**CLERK OF THE COURT** 

**NOAS** 1 DENNIS M. PRINCE, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 5092 TRACY A. EGLET, ESQ. 3 Nevada Bar No.: 6419 DANIELLE TARMU, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 11727 **EGLET PRINCE** 400 South Seventh Street, #400 6 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 eservice@egletlaw.com (702) 450-5400 phone (702) 450-5451 facsimile 8 Attorneys for Plaintiff

Electronically Filed Mar 24 2016 01:17 p.m. Tracie K. Lindeman Clerk of Supreme Court

# IN THE EIGHTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT OF THE STATE OF NEVADA

# CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

BEAU R. ORTH,

Beau R. Orth

Plaintiff,

vs.

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D.; DOES I through X; ROE BUSINESS ENTITIES I through X, inclusive,

Defendants.

CASE NO. : A-11-648041-C

DEPT. NO.: III

### **NOTICE OF CROSS-APPEAL**

Notice is hereby given that Plaintiff Beau R. Orth appeals to the Nevada Supreme Court from the following orders: (1) Order Regarding Defendant's Motion for New Trial, or in the Alternative, for Amendment of Judgment, limited to the briefing regarding NRS 42.021 and any admission of Plaintiff's insurance information, attached as **Exhibit "1;"** (2) Order Regarding Defendant's Motion for Application of NRS 41A.035 and NRS 42.021 regarding NRS 42.021 only, attached as **Exhibit "2;"** (3) Order Regarding Plaintiff's Motion to Declare NRS 42.021 and NRS 41A.035 Unconstitutional, regarding to NRS 42.021 only, attached as **Exhibit "3;"** 

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	***************************************
7	
8	***************************************
9	
10	***************************************
11	
12	
13	***************************************
14	
15	
16	***************************************
17	
18	
19	-
20	
21	Ì
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	1

28

and (4) Order Regarding Plaintiff's Omnibus Motion in Limine, Section 7, Regarding Collateral Sources of Payment, attached as Exhibit "4."

DATED this day of March, 2016.

EGLET PRINCE

DENNIS M. PRINCE, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 5092 TRACY A. EGLET, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 6419

DANIELLE TARMU, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 11727

400 South Seventh Street, Box 1, Suite 400

Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 Attorneys for Plaintiff

# EGLET TPRINCE

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Pursuant to NRCP 5(b), I certify that I am an employee of EGLET PRINCE, and that on March 21, 2016, I caused the foregoing document entitled NOTICE OF CROSS-APPEAL to be served upon those persons designated by the parties in the E-Service Master List for the above-referenced matter in the Eighth Judicial District Court eFiling System in accordance with the mandatory electronic service requirements of Administrative Order 14-2 and the Nevada Electronic Filing and Conversion Rules.

Anthony D. Lauria, Esq.
LAURIA, TOKUNAGA GATES& LINN, LLP
601 South Seventh Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor
Las Vegas, Nevada 89101
Alauria@Itglaw.net

Robert L. Eisenberg, Esq.
LEMONS, GRUNDY & EISENBERG
6005 Plumas Street, Suite 300
Reno Nevada 89519
rle@lge.net

Attorneys for Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.

An Employee of Eglet Prince

# ORIGINAL

	A THE COLD IN THE	
1	ORDR	
×	ROBERT L. EISENBERG (Nevada Bar No. 950)	Electronically Filed 02/10/2016 11:50:25 AM
2	Lemons, Grundy & Eisenberg	02/10/2010 11:00:20 AW
3	6005 Plumas Street, Third Floor	1
4	Reno, Nevada 89509	Alm to blum
7	775-786-6868	CLERK OF THE COURT
5	775-786-9756   Email: <u>rle@lgc.net</u>	
<b>6</b>	CHIBIT HEWIRGING	
_	Anthony D. Lauria	
7	Nevada Bar No. 4114	
8	LAURIA TOKUNAGA GATES & LINN, LLP	
9	601 South Seventh Street, 2nd Floor	
,	Las Vegas, NV 89101	
10	Tel: (702) 387-8633	
11	Fax: (702) 387-8635 ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT	
	THE TOTAL DESCRIPTION OF THE PROPERTY OF THE P	•
12		
13	IN THE EIGHTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COUR	T OF THE STATE OF NEVADA
14	IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF	FCLARK
1.4	BELLIA ON THE	~
15	BEAU R. ORTH, Plaintiff.	Case No. A-11-648041
16	Platiqui,	Dept. No. III
	vs.	ORDER REGARDING
17		DEFENDANT'S MOTION
18	ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D.	FOR NEW TRIAL, OR IN
19	Defendant.	THE ALTERNATIVE, FOR
''		AMENDMENT OF
20	/	JUDGMENT
21		
	<b></b>	
22	This matter was heard by the Court on Decer	nber 16, 2015. Dennis M. Prince, of
23	Eglet Prince, appeared on behalf of Plaintiff On	th. Anthony D. Lauria, of Lauria
24	Tokunaga Gates & Linn, LLP, and Robert L.	Eisenberg, of Lemons, Grundy &
25	Eisenberg, appeared on behalf of Defendant Capar	nna. Having considered the motion
.26	papers and the oral arguments by counsel, the Court	hereby rules as follows:
27	  //	

28

## Motion for New Trial

The Court finds that Defendant has not established grounds for a new trial, pursuant to NRCP 59. The Court affirms its pretrial rulings dealing with discovery and evidence relating to expert witnesses. The Court finds no basis to grant a new trial, pursuant to NRCP 59, regarding discussions about insurance in voir dire, jury instructions or arguments by plaintiff's counsel.

The Court also finds no basis for a new trial regarding MRI presentations at trial. And the Court finds no basis for a new trial on other issues raised in Defendant's Motion for New Trial.

Accordingly, the Motion for New Trial is denied.

## Motion for Amendment of Judgment

This motion seeks an amendment of the judgment, to comply with NRS 41A.035, which imposes a cap on noneconomic damages. Having considered the motion papers and the arguments of counsel, the Court hereby grants the Motion for Amendment of the Judgment. The noneconomic damages will be reduced to \$350,000. This amount will apply entirely to the past noneconomic damages.

It is so ORDERED.

**COURT JUDGE** 

Order initially brepared by:

RÖBERT L. EISENBERG

(Nv. Bar No. 0950)

Lemons, Grundy & Eisenberg 6005 Plumas Street, Third Floor

Reno, Nevada 89519

775-786-6868

Email: rie@lge.net Attorneys for Defendant

2

1

3

4

5 б

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

1.7

18

19 20

21

22 23

24

25 26

27

28

# EXHIBIT "2"

# ORICINAL

**Electronically Filed** 02/10/2016 11:53:07 AM

**ORDR** Ĭ. ROBERT L. EISENBERG (Nevada Bar No. 950) 2 Lemons, Grundy & Eisenberg 6005 Plumas Street, Third Floor 3 Reno, Nevada 89509 775-786-6868 775-786-9756 5 Email: rle@lge.net 6 Anthony D. Lauria 7 Nevada Bar No. 4114 LAURIA TOKUNAGA GATES & LINN, LLP \$ 601 South Seventh Street, 2nd Floor Las Vegas, NV 89101 Tel: (702) 387-8633 10 Fax: (702) 387-8635 11 ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT 12 13

CLERK OF THE COURT

IN THE EIGHTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT OF THE STATE OF NEVADA IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF CLARK

VS,

BEAU R. ORTH,

Plaintiff,

Case No. A-11-648041

Dept. No. III

16

18

19

14

15

17

ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D.

Defendant.

ORDER REGARDING **DEFENDANT'S MOTION** FOR APPLICATION OF NRS 41A.035 and 42.021

20 21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

This matter was heard by the Court on December 16, 2015. Dennis M. Prince, of Eglet Prince, appeared on behalf of Plaintiff Orth. Anthony D. Lauria, of Lauria Tokunaga Gates & Linn, LLP, and Robert L. Eisenberg, of Lemons, Grundy & Eisenberg, appeared on behalf of Defendant Capanna. Having considered the motion papers and the oral arguments by counsel, the Court hereby rules as follows:

### NRS 41A.035

. 

This statute imposes a cap of \$350,000 on noneconomic damages.<sup>1</sup> The Court finds that statute is applicable and that Plaintiff's noneconomic damages must not exceed \$350,000. Nevertheless, the Court denies Defendant's request to apportion noneconomic damages between past and future damages. The Court finds that the entire \$350,000 amount of noneconomic damages should be attributed to past damages.

## NRS 42.021

Subsections (3) through (8) of this statute deal with periodic payments for future damages. The Court finds that the statutory provisions for periodic payments apply to the amount awarded by the jury for future medical expenses, i.e., \$350,000. The Court finds that this portion of the judgment shall be paid in three periodic payments. The first payment will be the amount of \$175,000, which consists of one-half of the future medical expenses awarded by the jury. This amount will be paid within six months after entry of the amended judgment. The second periodic payment will be the amount of \$88,000, which will be paid within one year after entry of the amended judgment. The final periodic payment will be the amount of \$87,000, which will be paid within 18 months after entry of the amended judgment.

The Court also finds that the \$350,000 amount of future medical expenses awarded by the jury shall draw post-judgment interest, pursuant to NRS 17.130(2), from the time of entry of the judgment until satisfied, with post-judgment interest to be adjusted as each periodic payment is made.

It is so ORDERED.

DATED: February 4, 2011

DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

The Court has also dealt with application of this statute in the Order Regarding Defendant's Motion for Amendment of the Judgment.

Order initially prepared by: (Nv. Bar No. 0950)
Lemons, Grundy & Eisenberg
6005 Plumas Street, Third Floor
Reno, Nevada 89519
775-786-6868 б Email: <u>rle@lge.net</u> Attorneys for Defendant 

# EXHIBIT "3"

Ì. ORDR DENNIS M. PRINCE, ESQ. 2 Nevada Bar No.: 5092 TRACY A. EGLET, ESQ. 3 Nevada Bar No.: 6419 DANIELLE TARMU, ESQ. 4 Nevada Bar No.: 11727 5 EGLET PRINCE 400 South Seventh Street, #400 6 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 7 dprince@egletlaw.com teglet@egletlaw.com. 8 diarmu@egletlaw.com (702) 450-5400 phone 9 (702) 450-5451 facsimile 10 Attorneys for Plaintiff Beau R. Orth

**CLERK OF THE COURT** 

#### DISTRICT COURT

## CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

BEAUR. ORTH,

Plaintiff.

CASE NO.: A-11-648041-C

DEPT. NO.: III

VS.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D.; 19 DOES I through X; ROE BUSINESS ENTITIES I through X, inclusive, 20

Defendants.

ORDER REGARDING PLAINTIFF'S **MOTION TO DECLARE NRS 42.021 AND NRS 41A.035** UNCONSTITUTIONAL

22 23.

24

25

26

27

28

21

This matter having come on for hearing on the 14th day of August, 2015; Dennis M. Prince, Esq., and Danielle Tarmu, Esq. of Eglet Prince appearing on behalf of Plaintiff, Beau Orth; and Anthony D. Lauria, Esq. and Paul A. Cardinale, Esq. of Laura Tokunaga Gates & Linn, LLP, appearing on behalf of Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D. The Court, having read the moving papers and heard oral argument by counsel, and hereby DENIES Plaintiff's

1	Motion to Declare NRS 42.021 and N	RS 41A.035 Unconstitutional. The statutes pass
2	constitutional scrutiny under rational basis	test.
.3	Dated this 🐴 day of August, 201	ļ\$.
4		
<b>5</b> .		N N
6		DISTRICT COURT JUDGE
7	DATED this 20 day of August, 2015.	DATED this day of August, 2015.
8		<del></del>
9	Respectfully Submitted By:	Approved as to Form and Content:
10	EGLET PRINCE	LAURIA TOKUNAGA GATES & LINN
11		0
12	Mor	Land A Carlingly # 8394
13	DENNIS M. PRINCE, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 5092	ANTHONY D. LAURIA, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 4114
14	TRACY A. EGLET, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 6419	KIMBERLY L. JOHNSON, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 10554
15	DANIELLE TARMU, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 11727	601 South Seventh Street, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor Las Vegas, Nevada 89101
16	400 South Seventh Street, Suite 400 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101	Attorneys for Defendant
17	Attorneys for Plaintiff	

# EXHIBIT "4"

**CLERK OF THE COURT** 

ORDR DENNIS M. PRINCE, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 5092

TRACY A. EGLET, ESQ. 3 Nevada Bar No.: 6419

2

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

18

19

20

22 23

24

25

26

27

DANIELLE TARMU, ESQ.

Nevada Bar No.: 11727 5 EGLET PRINCE

400 South Seventh Street, #400 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101

dprince@exletiaw.com teglet@egletlaw.com

diarmu@egletlaw.com

(702) 450-5400 phone

(702) 450-5451 facsimile Attorneys for Plaintiff

Beau R. Orth

#### DISTRICT COURT

## CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

BEAU R. ORTH,

Plaintiff,

17

ALBERT H, CAPANNA, M.D.; DOES I through X; ROE BUSINESS ENTITIES I through X, inclusive,

Defendants. 21

CASE NO.: A-11-648041-C

DEPT. NO.: III

## ORDER REGARDING PLAINTIFF'S <u>MOTIONS IN LIMINE</u>

This matter having come on for hearing on the 14th day of August, 2015; Dennis M. Prince, Esq., and Danielle Tarmu, Esq. of Eglet Prince appearing on behalf of Plaintiff, Beau Orth; and Anthony D. Lauria, Esq. and Paul A. Cardinale, Esq. of Laura Tokunaga Gates & Linn, LLP, appearing on behalf of Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D. The Court, having read the moving papers and heard oral argument by counsel, and hereby rules as follows:

б

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Omnibus Motion in Limine No. 1 is ruled upon as follows:

- 1) Hypothetical Medical Condition. This Motion is GRANTED. Questions must be related to evidence in the record or evidence they reasonably anticipate will be presented at trial.
- Reference to Plaintiff Being a Malingerer, Magnifying Symptoms or Manifesting Secondary Gain Motives Should be Excluded. This Motion is GRANTED as unopposed. Defendant will not make this argument at all unless new evidence regarding these issues id disclosed at trial, in which case counsel must approach the bench before making any reference to the jury.
- References to Defense Medical Examiners as "Independent." This Motion is
   GRANTED as unopposed.
- 4) Closing Argument. This Motion is GRANTED as unopposed. Defendant will not argue that Plaintiff's counsel is asking for a higher verdict because he thinks the jury will award less. This order does not prevent Defendant from arguing that the amount requested by Plaintiff is not supported by the evidence.
- 5) Taxation. This Motion is GRANTED as unopposed. The parties will not reference taxation of any amount of damages.
- Precluding Reference as to Plaintiff's Counsel Working with Plaintiff's

  Treating Physicians on Unrelated Cases. This Motion is GRANTED IN PART and

  DENIED IN PART. Defendant can ask questions about the nature of physicians' practice,

  such as the amount of work for defense versus plaintiffs, and attorneys. However, Defendant

б

cannot ask specific questions about working with Plaintiff's counsel in the past, such as the number of times the doctor treated Plaintiff's counsel's clients.

 Exclude Collateral Sources of Payment. This Motion is DENIED without prejudice.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 2 to Exclude Irrelevant and/or Unduly Prejudicial Information is GRANTED. Any reference to Plaintiff's parents' alleged spinal treatment or Plaintiff having a congenital spinal condition is excluded from trial.

Unrelated Medical Conditions is GRANTED. Any reference to Plaintiff's previous injuries sustained while playing feetball and sports, including but not limited to, his ankle injury in his sophomore year of college, his torn ligament in his hand/thumb area approximately in 2009 or early 2010, and his March 2010 concussion, are excluded from trial. If Defendant believes that something at trial opens the door to allow questioning in this area, then the parties must approach the bench before asking questions or referencing it before the jury.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 4 to Permit Treating Physicians to Testify as to Causation, Diagnosis, Prognosis, Future Treatment, and Extent of Disability Without a Formal Expert Report is GRANTED. Dr. Cash can testify about billing, causation, prognosis, future treatment, and extent of disability without a formal expert report. He is a treating physician, not a retained expert. Asking a treating physician to do a future cost letter or certain other tasks does not automatically convert him/her to a retained expert.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 5 to Allow Parties to Present a Jury Questionnaire Prior to Voir Dire is MOOT as it is too late.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 6 to Limit Defendant's Experts' Testimony to the Opinions and Bases Set Forth in Their Expert Reports is GRANTED. Retained expert opinions must comply with NRCP 16.1(a)(2)(B) and be in a 16.1 disclosure, report, or deposition.

Dated this / day of August; 2015.

DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

DATED this \_\_\_\_\_ day of August, 2015.

DATED this \_\_\_\_ day of August, 2015.

Respectfully Submitted By:

Approved as to Form and Content:

EGLET PRINCE

LAURIA TOKUNAGA GATES & LINN

15 EGLET PRINCE

DENNIS M. PRINCE, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No. 5092
TRACY A. EGLET, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No. 6419
DANIELLE TARMU, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No.: 11727
400 South Seventh Street, Suite 400
Las Vegas, Nevada 89101

Attorneys for Plaintiff

ANTHONY D. LAURIA, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 4114
KIMBERLY L. JOHNSON, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 10554
601 South Seventh Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Las Vegas, Nevada 89101
Attorneys for Defendant

11

12 13

14

EGLET TPRINCE

15

16 17

18

19

20

21

22 23

24

25

26

27

28

DENNIS M. PRINCE, ESQ.

Nevada Bar No.: 5092

TRACY A. EGLET, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 6419

DANIELLE TARMU, ESQ.

Nevada Bar No.: 11727 EGLET PRINCE

400 South Seventh Street, #400

Las Vegas, Nevada 89101

eservice@egletlaw.com (702) 450-5400 phone

(702) 450-5451 facsimile

Attorneys for Plaintiff

Beau R. Orth

# IN THE EIGHTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT OF THE STATE OF NEVADA

# **CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA**

BEAU R. ORTH,

Plaintiff.

VS.

ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D.; DOES I through X; ROE BUSINESS ENTITIES I through X, inclusive,

Defendants.

CASE NO.: A-11-648041-C

DEPT. NO.: III

## PLAINTIFF'S CROSS-APPEAL STATEMENT

Pursuant to NRAP 3(a)(1), Plaintiff Beau Orth hereby submits the following cross-appeal

statement:

District Court Case Number and Caption Showing the Names of All Parties to the Α.

