IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEVADA

RALPH ALEXANDER,

Appellant,

vs.

THE STATE OF NEVADA,

Respondent.

Electronically Filed Oct 12 2016 10:46 a.m. Elizabeth A. Brown Clerk of Supreme Court

APPELLANT'S APPENDIX - VOLUME 5 OF 7

Appellant Ralph Alexander, by and through the undersigned counsel, submits this appendix to his Fast Track Statement.

DATED this 11th of October, 2016.

Docket No.

/s/ John Parris

JOHN P. PARRIS, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 7479 **LAW OFFICES OF JOHN P. PARRIS** 324 S. 3rd St. #200 Las Vegas, NV 89101 (702) 382-0905

Attorney for Appellant

CHRONOLOGICAL INDEX

Description	Vol.	Pages	Date
Transcript: Grand Jury Proceedings	1	1-163	8/13/2015
Indictment	1	164-69	8/14/2015
Transcript: Grand Jury Proceedings	2	1-179	10/8/2015
Superseding Indictment	2	180-93	10/9/2015
Transcript: Jury Trial Day 1	3	1-197	12/1/2015
Transcript: Jury Trial Day 2	4	1-270	12/2/2015
Transcript: Jury Trial Day 3	5	1-253	12/3/2015
Transcript: Jury Trial Day 4	6	1-247	12/4/2015
Transcript: Jury Trial Day 5	7	1-108	12/7/2015
Verdict	7	109-13	12/7/2015
Transcript: Sentencing	7	114-26	3/17/2016
Judgment of Conviction	7	127-32	3/25/2016
Notice of Appeal	7	133-34	4/18/2016

ALPHABETICAL INDEX

Description	Vol.	Pages	Date
Indictment	1	164-69	8/14/2015
Judgment of Conviction	7	127-32	3/25/2016
Notice of Appeal	7	133-34	4/18/2016
Superseding Indictment	2	180-93	10/9/2015
Transcript: Grand Jury Proceedings	1	1-163	8/13/2015
Transcript: Grand Jury Proceedings	2	1-179	10/8/2015
Transcript: Jury Trial Day 1	3	1-197	12/1/2015
Transcript: Jury Trial Day 2	4	1-270	12/2/2015
Transcript: Jury Trial Day 3	5	1-253	12/3/2015
Transcript: Jury Trial Day 4	6	1-247	12/4/2015
Transcript: Jury Trial Day 5	7	1-108	12/7/2015
Transcript: Sentencing	7	114-26	3/17/2016
Verdict	7	109-13	12/7/2015

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the 11th of October, 2016, I served this document on the following:

Name	Address
1141110	nuicss

Steven B. Wolfson, Esq. Steven S. Owens, Esq. Clark County District Attorney's Office Via eFlex: 200 Lewis Ave. Las Vegas, NV 89155

Adam Laxalt, Esq. Nevada Attorney General's Office Via eFlex: 100 N. Carson St. Carson City, NV 89701

/s/ John Parris

JOHN P. PARRIS, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 7479 **LAW OFFICES OF JOHN P. PARRIS** 324 S. 3rd St. #200 Las Vegas, NV 89101 (702) 382-0905

Attorney for Appellant

AFFIRMATION

Pursuant to NRS 239B.030, this document contains no social security numbers.

/s/ John Parris 10-11-16

John P. Parris, Esg. Date

Alm & Chinn

TRAN

CLERK OF THE COURT

DISTRICT COURT
CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

* * * * *

THE STATE OF NEVADA, . CASE NO. C-308719-1

. CASE NO. C-308719-2

Plaintiff,

. DEPT. NO. XII

VS.

TRANSCRIPT OF

RALPH ALEXANDER, a/k/a . PROCEEDINGS

RALPH LEONE ALEXANDER, and JAMES EARL PARKER,

•

Defendants.

BEFORE THE HONORABLE MICHELLE LEAVITT, DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT OF JURY TRIAL - DAY 3

THURSDAY, DECEMBER 3, 2015

FOR THE STATE: GIANCARLO PESCI, ESQ.

SARAH J. KILLER, ESQ.

Deputy District Attorneys

FOR DEFENDANT ALEXANDER: JOHN P. PARRIS, ESQ.

FOR DEFENDANT PARKER: MICHAEL W. SANFT, ESQ.

ALSO PRESENT:

Ricardo Pico

Spanish Interpreter

COURT RECORDER: TRANSCRIPTION BY:

KRISTINE CORNELIUS VERBATIM DIGITAL REPORTING, LLC

District Court Englewood, CO 80110

(303) 798-0890

Proceedings recorded by audio-visual recording, transcript

produced by transcription service.

	INDEX
WI	TNESSES

NAME	DIRECT	CROSS	REDIRECT	RECROSS
STATE'S WITNESSES:				
Stephanie Thi	7	16/19	20	21/
Heather Gouldthorpe	26	45/50	57	/
Alma Gutierrez	61	69/72		
Keshaun Richardson	76	92/95	100	104/
Elana Ojeda-Chavarria	a* 109	114/		
Raymond Wold	116	/		
Anthony Diaz	120	/		
Donald Sutton	126	135/141	144	/
Chad Embry	147	/		
Sean Hubbard	159	170/170	176	/
Allison Rubino	178	189/	193	194/
Briauna Williams	201	206/208		
Damian Walburn	211	232/239	245	/
*Testimony with Spans	ish interp	preter		
DESCRIPTION	EXH	<u>IIBITS</u>		ADMITTED
STATE'S EXHIBITS:				
Exhibit 21 Exhibits 25, 27, 28 a Exhibit 30 Exhibits 31 through 48 Exhibit 42 Exhibit 43 through 48 Exhibits 49 through 6 Exhibits 65 Exhibit 65 Exhibit 67 through 84 Exhibits 62, 63, 64	and 29			10 64 63 79 121 77 90 149

LAS VEGAS, NEVADA, THURSDAY, DECEMBER 3, 2015, 11:26 A.M. 1 2 (Outside the presence of the jurors) 3 THE MARSHAL: All rise. The Eighth Judicial 4 District Court, Department 12 is now in session, the 5 Honorable Michelle Leavitt presiding. Come to order and be seated, please. 6 7 Good morning. THE COURT: Good morning, Your Honor. 8 MR. SANFT: 9 MR. PARRIS: Good morning, Your Honor. 10 The hearing is taking place outside the THE COURT: 11 presence of the jury panel. Mr. Sanft, go ahead. 12 Thank you, Your Honor. We've had an MR. SANFT: 13 opportunity to speak with our clients about a potential negotiation. I think we need to put it on the record at this 14 particular point. It's --15 16 THE COURT: You think you need to put it on the 17 record? MR. SANFT: Well, there was a negotiation, but the 18 offer's been declined by my client -- or actually, by both 19 20 clients. And you think you need to put it on the 21 THE COURT: 22 record? 23 MR. SANFT: Well, I think we just need to make sure 24 that the Court is aware, and that there is a record that

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

there was a negotiation, there was an offer, and that both

25

```
clients at this particular point are declining that offer.
1
 2
              THE COURT: Okay. Is that true, Mr. Alexander?
 3
              DEFENDANT ALEXANDER: Yes, ma'am.
              DEFENDANT PARKER: Yes, ma'am.
 4
 5
                          Is that true, Mr. Parker?
              THE COURT:
              DEFENDANT PARKER: Yes, ma'am.
 6
                          Okay, you don't want to take the offer
 7
              THE COURT:
8
   that's been offered by the State?
 9
              DEFENDANT PARKER: No, ma'am.
10
              THE COURT: And you want to proceed?
11
              DEFENDANT PARKER: Yes, ma'am.
12
              DEFENDANT ALEXANDER: Yes, ma'am.
13
              THE COURT:
                          Okay.
                          Judge, for clarity purposes, defense
14
              MR. PESCI:
   counsel approached me this morning and said, is there a
15
   possibility of negotiating this? We talked back and forth.
16
17
   The State tried to contact the detective. We made an offer
18
    after the defense's request of a conspiracy to commit
19
   robbery, two counts of robbery with use of a deadly weapon,
20
   for a stipulated grand total of 12 to 30 years, and it's my
21
   understanding that that's been --
22
                          A stipulated 12 to 30?
              THE COURT:
23
              MR. PESCI: Yes.
24
              MR. SANFT:
                          Yes.
25
                           Aggregate, Your Honor.
              MR. PARRIS:
```

```
1
              MR. PESCI:
                          Aggregate.
 2
                          Aggregate?
              THE COURT:
              MR. PARRIS: Yes, Your Honor.
 3
                          And they're rejecting it?
 4
              THE COURT:
 5
                          Yes, Your Honor.
              MR. SANFT:
              THE COURT:
 6
                          Okay.
 7
              MR. PESCI: And they've rejected it. So, we're
   prepared; we'll go forward.
 8
 9
              THE COURT: Okay. And again, I just want to make
10
    sure, Mr. Alexander, you don't want to accept that?
11
              DEFENDANT ALEXANDER: No, ma'am.
12
              THE COURT: Mr. Parker?
13
              DEFENDANT PARKER: No, ma'am.
              THE COURT: Okay. All right. So, I'm assuming,
14
   Mr. Pesci, that offer's now going to be revoked?
15
16
              MR. PESCI: Yeah, and we're not going to do this
17
             We're just going to finish.
    anymore.
18
                          Okay, so --
              THE COURT:
              MR. PARRIS: And Your Honor, we do appreciate the
19
20
    extra time --
21
              THE COURT:
                          The deal's not going to get any
    sweeter, is what they just said.
              MR. PESCI: And that's not at defense counsel. I'm
23
24
    sorry, that's not intended that way at all, we're just --
   we'll finish.
25
```

MR. PARRIS: No, and we appreciate the extra time 1 2 this morning. We knew a juror was running late, but we did want to see. We were -- we believed we were relatively close 3 to resolving the case and sparing the jurors another two or three days of trial, as well as the other time, effort, and 5 6 energy associated with it. 7 THE COURT: You know I'll always give you time to 8 If you're saying you're going to negotiate, I'll always give you time. 9 Thank you, Your Honor. 10 MR. SANFT: Thank you, Your Honor. Appreciate it. 11 MR. PARRIS: 12 THE COURT: And I think we do have that juror here, 13 so --14 THE MARSHAL: Yes, ma'am. -- we have a full panel. Let's bring 15 THE COURT: 16 them in. 17 (Pause in the proceedings) THE MARSHAL: All rise for the entering jury. 18 (Within the presence of the jurors) 19 Thank you. Please be seated. 20 THE MARSHAL: 21 Does the State stipulate to the THE COURT: presence of the jury panel? 23 MR. PESCI: Yes, Your Honor. 24 THE COURT: Mr. Sanft? 25 MR. SANFT: Yes, Your Honor.

1	THE COURT: Mr. Parris?
2	MR. PARRIS: Yes, Your Honor.
3	THE COURT: State may call their next witness.
4	MR. PESCI: State calls Crime Scene Analyst
5	Stephanie Thi.
6	THE MARSHAL: If you will please step up in the
7	witness stand. Remain standing, raise your right hand, and
8	face the clerk.
9	STEPHANIE THI, STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN
10	THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated. Could
11	you please state your name and spell it for the record?
12	THE WITNESS: My name is Stephanie Thi.
13	S-t-e-p-h-a-n-i-e, T-h-i.
14	THE CLERK: Thank you.
15	THE COURT: You may proceed.
16	MR. PESCI: Thank you, Your Honor.
17	DIRECT EXAMINATION
18	BY MR. PESCI:
19	Q Ma'am, what do you do for a living?
20	A I'm a crime scene analyst with the Las Vegas
21	Metropolitan Police Department.
22	Q How long have you been in that position?
23	A For five years.
24	Q Do you have any training and experience that brings
25	you to that position?

- 1 A I do.
- Q And could you explain that to the jury, please?
- A I have a Bachelor of Science in Biology, and I also
 have a Master of Science in Forensic Sciences. I completed
 the crime scene academy, as well as the field training
 program.
 - Q And you said you've been with Metro five years?
- 8 A Yes, that's correct.
- 9 Q Is there a continuing training that goes on after 10 you start with Metro?
- 11 A Yes, there is.
- 12 Q And have you been a part of that continuing 13 training?
- 14 A I have.

16

17

- Q Were you assigned to a particular incident that occurred back on June the 26th of 2015, and that you responded to 4430 East Charleston here in Las Vegas, Nevada?
- 18 A I did.
- 19 Q Specifically, the LV Nails Spa?
- 20 A Yes.
- Q Were you the only crime scene analyst there?
- 22 A I was.
- Q And when you got to that scene, what did you do with that scene to document it?
- 25 A I first made contact with officers and detectives

```
on scene. I took notes of what I observed. I documented the scene with photographs, and I did fingerprint processing.
```

- Q All right.
- MR. PESCI: Speaking of photographs, can I approach the witness, Your Honor?
- THE COURT: You may.
- 7 BY MR. PESCI:

3

- Showing you State's Proposed Exhibits 21 through 29, except 23 and 24 are already admitted, could you review those and let me know when you're done? Starting with State's Proposed Exhibit 21, what do you recognize that to be?
- A That is an aerial view of 4430 East Charleston
 Boulevard.
- 15 Q That's the scene that you responded to?
- 16 A Yes, that's correct.
- Q Are you familiar with it, having responded there
 and living here in Las Vegas?
- 19 A Yes.
- Q Is that a fair and accurate aerial depiction of the area?
- A Yes, it is.
- MR. PESCI: Move for the admission of State's 21,
- 24 Your Honor.
- MR. SANFT: No objection, Your Honor.

```
MR. PARRIS: No objection.
 1
                          It's admitted.
 2
              THE COURT:
 3
                    (State's Exhibit 21 is admitted)
 4
              MR. PESCI:
                          Thank you.
 5
    BY MR. PESCI:
 6
              And to go with those that are not admitted yet,
         Q
    looking at State's 22, do you recognize that?
 8
              I do.
         Α
              And then, picking back up with 25 and going to 29,
    do you recognize those?
10
11
              I do.
         Α
              How do you recognize them, or what do you recognize
12
13
    them to be?
              Those are photographs I took of the nail salon.
14
         Α
15
              And are those fair and accurate depictions of the
         Q
    scene as you documented it?
16
17
              Yes, they are.
         Α
              MR. PESCI: I'd move for the admission, Your Honor,
18
    of State's 25 through 29, and in fact, 26 is already in.
19
20
              MR. SANFT: No objection, Your Honor.
21
              MR. PARRIS:
                           No objection.
22
              THE COURT:
                         They're admitted.
          (State's Exhibits 25, 27, 28, and 29 are admitted)
23
24
              MR. PESCI: May I publish?
25
              THE COURT: You may publish.
```

```
MR. PESCI: Thank you.
 1
    BY MR. PESCI:
              What is the purpose of taking the photographs when
 3
         Q
   you go to a scene?
 5
              The photographs are to visually document the scene
    as it appears on my arrival.
 6
              Do you take some photographs at the beginning to
         Q
    kind of orient the location?
 9
              I do.
         Α
              Looking at State's 22, is that one of those
10
    orienting photos?
11
              Yes, it is.
12
              And then, State's 23, does that show the entrance
13
14
    to the location?
              Yes, it does.
15
         Α
              There seems to be some yellow tape in front of the
16
17
    scene.
            What is that?
              That is the police tape that was placed prior to my
18
         Α
19
    arrival.
              Is that to maintain the scene to keep it in that
20
         Q
    condition before you get there so that when you are working
21
    it, it hasn't been touched?
23
              That's correct.
              Looking at State's 24, did you take photographs
24
```

inside of the location?

25

A I did.

Q Now, you talked about how one of the things that you do for documenting a scene beyond photographs is fingerprinting?

A Yes.

Q What is the process that you go through in trying to recover fingerprints?

A The process of recovering a fingerprint begins with speaking with victims or officers and detectives to determine which areas have been handled by suspects or possible suspects. I then examine those areas to see if anything is visible without any fingerprint powder. Surfaces that are conducive to fingerprinting are then processed with different types of fingerprint powders. Any visible prints after the powdering is then lifted with fingerprint tape.

Q Okay. So, let's back up just a little bit. You talked about speaking with witnesses or police officers to try to figure out where people might have -- or the suspects might have touched things. Do you often look at video surveillance to show you where individuals might have touched things?

A We do if the video is available at that time.

Q In this particular case that you worked, was there video from inside of the nail salon?

A I don't believe so, but I don't recall for certain.

- Q But even if there wasn't video, you gathered information from witnesses, either from them or through the officers as to areas that the suspects might have touched?

 A That's correct.
- Q And based on that, you then tried to recover prints from those locations?
 - A Yes.
- Q You talked about how certain surfaces are better than others?
- 10 A Yes.

3

4

5

6

8

9

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- 11 Q Could you explain that to the jury, please?
 - A For instance, glass, and metal, and shiny plastic surfaces are much better surfaces for recovering fingerprints, as opposed to items like untreated wood, or fabric, or leather.
 - Q Okay. Speaking of glass, looking at State's 27, did you in fact go to the glass area of the front door to try to see if you could lift anything from that area?
 - A I did, yes.
 - Q And we've been talking about lifts. What is a lift? How do you do that? What's the anatomy of a lift card?
 - A A lift card is comprised of the fingerprint tape, which is visible in that photograph. After the pieces of --
- Q Could you actually, on the screen, just circle the lift tape that you're referring to?

- A That's one of the lift tapes, and you can see that there are several on that door.
 - Q And then how do you try to get the print off of the surface via the tape?
 - A The tape is just -- it's like normal tape. The powders then stick to the tape; the tape is then placed on a white card for contrast.
 - Q And the powders, is that something that you use to try to see the print or to discover the print?
- 10 A Yes, that's correct.
- 11 Q Did you do that in this particular case?
- 12 A I did.

5

8

9

- Q Were you able to recover some latent prints?
- 14 A I did.
- 15 Q What is a latent print versus a patent print?
- 16 A Latent means it is not readily visible to the naked 17 eye without some sort of enhancement, when compared to a 18 patent print, which is visible, such as a fingerprint in 19 paint or blood.
- 20 Q In this particular case, we were dealing with 21 latent prints; is that correct?
 - 2 A Yes, that's correct.
- Q All right. Now, you talked about a card if I understood correctly, correct?
- 25 A Yes.

- Q That was a little redundant, sorry. Page -State's 28, what are we looking at?
 - A Those are the latent print cards that are then submitted into evidence.
 - Q Now, can we see the tape kind of hanging over the edge of one of those cards?
 - A Yes.

3

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

16

17

18

19

20

- Q And if we zoom-in -- let's take this one here, for example. Maybe that's not the best, but the powder sticks to the ridges that are left on the surface because of oils; is that correct?
- A Yes. The powder sticks to the residue in the fingerprints, which are mostly comprised of oils and sweat.
- Q And then, with the lift tape, you put it onto the card, and then what happens to the card?
 - A The cards are then labeled with identifying information, including the event number, the scene location, the date, and the recovered location.
 - Q Speaking of that -- the labeling, looking at State's 29, is that what we see here?
- A That is labeling that I do on scene. It's a diagram representing where they are recovered from.
- Q Is that the backside of the cards that we just saw a moment ago?
- 25 A Yes, it is.

- And then do you impound those cards, and then the Q envelope that you put those in do you label with what you just talked about; the location, the event number, things of that nature?
- 5 I do, and each individual card also gets its own label before they're impounded. 6
 - Now, are you the person that actually examines 0 those print cards?
 - Α No, I am not.
 - Okay. That's -- impounded, meaning put into the Q Metropolitan Police Department's vault so that a different individual with Metro can retrieve those and try to make comparisons?
- Yes, that's correct. 14 Α
- MR. PESCI: Court's indulgence. Pass the witness. 15
- 16 THE COURT: Any cross, Mr. Sanft?
- 17 CROSS-EXAMINATION
- 18 BY MR. SANFT:
- Ms. Thi, you're not the person though that analyzes 19 Q those prints after you lift them from a scene; is that
- 20
- 21 correct?

3

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

- That's correct. 22
- That's given to somebody else for their 23
- responsibilities? 24
- 25 Yes, we have latent print examiners. Α

- All right. One of the exhibits that you were shown Q a picture of is State's Exhibit number 27. Did you take pictures of every location to which you lifted prints from?
 - Α I did, yes.

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

17

18

20

- All right. And with regard to lifting prints, once again, you don't know the value of those prints, you're just lifting in certain locations, and then capturing those prints, and then taking it to somebody else for analysis; is that correct?
 - That's correct. Α
- All right. We have one picture here, and it looks Q like at the bottom of this picture, and I'm showing you -looks like it's the crossbar of the door, was this area as well lifted for prints?
- 15 There's no tape on there, so there were no Α 16 prints recovered.
- Okay. It looks like there's some type of blue substance on the top of that bar. Do you see what I'm talking about --19
 - Yes. Α
- 21 -- with my pen? Is that the -- is that the dust that you used to hopefully gather a print?
- 23 Yes, that is the fingerprint powder.
- 24 Okay. So, how do you know when to lift a print Q from an area that you've dusted versus an area that you don't 25

-- that you -- well, let me back up here. How do you know how to use tape on an area that you've dusted versus one that you've -- that doesn't make any sense either, does it? I think we all understand, right? All right, so let me make sure we're clear here for the record. How do you know when to put tape on an area to which you've dusted?

A The -- once the fingerprint powder is applied, that makes the ridge details visible. I will then examine the areas that I've processed for any visible details, and we have gone through training to determine what is of value for recovery, and those are the ones that are then recovered.

Q Okay, thank you. Did you ever have an opportunity to dust the cashier area where the cash register was, or the table around that area?

A I did, yes.

Q Okay. And once again, the reasons why you selected these areas was based upon your interview of both victims, people that were present, as well as police officers that were present as well?

A Yes.

Q Okay. And do you do your own determination -independent determination as to where you believe
fingerprints could be based upon your training and experience
sometimes?

A Yes. In those situations, it would depend on the

circumstances of the scene. Areas with obvious disturbance 1 would be easier to determine for fingerprint -- fingerprint 3 processing. MR. SANFT: I have no further questions. Thank 4 5 you. 6 THE COURT: Mr. Parris? 7 MR. PARRIS: Sure. 8 CROSS-EXAMINATION 9 BY MR. PARRIS: Ms. Thi, obviously, in the photograph that we have 10 Q before the jury, there are numerous -- on the glass itself, 11 we see numerous smudges, is more or less what I would call 12 13 them. Were those fingerprints deemed to be not suitable to be attempted to be recovered? 14 Yes. Anything that is not suitable for recovery is 15 Α not lifted. 16 17 And then you had indicated that you dusted for fingerprints on the cashier area, or the front desk area, 18 19 correct? 20 Α Yes.

21

23

24

25

And there were no prints -- you determined that there were no prints that were appropriate to be lifted and placed on cards, correct?

That's correct. Α

Other than the front door and the desk area, where

if at all else throughout the store did you dust for prints?

A There was one of the salon chairs with a small table adjacent to it. That area was also fingerprint processed.

- Q And similarly, there was no -- there were no prints that were appropriate to be attempted to be lifted?
- 7 A That's correct.
 - Q Okay. Just those three areas?
- 9 A Yes.

2

3

8

18

of a

- 10 MR. PARRIS: Nothing further. Thank you.
- THE COURT: Any redirect?
- MR. PESCI: Yes.
- 13 REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- 14 BY MR. PESCI:
- Q When you are trying to find a latent print, and at the picture that you're looking at right now, which is

 State's 27, is that an area that can be referred to as kind

high-volume area for fingerprints to appear?

- 19 A Yes, it is.
- Q It's a store that's open for business; it's a door
 that everybody that walks out can utilize and put their hands
 on?
- A Yes, and it was the only public entrance door to the business.
- 25 Q So anybody coming in or out has to go through that

door? 1 2 Α Yes. Does it make it more difficult to recover a print 3 Q when there have been many, many people that touch the same 5 area? The recovery isn't necessarily affected by it, but 6 Α there may be more prints that are not of investigatory value. 8 And that's where I was going. Can it be that if Q you've got a print on top of a print, latent prints, that is, that it will impede the ability to be able to utilize that 10 11 print? Overlapping prints will cloud the clarity of 12 Yes. the individual prints. 13 Plus, if someone touches a surface and just brushes 14 Q it slightly, there's not necessarily a sufficient amount of 15 16 ridge detail to make a comparison? 17 Α That's correct. Okay. So, you could look at this door and not see 18 Q what you think is sufficient ridge detail, and thus, you 19 don't try to lift from every inch of the door? 20 21 Α That's correct. MR. PESCI: Okay, thank you. 23 THE COURT: Mr. Sanft, any recross? 24 RECROSS-EXAMINATION

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

25

BY MR. SANFT:

Q Ms. Thi, how many times have you lifted prints -- or how many times have you gone to a crime scene to lift prints during the scope of your employment?

A Over the course of five years, I wouldn't be able to begin to guess, but I mean, we respond to fingerprint calls upwards of -- for me, possibly up to four times a day, so over the course of five years.

Q All right. And I'm assuming that you've done fingerprint lifts before of places like this where it's a high-traffic area situation where there's a door that's the only door leading into a business, for instance?

A Yes.

1

3

4

5

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

Q Have you ever lifted a print before that had investigatory value off of this type of scenario?

A I have, yes.

Q Okay. So, it is possible, of course, that you could have gotten the print of investigatory value from a door like this in a situation where it is a high-volume type of traffic area?

A Yes.

MR. SANFT: Okay, no further questions.

THE COURT: Mr. Parris?

MR. PARRIS: No, Your Honor, no follow up. Thank

24 you.

