he represented that the Plaintiff had agreed to dismiss the Complaint; a Stipulation and Order is being prepared. Ms. Cline inquired as to whether the whole case was being dismissed or just the association; colloquy. Court directed Ms. Cline to contact Mr. Ashby and if any problems arise, to put the matter back on calendar.

PRINT DATE: 12/11/2015 Page 1 of 7 Minutes Date: September 11, 2013

Title to Property	COURT MINUTES		October 23, 2013	
A-13-684715-C	vs.	rrez, Plaintiff(s) nts Pool 1 LLC, Defendant(s)		
October 23, 2013	8:30 AM	Motion to Dismiss	Third Party Defendant Nationstar Mortgage LLC's Motion to Dismiss Third Party Complaint	

HEARD BY: Villani, Michael COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 11A

**COURT CLERK:** Carol Donahoo

**RECORDER:** Michelle Ramsey

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Cline, Diana S. Attorney Vilkin, Richard J. Attorney

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- Counsel submitted the matter on their pleadings. COURT ORDERED, Motion GRANTED

COURT FINDS, that the Statute in question sets forth the priority for repayment on the HOA lien, it does not extinguish the prior recorded security interest.

Ms. Schmidt to prepare the Order.

A-13-684715-C Ignacio Gutierrez, Plaintiff(s)
vs.
SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC, Defendant(s)

January 08, 2014 8:30 AM All Pending Motions

HEARD BY: Villani, Michael COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 11A

COURT CLERK: Carol Donahoo

**RECORDER:** Michelle Ramsey

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Vilkin, Richard J. Attorney

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- This is the time set for hearing on the Motion by Defendant Nevada Association Services, Inc., to Dismiss Plaintiff's Complaint and for Attorney's Fees and Costs. Defendant Horizon Heights Homeowners Association filed a JOINDER.

Mr. Vilkin advised that he received no opposition so he spoke to Plaintiff's counsel, Sterling Kerr, last night; he represented that he was not opposing said motion. COURT ORDERED, Motion and Joinder GRANTED. Mr. Vilkin to prepare the Order.

Title to Property	COURT MINUTES	<b>August 11, 2015</b>
A 40 (04545 G		
A-13-684715-C Ignacio Gutierrez, Plaintiff(s)		
	VS.	
	SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC, Defendant(s)	
	of it investments four falls, berentaunt(s)	

August 11, 2015 10:30 AM Motion to Coordinate

HEARD BY: Bare, Rob COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 03C

**COURT CLERK:** Billie Jo Craig

**RECORDER:** Carrie Hansen

**REPORTER:** 

PARTIES PRESENT:

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR PRE-TRIAL COORDINATION ON ORDER SHORTENING TIME

Attorneys Edgar Smith, Richard Vilkin, Diana Cline, Karen Hanks present.

Sign-up sheets Left Side Filed in A662394: Robert Anderlik, Taylor Anello, Thomas N. Beckom, Jonathan D. Blum, Darren Brenner, Michael Brooks, Diana Cline, Britannica Collins, Chelsea Crowton, Peter Dunkley, Jessica Friedman, Charles Geisendorf, David Gluth, Karen Hanks, Joshua O. Igeleke, Michael Li, Steven Loizzi Jr., Elizabeth Lowell, Erica D. Loyd, Matthew McAlonis, David J. Merrill, Patrick Orme, Robin Perkins, Benjamin Petiprin (appeared telephonically), Edgar C. Smith, Kevin S. Soderstrom, Ashlie Surer, Abe Vigil, Richard Vilkin, Shawn Walkenshaw, David Winterton.

Upon inquiry of the Court, Ms. Hanks advised the Motion was filed and heard in this Court as this Court had the lowest case number. Colloquy regarding coordinating the HOA cases as to Discovery, Trials, and witness availability. Counsel suggested a more specific Case Management Plan for a Special Discovery Master to deal with these cases as the various District Court Judges thoughts vary. Court noted he talked briefly with Chief Judge David Barker and Chief Civil Judge Betsy Gonzalez. The Court noted Court Administration would be interested in addressing this issue. Court inquired if Ms. Hanks would be the point of contact, and she advised she would. She provided her E-mail address:

PRINT DATE: 12/11/2015 Page 4 of 7 Minutes Date: September 11, 2013

#### A-13-684715-C

#### Karen@hkimlaw.com

Statement by Mr. Vilkin regarding having a meeting first to determine what counsel will agree on as to the Case Management Plan.

Statements from Attorney Surur regarding coordination for Discovery procedures and noted her two cases where one was Dismissed and the other was pending a Motion to Dismiss where the Court had no jurisdiction.

Statements from Attorney Brooks, who had multiple cases, regarding setting deadlines for counsel to submit a plan to in-house counsel, which may take 2 to 3 weeks.

Attorney Brenner advised a Case Management Plan would first be needed as there are 10 different banks and in-house counsel. He would then be in a position to respond.

COURT ORDERED, Ms. Hanks to submit a Proposed Case Management Plan to counsel by 8/25/15. Counsel to respond by 9/29/15. Matter SET for Status Check: Proposed Case Management Plan to determine when a Continued Hearing on this Motion to Coordinate to be heard.