Proceedings:

Beau R. Orth, Plaintiff Albert H. Capanna, M.D., Defendant

Case No.: A-11-648041-C

Department No. III

1	B. Name of Judge Who Entered Order or Judgment Being Appealed:
2	Honorable Douglas Herndon
3	C. Name of Each Appellant and the Name and Address of Counsel for Each
4	Appellant:
5	Beau R. Orth is represented by the following counsel:
6	Dennis M. Prince
7	Danielle Tarmu Eglet Prince
9	400 South Seventh Street, Suite 400 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 Telephone: (702) 450-5400
10	D. Name of Each Respondent and the Name and Address of Each Respondent's
11	Appellate Counsel, if known:
12	Albert H. Cappana, M.D. is represented by the following counsel:
13   14	Anthony D. Laura
15	Lauria, Tokanaga, Gates & Linn 601 S. Seventh Avenue
16	Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 Telephone: (702) 387-8633
17	Robert L. Eisenberg
18	Lemons Grundy & Eisenberg 6005 Plumas Street, Third Floor
19	Reno, Nevada 89519 Telephone: (775) 786-6868
20	
21	E. Whether An Attorney Identified in Response to Subparagraph (D) is not
22	Licensed to Practice Law in Nevada, and if so, Whether the District Court Granted That
23	Attorney Permission to Appear Under SCR 42, Including a Copy of Any District Court Appeal:
24	All attorneys are licensed in Nevada.
25	F. Whether the Appellant Was Represented by Appointed or Retained
26	Counsel in the District Court, and Whether the Appellant is Represented by Appointed
27	Counsel on Appeal: Retained counsel.
28	

- G. Whether the Appellant was Granted Leave to Proceed in forma pauperis: No.
- H. <u>Date Proceedings Commenced in District Court</u>: September 8, 2011.
- I. Brief Description of Nature of the Action and Result in District Court, Including the Type of Judgment or Order Being Appealed and the Relief Granted by the District Court: Medical malpractice action wherein Defendant physician was found by a jury to be below the standard of care by performing surgery on the wrong level of Plaintiff's spine. This resulted in money judgment against Defendant. Appellant is appealing the admission of Plaintiff's collateral source information and the constitutionality of NRS 42.021, as permitted in the following orders: (1) Order Regarding Defendant's Motion for New Trial, or in the Alternative, for Amendment of Judgment, limited to the briefing regarding NRS 42.021 and any admission of Plaintiff's insurance information; (2) Order Regarding Defendant's Motion for Application of NRS 41A.035 and NRS 42.021, regarding NRS 42.021 only; (3) Order Regarding Plaintiff's Motion to Declare NRS 42.021 and NRS 41A.035 Unconstitutional, regarding NRS 42.021 only; and (4) Order Regarding Plaintiff's Omnibus Motion in Limine, Section 7, regarding Collateral Sources of Payment.
- J. Whether the Case Was Previously Subject of an Appeal to or Original Write Proceeding in the Supreme Court and, if so, the Caption and Supreme Court Docket Number of the Prior Proceeding: Defendant filed an appeal on March 7, 2016 and Plaintiff hereby files a cross-appeal. The caption and docket number of Defendant's appeal is: Albert H. Capanna, M.D., Appellant, vs. Beau R. Orth, Respondent, Supreme Court No. 69935.

||III||

26 ||///

27 | | ///

# EGLET TPRINCE

K.	Whether the Appeal Involves Child Custody or Visitation: No.
L.	Whether Appeal Involves Possibility of Settlement: Yes.
DATI	ED this A day of March, 2016.

EGLET PRINCE

DENMIS M. PRINCE, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 5092 TRACY A. EGLET, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 6419 DANIELLE TARMU, ESQ.

Nevada Bar No.: 11727

400 South Seventh Street, Box 1, Suite 400

Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 Attorneys for Plaintiff

# EGLET PRINCE

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Pursuant to NRCP 5(b), I certify that I am an employee of EGLET PRINCE, and that or
March <u>1</u> , 2016, I caused the foregoing document entitled <u>PLAINTIFF'S CROSS-APPEAL</u>
STATEMENT to be served upon those persons designated by the parties in the E-Service
Master List for the above-referenced matter in the Eighth Judicial District Court eFiling System
in accordance with the mandatory electronic service requirements of Administrative Order 14-2
and the Nevada Electronic Filing and Conversion Rules.

Anthony D. Lauria, Esq.
LAURIA, TOKUNAGA GATES& LINN, LLP
601 South Seventh Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor
Las Vegas, Nevada 89101
Alauria@ltglaw.net

Robert L. Eisenberg, Esq. LEMONS, GRUNDY & EISENBERG 6005 Plumas Street, Suite 300 Reno Nevada 89519 rle@lge.net

Attorneys for Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.

An Employee of Eglet Prince

# **CASE SUMMARY** CASE NO. A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

Location: Department 3 00 00 00 00 00 00 00 00 00 Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W. Filed on: 09/08/2011

Case Number History:

Cross-Reference Case A648041

Number:

Supreme Court No.: 69935

#### CASE INFORMATION

Case Type: Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**Appealed to Supreme Court** Case Flags:

Jury Demand Filed **Automatically Exempt from** 

Arbitration

Commissioner Bulla Recused

Lead Attorneys

Med Mal Case

DATE CASE ASSIGNMENT

Current Case Assignment

Case Number Court Date Assigned Judicial Officer

A-11-648041-C Department 3 08/07/2013 Herndon, Douglas W.

PARTY INFORMATION

Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Prince, Dennis M Retained

7022286800(W)

Lauria, Anthony D Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Retained

702-387-8633(W)

DATE	EVENTS & ORDERS OF THE COURT	INDEX
09/08/2011	Complaint Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Complaint	
09/08/2011	Case Opened	
09/08/2011	Med Mal Case	
11/16/2011	Affidavit of Due Diligence Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Affidavit of Due Diligence	
11/29/2011	Ex Parte Application Party: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Ex Parte Application to Effecutate Service of Process on Defendant by Certified Mail Pursuant to NRS 14.090(b)	
12/07/2011	Order Granting Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R	

# CASE SUMMARY

# CASE NO. A-11-648041-C

	CASE NO. A-11-048041-C
	Order Granting Ex Parte Application to Effectuate Service of Process on Defendant by Certified Mail Pursuant to NRS 14.090(b)
12/13/2011	Notice of Service Party: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Notice of Service of Summons and Complaint By Certified Mail Pursuant to NRS 14.090(b)
01/11/2012	Initial Appearance Fee Disclosure Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Initial Appearance Fee Disclosure
01/11/2012	Demand for Jury Trial Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.'s Demand for Jury Trial
01/11/2012	Answer to Complaint Filed by: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.'s Answer to Plaintiff's Complaint
01/25/2012	Notice of Early Case Conference Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Notice of NRCP 16.1 Early Case Conference
02/16/2012	Peremptory Challenge Filed by: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Peremptory Challenge of Judge
02/16/2012	Notice of Department Reassignment
03/16/2012	Joint Case Conference Report Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R  Joint Case Conference Report
03/27/2012	Scheduling Order Scheduling Order
07/06/2012	Order Setting Medical/Dental Malpractice Status Check Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Order Setting Medical/Dental Malpractice Status Check and Trial Setting Conference
08/08/2012	Status Check: Medical/Dental Malpractice (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Cory, Kenneth)
09/12/2012	Peremptory Challenge Filed by: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Peremptory Challenge
09/12/2012	Notice of Department Reassignment
02/05/2013	Status Check: Medical/Dental Malpractice (1:00 PM) (Judicial Officer: Wiese, Jerry A.)
02/22/2013	Order Setting Civil Jury Trial, Pre-Trial, and Calendar Call  Order Setting Civil Jury Trial (Med Mal Firm Setting)

# CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-11-648041-C

	CASE NO. A-11-648041-C
06/25/2013	Stipulation and Order to Extend Discovery Deadlines Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Stipulation and Order to Extend Discovery Deadlines (First Request)
06/25/2013	Notice of Entry of Order Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Notice of Entry of Order
08/06/2013	Status Check: Medical/Dental Malpractice (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Wiese, Jerry A.)
08/08/2013	Amended Order Setting Jury Trial  Amended Order Setting Civil Jury Trial
08/09/2013	Designation of Expert Witness Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Designation of Expert Witnesses
12/03/2013	Stipulation and Order to Extend Discovery Deadlines Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Stipulation and Order to Extend Discovery (Second Request)
12/04/2013	Notice of Entry of Stipulation and Order Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Notice of Entry of Stipulation and Order
12/12/2013	CANCELED Pre Trial Conference (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Sturman, Gloria)  Vacated - per Judge
12/18/2013	CANCELED Calendar Call (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Vacated - per Commissioner
01/02/2014	CANCELED Calendar Call (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Sturman, Gloria)  Vacated - per Judge
01/06/2014	CANCELED Jury Trial (10:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Vacated - per Commissioner
02/03/2014	CANCELED Jury Trial (10:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Sturman, Gloria)  Vacated - per Judge
02/04/2014	Status Check: Medical/Dental Malpractice (8:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Wiese, Jerry A.)
02/14/2014	Amended Order Setting Jury Trial  2nd Amended Order Setting Civil Jury Trial
07/08/2014	Substitution of Attorney Filed by: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Substitution of Attorneys
08/12/2014	Status Check: Medical/Dental Malpractice (8:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Wiese, Jerry A.)
08/12/2014	Status Check: Discovery (8:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Bulla, Bonnie)
08/13/2014	Arnended Order Setting Jury Trial

# CASE SUMMARY

# CASE NO. A-11-648041-C

	CASE NO. A-11-648041-C
	Amended Order Setting Civil Jury Trial (Med Mal Firm Set)
08/20/2014	Notice of Change of Address  Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R  Notice of Change of Address
09/12/2014	CANCELED Status Check: Compliance (11:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Bulla, Bonnie)  Vacated - per Commissioner
09/19/2014	Discovery Commissioners Report and Recommendations Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Discovery Commissioner's Report and Recommendations
09/22/2014	Notice of Entry of Order  Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H  Notice of Entry of Order
10/01/2014	CANCELED Calendar Call (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Vacated - per Judge
10/13/2014	CANCELED Jury Trial (10:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Vacated - per Judge
11/14/2014	Designation of Expert Witness Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Initial Expert Witness Disclosure Statement of Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.
11/14/2014	Designation of Expert Witness Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Designation of Expert Witnesses
11/19/2014	Designation of Expert Witness Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's First Supplement to Designation of Expert Witnesses
02/03/2015	Status Check: Medical/Dental Malpractice (8:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Wiese, Jerry A.)
02/03/2015	Status Check: Discovery (8:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Bulla, Bonnie)
02/04/2015	Amended Order Setting Jury Trial  Amended Order Setting Civil Jury Trial (Medical Malpractice)
02/11/2015	Notice of Change of Hearing  Notice of Change of Hearing
03/04/2015	CANCELED Calendar Call (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Vacated - Superseding Order
03/09/2015	CANCELED Status Check: Compliance (2:00 PM) (Judicial Officer: Bulla, Bonnie)  Vacated - Per Setting Slip
03/18/2015	Deposition Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Notice of taking Deposition of the Custodian of Records-Person Most Knowledgeable for Desert Institute of Spine Care Billing and Payment Information

# CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-11-648041-C

	CASE NO. A-11-040041-C
03/18/2015	Deposition Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Notice of Taking Deposition of the Custodian of Records-Person Most Knowledgeable for McKenna and Ruggeroli Pain Specialists Billing and Payment Information
03/18/2015	Deposition Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Notice of Taking Deposition of the Custodian of Records-Person Most Knowledgeable for Surgical Arts Center Billing and Payment Information
03/23/2015	Discovery Commissioners Report and Recommendations Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Discovery Commissioner's Report and Recommendations
03/25/2015	Notice of Deposition  Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H  Notice of Taking Deposition of Plaintiff, Beau R. Orth
03/30/2015	Notice of Vacating Deposition Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Notice Vacating Deposition of the Custodian of Records-Person Most Knowledgeable for Desert Institute of Spine Care Billing and Payment Information
03/30/2015	CANCELED Jury Trial (10:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Hemdon, Douglas W.)  Vacated - Superseding Order  Jury Trial Medical Malpractice (set during sweeps)
04/02/2015	Deposition Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H First Amended Notice of Taking Deposition of the Custodian of Records-Person Most Knowledgeable for McKenna and Ruggeroli Pain Specialists billing and Payment Information (change of location & date)
04/02/2015	Deposition Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H First Amended Notice of Taking deposition of the Custodian of Records-Person Most Knowledgeable for Surgical Arts Center Billing and Payment Information
04/08/2015	Designation of Expert Witness  Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R  Plaintiff's Second Supplement to Designation of Expert Witnesses
04/15/2015	Deposition Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H First Amended Notice of Taking Deposition of the Custodian of Records-Person Most Knowledgeable for Desert Institute of Spine Care Billing and Payment Information
04/15/2015	Notice of Association of Counsel Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Notice of Assocation of Counsel
05/05/2015	Notice of Deposition Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Notice of Taking Deposition of Anthony C. Ruggeroli, M.D.

# CASE SUMMARY CASE No. A-11-648041-C

	CASE NO. A-11-648041-C
05/08/2015	Notice to Vacate Deposition  Filed by: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H  Notice Vacating Deposition of the Custodian of Records-Person Most Knowledgeable for Desert Institute of Spine Care Billing and Payment Information.
05/15/2015	Deposition Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Second Amended Notice of Taking Deposition of the Custodian of Records-Person Most Knowledgeable for Desert Institute of Spine Care Billing and Payment Information.
05/28/2015	Deposition Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Second Amended Notice of Taking Deposition of the Custodian of Records-Person Most Knowledgeable for Desert Institute of Spine Care Billing and Payment Information
05/29/2015	Designation of Expert Witness Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Supplemental Expert Witness Disclosure Statement of Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.
06/01/2015	Amended Notice of Taking Deposition Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H  Amended Notice of Taking Deposition of Andrew Cash, M.D.
06/02/2015	Amended Notice of Taking Deposition Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Second Amended Notice of Taking Deposition of Andrew Cash, M.D.
06/03/2015	Deposition Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Third Amended Notice of Taking Deposition of the Custodian of Records-Person Most Knowledgeable for Desert Institute of Spine Care Billing and Payment Information
06/15/2015	Designation of Expert Witness Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Supplemental Expert Witness Disclosure Statement of Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.
06/18/2015	Designation of Expert Witness Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Supplemental Expert Witness Disclosure Statement of Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.
06/19/2015	Amended Notice of Taking Deposition Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Third Amended Notice of Taking Deposition of Andrew Cash, M.D.
06/19/2015	Designation of Expert Witness Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Supplemental Expert Witness Disclosure Statement of Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.
06/22/2015	Motion in Limine Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H  Defendant's Motions in Limine
06/22/2015	Notice of Hearing Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H

# CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-11-648041-C

	CASE NO. A-11-648041-C
	Notice of Hearing
06/22/2015	Omnibus Motion In Limine Filed by: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Omnibus Motion in Limine No. 1
06/22/2015	Motion in Limine Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 2: to Exclude Irrelevant and/or Unduly Prejudicial Information
06/22/2015	Motion in Limine Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 3: to Exclude Prior Unrelated Medical Conditions
06/22/2015	Motion in Limine Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 4: Permit Treating Physicians to Testify as to Causation, Diagnosis, Prognosis, Future Treatment, and Extent of Disability Without a Formal Expert Report
06/22/2015	Motion Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Motion No. 5 to Allow Parties to Present a Jury Questionnaire Prior to Voir Dire
06/22/2015	Motion in Limine Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 6 to Limit Defendant's Experts' Testimony to the Opinions and Bases Set Forth in Their Expert REports
06/24/2015	Notice to Vacate Deposition Filed by: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Notice Vacating Deposition of The Custodian of Records-Person Most Knowledgeable for Desert Institute of Spine Care Billing and Payment Information
07/02/2015	Deposition Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Fourth Amended Notice of Taking Deposition of the Custodian of Records-Person Most Knowledgeable for Desert Institute of Spine Care Billing and Payment Information
07/09/2015	Opposition Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendant's Motion in Limine
07/09/2015	Opposition to Motion in Limine Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant's Response and Opposition to Plaintiff's Omnibus Motion in Limine No. 1
07/09/2015	Opposition to Motion in Limine Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H  Defendant's Response and Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 2: to Exclude  Irrelevant and/or Unduly Prejudicial Information
07/09/2015	Opposition to Motion in Limine Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H

# CASE SUMMARY

CASE NO. A-11-648041-C

	CASE NO. A-11-648041-C
	Defendant's Response and Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 3: to Exclude Prior Unrelated Medical Conditions
07/09/2015	Opposition to Motion in Limine Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant's Response and Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 4: Permit Treating Physicians to Testify as to Causation, Diagnosis, Prognosis, Future Treatment, and Extent of Disability Without a Formal Expert Report
07/09/2015	Opposition to Motion in Limine Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant's Response and Limited Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 5: to Allow Parties to Present a Jury Questionnaire Prior to Voir Dire
07/09/2015	© Opposition to Motion in Limine Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant's Response and Limited Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 6: to Limit Defendant's Expert's Testimony to the Opinions and Bases Set Forth in Their Reports
07/13/2015	Motion Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Motion to Declare NRS 42.021 and NRS 41A.035 Unconstitutional
07/20/2015	Pre-Trial Disclosure Party: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Pre-Trial Disclosure Pursuant to NRCP 16.1(a)(3)
07/21/2015	Pre-trial Memorandum Filed by: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Pre-Trial Memorandum
07/21/2015	Pre-Trial Disclosure Party: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.'s Pretrial Disclosure Pursuant to NRCP 16.1(a)(3)
07/21/2015	Pre-Trial Disclosure Party: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.'s Supplemental Pretrial Disclosure Pursuant to NRCP 16.1(a)(3)
07/22/2015	Motion Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Motion for a Rebuttable Presumption Jury Instruction Pursuant to NRS 414. 100
07/22/2015	Calendar Call (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)
07/22/2015	Designation of Expert Witness Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Supplemental Expert Witness Disclosure Statement of Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.
07/23/2015	Pre-Trial Disclosure Party: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.'s Second Supplemental Pretrial Disclosure Pursuant to NRCP 16.1(a)(3)

# CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-11-648041-C

	CASE NO. A-11-048041-C
07/27/2015	Errata Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.'s Errata to Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.'s Pretrial Disclosure and Supplemental Pretrial Disclosures
07/27/2015	Errata Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.'s Errata to Supplement to NRCP 16.1 Early Case Conference Disclosure of Witnesses and Documents
07/27/2015	Designation of Expert Witness Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Supplemental Expert Witness Disclosure Statement of Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.
07/27/2015	Pre-Trial Disclosure Party: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.'s Third Supplemental Pretrial Disclosure Pursuant to NRCP 16.1(a)(3)
07/27/2015	Supplemental Filed by: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.'s Supplement to NRCP 16.1 Early Case Conference Disclosure of Witnesses and Documents
07/28/2015	Motion Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant's Trial Brief and Motion to Limit Damages to those Caused by Acts of Alleged Negligence
07/28/2015	Motion Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant's Motion re Application of NRS 50.275 and to Exclude Testimony regarding Future Treatment and Surgery Made Without Scientific Basis
07/30/2015	Opposition to Motion Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant's Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion to Declare NRS 42.021 and NRS 414.035 Unconstitutional
08/03/2015	Reply in Support Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Reply in Support of Omnibus Motion in Limine No. 1
08/03/2015	Reply in Support Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Reply in Support of Motion in Limine No. 5: to Allow Parties to Present a Jury Questionnaire Prior to Voir Dire
08/03/2015	Reply in Support  Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R  Plaintiff's Reply in Support of Motion in Limine No. 6: to Limit Defendant's Experts' Testimony to the Opinions and Bases Set Forth in Their Expert Reports
08/03/2015	Reply in Support Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R

# CASE SUMMARY

CASE NO. A-11-648041-C

Plaintiff's Reply in Support of Motion in Limine No. 4: to Permit Treating Physicians to Testify as to Causation, Diagnosis, Prognosis, Future Treatment, and Extent of Disability Without a Formal Expert Report 08/03/2015 Objection Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.'s Objection to Plaintiff's Pretrial Disclosure Pursuant to  $NRCP\ 16.1(a)(3)(c)$ 08/03/2015 Status Check: Medical/Dental Malpractice (8:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Wiese, Jerry A.) 08/03/2015 Reply to Opposition Filed by: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Reply to Opposition to Defendant's Motions in Limine 08/03/2015 Reply in Support Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Reply in Support of Motion in Limine No. 2: to Exclude Irrelevant and/or Unduly Prejudicial Information 08/03/2015 Reply in Support Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Reply in Support of Motion in Limine No. 3: to Exclude Prior Unrelated Medical Conditions Motion to Strike 08/04/2015 Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Motion to Strike Defendant's Untimely Disclosures on Order Shortening Time 08/07/2015 Opposition Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendant's Trial Brief and Motion to Limit Damages to Those Caused by Acts of Alleged Negligence 08/07/2015 Opposition Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendant's Motion Re Application of NRS 50.275 and to Exclude Testimony Regarding Future Treatment and Surgery Made Without Scientific Basis 08/07/2015 Reply to Opposition Filed by: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Reply to Defendant's Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion to Declare NRS 42.021 and NRS 41A.035 Unconstitutional 08/09/2015 Opposition and Countermotion Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant's Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion to Strike Untimely Disclosures and Counter-Motion to Exclude Improper "Supplemental" Disclosures and Claims for Future Damages 08/10/2015 Opposition to Motion Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant's Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for a Rebuttable Presumption Jury Instruction Pursuant to NRS 41A.100 08/12/2015 Pre-trial Memorandum

# CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-11-648041-C

	CASE NO. A-11-648041-C
	Filed by: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H  Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.'s Pre-Trial Memorandum
08/12/2015	Brief Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Trial Brief re Limited Hearsay Exception for Statements Made to a Physician
08/12/2015	Brief Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant's Trial Brief re NRS 42.021 and Introduction of Evidence of Benefits Payable to Plaintiff, Requirement that Plaintiff Obtain Medical Insurance Pursuant to Affordable Care Act Which Will Cover Claimed Future Medical Costs; Request for Periodic Payments for Any Award for Future Damages Over \$50,000
08/12/2015	Reply to Opposition Filed by: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Reply to Opposition to Defendant's Motion re Application of NRS 50.275 and to Exclude Testimony regarding Future Treatment and Surgery Made Without Scientific Basis
08/13/2015	Reply in Support Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Reply in Support of Motion for a Rebuttable Presumption Jury Instruction Pursuant to NRS 414.100
08/13/2015	Reply in Support Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Reply in Support of Motion to Strike Untimely Disclosures and Opposition to Defendant's Counter-Motion to Exclude Improper "Supplemental" Disclosures and Claims for Future Damages
08/14/2015	Omnibus Motion in Limine (1:00 PM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Defendant's Motions in Limine
08/14/2015	Motion in Limine (1:00 PM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 2: to Exclude Irrelevant and/or Unduly Prejudicial Information
08/14/2015	Motion in Limine (1:00 PM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 3: to Exclude Prior Unrelated Medical Conditions
08/14/2015	Motion in Limine (1:00 PM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 4: Permit Treating Physicians to Testify as to Causation, Diagnosis, Prognosis, Future Treatment, and Extent of Disability Without a Formal Expert Report
08/14/2015	Motion in Limine (1:00 PM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 6: to Limit Defendant's Experts' Testimony to the Opinions and Bases Set Forth in Their Expert Reports
08/14/2015	Motion (1:00 PM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Plaintiff's Motion No. 5 to Allow Parties to Present a Jury Questionnaire Prior to Voir Dire
08/14/2015	Omnibus Motion in Limine (1:00 PM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Plaintiff's Omnibus Motion in Limine No. 1
08/14/2015	Motion (1:00 PM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Plaintiff's Motion to Declare NRS 42.021 and NRS 41A.035 Unconstitutional
08/14/2015	Motion (1:00 PM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)

# CASE SUMMARY CASE No. A-11-648041-C

	CASE NO. A-11-648041-C
	Plaintiff's Motion for a Rebuttable Presumption Jury Instruction Pursuant to NRS 414.100
08/14/2015	Motion (1:00 PM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Defendant's Motion re Application of NRS 50.275 and to Exclude Testimony regarding Future  Treatment and Surgery Made Without Scientific Basis
08/14/2015	Motion (1:00 PM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Defendant's Trial Brief and Motion to Limit Damages to those Caused by Acts of Alleged  Negligence
08/14/2015	Motion to Strike (1:00 PM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Plaintiff's Motion to Strike Defendant's Untimely Disclosures on Order Shortening Time
08/14/2015	Opposition and Countermotion (1:00 PM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Defendant's Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion to Strike Untimely Disclosures and Counter- Motion to Exclude Improper "Supplemental" Disclosures and Claims for Future Damages
08/14/2015	All Pending Motions (1:00 PM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)
08/17/2015	CANCELED Jury Trial (10:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Vacated  Med Mal Sweeps
08/19/2015	Motion (10:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.) 08/19/2015-08/21/2015 Defendant's Trial Brief and Motion to Limit Damages to those Caused by Acts of Alleged Negligence
08/19/2015	Jury Trial - FIRM (10:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.) 08/19/2015-08/21/2015, 08/24/2015-08/28/2015, 08/31/2015-09/02/2015
08/20/2015	Brief Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Trial Brief No. 1
08/21/2015	Receipt of Copy Filed by: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Receipt of Copy
08/21/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Recorder's Partial Transcript of Proceedings: Jury Trial - Day 1 August 19, 2015
08/21/2015	Jury List
08/22/2015	Order Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Order Regarding Plaintiff's Motion to Declare NRS 42.021 and NRS 414.035 UnConstitutional
08/22/2015	Order Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Order Regarding Plaintiff's Motion to Strike Untimely Disclosures on Order Shortening Time
08/25/2015	Brief Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Trial Brief No. 2 (regarding collections notices)

# CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-11-648041-C

	CASE 110. A-11-040041-C
08/26/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Partial Transcript of Proceedings Trial by Jury - Day 3 Plaintiff's Opening Statements Only
08/26/2015	Media Request and Order Party: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Media Request And Order Allowing Camera Access To Court Proceedings
08/26/2015	Media Request and Order Party: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Media Request And Order Allowing Camera Access To Court Proceedings
08/27/2015	Jury Instructions Party: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Amended Proposed Jury Instructions
08/27/2015	Jury Instructions Party: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Proposed Jury Instructions
08/27/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Transcript of Proceedings Jury Trial - Testimony of Dr. Allan Belzberg August 24, 2015
08/28/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Transcript of Proceedings Excerpt of Jury Trial 4 Testimony of Andrw Cash August 24, 2015
08/31/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Recorder's Transcript of Proceedings Jury Trial - Testimony of Dr. Frank Yoo August 25,  2015
08/31/2015	Jury Instructions Party: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant's Proposed Jury Instructions
09/01/2015	Amended Jury List  Amended Jury
09/01/2015	Jury Instructions
09/02/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Recorder's Transcript Re: All Pending Motions 08/14/15
09/02/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Recorder's Transcript of Jury Trial - Day 8; Testimony of Albert Capanna 08-28-15
09/02/2015	Jury Verdict
09/02/2015	Request  Request for Application of N.R.S. 41A.035, N.R.S. 42.021
09/09/2015	Ex Parte Application Party: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H

### CASE SUMMARY

#### CASE NO. A-11-648041-C

	CASE NO. A-11-040041-C
	Defendant's Ex Parte Application for Motion to Stay Entry of Judgment Pending Motion to Apply Provisions of NRS 41A.035 and NRS. 42.021
09/11/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing Party: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Partial Transcript of Proceedings Trial by Jury Day 9, Direct Examination of Dr. Marc Kaye Only August 31, 2015
09/11/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing Party: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Partial Transcript of Proceedings Trial by Jury Day 10, Plaintiff's Rebuttal Closing Statements Only Septembe 1, 2015
09/25/2015	Opposition Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendant's Ex Parte Application for Motion to Stay Entry of Judgment Pending Motion to Apply Provisions of NRS 41A.035 and NRS 42.021
10/01/2015	Memorandum of Costs and Disbursements  Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R  Plaintiff's Memorandum of Costs and Disbursements
10/02/2015	Notice of Intent Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Notice of Intend to File Motion to Retax and Settle the Costs
10/06/2015	Motion to Retax Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Motion to Retax and Settle the Costs
10/14/2015	Motion to Stay (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Defendant's Ex Parte Application for Motion to Stay Entry of Judgment Pending Motion to Apply Provisions of NRS 41A.035 and NRS. 42.021
10/23/2015	Motion Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H  Motion for Application of NRS 41A.035, NRS 42.021
10/26/2015	Judgment on Jury Verdict Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R  Judgment Upon the Jury Verdict
10/26/2015	Judgment Plus Legal Interest (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.) Debtors: Albert H Capanna, MD (Defendant) Creditors: Beau R Orth (Plaintiff) Judgment: 10/26/2015, Docketed: 11/02/2015 Total Judgment: 4,659,490.49
10/27/2015	Objection Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D.'s Objection to Judgment on the Jury Verdict
10/27/2015	Opposition Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendant's Motion to Retax and Settle the Costs

# CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-11-648041-C

10/28/2015	Notice of Entry of Judgment Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Notice of Entry of Order
10/30/2015	Reply to Opposition Filed by: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant's Reply to Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendant's Motion to Retax and Settle The Costs
11/04/2015	Opposition Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendant's Motion for Application of NRS 41A.035 [AND] NRS 42.021
11/09/2015	Motion to Retax (3:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Defendant's Motion to Retax and Settle the Costs
11/09/2015	Motion for New Trial Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant's Motion for New Trial, or In The Alternative, For Amendment of Judgment
11/10/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Partial Transcript of Proceedings Trial by Jury Day 3 August 21, 2015
11/11/2015	Reply to Opposition Filed by: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Reply to Opposition to Motion for Application of N.R.S. 41A.035 and N.R.S. 42.021
11/12/2015	Notice of Association of Counsel Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Notice of Association of Counsel
11/16/2015	Motion for Attorney Fees Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Motion for Attorney's Fees
11/16/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Recorder's Partial Transcript of Proceedings Jury Trial Day 4; Bench Conferences and  Testimony of Andrew Cash Not Previously Transcribed August 24, 2015
11/16/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Recorder's Partial Transcript of Proceedings Jury Trial Day 5; Bench Conferences and  Proceedings Not Previously Transcribed August 25, 2015
11/16/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Recorder's Transcript of Proceedings Jury Trial Day 6 August 26, 2015
11/16/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Recorder's Transcript of Proceedings Jury Trial Day 7 August 27, 2015
11/17/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Recorder's Partial Transcript of Proceedings Jury Trial Day 8 August 28, 2015

## CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-11-648041-C

	CASE NO. A-11-648041-C
11/17/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Recorder's Partial Transcript of Proceedings Jury Trial Day 9 August 31, 2015
11/18/2015	Motion (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Argument: Motions
11/18/2015	Motion (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.) 11/18/2015, 12/16/2015 Defendant's Motion for Application of NRS 414.035, NRS 42.021
11/18/2015	All Pending Motions (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)
11/18/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Recorder's Transcript of Proceedings Jury Trial, Day 11, September 2, 2015
11/18/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Recorder's Transcript of Proceedings Defendant's Ex Parte Application for Motion to Stay  Entry of Judgment Pending Motion to Apply Provisions of NRS 41A.035 and NRS 42.021,  October 14, 2015
11/23/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Transcript of Proceedings Jury Trial Day 10 September 1, 2015
12/01/2015	Order Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Order Regarding Plaintiff's Motions in Limine
12/02/2015	Opposition Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Opposition to Motion for Attorney's Fees
12/02/2015	Opposition Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendant's Motion for New Trial, or in the Alternative For Amendment of Judgment
12/03/2015	Notice of Entry of Order Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Notice of Entry of Order
12/10/2015	Stipulation and Order Filed by: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Stipulation and Order to Continue Hearings
12/11/2015	Reply to Opposition Filed by: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant's Reply to Opposition to Motion for New Trial, or in the Alternative, For Amendment of Judgment
12/15/2015	Reply in Support  Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R  Plaintiff's Reply in Support of Motion for Attorney's Fees
12/16/2015	Motion for New Trial (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Defendant's Motion for New Trial, or In The Alternative, For Amendment of Judgment

# CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-11-648041-C

ı	CASE NO. A-11-040041-C	1
12/16/2015	All Pending Motions (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)	
12/21/2015	Motion for Attorney Fees and Costs (3:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Plaintiff's Motion for Attorney Fees and Costs	
12/23/2015	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Recorder's Transcript of Defendant's Motion for New Trial, or in the Alternative, for  Amendment of Judgment; and Defendant's Motion for Application fo NRS 41A.035, NRS  42.021	
01/28/2016	Amended Judgment Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Amended Judgment Upon the Jury Verdict	
01/28/2016	Amended Verdict (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.) Debtors: Albert H Capanna, MD (Defendant) Creditors: Beau R Orth (Plaintiff) Judgment: 01/28/2016, Docketed: 09/04/2015 Total Judgment: 941,435.34	
02/01/2016	CANCELED Status Check: Medical/Dental Malpractice (8:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Wiese, Jerry A.)  Vacated	
02/03/2016	Notice of Entry of Judgment Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Notice of Entry of Judgment	
02/10/2016	Order Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Order Regarding Defendant's Motion for New Trial, or in the Alternative, for Amendment of Judgment	
02/10/2016	Order Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Order Regarding Defendant's Motion for Application of NRS 41A.035 and 42.021	
02/11/2016	Notice of Entry of Order Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Notice of Entry of Order	
02/11/2016	Notice of Entry of Order Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Notice of Entry of Order	
03/04/2016	Motion to Strike Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Motion to Strike New Arguments and Law Raised in Defendant's Reply Related to His Motion for New Trial on Order Shortening Time	
03/04/2016	Receipt of Copy Filed by: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Receipt of Copy	
02/01/2016 02/03/2016 02/10/2016 02/10/2016 02/11/2016 02/11/2016	Debtors: Albert H Capanna, MD (Defendant) Creditors: Beau R Orth (Plaintiff) Judgment: 01/28/2016, Docketed: 09/04/2015 Total Judgment: 941,435.34  CANCELED Status Check: Medical/Dental Malpractice (8:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Willerry A.) Vacated  Notice of Entry of Judgment Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Notice of Entry of Judgment Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Order Regarding Defendant's Motion for New Trial, or in the Alternative, for Amendment Judgment  Order Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Order Regarding Defendant's Motion for Application of NRS 41A.035 and 42.021  Notice of Entry of Order Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Notice of Entry of Order Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Notice of Entry of Order Motion to Strike Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Motion to Strike New Arguments and Law Raised in Defendant's Reply Related His Motion for New Trial on Order Shortening Time  Receipt of Copy Filed by: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R	t of

# CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-11-648041-C

	CASE NO. A-11-040041-C	
03/07/2016	Notice of Appeal Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Notice of Appeal	
03/07/2016	Case Appeal Statement Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Case Appeal Statement	
03/07/2016	Notice of Filing Cost Bond Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Notice of Cost Bond	
03/08/2016	Opposition Filed By: Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Opposition to Motion to Strike	
03/15/2016	Reply in Support Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Reply in Support of Motion to Strike New Arguments and Law Raised in Defendant's Reply Related to His Motion for New Trial on Order Shortening Time	
03/16/2016	Motion to Strike (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Herndon, Douglas W.)  Plaintiff's Motion to Strike New Arguments and Law Raised in Defendant's Reply Related to  His Motion for New Trial on Order Shortening Time	
03/21/2016	Notice of Appeal Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Notice of Cross-Appeal	
03/21/2016	Case Appeal Statement Filed By: Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Plaintiff's Cross-Appeal Statement	
DATE	FINANCIAL INFORMATION	
	Defendant Capanna, MD, Albert H Total Charges Total Payments and Credits Balance Due as of 3/23/2016	247.00 247.00 <b>0.00</b>
	Plaintiff Orth, Beau R Total Charges Total Payments and Credits Balance Due as of 3/23/2016	294.00 294.00 <b>0.00</b>

#### CIVIL COVER SHEET

Clark County, Nevada
Case No. \_\_\_\_

A-11-648041-C XXVII

(Assigned by Clerk's Office) I. Party Information Plaintiff(s) (name/address/phone): BEAU R. ORTH Defendant(s) (name/address/phone): ALBERT H. CAPANNA, MD Attorney (name/address/phone): Attorney (name/address/phone): Dennis M. Prince, Prince & Keating, 3230 S. Buffalo Drive, Suite 108, Las Vegas, Nevada 89117 (702) 228-6800 II. Nature of Controversy (Please check applicable bold category and Arbitration Requested applicable subcategory, if appropriate) Civil Cases Real Property Torts Negligence Landlord/Tenant Product Liability ☐ Negligence – Auto Product Liability/Motor Vehicle ☐ Unlawful Detainer Negligence - Medical/Dental Other Torts/Product Liability Title to Property ☐ Negligence – Premises Liability ☐ Intentional Misconduct ☐ Foreclosure ☐ Torts/Defamation (Libel/Slander) (Slip/Fall) Liens ☐ Interfere with Contract Rights ☐ Negligence - Other Quiet Title ☐ Employment Torts (Wrongful termination) ☐ Specific Performance Other Torts Condemnation/Eminent Domain ☐ Anti-trust ☐ Fraud/Misrepresentation Other Real Property Insurance ☐ Partition Legal Tort ☐ Planning/Zoning ☐ Unfair Competition Probate Other Civil Filing Types Appeal from Lower Court (also check Construction Defect ☐ Summary Administration applicable civil case box) Chapter 40 General Administration Transfer from Justice Court ☐ General ☐ Justice Court Civil Appeal Special Administration ☐ Breach of Contract Building & Construction Civil Writ Set Aside Estates Insurance Carrier Other Special Proceeding ☐ Trust/Conservatorships Commercial Instrument Other Civil Filing ☐ Individual Trustee Other Contracts/Acct/Judgment Compromise of Minor's Claim Corporate Trustee Collection of Actions Conversion of Property Employment Contract Other Probate ☐ Damage to Property Guarantee Employment Security Sale Contract Enforcement of Judgment Uniform Commercial Code Foreign Judgment - Civil Civil Petition for Judicial Review Other Administrative Law Other Personal Property Recovery of Property Department of Motor Vehicles Stockholder Suit Worker's Compensation Appeal Other Civil Matters III. Business Court Requested (Please check applicable category; for Clark or Washoe Counties only.) ☐ NRS Chapters 78-88 ☐ Investments (NRS 104 Art. 8) ☐ Enhanced Case Mgmt/Business Commodities (NRS 90) Deceptive Trade Practices (NRS 598) Other Business Court Matters Securities (NRS 90) Trademarks (NRS 600A) 09/8/11 Date Signature of initiating party or representative



ORDR 1 Electronically Filed ROBERT L. EISENBERG (Nevada Bar No. 950) 02/10/2016 11:50:25 AM 2 Lemons, Grundy & Eisenberg 6005 Plumas Street, Third Floor 3 Reno, Nevada 89509 4 775-786-6868 CLERK OF THE COURT 775-786-9756 5 Email: rie@lge.net Ó Anthony D. Lauria 7 Nevada Bar No. 4114 LAURIA TOKUNAGA GATES & LINN, LLP 8 601 South Seventh Street, 2nd Floor 9 Las Vegas, NV 89101 Tel: (702) 387-8633 10 Fax: (702) 387-8635 ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT  $\Pi$ 12 IN THE EIGHTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT OF THE STATE OF NEVADA 13 IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF CLARK 14 BEAU R. ORTH, Case No. A-11-648041 15 Plaintiff, Dept. No. III 16 ORDER REGARDING VS. 17 DEFENDANT'S MOTION ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D. FOR NEW TRIAL, OR IN 18 Defendant. THE ALTERNATIVE, FOR 19 AMENDMENT OF JUDGMENT 20 21 22 This matter was heard by the Court on December 16, 2015. Dennis M. Prince, of 23 Eglet Prince, appeared on behalf of Plaintiff Orth. Anthony D. Lauria, of Lauria Tokunaga Gates & Linn, LLP, and Robert L. Eisenberg, of Lemons, Grundy & 24 25 Eisenberg, appeared on behalf of Defendant Capanna. Having considered the motion papers and the oral arguments by counsel, the Court hereby rules as follows: 26 27 III

#### Motion for New Trial

The Court finds that Defendant has not established grounds for a new trial, pursuant to NRCP 59. The Court affirms its pretrial rulings dealing with discovery and evidence relating to expert witnesses. The Court finds no basis to grant a new trial, pursuant to NRCP 59, regarding discussions about insurance in *voir dire*, jury instructions or arguments by plaintiff's counsel.

The Court also finds no basis for a new trial regarding MRI presentations at trial.

And the Court finds no basis for a new trial on other issues raised in Defendant's Motion for New Trial.

Accordingly, the Motion for New Trial is denied.

#### Motion for Amendment of Judgment

This motion seeks an amendment of the judgment, to comply with NRS 41A.035, which imposes a cap on noneconomic damages. Having considered the motion papers and the arguments of counsel, the Court hereby grants the Motion for Amendment of the Judgment. The noneconomic damages will be reduced to \$350,000. This amount will apply entirely to the past noneconomic damages.

It is so ORDERED.