25 THE COURT: Okay, thank you very much for your

```
testimony here today. You may step down. You're excused
 1
    from your subpoena. The State can call their next witness.
 2
 3
              MS. KILLER:
                           The State calls Heather Gouldthorpe.
              MR. PARRIS: Your Honor, before this witness, can
 4
 5
   we approach briefly?
 6
                          Of course.
              THE COURT:
 7
              MR. PARRIS: Thank you.
                          (Bench conference)
 8
                          Who is she?
              THE COURT:
 9
              MS. KILLER: Oh, she's our fingerprint analyst.
10
11
              THE COURT:
                          Oh, okay.
              MS. KILLER:
                           There is a -- there's essentially two
12
   events that she did comparison analysis on. There were also
13
14
    two events where the administrative AFIS was run.
                                                       One of
15
    those reports is technically assigned and was approved by
16
    another fingerprint analyst --
17
              THE COURT:
                          Okay.
18
              MS. KILLER: -- but it was negative, so the defense
19
    wants that information to come in.
                                        The other --
20
              THE COURT: Yeah, I knew that was going to come in.
21
                           -- fingerprint analyst was
              MS. KILLER:
    unavailable.
                  Just because of the confrontation issue, we
23
    wanted to make a record that, for a strategy point, defense
24
    is requesting that we ask her about this one.
25
              THE COURT: Right, and I thought this is what we
```

```
talked about before we started, right?
             MR. PARRIS: We discussed it very briefly, but we
 2
 3
    just wanted to make sure that it was clearly placed on the
   record this was the incident we were referring to though.
              THE COURT: Okay. So, how do you want to put it on
 5
 6
   the record? How do you want to -- how do you want the jury
 7
   to know what your stipulation is?
 8
              MR. PARRIS: No --
              THE COURT: Or are you going to just ask the
 9
10
    witness?
             MR. PARRIS: No, the State is going to ask --
11
12
              THE COURT:
                          Okay.
             MR. PARRIS: -- in their direct, but we wanted to
13
   explain why there was no -- the State wanted some protection
14
15
    as there was no confrontation issues.
16
              MR. PESCI: For a Crawford violation --
17
              MS. KILLER: Violation.
             MR. PESCI: -- argued by some other appellate --
18
19
              MR. PARRIS: Yes.
20
             MR. PESCI: -- attorney potentially.
21
              MS. KILLER:
                           Later.
                          So, you're waiving --
              THE COURT:
23
              MR. SANFT: That's correct.
24
              MR. PARRIS: That's correct.
25
              THE COURT:
                          Okay.
```

```
MR. PARRIS:
 1
                           So --
 2
                          Thank you, Judge.
              MR. PESCI:
 3
              MR. PARRIS: Thank you.
                          And that's a strategic decision,
 4
              THE COURT:
 5
    correct?
 6
              MR. SANFT:
                          That is correct.
 7
              MR. PARRIS: Yes, Your Honor.
 8
                          Just for our defense.
              MR. SANFT:
                          And you've discussed it with your
 9
              THE COURT:
    clients, correct?
10
                           That's correct.
11
              MR. PARRIS:
12
              THE COURT:
                          Okay.
13
                          Thank you very much, Judge.
              MR. PESCI:
                          Thank you.
14
              THE COURT:
              MS. KILLER:
15
                           Thank you.
                       (End of bench conference)
16
17
                          Sorry.
              THE COURT:
                            That's okay.
18
              THE WITNESS:
              THE COURT: If you'll stand and raise your right
19
    hand so you can be sworn by the clerk.
20
21
             HEATHER GOULDTHORPE, STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN
              THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated. Could
22
23
    you please state your name and spell it for the record?
24
              THE WITNESS: Yes. My name's Heather Gouldthorpe.
    Heather, H-e-a-t-h-e-r. Gouldthorpe, G-o-u-l-d-t-h-o-r-p-e.
25
```

THE CLERK: Thank you.

THE COURT: You may proceed.

DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MS. KILLER:

Q Good morning, Ms. Gouldthorpe. How are you currently employed?

A I'm a forensic scientist in the latent print unit of Las Vegas Metropolitan Police Department Forensic Laboratory.

Q And how long have you been working with the forensic lab?

A I started out at the forensic lab in June of 2007 as a forensic laboratory technologist. There, I gained my basic knowledge of fingerprint identification comparison. I began entering prints into this AFIS unit, which is our Automatic Fingerprint Identification System. I searched the database, and I also processed evidence to recover latent prints off of. I did that for about three-and-a-half years before I promoted to forensic scientist training.

During the trainee program, I was there for a year, where I learned how to do more complex comparisons, how to issue reports, and how to make determinations of conclusions, and how to testify in court. And then I became a forensic scientist, which I've been a forensic scientist for approximately three-and-a-half years now.

- Q And prior to your training and experience with Metro, did you have any degrees in a related field?
- A Yes. I have my bachelor's degree in sociology, and then my master's degree in forensic science.
- Q And do you have any certifications that relate to fingerprint comparison?
- A Yes. I was certified as a latent print examiner through the IAI, which is our International Association for Forensic -- sorry, International Association of Identification.
- Q And let me back up and just ask you a couple things that you'd mentioned in your training so the ladies and gentlemen of the jury can kind of follow along with us. You said you processed evidence to recover prints when you were a technologist. This I assume isn't on scene; it's items that are brought into the lab?
 - A That is correct.

- And then, you'd mentioned AFIS, but I'm going to have you explain that a little bit later. We're going to go through the background of fingerprints generally first. As a latent print examiner, can you kind of give us an overview of your duties?
- A Yes. We actually have twofold duties. We can process evidence to recover latent prints from. We also are asked to compare -- people that are requested, we compare

their known prints to the latent prints that are recovered.

- Q Let's start out with the basics. What is a fingerprint?
 - A What a latent print is --
- 5 | Q Or --

2

3

4

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

- A -- is if you look at the skin on your hands -- the palm of your hands and the soles of your feet, you'll notice that skin is different from the rest of your skin. It's more textured, and this is called friction ridge skin. Residues such as oils, sweat, blood, paint, whatever, coats these ridges, and when you touch a surface, you have the potential to leave behind an impression of that friction ridge skin. Typically, it's not seen visually, but you have to have either powder or chemical processing to be able to visualize that.
- Q And you had said latent print. There's kind of different types of fingerprints, right?
- 18 A That is correct.
- 20 So, a latent print would be the kind that are visible after processing?
- 21 A Correct.
- Q Okay, and then is it a patent print that's visible to -- just looking at it, visible to the naked eye?
- 24 A Yes.
- Q Okay. And then, a -- when we get to comparison, a

known print would be one that you're provided from some sort of database to compare, correct?

- A That is correct.
- Q Okay. Do -- and you had said that we're kind of born with the ridge detail. It's individualized for each person, correct?
 - A Correct.

1

3

4

5

6

8

9

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

- Q No two people have the same fingerprint?
- A Not that has been found to date.
- 10 Q Can you explain just briefly the process of 11 recovering latent prints?
 - A There's different methods to recover latent prints. Crime scene analysts that typically go to the scenes, they do powder processing. At the laboratory, we typically don't do the powder processing, but we do chemical processing to visualize latent prints.
 - Q And is this the super glue that we hear about?
 - A On some items, yes. On nonporous items.
 - Q In this case though, there wasn't any chemical processing, correct?
- 21 A That is correct.
- Q How do you determine -- or how do latent print
 examiners in general determine what is suitable for
 comparison?
- 25 A We look at both the latent and the known to

determine suitability. You can have knowns that aren't suitable for comparison also, but what we're looking for is enough quality, and quantity, and specificity of information in that latent print to determine that we can make a reliable conclusion. And we have guidelines in our latent print unit to -- that's in our technical manual that help us determine what is deemed suitable for comparison.

- Q Do you have to make that determination on each individual print?
- 10 A Yes, we do.

3

5

8

9

11

12

13

20

21

23

24

25

- Q It's not something where there can be a set criteria that if you have five lines of a print, you can suddenly always make a comparison, right?
- 14 A Correct.
- Q Do people leave fingerprints every time they touch a surface?
- 17 A No.
- Q Can you explain the factors that affect whether a print is left behind or not?
 - A Sure. There's several factors that go into whether or not you can potentially leave behind a latent print. The condition of your skin; are you dry typically or is it -- are you sweaty. How much residue and what type of residue is on your skin. What type of surface you're touching; is it flat, is it smooth, or is it rough and textured.

And then how you touched that print. If you just touch something, if you're just holding it general everyday way you hold a cup, you might develop latent prints, but if you're touching something and you're moving your hand at the same time, then it will be a little bit more distorted and we won't be able to typically compare those kind of prints. Then, also environmental factors; is it raining outside, is it left in the desert in the middle of the summer, is it snowing. Environmental factors also play into that, too.

- Q When you said movement, so if I reach out and just place my finger straight down on this and lift it straight back up on the water cooler here, which appears to have the metal outside, fairly good chance I might leave a print you can recover if I have the appropriate oil and dust on my hand?
 - A Correct, yes.
- Q What if I drag it along here? A lot smaller of a chance of recovering a print?
- A Yes.

- Q Okay. Do -- this might seem like a silly question, but having something on my fingers, or having a temporary cut through one of my fingers where the fingerprints are, that would also affect it, I assume?
- A That also is a comparable trait. If you have a scar, sometimes they're permanent, sometimes they're not.

- Depending on when that occurs, that can also be used as something that we can compare.
- Q If I have gloves on though, you're probably not getting any prints, I'd assume, correct?
- 5 A Correct.

3

- Q If I have a Band-Aid over my finger, it's obviously qoing to cover up the part that would leave the print?
- A Yeah, if you're talking about a particular part, but yeah.
- 11 A Yeah.
- Q -- where my fingerprint would be. You had
 mentioned AFIS earlier. Can you -- I know you said it, but
 Automatic Fingerprint --
- 15 A Automated Fingerprint Identification System.
- 16 Q And is that sort of a database of fingerprints?
- 17 A Yes, it is.
- Q And when you have prints come into the lab, does
 the lab have a procedure for scanning those in through AFIS
 to check for matches?
- 21 A Yes, we do.
- 22 Q Can you explain that process to us?
- A Yes. When we get packets into the laboratory, they
 come in from crime scene analysts, PSRs, cadets, officers.
- 25 When they're submitted to the lab, we store them at the lab

under controlled storage, and we automatically look at certain crime types.

So, we look at sexual assaults, homicides, robberies, burglaries, and we automatically do a screening of those prints to see whether or not they are suitable for our administrative AFIS program, which our administrative AFIS program is we're looking -- there are limited exams on the latent prints, but we're looking for the best prints in the case to generate leads for the detectives.

- Q And when you say limited, there's someone who goes through and screens, and picks out kind of the best of the best prints to put through the administrative AFIS screening?
- A Yes.

- Q In addition to the administrative process, are prints also put into AFIS by the individual reviewers?
 - A By the individual reviewers?
 - Q Or by like yourself when you're assigned a case?
- A Yes. If we're doing casework and we get somebody requested to compare, if we exclude that person and we determine that the prints are of enough value to run through the database, we can, as casework analysts, go ahead and put those prints through, even though they don't meet our administrative AFIS criteria, but they still meet AFIS criteria as far as entry goes.
 - Q And when you say AFIS criteria, AFIS is kind of

like a computer program that compares prints?

A Yes. We're looking for -- it's based on algorithm, so you basically take the minutia, and we plot the minutia that are there. And what minutia is, it's when you look at the ridges, they do something. They typically either stop, or they merge and divide to a different ridge path, and we plot those. And what we're looking for is basically a circular cluster so that the computer has the best chances of searching against the known database.

So, when you say minutia, and you said the ridges stop or turn, are we looking for like a unique pattern, or I guess, for lack of a better term, if we're looking at a picture of a fingerprint, kind of like a unique portion of that fingerprint? I mean, something that's different from the rest of the print; it's not just the consistent pattern?

A Correct. The only time we have -- like, there's -the ridges always do something. They're not horizontal or
vertical, typically. If you're talking about fingerprints,
that's typically what people associate with pattern types.
We have -- fingerprints have arches, loops, and whirls, and but even though that's only on the distal portion right
here, but your other friction ridge skin, your palms and your
-- just -- or your phalanges here, they all have ridges that
flow in a certain manner, not always creating a pattern, but
they all have a type of flow to them.

- Q So, a minutia is just kind of a point that you can pick out in the print that differs from the rest of the print; something you can identify --
 - A Correct.
 - Q -- and compare?
- 6 A Correct.

- Q Now, we had said that AFIS is a database. It's kind of a computer program that can compare certain minutia when you find them. Does it work like we see on CSI where you just type it in, and 30 seconds later, it pops up with the exact person who left that fingerprint?
- A No, it doesn't. What happens is it returns a candidate list, and we individually go through each candidate -- each candidate on that list and determine -- we do a comparison on screen. At that point, we're doing a potential comparison. So, if we get something that's a potential hit, then we have to pull that -- there's a number associated with that. We pull that -- the exemplars for those numbers, and then we do a side by side comparison.
 - Q So, it's kind of a starting point?
- 21 A Yes.
 - Q Once you're assigned a case to compare as a fingerprint analyst, if there's a request from the officer, or the prosecutor or someone, do you go pull the fingerprints that are submitted using the event number? Is that how

- 1 | they're identified?
- 2 A No, it's using an ID number.
- Q I mean, so like when you got a request for this
 4 case, you got a request on two of the event numbers, correct?
- 5 A Correct.
- 6 Q Sorry, that's what I was trying to ask you.
- A Yes.
- 8 Q And the first one was 150626-3511?
- 9 A Yes.
- Q And just briefly, what that means is it happened in 2015 on June 26th, correct?
- 12 A Correct.
- Q And then the last four numbers are just
- 14 chronological throughout the day as the calls come in?
- 15 A That is correct.
- Q In reference to the event from June 26th, those prints were submitted by --
- 18 MS. KILLER: Court's indulgence.
- 19 BY MS. KILLER:
- 21 A Correct.
- 22 And she testified earlier about lift cards. Is
- 23 that where you get the latent prints for comparison?
- 24 A Yes, they are.
- 25 Q Before you did your comparison, was there an

- administrative AFIS -- not comparison, but I guess was it put in the administrative AFIS?
- 3 A Yes, they were.
- 4 Q And did that search return any results?
- 5 A No, they were negative.
- Q When you did your actual comparison and took those lift cards, there were five cards, correct?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q And on each of those cards, there's multiple 10 fingerprints?
- 11 A On some --
- 12 Q Or on some of them?
- 13 A Yeah, on some of them, there were multiple latent 14 prints.
- 2 So, I'm going to try to use the identifiers on your report so that we can follow along here. The cards are
- 18 A Correct.
- Q And then, within those cards, if there's multiple prints, you use letters a, b, c, d, and so on?
- 21 A That is correct, yes.

numbered Q1 through 5, correct?

- Q Okay. Let's start with Card Q(1). That card was
- 23 lifted from the interior of the west-facing public entrance
- 24 door?

17

25 A Correct.

- Q And then, on that card, there were five prints suitable for comparison?
- A Yes, correct.

3

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

19

- Q And suitable for -- can you just give us a brief explanation of what suitable for comparison means?
- A There's enough quality and quantity of information in the latent print, so I look at the ridge paths, how the ridges flow, what the ridges do; do they stop, do they merge, or the bifurcations, the minutia points that I referred to earlier. And then, if I have enough of that information, then I can carry on to comparison.
- Q So, it's similar to the AFIS analysis, but when you're doing the physical comparison, you don't need as many specific minutia or points?
- 15 A Correct.
- Q And that's because you're physically looking at the latent print and a known print, rather than just trying to put it in for a computer to use a map --
 - A Yes.
- 20 Q -- to figure it out?
- 21 A Yes, that's correct.
- Q So, the first print, which would have been 1Qa -or Q(1)(a), I'm sorry, did you compare that latent print to
 known prints for Ralph Alexander, James Parker, and a Maria
 Villanueva (phonetic)?

A I did.

1

4

8

12

13

14

15

23

- Q Okay. And were you able to find a match or exclude those people?
 - A I excluded those people.
- Q Okay. Was that print also run through AFIS by you 6 rather than the administrative AFIS?
- 7 A Yes, it was.
 - Q And were there any results there?
- 9 A I got negative results on that.
- Q Q(1)(b), the second print, that print had been searched through administrative AFIS, correct?
 - A No, only -- I believe only Q(1)(a) was through administrative AFIS. Q(1)(b) was searched through AFIS as casework, and I had positive results which I subsequently identified to Maria Villanueva.
- Q Okay. So, that's where her name would have come from, and then you used her known prints from that result to compare on the other prints?
- 19 A Correct.
- Q On print Q(1)(c), did you again do the comparison of the latent prints and the known prints to the three individuals, Ralph Alexander, James Parker, and Maria
- 24 A I did.

Villanueva?

Q Were they excluded from that print?

Yes, they were. 1 Α Q(1)(d), same result? 2 Q 3 Α Yes. And that was also searched through AFIS with no 4 0 5 match? 6 Correct. Α 7 Q(1)(e) I believe is a -- it looks like it's a Q 8 print from a palm rather than a fingertip? 9 Yes, it was, and I had palm -- or palm exemplars Α for Alexander and Parker; however, I did not have a complete 10 recording of the palm exemplars, so I went incomplete with no 11 detail in agreement, meaning I have palm exemplars, but I 12 need more additional palm exemplars to complete my 13 comparison. And then, for Maria Villanueva, I had no palm 14 exemplars whatsoever, so I could not compare her at all for 15 16 palms. 17 So, when you say no detail found in agreement, the portions of the palm that you were able to compare did not 18 19 match? 20 Α That is correct. But you were unable to compare the whole palm? 21 Q Correct. 23 And those were also run in AFIS; negative results Q

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

again?

Α

Correct.

24

25

```
On Lift Card (2)Q taken from the same place, there
 1
         Q
    was just one suitable print, correct?
 2
 3
              Correct.
         Α
              And were you -- what was your result there?
 4
         Q
 5
              Can I refer to --
         Α
 6
         Q
              Oh.
              -- my report?
 7
         Α
              Sure.
 8
         Q
 9
         Α
              Thank you.
              MS. KILLER: Your Honor, may I approach?
10
11
              THE COURT:
                           You may.
12
              THE WITNESS:
                             Okay.
              MS. KILLER: For the record, returning to the
13
    counsel table with the report.
14
15
    BY MS. KILLER:
              On Q(2), one print, so Q(2)(a), what were your
16
         Q
17
    results?
              I excluded all three people that I compared.
18
         Α
              And negative on the AFIS search?
19
         Q
20
              And negative on -- yes.
         Α
21
              On Q(3), no suitable latent prints were recovered,
         Q
22
    correct?
              That is correct.
23
         Α
              So, the CSI submitted, as we looked at earlier, the
24
25
    prints with the tape, but none of them were of the quality
```

- that you could compare them?
- 2 A That is correct.

- Q Q(4), there was one suitable print, so it would be Q(4)(a), and the three people we've been discussing were excluded from that print?
- 6 A That is correct.
- Q And Q(5), likewise, one suitable print. It looks like it's -- again, it's a palm?
- A It is a palm, and I was able to exclude Parker and
 Alexander, but I could not compare Maria Villanueva because I
 had no palm exemplars for her.
- 12 Q Now, let's talk about another event number. You
 13 also received a request on event number 150630-0586, correct?
- 14 A Correct.
- 15 Q And that would be June 30th of 2015?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 Q And those were submitted by CSA Kaitlin King, 18 correct?
- 19 A Correct.
- Q Was -- was there an administrative AFIS run on that event number?
- 22 A Yes, there was.
- Q And that was actually completed by -- or checked by another latent print analyst, correct?
- 25 A That is correct. The administrative AFIS procedure

- 1 on that packet was done by somebody else.
- Q But you did the comparison on the casework or the request part?
- 4 A Yes, I did.
- Q Okay. And the administrative AFIS result on that was a negative on the first search, correct?
- A Correct.
- And then, when you did your comparison, you received four latent print cards from CSA King?
- 10 A That is correct, yes.
- 11 Q And those are, again, tracked under that event 12 number, which is how you know they're the same ones?
- 13 A Yes.
- Q Okay. Looking at Q(1), there were three suitable prints for comparison?
- 16 A Yes, there was.
- Q And those were taken from the interior side of the southmost east-facing entry/exit door?
- 19 A Yes, it was.
- Q Okay. So, basically, the entry/exit to the Rainbow 21 Market? To the location --
- 22 A Yes.
- Q -- where they were lifted? Okay. And on print A, were you able to -- oh, you know what, let me ask this first so I don't confuse everybody. Did you also receive

elimination prints for a Ronald Main --They were located inside the latent print 2 Α I did. packet that the crime scene analyst turned in to the 3 laboratory. And elimination prints are essentially 5 prints that are submitted for people who were either victims, or witnesses, or are known to be at that scene on a regular basis? 8 That is correct, yes. 9 Α It helps you kind of narrow down so you're not 10 Q searching for the whole world on a print if it's someone 11 that's going to be repeatedly there? 12 13 Α Correct. On Q(1)(a), were you able to exclude Ralph 14 15 Alexander, James Parker, and Ronald Main? 16 Α I was, yes. 17 The same result on Q(1) (b), correct? Q 18 Α Correct. And then, Q(1)(c), another palm print? 19 Q Yes, it was another palm print. 20 Α 21 And were you able to exclude Ralph Alexander and Q James Parker? 23 Yes, I was. Α And then, with Mr. Main, you didn't have comparison 24

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

25

exemplars, correct?

Right, I didn't have palm prints for him. 1 Α As to Q(2) lifted from the cash tray on the 2 3 customer service counter, were there any suitable prints for comparison? 4 5 No, there was not. And the same for Q(3) and Q(4) as well, which were 6 Q also from the cash tray? 8 That is correct, yes. Α 9 MS. KILLER: No further questions from the State. Mr. Sanft, cross-examination? 10 THE COURT: Yes, Your Honor. 11 MR. SANFT: 12 CROSS-EXAMINATION 13 BY MR. SANFT: I'm sorry, ma'am, what's your name again? 14 0 Heather Gouldthorpe. 15 Α 16 Gouldthorpe? Q 17 Gouldthorpe, yes. Α Okay. Ms. Gouldthorpe, I have just a few 18 Q questions. We've been talking, and just for clarification 19 for the jury, two separate instances -- incidents that you 20 21 analyzed prints from; is that correct? That is correct, yes. 22 All right. Two different days? 23 Q Yeah, two different cases. Two different days, 24 Α 25 yeah.

- Q All right. Have you ever been asked to compare like, say, tread marks or tread patterns on shoes?
 - A No, I have not.
 - Q That's somebody else's job?
- 5 A Correct.

3

4

6

8

9

10

11

12

14

15

16

17

18

20

21

23

24

25

- Q All right. And with regards to fingerprints, do you know where those fingerprints that you've analyzed were lifted from? Like what surfaces they were lifted from?
- A They're -- on the lift card themselves, the -- whoever turns in the lift card, whether it be a crime scene analyst, an officer, a cadet, or PSR, they write on the lift cards where it came from.
- 13 | Q Okay.
 - A So, that's the information I have to go on.
 - Q As part of your training in becoming a fingerprint analysis -- analysis -- analyst, thank you, do you -- are you taught as to how fingerprints are lifted at a crime scene, for instance, by the crime scene analyst?
- 19 A Yes.
 - Q Okay. And are you also taught, for instance, the value of certain locations, for instance, of where you should be lifting for prints and locating prints?
 - A Yeah, to a degree. That's more the crime scene side of things, but we know kind of how they operate, so it helps us do our job as well.

- Q Okay. And we've talked a little bit about the location of these prints. How about high-traffic areas? Do you understand what I mean by that?
 - A Yeah, like public access doors?
- 5 Q Correct.
 - A Yeah.

- Q Have you ever compared a print in which there was obviously a lot of prints in a high-traffic area, like an access door?
 - A Yes.
- Q Have you ever been able to identify prints of value or prints of interest to you lifted from an area like that?
- A Occasionally, yes.
- Q Okay. There's been some discussion about high traffic, meaning someone comes up, pushes on a glass area of a door, for instance, and then another person comes along and pushes up against that same area, and over, and over, and over again. Can you -- are you still able to get prints of value sometimes based upon that kind of high-traffic area?
- A What you're referring to would be like if you're touching the same area of the door like repeatedly --
- 22 Q Right.
 - A -- then we'd get overlay of prints. So, you'd see one latent print impression on top of another, on top of another. Those we would determine probably aren't suitable.

But if you're talking about a door, typically, the way people touch objects are going to be a little bit different from the person in front of them, or the person preceding them or behind them. So, you know, in that instance, we are able to identify or exclude people from a public access door.

- Q And I appreciate that, because that was actually going to be my next question. That is, on access doors, for instance, there's not just one particular area typically where someone -- where multiple people are pushing up on the exact same area; is that correct?
 - A That's correct.
- Q Okay. And then finally, your -- you've testified a little bit as to the manual for the guidelines in which you determine what's a valuable print and what's not a valuable print?
- ${\tt A} {\tt Yes.}$

3

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

23

24

25

- 17 Q Do you have that -- those guidelines here with you?
- 18 A I do not.
- 20 And with regards to those guidelines, is that an administrative thing within your department?
- 21 A Yeah, it's solely for our unit in our department.
- 22 Q Okay. What's the reason for the guidelines?
 - A Just so that we have a way to explain things as of now. Like in court, I can get here and tell you. So, our guidelines for the fingerprint portion, we would need

typically about eight minutia points.

Plus, we would need to determine one or more of the following, which is a distal orientation, meaning whether -- which way is up. Is there a focal point, which is basically a core, or a delta, or some other feature on that print that we can say, you know, is going to be there. And then whether or not we have robust and distinct target group, which means we have a couple minutia points that we can cluster together that we can say, this is a good starting point, we're going to start our comparison here, and then work our way through the whole rest of the print.

And then, the rest of the guidelines, I can go through them if you wish, but they're different for each area individually --

- Q That's fine.
- A -- in the finger.
- Q Let me ask you this. With regard to the purpose of those guidelines, is that to help you kind of whittle down -- or whittle down the number of prints you have to take a look at?
- 21 A That is correct, yes.
 - Q Okay, so it's a matter of -- would it help to say it helps you with your resources, because I'm assuming you have limited resources?
- 25 A Yes.

1 Q Limited manpower?
2 A Yes.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

24

- Q And so you're looking at, based upon an administrative decision, a more narrow focus in terms of the type of prints you're looking at?
- A Correct, and it gives us some consistency as a unit, because not only do we compare the prints, but then it's also verified by other members of the unit, so they essentially do the same work to make sure you come to the same conclusion as they do.
 - Q Based upon the guidelines that your --
- 12 A Based upon the guidelines, yes.
- 13 Q -- office has set?
- 14 A Right.
- MR. SANFT: No further questions, Your Honor.
- 16 THE COURT: Mr. Parris?
- 17 MR. PARRIS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 18 CROSS-EXAMINATION
- 19 BY MR. PARRIS:

country?

- 20 Q Ms. Gouldthorpe, getting back to the manual that
 21 you use, is that the same manual for everyone who has your
 22 level of expertise, not only in the Las Vegas Metropolitan
 23 Police Department, but in police departments across the
- A No. Our technical manual is specific only to our

- unit -- our detail at the Las Vegas Metropolitan Police
 Department.
- Q Okay. Have you ever served in any other -- excuse me, worked for any other police departments other than Metro?
 - A As a fingerprint examiner, no.
- 6 Q Yes, ma'am.
 - A No.

3

5

8

9

10

11

13

14

15

16

25

- Q Okay. In your subsequent training, have you been able to come in contact with other individuals who perform your job functions for other law enforcement agencies across the country?
- 12 A Yes, I do.
 - And I would assume that there is a significant amount of consistency regarding how all law enforcement agencies, generally speaking, will process and handle fingerprints, and perform their analyses, correct?
- 17 A Correct.
- Q And you had referenced that you had some sort of certification from the IAI, correct?
- 20 A Correct.
- 21 Q And I forget what that acronym stood for, but 22 that's -- is that a national or international group?
- A It's international. It's the leading professional organization for latent print examiners in the world.
 - Q Okay. Now, regarding AFIS itself, I know we had

talked about AFIS, but just to flesh that out, is it true that -- or isn't it true that AFIS is a -- well, at least a national database, correct?

A You're talking about different databases. We have a local database that is specifically here to Clark County, and then we also have the international, which is -- it's run by the FBI, and that's called IAFIS, which is the -- it's a countrywide AFIS system.