9/1/15 10:30 AM STATUS CHECK: PROPOSED CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN (IN A662394 ONLY)

PRINT DATE: 12/11/2015 Page 5 of 7 Minutes Date: September 11, 2013

A-13-684715-C Ignacio Gutierrez, Plaintiff(s)
vs.
SFR Investments Pool 1 LLC, Defendant(s)

October 21, 2015 8:30 AM All Pending Motions

HEARD BY: Bixler, James COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 11A

COURT CLERK: Louisa Garcia

**RECORDER:** Michelle Ramsey

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Gilbert, Jacqueline Attorney

Hanks, Karen Attorney Stern, Ariel E. Attorney

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- Mr. Stern stated the issue was the first deed of trust noting Nationstar had the first deed. Statement by Court regarding Supreme Court decision. Colloquy regarding recitals. Mr. Stern argued parties were required to provide proper notice of sale; the sale was not proper because the interested party did not receive notice. The Defendant's claim was Bank of America received notice and signed attorney of fact; it does not mean that Nationstar received notice. Upon Court's inquiry regarding issue of fact, Ms. Gilbert argued it was not disputed because conclusive recitals were just that; they do not know other than from the recitals that the collection company did not mail it. Further argued the statute does not require you actually receive it just that notice of sale be given. As a purchaser they have to rely on the recital deed; counsel does not get to look behind the recitals and say it was not done properly. Ms. Gilbert stated if counsel wants to allege it was not done properly their relief is under NRS 21.140. Counsel stated they were the purchaser and had nothing to do with the foreclosure sale; they have to go after the trustee. Statement by Court regarding remedy. Mr. Stern cited relief under 116. Further argument regarding trust deed recital, Freddie Mac loan and federal statute. Colloquy regarding Judge Pro's opinion. Colloquy regarding late filing of motion. Ms. Gilbert requested motion be stricken. COURT ORDERED, Motion for Summary Judgment GRANTED; Countermotion DENIED. At the request of Ms. Gilbert, FURTHER ORDERED, Motion

PRINT DATE: 12/11/2015 Page 6 of 7 Minutes Date: September 11, 2013

#### A-13-684715-C

to Strike Experts MOOT. Mr. Stern requested oral Motion to Stay. Upon Court's Inquiry, Mr. Stern requested Stay to allow FHFA to intervene. Court advised counsel he may appeal the matter. Ms. Gilbert to prepare Order.

PRINT DATE: 12/11/2015 Page 7 of 7 Minutes Date: September 11, 2013



# EIGHTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT CLERK'S OFFICE NOTICE OF DEFICIENCY ON APPEAL TO NEVADA SUPREME COURT

DARREN T. BRENNER, ESQ. 1160 TOWN CENTER DRIVE, SUITE 330 LAS VEGAS, NV 89144

DATE: December 11, 2015

CASE: A684715

**RE CASE:** IGNACIO GUTIERREZ vs. KB HOME MORTGAGE COMPANY

NOTICE OF APPEAL FILED: December 9, 2015

YOUR APPEAL HAS BEEN SENT TO THE SUPREME COURT.

PLEASE NOTE: DOCUMENTS NOT TRANSMITTED HAVE BEEN MARKED:

	<ul> <li>\$250 - Supreme Court Filing Fee (Make Check Payable to the Supreme Court)**</li> <li>If the \$250 Supreme Court Filing Fee was not submitted along with the original Notice of Appeal, it must be mailed directly to the Supreme Court. The Supreme Court Filing Fee will not be forwarded by this office if submitted after the Notice of Appeal has been filed.</li> </ul>
	\$24 - District Court Filing Fee (Make Check Payable to the District Court)**
$\boxtimes$	\$500 - Cost Bond on Appeal (Make Check Payable to the District Court)** - NRAP 7: Bond For Costs On Appeal in Civil Cases
	Case Appeal Statement - NRAP 3 (a)(1), Form 2
	Order

#### NEVADA RULES OF APPELLATE PROCEDURE 3 (a) (3) states:

Notice of Entry of Order

"The district court clerk must file appellant's notice of appeal despite perceived deficiencies in the notice, including the failure to pay the district court or Supreme Court filing fee. The district court clerk shall apprise appellant of the deficiencies in writing, and shall transmit the notice of appeal to the Supreme Court in accordance with subdivision (e) of this Rule with a notation to the clerk of the Supreme Court setting forth the deficiencies. Despite any deficiencies in the notice of appeal, the clerk of the Supreme Court shall docket the appeal in accordance with Rule 12."

Please refer to Rule 3 for an explanation of any possible deficiencies.

<sup>\*\*</sup>Per District Court Administrative Order 2012-01, in regards to civil litigants, "...all Orders to Appear in Forma Pauperis expire one year from the date of issuance." You must reapply for in Forma Pauperis status.

## **Certification of Copy**

State of Nevada
County of Clark

I, Steven D. Grierson, the Clerk of the Court of the Eighth Judicial District Court, Clark County, State of Nevada, does hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and correct copy of the hereinafter stated original document(s):

NOTICE OF APPEAL; CASE APPEAL STATEMENT; DISTRICT COURT DOCKET ENTRIES; CIVIL COVER SHEET; ORDER GRANTING SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND DENYING BANK OF AMERICA, N.A. AND NATIONSTAR MORTGAGE, LLC'S COUNTERMOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT; NOTICE OF ENTRY ORDER GRANTING SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND DENYING BANK OF AMERICA, N.A. AND NATIONSTAR MORTGAGE, LLC'S COUNTERMOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT; DISTRICT COURT MINUTES; NOTICE OF DEFICIENCY

IGNACIO GUTIERREZ,

Plaintiff(s),

VS.

KB HOME MORTGAGE COMPANY,

Defendant(s),

SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC,

Counter-Claimant and Third Party Plaintiff(s),

VS.

NATIONSTAR MORTGAGE, LLC; COUNTRYWIDE HOME LOANS, INC.,

Counter-Defendant and Third Party Defendant(s),

now on file and of record in this office.

Case No: A684715

Dept No: XVII

IN WITNESS THEREOF, I have hereunto Set my hand and Affixed the seal of the Court at my office, Las Vegas, Nevada This 11 day of December 2015.

Steven D. Grierson, Clerk of the Court

Mary Kielty, Deputy Clerk