DATED: 55 2016

DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

Order initially prepared by:

RÖBERT L. EISENBERG

(Nv. Bar No. 0950)

Lemons, Grundy & Eisenberg

6005 Plumas Street, Third Floor

Reno, Nevada 89519

775-786-6868

Email: rie@lge.net

Attorneys for Defendant

23 24

25

26

Ĩ.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

27

1	NEOU	Alun b. Comm
2	Anthony D. Lauria   Nevada Bar No.: 4114	CLERK OF THE COURT
3	Kimberly L. Johnson Nevada Bar No.: 10554	CLERK OF THE GOOK!
	LAURIA TOKUNAGA GATES & LINN, LI 601 South Seventh Street, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor	.P
4	601 South Seventh Street, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor Las Vegas, Nevada 89101	
5 6	Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 (702) 387-8633; Fax: (702) 387-8635 Attorneys for <i>Defendant ALBERT H.</i> <i>M.D.</i>	. CAPANNA,
7	DIST	RICT COURT
8		OUNTY NEVADA
9		
_0	BEAU R. ORTH,	) CASE NO. : A-11-648041-C ) DEPT. NO. : 3
.1	Plaintiff,	NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER
	v.	\ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \
_2	ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D.; DOES	}
.3	ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D.; DOES I THROUGH X; ROE BUSINESS ENTITIES I THROUGH X,	}
.4	Defendants.	<b>\</b>
.5	Defendants.	_}
.6		
.7	NOTICE IS HEREBY GIVEN	that the above-entitled court entered its Order
	on February 4, 2016, a copy of which i	s attached.
8	Dated: February 11, 2016.	
9	LAUR	IA TOKUNAGA GATES & LINN, LLP
0	By:	/s/ ANTHONY D. LAURIA
1	Dy.	Anthony D. Lauria
2		Nevada Bar No.: 4114 601 South Seventh Street
3		Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 Attorneys for Defendant
4		Tibotheys for Determant
5		
6		
7		
8.		
:9		
0		

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE Pursuant to N.R.C.P. 5(b), I certify that I am an employee of Lauria Tokunaga Gates & Linn, and that on the 11<sup>th</sup> day of February 2016, I served a true and correct copy of the foregoing NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER: By placing same to be deposited for mailing in the United States Mail, in a sealed envelope upon which first class postage was prepared in Las Vegas, Nevada; and/or X Via electronic mail; and/or Via facsimile; and/or Via Receipt of Copy to the interested parties as follows: Dennis M. Prince, Esq. Eglet Prince 400 S. 7<sup>th</sup> Street, Box 1, Suite 400 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 Attorneys for Plaintiff BEAU R. ORTH /s/ CARRIE C. TAYLOR Carrie C. Taylor Lauria Tokunaga Gates & Linn 



ORDR 1 Electronically Filed ROBERT L. EISENBERG (Nevada Bar No. 950) 2 02/10/2016 11:50:25 AM Lemons, Grundy & Eisenberg 6005 Plumas Street, Third Floor 3 Reno, Nevada 89509 4 775-786-6868 CLERK OF THE COURT 775-786-9756 5 Email: rie@lge.net ð Anthony D. Lauria 7 Nevada Bar No. 4114 LAURIA TOKUNAGA GATES & LINN, LLP 601 South Seventh Street, 2nd Floor 9 Las Vegas, NV 89101 Tel: (702) 387-8633 10 Fax: (702) 387-8635 ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT 11 12 IN THE EIGHTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT OF THE STATE OF NEVADA 13 IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF CLARK 14 BEAUR. ORTH, Case No. A-11-648041 15 Plaintiff, Dept. No. III 16 VS. ORDER REGARDING 17 DEFENDANT'S MOTION ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D. 18 FOR NEW TRIAL, OR IN Defendant. THE ALTERNATIVE, FOR 19 AMENDMENT OF JUDGMENT 20 21 This matter was heard by the Court on December 16, 2015. Dennis M. Prince, of 22 Egiet Prince, appeared on behalf of Plaintiff Orth. Anthony D. Lauria, of Lauria 23 Tokunaga Gates & Linn, LLP, and Robert L. Eisenberg, of Lemons, Grundy & 24 Eisenberg, appeared on behalf of Defendant Capanna. Having considered the motion 25 papers and the oral arguments by counsel, the Court hereby rules as follows: 27

///

#### Motion for New Trial

The Court finds that Defendant has not established grounds for a new trial, pursuant to NRCP 59. The Court affirms its pretrial rulings dealing with discovery and evidence relating to expert witnesses. The Court finds no basis to grant a new trial, pursuant to NRCP 59, regarding discussions about insurance in voir dire, jury instructions or arguments by plaintiff's counsel.

The Court also finds no basis for a new trial regarding MRI presentations at trial. And the Court finds no basis for a new trial on other issues raised in Defendant's Motion for New Trial.

Accordingly, the Motion for New Trial is denied.

#### Motion for Amendment of Judgment

This motion seeks an amendment of the judgment, to comply with NRS 41A.035, which imposes a cap on noneconomic damages. Having considered the motion papers and the arguments of counsel, the Court hereby grants the Motion for Amendment of the Judgment. The noneconomic damages will be reduced to \$350,000. This amount will apply entirely to the past noneconomic damages.

414

It is so ORDERED.

DATED: 15/2016

T COURT JUDGE

Order initially prepared by:

RÖBERT L. EISENBERG

(Nv. Bar No. 0950)

Lemons, Grundy & Eisenberg

6005 Plumas Street, Third Floor

Reno, Nevada 89519

775-786-6868

Email: rie@lge.net Attorneys for Defendant

Į

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26



Electronically Filed 02/10/2016 11:53:07 AM

ROBERT L. EISENBERG (Nevada Bar No. 950)

CLERK OF THE COURT

Case No. A-11-648041

ORDER REGARDING

DEFENDANT'S MOTION

FOR APPLICATION OF

NRS 41A.035 and 42.021

Dept. No. III

**ORDR** 

2

4

5

Lemons, Grundy & Eisenberg 6005 Plumas Street, Third Floor

Reno, Nevada 89509

775-786-6868

775-786-9756

Email: rie@lge.net

6 7

8

Anthony D. Lauria Nevada Bar No. 4114

LAURIA TOKUNAGA GATES & LINN, LLP

601 South Seventh Street, 2nd Floor

<sup>9</sup> Las Vegas, NV 89101

Tel: (702) 387-8633

Fax: (702) 387-8635

ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT

ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D.

12

13

10

11

IN THE EIGHTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT OF THE STATE OF NEVADA IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF CLARK

Plaintiff.

Defendant.

14

15 BEAU R. ORTH,

VS,

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

This matter was heard by the Court on December 16, 2015. Dennis M. Prince, of Eglet Prince, appeared on behalf of Plaintiff Orth. Anthony D. Lauria, of Lauria Tokunaga Gates & Linn, LLP, and Robert L. Eisenberg, of Lemons, Grundy & Eisenberg, appeared on behalf of Defendant Capanna. Having considered the motion papers and the oral arguments by counsel, the Court hereby rules as follows:

27

28

 $H\!\!H$ 

#### NRS 41A.035

This statute imposes a cap of \$350,000 on noneconomic damages.<sup>1</sup> The Court finds that statute is applicable and that Plaintiff's noneconomic damages must not exceed \$350,000. Nevertheless, the Court denies Defendant's request to apportion noneconomic damages between past and future damages. The Court finds that the entire \$350,000 amount of noneconomic damages should be attributed to past damages.

#### NRS 42.021

Subsections (3) through (8) of this statute deal with periodic payments for future damages. The Court finds that the statutory provisions for periodic payments apply to the amount awarded by the jury for future medical expenses, i.e., \$350,000. The Court finds that this portion of the judgment shall be paid in three periodic payments. The first payment will be the amount of \$175,000, which consists of one-half of the future medical expenses awarded by the jury. This amount will be paid within six months after entry of the amended judgment. The second periodic payment will be the amount of \$88,000, which will be paid within one year after entry of the amended judgment. The final periodic payment will be the amount of \$87,000, which will be paid within 18 months after entry of the amended judgment.

The Court also finds that the \$350,000 amount of future medical expenses awarded by the jury shall draw post-judgment interest, pursuant to NRS 17.130(2), from the time of entry of the judgment until satisfied, with post-judgment interest to be adjusted as each periodic payment is made.

It is so ORDERED.

DATED: February 4, 2016

DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Court has also dealt with application of this statute in the Order Regarding Defendant's Motion for Amendment of the Judgment.

Order initially prepared by: ROBERT L. EISENBERG (Nv. Bar No. 0950) Lemons, Grundy & Eisenberg 6005 Plumas Street, Third Floor Reno, Nevada 89519 ő 775-786-6868 Email: <u>rle@lge.net</u> Attorneys for Defendant į į 

NEOJ	Alm & Chrim
Anthony D. Lauria Nevada Bar No.: 4114	CLERK OF THE COURT
Kimberly L. Johnson Nevada Bar No.: 10554	
EAURIA TOKUNAGA GATES & LINN 601 South Seventh Street, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor	r LLP
LAURIA TOKUNAGA GATES & LINN 601 South Seventh Street, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 (702) 387-8633; Fax: (702) 387-8633 Attorneys for <i>Defendant ALBERT</i>	5
M.D. Attorneys for Dejenaant ALBERT	I H. CAPANNA,
DIS	STRICT COURT
CLARK	K COUNTY NEVADA
BEAU R. ORTH,	) CASE NO. : A-11-648041-C DEPT. NO. : 3
Plaintiff,	NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER
v.	
ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D.; DO: I THROUGH X; ROE BUSINESS ENTITIES I THROUGH X,	ES }
Defendants.	
NOTICE IS HEREBY GIVE on February 4, 2016, a copy of whice Dated: February 11, 2016.	EN that the above-entitled court entered its O ch is attached.
· ·	AURIA TOKUNAGA GATES & LINN, LLP
	,
Ву	y: /s/ ANTHONY D. LAURIA Anthony D. Lauria
	Anthony D. Lauria Nevada Bar No.: 4114 601 South Seventh Street
	Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 Attorneys for Defendant

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE** Pursuant to N.R.C.P. 5(b), I certify that I am an employee of Lauria Tokunaga Gates & Linn, and that on the 11th day of February 2016, I served a true and correct copy of the foregoing NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER: By placing same to be deposited for mailing in the United States Mail, in a sealed envelope upon which first class postage was prepared in Las Vegas, Nevada; and/or X Via electronic mail; and/or Via facsimile; and/or Via Receipt of Copy to the interested parties as follows: Dennis M. Prince, Esq. Eglet Prince 400 S. 7<sup>th</sup> Street, Box 1, Suite 400 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 Attorneys for Plaintiff BEAU R. ORTH /s/ CARRIE C. TAYLOR Carrie C. Taylor, an employee of Lauria Tokunaga Gates & Linn 



Electronically Filed 02/10/2016 11:53:07 AM

ORDR 1. ROBERT L. EISENBERG (Nevada Bar No. 950) 2 Lemons, Grundy & Eisenberg 6005 Plumas Street, Third Floor 3 Reno, Nevada 89509 4 775-786-6868 775-786-9756 5 Email: rie@ige.net 6 Anthony D. Lauria 7 Nevada Bar No. 4114 LAURIA TOKUNAGA GATES & LINN, LLP 8 601 South Seventh Street, 2nd Floor Las Vegas, NV 89101 Tel: (702) 387-8633 10 Fax: (702) 387-8635 ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT 11 12 13 14

CLERK OF THE COURT

IN THE EIGHTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT OF THE STATE OF NEVADA IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF CLARK

BEAU R. ORTH, 15

Plaintiff,

Case No. A-11-648041

Dept. No. III

VS,

16

17

18

19

ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D.

Defendant.

ORDER REGARDING DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR APPLICATION OF NRS 41A.035 and 42.021

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

This matter was heard by the Court on December 16, 2015. Dennis M. Prince, of Eglet Prince, appeared on behalf of Plaintiff Orth. Anthony D. Lauria, of Lauria Tokunaga Gates & Linn, LLP, and Robert L. Eisenberg, of Lemons, Grundy & Eisenberg, appeared on behalf of Defendant Capanna. Having considered the motion papers and the oral arguments by counsel, the Court hereby rules as follows:

27

28

HI

#### NRS 41A.035

This statute imposes a cap of \$350,000 on noneconomic damages.<sup>1</sup> The Court finds that statute is applicable and that Plaintiff's noneconomic damages must not exceed \$350,000. Nevertheless, the Court denies Defendant's request to apportion noneconomic damages between past and future damages. The Court finds that the entire \$350,000 amount of noneconomic damages should be attributed to past damages.

#### NRS 42.021

Subsections (3) through (8) of this statute deal with periodic payments for future damages. The Court finds that the statutory provisions for periodic payments apply to the amount awarded by the jury for future medical expenses, i.e., \$350,000. The Court finds that this portion of the judgment shall be paid in three periodic payments. The first payment will be the amount of \$175,000, which consists of one-half of the future medical expenses awarded by the jury. This amount will be paid within six months after entry of the amended judgment. The second periodic payment will be the amount of \$88,000, which will be paid within one year after entry of the amended judgment. The final periodic payment will be the amount of \$87,000, which will be paid within 18 months after entry of the amended judgment.

The Court also finds that the \$350,000 amount of future medical expenses awarded by the jury shall draw post-judgment interest, pursuant to NRS 17.130(2), from the time of entry of the judgment until satisfied, with post-judgment interest to be adjusted as each periodic payment is made.

It is so ORDERED.

DATED: February 4, 2012

DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

The Court has also dealt with application of this statute in the Order Regarding Defendant's Motion for Amendment of the Judgment.

Order initially prepared by: = 4114 (Nv. Bar No. 0950) Lemons, Grundy & Eisenberg 6005 Plumas Street, Third Floor Reno, Nevada 89519 775-786-6868 Email: <u>rle@lge.net</u> Attorneys for Defendant

]

Ó

S

Ì ORDR DENNIS M. PRINCE, ESQ. Neyada Bar No.: 5092 TRACY A. EGLET, ESQ. 3 Nevada Bar No.: 6419 DANIELLE TARMU, ESO. Nevada Bar No.: 11727 5 EGLET PRINCE 400 South Seventh Street, #400 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 dprince@egletlaw.com teglet@egletlaw.com dtarmu@egletlaw.com (702) 450-5400 phone (702) 450-5451 facsimile 10 Attorneys for Plaintiff Beau R. Orth

Alm & Blum

CLERK OF THE COURT

#### DISTRICT COURT

#### CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

BEAUR, ORTH,

Plaintiff.

VS.

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23.

24

25

26

27

28

ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D.;
DOES I through X; ROE BUSINESS
ENTITIES I through X, inclusive.

Defendants.

CASE NO. : A-11-648041-C

DEPT. NO.: III

ORDER REGARDING PLAINTIFF'S
MOTION TO DECLARE NRS 42,021
AND NRS 41A.035
UNCONSTITUTIONAL

This matter having come on for hearing on the 14th day of August, 2015; Dennis M. Prince, Esq., and Danielle Tarmu, Esq. of Eglet Prince appearing on behalf of Plaintiff, Beau Orth; and Anthony D. Lauria, Esq. and Paul A. Cardinale, Esq. of Laura Tokunaga Gates & Linn, LLP, appearing on behalf of Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D. The Court, having read the moving papers and heard oral argument by counsel, and hereby **DENIES** Plaintiff's

1		
	Motion to Declare NRS 42.021 and 1	NRS 41A.035 Unconstitutional. The statutes pass
£ %	constitutional scrutiny under rational basi	s test.
.3	Dated this 🐴 day of August, 20	15.
3		
5		AN
6		DISTRICT COURT JUDGE
7	DATED this 2 day of August, 2015.	DATEDAL double some 2012
8	Respectfully Submitted By:	DATED this day of August, 2015.
9		Approved as to Form and Content:
10	EGLET PRINCE	LAURIA TOKUNAGA GATES & LINN
11		1
12	Distance Property	_ Land & Lating C, 273944
13	DENNIS M. PRINCE, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 5092	Nevada Bar No. 4114
14	TRACY A. EGLET, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 6419	KIMBERLY L. JOHNSON, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 10554
15	DANIELLE TARMU, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 11727	601 South Seventh Street, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor Las Vegas, Nevada 89101
16	400 South Seventh Street, Suite 400   Las Vegas, Nevada 89101	Attorneys for Defendant
17	Attorneys for Plaintiff	
18		
19		
20		
21	,	
22		
23		
24		
25		
26	4-0-0-0-0-0-0-0-0-0-0-0-0-0-0-0-0-0-0-0	
27		
28		

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Alun b. Elmin

**ORDR** 1 DENNIS M. PRINCE, ESQ. 2 Nevada Bar No.: 5092 TRACY A. EGLET, ESQ. 3 Nevada Bar No.: 6419 DANIELLE TARMU, ESQ. 4 Nevada Bar No.: 11727 5 EGLET PRINCE 400 South Seventh Street, #400 6 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 dprince@egletlaw.com 7 teglet@egletlaw.com 8 dtarmu@egletlaw.com (702) 450-5400 phone (702) 450-5451 facsimile 10 Attorneys for Plaintiff

CLERK OF THE COURT

#### DISTRICT COURT

#### CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

BEAU R. ORTH,

Beau R. Orth

Plaintiff,

VS.

ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D.; DOES I through X; ROE BUSINESS ENTITIES I through X, inclusive,

Defendants.

CASE NO. : A-11-648041-C

DEPT. NO.: III

## ORDER REGARDING PLAINTIFF'S MOTIONS IN LIMINE

This matter having come on for hearing on the 14th day of August, 2015; Dennis M. Prince, Esq., and Danielle Tarmu, Esq. of Eglet Prince appearing on behalf of Plaintiff, Beau Orth; and Anthony D. Lauria, Esq. and Paul A. Cardinale, Esq. of Laura Tokunaga Gates & Linn, LLP, appearing on behalf of Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D. The Court, having read the moving papers and heard oral argument by counsel, and hereby rules as follows:

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Omnibus Motion in Limine No. 1 is ruled upon as follows:

- 1) Hypothetical Medical Condition. This Motion is GRANTED. Questions must be related to evidence in the record or evidence they reasonably anticipate will be presented at trial.
- 2) Reference to Plaintiff Being a Malingerer, Magnifying Symptoms or Manifesting Secondary Gain Motives Should be Excluded. This Motion is GRANTED as unopposed. Defendant will not make this argument at all unless new evidence regarding these issues id disclosed at trial, in which case counsel must approach the bench before making any reference to the jury.
- 3) References to Defense Medical Examiners as "Independent." This Motion is GRANTED as unopposed.
- 4) Closing Argument. This Motion is GRANTED as unopposed. Defendant will not argue that Plaintiff's counsel is asking for a higher verdict because he thinks the jury will award less. This order does not prevent Defendant from arguing that the amount requested by Plaintiff is not supported by the evidence.
- 5) Taxation. This Motion is GRANTED as unopposed. The parties will not reference taxation of any amount of damages.
- 6) Precluding Reference as to Plaintiff's Counsel Working with Plaintiff's

  Treating Physicians on Unrelated Cases. This Motion is GRANTED IN PART and

  DENIED IN PART. Defendant can ask questions about the nature of physicians' practice,

  such as the amount of work for defense versus plaintiffs, and attorneys. However, Defendant

б

cannot ask specific questions about working with Plaintiff's counsel in the past, such as the number of times the doctor treated Plaintiff's counsel's clients.