Q So, the database that you -- when you referenced the AFIS analyses that were performed on these fingerprints, all of those were from the local Clark County database; is that correct?

- A Actually, we search both.
- 14 Q Okay.

2

3

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

22

23

24

25

- 15 A Yeah.
- Q So, you did both the local and the FBI's international one, correct?
- 18 A Yeah, it's -- it's just to this country only
 19 though.
- 20 Q Okay.
- 21 A But yeah.
 - Q Okay. Now, so, regarding prints that are placed into the international database, do examiners like yourself follow the same specific criteria as to how they go about marking the specific whirls or other minutia regarding a

fingerprint that they find?

A Yes.

1

2

3

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

Q Okay. So, there is a good amount of consistency when it comes to the prints that are added into that either local or national AFIS databases?

A Yes.

Q Okay. Now, in this particular instance, you were given -- well, let me back up. Regarding those databases, the local and international, experts like yourself can upload fingerprints that they came into contact with at any point in time, correct?

A Correct.

Q Okay. And is there a link between the AFIS database and the booking area of like the Clark County Detention Center, for example, when a person gets booked in and they do the fingerprint -- you know, they roll their fingers like we see on TV? Is there a link between those two?

A Locally, yes.

Q Okay. So, on the local AFIS database, anytime someone is booked into the Clark County Detention Center, their fingerprints are captured, correct --

A Yes.

Q -- to your knowledge?

25 A Yes. To my knowledge, yes.

- Q Okay. And then, to your knowledge, those fingerprints are then uploaded into the at least local database, correct?
 - A Yes, correct.

- Q Okay. Now, AFIS also -- in addition to having people who are just booked into county, AFIS does have fingerprints from other governmental entities uploaded into it, correct?
- A Correct. My fingerprints, because I work for Metro, are in the system also.
- Q Okay. Regarding Metro, are other governmental -to your knowledge, do you know if other governmental agencies
 upload their fingerprints similar to Metro into that AFIS
 database?
- A To the local one, yes, determined based on job classification, but the IAFIS, the FBI-run one, I believe some military records are also kept in there, but I don't know the specifics on that, but I do believe military records are also in there.
- Q Okay. Regarding the local database, can you give an approximation as to how many discrete fingerprints are in that database?
- 23 A I believe the last count was over a million 24 fingerprint --
- 25 Q And that's just for --

1 Α -- records. -- the Clark County one? 2 That's just -- yeah, that's just for Clark County. 3 Α Any idea how many are in the International AFIS? 4 0 5 If you're just talking Clark County, multiple 6 that by 50 states, and you got a lot. 7 A lot? Okay. Now, in this particular case, Q 8 regarding the cards that you were given from the June 26th and June 30th incidents, you ran those prints that you were 9 able to pull up -- or that you were able to identify as 10 appropriate against everyone in the local and international 11 AFIS database, correct? 12 Right -- well, international's kind of not the 13 14 appropriate word. 15 I keep saying international because --0 16 Yeah. Α -- it's IAFIS, and that's --17 Q IAFIS, yeah, and it's the national --18 Α Okay. 19 Q 20 -- national database. Α 21 I apologize. Q That's okay. But yes, I did. 22 Okay, but you were also specifically requested to 23 24 check against fingerprints you had been given regarding Mr.

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

Parker and Mr. Alexander, correct?

25

A Correct, and those -- I would have compared the specific prints that we were requested to compare first before entering them into the AFIS database.

Q I'm sorry. So, when you first got the prints on the various cards, you -- when you were given -- when it was suggested to you by whomever, compare against person X or person Y, you do those people first, the known individuals, correct?

A That is correct, because if it does belong to them, then it -- I would identify that person. Then I would no longer have to put it into the database because I would know that this print belongs to this person.

Q So, it would be easier to make a one on one comparison versus one on a million, you know, needle in the haystack search, correct?

A Correct, yes.

Q Okay. So, after the prints that you were given regarding Mr. Parker, we'll start there, for example, came back negative, you then went to Mr. Alexander, or vice versa, and then you went needle in a haystack, so to speak, correct?

A Correct.

Q Okay, and that came back negative on all fronts as best as the prints would allow you to examine, correct?

A Except for the one that was identified to Maria Villanueva.

- Q Okay. And regarding Maria Villanueva, you were not given that as one to check against originally, correct?.
- 3 A Correct.
 - Q Was that the local AFIS or the national AFIS that came up with that hit?
- 6 A The local AFIS.
- Q Okay.
- MR. PARRIS: Your Honor, I have nothing further.
- 9 Thank you.

5

- 10 THE COURT: Any redirect?
- MS. KILLER: Just very briefly. Just a few points
- 12 of clarification for myself and the jury.
- 13 REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- 14 BY MS. KILLER:
- Q You said when two prints kind of crossover, you call that an overlay print?
- 17 A Yes.
- Q Okay. And that happens if two of us touch the same area?
- A Correct, or if I -- like, for instance, if I touch
 this mug right here, and I lift up, and I touch it again, and
- 22 I touch it again, and I touch it again, that would be an
- 23 overlay.
- Q An overlay? Okay. And I presume sometimes you're able to separate those out, but for the most part, it makes

it more difficult than just one fingerprint?

- A That's correct.
- Q The defense had asked you about high-traffic areas or access doors, and if you can sometimes get prints of suitable quality off of those. I believe you'd said yes?
- A Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

20

21

- Q And in fact, on the Q(1) -- the Q(1) card on the event from the 30th, and all of the cards on the event from the 26th, those were from entry doors, correct?
- 10 A Correct.
- 11 Q You mentioned checking for the orientation.
- 12 A Um-hum.
- Q Sorry, technology problem. And you said which way is up. Obviously, when we touch a surface, we don't always touch it with our fingers pointing out to make it easy for you all?
- A No. Sometimes it's sideways, sometimes it's upside-down. We have to know through our training and experience how to orient that print.
 - Q And that's to ensure that your comparisons are accurate?
- 22 A Correct.
- Q Because portions of my fingerprint could look like portions of Mr. Pesci's, but if you have enough minutia and enough of the print, you're able to -- that's a suitable

print that you can make the comparison on and be sure whose is whose?

A Correct.

Organization of Standards.

3

4

5

10

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

25

- Q We talked about the standards that you use in the lab, but the lab itself is subject to accreditation, correct?
- A Yes. We are a fully accredited laboratory through
 the ASCLD Laboratory, ISO 17025, which ASCLD Lab is the

 American Society of Crime Lab Directors Laboratory

 Accreditation Board, and then ISO is the International
- 11 Q And there's national and international standards
 12 for your lab to qualify for that?
- 13 A Correct.
 - Q And then you had mentioned that somebody goes back through and kind of double-checks to confirm the conclusion.

 Is that called a technical reviewer?
 - A Yes.
 - Q When Mr. Parris had asked you kind of the order that you did the comparison in versus the AFIS, on both of these events, the administrative AFIS search was run before your comparisons?
- 22 A That is correct.
 - Q And that's the one we talked about earlier where the packets come in after the crime, and they're processed administratively before you even get the request?

1 Α Yes. One last question. You can't determine the age of a fingerprint, correct, or how long it's been on a surface? 3 4 Α Correct. 5 So, just because prints are recovered doesn't mean 6 they were the last person to touch the door? 7 No, it does not mean that. Α They could have been from a customer a year ago or 8 Q someone who walked in that morning? 9 10 Α Yes. MS. KILLER: Okay, thank you. No further 11 questions. 12 THE COURT: Mr. Sanft? 13 MR. SANFT: No further questions, Your Honor. Thank you. 14 15 THE COURT: Mr. Parris? 16 MR. PARRIS: No, Your Honor. Thank you. 17 Thank you very much for your testimony THE COURT: here today. You may step down. You're excused from your 18 19 subpoena. 20 THE WITNESS: Thank you. 21 And the State may call their next THE COURT: witness. MS. KILLER: The State calls Alma Gutierrez. 23 THE MARSHAL: And if you'll please step up in the 24

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

25

witness stand.

```
MS. KILLER: Your Honor, may I approach the clerk?
 1
              THE MARSHAL: Remain standing, raise your right
 2
   hand, and --
 3
 4
              THE COURT: You may.
 5
              THE MARSHAL: -- face the clerk, please.
                ALMA GUTIERREZ, STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN
 6
 7
              THE CLERK:
                          Thank you. Please be seated. Could
    you please state your name and spell it for the record?
 8
 9
              THE WITNESS: Alma Gutierrez. A-l-m-a,
10
     G-u-t-i-e-r-r-e-z.
11
              THE CLERK: Thank you.
12
                           DIRECT EXAMINATION
13
    BY MS. KILLER:
              Do you mind if I call you Alma?
14
         Q
15
              That's fine.
         Α
16
              Alma, where do you work?
17
              Rainbow Market.
         Α
              And is that at 5075 East Washington Avenue here in
18
         Q
    Las Vegas, Clark County, Nevada?
19
20
         Α
              Yes.
              Were you working there on June 30th of 2015?
21
         Q
22
              Yes.
23
              In the early morning hours, about 4:30 in the
         Q
24
   morning?
25
         Α
              Yes.
```

```
MS. KILLER: Your Honor, may I approach?
 1
                          Sure. Oh, you want to approach the
 2
              THE COURT:
 3
    witness?
 4
              MS. KILLER: Oh, yes.
 5
              THE COURT:
                          Sure, go ahead.
 6
   BY MS. KILLER:
              I'm going to show you State's Proposed Exhibits 31
         Q
8
   to 41. Yes, 31 to 41. If you could just take a look at
   these without making a comment yet, and then I'm going to ask
 9
   you a question about them.
10
11
         Α
              Okay.
              [Inaudible] without dropping them. And I lost one.
12
    Sorry, everyone. Now, there's a map, and then the rest are
13
   photographs. Do you recognize where the map is and what the
14
   photographs are of?
15
16
              Yes.
         Α
17
              And how do you recognize those?
         Q
              That's where I work -- convenience store where I
18
         Α
19
   work.
              The Rainbow Market where you work?
20
         Q
21
              Yes.
         Α
22
              And do all of these fairly and accurately depict
23
    the location and what Rainbow Market looked like on June 30th
24
    of 2015?
25
         Α
              Yes.
```

```
MS. KILLER: Your Honor, the State moves to admit
 1
 2
    State's Proposed 31 through 41.
              MR. SANFT: No objection, Your Honor.
 3
              MR. PARRIS: No objection.
 4
                          They're admitted.
 5
              THE COURT:
             (State's Exhibits 31 through 41 are admitted)
 6
    BY MS. KILLER:
              Showing you State's Exhibit 31, it looks like --
 8
         Q
    that will clear up a little. Looks like your store is
 9
    located at the corner of Nellis and Washington?
10
11
         Α
              Yes.
12
              And that's in the northeast area of town?
         Q
13
         Α
              Yes.
              And showing you 32, is that your store?
14
         0
15
              It's the front entrance.
         Α
              Showing you State's 36, is that the cashier or the
16
17
    clerk counter?
18
         Α
              Yes.
              Is that where you were working on the morning of
19
    June 30th at 4:30 in the morning?
20
21
         Α
              Yes.
22
              When you were working that morning, June 30th at
23
    4:30 A.M., what occurred that causes you to be here today?
              Two men came into the store and robbed the store.
24
25
              And does your store have video surveillance?
         Q
```

1 Α Yes. And are you aware that some of that surveillance 2 3 was provided to the Las Vegas Metropolitan Police Department? 4 Α Yes. And prior to coming to court, did you get a chance 5 6 to watch a portion of that surveillance? 7 Α Yes. 8 MS. KILLER: Your Honor, pursuant to stipulation, the State moves to admit State's Proposed 30, which is the 9 10 video surveillance from the Rainbow Market on June 30th. That's fine, Your Honor. 11 MR. SANFT: 12 MR. PARRIS: Yes, Your Honor, we do so stipulate. 13 THE COURT: It's admitted, and you may publish. (State's Exhibit 30 is admitted) 14 15 MS. KILLER: Thank you, Your Honor. Alma, we're going to -- if you can switch over to the computer when you 16 17 have a chance. Mr. Pesci's going to help me out here and play the videos for you. 18 BY MS. KILLER: 19 20 Do you see yourself there at the start of the video 21 in the frame? Yes. And is that you in the red shirt in the lower left 23 Q 24 corner?

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

25

Α

Yes.

```
And that gentleman there, is that the security
 1
         Q
    guard that was working at your store, Ronald Main, I believe?
 3
         Α
              Yes.
              We see the timestamp here as the customers come in.
 4
         0
 5
    It's about 4:25, 4:26 in the -- in the early morning,
 6
    correct?
         Α
              Yes.
              Now we see two men entering. Does this video
 8
         Q
 9
    fairly and accurately depict what occurred that morning?
10
              Yes.
         Α
              I'm going to play one more clip for you. Those
11
    were the two customers we saw come in at the start of the
12
    last clip, correct?
13
14
         Α
              Yes.
              Is that you that we see on the bottom edge of the
15
         0
16
    video?
17
         Α
              Yes.
18
              Opening the cash register?
         Q
              Yes, that's me.
19
         Α
              MS. KILLER: Okay, if we can back that one up and
20
21
    start it again.
    BY MS. KILLER:
23
              When you said the store was robbed, you -- how many
24
    men came in?
25
         Α
              Two.
```

- 1 Q Two? And how many firearms did you see?
- 2 A One.
- 3 Q And I'm going to let the video get -- there we go.
- 4 The -- is that the gentleman -- or is that -- the customers
- 5 we see going off the screen, I assume they went towards the
- 6 back of the store?
- A Yes.
- Q Okay. The man with the -- the man we see there, is he the one you saw with the gun?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q Okay. And can you describe him for us?
- 12 A He's a male.
- 13 Q Okay.
- 14 A I believe him to be Hispanic.
- 15 Q Go ahead. To you, he looked Hispanic when he came
- 16 in?
- 17 A He seemed Hispanic, yes.
- 18 Q And did he have something covering his face?
- 19 A A bandana covering the lower half of his face.
- 20 And he was the one that was holding the gun?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Did he stay right next to you, or did he go over to
- 23 Mr. Main?
- 24 A He approached me first, approached the counter
- 25 | first, told me to give him everything we had, and then he

- 1 | went to the security officer.
 - Q I'm sorry, [inaudible]. He told you what?
- A To give him everything I had, and then he went off to the security officer.
- Q Okay. And once he walked off, did the second individual approach the counter?
- A Yes.

- Q Okay, and what did that individual have on, clothes or face covering?
- 10 A He had a skull hoodie, and --
- 11 Q And due to that, you were unable to see his face as 12 well?
- 13 A That's right.
- Q Okay. When the second suspect was at the counter, what did you see him do? Or when he came up to the counter, did you open the drawer for him?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q Okay.
- A I opened the drawer, he leaned over, got the cash, took the money, pulled out the drawer, got some coins.
- 21 Q And after he grabbed that, did the --
- 22 MS. KILLER: Court's indulgence.
- 23 BY MS. KILLER:
- Q Do you know how much or about how much money was taken from your store?

About \$100. 1 Α About \$100? After the second man, the one with the 2 skull mask, got the \$100, did he and the first man wearing 3 the bandana, holding the gun leave the store? 5 He took the money, asked if I could access the 6 safe, and then the guy with the -- the first one with the gun told him that I wasn't able to, and then they left. 8 That you were not able to? Q 9 Yes. Α And so you did not give them any money out of the 10 Q 11 safe? 12 Α No. They just got the money out of the register? 13 Q That's right. 14 Α Okay. And then did they leave together? 15 0 16 Yes. Α 17 I'm just going to go back to the video of the front door for a second. Sorry, we just have to get past that 18 first part. Those two people we see depicted there, are 19 those the same two that you described as pointing the gun at 20 21 you and robbing the store for the money from the cash drawer? 22 Α Yes. MS. KILLER: No further questions. 23 24 THE COURT: Mr. Sanft, any cross?

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

MR. SANFT: Yes, Your Honor.

25

CROSS-EXAMINATION 1 2 BY MR. SANFT: 3 Ms. Gutierrez, this particular shift was 4:00 Q o'clock in the morning? 4 5 Yes. Α What time did you start your shift? 6 It's graveyard shift. I start from 9:00 P.M. to 7 Α 8 5:00 A.M. Have you worked that shift before? 9 Q 10 Α Yes. THE COURT: Did you -- you said 9:00 P.M. to 5:00 11 12 P.M.? 13 THE WITNESS: I'm --THE COURT: What did you say? Did you say 9:00 14 15 P.M. to 5:00 A.M.? THE WITNESS: 9:00 P.M. to 5:00 A.M. 16 17 THE COURT: Okay, I just wanted to make sure we got that right. 18 BY MR. SANFT: 19 With that particular shift -- how often have you 20 worked that shift before this incident occurred? 21 22 It's my regular shift. As long as I've been with 23 the company. Okay. Can you describe for the jury the kind of 24 Q 25 volume of people that come in during that time period,

1 especially say around -- between the hours of 2:00 o'clock in 2 the morning to 5:00 o'clock in the morning?

- A It's slow. I want to say roughly about 20 people.
- Q Okay. And with regard to that shift as well, are you expected to do cleaning?
- A Yes.

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

14

20

21

23

24

- Q Meaning the floors? You'd mop the floors, I'm assuming?
 - A Yes, I have to mop the floors.
- Q And would that be something that, typically, a person that's on that particular shift would be required to do more of the cleaning because there's less traffic?
- 13 A Yes.
 - Q Okay. How about wiping down counters?
- 15 A Yes, I wipe down counters.
- 16 Q There was video of an individual that was leaning 17 forward; he had a hand on the counter. Did you wipe that 18 counter prior to him touching that counter?
- 19 A Yes.
 - Q Okay. And as far as you can recall, when you wiped down that counter before he touched the counter, how many other people touched that counter in between the time that you wiped the counter down?
 - A I honestly can't say. I don't remember.
- 25 Q All right, but it would be fair to say, of course,

```
not high-traffic, not something --
 1
              No, not at all.
 2
         Α
              Not something in the early morning rush hour
 3
         Q
 4
    traffic --
 5
         Α
              No.
              -- or in the noontime, or --
 6
         Q
 7
              It's very slow.
         Α
              Now, when you were at the area there, there was
 8
         Q
    some video of you in the very beginning. You were wearing a
 9
    shirt
10
            -- a red shirt?
11
              Yes.
         Α
                    When the two individuals came in, where did
12
         Q
              Okay.
13
    you go?
              I was behind the counter.
14
         Α
15
              Oh, I see. So, you were behind the counter, and
         Q
    that's when the -- one of the individuals who was touching
16
17
    that counter was telling you to open up the safe?
18
         Α
              Yes.
              Did you ever move from that area?
19
         Q
              No, I stayed there until the police arrived.
20
         Α
21
              All right. And when the police finally arrived,
         Q
    were you the one that was -- well, I'm sure you spoke to
    police at some point?
23
24
         Α
              Yes.
25
              And you gave them -- you let them know what
```

```
happened?
 1
 2
              Yes.
         Α
 3
              Did you help them look at the video surveillance?
         Q
 4
              No.
         Α
 5
              Who did that?
         Q
 6
              The manager of the store.
         Α
 7
              Okay. And as far as you know, were you able to
         Q
 8
    observe them looking at video or surveillance of any sort?
 9
              I was off into the corner. I wasn't in the office
         Α
10
    area.
              MR. SANFT: Okay. No further questions, Your
11
            Thank you.
12
    Honor.
13
              THE COURT: Mr. Parris?
14
              MR. PARRIS: Yes, ma'am.
15
                           CROSS-EXAMINATION
16
    BY MR. PARRIS:
              Ms. Gutierrez, on the night in question, you -- do
17
18
    you recall speaking to various officers that arrived on
19
    scene?
20
         Α
              Yes.
              And approximately how quickly did the officers
21
         Q
    arrive after this incident had occurred?
23
              Maybe less than six -- ten minutes.
         Α
              I'm sorry, between six and ten minutes?
24
25
         Α
              Yes.
```

Okay. And do you recall that same morning, it 1 Q would be, that you wrote out a -- approximately a one-page 2 3 statement for the authorities? 4 Α Yes. Okay. And in that statement, you wrote that out 5 within an hour or so, would you say, of when the incident 6 7 occurred? 8 Probably. Α 9 Probably? 10 Yeah. Α Okay. And at the time that you wrote that, the 11 Q events were still relatively fresh in your mind --12 13 Α Yes. -- is that fair to say? Now, earlier, you had --14 15 well, did you have an opportunity to review that statement 16 prior to testifying today? 17 Α Yes. Okay. And you would agree that your testimony 18 Q today is consistent with that which is contained in that 19 statement, correct? 20 21 Α Yes. 22 Your memory today has not significantly changed 23 since you wrote down that statement detailing what happened 24 that morning, correct? 25

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

I'm sorry, can you repeat the question?

Α

Well, your memory as you sit here today isn't Q different of what happened on the morning in question; it's not significantly different from what you outlined in that statement, correct? [Inaudible]. I'm sorry? Q Yes, it is. Α Okay. What differences -- what things would you Q like to add to that statement as you sit here today that you now remember? Oh, add? No, just I thought the money had been Α pulled out after the drawer had been pulled out of the drawer -- my register, but as I saw in the video, that's not how it occurred. The money had been pulled out first --0 Okay. -- and then the drawer. Okay. So, in your recollection, you remember the -- I'm sorry, the drawer -- the money being pulled out before the drawer was pulled out? The drawer being pulled out first, and then the money. Okay, but on the -- once you had an opportunity to

1

3

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Α

Yes.

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

-- correct? Other than that change, was your

review the video, it was the reverse --

```
statement that you wrote that morning consistent with what
 1
   you said today regarding --
 3
         Α
              Yes.
              -- regarding the two men, regarding the Hispanic
 4
         Q
 5
   man with the gun, regarding the black man who came and -- I
   think Mr. Sanft had referenced he put his hand on the
 7
    counter, and actually took the money?
 8
              Yes.
         Α
              That's all consistent, correct?
 9
10
         Α
              Yes.
              Thank you. Oh, and nothing was taken from you
11
         Q
   personally, correct?
12
13
         Α
              No.
              MR. PARRIS: Thank you. I have no further
14
15
    questions.
                          Any redirect?
16
              THE COURT:
17
              MS. KILLER: No, Your Honor.
                          Thank you very much for your testimony
18
              THE COURT:
   here today.
19
20
              THE WITNESS:
                            Thank you.
21
                         You may step down. You are excused
              THE COURT:
    from your subpoena. Thank you for being here, and you may
23
    call your next witness.
24
              MS. KILLER: The State calls Keshaun Richardson.
              THE MARSHAL: I'm sorry?
25
```

MS. KILLER: Keshaun Richardson. And for the 1 2 record, I'm returning 31 to 41 to your clerk. 3 THE COURT: Thank you. THE MARSHAL: And if you'll please step up into the 4 5 witness stand, remain standing, raise your right hand, and 6 face the clerk. KESHAUN RICHARDSON, STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN Thank you. Please be seated. Could 8 THE CLERK: 9 you please state your name and spell it for the record? THE WITNESS: Keshaun, K-e-s-h-a-u-n. Last name is 10 Richardson, R-i-c-h-a-r-d-s-o-n. 11 12 THE CLERK: Thank you. 13 DIRECT EXAMINATION 14 BY MS. KILLER: Keshaun, on July 9th of 2015, were you working at 15 Q 16 the Family Dollar --17 Α Yeah. -- at 4365 East Lake Mead here in Las Vegas, Clark 18 County, Nevada? 19 20 Α Yes. 21 And is that kind of the corner of Lamb and Lake Mead? 23 Α Yes. And at about 8:30 on the morning of July 9th, did 24 Q 25 something occur that causes you to be here today?

Yes. 1 Α What was that? 3 I was working at Family Dollar, and on my first day, there was a robbery. 4 It was your first day of work there? 5 6 Α Yes. MS. KILLER: Your Honor, if I could approach the witness briefly? 8 9 THE COURT: You may. 10 BY MS. KILLER: Showing you what's been marked as State's Proposed 11 Q 49 through 61, I'm going to show these to you --12 13 Yeah. Α -- briefly, and just don't comment on them yet. We 14 have a group question at the end. Do you recognize what's 15 depicted in those photographs? 16 17 Α Yes, I do. And how do you recognize it? 18 Q 19 That's the front of my store. And are the remaining photographs the inside of 20 21 your store? 22 Correct. 23 And do State's Proposed 49 through 61 fairly and accurately depict your store as it appeared on July 9th of 24

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

25

2015?

```
1
         Α
              Yes.
              MS. KILLER: The State moves to admit 49 through
 2
 3
    61.
              THE COURT:
                          Any objection?
 4
 5
              MR. SANFT:
                          No, Your Honor.
              MR. PARRIS: No objection, Your Honor.
 6
                          They're admitted.
 7
              THE COURT:
             (State's Exhibits 49 through 61 are admitted)
 8
 9
    BY MS. KILLER:
              Showing you State's Exhibit 49 --
10
         Q
              MS. KILLER: Oh, yeah, sorry. Thank you.
11
12
    BY MS. KILLER:
              Is that the Family Dollar Store we're talking
13
    about?
14
15
              Yes.
         Α
              And then, still on 49, in the middle here, is that
16
     -- those doors we see, is that the entrance and exit to the
17
18
    store?
19
         Α
              Correct.
              Okay. And showing you Exhibit -- State's Exhibit
20
    51, are those the same doors we see here on the right side of
21
    the photograph?
23
         Α
              Yes.
24
              But this is taken from the inside?
25
         Α
              Correct.
```

```
Okay. And this counter we see over here on the
 1
         Q
    left, is that the cashier area of your store?
 3
         Α
              Yes.
 4
         Q
              Okay.
 5
              MS. KILLER: Can we switch back to video? Thanks.
 6
    BY MS. KILLER:
              Your store has surveillance video, correct?
         0
 8
              Correct.
         Α
              And are you aware that surveillance video from the
 9
    robbery was provided to the police?
10
11
         Α
              Yes.
              And did you have an opportunity to review portions
12
13
    of that video before you testified today?
              I've seen pictures of the video.
14
         Α
15
              Okay, still shots from the video?
         Q
16
              Yes.
         Α
17
              Okay.
         Q
              MS. KILLER: Your Honor, the State moves to admit
18
    by prior stipulation the video from this incident.
19
    State's Proposed Exhibit 42.
20
21
                          That is correct, Your Honor.
              MR. SANFT:
22
              MR. PARRIS: Yes, Your Honor.
23
              THE COURT: Okay, it's admitted, and you may
24
   publish.
25
                   (State's Exhibit 42 is admitted)
```

BY MS. KILLER:

1

2

3

5

- Q Keshaun, if you can look at the screen there. That went pretty quick. We're going to back it up from the start and have you kind of narrate us through what happened. If you need any tissue, they're in front of the monitor.
- 6 A Um-hum.
 - Q Is that you we see on the left side?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q Okay. And then the -- we see a man who approached 10 you?
- 11 A Correct.
- Q And fair to say he -- the first person to approach you is wearing a blue hat; a white kind of plaid or striped various ways shirt?
- 15 A Yes.
- Q Okay. And was that man holding a gun?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q The second man that we see in the photograph, was
 19 he also part of the robbery?
- 20 A Yes, he was.
- 21 Q And what was he wearing?
- A A skull mask, black sweater, blue jeans, white sneakers.
- Q What had you been doing just before this video started when we saw them approach you?