 Exclude Collateral Sources of Payment. This Motion is DENIED without prejudice.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 2 to Exclude Irrelevant and/or Unduly Prejudicial Information is GRANTED. Any reference to Plaintiff's parents' alleged spinal treatment or Plaintiff having a congenital spinal condition is excluded from trial.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 3 to Exclude Prior Unrelated Medical Conditions is GRANTED. Any reference to Plaintiff's previous injuries sustained while playing football and sports, including but not limited to, his ankle injury in his sophomore year of college, his torn ligament in his hand/thumb area approximately in 2009 or early 2010, and his March 2010 concussion, are excluded from trial. If Defendant believes that something at trial opens the door to allow questioning in this area, then the parties must approach the bench before asking questions or referencing it before the jury.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 4 to Permit Treating Physicians to Testify as to Causation, Diagnosis, Prognosis, Future Treatment, and Extent of Disability Without a Formal Expert Report is GRANTED. Dr. Cash can testify about billing, causation, prognosis, future treatment, and extent of disability without a formal expert report. He is a treating physician, not a retained expert. Asking a treating physician to do a future cost letter or certain other tasks does not automatically convert him/her to a retained expert.

T C

ő

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 5 to Allow Parties to Present a Jury Questionnaire Prior to Voir Dire is MOOT as it is too late.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 6 to Limit

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 6 to Limit Defendant's Experts' Testimony to the Opinions and Bases Set Forth in Their Expert Reports is GRANTED. Retained expert opinions must comply with NRCP 16.1(a)(2)(B) and be in a 16.1 disclosure, report, or deposition.

Dated this \_\_\_\_ day of August, 2015.

DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

DATED this <u>1</u> day of August, 2015.

Respectfully Submitted By:

EGLET PRINCE

DATED this \_\_\_\_\_ day of August, 2015.

Approved as to Form and Content:

LAURIA TOKUNAGA GATES & LINN

DENNIS M. PRINCE; ESQ.
Nevada Bar No. 5092
TRACY A. EGLET, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No. 6419
DANIELLE TARMU, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No.: 11727
400 South Seventh Street, Suite 400
Las Vegas, Nevada 89101

Attorneys for Plaintiff

ANTHONY D. LAURIA, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No. 4114
KIMBERLY L. JOHNSON, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No.: 10554
601 South Seventh Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor
Las Vegas, Nevada 89101
Attorneys for Defendant

1 NEOJ DENNIS M. PRINCE, ESQ. 2 Nevada Bar No. 5092 TRACY A. EGLET, ESQ. 3 Nevada Bar No. 6419 4 DANIELLE TARMU, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 11727 5 **EGLET PRINCE** 400 South Seventh Street, #400 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 7 eservice@egletlaw.com (702) 450-5400 phone 8 (702) 450-5451 facsimile 9 Attorneys for Plaintiff 10 Beau R. Orth 11 12 DISTRICT COURT 13 **CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA** 14 BEAU R. ORTH, 15 Plaintiff, 16 VS. 17 18 ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D.; DOES I through X; ROE BUSINESS 19 ENTITIES I through X, inclusive, 20 Defendants. 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28

CLERK OF THE COURT CASE NO.: A-11-648041-C DEPT. NO.: III NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER

# EGLET TPRINCE

	PLEASE	TAKE	NOTICE	that an	Order	Regarding	Plaintiff's	Motions	in Limine	e wa:
signed	on Septen	nber 1,	2015 and	entered	in the	above-entit	tled action	on Decen	nber 1, 20	)15, a
сору о	f which is	attached	d hereto as	Exhibi	t "1."					

Respectfully submitted this 3rd day of December, 2015.

#### EGLET PRINCE

/s/ Danielle Tarmu
DENNIS M. PRINCE, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No.: 5092
TRACY A. EGLET, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No.: 6419
DANIELLE TARMU, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No.: 11727

# EGLET PRINCE

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

Pursuant to NRCP 5(b), I certify that I am an employee of EGLET PRINCE, and that or
December 3rd, 2015, I caused the foregoing document entitled NOTICE OF ENTRY OF
ORDER to be served upon those persons designated by the parties in the E-Service Master Lis
for the above-referenced matter in the Eighth Judicial District Court eFiling System in
accordance with the mandatory electronic service requirements of Administrative Order 14-2
and the Nevada Electronic Filing and Conversion Rules.

Anthony D. Lauria, Esq.
Kimberly L. Johnson, Esq.
LAURIA, TOKUNAGA GATES &
LINN, LLP
601 South Seventh Street
2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor
Las Vegas, NV 89101
Office: (702) 387-8633
Fax: (702) 387-8635
Alauria@ltglaw.net
Kjohnson@ltglaw.net
Attorneys for Defendant
Albert H. Capanna, M.D.

/s/ Brittney Glover an Employee of EGLET PRINCE

Alun to blum

CLERK OF THE COURT

**ORDR** 1 **DENNIS M. PRINCE, ESO.** 2 Nevada Bar No.: 5092 TRACY A. EGLET, ESQ. 3 Nevada Bar No.: 6419 DANIELLE TARMU, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 11727 5 EGLET PRINCE 400 South Seventh Street, #400 6 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 dprince@exletlaw.com 7 teglet@egletlaw.com 8 dtarmu@egletlaw.com (702) 450-5400 phone (702) 450-5451 facsimile **Attorneys for Plaintiff** Beau R. Orth

#### DISTRICT COURT

#### **CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA**

BEAU R. ORTH,

Plaintiff,

VS.

18

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

19

20

2I 22

23 24

25

26

27

ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D.; DOES I through X; ROE BUSINESS ENTITIES I through X, inclusive,

Defendants.

CASE NO.: A-11-648041-C

DEPT. NO.: III

### ORDER REGARDING PLAINTIFF'S MOTIONS IN LIMINE

This matter having come on for hearing on the 14th day of August, 2015; Dennis M. Prince, Esq., and Danielle Tarmu, Esq. of Eglet Prince appearing on behalf of Plaintiff, Beau Orth; and Anthony D. Lauria, Esq. and Paul A. Cardinale, Esq. of Laura Tokunaga Gates & Linn, LLP, appearing on behalf of Defendant Albert H. Capanna, M.D. The Court, having read the moving papers and heard oral argument by counsel, and hereby rules as follows:

б

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Omnibus Motion in Limine No. 1 is ruled upon as follows:

- Hypothetical Medical Condition. This Motion is GRANTED. Questions
  must be related to evidence in the record or evidence they reasonably anticipate will be
  presented at trial.
- Reference to Plaintiff Being a Malingerer, Magnifying Symptoms or Manifesting Secondary Gain Motives Should be Excluded. This Motion is GRANTED as unopposed. Defendant will not make this argument at all unless new evidence regarding these issues id disclosed at trial, in which case counsel must approach the bench before making any reference to the jury.
- References to Defense Medical Examiners as "Independent." This Motion is
   GRANTED as unopposed.
- 4) Closing Argument. This Motion is GRANTED as unopposed. Defendant will not argue that Plaintiff's counsel is asking for a higher verdict because he thinks the jury will award less. This order does not prevent Defendant from arguing that the amount requested by Plaintiff is not supported by the evidence.
- 5) Taxation. This Motion is GRANTED as unopposed. The parties will not reference taxation of any amount of damages.
- 6) Precluding Reference as to Plaintiff's Counsel Working with Plaintiff's

  Treating Physicians on Unrelated Cases. This Motion is GRANTED IN PART and

  DENIED IN PART. Defendant can ask questions about the nature of physicians' practice,

  such as the amount of work for defense versus plaintiffs, and attorneys. However, Defendant

б

cannot ask specific questions about working with Plaintiff's counsel in the past, such as the number of times the doctor treated Plaintiff's counsel's clients.

 Exclude Collateral Sources of Payment. This Motion is DENIED without prejudice.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 2 to Exclude Irrelevant and/or Unduly Prejudicial Information is GRANTED. Any reference to Plaintiff's parents' alleged spinal treatment or Plaintiff having a congenital spinal condition is excluded from trial.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 3 to Exclude Prior Unrelated Medical Conditions is GRANTED. Any reference to Plaintiff's previous injuries sustained while playing football and sports, including but not limited to, his ankle injury in his sophomore year of college, his torn ligament in his hand/thumb area approximately in 2009 or early 2010, and his March 2010 concussion, are excluded from trial. If Defendant believes that something at trial opens the door to allow questioning in this area, then the parties must approach the bench before asking questions or referencing it before the jury.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 4 to Permit Treating Physicians to Testify as to Causation, Diagnosis, Prognosis, Future Treatment, and Extent of Disability Without a Formal Expert Report is GRANTED. Dr. Cash can testify about billing, causation, prognosis, future treatment, and extent of disability without a formal expert report. He is a treating physician, not a retained expert. Asking a treating physician to do a future cost letter or certain other tasks does not automatically convert him/her to a retained expert.

2 3

4

5

б

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15 16 17

18

19

20

21

22 23

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 5 to Allow Parties to Present a Jury Questionnaire Prior to Voir Dire is MOOT as it is too late.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 6 to Limit Defendant's Experts' Testimony to the Opinions and Bases Set Forth in Their Expert Reports is GRANTED. Retained expert opinions must comply with NRCP 16.1(a)(2)(B) and be in a 16.1 disclosure, report, or deposition.

Dated this day of August, 2015.

DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

DATED this \_\_\_\_ day of August, 2015.

Respectfully Submitted By:

EGLET PRINCE

DENNIS M. PRINCE, ESO. Nevada Bar No. 5092 TRACY A. EGLET, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 6419 DANIELLE TARMU, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 11727 400 South Seventh Street, Suite 400 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 Attorneys for Plaintiff

day of August, 2015. DATED this \_

Approved as to Form and Content:

Lauria tokunaga gates & Linn

ANTHONY D. LAURIA, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 4114 KIMBERLY L. JOHNSON, ESQ. Nevada Bay No.: 10554 601 South Seventh Street, 2nd Floor Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 Attorneys for Defendant

## DISTRICT COURT CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

A-11-648041-C
Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)
vs.
Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

August 08, 2012

9:00 AM
Status Check:
Medical/Dental
Malpractice

HEARD BY: Cory Kenneth COURT MINUTES

August 08, 2012

August 08, 2012

COURTECOM: Complex Litigation Conterns

**HEARD BY:** Cory, Kenneth

**COURTROOM:** Complex Litigation Center

Wiese, Jerry A.

COURT CLERK: Dulce Romea

Alice Jacobson Sharon Coffman Aaron Carbajal Vanessa Ward

RECORDER:

**REPORTER:** 

PARTIES PRESENT:

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- Attorney(s) present: Michael Kane and John Cotton.

The Med-Mal Status Check was conducted by a panel consisting of Judges Jerry A. Wiese II and Kenneth C. Cory. Pursuant to EDCR 1.30, due to unavailability of the court or counsel, CHIEF JUDGE ORDERED case is REASSIGNED to Dept. 12.

## DISTRICT COURT CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

Malpractice - Medical/Dental COURT MINUTES February 05, 2013

A-11-648041-C Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)
vs.
Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

February 05, 2013 1:00 PM Status Check:

Medical/Dental Malpractice

HEARD BY: Wiese, Jerry A. COURTROOM: Complex Litigation Center

COURT CLERK: Alice Jacobson

Sylvia Perez Andrea Natali Katrina Hernandez Michelle Jones

RECORDER:

**REPORTER:** 

PARTIES PRESENT:

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- Appearances by: Adam Schneider and Michael Kane.

The Med-Mal Status Check was conducted by Judge Jerry A. Wiese II. Colloquy regarding status of the case. COURT ORDERED, matter SET for trial and CONTINUED to next Med-Mal Status Check.

2/3/14 1:00 PM JURY TRIAL

**COURT MINUTES** Malpractice - Medical/Dental August 06, 2013 A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

August 06, 2013 9:00 AM Status Check:

> Medical/Dental Malpractice

**COURTROOM:** Complex Litigation Center **HEARD BY:** Wiese, Jerry A.

COURT CLERK: Sylvia Perez

Alice Jacobson Sharon Coffman Teresa Slade Keri Cromer

**RECORDER:** 

REPORTER:

**PARTIES** PRESENT:

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- Attorneys present: Adam Schneider and Evan Schwab

The Med-Mal Status Check was conducted by Judge Jerry A. Wiese II. Colloquy regarding status of the case. COURT ORDERED, trial date VACATED AND RESET. Pursuant to EDCR 1.30, due to the unavailability of the Dept. or counsel, CHIEF JUDGE ORDERED, case TRANSFERRED to Dept. 3. FURTHER, matter SET on next Med-Mal Status Check.

1/6/14 1:30 PM JURY TRIAL

A-11-648041-C
Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)
vs.
Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

February 04, 2014 8:30 AM Status Check:

Medical/Dental Malpractice

HEARD BY: Wiese, Jerry A. COURTROOM: Complex Litigation Center

COURT CLERK: Sylvia Perez

Alice Jacobson Sharon Coffman Athena Trujillo Melissa Murphy Andrea Natali

**RECORDER:** 

**REPORTER:** 

PARTIES PRESENT:

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- Parties Present: Garnet Beal, Adam Schneider

Colloquy regarding status of the case and Trial setting. Parties anticipated 5 days for trial. COURT ORDERED, matter SET for trial and CONTINUED to next Med-Mal Status Check.

10/13/14 JURY TRIAL (DEPT 03)

CLERK'S NOTE: Court inadvertently gave an inaccurate trial date set for 10/12/14, the above minute order has been AMENDED to reflect the correct trial setting for Department 03.// mm 02/07/14

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 4 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

**COURT MINUTES** 

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

August 12, 2014

A-11-648041-C Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

VS.

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

August 12, 2014 8:30 AM Status Check:

Medical/Dental Malpractice

HEARD BY: Wiese, Jerry A. COURTROOM: Complex Litigation Center

COURT CLERK: Keri Cromer

Alice Jacobson Michelle Jones Melissa Murphy Andrea Natali

RECORDER:

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Beal, Garnet E. Attorney

Lauria, Anthony D Attorney

## JOURNAL ENTRIES

- The Med-Mal Status Check was conducted by Judge Jerry A. Wiese II. Mr. Lauria stated he filed a motion for a new trial setting; anticipated 8 days for trial. COURT ORDERED, trial date VACATED and RESET. DIRECTED, counsel to meet with Commissioner Bulla.

3/30/15 - JURY TRIAL MEDICAL MALPRACTICE (SET DURING SWEEPS) (DEPT. 3)

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 5 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

August 12, 2014

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

August 12, 2014

8:30 AM

Status Check: Discovery

**HEARD BY:** Bulla, Bonnie

**COURTROOM:** Complex Litigation Center

COURT CLERK: Iennifer Lott

RECORDER:

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT:

Beal, Garnet E.

Attorney

Lauria, Anthony D

Attorney

## **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- Dept. 3; March 30, 2015 Trial date. COMMISSIONER RECOMMENDED, discovery cutoff EXTENDED to 1/9/2015; adding parties, amended pleadings, and initial expert disclosures DUE 10/9/14; rebuttal expert disclosures DUE 11/10/14; FILE dispositive motions by 2/9/2015. Mr. Beal confirmed Pltf had additional treatment two months ago.

Mr. Lauria to prepare the Report and Recommendations, and Mr. Beal to approve as to form and content. A proper report must be timely submitted within 10 days of the hearing. Otherwise, counsel will pay a contribution. Mr. Lauria to appear at status check hearing to report on the Report and Recommendations.

9/12/14 11:00 a.m. Status Check: Compliance

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 6 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental COURT MINUTES February 03, 2015

A-11-648041-C Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)
vs.
Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

February 03, 2015 8:30 AM Status Check:

Medical/Dental Malpractice

HEARD BY: Wiese, Jerry A. COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 10D

**COURT CLERK:** Alice Jacobson

Treva Palmer Tena Jolley Michelle Jones Keri Cromer

RECORDER:

**REPORTER:** 

PARTIES PRESENT:

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- Attorneys present: Richard Englemann and Paul Cardinale

The Med-Mal Status Check was conducted by Judge Jerry A. Wiese II. Colloquy regarding status of case. COURT ORDERED, trial date VACATED and RESET due to the unavailability of the Dept. or counsel. FURTHER, matter SET on next Med-Mal Status Check.

8/17/2015: MED-MAL JURY TRIAL

**COURT MINUTES** 

February 03, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

VS.

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

February 03, 2015 8:30 AM Status Check: Discovery

HEARD BY: Bulla, Bonnie COURTROOM: RJC Jury Deliberation Room

10th Floor - North

COURT CLERK: Jennifer Lott

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**RECORDER:** 

REPORTER:

PARTIES PRESENT:

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- Attorneys present: Richard Englemann and Paul Cardinale.

Dept. 3; 8/17/15 Trial date. Commissioner previously Recused from this case. Mr. Englemann stated deposition clean up is needed, and Dr. Capanna's deposition is still needed. COMMISSIONER RECOMMENDED, discovery cutoff EXTENDED to 5/29/15; FILE dispositive motions by 6/29/15.

Mr. Cardinale to prepare the Report and Recommendations, and Mr. Englemann to approve as to form and content. A proper report must be timely submitted within 10 days of the hearing. Otherwise, counsel will pay a contribution. Mr. Cardinale to appear at status check hearing to report on the Report and Recommendations.

3/6/15 11:00 a.m. Status Check: Compliance

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 8 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

July 22, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

July 22, 2015

9:00 AM

Calendar Call

HEARD BY:

Herndon, Douglas W.

COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 16C

COURT CLERK: Shelly Landwehr

RECORDER:

Sara Richardson

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Lauria, Anthony D Attorney

Prince, Dennis M

Attorney

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- Parties announced ready for trial. Mr. Prince stated his expert would need to be on early in the trial and requested jury selection begin on 8/19/15 with witnesses to start on 8/24/15. Mr. Lauria expressed concern stating there are six surgeons that will be testifying. Representations by Mr. Lauria regarding defendant's upcoming motion. Colloquy. COURT ORDERED, trial date VACATED and RESET. FURTHER, all current pending motions RESCHEDULED to 8/10/15.

08/10/15 1:00 PM ALL PENDING MOTIONS

08/19/15 10:30 AM JURY TRIAL (FIRM)

**COURT MINUTES** 

August 03, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

VS.

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

August 03, 2015

8:30 AM

Status Check:

Medical/Dental Malpractice

**HEARD BY:** Wiese, Jerry A.

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 15D

COURT CLERK: Alice Jacobson

Shelley Boyle Cynthia Moleres Natalie Ortega Robin Thomas

RECORDER:

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Lauria, Anthony D

Attorney Attorney

Prince, Dennis M

**JOURNAL ENTRIES** 

- The Med-Mal Status Check was conducted by Judge Jerry A. Wiese II. Colloquy regarding status of the case. COURT ORDERED, trial date STANDS, matter SET on next Med-Mal Status Check.

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 10 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

August 14, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

VS.

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

August 14, 2015

1:00 PM

All Pending Motions

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 16A

COURT CLERK: Alan Castle

RECORDER:

Sara Richardson

REPORTER:

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Cardinale, Paul A. Attorney

Lauria, Anthony D Attorney
Prince, Dennis M Attorney
Tarmu, Danielle A. Attorney

#### JOURNAL ENTRIES

#### - Plaintiff's Omnibus Motion in Limine No. 1

Item #1 Court Finds Hypothetical medicals are okay if based on something that will be explained later in the case by the evidence or if there is some reasonable inference to what is in the plaintiff s medical records.

#2 Exclude Reference to Plaintiff being a malingerer, magnifying symptoms or manifesting secondary gain motives COURT ORDERED, GRANTED;

#3 Exclude Reference to Defense Medical Examiners as "Independent." COURT ORDERED, GRANTED;

#4 COURT Finds it not improper to say Plaintiff is asking for more than what the "evidence" suggests, however, not proper to for an amount less that Plaintiff expect to receive. COURT ORDERED, GRANTED;

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 11 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

#5 Exclude reference to taxation. No opposition. COURT ORDERED, GRANTED;

#6 Exclude reference to treating physicians on unrelated cases. COURT Finds if similar not unfair to ask about treating practices and being retained as an expert, but not appropriate to ask number of times expert worked counsel. COURT ORDERED, GRANTED IN PART / DENIED IN PART

#7 Exclude collateral sources. Addressed. COURT ORDERED, DENIED WITHOUT PREJUDICE.

Defendant's [Omnibus] Motions in Limine

#1 Exclude evidence relating to malpractice insurance coverage - COURT ORDERED, GRANTED;

#2 Exclude evidence relating to other claims - COURT admonished counsel and Finds sometimes regardless of the case, the witness will infer just by talking and make irrelevant statements. COURT ORDERED, GRANTED;

#3 Exclude evidence relating to Plaintiff's Nevada State Board of Medical Examiners' Complaint COURT ORDERED, GRANTED;

#4 Exclude evidence from Plaintiff's expert's report and testimony regarding Nevada Board of Medical Examiner's Complaint. COURT ORDERED, GRANTED

#5 Seek permission from Court during opening for demonstratives that are not stipulated; or Court and parties must go over beforehand; especially proposed evidence;

#6 Exclude evidence of claims for lost wages. No opposition. COURT ORDERED, GRANTED;

#7 Exclude evidence relating to medical matter by Plaintiff or lay witness. COURT ORDERED, GRANTED;

#8 Exclude evidence relating to the residence of defense counsel. No opposition. COURT ORDERED, GRANTED;

#9 Exclude evidence of alleged acts of negligence not the legal and proximate cause of harm to Plaintiff. COURT ORDERED, GRANTED;

#10 Exclude personal opinions and preferences of Plaintiff's experts. COURT ORDERED, GRANTED;

#11 Exclude opinions by Plaintiff's expert other than those provided at deposition, or, contained in expert's report. COURT Finds it would not be proper to supplement opinion at trial unless there is notice pursuant to the rules. COURT ORDERED, CONDITIONALLY GRANTED;

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 12 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

#12 Exclude testimony from an untimely identified expert witness. No opposition. COURT ORDERED, GRANTED;

#13 Sequence of testifying witness. COURT Finds asking generally who will be testifying is helpful for smoother flow and schedule planning. COURT ORDERED, GRANTED;

#14 Exclusionary rule INVOKED.

#15 COURT Finds there will be considerable 'crossover' based on the variety of medical disciplines, which is not necessarily cumulative as much as a different perspective. COURT ORDERED, GRANTED;

#16 Exclude reference to failure to call a doctor or witness. COURT Finds there may be comment from both sides if relevant to the case. COURT ORDERED, DENIED.

- Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 2: to Exclude Irrelevant and/or Unduly Prejudicial Information COURT ORDERED, GRANTED.

Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 3: to Exclude Prior Unrelated Medical Conditions COURT ORDERED, GRANTED.

Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 4: Permit Treating Physicians to Testify as to Causation, Diagnosis, Prognosis, Future Treatment, and Extent of Disability Without a Formal Expert Report COURT ORDERED, GRANTED.

Plaintiff's Motion No. 5 to Allow Parties to Present a Jury Questionnaire Prior to Voir Dire COURT FINDS WITHDRAWN; not practical due to timing.

Plaintiff's Motion in Limine No. 6: to Limit Defendant's Experts' Testimony to the Opinions and Bases Set Forth in Their Expert Reports

COURT ORDERED, GRANTED.

Plaintiff's Motion to Declare NRS 42.021 and NRS 41A.035 Unconstitutional NRS 42.021 Actions based on professional negligence of providers of health care: Introduction of certain evidence relating to collateral benefits; restrictions on source of collateral benefits; payment of future damages by periodic payments. COURT FINDS the law says the statute passes constitutional scrutiny at this time and ORDERED, motion DENIED.

NRS 41A.035 Limitation on amount of award for noneconomic damages. In an action for injury or death against a provider of health care based upon professional negligence, the injured plaintiff may recover noneconomic damages, but the amount of noneconomic damages awarded in such an action must not exceed \$350,000. COURT FINDS the law says the statute passes constitutional scrutiny at

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 13 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

this time and the support of the ballot measure. COURT ORDERED, DENIED.

Plaintiff's Motion to Strike Defendant's Untimely Disclosures on Order Shortening Time COURT ORDERED, DENIED.

Defendant's Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion to Strike Untimely Disclosures and Counter-Motion to Exclude Improper "Supplemental" Disclosures and Claims for Future Damages COURT ORDERED, DENIED.

Plaintiff's Motion for a Rebuttable Presumption Jury Instruction Pursuant to NRS 41A.100 COURT thinks Plaintiff is entitled and Finds inclined to give instruction, but DEFERRED RULING until after the evidence has been presented and not be given as a pre-instruction.

Defendant's Motion re Application of NRS 50.275 and to Exclude Testimony regarding Future Treatment and Surgery Made Without Scientific Basis COURT ORDERED, DENIED.

Defendant's Trial Brief and Motion to Limit Damages to those Caused by Acts of Alleged Negligence CONTINUED TO 8/19/15 @ 10:00 a.m.

8/19/15 10:00 a.m. Defendant's Trial Brief and Motion to Limit Damages to those Caused by Acts of Alleged Negligence /// Jury Trial

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 14 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental COURT MINUTES

August 19, 2015

A-11-648041-C Bea

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

VS.

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

Motion

August 19, 2015

10:00 AM

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

**COURTROOM:** RJC Courtroom 16C

COURT CLERK: Deborah Miller

**RECORDER:** Sara Richardson

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant

Cardinale, Paul A. Attorney
Lauria, Anthony D Attorney
Orth, Beau R Plaintiff
Prince, Dennis M Attorney
Tarmu, Danielle A. Attorney

JOURNAL ENTRIES

- COURT ORDERED, matter CONTINUED.

CONTINUED TO: 8/20/15 12:00 PM

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 15 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

August 19, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

August 19, 2015

10:30 AM

Jury Trial - FIRM

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

**COURTROOM:** RJC Courtroom 16C

**COURT CLERK:** Deborah Miller

RECORDER:

Sara Richardson

REPORTER:

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Capanna, MD, Albert H

Defendant Attorney Attorney Plaintiff Attorney Attorney

Orth, Beau R Prince, Dennis M Tarmu, Danielle A.

Lauria, Anthony D

Cardinale, Paul A.

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE PROSPECTIVE JURY PANEL: Discussion regarding Voir Dire and Jury selection. Mr. Prince advised parties have stipulated to majority of exhibits with the exception of medical bills. Colloquy regarding billing.

PROSPECTIVE JURY PANEL PRESENT: Introductions by Court and counsel. Clerk called roll of the prospective jury panel. Voir Dire of panel. .

OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE PROSPECTIVE JURY PANEL: Colloquy regarding challenges for cause.

PROSPECTIVE JURY PANEL PRESENT: Voir Dire of panel.

OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE PROSPECITVE JURY PANEL: Colloquy regarding scheduling.

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 16 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

CONTINUED TO: 8/20/15 12:00 PM

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 17 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

**COURT MINUTES** 

August 20, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

VS.

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

August 20, 2015 12:00 AM Motion

Brief and Motion to Limit Damages to those Caused by Acts

Defendant's Trial

of Alleged Negligence

HEARD BY: Herndon, Douglas W. COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 16C

**COURT CLERK:** Deborah Miller

**RECORDER:** Sara Richardson

REPORTER:

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant

Cardinale, Paul A.

Lauria, Anthony D

Orth, Beau R

Prince, Dennis M

Tarmu, Danielle A.

Attorney

Attorney

**JOURNAL ENTRIES** 

- COURT ORDERED, matter CONTINUED.

CONTINUED TO: 8/21/15 8:30 AM

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 18 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

August 20, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

August 20, 2015

12:00 AM

Jury Trial - FIRM

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

**COURTROOM:** RJC Courtroom 16C

**COURT CLERK:** Deborah Miller

Cardinale, Paul A.

Prince, Dennis M

Tarmu, Danielle A.

Orth, Beau R

Lauria, Anthony D

RECORDER:

Sara Richardson

REPORTER:

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant Attorney Attorney Plaintiff Attorney Attorney

## **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- OUTSIDE PRESENCE OF THE PROSPECTIVE JURY PANEL: Discussion regarding schedule and testimony of expert witnesses.

PROSPECTIVE JURY PANEL PRESENT: Juror #20 was excused for cause as she was delayed at a doctor's appointment. Voir Dire by Plaintiff's continued. Voir dire by Defense.

OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE PROSPECTIVE JURY PANEL: Court made a record of the bench conference as to challenges for cause.

PROSPECTIVE OF JURY PANEL PRESENT: Court admonished jury and excused for the evening.

CONTINUED TO: 8/21/15 8:30 AM

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 19 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

August 21, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

August 21, 2015

8:30 AM

Motion

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

**COURTROOM:** RJC Courtroom 16C

COURT CLERK: Deborah Miller

RECORDER:

Sara Richardson

REPORTER:

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Capanna, MD, Albert H

Defendant Cardinale, Paul A. Attorney Lauria, Anthony D Attorney Orth, Beau R Plaintiff Prince, Dennis M Attorney Tarmu, Danielle A. Attorney

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- Arguments by Mr. Lauria as to the computation of damages and the additional \$350,000 being requested. Arguments by Mr. Prince as to future damages, noting error that was filed in disclosure form. Court stated FINDINGS and ORDERED, Motion DENIED, noting he will allow future damages. Mr. Lauria requested he make a standing objection as to statements in opening as to future damages. Court GRANTED requested and noted he should raise standing objection during testimony. Arguments as to Mr. Lauria requesting to exclude questions regarding defendant going to law school. Arguments by Mr. Prince. Court GRANTED request to exclude reference that defendant attended law school. Further arguments by Mr. Prince as to Dr. Capanna's testimony, opposing any diagrammatic drawings of procedure. Court stated counsel may cross-examine witnesses regarding any drawings.

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 20 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

August 21, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

August 21, 2015

8:30 AM

Jury Trial - FIRM

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

**COURTROOM:** RJC Courtroom 16C

COURT CLERK: Deborah Miller

RECORDER:

Sara Richardson

REPORTER:

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant Attorney Attorney Plaintiff Attorney Attorney

Orth, Beau R Prince, Dennis M Tarmu, Danielle A.

Cardinale, Paul A.

Lauria, Anthony D

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE PROSPECTIVE JURY PANEL: Mr. Lauria noted objection to questioning regarding insurance during Voir dire and concern the jury has been prejudiced, therefore, requested a mistrial. Arguments by Mr. Prince. Court DENIED request for mistrial.

PROSPECITVE JURY PANEL PRESENT: Voir dire continued.

OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE PROSPECTIVE JURY PANEL: Peremptory challenge exercised. Discussion regarding Motion in Limine as to expert testimony regarding family history. Arguments by counsel as to Motion to Limit Damages to those Caused by Acts of Alleged Negligence. Court stated FINDINGS and ORDERED, Motion DENIED. Discussion regarding Dr. Capanna's testimony.

JURY PANEL PRESENT: Jury SELECTED and SWORN. Opening statements by Mr. Prince. Opening statements by Mr. Lauria. Court ADMONISHED and EXCUSED jury for the weekend

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 21 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

recess.  $\,$  COURT ORDERED, trial CONTINUED.

CONTINUED TO: 8/24/15 9:00 AM

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 22 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

August 24, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

August 24, 2015

9:00 AM

Jury Trial - FIRM

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

**COURTROOM:** RJC Courtroom 16C

**COURT CLERK:** Deborah Miller

RECORDER:

Sara Richardson

REPORTER:

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Capanna, MD, Albert H

Defendant Attorney Attorney Plaintiff Attorney Attorney

Lauria, Anthony D Orth, Beau R Prince, Dennis M Tarmu, Danielle A.

Cardinale, Paul A.

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE JURY PANEL: Counsel stated stipulation as to exhibits and noted objections for the record. Colloquy regarding scheduling of witness testimony.

JURY PANEL PRESENT: Testimony and exhibits presented (see worksheets). DEPOSITION PUBLISHED IN OPEN COURT.

OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE JURY: Mr. Prince noted objection to the record regarding Dr. Belzberg's testimony. Arguments by Mr. Lauria. Court stated questions as to supplemental report are permitted.

JURY PRESENT: Testimony and Exhibits presented (see worksheets).

Court admonished jury and excused for the evening.

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 23 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

CONTINUED TO: 8/25/15 11:00 AM

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 24 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

August 25, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

August 25, 2015

11:00 AM

Jury Trial - FIRM

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

**COURTROOM:** RJC Courtroom 16C

**COURT CLERK:** Deborah Miller

RECORDER:

Sara Richardson

REPORTER:

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Capanna, MD, Albert H

Defendant Attorney Attorney Plaintiff Attorney

Orth, Beau R Prince, Dennis M Tarmu, Danielle A.

Lauria, Anthony D

Cardinale, Paul A.

Attorney

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE JURY: Mr. Lauria noted objection as to Dr. Yoo's as to need of future treatment, noting report was untimely. Discussion regarding questioning of witness.

JURY PRESENT: Testimony and exhibits presented. (See worksheet).

OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE JURY: Discussion regarding availability of witnesses.

JURY PRESENT: Testimony and exhibits presented. (See worksheets).

CONTINUED TO: 8/26/15 10:30 AM

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 25 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

August 26, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

August 26, 2015

10:30 AM

Jury Trial - FIRM

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

**COURTROOM:** RJC Courtroom 16C

**COURT CLERK:** Deborah Miller

RECORDER:

Sara Richardson

REPORTER:

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant Attorney Attorney Plaintiff Attorney

Attorney

Lauria, Anthony D Orth, Beau R Prince, Dennis M Tarmu, Danielle A.

Cardinale, Paul A.

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE JURY: Mr. Lauria requested Mr. Prince provide a copy of the cd be provided to the court of the demonstrative images. Court stated any power point presentation and demonstrative exhibits prior to the end of trial.

JURY PRESENT: Testimony and exhibits presented (See worksheet).

OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE JURY: Discussion regarding document to be discussed during testimony of Dr. Capanna. Mr. Prince argued document has been stipulated to in the exhibits. Arguments by Mr. Lauria. Court granted request to exclude testimony about suspension.

JURY PRESENT: Court noted question regarding suspension be stricken. Testimony and exhibits presented (See Worksheet).

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 26 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

OUTSIDE PRESENCE OF THE JURY: Discussion regarding objections.

CONTINUED TO: 8/26/15 10:30 AM

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 27 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

August 27, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

August 27, 2015

10:30 AM

Jury Trial - FIRM

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

**COURTROOM:** RJC Courtroom 16C

**COURT CLERK:** Deborah Miller

RECORDER:

Sara Richardson

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant Attorney Attorney Plaintiff Attorney

Lauria, Anthony D Orth, Beau R Prince, Dennis M

Cardinale, Paul A.

Tarmu, Danielle A. Attorney

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- OUTSIDE THE PRESENSE OF THE JURY: Mr. Lauria requested court sign an order for counsel to obtain medical records. ORDER SIGNED IN OPEN COURT.

JURY PRESENT: Testimony and exhibits presented. (See worksheet).

CONTINUED TO: 8/27/15 9:00 AM

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 28 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

August 28, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

August 28, 2015

9:00 AM

Jury Trial - FIRM

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

**COURTROOM:** RJC Courtroom 16C

**COURT CLERK:** April Watkins

RECORDER:

Sara Richardson

REPORTER:

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant

Cardinale, Paul A. Lauria, Anthony D Attorney Attorney

Orth, Beau R Prince, Dennis M

Plaintiff Attorney

Tarmu, Danielle A.

Attorney

## **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

#### - OUTSIDE PRESENCE OF THE JURY:

Colloquy regarding witnesses and testimony.

**JURY PRESENT:** 

Testimony and exhibits presented. (See worksheets).

OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE JURY:

Mr. Lauria moved for Rule 50(a) Motion and argued in support. Colloquy. Further argument by Mr. Lauria. Opposition by Mr. Prince. COURT ORDERED, motion DENIED. Court noted Pltf. will be withdrawing Ruggeroli claim and counsel precluded from bringing it up. Additional argument by

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 29 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Mr. Lauria.

Jury instructions argued by counsel and not settled.

Court recessed.

CONTINUED TO: 8/31/15 8:00 AM

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 30 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

August 31, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

August 31, 2015

8:00 AM

Jury Trial - FIRM

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

**COURTROOM:** RJC Courtroom 16C

**COURT CLERK:** Deborah Miller

RECORDER:

Sara Richardson

REPORTER:

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Capanna, MD, Albert H

Defendant Attorney Attorney Plaintiff

Orth, Beau R Prince, Dennis M Tarmu, Danielle A.

Lauria, Anthony D

Cardinale, Paul A.

Attorney Attorney

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- JURY PRESENT: Testimony and exhibits presented. (See worksheet).

OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE JURY: Defense rests. Plaintiff's rebuttal witness sworn and testified. (See worksheet). Plaintiff rests. Court ADMONISHED jury and excused for the evening.

OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE JURY: Jury Instructions settled on the record. Mr. Prince moved for Rule 50(a) Motion and argued in support. Colloquy. Arguments by Mr. Lauria. Further arguments by Mr. Prince. COURT ORDERED, motion DENIED. Colloquy regarding exhibits.

CONTINUED TO: 9/1/15 10:00 AM

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 31 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

September 01, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

September 01, 2015

10:00 AM

Jury Trial - FIRM

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

**COURTROOM:** RJC Courtroom 16C

**COURT CLERK:** Deborah Miller

RECORDER:

Sara Richardson

REPORTER:

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Capanna, MD, Albert H

> Cardinale, Paul A. Attorney Lauria, Anthony D Attorney Orth, Beau R Plaintiff Prince, Dennis M Attorney Tarmu, Danielle A. Attorney

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

Defendant

- OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE JURY: Discussion regarding exhibits and Jury Instructions.

JURY PRESENT: Court read jury instructions to the jury. Closing arguments by Mr. Prince.

OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE OF THE JURY: Mr. Lauria noted for the record objection regarding slide that was used during closing argument. COURT SO NOTED.

JURY PRESENT: Closing arguments continued. At the hour of 4.42 p.m., the Jury retired to begin deliberations.

CONTINUED TO: 9/2/15 10:00 AM

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 32 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

September 02, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

September 02, 2015

10:00 AM

Jury Trial - FIRM

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

**COURTROOM:** RJC Courtroom 16C

**COURT CLERK:** Deborah Miller

RECORDER:

Sara Richardson

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Capanna, MD, Albert H Defendant Attorney

Orth, Beau R Prince, Dennis M

Lauria, Anthony D

Plaintiff Attorney

Tarmu, Danielle A.

**Attorney** 

### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- JURY PRESENT: Jury returned at 10:00 a.m. for deliberations. At the hour of 12.29 p.m., the Jury returned with a verdict for the Plaintiff. Jury polled. Court thanked and excused jury.

Request for Application of N.R.S. 41A.035, N.R.S. 42.021 FILED IN OPEN COURT.

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 33 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

COURT MINUTES

October 14, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

VS.

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

October 14, 2015

9:00 AM

Motion to Stay

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 16C

**COURT CLERK:** Deborah Miller

RECORDER:

REPORTER:

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Lauria, Anthony D

Attorney

Prince, Dennis M

Attorney

## **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- Mr. Lauria argued judgment is improper as it exceed \$350,000, noting he filed a pleading the day of the verdict. Arguments by Mr. Prince argued as to the lack of procedural basis to stay Entry of Judgment. Further arguments by counsel. COURT ORDERED, Motion DENIED; Mr. Lauria to file appropriate motions. COURT FURTHER ORDERED, Briefing schedule SET as follows: defense to file motion on or before October 23, 2015; plaintiff to reply on or before November 4, 2014; defense to reply on or before November 13, 2015, matter SET for argument. Discussion regarding Entry of Judgment.

Discussion regarding whether or not the PowerPoint with the MRI cuts was marked as a court exhibit. Court stated he does not recall it being marked as an exhibit, however, it will need to be submitted if they were ordered by the Court.