- A I was opening a box, and I seen another customer, and she signaled me that she was ready to check out, so I went to turn to go check her out.
- Q Did you see the men who robbed you when they initially came in the store?
- 6 A No, I did not.
- Q So, when they kind of charged at you here, this was your first interaction with them?
- 9 A Correct.

3

4

5

14

- 10 Q The first individual, the one with the gun in the 11 blue hat and white plaid shirt that we can see in this video, 12 did he have anything covering his face?
- 13 A Say it again.
 - Q Did he have anything covering his face?
- 15 A Yes, he had a blue bandana.
- 16 Q Did he say anything to you?
- 17 A Besides -- can I say that word?
- 18 Q Yes.
- 19 A Oh, okay. He -- okay.
- Q In court, we ask that you say it as it was said to you, and the ladies and gentlemen of the jury will excuse any profanity.
- A Okay. He said, shut up, bitch, get down; open the register, it's a robbery.
- 25 Q And the second gentleman that came in and charged

you with him, were you able to see if he had a gun? 1 2 Α No, he didn't have a gun. The gun that you saw was in the hand of the first 3 4 individual? 5 Correct, with the --6 But they were --Q 7 -- plaid shirt. Α I'm sorry. But they approached you together? 8 Q 9 Yes. Α And at this point, we see that you're kind 10 Okay. Q of pushed to the ground, and the second individual goes past 11 12 you? 13 Α Correct. Did you see where he went? 14 Q 15 He jumped over the counter. Α Okay. 16 Q 17 Which is the first register. Α And the first individual, we'll say the bandana and 18 Q the white plaid shirt --19 20 Α Okay. -- for identification purposes. He walked you --21 it looked like he walked you up to the register? 23 Correct. Α We're going to play the video from another view

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

now. Is that the customer that you were trying to help check

24

25

out? 1 Yes, ma'am. 2 Α And the individual that we just saw jump the 3 Q counter there, is that the second person involved in the 4 5 robbery, the one with the skull mask? 6 Yes. Α 7 Okay. At this point, we see you at the register. Q What were you trying to do? 8 He told me to open the register, and I couldn't get 9 Α 10 the register to open. And does he still have the gun to you? 11 Q 12 Yeah, he has it to the back of my head right here. Can you describe for us what the fun felt like and 13 looked like? 14 It was cold, it's heavy, metal, round. I can feel 15 Α the pressure of the gun, and it was just like right here. 16 17 And just because she's going to have to type everything we say, they're not going to have a video of this 18 later, when you said right here, you gestured to the back of 19 20 your neck? 21 Right. Α 22 Did the commands to open the register and give you the money continue? 23

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

This was your first day there, right?

24

25

Α

Yes.

- 1 A Correct.
- 2 Q Were you able to get the register open?
- 3 A No, I wasn't.
- 4 Q Was there another employee in the store with you?
- 5 A Yes, there was.
- 6 Q Who was that?
- 7 A That was Chad.
- 8 Q Does -- is -- Chad Williams, is that --
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q -- accurate?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q And at the time when the robbery started, where was
- 13 | Chad?
- A Chad was sitting at the kiosk, which is directly --
- 15 | if you walk in, it's on your lefthand side.
- Okay. So, in this video, we see you behind the
- 17 register, he'd be directly across from you --
- 18 A Correct.
- Q -- in front of you, and the entry doors would be to
- 20 our right?
- 21 A Correct.
- 22 Q Okay. And did he have anything in his hands, or
- 23 | was he doing anything at this time?
- A He was on the phone. He did throw the phone in the
- 25 | kiosk; just kind of let it go.

- Q I think we saw you kind of reach over for something in the video there. What were you trying to do with that?
- A Chad told me to scan something, so the first thing I grabbed was a pack of lighters, which was on my right hand side, and I was trying to scan it so the register can open.
- Q Were you ever able during the course of the robbery to get the register open?
 - A No.

3

4

5

8

9

10

12

13

14

- Q So, the two individuals that came in did not get any money from the register?
- 11 A That is correct.
 - Q Okay. I'm going to back it up just a bit, and then hit play again. Is the customer that you were trying to help check out there in the bottom right corner?
- 15 A Yes.
- Q Okay. And this is you still trying to open the register while the skull mask -- the person with the skull mask puts his backpack out on the counter, open?
- 19 A Yes.
- Q And we kind of saw everybody look out towards the front there. At some point during the robbery, were you able to look up and outside?
- 23 A Yes.
- Q And what did you see?
- 25 A I seen a black SUV, a gentleman standing out of it

- 1 -- outside of the car. He had a badge that was wrapped 2 around his neck. He was an unmarked car.
 - Q So, a plain clothes police officer?
- 4 A Correct.

5

6

7

9

10

13

14

15

16

17

- Q Okay. And we kind of saw it in the video, but did the people robbing the store also look outside at a similar time?
- 8 A Yes.
 - Q And after they looked outside, do they kind of back off from you and go running out of the screen here?
- 11 A Correct.
- 12 | Q Did you see where they went?
 - A They went to the back. They didn't go through -because we have different alarms, they went through the alarm
 that goes off where we know that someone -- it was the side
 back of the store. It wasn't the receiving door; it was the
 side door.
- Q Okay. I think I have a picture I can show you to probably explain it a little better. Showing you State's Exhibit 60 --
- MS. KILLER: I apologize, Kris, if we can switch one more time.
- 23 BY MS. KILLER:
- 24 Q Are those the two back doors to your store?
- 25 A Yes.

- Q Okay. And you said they went out the side back door. Can -- if you touch your screen, you can draw on it. Can you circle -- and you were able to tell that they went out that door from the --
- 5 A The alarm.
- 6 Q -- sound of the alarm?
 - A Yes.

3

8

9

10

- Q And I know you were probably focused on trying to get the register open, but did you see anything get taken from the customer?
- 11 A Yes, her purse.
- 12 Q And did you see where they put that purse?
- 13 A In the backpack that the gentleman with the skull 14 mask was holding.
- Q Okay. Was the man with the skull mask the person that physically grabbed the purse from the customer?
- 17 A Correct.
- Q And was the gun pointed at her directly?

 Obviously, the gun was out and visible, but it was pointed directly at her at some point during this?
- A Yes. She was praying, and he told her to shut up, and then -- yeah.
- Q And that was the man with the blue hat and the white plaid shirt?
- 25 A That is correct.

- 1 Q The bandana? When the two men robbing the store 2 looked outside and presumably saw what you saw, did they make 3 any comments?
 - A Yes. The one with the skull mask had said, there's the cops; it's the cops.
- Q And that's -- shortly after that, they took off and ran out the back of your store?
- 8 A Yes.

5

- 9 MS. KILLER: Court's indulgence.
- 10 BY MS. KILLER:
- 11 Q After the defendants had left the store, did the 12 police respond?
- 13 A Yes.
- Q And once the police arrived, did -- without telling us what you said, did you speak with them and tell them what had occurred?
- 17 A Yes.
- Q After that, were you taken to view two individuals
 that they had apprehended?
- 20 A Correct.
- Q And when you did this, were you read some instructions before you were shown these people?
- 23 A Yes.
- Q And when you were shown the people, were they in the same location, or were they in separate locations?

- A They were in separate locations.
- 2 Q Okay, but you were shown two individuals total?
- 3 A That is correct.
 - Q Did you recognize those individuals as the same people who had just held a gun to you and tried to rob the store?
- A Yes.

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

- Q And what features or clothing did you specifically notice on them?
- A For the gentleman that was in the skull mask, he had -- when he jumped over the counter, he had tried to fix his mask coming back to us, and I seen the back of his head, and then his tennis shoes. And when they went to go show me two different people, he had the same tennis shoes on, the same jeans, and the hump on the back of his head.
- Q Okay, kind of like --
- 17 A A cup.
- 18 Q oh, a cup? So like an indention?
- 19 A Correct.
- Q Okay. And you had been able to see that because when he jumped, the mask lifted up in the back?
- 22 A Correct.
- Q Okay. And you said his tennis shoes.
- MS. KILLER: Oh, well, that's over here. Your
- 25 Honor, if I may approach the clerk?

```
THE COURT: You may.
 1
    BY MS. KILLER:
 3
              Would you recognize a photograph of those tennis
         Q
    shoes if you were shown it?
 5
         Α
              Yes.
 6
              MS. KILLER: Your Honor, if I may approach the
 7
    witness?
 8
              THE COURT: You may.
 9
    BY MS. KILLER:
10
              Showing you State's Proposed Exhibit 65, do you
         Q
    recognize what's in that photograph?
11
12
              Yes.
         Α
              Okay. And how do you recognize it?
13
         Q
              The Nike symbol.
14
         Α
              Okay. Are these the same tennis shoes you saw?
15
         Q
16
              Yes.
         Α
              And does this photograph fairly and accurately
17
    depict how those shoes looked on July 9th?
18
19
         Α
              Yes.
20
              MS. KILLER: State moves to admit State's Proposed
21
    65.
              MR. SANFT: No objection.
23
              MR. PARRIS: No objection.
24
              THE COURT: It's admitted.
25
                   (State's Exhibit 65 is admitted)
```

MS. KILLER: May I publish? 1 2 THE COURT: You may. 3 BY MS. KILLER: Keshaun, let me just ask you while the jury's 4 Q 5 viewing the photograph, is that a photograph of the same 6 tennis shoes you saw on one of the men when they were robbing the store, and then again when he was apprehended by police and you did your show-up identification? 8 9 Α Yes. And I believe you said, but I just want to 10 Q Okay. make sure we're clear, these were worn by the individual in 11 12 the skull mask? 13 Α Correct. 14 Q When you saw him, did he have the same black shirt 15 that we saw in the video? 16 Α Yes. 17 And were you also shown the individual who had been wearing the blue baseball cap and the plaid shirt during the 18 time of the robbery? 19 20 Α Yes. Okay, and did you recognize him as well? 21 Q Yes. He did not have those items on by the time you were 23 at the show-up, correct? 24

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

25

Α

That is correct.

Okay. 1 Q MS. KILLER: No further questions at this time. 2 Mr. Sanft, any cross? 3 THE COURT: Yes, Your Honor. 4 MR. SANFT: 5 CROSS-EXAMINATION 6 BY MR. SANFT: 7 Ms. Richardson, what time of day was this when this Q occurred? 8 8:30 in the morning. 9 Α All right. And what time does the store typically 10 Q 11 open? We open at 8:00. 12 Α 8:00 o'clock? 13 Q Um-hum. 14 Α How many people were in the store at that 15 Q 16 particular point around 8:30 on this particular morning? 17 There was a woman, another woman, a baby, and my store manager, and me. 18 19 And out of all the employees for the store, there Q was only two employees that were working at that time? 20 21 Α Yes, that's correct. 22 Yourself and Chad? 23 Α Yes. Now, when these two individuals came in, you were 24 Q

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

already sort of in the area of the cash -- of the register;

25

is that right? 1 2 Yes, I was on the side of it. Α All right. And so, when these two individuals 3 Q approached you, immediately grabbed a hold of you? 4 5 Um-hum. Α 6 Q Is that a yes? 7 Yes, that's a yes. Α Okay, and forced you to go behind the counter? 8 Q 9 That is correct. Α All right. Fair to say that they called you names 10 Q as they were leading you behind? 11 12 Α Yes. Called you, what, bitch? 13 Q A bitch, um-hum. 14 Α All right, and then were relatively rough with you 15 Q as you were being led behind? 16 17 Α Correct. Okay. They didn't give you any type of pass, or 18 Q treat you anything but rough; is that correct? 19 20 Α That is correct. 21 Okay. Now, your testimony was that the person with Q the skull mask had at some point had his mask fall off of his head? 23 It didn't fall off. When he jumped over, he 24

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

adjusted it --

25

- 1 Q I see.
- $2 \mid A --$ to bring it back down.
- $3 \mid Q \quad I \quad see.$
- A And when he did that, you can see the back of his head.
- 6 Q Okay, because he's pulling on the mask this way --
- 7 A Um-hum.
- 8 Q -- and the back of the mask is actually lifting up?
- 9 A Correct.
- Q All right. So, it was the type of mask that was completely covering his entire head?
- 12 A That is correct.
- Q It wasn't like the type of mask that's just covering the front part of his face?
- 15 A Um-hum, that's correct.
- Q Okay. And it's not the type of mask, for instance, where you could see very distinctly hair on the back of his head, correct?
- 19 A Yes, that's correct.

21

23

24

- Q All right. Now, you had said as well that the two individuals that were there -- that were there in the front of the store, how long were they there in the front of the store doing the robbery? Do you recall how fast it was, or how quick it was?
- 25 A Are you saying in front of the store, meaning

- inside the store, or are you saying in front of the store outside the store?
 - Q And I apologize for that. Let me just make sure we're clear. At the time that you are in interaction with these two individuals --
- 6 A Correct.

5

9

- Q -- from the time they first approached you to the time they ran out of the store, do you know how long that was?
- 10 A I would say seven -- seven minutes. Seven, ten
 11 minutes.
- 12 Q And that's from the time that they grabbed a hold 13 of you to the time that they turned around and ran out the 14 back of the store?
- 15 A Yes.
- MR. SANFT: I have no further questions. Thank
- 17 you. THE COURT: Mr. Parris?
- 18 MR. PARRIS: Very briefly, briefly.
- 19 CROSS-EXAMINATION
- 20 BY MR. PARRIS:
- Q Ms. Richardson, you had no property -- none of your personal property was taken from you, correct?
- 23 A That is correct.
- Q So, you -- not your wallet, your purse, nothing of that nature, correct?

- 1 A That is correct.
- 2 Q Let's back up. This happened on your first day at
- 3 | work?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q And you still went back for a second day?
- 6 A Yes.
- Q Okay, I respect that. On the morning in question, 8 obviously, police were -- you indicated that you saw police 9 officers outside while the robbery was actually occurring,
- 10 | correct?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q Later on, you interacted with some police officers
 13 who, for example, did that show-up lineup with you, correct?
- 14 A That is correct.
- Q Also that morning, you filled out a two-page written statement, correct?
- 17 A That is correct.

Yes.

- Q Okay. Did you have an opportunity to review that

statement --

Α

19

20

- 21 Q -- prior to coming to court today?
- 22 A When I had my pre, yes, I did.
- Q And when your pre -- when you met -- are you
 referring to a meeting you had with the district attorneys --
- 25 A Yes.

- Q -- prior to testifying in court today?
- A Yes.

5

6

7

8

9

- Q It was within the last week, or thereabouts; is --
- 4 A Yes.
 - Q -- that fair to say? And regarding that voluntary statement, was there anything -- after reviewing it approximately a week ago, was there anything in that statement that you wanted to change or alter based upon your memories of what happened that morning?
- 10 A Yes.
- Q Okay. The information that you testified to today,
 is it consistent with your memory -- excuse me, your memories
 of that particular incident?
- 14 A Yes.
- Q Okay. So, you're saying the version of events that you gave us today would potentially be more accurate than that which is contained in your voluntary statement?
- 18 | A That -- yes.
- Q Okay. Now, you would agree that your voluntary
 statement was written within an hour or two of this incident,
 correct?
- 22 A Yes.
- Q But today, your memory is better than it was, oh,

 24 five or six months ago, correct?
- 25 A My memory is better because at the time of my

statement, I was still in shock. I was writing my statement; on top of that, they had me go view the suspects. So, in the meantime of me writing it -- I wrote my statement before I went and viewed them, so me sitting there, thinking of everything from stuff that started to come clearly to me.

- Q So, you wrote your statement before you had a chance to go and do the show-up lineup with the police, correct?
 - A Correct.

3

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

- Q And when you did the show-up lineup, when you were shown the first individual, I think the first one you had referenced was the guy who had the skull mask, correct?
- A I didn't see him. I saw the guy with the skull mask. He was my second view.
- Q Okay. So, the first individual you saw was the guy with the blue hat, correct?
- 17 A Correct.
- Q And you had indicated that he was no longer wearing that blue hat, correct?
- 20 A That is correct.
- 21 Q And his shirt was different, correct?
- 22 A Correct.
- Q And throughout the time that he was inside the store, that person was always wearing a blue bandana, correct?

Correct. Α

1

2

3

4

17

18

- So, you didn't get to see his face, other than from the bridge of his nose to maybe his forehead; is that fair to say?
- 5 That is correct.
- Okay. So, he was wearing different clothing, but 6 Q you could see his face finally when you did the show-up lineup, correct? 8
- 9 Um-hum. Α Yes.
- And when you did that show-up lineup, I would 10 assume that person was in handcuffs, correct? 11
- 12 Α Correct.
- 13 Okay. And he was probably standing amongst some Q number of uniformed police officers, correct? 14
- 15 Α Correct.
- And other than the second person you identified, 16 I'm guessing that -- excuse me. I'm guessing that the two people you identified were the only two non-uniformed officers in that area, correct? 19
- Yes. Like, are you saying like the only two people 20 Α that was in the parking lot, or are you saying the one that 21 went to take me to go view --
- When you went and did the actual viewing of the two 23 24 individuals --
- 25 Α Okay.

```
Well, let me back up. The police came to you and
 1
         Q
    said words to the effect of, we caught the guys, we need you
 3
    to identify them; is that accurate?
 4
         Α
              No.
 5
         Q
              Okay.
              They said that they had two people that could be
 6
         Α
    possibly the suspects; we want you to come and view them.
 8
              Okay. So, when you went and saw those two people,
         Q
    there were -- in addition to those two people, there were
 9
10
    numerous uniformed officers in that area; is that correct?
11
              Yes.
         Α
              Okay. And were those two people you were asked to
12
    identify the only non-uniformed officers in that vicinity?
13
14
              Yes.
         Α
              Okay. And they were the only two people that were
15
         Q
    handcuffed or otherwise restrained, correct?
16
17
         Α
              Correct.
              MR. PARRIS: Court's indulgence. Your Honor, I
18
    have nothing further.
19
                          Thank you, Mr. Parris. Any redirect by
20
              THE COURT:
21
    State?
              MS. KILLER: Yes, Your Honor, just briefly.
23
                      (Pause in the proceedings)
24
                         REDIRECT EXAMINATION
25
    BY MS. KILLER:
```

- Q Keshaun, when you did your show-ups, you were read some instructions from the police officer, correct?
- A Correct.

3

5

6

7

21

23

24

25

- 4 Q And then --
 - MS. KILLER: And for the record, Your Honor, I'm folding her show-up so she only sees the portion with the instructions, and her signature and writing.
- 8 THE COURT: Okay.
- 9 MS. KILLER: If I may approach the witness?
- THE COURT: You may.
- 11 BY MS. KILLER:
- Q Do you recognize these instructions, and then what you said about the defendants?
- 14 A Yes.
- Q Okay. And Mr. Parris had asked you what you were told by the officers. Are these the same instructions that you were given before you gave your show-up?
- 18 A Correct.
- Q And I'm just going to read them to you, and you tell me if this is what you were told.
 - "In a moment, I'm going to show you a person who is being detained. This person may or may not be a person who committed the crime now being investigated. The fact that this person is detained should not cause you to believe or guess that he or she is guilty. You do not have to identify

anyone. It is just as important to free innocent persons from suspicion as it is to identify those who are guilty.

Please keep in mind that clothing can easily be changed. Please do not talk to anyone other than police officers while viewing this person. You must make up your own mind and not be influenced by other witnesses, if any.

When you have viewed the person, please tell me whether or not you can make -- whether or not you can make identification. If you can, tell me in your own words how sure you are of the identification. Please do not indicate in any way to the other witnesses that you have or have not made an identification. Thank you." Is -- are those the instructions you were given?

A Yes.

Q Okay. And just to check, there were no other witnesses standing next to you when you did this, correct?

A That is correct.

Q Okay. And you identified the person as 100 percent sure as to the person who held the gun to your neck, correct?

A Correct.

Q Mr. Parris had also asked you about the statement you'd given, and I think you already explained you were still in shock, and it was just after the event. That was also handwritten on a piece of paper, correct?

A Correct.

- Q It wasn't a situation where someone was asking you questions and you were just responding verbally?
- 3 A That is correct.
- 4 | Q What?
- 5 A That is correct.
- Q And at that time, you weren't asked all these same questions we're asking you today?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q And I think you said you were still upset and still 10 under the shock of the situation?
- 11 A Yes.

13

14

15

- Q You also mentioned that the blue bandana on the man holding the gun covered about half his face. Were you able to see enough of his face that you'd recognize him if he were here in the courtroom?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 Q Do you recognize anyone in the courtroom?
- 18 A Yep.
- Q Can you point to that person and identify an article of clothing they're wearing?
- 21 A What they're wearing right now?
- 22 Q Yes.
- 23 A A gray shirt, tan tie, little twisties.
- Q When you say little twisties, are you referring to
- 25 his hair?

1 Α Yes. MS. KILLER: Your Honor, can the record reflect the 2 identification of Defendant Ralph Alexander? 3 4 THE COURT: So reflected. 5 BY MS. KILLER: I think the answer's probably no, but were you able 6 Q to see enough of the person with the skull mask that you could recognize them? 8 9 Α No. MS. KILLER: No further questions. 10 11 Thank you. Mr. Sanft, any recross? THE COURT: 12 MR. SANFT: Yes, Your Honor. 13 RECROSS-EXAMINATION 14 BY MR. SANFT: 15 Ms. Richardson, when you were required or I guess Q escorted to the area to which you located those two 16 17 individuals that were in custody, was that -- was the other individual my client right here to the left of me? 18 Yes. 19 Α All right. Did he have at that particular point --20 21 you recall what he looked like on that day, I'm assuming? Say it again. Do you recall what he looked like on that day? 23 Q 24 Α Yes. 25 Did he have short hair or long hair?

- He had short hair. Α
- And when someone -- when you say that someone has 2 Q twisties or twists, what does that mean to you? 3
 - Like they're starting to start dreads. Α
- 5 Q Okay.

1

4

11

- 6 Yeah. Α
- So, it's longer, and then you start twisting your 7 Q 8 hair to create dreads, hopefully?
- 9 Α Correct.
- All right. And with regards to what you recall my 10 Q client looking on this particular day, did he look like he was starting twisties or twists in his hair? 12
- No, he did not. 13 Α
- He had very short hair? 14
- I know he had a do-rag on, but from what I saw and 15 Α what I've seen from his face when he approached me, I'd seen 16 17 enough of this to know that that was the man that threw me to 18 the ground.
- Okay, and that's fine, but I'm asking specifically 19 Q about his hairdo on this particular day. 20
- 21 I did not see his hairdo on this particular day. Α He had a hat on and a do-rag on.
- All right, but at the time that you then show up 23 24 with a police officer to a scene --
- 25 Α Um-hum.

```
-- which my client's in custody --
 1
         Q
              Um-hum.
 2
         Α
 3
              -- at that time?
         Q
 4
         Α
              Yes.
              My question is very simple. That is, you saw his
 5
 6
    head; is that correct?
 7
              I did see his head.
         Α
 8
              And no twisties?
         0
 9
              No twisties.
         Α
              MR. SANFT: No further questions, Your Honor.
10
              MR. PARRIS: No follow up, Your Honor.
11
                          Okay, thank you very -- okay, if you
12
              THE COURT:
    can just wait one moment. It looks like we have a question
13
    by one of the jurors.
14
                       (Pause in the proceedings)
15
                           (Bench conference)
16
17
                          I'm not going to ask this. This is the
              THE COURT:
18
    CSI effect.
19
              MS. KILLER: And I don't believe It was done, so.
20
              THE COURT:
                          Okay.
21
              MR. PESCI:
                          Yeah, we don't -- we're not sure, but
    we don't think so.
23
              THE COURT: I don't want to ask the question. I
   think it's inappropriate. Does either side really want me to
24
    ask the question?
25
```

1 MR. SANFT: No. 2 MR. PESCI: No. 3 MS. KILLER: No. Okay. All right. Okay. 4 THE COURT: 5 (End of bench conference) 6 THE COURT: All right, at this time, the question will be marked as Court's Exhibit number 4, and the Court is 8 not inclined to ask this question. Is there anything else 9 from the jury panel? Okay, at this time, you are excused. 10 Thank you very much for your testimony. You are excused from your 11 subpoena. Thank you for being here. 12 13 We're going to recess for lunch. During this recess, you're admonished not to talk or converse amongst 14 yourselves or with anyone else on any subject connected with 15 16 this trial, or read, watch, or listen to any report of or 17 commentary on the trial, or any person connected with this trial, by any medium of information, including, without 18 limitation, newspapers, television, the internet, or radio, 19 or form or express any opinion on any subject connected with 20 21 this trial until the case is finally submitted to you. 22 1:30. Let's see, it's 1:24. About 2:45. We'll be in recess until 2:45. Thank you. 23 Thank you. All rise for the exiting 24 THE MARSHAL: 25 jury, please. Jurors.

```
(Court recessed at 1:25 P.M. until 2:45 P.M.)
 1
 2
                 (Outside the presence of the jurors)
              THE MARSHAL: All rise for the entering jury.
 3
 4
    Jury.
 5
                  (Within the presence of the jurors)
 6
              THE MARSHAL: Thank you. Please be seated.
 7
                      (Pause in the proceedings)
              THE MARSHAL: Please remain seated and come to
 8
 9
    order.
            Court is now in session.
              THE COURT: Do I have a stipulation from the State
10
    as to the presence of the jury panel?
11
12
              MR. PESCI:
                          Yes, Your Honor.
13
              THE COURT:
                         Mr. Sanft?
14
              MR. SANFT:
                          Yes, Your Honor.
15
              THE COURT:
                          Mr. Parris?
16
              MR. PARRIS:
                           Yes, Your Honor.
17
                          You may call your next witness.
              THE COURT:
                         State calls Elana Chavarria-Ojeda.
18
              MR. PESCI:
                         Does she need an interpreter?
19
              THE COURT:
20
              MR. PESCI:
                          She does, and the interpreter's here.
21
                            Straight ahead to the witness stand,
              THE MARSHAL:
   please. Please step up into the witness stand, remain
    standing, raise your right hand, and face the clerk.
23
24
              THE COURT: Will the interpreter please raise his
25
    hand so you can be sworn by the clerk?
```

1	INTERPRETER SWORN	
2	THE CLERK: Thank you, sir.	
3	THE COURT: And will you please state your name for	
4	the record?	
5	THE INTERPRETER: Ricardo Pico (phonetic),	
6	certified Spanish interpreter.	
7	THE COURT: Thank you. And will the witness please	
8	raise your right hand so you can be sworn by the clerk?	
9	ELANA OJEDA-CHAVARRIA, STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN	
10	THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated. Please	
11	state and spell your name for the record.	
12	THE WITNESS: Elana Isabel Ojeda-Chavarria	
13	THE COURT: Can you spell that for us?	
14	THE WITNESS: E-l-a-n-a; I-s-a, b as in boy, e-l;	
15	O-j-e-d-a; C-h-a, v as in Victor, a-r-r-i-a.	
16	THE CLERK: Thank you.	
17	THE COURT: Okay, you may proceed.	
18	MR. PESCI: Thank you, Your Honor.	
19	DIRECT EXAMINATION	
20	BY MR. PESCI:	
21	Q Ma'am, I want to direct your attention to July the	
22	9th of this year. Did you go to the Family Dollar located at	
23	4365 East Lake Mead?	
24	A Yes.	
25	Q What were you doing there?	