11/18/15 9:00 AM ARGUMENT: MOTIONS

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 34 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

**COURT MINUTES** 

A-11-648041-C

November 09, 2015

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

November 09, 2015 3:00 AM Motion to Retax

**COURTROOM:** RJC Courtroom 16C **HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

COURT CLERK: Deborah Miller

RECORDER:

REPORTER:

**PARTIES** PRESENT:

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- As to the defendants motion to retax and settle costs, this Court orders that the motion for costs is GRANTED in part and DENIED in part. Specifically, this Court finds that a party who prevails in an action is entitled to move for its costs. See NRS 18.020. Here, plaintiff is a prevailing party, having prevailed at the conclusion of a jury trial, and is entitled to statutory costs per NRS 18.005 and 18.020. Having reviewed the memorandum of costs and accompanying documentation on file, and having evaluated the requested costs in light of Berosini, 114 Nev. 1348, the Court ORDERS that utilizing the eight categories in plaintiff's memorandum of costs, costs will be awarded in full as requested for Category (1) In House Expenses (which includes copies, postage, courier and long distance costs) -\$5,026.53; Category (3) Expert Fees - \$69,975.95 The Court specifically finds that all named experts were necessary to plaintiff s case and exceeding the statutory amounts is justified and reasonable for Dr. Yoo and Dr. Cash based on their roles in the litigation; Category (4) Express Mail - \$172.31; Category (5) Investigation/Service - \$528.48; Category (6) Medical/Financial Records - \$2055.90 and Category (8) Travel Expenses - \$488.00. Regarding Category (2) Deposition Expenses, the Court finds that the TrialSmith charge of \$868.00 and the Turner Reporting charge of \$372.25 are unjustified and the total amount awarded for that category will be \$4,679.75. Regarding Category (7) Misc. Expenses/Court Fees, the court notes that plaintiff has withdrawn its meal cost request so that category will be reduced to a total award of \$40,395.28.

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 35 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

November 18, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

November 18, 2015

9:00 AM

All Pending Motions

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

**COURTROOM:** RJC Courtroom 16C

**COURT CLERK:** Deborah Miller

RECORDER:

Sara Richardson

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** PRESENT:

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- Argument: Motions...Defendant's Motion for Application of NRS 41A.035, NRS 42.021

Court stated counsel is requesting matter be continued until December 16, 2015 when the Motion for New Trial is set to be heard. COURT SO ORDERED.

CONTINUED TO: 12/16/15 9:00 AM

PRINT DATE: Page 36 of 41 03/23/2016 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

December 16, 2015

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

VS.

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

December 16, 2015

9:00 AM

All Pending Motions

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

**COURTROOM:** RJC Courtroom 16C

COURT CLERK: Deborah Miller

RECORDER:

Sara Richardson

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Eisenberg, Robert L.

Attorney Attorney

Lauria, Anthony D Prince, Dennis M

Attorney

**JOURNAL ENTRIES** 

- DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR NEW TRIAL, OR IN THE ALTERNATIVE, FOR AMENDMENT OF JUDGMENT...DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR APPLICATION OF NRS 41A.035, NRS. 42.021

Court noted that the Motion for Attorney Fees and Costs will be done on his chambers calendar to allow him time to review all the billings. As to Defendant's Motion for a New Trial, Counsel submitted on the motion. Court stated FINDINGS and ORDERED, motion DENIED, noting the allegations fall under the seventh category of error in law.

As to Defendant's Motion for Application of NRS 41A.035, NRS 42.021, Mr. Lauria argued NRS 41A.035 and NRS 42.021 are mandatory per the statute. Arguments by Mr. Prince as to the jury award and the constitutionality of NRS 41A.035. Discussion regarding judgment of order. Mr. Prince to provide copies to the defense prior to signature in the future. Further arguments by counsel as to periodic payments and future damages. COURT ORDERED, Motion GRANTED as to 41A, Pain and Suffering awards reduced to \$350,000, noting law is constitutional; interest will start accruing at the time of the order. COURT FURTHER ORDERED, Motion GRANTED as to 42.021, periodic payments

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 37 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

set as follows: \$175,000 to be paid within six months, \$88,000 to be paid at the period of twelve months, and the remaining \$87,000 to be paid at the period of 18 months. Mr. Prince inquired as to the security for the payments. Mr. Eisenberg noted the statute states if the judgment debtor is not adequately insured, the Court can require security adequate to it. Court stated an amended judgment will be prepared and Mr. Prince will provide a copy to Mr. Lauria prior to signature. Further discussion regarding insurance. Court stated he will make the ruling on fees and costs and Mr. Prince may litigate security for the periodic payments in writing if he believes they should be entitled to it. Mr. Lauria to prepare orders on motions. Mr. Lauria noted for the record that he and Mr. Prince had an agreement that there would be no attempt to execute on the judgments until all the post trial orders are noticed or filed. Mr. Prince stated that he is not agreeing to counsel's representations. Further discussion regarding execution of judgment. Mr. Prince agreed to not seek any execution of judgment until the amended judgment order, order on today's motions, and order regarding Court's decision on fees and costs are filed.

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 38 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

## DISTRICT COURT CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

Malpractice - Medical/Dental COURT MINUTES December 21, 2015

A-11-648041-C Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)
vs.
Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

December 21, 2015 3:00 AM Motion for Attorney Fees

and Costs

HEARD BY: Herndon, Douglas W. COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 16C

COURT CLERK: Deborah Miller

RECORDER:

REPORTER:

PARTIES PRESENT:

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- Upon review of the papers and pleadings on file herein, the Court notes that plaintiff, after prevailing at trial, has moved for an award of attorney s fees. The sole legal basis stated in plaintiff s request is NRS 18.010(2)(b). Pursuant to NRS 18.010(2)(b), attorney s fees are awardable to the prevailing party when the court finds the opposing party s claims were brought without reasonable grounds or to harass the prevailing party. Moreover, the court is to liberally construe the provisions of 18.010(2)(b). Plaintiff has alleged that all and/or at least the liability part, of defendant s defenses were maintained without reasonable grounds and therefore plaintiff should be awarded its appropriate attorney s fees. As with most, if not all, medical malpractice actions, issues regarding liability and damages are separate. Even when one issue or the other is agreed upon between the parties, evidence regarding each issue requires a different presentation to the jury. Generally speaking, where both issues are contested, the liability portion requires much more time and effort as you never even reach the issue of damages without first establishing liability. This case was no different. Although certain witnesses addressed both issues, the manner of the presentation on each issue is different and the time spent on presenting each issue is different. Understanding this is important in the instant case because the court cannot find that defendant s liability defense was maintained with reasonable grounds, although defending the issue of damages was made in good faith and with reasonable grounds. The presentation of evidence on liability, which it should be noted

PRINT DATE: 03/23/2016 Page 39 of 41 Minutes Date: August 08, 2012

#### A-11-648041-C

included evidence and opinions from some of defendant's own experts, was overwhelming. It could not only be characterized as clearly exceeding the civil burden of proof standard but, arguably, the totality of evidence showing that the original surgery was performed at the wrong level of the spine would meet a beyond a reasonable doubt standard. Turning to the issue of time, it is difficult to ascertain with precision exactly how much time and effort is spent on liability issues versus damages issues over the course of a jury trial, particularly one such as this that spans the course of three weeks. However, a review of available information allows the Court to conclude that it is reasonable to characterize the presentation of liability issues (though jury selection, opening statements, evidence presentation and argument) as encompassing at least 80% of plaintiff's trial presentation. The Court has further evaluated the requested amounts, the documentation provided and, pursuant to Schouweiler, 101 Nev. 827 (1985), has taken into account the complexity of the case, the quality of the advocacy, the character of the work, the work actually performed and the results. The Court also finds that the application of NRS 7.095 is an appropriate mechanism to address attorney s fees. Based upon that, the Court finds that the total attorney s fees award of \$212,486.98 as requested in plaintiff s reply brief (which is less than the original amount requested in the motion) is an appropriate figure to which to apply the 80% designation described above. Therefore, having found pursuant to NRS 18.010(2)(b) that defendant maintained a liability defense without reasonable grounds and that plaintiff's liability presentation at trial encompassed at least 80% of their time and effort, the Court now ORDERS that attorney s fees will be awarded in the amount of \$169,989.58.

CLERK'S NOTE: A copy of this minute order has been emailed to Dennis Prince, Esq. and Anthony Lauria, Esq. dm3/17/16

# DISTRICT COURT CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

Malpractice - Medical/Dental

**COURT MINUTES** 

March 16, 2016

A-11-648041-C

Beau Orth, Plaintiff(s)

VS.

Albert Capanna, MD, Defendant(s)

March 16, 2016

9:00 AM

Motion to Strike

**HEARD BY:** Herndon, Douglas W.

COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 16C

**COURT CLERK:** Deborah Miller

RECORDER:

Sara Richardson

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** 

**PRESENT:** Lauria, Anthony D

Attorney

Prince, Dennis M

Attorney

#### JOURNAL ENTRIES

- Mr. Prince argued reply brief improperly raised new arguments and law. Mr. Lauria argued the request is untimely and Plaintiff's arguments are not supported by legal authority. Court stated he does not feel it would be appropriate for Court to strike something that he considered and allowed to be part of previous argument. Further, Court stated he would be inclined to DENY the motion if he had jurisdiction, however, Supreme Court will decide if appropriate to consider Discussion regarding pending motions. Mr. Lauria requested sanctions be imposed regarding the time to prepare for the motion. COURT ORDERED, request for sanctions, DENIED, noting issue was appropriate to have been raised in front on the Court prior to the Supreme Court. Mr. Lauria to prepare order and provide to opposing counsel prior to submitting for signature.

# Beau Orth vs. Albert Capanna, M.D. Case No. A-11-648041-C; Department III

## PLAINTIFF'S TRIAL EXHIBITS

	Description	Stipulated	Objected	Offered	Admitted
1.	Medical records from International Neuroscience (P00001 – P00096)	* X		8 - 24-15	8-24/5
2.	Billing records from International Neuroscience (P00097 – P00099)	X	***************************************	S Polytography (1975)	
3.	Medical records from Desert Institute of Spine Care (P00100 – P00225)	X		STATE OF THE PARTY	The Association of the Control of th
4.	Billing records from Desert Institute of Spine Care (P00226)	+			and the second
5.	Medical records from Steinberg Diagnostic Medical Imaging (P00227 – P00232)	X			
6.	Billing records from Steinberg Diagnostic Medical Imaging (P00233 – P00235)	X		Westernist the Samming weeks	оливаниченного очения,
7.	Medical records from McKenna and Ruggeroli Pain Specialists (P00236 – P00257)	X		A STATE OF THE STA	and continue outside successive s
8.	Billing records from McKenna and Ruggeroli Pain Specialists (P00258 – P00259)	X		Vecessive	- The second sec
9.	Medical records from Surgical Arts Center (P00260 - P00445) P00318 REMOVED By Shallaton of Counsel	I X		**************************************	адаруууналаналаналананаруу
10.	Billing records from Surgical Arts Center (P00446 – P00448)	X		The Annual Control of the Control of	diameteletuman-uusuungitusses
11.	Medical records from Desert Radiologists (P00449 – P00451)	X		printe chickenini series dine dine	es-communication of the contraction of the contract
12.	Billing records from Desert Radiologists (P00452 – P00454)	X	ì	Anticological desiration of the control of the cont	williotificitis filte from companying or the
13.	Medical records from Axiom Imaging of Las Vegas (P00455 - P00457)	X		And the state of t	and the second s
14.	Medical records from Clinical Neurology Specialists (P00458 – P00473)	X	•	Ammunia di da di munigio ny jan	encomment of the state of the s
15.	Medical records from Keith Kleven Physical Therapy (P00474 - 100714)	X	And the second s	*** The Particular Service Committee	ati ottometja, maja ja dis

Description		Stipulated	Objected	Offered	Admitted	
16.	Billing records from Keith Kleven Physical Therapy (P00715 - P00737)	×		8-2415	8.24.15	
17.	Medical records from University Medical Center (P00738 – P00793)	<del>-</del>				
18.	Billing records from University Medical Center (P00794 – P00798)	X		A CONTRACTOR OF THE PROPERTY O		
19.	Medical records from Southern Hills Hospital (P00799 - P01045)	X		The second secon		
20.	Billing records from Southern Hills Hospital (P01046 – P01052)	X		Political and the second of th	The state of the s	
21.	Billing records from Radiology Specialists (P01053 – P01054)	X			They are the control of the control	
22.	Medical records from PBS Anesthesia (P01055 – P01058)	X		The second secon		
23.	Billing records from PBS Anesthesia (P01059)	X				
24.	Billing records from Andrew L. Zak, M.D. (P01060 – P02062)	Χ		Annual transport of the state o		
25.	Billing records from ProCare Medical Center (P01063)	X	·			
26.	Life Expectancy Table (P01064 – P01065)	X		A connection of the state of th		
27.	Medical Billing Summary (P01066)		X	8-24.15	not don'tte	
28.	University Medical Center – Call Sheet, July, 2008 – January, 2012 DMC (P01064 – P01111)		X		Wmi#	
29.	University Medical Center – Surgery Schedule of Albert Capanna, M.D., 1/1/2008 – 5/11/2015 (P01112 – P01125)	;	X		Admit	
30.	Consent for Operation	8-24-15			Adm 1+fe	

Case No.: <b>A648041</b>	Clerk: Debbie Miller
Dept.: III Judge: Douglas Herdon	Recorder: Sara Panardson
Pltf(s): Beau Orth	Pltf's Counsel: Dennis M. Prince, Esq.
	Jo
Deft(s): Albert H. Capanna, M.D.	Deft's Counsel: Anthony D. Lauria, Esq.
Derits). Albert II. Capanna, W.D.	Paul A. Cardinale, Esq.

Exh. No.	Description	Date Offered	Obj.	Date Admitted
Α	Plaintiff's Complaint filed on September 8, 2011	_ xx xx	The second secon	***************************************
В	Defendant's Answer to Plaintiff's Complaint filed on			
	January 11, 2012	~~************************************		
С	Medical records from Michael Milligan, M.D./A. Scott		***************************************	NOT
	Martin, M.D.	8.24.15	WA	A. Jon Had
'e	Bates Stamped: COOI — COAB	8-24-15		/(u////jkca
D	Billing records from Michael Milligan, M.D. / A.S.			
	Martin, M.D.  Bates Stamped: $000/-0029$	8-24-15	SOP	8.24.15
E	Medical records from Desert Radiologist			300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300
	Bates Stamped: 5001 - E017	######################################		96 pa 644
F	Billing records from Desert Radiologist			100
	Bates Stamped: 1-001	th, constanting	####	g, n d annual an
G	Medical records from McKenna and Ruggeroli Pain	****		and the same of th
·	Specialists Bates Stamped: 6001-6119	д Думина Алеренулия	**************************************	anning page and and an anning page and an an
H	Billing records from McKenna and Ruggeroli Pain			0
	Specialists	***		49-A
	Bates Stamped:	100 Per 100 Pe		- 444
	4001- HOOY			M. Grand and M. Gr
1	Medical records from Clinical Neurology Specialists			77-1111
	Bates Stamped: エ 00 / - エ 009			миленици
J	Billing records from Clinical Neurology Specialists			o de de la companya d
	Bates Stamped JOO /	244 244 244 244 244 244 244 244 244 244		thin the second
K	Medical records from International Neuroscience (Dr.	***		#
	Capanna)		1000 to 1000 t	Ниментим
	Bates Stamped: K001 -K119	Hthilanedillanum	TOTAL THE RELIEF HER PROPERTY OF THE PROPERTY	Alamannin kanadajatar kelilijanad
L	Billing records from International Neuroscience (Dr. Capanna) LOOI - LOO3	Millian de la companya de la company	STATE OF THE PROPERTY OF THE P	

Exh.	Description	Date		Date
No.	•	Offered	Obj.	Admitted

-	Bates Stamped:				And the state of t
M	Medical records from Axion Imaging of Las Vegas  Bates Stamped: 1001 - 1005	82	4-15	sty	8.24.15
N	Medical records from University Medical Center  Bates Stamped:  NOT (- NOT 9		and the same of th	* William in the last of the l	***************************************
0	Billing records from University Medical Center  Bates Stamped:  000   -005		Commission of the control of the con	may Name and Control of the Control	
P	Medical and billing records from PBS Anesthesia  Bates Stamped: POOI - POO5		WALTER COLUMN TO THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPERTY	and the state of t	pod district in the control of the c
Q	Billing records from PBS Anesthesia  Bates Stamped: 00/		TO O Depth of the party of the	олийнорујунницевником.	44444
R	Medical records from Steinberg Diagnostic Medical Imaging  Bates Stamped: 0273-0285 ROO / -ROO D			ручения в применя в	
S	Billing records from Steinberg Diagnostic Medical Imaging Bates Stamped: 0273-0285		arii (azaveninininininininininininininininininini	disease de la companya del companya del companya de la companya de	
T	Medical records from Desert institute of Spine Care (Dr. Cash Bates Stamped: 0287-0354		And the second s	de de la companya de	
U	Billing records from Desert Institute of Spine Care (Dr. Cash)  Bates Stamped: 0355  U001 - U002		And the state of t		The register of the state of th
٧	Updated billing records from Desert Institute of Spine Care (Dr. Cash) $VOOI-VOQR$	######################################	The second of the second	renterment renterment met enterment	
W	Medical records from Southern Hills Hospital  Bates Stamped: WOO1 - W 247		THIRD CONTRACTOR OF THE PERSON	eienneilinderdesimmengegegegegegegegegegegegegegegegegege	нения выполня при
X	Billing records from Southern Hills Hospital  Bates Stamped: 0606-0614 XOOI -XOO	) The same of the	TO PROPERTY OF THE PROPERTY OF	and detail messassiffee majests.	