- A I went shopping.
- Q While you were there -- or let me ask you, was it about -- between 8:00 and 9:00 in the morning?
 - A Yes.

1

4

8

9

10

15

16

17

18

22

23

24

25

- Q Were you there by yourself, or was there someone with you?
- 7 A By myself.
 - Q What were you getting at the store?
 - A Some fabric softener for my clothes, and some nail polish.
- 11 Q Did you make your way to the cash register to pay
 12 for the items?
- 13 A Yes.
- 14 Q What happened to you when you were at the counter?
 - A Two men approached. One had a gun; the other one did not. The one with the gun grabbed the cashier. The one that had no gun, he came near me, and the one with the gun had the gun pointed at the cashier's head.
- Q And what happened when the gun was pointed to the cashier's head, and the man -- the other man came over to you?
 - A I could not understand what they were saying. I just kept looking at them, but the one with the gun, he pointed the gun at me, and he made a gesture for me to -- to lay down.

- 1 Q Based -- go ahead.
- 2 A So I got on my knees, and I remained like that.
- 3 Q What were you doing on your knees?
- A I was just, you know, looking at the floor, and if
 I would turn around to look at them, they would yell at me
 something.
- Q Did you know what they said?
- 8 A No.
- 9 Q When you walked up to the counter to purchase your 10 items, did you have a means by which you could pay for those 11 items?
- 12 A How do you mean?
- 13 Q How were you going to pay for the --
- 14 A How I was going to pay? With my money.
- 15 Q Where was your money?
- 16 A In my purse.
- 17 Q Were you carrying the purse?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q What happened to your purse?
- 20 A Someone that was there took it.
- 21 | Q Did you see who took it?
- 22 A Yes.
- Q Who took it?
- 24 A The guy in the middle.
- Q At this table? Which guy?

Dark-skinned gentleman that is in front of me. 1 Α THE COURT: Can you have her count in, maybe? 2 BY MR. PESCI: 3 If this is position 1, 2, 3, and 4, what position 4 Q 5 is he in? 6 Second one. Α 7 Position 2? That's the individual that took your 0 8 purse? 9 Α Yes. After your purse was taken by the defendant, what 10 happened? 11 THE COURT: Okay, the record will reflect that she 12 did identify Mr. Parker. 13 14 Thank you. MR. PESCI: THE WITNESS: He put the purse in a black bag that 15 he was carrying. 16 17 BY MR. PESCI: And then what happened? 18 Q Later, one of them saw that the police, they were 19 20 The lady -- the cashier was not able to open the cash register. 21 22 Did they leave after they saw the police? Yes. 23 Α Did the police come inside the store? 24 Q 25 Α Yes.

And eventually, did you write a statement about 1 Q what happened? 2 3 Yes. Α Was that a one-page statement? 4 Q 5 Yes. Α Was that just a brief summary? 6 Q MR. SANFT: Objection, Your Honor, leading. 7 8 THE COURT: Overruled. She can answer. 9 THE WITNESS: Yes. BY MR. PESCI: 10 Let me ask it to you this way. Was anybody asking 11 Q you questions when you wrote your statement? 12 13 Α No. Ma'am, to your right, there is a screen. I'm going 14 to play a video. 15 MR. PESCI: With the Court's permission, if we can 16 17 switch over. 18 THE COURT: Sure. BY MR. PESCI: 19 And ask you if you recognize what we see in this 20 Q screen. Ma'am, do you recognize who's at the counter? 21 Yes. 23 Who is that? Q 24 Α Me. 25 Ma'am, why did you get down? Q

```
Because the person that was with the cashier is
 1
         Α
    telling me to get down.
 3
              Where's your purse, ma'am?
         Q
              I have it hanging on my left arm.
 4
         Α
 5
              On your left shoulder?
         Q
 6
              Yes.
         Α
              Ma'am, has your purse just been taken off the
         Q
 8
    floor?
 9
         Α
              Yes.
              You testified earlier that it was put inside of a
10
    bag; is that correct?
11
12
         Α
              Yes.
13
              Is that what we can see in the video now?
              Yes.
14
         Α
              Were you close to the person with the mask?
15
         Q
              Well, yes.
16
         Α
17
              Ma'am, what was in your purse?
         Q
              My phone, my money, my wallet, my bank cards,
18
         Α
    personal items, makeup, my car keys.
19
                          Thank you. We'll pass the witness.
20
              MR. PESCI:
                          Mr. Sanft, cross-examination?
21
              THE COURT:
              MR. SANFT: Yes, Your Honor.
23
                           CROSS-EXAMINATION
24
    BY MR. SANFT:
              Ms. Ojeda, your -- after your purse was taken, what
25
```

did you do? 1 2 I just stayed there, sitting. Α Did police at some point come into the store? 3 Q After they left, yes. 4 Α 5 Did you give a statement to police? Q 6 Yes, when I filled out that paper. Α What -- after you filled out the paper, did you 7 0 8 have anything else to do with the store? 9 Α No. Did police ever ask you or transport you to go and 10 Q 11 see any person? 12 Α No. So, after you filled out the paper, you haven't had 13 Q any more contact with police outside of being in court today? 14 15 Α No. 16 No further questions. MR. SANFT: 17 THE COURT: Mr. Parris? MR. PARRIS: No questions, Your Honor. 18 Any redirect? 19 THE COURT: No, thank you. 20 MR. PESCI: 21 Thank you very much for your testimony THE COURT: here today. You may step down. You are excused from your subpoena. You may call your next witness. 23 MR. PESCI: Thank you. The State calls Raymond 24

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

Wold. If we could switch over, and if I could approach the

25

```
clerk?
 1
 2
              THE COURT: Of course.
              THE MARSHAL: To your right, straight ahead.
 3
                                                             Thank
   you. Please step up into the witness stand, remain standing,
 4
 5
    raise your right hand, and face the clerk.
              THE CLERK: Please face -- thank you.
 6
 7
                 RAYMOND WOLD, STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN
 8
              THE CLERK:
                          Thank you. Please be seated. Could
   you please state your name and spell it for the record?
 9
              THE WITNESS: Raymond Leonard Wold. R-a-y-m-o-n-d,
10
11
    L., W-o-1-d.
                          Thank you.
12
              THE CLERK:
                         You may proceed.
13
              THE COURT:
14
              MR. PESCI:
                          Thank you, Judge.
15
                          DIRECT EXAMINATION
16
    BY MR. PESCI:
              Sir, on July the 9th of this year, did you go to
17
    the Family Dollar on East Lake Mead?
18
19
         Α
              Yes, I did.
              Between about 8:00 and 9:00 in the morning?
20
21
              Yes.
         Α
22
              What were you doing?
              I was having my car fixed next-door. Had an hour
23
   or so to kill, so I thought I'd go shopping there.
24
              What happened as you went to go shopping there?
25
         Q
```

There was a guy in a mask. I thought it was the manager or something playing a joke on somebody, but then he reached over, he grabbed the person by me, threw them on the floor, and held a gun to them, said, get your ass down there, and then I stepped out of the door and left. Okay. I want to show you State's Exhibit 49. Q you recognize that? Yes, I do. Α What do you recognize that to be? Q The Family Dollar Store. Α And focusing on Number 50 -- State's 50, is that Q the door area? Α Yes. Is much of the door area glass? 0

I opened the door and started to step inside.

- 19 A I opened the door. I was able to see inside.
- Q Showing you State's Exhibit 51, do you recognize this location just inside the door?

And based on that being glass, were you able to see

22 A Yes, I do.

Α

Q

inside?

Yes.

- Q So, as you approached the door and opened the door, were you able to see what it is that you've just described?
- 25 A Yes.

1

2

3

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

Α

- Q Okay. And tell me again what it is that you saw as far as a mask? Describe it, please.
- A Well, it was -- it was a Halloween type mask, I think kind of like a Predator movie type mask. Black and white type of thing, skull type.
- Q And you saw the person with the mask do what?
- A He was standing in front of me. First, when I went in, he just kind of stood there for a second, and then he grabbed the person by me and threw them on the floor.
- Q Okay. And then, based on that, did you realize this was not a joke?
- 12 | A Yes.

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

- Q And what did you do?
- A Well, the door wasn't quite shut. I slipped out the door and left.
- 16 Q Okay. Did police arrive?
- A Yes. When I went out in the parking lot, I started waving, trying to wave cars down and get some help, and I --
- 19 Q Did the police arrive?
- 20 A Well, after a few minutes, yeah.
- Q Okay. And when the police arrived -- at some point after they arrived, did you go and speak with them?
- 23 A Yes.
- Q Did you tell them what had occurred?
- 25 A Yes.

What you had seen? 1 Q Yes. Α 3 Q Okay. MR. PESCI: Court's indulgence. Pass the witness. 4 5 THE COURT: Cross, Mr. Sanft? 6 MR. SANFT: No cross, Your Honor. Thank you. 7 Mr. Parris? THE COURT: 8 MR. PARRIS: No questions, Your Honor. Thank you. 9 THE COURT: Thank you very much for your testimony here today, sir. You may step down. You're excused from 10 11 your subpoena. 12 THE WITNESS: Thank you. THE COURT: Thank you for being here. State may 13 14 call their next witness. MS. KILLER: The State calls Anthony Diaz. 15 Honor, may I approach the clerk to grab a photo? 16 17 THE COURT: Yes, of course. THE MARSHAL: And if you'll please step up into the 18 witness stand. Remain standing, raise your right hand, and 19 20 face the clerk, please. 21 ANTHONY DIAZ, STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN 22 THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated. Could you please state your name and spell it for the record? 23 24 THE WITNESS: Anthony Diaz. A-n-t-h-o-n-y, D-i-a-25 Z .

		120
1		THE CLERK: Thank you.
2		DIRECT EXAMINATION
3	BY MS. KI	LLER:
4	Q	Good afternoon, Mr. Diaz.
5	A	Good afternoon.
6	Q	On July 9th of 2015, were you a patrol officer with
7	the Las Ve	egas Metropolitan Police Department?
8	A	Yes, ma'am.
9	Q	And as of today, you're currently switching
10	agencies,	correct?
11	А	Yes, ma'am.
12	Q	And you're going to be working for another police
13	departmen ⁻	t soon?
14	А	Yes, ma'am.
15	Q	On July 9th, were you called and responded to an
16	incident [.]	that occurred at the Family Dollar at 4365 East Lake
17	Mead?	
18	А	Yes, ma'am.
19	Q	Is that here in Las Vegas, Clark County, Nevada?
20	A	Yes, ma'am.
21	Q	At the time, were you in a marked patrol car?
22	А	Yes, ma'am.
23	Q	And were you in uniform?
24	А	Yes, ma'am.
25	Q	Were you riding alone, or with a partner?

With a partner. 1 Α And that officer's name? 2 Officer Keith Parker. 3 Α Did you respond to a call under event number 4 Q 150709-1037? 5 6 Yes, ma'am. Α And was that at approximately 8:30 in the morning? Q Yes, ma'am. 8 Α 9 MS. KILLER: Your Honor, if I may approach the witness? 10 11 THE COURT: You may. 12 BY MS. KILLER: 13 Officer, I'm going to show you some photographs that are maps. I promise I won't make you explain them all, 14 but if you can just take a look, and then I'm going to ask 15 you one question about all of them. 16 17 MS. KILLER: And for the record, Your Honor, I showed State's Proposed 43 through 48. Counsel, it's the 18 19 maps. MR. SANFT: No objection, Your Honor. 20 21 No, Your Honor, none. MR. PARRIS: 22 THE COURT: Okay, they're admitted. (State's Exhibits 43 through 48 are admitted) 23 43 through 48? THE CLERK: 24 THE COURT: 25 Yes.

```
Thank you.
 1
              THE CLERK:
    BY MS. KILLER:
              Officer, let's go with this overview first for the
 3
    jury. The Family Dollar is located at the corner of Lamb and
 5
    Lake Mead, correct?
              Yes, ma'am.
 6
         Α
 7
              Okay. So, the east-west street we see up at the
         Q
 8
    top is Lake Mead Boulevard?
              Yes, ma'am.
 9
         Α
10
              And the north-south is Lamb?
         Q
11
              Yes, ma'am.
         Α
              The street that runs along the bottom of the map
12
    here from east to west, that looks like it's two streets.
13
    It's Tonopah, and is it Kell?
14
              Yes, ma'am.
15
         Α
              Okay. And in your work with Metro, are you
16
    familiar with this area generally?
17
18
         Α
              Yes, ma'am.
              And do all of the maps I showed you fairly and
19
20
    accurately depict the area?
              Yes, ma'am.
21
         Α
22
              For the record, that was State's 43. Let's see if
    I can get that all to fit on the screen. Okay. Showing you
23
24
    State's 44, a little bit narrower of an area, but the same
25
    photograph. Where we see the red marker here, that's the
```

- 1 Family Dollar Store, correct?
- 2 A Yes, ma'am.
- Q North of it, Lake Mead -- or, yeah, Lake Mead 4 again?
- 5 A Yes, ma'am.
- 6 Q And then, running north-south, Lamb?
- A Yes.
- Q Okay. I'm going to leave that up there to let you explain to help the jury follow along. When you responded to the call, what was your role?
- 11 A I was a backup officer.
- 12 Q And when you arrived, were other officers already
 13 pursuing the suspects?
- 14 A Yes, ma'am.
- 15 Q What did you see initially upon your arrival?
- A As I was traveling eastbound on Lake Mead towards
 Lamb, I see one of the suspects running southbound on Lamb,
 hop the wall, and go into the neighborhoods.
- Q And once he was in the neighborhood, I presume you momentarily lost sight of him?
- 21 A Yes, ma'am.
- 23 A I entered the neighborhoods right here.
- Q If you draw on the screen, it should make a mark.
- 25 A I'm sorry?

- Q If you touch the screen, it will make a mark or a line for us --
- 3 A Okay.

4

5

6

7

9

10

- Q -- that we can see on our screens. There we go.
 - A I entered here, made a right, went down here, and parked just before the little gate. Walked through the gate onto Kell Lane. We're looking for the suspect, at which point we see him hop the wall right here.
- Q And that's approximately three houses down, between the third and the fourth house?
- 11 A Approximately three houses down, yes.
- 12 Q At that point, did you take that suspect into 13 custody?
- 14 A Yes, ma'am.
- 15 Q Do you see that person here in the courtroom today?
- 16 A Yes, ma'am.
- Q Can you point to him and identify an article of clothing he is wearing?
- 19 A He's sitting right there with the gray shirt.
- 20 What color tie?
- 21 A A dark gray tie.
- MS. KILLER: Your Honor, can the record reflect the
- 23 identification of Defendant Parker?
- 24 THE COURT: So reflected.
- 25 BY MS. KILLER:

Now, Officer, you've kind of described for us where Q you had parked. Previously admitted State's 48. apologize, when -- I'm going to mess up your map. For the record, you had entered about midway through the houses, and then turned on Attleboro Street? Yes, ma'am. Α Okay, where you parked down at the end here? Q Yes, ma'am. Α Okay. Showing you State's 48, is the area we see that white truck where you had parked? Yes, ma'am. Α And then you described coming through a gate. where I'm pointing here in the middle of the photo near the edge of the --Α Yeah. -- not brick, not stone --Α That's the one. Q The block wall? That's the name. Yes, ma'am. Α MS. KILLER: Court's indulgence. No further questions. THE COURT: Any cross? MR. SANFT: No, Your Honor.

1

3

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

Officer, thank you very much for your

MR. PARRIS: No questions, Your Honor.

THE COURT:

testimony here today. You may step down. You're excused 1 2 from your subpoena. 3 THE WITNESS: Thank you. Thank you. You may call your next 4 THE COURT: 5 witness. 6 MR. PESCI: State calls Officer Donald Sutton. 7 DONALD SUTTON, STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN Thank you. Please be seated. Could 8 THE CLERK: 9 you state your name and spell it for the record? THE WITNESS: My name is Donald Sutton. It's 10 spelled D-o-n-a-l-d. Last name, Sutton, S-u-t-t-o-n. 11 12 Thank you. THE CLERK: THE COURT: You may proceed. 13 14 MR. PESCI: Thank you. 15 DIRECT EXAMINATION 16 BY MR. PESCI: 17 Sir, what do you do for a living? I'm a police officer with Metropolitan Police 18 Department. 19 How long have you been with Metro? 20 21 A year and one month. 22 Prior to being with Metro, what did you do for a 23 living? I was with North Las Vegas Police Department, and 24 the county marshals. 25

- 1 Q Have you worked actually in this building?
- 2 A I have.
- 3 Q As a marshal?
- 4 A I have.
- Okay. But focusing in on your time with Metro, I
- 6 | want to direct your attention to July the 9th of this year.
- 7 Did you respond to the Family Dollar located specifically at
- 8 4365 East Lake Mead?
- 9 A I responded to that call, but not directly to that 10 store.
- Q Good point, I'm sorry. The call originated from that address?
- 13 A Correct.
- Q Okay. Where did you respond to?
- A I responded to Tonopah and Lamb, just west of -- on Tonopah, to do -- basically, other officers were on scene. I was just there to help another officer.
- Q Okay. Had multiple officers been called to the scene?
- 20 A Yes.
- Q As subsequent officers like yourself arrive, are
- 22 | you given different responsibilities?
- 23 A Yes.
- Q What was your responsibility?
- A My responsibility was to do the show-up.

- Q What is a show-up?
- A A show-up is to grab the witnesses, take them to where the suspects are, not to where the witnesses are identified, but enough to where the witness can identify the suspect. I take them to each suspect, have them identify, take them to another if the case -- if it involves more than one person, and then I take them back to where they -- where I picked them up from originally.
- Q In this case, did you know if it involved more than one suspect?
- 11 A I did.

1

3

5

9

10

- 12 Q Did you do a show-up with more than one witness?
- 13 A I did.
- Q Did you take those witnesses separately?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q Let's start with the female, Keshaun Richardson.
- 17 Did you take her first, or the male first?
- 18 A I took the female first.
- Q All right. With Keshaun Richardson, did you take
- 20 her from the Family Dollar to the area where the suspects
- 21 | were?
- 22 A Yes, I did.
- Q Were the suspects in two separate locations?
- 24 A Yes, they were pretty far apart.
- 25 Q Okay. Did you take Ms. Richardson to the first

suspect? 1

4

- 2 Yes. Α
- Now, when you do a show-up, is there an instruction 3 Q
- -- or are there instructions that you give to the individual? 5 We have actually a show-up sheet that we were
- mandatory to have, and we have to read the instructions 6
- 7 before we take them to identify the suspect.
- MR. PESCI: May I approach? 8
- 9 You may. THE COURT:
- 10 BY MR. PESCI:
- I'm showing you what has not been marked, but has 11 Q
- been shown to defense counsel. Do you recognize what this 12
- 13 is?

20

- Yes, that is a show-up. 14 Α
- And do you recognize it being associated with this 15 Q 16 particular case?
- 17 Α I do.
- 18 How do you know it's associated with this case? Q
- Because one of the names is Keshaun Richardson, and 19 I remember doing this page myself, filling it out.
- 21 Q Okay. So, is the handwriting on some of this page
- your handwriting?
- Yeah, some of it's mine, and some of it's my field 23 training officer's handwriting. 24
- And then, there's a middle section where it's 25 Q

entitled "Statement." Is there handwriting there that's not yours or your field training officer's?

A Where it says "Statement," that handwriting is not mine. That's going to be the witness that writes in that section.

- Q Did you ask her to write some information down after this show-up was done?
 - A Yes, I did.
- Q Okay. Now, on this show-up, is -- are the instructions listed on the show-up?
- 11 A Yes, it is.
- 12 Q All right. Did you give those instructions to Ms.
- 13 Richardson before you went to the location of suspect number
- 14 1?

19

22

23

24

25

3

5

6

8

10

- 15 A Yes, we did it at the Family Dollar.
- Q All right. Just so it's really clear, when you grabbed her, you didn't say, hey, we got them, we want you to come pick them out?
 - A I'm sorry, say that again.
- Q Did you say to her when you first picked her up, 21 hey, we got him, we just want you to come pick him out?
 - A Pretty much. I mean, I don't know if I used those exact words, but we have people in custody right now; we need to take you down there to make sure this is the person or it's not the person, basically.

A It's more detailed than that, but yes. And very
vague, that's kind of what it means.

That it could be the person?

A Yes.

Clearly, it's someone that you think might be

Okay. Those are the instructions that you give --

- 7 involved, because that's why the person was stopped? 8 A Absolutely.
 - Q But when you give the instructions, the instructions indicate that it may or may not be the person?
- 11 A Correct.

Q

1

9

10

- Q And it's just as important to say if it's not the person than to say that it is the person?
- 14 A Correct.
- 15 Q Did you read those instructions verbatim to her?
- 16 A Verbatim.
- Q Okay. After reading the instructions, did you bring her to the location?
- 19 A I did, yeah.
- 20 And then, does she remain in the vehicle?
- 21 A She did.
- 22 | Q Meaning your car?
- 23 A Correct.
- 24 Q Is that a marked police vehicle?
- 25 A Correct.

- Q And do you do it in such a way that the individual in your car is not going to be seen by the individual that's the focus of the show-up?
- A Yes.

1

3

4

6

8

9

15

16

17

19

20

21

- Q And that's what you did and the procedure in this situation?
- 7 A I did.
 - Q Okay. When you got to that location, was she able to make an identification?
- 10 A Yes, she did, right away.
- 11 Q Did she tell you how sure she was?
- 12 A Yes. She said 100 percent.
- Q Okay. Did you then take her -- or did she ask to have the individual moved at all, do you recall?
 - A No, we move the individual. We do a front shot, and then we do side shots. So, we -- we most likely -- I don't remember the event 100 percent right now, but --
- 18 Q Okay.
 - A -- the -- we normally take the suspect or the person that's in custody, and we face them towards the vehicle, and then we do side to side.
- Q Okay. Did you then go to a -- or take Ms.
- 23 Richardson to the second individual?
- 24 A Yes, I did.
- 25 Q Did you follow the same procedure?

- 1 The exact same. Α 2 Did she remain in the car? Okay. Q 3 Yes. Α Was she able to identify that person? 4 Q 5 Yes. Α 6 Did she say how sure she was? Q 7 She didn't give a percentage on that. And on her Α statement, I believe there was no percentage; she just was 8 able to identify him. 9 Okay. Now, did you bring her back to the Family 10 Q 11 Dollar? I did. 12 Α 13 Did you get a male to go with you? Q 14 Yes. Α Does Chad Williams ring a bell? 15 Q 16 It does. Α May I approach the witness? 17 MR. PESCI: 18 You may. THE COURT:
- 20 BY MR. PESCI:

19

21 Q Showing you what's not been marked, but what has 22 been shown to defense counsel and provided to them, do you 23 recognize this?

Thank you.

- 24 A I do.
- Q And what is that?

MR. PESCI:

- A That's another show-up with Chad Williams, the witness.

 Q Did you follow the same procedure with Mr. Will
 - Q Did you follow the same procedure with Mr. Williams that you did with Ms. Richardson?
- 5 A The same exact one.
- Q Was Mr. Williams able to identify the first suspect that you went to?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q Was the first suspect with Mr. Williams the same 10 first suspect with Ms. Richardson?
- 11 A Yes, it was.
- 12 Q In the same order?
- 13 A Yep.
- 14 Q And was Mr. Williams able to identify the second?
- 15 A Yes.
- Q Okay. The two suspects, number 1 and 2, for lack
 of better terms, that were out in the focus of this show-up,
 are they here in court?
- 19 A They are.
- Q Could you point to them and describe something they're wearing, please?
- A A light blue-gray shirt and pants, and the second gentleman over here was -- looks like a -- like a gray shirt.
- MR. PESCI: May the record reflect identification of the defendants, Your Honor?

THE COURT: So reflected. 1 2 BY MR. PESCI: 3 After you were done with Mr. Williams, did you Q bring him back to Family Dollar? 5 I did. Α And when you dropped off Mr. Williams, what was 6 your responsibility after that? 8 I don't recall. Okay. Do you remember having any real involvement 9 after that? 10 No. I went back over to where I first initially 11 Α went, and I believe I helped an officer with a witness 12 13 statement. MR. PESCI: Okay. We'll pass the witness, Your 14 15 Honor. THE COURT: Mr. Sanft? 16 17 CROSS-EXAMINATION 18 BY MR. SANFT: Officer Sutton, your testimony is that you've been 19 Q with Metro for a year and a month so far? 20 21 A year and one month, sir. Α Okay. So, at the time when this event occurred, 22 how long had you been with Metro? 23 At least -- that was my second [inaudible]. At 24 least four to six weeks. I'm not sure. 25

Now, your testimony was that prior to working for 1 Q Metro, you worked for the county as a marshal here or a 3 bailiff here? 4 Α Yes. 5 And prior to that, you worked for North Las 0 6 Vegas? 7 Yes. Α Was that as a patrol officer as well? 8 Q 9 Yes, as a police officer. Α Okay. Now, when you were working and starting with 10 Q Las Vegas Metro -- no, North Las Vegas Police Department 11 [inaudible]? 12 13 Yeah. NLVPD. It doesn't matter, it's all the 14 same. All right. When you were working for North Las 15 Q 16 Vegas, did you have to go through an academy? 17 I did. Α And I'm sure in the academy, they trained you on 18 Q how to be a police officer in North Las Vegas; is that 19 20 correct? 21 Α Correct. 22 When you graduated from that academy, did you graduate with any other police officers from any other 23 jurisdiction; meaning like Las Vegas, or Las Vegas Marshals, 24 25 or --

A Yes. The first academy I went through had Henderson Police Department school police, and a couple non-affiliates, which is people that just want to go through an academy so they have a -- kind of like a degree, and then they go test for other agencies.

- Q How long had you been working for North Las Vegas?
- A I worked for about a year there.
- Q And then, after that, you switched over to becoming a bailiff here?
- 10 A Correct.

1

2

3

5

6

8

9

18

19

20

21

- 11 Q Now, when you were with North Las Vegas, how many 12 times were you required to do a show-up?
- 13 A It was seven years ago. I honestly couldn't 14 remember. I would say maybe a handful that I can remember.
- Q All right. And then, when you were working as a bailiff, did you ever do a show-up as a bailiff?
- 17 A I did not.
 - Q All right. Now, when you were working for Metropolitan Police Department, up until the time that you did this particular show-up, how many show-ups had you had done up until that point?
- 22 A That was my first one.
- Q Now, when you were in the academy, were you ever taught or trained on how to do a show-up?
- 25 A Yes, we were.