No. Offered Obj. Admitted	Exh.	Description	Date		Date
		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	Offered	Obj.	Admitted

Υ	Medical records from Keith Kleven Physical Therapy  Bates Stamped: 0615-0732	8-24	15	SZ	P	824	1-/5	ne.
Z	Billing records from Keith Kleven Physical Therapy  Bates Stamped: 0733-0742  201-2013	THE COLUMN TWO PERSONS AND ASSESSED TO SERVICE					trefft renumeroverent filter from a constitution of the constituti	
AA	Billing records from Andrew L. Zak, M.D.  Bates Stamped: 0743-0745  AAOO / - AOO 3	And the second s		ing intercompany page 1990	***************************************		Andrewsky Andrew	
ВВ	Desert Radiologists, Medical Imaging Report dated 8/31/12  Bates Stamped: BOO/ - BOO 2	од от на верения пределения верения ве		A THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPERTY			And the second s	
CC	Billing records from Desert Radiologists (Zotec Partners dated 8/31/12  Bates Stamped: CCO/ -CCO/	And processing statements and the statements are statements and the statements are statements and the statements and the statements are statements and the statements and the statements and the statements are statements and the statements are statements and the			100 mm			
DD	Records from UCLV Athletic Training ODOV - DOD	J 86	1415	4	0	8.24	//5	e. 21-15
EE	Plaintiff's Answers to Defendant's Interrogatories	8.2	4-15	- Ux		Cour	l-Gd	UZZŁŦI
FF	Plaintiff's Response to Defendant's Request for Production of Documents	8-2	4.15	· <i>U</i>	20	, Adn	+ ]:442	-
GG	Plaintiff's Supplement to Response to Defendant's Request for Production of Documents		- State and and the state of th	провеня при	THE PARTY OF THE P	intermental property in the	•	•
НН	Plaintiff's Response to Defendant's Second Set of Request for Production of Documents			-		Higher Scientist Fernancia Acresiums (4) 44 ffac		
	Plaintiff's Answers to Defendant's Second Set of Interrogatories		000			Market and the second	10000	
]]	Plaintiff's Response to Defendant's Third Set of Request for Production of Documents	-	990 <del>0000000000000000000000000000000000</del>			The constitution of the co		
KK	Plaintiff's Answers to Defendant's Third Set of Interrogatories		in designation of the second					
LL	Plaintiff's Response to Defendant's Fourth Set of Request for Production of Documents		AND THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPER	The state of the s		Cau		
MM	Plaintiff's Response to Defendant's Request for Admissions	1441146	Fi-Thrussen-transferozzasia-and-prezeszas	en e		non Adn		d

Exh.	Description	Date		Date
No.	•	Offered	Obj.	Admitted

NN	Curriculum Vitae, Testimony List and Fee Schedule for Allan Belzberg, B.Sc., M.D., FRCS	o Miller		0-7112
	Alian beizberg, bioc., Wib., FRC5	824-15	W.	8-24-15
00	Expert Report prepared by Allan Belzberg, B.Sc., M.D., FRCSC	We will be a second of the sec		not Admittal
PP	Supplemental Expert Report prepared by Allan Belzberg, B.Sc., M.D., FRCSC dated 7/20/15	Operation of the state of the s	7	Three and the common of the co
QQ	Curriculum Vitae, Testimony List and Fee Schedule for Marc D. Kaye, M.D.			
RR	Expert Report prepared by Marc D. Kaye, M.D. dated 8/5/13	100 mm	O O O O O O O O O O O O O O O O O O O	A vermentalisment in the property of the prope
SS	Power Point prepared by Marc D. Kaye, M.D.			999
TT	Updated Power Point prepared by Marc D. Kaye, M.D.			
UU	Curriculum Vitae, Testimony and Fee Schedule for Reynold L. Rimoldi, M.D.	The district Agricultural Agric	Militaria de construcción de c	
VV	Expert Report prepared by Reynold L. Rimoldi, M.D. dated 7/17/13		To an analysis of the management of the state of the stat	
ww	Supplemental Expert Report prepared by Reynold L. Rimoldi, M.D. dated 5/26/15		0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	
XX	Supplemental Expert Report prepared by Reynold L. Rimoldi, M.D. dated 7/24/15		Carlo de Maria de Carlo de Car	
ΥΥ	Steinberg Diagnostic Medical Imaging and records which include an MRI of the lumbar spine dated 3/21/14	8-24-15	S+	8-24-15 8-24-15
ZZ	Steinberg Diagnostic Medical Imaging billing records	8-24-15	SHIP	8-24-15
AAA	Surgical Arts Center billing including facility for injections by Dr. Ruggeroli on 3/26/14, 4/16/14, and 5/14/14	Militaria sanja mananja da manananja	e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e	
BBB	Medical records from Surgical Arts Center		**************************************	op of the state of
CCC	Updated billing from Desert Institute of Spine Care through 3/18/14 (Dr. Cash)	This contains the	SPP-vegishermore control of the cont	His district of the second sec
DDD	UNLV – MRI Lumbar spine dated 2/8/10		1	TOF ASM

Exh.	Description	Date		Date
No.	* ·	Offered	Obj.	Admitted

EEE	Axion Imaging – MRI Lumbar spine dated 9/2/10	8 24-15 stop Admitte
FFF	Axion Imaging – MRI Lumbar spine dated 9/2/10	
GGG	Dr. Capanna's Operative Report	8.24-15 Stip 8.24.15
ННН	Dr. Cash's Operative Report	8.24-15.54ip 8.24-15 8.24-15.54ip 8.24-15 8.24-15.54ip 8.24-15
Amment .	Dr. Ruggeroli's Operative Report dated 4/16/14	824-15 Stip 8:24-15
JJJ	Desert Radiologists, MRI taken 2/3/2009	8-2415 Admitted
KKK	Desert Radiologists, MRI taken 2/18/2010	
LLL	Desert Radiologists, MRI taken 8/31/2012	
MMM	Steinberg Diagnostics, MRI Lumbar taken 10/6/2010	
NNN	Steinberg Diagnostics, MRI Lumbar taken 3/13/2014	
000	Desert Institute of Spine Care, X-ray, Lumbar dated 10/12/10	
PPP	Desert Institute of Spine Care, X-ray, Lumbar dated 11/3/2010	
QQQ	Desert Institute of Spine Care, X-ray, Lumbar dated 12/1/2010	A primition and the second
RRR	Desert Institute of Spine Care, X-ray, Lumbar dated 2/8/2011	
SSS	Desert Institute of Spine Care, X-ray, Lumbar dated 8/28/2012	
TTT	Desert Institute of Spine Care, X-ray, Lumbar dated 10/12/10	
UUU	Article entitled Microdiscectomy for the treatment of lumbar disc herniation: an evaluation of reoperations and long-term outcomes, Evid Base Spine Care J., 2014	82415 iso Not Admitted

Exh.	Description	Date		Date	
No.	•	Offered	Obj.	Admitted	

	Oct; 5(2): 77-86.			
VVV	Article entitled Limited microdiscectomy for lumbar disk herniation: a retrospective long-term outcome analysis, J. Spinal Disord Tech., 2014 Feb; 27(1):E8-E13.	8-24-15	GB	not- Admitted
www	Article entitled Recurrent disc herniation and long-term back pain after primary lumbar discectomy: review of outcomes reported for limited versus aggressive disc removal, Neurosurgery, 2009 Feb; 64(2):338-44.	The state of the s	- The second	
XXX	Article entitled Long-term back pain after a single-level discectomy for radiculopathy: incidence and health care cost analysis, J Neurosurg Spine, 2010 Feb; 12(2):178-82.	and the state of t	And the second district of the second distric	And the second s
YYY	Article entitled Microdiscectomy for the treatment of lumbar disc herniation: an evaluation of reoperations and long-term outcomes, Evid Based Spine CareJ., 2014 Oct; 5(2):77-86.		The state of the s	The commence of the state of th
ZZZ	Article entitled Mid- to long-term outcome of disc excision in adolescent disc herniation, Spine J, 2006 Jul-Aug; 6(4):380-4.	ве паладента под предоставления при предоставления	e de la constitución de la const	
AAAA	Article entitled The outcomes of lumbar microdiscectomy in a young, active population: correlation by herniation type and level, Spine (Phila Pa 1976). 2008 Jan 1; 33(1):33-8.	The state of the s		The second secon
ВВВВ	Article entitled Minimally invasive surgery for lumbar disc herniation: a systematic review and meta-analysis, Eur Spine J. 2014 May;23(5):1021-43.	The distribution of the control of t	The control of the co	The state of the s
CCCC	Article entitled Is the rate of re-operation after primary lumbar microdiscectomy affected by surgeon grade or intra-operative lavage of the disc space? Br J Neurosurg., 2014 Apr; 28(2):247-51	in the contract of the contrac	Andrews and the state of the st	
DDDD	Article entitled Reoperation for recurrent lumbar disc herniation: a study over a 20-year period in a Japanese polulation, J Orthop Sci., 2012 Mar; 17(2): 107-13.	The state of the s	The second secon	

Exh.	Description	Date		Date
No.		Offered	Obj.	Admitted

				<b></b>		
EEEE	Article entitled Long-term outcomes of lumbar microdiscectomy in a working class sample, Neurocirugia (Astur), 2011 Ju: 22(3):235-44.	9.3	To the second se	\\\\\	>	not Admitted
FFFF	Article entitled The efficacy of minimally invasive discectomy compared with open discectomy: a meta-analysis of prospective randomized controlled trial, J. Neurosurg Spine, 2012 May; 16(5):452-62.	A Comment of the state of the s	And the state of t	учення на		
GGGG	Article entitled Reoperation rate after surgery for lumbar spinal stenosis without spondylolisthesis: a nationwide cohort study. Spine J. 2013 Oct; 13(10):1230-7.		Annue errorein reconstitute per premititate annico de grannes es estados de la companione d	от профина общинием выполнять предержения по поставления по	-	Account of the control of the contro
НННН	Article entitled 5-year reoperation rates after different types of lumbar spine surgery. Spine (Phila Pa 1976). 1988 Apr 1; 23(7):814-20.		HALL STATE OF THE			And security with the control of the
1111	Article entitled Revision surgery following operations for lumbar stenosis. J Bone Joint Surg Am. 2011 Nov 2; 93(21):1979-86.	44-44-4	Children of the Commission of			
ווונ	Article entitled Surgery for spinal stenosis: long-term reoperation rates, health care cost, and impact of instrumentation. Spine (Phila Pa 1976). 2014 May 20; 39(12):978-87.		Petronomen en e	A commencer and search makes the data design to the search makes the searc	ала и о талабартардинин уул неш котпетиций ж.у. неш ф. Сухучний сухучний сухучний сухучний сухучний сухучний с	
KKKK	Article entitled Complications, reoperation rates, and health-care cost following surgical treatment of lumbar spondylolisthesis. J Bone Joint Surg. Am, 2013 Nov 6; 95(21):e 162.		Anna Carlotte de la companya del la companya de la companya del la companya de la	overnormer merennen merennen skalaturkakatatatakatatatatakatatatakatatatatakatatatatakatatatatakatatatatakatat	ней-кандий мерен и метериней мерен мерен метериней метериней метериней метериней метериней метериней метериней	
LLLL	Article entitled Reoperation rate after surgery for lumbar herniated intervertebral disc disease: nationwide cohort study. Spine (Phila Pa 1976). 2013 Apr 1; 38(7):581-90	The state of the s	ered vermentely of the many later and the many late		And the second s	
MMMM	Article entitled Repeat surgery after lumbar decompression for herniated disc: the quality implications of hospital and surgeon variation. Spine J. 2012 Feb; 12(2):89-97		The state of the s	-	A Commence of the Commence of	

Exh.	Description	Date		Date
No.		Offered	Obj.	Admitted

- MA - WA		
NNNN	Article entitled Risk of multiple reoperations after lumbar discectomy: a population-based study. Spine (Phila Pa 1976). 2003 Mar 15; 28(6):621-7	8.24-15 you not. Admitted
0000	The deposition transcript of Beau Orth, dated April 14, 2015, and any exhibits thereto.	8-26-15 N Court #17 9-2-1 8-26-15 N Court #18 9-2-1
PPPP	The deposition transcript of Albert Capanna, M.D. dated January 15, 2015, and any exhibits thereto.	8-26-15 N Court - 49-2-1 Exhubit # 18
QQQQ	The deposition transcript of Allan Belzberg, M.D. dated May 29, 2015, and any exhibits thereto.	8-24-15 N Court Exhibit 16 9-2-
RRRR	The deposition transcript of Marc Kaye, M.D., dated June 15, 2015, and any exhibits thereto	8-31-15 1 Court 54-195
SSSS	The deposition transcript of Reynold Rimoldi, M.D. dated June 17, 2015, and any exhibits thereto	- not offered or
TIII	The deposition transcript of Michelle Bennion, dated April 7, 2015, and any exhibits thereto	not stricted
UUUU	The deposition transcript of Eileen Rinaldi, dated April 8, 2015, and any exhibits thereto	
VVVV	The deposition transcript of Anthony Ruggeroli, M.D., dated May 21, 2015, and any exhibits thereto.	THE STATE OF THE S
www	The deposition transcript of Frank Yoo, M.D., dated May 26, 2015, and any exhibits thereto	
XXXX	The deposition transcript of Andrew Cash, M.D., dated June 17, 2015, and any exhibits thereto.	
YYYY	The deposition transcript of Andrew Cash, M.D., dated June 23, 2015, and any exhibits thereto	
<b>ZZZZ</b>	The deposition transcript of Andrew Cash, M.D., dated May 27, 2015, and any exhibits thereto	
AAAAA	The deposition transcript of Stephanie Saxon, dated July 8, 2015, and any exhibits thereto	
BBBBB	Affidavit of Kevin Yoo, M.D. dated 9/7/2011	8-24-5 GD not Admitted
ccccc	Expert Report prepared by Kevin Yoo, M.D. undated and served on 7/17/15	
DDDDD	Supplemental Expert Report by Kevin Yoo, M.D. dated 7/17/2015	
EEEEE	Expert Report prepared by Andrew Cash, M.D. dated 4/1/2015	

Exh.	Description	Date		Date
No.	•	Offered	Obj.	Admitted

FFFFF	Expert Report prepared by Anthony Ruggerolli, M.D. dated 4/27/2015	8-24	15	VA	M/m	40/
GGGGG	Supplemental Expert Report prepared by Andrew Cash, M.D. dated 7/28/2015	To the state of th			A Section of the sect	
ННННН	Medical Report prepared by Andrew Cash, M.D. dated 2/25/2011				Antigeness of the second second	
11111	Medical report prepared by Andrew Cash, M.D. dated 4/21/2011		***************************************	ницијиници феденски градин	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
,	Medical report prepared by Andrew Cash, M.D. dated 9/6/2012	######################################	111111111111111111111111111111111111111	Anteres and participation of the factoring of the factori	H-1-diff-d-1-d-1-d-1-d-1-d-1-d-1-d-1-d-1-d-1-d	
KKKKK	Medical report prepared by Andrew Cash dated 9/6/2012	A STATE OF THE STA		-	The state of the s	
LLLLL	Medical report prepared by Andrew Cash dated 3/13/2014	pp (Filming to U.S.)		Annous memorial management	не эннерспінально, приципир	
MMMM	Medical report prepared for Andrew Cash, M.D. dated 3/19/2014		All the state of t		Month of the second of the sec	
NNNNN	McKenna, Ruggeroli and Helmi Pain Specialists notes				944	
00000	Andrew Cash, M.D. letter to Eglet Prince dated May 14, 2015	Control Contro			The state of the s	
·	Prior testimony of Dr. Frank Yoo	70+			r Admi	4401
444444444444444444444444444444444444444	Prior testimony of Andrew Cash, M.D.		* : (15	-/L5/14/J		1/-
	Prior testimony of Anthony Ruggeroli, M.D.				The state of the s	Harris Ha
PPPP	Chief Complaint - Deport First it lite	831-	15	WO	And the state of t	
SERRIC	101, Coop Hos - 3-1-07	0000007 ==== 1/400004		10000000000000000000000000000000000000	NOT-AU	MH
<u> </u>	Billing for Ari Cash	8-/-	15t	N	8-1-13	
	AFFIDGELIT OF TIMOTHY Spears	8-31	45	40 <u></u>	8-3/-1	
						-

#### **COURT'S EXHIBITS**

#### CASE NO. A648041

	Date Offered	Objection	Date Admitted
1) Demonstrative	8/24/15	<u>N</u>	8/24/15
2) Demonstrative	8/24/15	N	8/24/15
3) June #/ Question	8/25/15	N	8/25/15
4) Junor # 4 Gustion	8/26/15		8/26/15
5) Juron # 10 Question	8/26/15	Esadist Raad	8/26/15
6) Juron # 6 Question	8/27/15		8/27/15
7) Juron 41 Question	8/27/15	N	8/27/15
8) Juron#6 Question	8/37/15	N	8/27/15
9) Jurar # 10 Question	8/29/15	· /U	8/20/15
10) Junon # 3 Question	8/3//15	Y	8/3/15
11) Juron#1 Quistion	8/31/15	ASTED I	8/3/15
12) Jun 4/ Question	8/3/115	-Nort Asked	8/3//15
13) Depense Exhibit EE	8/3//5		8/3//15
14) Defense Exhibit LL	8/3//15		8/3/15
15) Plaintiffs Opening Power Point	9/2/15	N	9/2/15
	8-24-15		9/2/15
17) Deposition of Beau Outh	825-15		9/2/15
18) Deposition of Marc D. Kaye, M.D.	8-26-15		9/2/15
19) Datosition of Marc D. Kaye, M.D.	8/31/15	**************************************	9/2/15



# EIGHTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT CLERK'S OFFICE NOTICE OF DEFICIENCY

#### ON APPEAL TO NEVADA SUPREME COURT

DENNIS M. PRINCE, ESQ. 400 S. SEVENTH ST., #400 LAS VEGAS, NV 89101

**DATE: March 23, 2016** 

CASE: A648041

RE CASE: BEAU R. ORTH vs. ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D.

NOTICE OF APPEAL FILED: March 21, 2016

YOUR APPEAL HAS BEEN SENT TO THE SUPREME COURT.

PLEASE NOTE: DOCUMENTS NOT TRANSMITTED HAVE BEEN MARKED:

	\$250 - Supreme Court Filing Fee (Make Check Payable to the Supreme Court)**  - If the \$250 Supreme Court Filing Fee was not submitted along with the original Notice of Appeal, it must be mailed directly to the Supreme Court. The Supreme Court Filing Fee will not be forwarded by this office it submitted after the Notice of Appeal has been filed.
	\$24 – District Court Filing Fee (Make Check Payable to the District Court)**
	\$500 - Cost Bond on Appeal (Make Check Payable to the District Court)** - NRAP 7: Bond For Costs On Appeal in Civil Cases
	Case Appeal Statement - NRAP 3 (a)(1), Form 2
	Order
Ø	Notice of Entry of Order re: Order filed August 22, 2015

#### NEVADA RULES OF APPELLATE PROCEDURE 3 (a) (3) states:

"The district court clerk must file appellant's notice of appeal despite perceived deficiencies in the notice, including the failure to pay the district court or Supreme Court filing fee. The district court clerk shall apprise appellant of the deficiencies in writing, and shall transmit the notice of appeal to the Supreme Court in accordance with subdivision (e) of this Rule with a notation to the clerk of the Supreme Court setting forth the deficiencies. Despite any deficiencies in the notice of appeal, the clerk of the Supreme Court shall docket the appeal in accordance with Rule 12."

Please refer to Rule 3 for an explanation of any possible deficiencies.

<sup>\*\*</sup>Per District Court Administrative Order 2012-01, in regards to civil litigants, "...all Orders to Appear in Forma Pauperis expire one year from the date of issuance." You must reapply for in Forma Pauperis status.

## **Certification of Copy**

State of Nevada County of Clark SS

I, Steven D. Grierson, the Clerk of the Court of the Eighth Judicial District Court, Clark County, State of Nevada, does hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and correct copy of the hereinafter stated original document(s):

NOTICE OF CROSS-APPEAL; PLAINTIFF'S CROSS-APPEAL STATEMENT; DISTRICT COURT DOCKET ENTRIES; CIVIL COVER SHEET; ORDER REGARDING DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR NEW TRIAL, OR IN THE ALTERNATIVE, FOR AMENDMENT OF JUDGMENT; NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER; ORDER REGARDING DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR APPLICATION OF NRS 41A.035 AND 42.021; NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER; ORDER REGARDING PLAINTIFF'S MOTION TO DECLARE NRS 42.021 AND NRS 41A.035 UNCONSTITUTIONAL; ORDER REGARDING PLAINTIFF'S MOTIONS IN LIMINE; NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER; DISTRICT COURT MINUTES; EXHIBITS LIST; NOTICE OF DEFICIENCY

BEAUR. ORTH,

Plaintiff(s),

VS.

ALBERT H. CAPANNA, M.D.,

Defendant(s),

now on file and of record in this office.

Case No: A648041

Dept No: III

IN WITNESS THEREOF, I have hereunto Set my hand and Affixed the seal of the Court at my office, Las Vegas, Nevada This 23 day of March 2016.

Steven D. Grierson, Clerk of the Court

Heather Ungermann, Deputy Clerk

EGLET PRINCE COST ACCOUNT 400 S. 7TH STREET SUITE 400 LAS VEGAS, NV 89101 702-450-5400

A648041

BANK OF NEVADA 94-177/1224

3/21/2016

PAY TO THE Clerk of the Supreme Court

**\$**\*\*250.00

Two Hundred Fifty and 00/100\*\*

-

Clerk of the Supreme Court Tracie Lindeman, Clerk 201 E. Carson Street, Suite 201

Carson City, NV 89701

DOLLARS

14908

MEMO

244178/Beau R. Orth/Notice of Appeal filing fee/brg

"O14908" :1122401778: 7502280804"

14908

Clerk of the Supreme Court

**EGLET PRINCE/COST ACCOUNT** 

3/21/2016 244178/Beau R. Orth/Notice of Appeal filing fee/brg

250.00

Cost Acct-Eglet Law

244178/Beau R. Orth/Notice of Appeal filing fee/

250.00