Q Can you explain to this jury why a show-up is -- the way you were trained, why that would be important?

A It's important for us to know the process through the whole thing, and the reason why we have the sheet of paper is so we don't miss any steps. We literally read it from top to bottom before we take the witness over to the suspect. That way, they know if the suspect's not -- or the person in custody is not the suspect, that we take them right back, we make sure that we document that it's not the person in custody who's involved, and that's pretty much what a show-up is. It's just to identify if that's the person involved in this crime.

Q Okay. Now, would it be fair to say, in speaking with this jury and educating this jury as to what that means, you're also trying to preserve the -- well, let me put it this way. You're not -- you're trying to make sure that the person has not been influenced in any way by anything that you might have said or anything along those lines; would that be fair to say as well?

A Absolutely. That's why we read it verbatim.

Q Okay. Did you at any point prior to either the first person or second person you took to show-ups, did you ever talk to them while they're in the vehicle as you're transporting them to the location of either suspect?

A Maybe when -- right -- not initially at the first

part of the drive over there, but as we pulled in, I basically said, okay, we're going to turn the vehicle this way so you can identify who he is. And then I get on the radio, advise that officer to pull him out of the vehicle, and do the show-up.

Q Okay. Now, as you're driving to that location, once again, what you're trying to do is preserve the person from being influenced by anything; is that correct?

A That's correct.

Q So that when the person arrives on the scene, the only thing they're going to be able to do is look at a potential suspect and say whether or not they recognize that person, right?

A Yes.

2

3

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

20

23

24

Q Okay. Do you turn off your car radio?

A Yes, everything is silent.

17 Q I'm sorry?

18 A Everything -- I don't turn off -- I have an 19 earpiece.

Q Okay.

A So, I hear the other officers in my ear. The radio in the car is not on.

Q All right. Is that part of your training and experience is to turn off the car radio?

25 A It is.

Q And when I say car radio, I'm not talking about the radio for a radio station, right?

A Right. You're talking about the police radio that we have in all of our vehicles.

Q Okay. Now, as you were going to that location, how did you learn of the location to take the -- or take the person to the -- to wherever the suspect was located? Was that through your ear?

A I knew that the first part we were going to go to was where I've already been. And then, when I went to the Family Dollar, there was an officer there that said they had a second person of interest in the crime at another location.

Q Okay. Now, when you read this particular item to -- the instructions --

A Uh-huh.

Q -- when do you read those items? Do you read the item before you take the person to the location, or when you roll up to the location, you give the person the piece of paper to read -- or read to the person?

A We basically say, we're, you know, getting in the car, we're going to -- we're going to go ahead and say, do you want to try to identify who these people are? And they say yes, and then say, okay, well, we got to put you in the vehicle. And then, once we put them in the vehicle, I turn around, read the instructions off the piece of paper, make

sure they understand, and then drive pretty much over to the location.

Q And your testimony is, on both of those occasions, you're driving in silence between -- after the time you read the instructions to both of these individuals to the time of arrival on the scene to identify the suspects?

A Absolutely. There's silence in the vehicle, but not silence on my ear.

9 MR. SANFT: Okay. No further questions, Your 10 Honor.

THE COURT: Mr. Sanft -- I'm sorry, Mr. Parris?

12 Sorry.

MR. PARRIS: No worries, Your Honor.

14 THE COURT: Sorry.

MR. PARRIS: His hair is back in a ponytail. It's hard to tell us apart.

17 MR. SANFT: That's not an insult.

18 MR. PARRIS: A lot of people confuse us.

19 CROSS-EXAMINATION

20 BY MR. PARRIS:

21

23

24

25

2

3

5

6

7

8

Q Officer Sutton, we're using the term "show-up lineup." And many times when we hear the word "lineup," we kind of visualize like the beginning of the usual suspects, you know, when there's five people in a room and a person is selecting between them. That's not what happened in this

I have not mentioned anything about a lineup 2 3 whatsoever. 4

MR. PESCI: Nor the State.

THE WITNESS: I've only used the word "show-up."

MR. PARRIS: All right.

BY MR. PARRIS:

case, correct?

1

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

25

So, for this witness identification, when this Q identification occurs, the person of interest, as you had referenced, you had indicated that when you pull up to the site where that person's located, that you radio another officer to take that person out of a vehicle, correct?

Α Yes.

So -- and that's what happened in this case for both of the -- both of the identifications for both of the witnesses, correct?

Α Yes.

So, when you pulled up with the female, you pulled Q up to -- was it a parking lot, or was it a desert area?

It's on the corner of Tonopah and Lamb. Α

Okay. So, when you pulled up to the vicinity, Q approximately how far away from -- was your car or your vehicle from the vehicle containing the person of interest?

I'm not a -- I'm not a professional at measurements. I don't know, I can't recall.

Q Okay. Well, was it -- I'm currently standing at the back door of the courtroom. Was it closer or further away than where I am right now?

A I'd have to say it's roughly about that, if not a little bit further. Maybe a few feet.

Q So, I'm currently standing in the vestibule area in the middle of it. Is this ballpark, right about where you -- the distance, as best as you remember?

A Best as I remember, it's pretty ballpark. If not, like I said, maybe a couple feet further. We don't like to obviously put them close, because we don't want the person in custody to identify who is in our vehicle. But as our patrol vehicles do, we do have tinted windows.

Q Okay.

A So, most likely, they're not going to see who the witness is.

Q So, again, approximation from where you're sitting, the person of interest is located somewhere between this first door of the courtroom and the door to the hallway; is that fair to say?

A Sounds fair.

Q Okay. So, when you arrive on scene, you radio to have the person of interest taken out of that police car, correct?

25 A Correct.

- Q And as it happened in this particular situation, that person -- or each of those people when they were taken out of the cars was in handcuffs, correct?
- A Yes.

3

4

5

12

13

14

15

- Q Okay. Or restrained in some way, correct?
- 6 A Yes.
- Q Okay. And I would assume then that they were in close proximity to one or more officers; is that fair to say as well?
- 10 A I wouldn't say any more than two.
- 11 Q Okay, so --
 - A Just for the sole purpose of -- we do that for the sole purpose of not bombarding them with police officers so they're not automatically found like that's a guilty person, so we don't have too many officers around.
- Q Okay. So, it's one person in handcuffs generally 17 well, in this case, were they flanked by an officer on
 18 either side?
- A Normally -- no, it's just one. And then, normally, there's an officer nearby.
- Q Okay. So, there would be a person who -- the
 person of interest would be in close proximity to a uniformed
 officer, correct?
- 24 A Yes.
- 25 Q And then there would be another officer somewhere

in the vicinity also, correct? 1 2

Correct, around the car somewhere. Α

And there would be no other, for lack of a better Q term, civilians or plain clothes individuals other than the person of interest; is that fair to say?

I don't remember that far back, but I don't remember a lot of people being right on scene at that point.

Okay. And that was true for both identifications Q for both individuals, correct?

Α Correct.

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

24

Same procedure. The person's in the car when you Q pull up -- the person of interest is in the other vehicle when you pull up, and they come out, flanked by an officer, with another officer somewhere nearby, correct?

Yes, yes. Α

MR. PARRIS: Your Honor, I have nothing further. 16 17 Thank you.

18 THE COURT: Any redirect?

Yes, please. Can I approach? 19 MR. PESCI:

20 THE COURT: You may.

21 MR. PESCI: Thanks.

22 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

23 BY MR. PESCI:

Keeping in mind the questions about the distance, Q I'd like to show you the copies of the show-up again and ask 25

- 1 | you if you write down the time when this occurred?
- 2 A Yes. 09:00 on one, and 09:20 on the other.
- 3 Q So, is that A.M.?
- 4 A That is A.M.
- 5 Q That was here in Las Vegas in July?
- 6 A It was an extremely sunny, beautiful, hot day out.
- Q You beat me to it. So, was there any difficulty seeing even this far on a --
- 9 A No.
- 10 Q -- summer morning in Las Vegas?
- A No. It might as well have been a spotlight because it was so bright outside.
- 13 MR. PESCI: Thank you. Nothing further.
- 14 THE COURT: Mr. Sanft?
- MR. SANFT: Nothing further, Your Honor.
- 16 THE COURT: Mr. Parris?
- MR. PARRIS: No follow up, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Thank you very much for your testimony
- 19 here today. You may step down. You're excused from your
- 20 subpoena.
- 21 THE WITNESS: Thank you, Judge.
- 22 THE COURT: Thank you for being here. You may call
- 23 | your next witness.
- MR. PESCI: State calls Chad Embry. May I approach
- 25 | your clerk?

1	THE COIDT. Vol. mark	
	THE COURT: You may.	
2	THE MARSHAL: If you'll please step up in the	
3	witness stand, remain standing, raise your right hand, and	
4	face the clerk.	
5	CHAD EMBRY, STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN	
6	THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated. Could	
7	you please state your name and spell it for the record?	
8	THE WITNESS: Chad Embry. C-h-a-d, E-m-b-r-y.	
9	THE CLERK: Thank you, sir.	
10	DIRECT EXAMINATION	
11	BY MR. PESCI:	
12	Q What do you do for a living?	
13	A I'm a detective with Las Vegas Metro Police	
14	Department.	
15	Q How long have you been with Metro?	
16	A For 16 years.	
17	Q Are you assigned to a particular division within	
18	Metro?	
19	A I am, the Northeast Area Command.	
20	Q Back in July, specifically July the 9th of 2015,	
21	were you assigned to that area command?	
22	A I was assigned to a robbery.	
23	Q Okay. And as you were assigned to robbery, were	
24	you asked to respond to the Family Dollar on East Lake Mead?	
25	A Yes.	

- 1 Q Specifically, 4365 East Lake Mead?
- 2 A Yes.

5

6

8

13

14

- 3 Q What was your responsibility at that scene?
 - A To photograph evidence located from a robbery that occurred at the Family Dollar.
 - Q Now, this jury has heard from some crime scene analysts in this particular case. Normally, will crime scene analysts take some photographs?
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q However, as officers and detectives, are you 11 allowed to take photographs as well?
- 12 A Correct.
 - Q Sometimes are there many calls at the same time which may utilize the resources of crime scene analysts?
- 15 A Correct.
- Q Do you recall at this particular time if the crime scene analysts were called to a different location?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q Based on that, did you yourself take some 20 photographs?
- 21 A I did.
- 22 MR. PESCI: May I approach the witness?
- THE COURT: You may.
- 24 BY MR. PESCI:
- 25 Q Showing you State's Proposed Exhibits 67 through

```
84, why don't you peruse through those. Detective, looking
    through 67 through 84, do you recognize those photos?
 3
              Yes.
         Α
              When you responded to this scene, did you document
 4
         Q
 5
   the scene both at the Family Dollar and in the neighborhood
 6
    around the Family Dollar?
         Α
              Yes.
              Do these photographs capture those items of
 8
         Q
 9
    interest and the locations?
10
         Α
              Yes.
              Are they fair and accurate depictions of those
11
    locations and those items?
12
13
         Α
              Yes.
              MR. PESCI: Move for the admission, Your Honor, of
14
    67 through 84.
15
                         No objection, Your Honor.
16
              MR. SANFT:
17
              MR. PARRIS: No objection, Your Honor.
                          They're admitted.
18
              THE COURT:
             (State's Exhibits 67 through 84 are admitted)
19
                          Thank you, Your Honor.
20
              MR. PESCI:
21
                          67 through 84.
              THE COURT:
22
              THE CLERK: Thank you, Your Honor.
23
   BY MR. PESCI:
              And then I want to ask you to look at 62 through
24
   66. Do you recognize 62 through 66?
25
```

```
I recognize that as the area to the rear of the
 1
         Α
 2
    Family Dollar.
              All right. Did you take these pictures?
 3
 4
              I don't believe I did.
 5
              Okay. Do you recognize this, however, as being the
 6
    area that you responded to?
         Α
              Correct.
 8
              And are they fair and accurate depictions?
         Q
 9
              Yes.
         Α
                         Move for the admission of 62, 3, and 4.
10
              MR. PESCI:
                          Any objection?
11
              THE COURT:
                          No objection, Your Honor.
12
              MR. SANFT:
13
              MR. PARRIS: No objection, Your Honor.
                          They're admitted.
14
              THE COURT:
             (State's Exhibit 62, 63, and 64 are admitted)
15
                          And 66?
16
              THE CLERK:
                          66 I'm going to ask a question about.
17
              MR. PESCI:
18
    BY MR. PESCI:
              So, Detective, as you look at 66, do you recognize
19
20
    what's depicted in 66?
21
         Α
              I do not.
22
              Okay.
              MR. PESCI: So, I'm going to bring that one back to
23
    the clerk.
24
25
              THE CLERK:
                          Thank you.
```

1 MR. PESCI: Thank you. 2 BY MR. PESCI: Detective, I want to show you State's 67. Why did 3 Q you take this picture? 4 5 I'm sorry, I didn't hear you. Why did you take -- why were this pictures taken? 6 7 Α This is documenting the inside of the business as you step through their front door, looking directly at the 8 9 merchant's counter. And on the ground, is there something that appears 10 to be black next to some gum? 11 12 Α Yes. Showing you 68, is that a close-up of what those 13 items were on the floor? 14 15 Α Yes. 16 And what were those items on the floor? Q 17 They were pants that were from inside the business. Α And leaving the inside of the business and going to 18 Q the outside, did you take some photographs of items outside? 19 20 Α Yes. 21 Were you briefed when you got to the scene? Q I was. 22 And was there information that you had obtained 23

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

from that briefing that certain items of personal property

had been taken and/or seen with the suspects?

24

25

- 1 A Correct.
- Q Showing you Exhibit 69, what do you recognize that to be?
- A That was a black backpack that was located to the rear of the business.
- Q And in 70, are we looking at that particular backpack?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q Did that backpack have something inside of it?
- 10 A Yes, it had a black purse inside.
- 11 Q Are we seeing that right now as we look at State's
- 12 70?
- A Correct. The backpack is unzipped, and you can see the black purse inside of the backpack.
- 15 Q Did you remove the purse from the backpack?
- 16 A Yes.
- Q Looking at State's 71, is that the purse now out of the backpack, and the backpack is the main focus of the
- 19 photo?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q Did you photograph the purse as depicted in 72?
- 22 A Yes.
- Q And are you aware that this was returned to one of the victims inside the establishment?
- 25 A I was, yes.

- Q So, that's -- that's somebody's purse that was stolen that was found in the desert area behind the Family Dollar?
- A Yes.

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

- Q Okay. Now, leaving the immediate area of the Family Dollar, did you also go into the surrounding neighborhood to document some items that were found?
- A Yes.
- Q Looking at State's Exhibit 73, did you take a photograph of the cross-streets to be able to orient where some of these items were found?
- 12 A I did.
- Q Specifically, this is the cross-street of Provincetown and Lamb; is that correct?
- 15 A Yes.
- Q Showing you Exhibit 74, what was that a photograph of?
- A This is a photograph of the wall that runs north-south on Lamb, just south of that intersection.
- Q And is there a particular item that you're trying to document with this photograph?
- 22 A Yeah, there's a blue hat against the wall.
- Q Were you able to take a close-up shot of that?
- 24 A Yes.
- 25 Q Looking at State's 75, do you recognize that?

- Yes, that's the blue hat against the wall. 1 Α
- Is that a Lions hat?
- Correct, Detroit Lions. 3 Α
- 4 Does it have a sticker on the brim? 0
- 5 Yes. Α
- 6 And even kind of a black corner or diamond shape on Q the brim as well?
- 8 Yes. Α
- Showing you State's 76, did you take another 9 photograph to try to, again, orient to where you were? 10
- 11 Α I did.
- Is that a picture of the Tonopah Lamb Apartments? 12 Q
- 13 Yes. Α
- In the area of 4250 East Tonopah? 14 0
- 15 Α Correct.
- That's in State's 76. Looking at 77, was there an 16 Q 17 item in the area -- it seems to be that these apartments have kind of a wrought iron gate? 18
- Α

Yes.

19

- Showing you 77, do we know we're in the same area 20
- 21 based on the gate?
- Yes.
- And then what do we have next to the gate? 23 Q
- That's going to be a black beanie. 24 Α
- 25 Q Were some other items found also in the

- neighborhood surrounding the Family Dollar?
- 2 A Yes.
- Q Specifically, State's 78, was there a glove that 4 was found?
- 5 A Yeah, there was a leather work type glove.
- Q Speaking of gloves, were there some other gloves
 also found? Showing you State's 79, do you recognize that?
 - A Yes.

- 9 Q And what are those?
- 10 A Those were gloves that were located on one of the 11 suspects, removed from one of the suspects, that were placed 12 on the patrol hood that I documented.
- Q So, as we see that white background, that's actually a patrol hood?
- 15 A Correct.
- 16 Q There's a little bit of black here on the side 17 showing from the car?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q Okay. And then, State's Exhibit 80, do you 20 recognize that?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q Again, you had information based on the briefing 23 and contact with the victims about the clothing of the 24 suspects?
- 25 A Yes.

- Q Were you able to see the surveillance?
- 2 A Briefly.

9

14

15

16

- Q Okay. And based on seeing that, was this shirt of 4 interest to you?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 Q Showing you State's 81, do you recognize that?
 - A Yes. It's a white and blue plaid shirt located next to -- I forget the exact numbers on the residence; next to a house.
- Q Okay. That's the -- State's 81 is the same as in

 State's 80; it's just been removed from the side of the house

 by the water spigot?
- 13 A Correct.
 - Q And then, showing you State's Exhibit 82, did you again take a picture showing some cross-streets to be able to orient us as to where you were?
- 17 A Yes, I did.
- 18 Q What were the cross-streets?
- 19 A Attleboro and Hinsdale.
- Q And in that area, looking at State's 83, was something of interest found in front of a house there?
- A Yes. To the west of the house is a black Punisher style mask that was located in the rocks.
- Q And then did you take a close-up of that --
- 25 A Yes.

- Q -- depicted in State's 84?
- A Correct.

3

5

8

9

- Q Okay. Now, those are items that were found in the neighborhood or surrounding the south area of the Family Dollar; is that correct?
- 6 A Yes.
 - Q And as we look at State's Exhibit 62, is that taken from the back of the Family Dollar, looking south across the desert area to that neighborhood?
- A Yes, that's toward -- this is kind of towards the southeast direction from the rear of the business.
- Q All right. And let's -- let's move maybe a little
 more exactly south in State's 63. Is that what we're looking
 at here?
- 15 A Yes.
- Q And then, moving in somewhat of a southwest direction, in State's 64, do you see that?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q Is that block wall very large?
- 20 A In height?
- 21 Q Yes.
- 22 A I believe it's under six-foot.
- Q Okay. And then is there a break in that wall to be able to have ingress and egress?
- 25 A Yes, there is.

1	Q	And that's depicted in this photograph?
2	А	Yes.
3	Q	And the items that we saw earlier came from
4		MR. PESCI: Bless you.
5		THE COURT: Thank you. I'm sorry.
6	BY MR. PE	SCI:
7	Q	Came from the area of these houses to the south of
8	the Famil	y Dollar?
9	А	Yes.
10		MR. PESCI: Court's indulgence. Pass the witness.
11		THE COURT: Cross-examination, Mr. Sanft?
12		MR. SANFT: No cross, Your Honor.
13		THE COURT: Mr. Parris?
14		MR. PARRIS: No questions, Your Honor.
15		THE COURT: Thank you very much for your testimony
16	here toda	У•
17		THE WITNESS: Thank you.
18		THE COURT: You may step down. You're excused from
19	your subp	oena. The State may call their next witness.
20		MS. KILLER: The State calls Sean Hubbard.
21		THE MARSHAL: Please step up in the witness stand,
22	remain st	anding, raise your right hand, and face the clerk.
23		SEAN HUBBARD, STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN
24		THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated. Could
25	you pleas	e state your name and spell it for the record?

```
THE WITNESS: It's Detective Sean Hubbard.
 1
 2
    n, H-u-b-b-a-r-d.
 3
              THE CLERK:
                           Thank you.
              MS. KILLER: And I apologize, Your Honor, I'm just
 4
 5
    grabbing one more exhibit.
 6
                         Okay, fine.
              THE COURT:
 7
                           DIRECT EXAMINATION
    BY MS. KILLER:
 8
              Detective Hubbard, how long have you been -- let me
 9
         Q
    ask it this way. Are you employed with the Las Vegas
10
    Metropolitan Police Department?
11
12
              Yes, I am.
         Α
              How long have you been so employed?
13
         Q
              Almost 15 years.
14
         Α
              And how long have you been a detective?
15
         Q
              Gosh, a little over seven.
16
         Α
17
              On July 9th of 2015, were you working as a
         Q
18
    detective with Metro?
19
         Α
              Yes, I was.
20
              In what division?
21
              I was in the robbery section.
         Α
22
              And on that day, were you asked to respond to a
    call at 4365 East Lake Mead Boulevard here in Las Vegas,
23
24
    Clark County, Nevada?
25
         Α
              Yes, I was.
```

- 1 Q And was that the location of a Family Dollar Store?
- 2 A Yes, it is.
- 3 Q And did you respond under event 150709-1037?
- 4 A Yes.
- Q Showing you what's been previously admitted as State's Exhibit 57, is that the Family Dollar Store you responded to?
- 8 A Yes, it is.
- 9 Q And showing you State's 58, is that same store,
 10 just a little further down on the sidewalk?
- 11 A Yeah, that's the west -- the west side of the 12 business.
- Q Okay. And behind it on the right edge of the photograph -- if you point and touch the screen, it will draw a line. Is there a wall that leads to a housing development?
- 16 A Yes, it's right here.
- 17 | Q Showing you State's 43 --
- 18 MS. KILLER: Can you clear it? I'm sorry.
- 19 BY MS. KILLER:
- Q Where that orange or red dot is, is that the Family
- 21 | Dollar Store?
- 22 A Yes, it is.
- Q Okay. And the houses we see to the south of it, is that the same development we were just looking at from the
- 25 Family Dollar parking lot in the last photo?

A Yes, it is.

1

3

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

- Q As part of your duties in responding to this call, did you follow along in the area where the suspects had been pursued and recover items related to the robbery?
 - A Yes, myself and Detective Chad Embry did.
- Q And when you did so, was Detective Embry with you taking photographs?
 - A Yes, he was.
- Q Before you went looking for this evidence, were you briefed by other officers and detectives who had responded before you?
- A Yes, we had a briefing out in the parking lot to discuss what had happened inside the business, and then the direction of travel of the suspects.
- Q Without telling us specifically what was said, the information you gained from that briefing, did you use it to locate these items?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q Okay.
- MS. KILLER: Court's indulgence. Sorry, too many photographs, not enough desk space.
- 22 BY MS. KILLER:
- Q I don't have a map with all the street names

 24 showing, but generally, when you were recovering the items,

 25 did you go through the desert area south of the store, and

then within these houses on these side streets that we see here?

A Yes, there's an opening in the wall that would be the north wall of that residential area, and you can cross through, and it -- yeah, there we are. There's an opening in that wall, and you can cross, heading southbound through the residential complex. I think it's -- Attleboro is the name of the street.

- Q This street here on --
- 10 A Yes.

2

3

5

6

8

9

13

14

15

16

- 11 Q -- State's 43?
- 12 A Yes.
 - Q And for the record, the previously shown photo, including the hole in the wall, is 64. So, you went through the break in the wall and went along through the housing development and were able to recover these items?
- 17 A Yes.
- Q Okay. Let's start with the backpack. In the dirt area to the -- correct me if I'm wrong -- south and/or west of the store --
- 21 A Yes.
- 23 A Yes.
- MS. KILLER: And Your Honor, may I approach?
- THE COURT: You may.

```
MS. KILLER: I think it was previously admitted,
 1
 2
    but just to be safe --
 3
                          What number is it?
              THE COURT:
 4
              MS. KILLER:
                            69.
 5
              THE COURT:
                         Has 69 been admitted?
                          I don't believe so.
 6
              THE CLERK:
 7
              THE COURT:
                          No.
                          It has been admitted. I'm sorry.
 8
              THE CLERK:
 9
                           Oh, it has.
              THE COURT:
10
              MS. KILLER:
                          It has? Okay.
11
              THE CLERK:
                           Sorry.
                          So, you can publish.
12
              THE COURT:
              MS. KILLER: That's okay. Permission to publish
13
14
    then?
              THE COURT:
15
                          You may.
16
                            Thank you.
              MS. KILLER:
17
    BY MS. KILLER:
              Detective Hubbard, is that -- does this photograph
18
         Q
    reflect where you found the bag, and is that the bag you
19
20
    found?
21
         Α
              Yes.
22
              And inside the bag, did you also locate another
23
    item?
24
         Α
              Yes.
25
              Showing you State's 70, does that picture show what
         Q
```

- 1 | was inside the bag?
- 2 A Yes. The bag's open, and that was inside the bag,
- 3 yes.
- 4 Q And is that a black purse?
- 5 A Yes, it is.
- 6 Q Okay. Showing you 72, the contents of the purse?
- 7 A Yes.
- 8 Q Okay. And that purse was returned to the victim --
- 9 A Yes, it was.
- 10 Q -- it was taken from, correct? 71, is that the
- 11 outside of the backpack?
- 12 | A Yes.
- Q And I think we kind of see the purse in the lower right corner?
- 15 A Correct.
- 16 Q Showing you State's 74, it's a little hard to see
- 17 on the screen, so let me zoom-in. Did you locate a blue
- 18 baseball cap in the area of -- in the area near Lamb, just
- 19 | south of Providence?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q And is that a photo of where that cap was located?
- 22 A Yes, it is.
- Q That wall we're seeing, is that the retaining wall
- 24 or the border wall of the housing development?
- 25 A Yeah, it's the west retaining wall facing Lamb from

- l that housing development.
- 2 Q And Providence is the entry street to the 3 development?
- A Yes, it's the main entrance right here, and then it was just to the south of that.
- 6 Q 73 is just a photo of that intersection, correct?
- A Yes.
- 8 Q Showing 75, is that where the cap was located when 9 you found it?
- 10 A Yes, it is.
- MS. KILLER: Court's indulgence. We'll skip that
 one because we went over it already.
- 13 BY MS. KILLER:
- Q Was there also a black beanie located along one of the fences?
- 16 A I'm sorry?
- Q Was there also a black beanie located along one of the fences?
- 19 A I believe that was off of Tonopah and Lamb.
- Q Tonopah and Lamb? And Tonopah is the street south
 of the housing development, correct?
- 22 A Yes. It runs east-west, and it intersects Lamb.
- Q Right here?
- A Yeah, it's right here. Yep, and turns into Kell as it extends across Lamb.

- Q And I got us a little bit out of order, but State's 2 78, is that a photo of a leather work glove?
 - A Yes, it is.
- Q And that was also located in the area of Lamb and Provincetown, correct?
- A Yeah, that's in the bushes along that border wall on Lamb, and there's Provincetown right here.
- 10 A Yes.

20

21

- Q State's 80, is that a photograph of where the shirt was and how it appeared when you found it?
- 13 A Yes.
- Q And you found that in the area of -- is it Raynham,
 15 or?
- A I think that's how it's pronounced. It was in the

 -- on the side yard on the west -- the west side of the

 house.
- 19 Q Okay. And that is one of the housing streets --
 - A Yeah, I think it's the second one -- the second one south. It's the first one north of Provincetown, and it was in the -- on the west wall on the side yard of the residence.
- Q And if you could just draw a line on the screen for the --
- 25 A Without the thing --

- 1 Q -- in the general area.
- 2 A I believe it was right here.
- Q Okay. State's 81, same shirt, just laid out?
- 4 A Yes.
- Okay. Was there also a beanie or a mask, something
- 6 with a white skull-like emblem on the front?
- 7 A Yes.
- Q Okay. And did you find that near another one of
- 9 the homes?
- 10 A It was -- it was in the side yard just off of
- 11 Attleboro. I can't remember the exact address it was on, but
- 12 | it was right in the side yard.
- 13 Q Showing you 82, that's the intersection of
- 14 Attleboro and --
- 15 A Yeah.
- 16 Q -- Hinsdale?
- 17 A Hinsdale, yeah.
- 18 Q Somewhere in that area?
- 19 A Yes.
- 20 Q Showing you 83, is that where you found that item?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q And showing you 84 --
- 23 A That's --
- Q -- is that the mask or --
- 25 A Yes, it is.

- Q -- whatever we've been discussing?
- 2 A Yes.

- 3 Q Was there also a black do-rag located at the corner
- 4 -- or on Lamb south of Providence -- Provincetown?
- 5 A I don't recall exactly where that was located.
- 6 Q It was located somewhere in your search?
- A Yes, yes.
- Q Would it refresh your recollection to see a copy of the notes you took as to the locations?
- 10 A Yes.
- MS. KILLER: Your Honor, may I approach?
- 12 THE COURT: You may.
- MS. KILLER: And for the record, taking a copy of
- 14 | the detective's notes back with me.
- 15 BY MS. KILLER:
- 16 Q Detective, does that refresh your recollection?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q Okay. The black do-rag was located where?
- A It was in the bushes south of Provincetown, pretty
- 20 | much where most of the other items were located.
- 21 Q Same general area as the --
- 22 | A Yes.
- 23 Q -- hat and some of the gloves?
- 24 A In the bushes, yes.
- Q Okay. Were there also a pair of black gloves that

were located near one -- where one of the suspects was taken 2 into custody? I didn't take those off of one of the suspects; one 3 of the other officers did and they gave them to us. I 5 believe it was off of Alexander. 6 MS. KILLER: Court's indulgence. BY MS. KILLER: You had said Detective Embry took the photographs 8 Q of these items as you located them, correct? 9 10 Α Yes. Did you impound all of these items? 11 Q Yes, I did. 12 Α 13 And did you impound that under your P number? Q Yes. 14 Α 15 And what is that number? 0 7212. 16 Α 17 And did you also impound them under the event 18 number 150709-1037? 19 Yes, I did. And both those numbers would be placed on the 20 21 evidence bags used to impound these items, correct? 22 Α Yes. 23 MS. KILLER: No further questions. Mr. Sanft? 24 THE COURT: 25 CROSS-EXAMINATION

BY MR. SANFT:

1

2

3

6

8

9

10

14

15

16

20

21

23

24

25

- Detective Hubbard, as part of your duties in this Q particular investigation, you located the items, and then helped to impound the items?
- 5 I impounded the items.
 - Okay, meaning you actually picked the items up, put Q them into a bag, and then sealed the bag up?
 - Α Yes.
 - And then handed it off to somebody else? CSA was never involved in that?
- We called for crime scene analysts, but they were 11 Α busy on another call, so it would be hours before they were 12 available, so we decided to start collecting it our self. 13
 - Okay. And just to be fair, of course, that 0 sometimes when there isn't enough people to do that portion of the work, it falls upon you?
- 17 Quite often, it's our responsibility. Α
- 18 Q Okay.
- It's usually only on very major crime scenes where 19 we have CSAs come out and impound our property.
 - Okay. And so, just to describe for this jury, you Q see something on the ground. I'm assuming you're wearing You have an evidence bag in your hand, the item gets photographed where you locate it, documented where it's located, and then at that point, you pick the item up with

the gloves on, you put it into the bag, and you seal the item in the bag, and then you take that back --

A No. In this instance, we went through -- we had officers walk us through the entire path and the route that the suspects took, and as we walked through the scene, we took pictures, noted where it was on my notes, like put where it was located. Then, once we were done finding all the evidence, we went back through, picked it up, put it in bags, and brought it back to the office, where we completed paperwork and sealed it.

- Q Okay. And with regard to these particular items, you were shown a certain beanie or mask. Do you recall that particular item?
- 14 A Yes. The mask, or the beanie?
- 15 Q This would be the -- I guess it would be a mask.
- 16 A With the skull on it?
- 17 Q Yes, with the --
- 18 A Yes.

1

3

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

- 19 Q -- skull on it. And this is State's Exhibit 84.
- 20 We're showing this exhibit again?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 | Q You actually handled that exhibit; is that correct?
- 23 A Yes.
- Q Meaning you picked it up, put it into a bag, and sealed the bag?

A Yes.

1

2

3

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

23

24

25

Q All right. Can you describe for this jury what kind of mask this is?

A I mean, it kind of looks like the Punisher -- the movie, the Punisher.

Q Yeah. And with regard to this particular mask, is this a mask that is a mask that covers the entire head; the front of the face? I mean, can you describe that for the jury as well?

A I can't tell from this picture if it has eye holes. It may have eye holes on it where it would cover the entire face, but I can't really tell from this picture.

Q Okay. And does it cover your entire head?

A It's like a beanie where it would cover a large portion of your head.

Q All right. And so the difference between this, for instance, and a mask that you would wear, like say a Halloween mask, a plastic mask you put in front of your face with a little elastic band around the back, it's not that kind of mask; is that right?

A No, it's -- it's a knit beanie type that you could pull down over your face --

Q Okay.

A -- is what it looks like.

Q And then, with regard to this particular beanie

here, you're saying that you didn't -- you didn't observe
whether or not there were any holes in the area of the eyes
for this particular mask?

A It looks like there are, but I impounded it months ago, so I don't remember exactly if it had eye holes in it or not.

Q Fair enough.

MR. SANFT: No further questions, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Mr. Parris, any cross?

10 CROSS-EXAMINATION

11 BY MR. PARRIS:

4

5

6

8

9

12

13

14

15

18

19

20

23

24

25

Q Detective Hubbard, did you follow -- the same procedures Mr. Sanft outlined, did you follow those same impound procedures for all of the items you impounded pursuant to this investigation?

A We typically just do it the same way every time.

17 It's the most expedient.

Q Okay. So, it's photographed; you put gloves on your hands, correct?

A Yeah.

Q So as not to contaminate either yourself or the items, correct?

A Right, right.

Q Then you put it in -- put those items, whatever they may be, in a bag. Now -- correct?

A Yes.

Q Okay. Now, those bags, are they -- are they just normal Ziploc bags, or are they a little more robust?

A No, they're paper grocery bags, for lack of a better term.

Q Okay. And then, when you have something along the lines of let's say two gloves, if -- two identical items like gloves, are each of them placed in the same bag at the same time?

- A Depends if the gloves match each other.
- 11 Q Assuming they are matching?
- 12 A Yes.
 - Q And then you take that bag, and you said that you in this particular incident, you put the items in that
 grocery bag, and then took them back to -- I think you said
 headquarters or your office?

A Yeah, we take them back -- well, at that time, we were in headquarters, so we took it back to the headquarters building.

- Q Okay. And at that point in time, you completed the paperwork, correct?
- A Right. We go through, we itemize each thing, put it in an item number, a package number, make sure it's placed in the right item -- as the right item in the right package. We write that on the outside of a sticker on the outside of

it, make sure it matches and corresponds to the property report. Then we seal it, write our initials and the date on the outside of the seal, and then we impound it.

- Q Now, when you say you seal it, what do you mean by that?
- A We seal it with Las Vegas Metropolitan Police
 Department evidence seals. They're plastic seals, for lack
 of a better term, that are sticky. They wrap around the -any openings that are on the bag, or box, or what have you.
- Q And then you said you sign those seals. Why do you sign -- do you sign your actual --
- 12 A No.

- Q -- physical name?
 - A Initials and P number, so S7212H, and then the date that we impound it.
 - Q Okay. And then you place them in the -- or they're placed in the evidence vault for tests to be run thereafter, correct?
 - A Well, they're placed in the evidence vault so the evidence technicians can come out and recover it, and later on, if tests are required or asked for, then they can pull that out of the evidence vault and test them.
 - Q Now, in this particular investigation, you were not vested with the duty of determining what should be tested and what shouldn't, correct?

1 A Correct.

4

5

6

7

8

- Q That was given to someone else. Do you know who that someone else is?
 - A Dave Miller was the case agent. I don't -- at that time, we were going through decentralization. I was no longer in the unit, and then we kind of all went our separate ways, unfortunately, and it would have been up to him to request any processing done.
- 9 MR. PARRIS: Thank you. I have nothing further.
- THE COURT: Any redirect?
- 11 MS. KILLER: Just briefly.
- 12 REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- 13 BY MS. KILLER:
- Q Detective, when you said the evidence seals, are we talking -- is it kind of similar to tape?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 Q Okay.
- 18 A Red tape.
- 20 And if someone like a crime scene analyst or 20 someone needs to open the bag for any reason, they don't un-21 tape your area, correct? They --
- ${\tt 22}$ ${\tt A}$ ${\tt No}$, they create a new opening in the package.
- Q And then they follow the same procedure to seal it up?
- 25 A Yes, and then they would seal it up, they would

sign their initials and P numbers, and the date they resealed it.

Q I think we may have covered this, but just to be safe, there was also a \$10 bill and a flashlight also found in those bushes on Tonopah west of Lamb, correct?

A Yes.

2

3

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

20

21

23

24

25

Q Okay. And that was the area where one of the suspects was taken into custody?

A That's correct.

Q And did you look for a bandana and a firearm?

A Yes. Never recovered a firearm. The bushes on Lamb are incredibly thick, and we went through them as well as we could, but we never recovered a firearm.

O Same for the bandana?

A Yes.

MS. KILLER: No further questions.

17 THE COURT: Any recross, Mr. Sanft?

18 MR. SANFT: No, Your Honor.

19 MR. PARRIS: No, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Thank you very much for your testimony here today. You may step down. You are excused from your subpoena. And you may call your next witness.

MR. PESCI: State calls Allison Rubino.

THE MARSHAL: And if you'll please step up into the witness stand. Please remain standing, raise your right

hand, and face the clerk. 1 2 ALLISON RUBINO, STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN 3 THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated. Could 4 you please state your name and spell it for the record? 5 THE WITNESS: Allison Rubino. A-l-l-i-s-o-n, R-u, 6 b as in boy, i-n-o. 7 Thank you. THE CLERK: THE COURT: You may proceed. 8 9 Thank you, Your Honor. MR. PESCI: 10 DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. PESCI: 11 Ma'am, what do you do for a living? 12 13 Α I'm employed at the Las Vegas Metropolitan Police 14 Department Forensic Laboratory. What do you do at the forensic laboratory? 15 0 16 I'm a forensic scientist 1 in the biology DNA Α detail. 17 And in that detail, what jobs do you perform? 18 Q My responsibilities are to examine evidence for the 19 presence or absence of biological material, and then conduct 20 21 any DNA analysis as requested in certain cases that are requested to my detail. And what training and experience do you have that 23 provides you with the opportunity to do that job? 24 25 Α At the laboratory, we go through a very extensive,

comprehensive documented training program that involves examining evidence that we would possibly come to find in the field, and then we also conduct DNA analysis on a variety of samples, like blood, semen, references, et cetera.

- Q And how long have you been doing this, ma'am?
- A I've been with Las Vegas Police Department since January of 2014, so about two years.
- Q And do you have any schooling that you did to get you this position?
 - A Yes. I have a Bachelor's of Science in Biochemistry from the University of Scranton in Pennsylvania, and I have a Master's of Science in Forensic Science from the University of New Haven in Connecticut.
- Q And ma'am, you talked about how you look for the presence or the absence of DNA; is that correct?
 - A Of biological material.

- Okay. And specifically, what is DNA?
 - A DNA, it stands for deoxyribonucleic acid, and it's a chemical that's found in nearly every cell within our body. And what DNA has is the information that makes us who we are, from the size of our organs, our hair and eye color. It's sometimes commonly known as our genetic blueprint.
 - Q Is DNA unique to a specific individual?
 - A Yes. The only people that are known to have the same DNA are identical siblings.

Q And how is it that you try to check for the presence of DNA?

A Depending -- depending on the sample, we encounter a variety of samples in the lab, and the body fluids we really test for are blood and semen. Another type of, I guess, DNA we look for or test for is touch DNA, or DNA that's present when someone comes into contact with someone else -- someone else or something else. Let's say you open a door. They might take a swabbing of the door handle, and we might do DNA testing to see maybe who has contacted -- has contacted that door.

Q Would it be from the skin cells with your example of touching the door?

A Correct.

Q Okay. Now, that's when you have a particular item that you're looking for the presence of DNA. When you look for the presence, do you compare it to something?

A In the case, if we get any reference standards -and what a reference standard is is just a known sample of
DNA. So, if you were to give your DNA, we would take a
swabbing from the inside of your cheek, and then we could say
that this DNA came from you.

Q So, let's use that example. Is that often referred to as a buccal swab?

A Correct.

- Q If you were to take my sample, is it as simple as 2 almost like a Q-tip rubbed in the inside of my mouth?
 - A Yeah. It's an extended Q-tip that you'll just rub on the inside of your cheek, and then we put your name on it, and that's our reference.
- 6 Q It's not very invasive; painful?
 - A No.

5

8

9

10

- Q All right. In this particular case, were you asked to perform some analysis in the case with the event number 150709-1037?
- 11 A Yes.
- Q Were you provided specific known samples of DNA

 from the references you just spoke of about buccal swabs from

 Ralph Alexander and a James Parker?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q Did that -- do you notate that in your report?
- 17 A Yes, I do.
- 18 Q As far as who you got the known sample from?
- 19 A Correct.
- 20 Q It's from those two individuals, but the person 21 that actually impounded or retrieved that buccal swab is 22 notated by the P number of that officer?
- 23 A In the report, yes.
- Q Okay. And in your report, did you reference that P number 6627 retrieved your number items 2 and 3, which are

```
the reference samples of Ralph Alexander and James Parker?
 1
              May I refer to my notes just to be clear?
 2
         Α
              THE COURT: Will that help refresh your
 3
 4
    recollection?
 5
              THE WITNESS: Yes.
 6
                          You may.
              THE COURT:
 7
                         Thank you, Your Honor.
              MR. PESCI:
              THE COURT: Are you referring to your report?
 8
              THE WITNESS: Yes.
 9
              THE COURT: Okay, she's referring to her report.
10
                           Okay. And I'm sorry, I was inquiring
11
              MR. PARRIS:
    as to what document she was reviewing.
12
13
                          That's what I figured.
              THE COURT:
              MR. PARRIS: Thank you.
14
                          Thank you very much, Your Honor.
15
              MR. PESCI:
16
              THE COURT:
                          Um-hum.
              MR. PARRIS: We -- for the record, we have been
17
   provided with her report.
18
19
              THE COURT:
                          You --
20
              MR. PARRIS: We have.
21
              MR. SANFT:
                          We have.
              MR. PARRIS: Yes.
23
              MR. SANFT: Yeah.
              THE COURT: Okay, thank you.
24
25
   BY MR. PESCI:
```

- Q Ma'am, did you just review your report?
- A Yes. In regards to lab items 2 and 3, they were impounded by the officer with the number 6627.
 - Q All right. So, those are the known samples?
- A Correct.

- Q Did you conduct analysis to look at the DNA of those individuals?
 - A Correct.
 - Q What process do you do for that?

A Our DNA process, the first thing we do is called an extraction, and we want to isolate the DNA away from -- away from the swab and anything that's on that swab. After we extract the DNA, we quantify it. We need to know how much we have and get a relative on possible quality. Once we've quanted it, we'll take a certain volume of DNA and we amplify it, which is our -- essentially a DNA copy machine. We put it in a tube and add some chemicals, and after a certain length of time, we make millions and millions of copies.

And once we've made our copies of amplified sample, we put it in an instrument, and the instrument separates the DNA based on its size. And as it's traveling through the instrument, it approaches and camera, and every time a part of the sample goes through the camera -- goes through this window, it will take a little snapshot. And after the complete DNA has run through the instrument, we then develop

- the actual picture DNA profile in a software.
- Q So, is that almost like a blueprint of the DNA of that individual?
- 4 A We end up essentially getting a chart.
- Q A chart? I apologize. You seemed uncomfortable with blueprint, sorry. But is it unique to that particular individual?
- 8 A Correct.
 - Q Okay. Now, that was the known samples. Did you retrieve a piece of physical evidence to be able to compare if there was any DNA from that physical evidence to the known samples?
- 13 A Yes.

10

11

12

17

18

19

- 14 Q I want to show you State's Exhibit 84. Do you 15 recognize that?
- 16 A Yes.
 - Q Now, did you reference in your report that that particular item had been impounded by an officer with the P number 7212?
- A May I refer to my report just to make sure?
- 21 THE COURT: Will that help refresh your
- 22| recollection?
- 23 THE WITNESS: Yes.
- 24 THE COURT: You may.
- 25 BY MR. PESCI:

- 1 Q That will be the last time I ask a P number, I 2 promise.
 - A You said 7212?
 - Q Yes, 7212.

4

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

- 5 A That is correct.
 - Q All right. So, the officer with that particular P number was written on that item that you retrieved. Inside that envelope with that P number was this particular item, the skull mask?
 - A This was in that package, correct.
 - Q Okay. And then, what did you do with that mask to try to see if you could get any DNA from it?
 - A Okay. Because it's -- because it's a mask, the first thing I did was I cut it open in the back, just to see the whole entire inside. And what I ended up doing, the mask had holes pretty much where your eyes would go and where your nostrils would be. There was no other hole maybe where your mouth could be, but -- there was no hole there. What I ended up doing was swabbing that inside front of the mask around the eyes, around the nose, around possibly where the mouth would have been, and then that swabbing that I took, I processed out for DNA.
- Q That's the same process you did on the known 24 samples?
- 25 A It would be the same process, yes.

- Q Okay. Now, if a mask is on a face, can there be -2 is it often referred to as a sloughing as skin cells?
 - A We sometimes refer to it as sloughing off skin cells.
 - Q That's how the rubbing could occur, and the cells could get on the actual mask, and then you could find DNA there?
 - A We could test for it, yes.
 - Q You tested for it in this case?
- 10 A Yes.

4

5

6

7

8

9

16

17

18

19

20

- Q Were you able to get a DNA profile?
- 12 A Yes, I was.
- Q All right. Were you able to compare the profile
 from that mask -- well, was there a mixture in that profile?
 Was there more than one profile?
 - A Yes. Sometimes with question samples and evidence samples, we don't always get a single source like we would with a reference. In this particular case, I did obtain a mixture which looked like it did come from multiple individuals.
- Q Now, even with a mixture, can you say if there is a major versus a minor contributor to the mixture?
- 23 A Yes.
- 24 Q And what was the result in this case?
- 25 A In this particular profile, I was able to

distinguish a major profile.

- Q Okay. So, that means you could see who the major profile was?
 - A Correct.

- Q The minor profile, is it such that you could not be able to identify who that was?
- A We have thresholds in our lab that allow us to interpret certain data, and the data in -- the extra data, or from the extra -- from the additional contributors did not meet that threshold, so I can't make any conclusions on any minor or trace contributors.
- Q Okay. So, you couldn't be sure on the minor, but you could on the major?
 - A Correct.
 - Q And then, what was the result when you compared the major profile from the skull mask to the two known samples that you had from Ralph Alexander and James Parker?
- A The full major profile was consistent with James
 Parker.
 - Q What does that mean, consistent with?
 - A So, when I get this DNA profile picture, it looks like a series of peaks, and the peaks have associated numbers to them. So, what I'll do is I'll go location by location that we test for and compare the numbers. So, the number at the first location was consistent or matched that of the

known reference of James Parker. I continued to do that for each location, and therefore, because each location, the numbers were the same for both the full major and the known reference, we say that it's consistent with James Parker.

- Q Do you often or sometimes use probability language?
- 6 A Yes.

2

3

4

5

8

9

10

- Q And I said I wouldn't ask any P numbers, but I do want to ask you a different number, so I might need you to look at your report again, with the Court's permission, if it refreshes your recollection.
- 11 A Okay. May I?
- 12 THE COURT: Sure.
- 13 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- 14 MR. PESCI: Any objection?
- MR. SANFT: No.
- MR. PESCI: No objection from the defense, ma'am.
- 17 | So you --
- 18 MR. PARRIS: No, Your Honor.
- 19 BY MR. PESCI:
- Q I think you have that out. Can you read to me what is the statement that you give as far as the probability in this case?
- A The probability of randomly selecting an unrelated individual having the DNA profile that is consistent with the full major obtained in the evidence sample was 6.21

quintillion.

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

20

21

- Q What is that number?
- A Well, if we think about a million has 6 zeros, a billion has 9, a trillion has 12, a quadrillion has 15 zeros, and then you have quintillion, which has 18 zeros. So, what we're saying here is that the probability -- while 6.21 is a very large number, the probability of finding a profile that is consistent with that of the full major in the evidence is one in, which is essentially saying one divided by 6.21 quintillion, which is a very small number, which just gives, for us, weight to the evidence.
- 12 MR. PESCI: Thank you very much. Pass the witness.
- 13 THE COURT: Mr. Sanft, any cross?
- 14 MR. SANFT: Yes, Your Honor.
- 15 CROSS-EXAMINATION
- 16 BY MR. SANFT:
- Q What's the definition -- I'm sorry, hold on real quick. Ms. Rubino, hi. What is the definition of a major and a minor contributor?
 - A So, when we look at major and minor, a major is the part of the profile that gives more of the DNA, and a minor or a trace gives less of the DNA.
- Q So, I'm just going to stand over here, because I'm not quite -- I'm not quite understanding what the difference is anyhow. Is that a matter of volume of, say, for instance,

the type of stuff that you're drawing the DNA from; that, you know, there's more of this than that, so therefore, this is 3 major and this is minor?

Well, in this DNA profile, the peaks have certain Α heights, so the peaks that we're looking at -- when I distinguish a major, I'm looking for the highest peaks in the profile, and they were easily distinguishable in this particular profile. When I'm talking about a minor or a trace component, the peaks for those additional contributors are very low in comparison to that of the peaks of the major contributor.

- So, if -- if you're looking -- I'm assuming Q Okav. that's some type of graph; is that what it is?
 - Α In the chart, correct.
- 15 Chart? And then you've got what looks like a bunch Q of -- what would these things be called? Waves? 16
- 17 Α Peaks.

4

5

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

18

19

20

24

- Okay. And so what you're looking for is the top Q part of each peak, right, that made you determine which is the major and which is the minor?
- 21 Each peak in the chart is given the number, Α Yeah. and it's also given the peak height.
- All right. So, for instance, even though you may 23 have one profile that keeps hitting the major peaks, there 25 are other potential profiles that are there, they're just

hitting minor peaks; is that how that works?

A Everything is all relative to a particular profile. For this particular profile, the peaks were substantially higher, and it's relative to the other peaks. So, they're major in relation to all those other peaks that were lower.

Q Okay. Can you give us some reasons as to why one DNA profile could have major peaks, while other DNA profiles could have minor peaks?

A It would only be major and minor if it was -- if it was a mixture. Sometimes there are no majors. Sometimes you can't distinguish anything, because all the peaks, if they're from 2, 3, 4 people, they're all the same height. So sometimes we can't distinguish, but in this particular case, we could.

Q So, your testimony earlier to this jury was that there was a mixture?

A Correct.

Q And there were multiple people that at some point or another had contact with the inside of that mask, meaning the eyes where you had swabbed, the nose area, and potentially where the mouth was?

A Correct.

Q Okay. As you sit here today, can you tell this jury as to when the other people potentially touched or wore those -- that mask?

- 1 A No.
- 2 Q And that's really not what you're here for,
- 3 | correct?
- 4 A Correct.
- Q You're just here to say that there is DNA from Mr.
- 6 Parker that's on the inside of that mask?
- 7 A Correct.
- Q And you don't know when those other people may have used that mask?
- 10 A Correct.
- 11 Q Now, in addition to that though, you did find in 12 that package -- as you were preparing that particular item to 13 be swabbed, you did find other material that could have DNA
- 14 on it; is that correct?
- 15 A Correct. There were multiple items in the package.
- Q Okay. And what I mean, the package, we're talking about this specific mask, plus whatever was in there related
- 18 to the mask; is that correct?
- 19 A Correct.
- 20 Q Did you find hair on the inside of the mask?
- A There were possible hairs that were dislodged from the mask when I was doing my initial examination.
- Q And of course, you explained to this jury that DNA would be located on a strand of hair?
- 25 A It could be in the root of the hair.

```
Okay. And in this case, did you run any type of
 1
         Q
 2
    DNA comparison to see if the hair matched any particular
 3
    person?
 4
         Α
              No.
                          I have no further questions, Your
 5
              MR. SANFT:
 6
            Thank you.
    Honor.
 7
              MR. PARRIS: No questions, Your Honor.
                          Any redirect?
 8
              THE COURT:
 9
              MR. PESCI:
                          Yes.
10
                         REDIRECT EXAMINATION
11
    BY MR. PESCI:
              Why did you not do it with the hair?
12
              Well, once I -- once I noticed there were possible
13
         Α
   hair from the mask, I looked under a stereo microscope.
14
                                                              It's
15
    just a larger magnifying glass that allows me to closer see
16
    what the hair looks like, because the -- for the DNA testing
17
   we do at the laboratory, what we want to look at are the
    roots, and if we have root material present, that's where the
18
    DNA is going to be. When I looked under the microscope, I
19
20
    didn't see anything that would be suitable for our testing.
21
              So, you looked to try to see if there was another
         Q
    source of DNA, but those particular hairs did not have the
23
    root which has the DNA, so you couldn't do it?
24
              Correct.
         Α
25
              MR. PESCI:
                         Thanks.
```

```
1
              MR. SANFT:
                          Okay.
                         Any recross?
 2
              THE COURT:
                         Yes, Your Honor.
 3
              MR. SANFT:
 4
                          RECROSS-EXAMINATION
 5
    BY MR. SANFT:
 6
              So, let's make sure for this jury that we
    understand [inaudible]. The hair that you looked at, can you
 8
    describe for us that hair?
              If I could look at my -- I have notes with me.
 9
         Α
                                                               Ιf
    I could look at it. I don't --
10
11
         Q
              Sure, absolutely.
12
              THE COURT: Go ahead.
13
              THE WITNESS: Thank you.
                          Thank you.
14
              THE COURT:
              MR. PARRIS: Your Honor, just for clarification,
15
    are we referring to the report, or notes that are outside of
16
17
    the report?
              THE COURT: Have you been referring to your report
18
19
    each time?
              THE WITNESS: Now, yes, but the notes about the
20
21
    hair would be in my notes from my file. It would be outside
    of the --
              MR. SANFT: That's fine. That's fine, Your Honor.
23
24
    I'm okay with that.
25
              THE WITNESS: It would be outside of the --
```

```
MR. PARRIS: May we approach?
 1
 2
              THE COURT:
                          Sure.
 3
                          (Bench conference)
                          Sorry I didn't wait. I apologize. I
 4
              MR. PESCI:
 5
   didn't wait for her.
 6
             MR. PARRIS: I'm not necessarily opposed to her
   looking at those notes, but I think we would like to see
8
    those notes as well. I would assume --
              THE COURT: Why don't you just go over there and
 9
   look at them right now?
10
             MR. PARRIS: Yeah, and that's -- that's all, I mean
11
12
              THE COURT: All four of you can go over and look at
13
   her notes right now if you want to.
14
             MR. PARRIS: Okay, that's all we'd be asking for.
15
16
                          Thank you, Judge.
              MR. PESCI:
17
                          I don't think -- honestly, I'm just
              MR. SANFT:
   going to ask her for a description of the hair. That's all
18
   I'm asking for.
19
             MR. PESCI: Yeah, she needs to look at it to be
20
21
    able to refresh her memory.
22
              MR. PARRIS: Yeah, [inaudible].
                          She might not be able to remember.
23
              MR. PESCI:
24
              THE COURT:
                          Yeah, she's not going to be able to
25
   testify without looking at her notes, is what she said.
```

```
1
              MR. PARRIS: Yeah.
 2
              MR. SANFT: No, no, that's fine.
 3
              THE COURT: She's not going to look at her report;
 4
    she said she has to look at notes.
 5
              MR. PARRIS: Well, if it's notes, we --
              MR. PESCI: We have no objection to be able to look
 6
 7
    at the notes.
 8
              THE COURT: Go ahead and look at the notes.
 9
              MR. PARRIS:
                          Yeah.
              THE COURT: You can walk right over there and look
10
11
    at them.
                       (End of bench conference)
12
13
              MR. PESCI: Judge, if we -- while we're up here --
                          Oh, sorry.
14
              THE COURT:
                          (Bench conference)
15
              THE COURT:
16
                          Sorry.
                          I'm sorry. We have three other
17
              MR. PESCI:
    witnesses still waiting. I don't know how long the witness
18
19
    will go. One of the three we definitely need to do tonight.
20
              THE COURT:
                          Okay.
21
              MR. PESCI:
                          So, if we can, if we -- if we're
    approaching 5:00, if we can maybe go a little bit later than
           I don't think that's going to happen; depends on your
23
24
    cross.
25
              THE COURT: Are you going to call that witness
```

```
1
    next?
 2
              MR. PESCI:
                         Yes.
 3
              THE COURT:
                          Who is it?
                          It's a woman who's actually from the
 4
              MR. PESCI:
 5
    nail salon, Briauna Williams. She said she had school so she
 6
    could only come after 3:30, so we had to work on a day that
 7
    was good for her, so.
 8
              THE COURT:
                          Okay.
                          Giancarlo, I'll be like one more
 9
              MR. SANFT:
    question [inaudible].
10
11
              MR. PESCI:
                          Okay.
12
              THE COURT:
                          Okay.
13
              MR. PARRIS:
                           Okay.
14
              THE COURT:
                          All right.
15
                       (End of bench conference)
              THE COURT: At this time, I'm going to allow the
16
17
    attorneys -- the notes that are in your file, the attorneys
    have the right to see those, so they're all four I think
18
    going to come over, and they can approach the witness and
19
    look at her notes. So, if you could just identify the notes
20
21
    that you're referring to.
22
              MS. KILLER: Your Honor, do you mind if I come up
    here [inaudible]?
23
24
              THE COURT: Not at all.
25
              MS. KILLER: We don't want to surround you, but --
```

1	MR. PESCI: Do you feel a little pressure?
2	THE WITNESS: So, these are
3	MR. PARRIS: Breathing down your neck.
4	THE WITNESS: These are my electronic notes from my
5	serological examination. These are of the reference
6	standards, and it just contains all of the information here,
7	and this is of the actual evidentiary item.
8	And so I have here the one item, which was the
9	skeleton mask, the swabbing from the inside of the mask, and
10	all of my notes. And then here are the dislodged hairs. So,
11	I note here, when moving around, the short hairs were
12	dislodged onto that bench surface, and they were visualized
13	under a stereo microscope. Two of them had blunt cut like
14	ends, and the third appeared frayed at one end, and none of
15	the three appeared to be suitable for further testing.
16	MR. SANFT: Okay.
17	THE WITNESS: I packaged them, and that was it.
18	MR. PARRIS: May I?
19	THE WITNESS: Sure.
20	(Pause in the proceedings)
21	MR. PARRIS: Is this the only set of notes?
22	THE WITNESS: [Inaudible] that's what I have, yes.
23	MR. PARRIS: Okay, okay. Thank you.
24	THE WITNESS: You're welcome.
25	THE COURT: Mr. Parris, are you now satisfied?

Thank you, Your Honor. 1 MR. PARRIS: Yes. And any objection? Okay. 2 THE COURT: 3 MR. PARRIS: No, none, Your Honor. Thank you. Okay. You may proceed. 4 THE COURT: 5 MR. SANFT: All right. 6 BY MR. SANFT: 7 Ms. Rubino, my question specifically is the 0 8 description of those hairs. Can you describe for us what 9 they looked like? Yes. So, I -- when I opened the mask, three small 10 hairs -- three short hairs, I have here approximately six 11 inches or less, were noted, and they fell on the bench top. 12 What I ended up doing was taking them and observing them 13 under the stereo microscope, like I said. Two of them looked 14 like they had blunt ends, so as if -- so, possibly, as if 15 16 when you get your hair cut, those blunt ends that you see. 17 The other one had kind of a frayed end, and to me, it didn't have any material that I thought would be suitable for DNA 18 19 testing. 20 Q Okay. So, with regard to those hairs, the length 21 of those hairs you're saying were less than six inches? 22 Yes, six inches or less. Okay. And with regards to those hairs in terms of 23 the length, that's based upon your looking at it? Did you 24 25 ever --

It's approximation, putting it against a ruler. 1 Α So, I have all three cumulatively were about six inches or 3 less. Okay. And once again, I'm just -- this is about 4 Q six inches right here? Okay, about [inaudible]. I'm just --5 6 for the record, you just estimated what you believe is about six inches? 8 Could be possibly, yes. Α Okay, no further questions. 9 MR. SANFT: THE COURT: Mr. Parris? 10 MR. PARRIS: No, Your Honor. Thank you. 11 12 THE COURT: Anything else from the State? 13 MR. PESCI: No, thank you. 14 THE COURT: Okay. Thank you very much for your 15 testimony here today. 16 THE WITNESS: Thank you. THE COURT: You may step down. You're excused from 17 your subpoena. Thank you for being here. You may call your 18 19 next witness. 20 MR. PESCI: State calls Briauna Williams. 21 And if you will please step up into THE MARSHAL: the witness stand, remain standing, raise your right hand, 23 and face the clerk, please. 24 BRIAUNA WILLIAMS, STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN 25 THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated. Could

```
you please state your name and spell it for the record?
              THE WITNESS: Briauna Williams. B-r-i-a-u-n-a,
 2
 3
     W-i-l-l-i-a-m-s.
                          Thank you.
 4
              THE CLERK:
 5
                          Thank you. You may proceed.
              THE COURT:
 6
                          Thank you.
              MR. PESCI:
 7
                          DIRECT EXAMINATION
    BY MR. PESCI:
 8
              Ma'am, I want to direct your attention to June the
 9
         Q
    26th of this year. Did you go to the LV Nails Spa at 4430
10
    East Charleston?
11
12
              Yes.
         Α
13
              Were you there in the evening hours?
14
              Yes.
         Α
              Were you having -- was it your eyebrows that were
15
         Q
    being done?
16
17
         Α
              Yes.
              Okay. What happened while that was being done?
18
         Q
              Two guys came in and robbed the place.
19
              Okay. When the two guys came in and robbed the
20
         Q
    place, was anything taken from you?
21
              Yes, my wallet.
              Your wallet?
23
         Q
24
         Α
              Um-hum.
25
              THE COURT: Is that a yes?
```

- THE WITNESS: Yes.
- 2 THE COURT: Thank you.
- 3 BY MR. PESCI:
- Q They're recording everything, so it's just so it's a clear answer one way or the other.
- 6 A Okay.
- Q You said your wallet was taken. Did you have any money in that wallet?
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q Did you have any identification in the wallet?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 | Q And how about any credit cards?
- 13 A Yes.
- 14 Q And those things were all taken from you?
- 15 A Yes.
- Q Were they taken from you by the two individuals?
- 17 A Yes.
- Q Can you describe those two individuals?
- 19 A Well, the one, he had on a mask, so I can't really
- 20 describe him. The other one, he had nappy hair pulled to the
- 21 | back in a ponytail.
- 22 Q Okay. Let's start with the first one with the
- 23 mask. Can you describe the mask?
- 24 A It was a white mask. It was like long in the
- 25 | front, and it looks kind of like a Scream mask.

25

Α

Black.

- Q Okay. And then, that -- those items that were taken from you, was there anything said to you to make you give over that item?
 - A They demanded for everyone to give them they stuff.
 - Q How did they demand it?
- A He was just like, it's a robbery. That's what he said when he first came in, and then he -- that's the one with the black bandana; that's what he said.
 - Q Okay.

- A And he demanded for the owner to open up the drawer.
- 12 O What did the owner do?
 - A She -- like, first, she didn't want to open the drawer, and then he was like, don't make me shoot you over no stupid shit. And she opened up the drawer, and she was like, do you want checks, too, and he said no. And then, at that point, he like -- he walked on the other side of me, and he made the owner get on the floor, and that's when he took my wallet, and he walked back with the other guy that had the Scream mask on.
 - Q Okay.
 - A He was on the other end. And he like grabbed everyone's stuff, and the guy that had on the bandana, he walked back down that way to the other -- the far end, and he asked the other -- I'm not sure if he the owner, but the

- Asian guy, he asked him, you know, if he had any money or anything, and he said no.
- 3 Q Was that -- you said an Asian guy?
- 4 A Yeah, I think he's the owner, too. I'm not sure.
- Q All right, so when you said the owner, the first one, was that a male or a female?
- 7 A The first one that was doing my eyebrows, she was a 8 woman.
 - Q Okay. And then you just spoke about an employee you think might be the owner; it was a male?
- 11 A Yes.

- 12 Q And then there was a demand made from that male for 13 money?
- 14 A Huh?
- Q My apologies. I thought I heard you say that they asked the male owner for some money.
- 17 A Yeah, they did.
- 18 Q And what happened?
- 19 A And he didn't have any money to give them, and --
- 21 A Yes. They had two guns.
- 22 Q You saw to guns?
- 23 A Yes.
- Q Where were the guns? Who had the guns?
- 25 A The one guy with the black -- I mean with the white

```
mask, he had the black gun; and the other guy that had the
    bandana, he had the gun with the brown handle.
 2
              Okay. Do you remember if you saw gloves on any of
 3
         Q
 4
    these individuals?
 5
              I can't remember.
 6
              It's okay. After these items were taken, did you
         Q
 7
    see where they went?
              They ran towards the beauty supply.
 8
         Α
              Did they exit the store?
 9
         Q
              Yeah, yeah, they left out.
10
         Α
              Did they exit together?
11
         Q
12
         Α
              Yes.
13
              Okay.
         Q
                           Thank you. We'll pass the witness.
14
              MR. PESCI:
15
                           Mr. Sanft, any cross?
              THE COURT:
16
                           Yes, Your Honor.
              MR. SANFT:
17
                           CROSS-EXAMINATION
18
    BY MR. SANFT:
              I'm sorry, it's Ms. Williams?
19
         Q
20
         Α
              Yeah.
21
              All right. Ms. Williams, were you there with
         Q
    anybody; any of your friends?
23
         Α
              No.
24
              By yourself?
         Q
25
         Α
              Yes.
```

- All right. And in the nail salon on that Q particular day, do you recall how many people were in there getting some type of service done?
 - I think probably about six. Α
- 5 Q Six people?

3

4

9

guy.

- 6 I think about six. Α
- 7 All right, that's fine. Do you recall, did Q everyone get robbed? 8
 - No, there was one girl that didn't get robbed. Α
- Who did not get robbed? 10 Q
- 11 Α It was a black lady. She was the one that was on She was getting her nails done by the Asian 12 the far end. 13
- Okay. And why didn't she get robbed? 14 Q
- 15 I don't know. Α
- Do you know -- how did you know that she did not 16 get robbed? 17
- Because I saw. She -- he -- the guy that had the 18 Α bandana on, when he walked down that way, she went to hand 19 her stuff, and he was like, no, baby girl, you all right, and 20 21 that was it.
- 22 Okay. He said, no, baby girl, you're all right, and then continued to rob everybody else? 23
- 24 Α Um-hum.
- 25 Is that a yes?

```
THE COURT: Is that a yes?
 1
              THE WITNESS: Wait, at that point -- no, at that
 2
    point, that's when he left out this door. That's when they
 3
    end up leaving.
 5
    BY MR. SANFT:
 6
              Okay, so she's about ready to hand over her stuff,
         Q
    and he says, no, baby girl, you're all right, then turns and
 8
    walks out of the store?
 9
         Α
              Yeah.
                         Okay, no further questions.
10
              MR. SANFT:
                          Mr. Parris?
11
              THE COURT:
12
                           CROSS-EXAMINATION
13
    BY MR. PARRIS:
              Ms. Williams, you had indicated that your wallet
14
         Q
15
    was taken in this robbery, correct?
16
         Α
              Um-hum.
17
         Q
              Is that a yes?
18
              THE COURT: Is that a yes?
19
              THE WITNESS: Yes, sorry.
20
              MR. PARRIS: No worries.
21
    BY MR. PARRIS:
22
              And in that wallet, you had referenced that you had
    some debit cards and/or credit cards, correct?
23
24
         Α
              Yes.
25
              How many debit cards or ATM cards did you have in
```

your wallet? 1 It was just one. 2 Α One? And regarding that ATM card, did you report 3 Q that as stolen shortly after this incident? It was a prepaid card. No, I didn't. 5 6 Okay. So, you never reported that to whomever Q issued that card then? 8 Α No. Okay. Regarding -- did you have credit cards in 10 there also? No, just -- just -- it was just a prepaid debit 11 12 card. Okay, and then cash and other identification, 13 14 correct? 15 Α Yeah. Okay. Regarding that prepaid card, is there any 16 17 way for whomever issued it to you to contact you about it? I can probably get in touch with them. 18 Α Okay, but no one has gotten in contact with you 19 since this incident regarding whether that card was used, 20 21 correct? 22 Α No. MR. PARRIS: Thank you. Nothing further. 23 MR. PESCI: No, thank you, Your Honor. 24

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

THE COURT:

25

Thank you very much for your testimony

```
here today. You may step down. You're excused from your
 1
 2
   subpoena. Thank you for being here, Ms. Williams. You may
 3
   call your next witness.
 4
             MR. PESCI: State calls Officer Walburn.
             THE MARSHAL: I'm sorry?
 5
 6
             MR. PESCI: Officer Walburn.
 7
             MS. KILLER: I believe it's Damian. Your Honor,
8
   may I approach to get photos?
 9
             THE COURT: You may.
             THE MARSHAL: If you'd please step up into the
10
   witness stand, remain standing, raise your right hand, and
11
   face the clerk, please.
12
13
             THE CLERK: Please face me. Thank you.
               DAMIAN WALBURN, STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN
14
                         Thank you. Please be seated.
15
              THE CLERK:
16
              THE WITNESS:
                            Thank you.
17
             THE CLERK: Could you please state your name and
    spell it for the record?
18
             THE WITNESS: Damian Avery Walburn. D-a-m-i-a-n,
19
    A-v-e-r-y. Last name is W-a-l-b-u-r-n.
20
21
              THE CLERK:
                          Thank you.
22
                          Officer Walburn, just a moment while I
23
   grab some maps.
24
              THE COURT: Is it detective or officer?
25
              THE WITNESS: I'm an investigator at Northeast,
```

23

24

25

the area?

Α

Yes, ma'am.

Showing you State's Exhibit 43, is that a map of

- Q And that orange or red dot, is that where the Family Dollar is located?
 - A Yes, ma'am.

4

5

6

8

9

18

19

20

21

23

24

25

- Q Or, I'm sorry, I guess I shouldn't have phrased it respond to a call. Were you in the area of the Family Dollar?
- A Yes, ma'am.
 - Q And did something occur that drew your attention around 8:30 in the morning?
- 10 A Yes, ma'am.
- 11 Q If you touch that screen, it will make a mark for 12 the jury where you're drawing. Can you describe for us what 13 drew your attention and where you were traveling?
- A Should I touch the monitor as I move with a directional?
- 16 THE COURT: Sure.
- 17 MS. KILLER: Sure.
 - THE WITNESS: Okay. Thank you, Judge. Ladies and gentlemen, my partner and I work as a plain clothes undercover unit in Northeast Area Command, which is where this store is facilitated. We were driving eastbound here on Lake Mead from Lamb Boulevard, and right about here, we noticed two gentlemen that are seated in the courtroom today walking northbound towards the Family Dollar Store. And as they came to the front of the location, which is where I

stopped the directional with my finger, we continued.

We observed them looking back and forth over their shoulders very frantically, and it was very suspicious in nature. As we continued to go eastbound, my partner and I both said to each other that something didn't look right, the way their mannerisms were. And over my shoulder, I looked back. Both of the gentlemen had stopped on the corner of the store, talked to each other, continued to look around, and then went into the store.

10 BY MS. KILLER:

2

3

5

9

- 11 Q Let me stop you there, Officer. Sorry, I'm missing
 12 my technology assistant at the moment.
- MS. KILLER: Kris, can you wait just a minute

 14 before you switch it so I can pull up the right file folder?

 THE COURT RECORDER: Sure.
- MS. KILLER: Thank you. I apologize, ladies and gentlemen. Just let me grab Mr. Pesci.

18 | (Pause in the proceedings)

- MS. KILLER: Please forgive my lack of technology skills, everyone.
- 21 THE COURT: You're okay.
- 22 MS. KILLER: Okay, you can switch it now.
- 23 BY MS. KILLER:
- Q As per the investigation, did you become aware that Family Dollar had video surveillance?

- A I was never aware until I actually left the scene that there was video at the property. I never went inside to view any, ma'am.
 - Q Eventually, you learned of it though?
- 5 A Yes, ma'am, I did.
 - Q Okay. And did you have an opportunity to briefly review the surveillance before you came to testify today?
- 8 A Yes.

1

3

4

6

9

10

11

- Q We're going to play a clip, and if you could just describe for us and let us know if that was the -- what we're seeing is what you were observing on July 9th.
- 12 A Yes, ladies and gentlemen, it is.
- 13 Q Are those the individuals you were referring to?
- 14 A Yes, ma'am, it is.
- Q And when you said they were looking around, is that what we just saw there?
- 17 A Yes, ma'am, it is.
- Q And we saw them enter the store. Do you see those two individuals here in the courtroom today?
- 20 A Yes, ma'am, I do.
- Q Can you point to them and identify an article of clothing they're wearing?
- A Yes, ma'am. The gentleman in the tie with the gray slacks and the dark shoes, with his hands folded on the end.
- 25 The gentleman in the shirt and tie here with his hand on his

1 face.

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

25

THE COURT: The record reflect he has identified both defendants.

4 MS. KILLER: Thank you.

5 BY MS. KILLER:

And I'm sorry, I'll let you get back to your map and what you were showing us. So, I believe you've drawn your line across Lake Mead. When you observed that, you turned around. I assume this is an unmarked car? It's not a patrol car as we normally think of with the black and white labels and the sirens, correct?

A Ladies and gentlemen, we operate in a gold Chevy Silverado. I'm not sure of the year. It's got a toolbox in the back and the windows are tinted. It is a plain vehicle, and we operate in the clothing capacity that you saw me enter the courtroom today. I wear jeans and a t-shirt or a jacket each day, and I'm identified by LVMPD hang badge, as well as raid jackets at times, which are yellow in color and say "Police" on them.

Q After you turned around, what did you do?

A I'm going to put this back up because I'm old and I need a reference here.

Q My apologies.

A As we were going eastbound here on Lake Mead and we observed the two gentlemen that I've identified in the

courtroom, they're in front of the Family Dollar. As I said, my partner and I both felt that something wasn't right by their mannerisms, by the way they were looking back and forth over their shoulders and around in the immediate area.

We conducted a u-turn, and a vehicle was pulling out, almost hit us, so we had to slow down, and I directly started to look at the building again and saw that they had gone inside. Once we came in the u-turn, we pulled into the parking lot. And without blowing this up, we actually pulled into the parking lot to the front of the store --

- O Officer --
- 12 A -- and --

1

3

5

6

9

10

11

16

17

18

19

20

21

- 13 Q I think if I put 49 up, does that depict the area?
- 14 A Yes, ma'am. And I don't know if I can mark this.
- 15 Q You can.
 - A We actually backed into this stall right here that I've put an X on, and we actually watched the front of the Family Dollar, and had a view partially inside through the clear glass windows that were lit.
 - Q And showing you State's 50, are those the windows that you were looking through?
- 22 A Yes, ma'am, it is.
- Q And we took away your line again. I apologize.

 When you saw the defendants before they went inside the

 store, could you see if they were speaking to each other at

all?

1

2

3

5

6

10

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

25

A I didn't see their lips moving, ma'am. I just saw them -- their mannerisms, looking over their shoulders back and forth. One would presume, but I don't know if they were speaking or not.

- Q They were walking together?
- A Yes, ma'am.
- 8 Q And by their mannerisms, interacting with each 9 other?
 - A Yes, ma'am, that is correct.
- 11 Q Once they entered the store, did you continue to 12 remain outside and observe?
- 13 A Yes.
 - Q Okay. The robbery as you've described, did it occur immediately, or did it occur a few minutes -- not minutes, but a little bit after they entered the store?
 - A For clarification, ladies and gentlemen, from the time that I observed both of the gentlemen walking from the area to the side, or from behind the Family Dollar to the front and go inside, from the time that we actually did -- or conducted the u-turn and came back and parked into the parking lot, it was less than two or three minutes. It happened all within a matter of seconds.
 - Q Okay. Could you -- I guess my question would be better phrased as, when they entered the store, could you see

them the whole time, or did they disappear briefly and then come back into view?

- A They disappeared briefly, and then they did come back into view towards the front of the store, ma'am.
- Q When they came back into view, did they have anything on their faces?
 - A Yes, ma'am, they did.

3

5

6

8

9

10

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

- Q When they were outside, did they have anything on their faces before they entered the store?
- A No, ma'am, they did not.
- 11 Q When they came back in, what, if anything, did they
 12 have over their faces?
 - A When I observed the individuals at the interior of the Family Dollar, the taller of the two gentlemen had on a black overgarment with what appeared to be a white skull face concealing his face. The shorter of the two gentlemen had a dark-colored mask over his face.
 - Q The person you described with the skull over his face you said was the slightly taller, I believe, or the slightly larger?
 - A Yes, ma'am. There were two distinct sizes with the gentlemen that I observed. One was shorter, one was taller.

 The one that was taller had the mask with the skull on the
- 24 front, and it was a white skull, so it stood out.
- 25 Q Did you see -- the man who had the dark mask or

item over his face, the second person you described, did you see what he was wearing?

A I don't recall the exact clothing at the time. The one thing that I did observe, however, was that the shorter male with the face concealed, I could see in his hand was a dark-colored handgun.

Q Did you know if his clothing was lighter or darker, or the same color as the other's?

A I recall that the shorter gentleman had on a lighter-colored top.

Q Okay.

3

5

8

9

10

11

12

15

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

A I'm sorry.

Q And that was the man that you observed with the handgun?

A Yes, ma'am, the gentleman that was shorter.

Q And the -- the person with the skull mask, you did
not see him gun with (sic)?

A No, ma'am.

Q Once you saw that -- those two individuals inside, could you observe what was happening between them and the store employees?

A The mannerism of the employee that was behind the counter, who I would presume to call a clerk, was hysterical and moving around back and forth. The shorter male that I've identified in the courtroom that I observed with a handgun

with his face concealed was behind the counter area in that immediate area. The taller man with the face concealed by a skull mask was walking back and forth in the front of the store, and at one point, he had actually stopped and stared out at us in our unmarked patrol vehicle.

Q You had just referenced the people you had identified earlier. Just for the jury's clarification, do you mind telling us which one was the person wearing the skull mask, and which one was the shorter man with the gun?

A Yes, ma'am. The gentleman that's sitting directly in front of me closest to you was the gentleman that I saw with the skull mask on his face. The gentleman on the far right was the person that I observed with the handgun and the dark concealment over his face.

MS. KILLER: And Your Honor, for the record, can the record reflect that the detective identified Mr. Parker as the person with the skull mask, and Mr. Alexander as the person with the gun?

THE COURT: So reflected.

MS. KILLER: Thank you.

21 BY MS. KILLER:

Q You had just mentioned that the suspect -- or the defendant with the skull mask at some point looked up at you and appeared to see you?

A Yes, ma'am.

Q And at that point, what did you observe them doing?

A At that point, it seemed like there was a brief pause, where the subject with the skull mask -- it was almost like he was frozen, looking at us. Then he immediately looked over his shoulder towards the other suspect, and I couldn't see any communication with their lips, but their body language told me that he had said he thought someone was outside. I don't know if he thought we were police or not, but immediately, they disappeared towards the south part of the store, where I presumed and later located a rear exit door to the premise.

Q When they disappeared towards the south end of the store, what action did you take?

A I ordered my partner to take a perimeter position to the front of the store and guard the point of entry to the front of the premise. I had also called for additional support with air and canine, and additional units as to the behaviors and mannerisms that I see going on within the store, and that I did in fact through my training and experience believe that this was armed robbery. I told my partner that I was going to take a position at the rear of the store in hopes of containing this dynamic incident.

Q And showing you State's 46, it's a closer view of what we've been looking at on the map. Can you show us where you went from the front parking lot to your next position?

A Can you pull the picture itself down towards the bottom just a little? Okay, thank you.

Q I can, but I think it cuts off what you're trying to point out. I apologize. Hold on, I have another that might work. Showing you State's 45.

A Thank you. This area -- and I apologize, is there a way to erase that?

Q Yes.

A We were parked here. My partner stayed with the vehicle to keep containment on the front of the store.

Q And your partner's name?

A My partner's name is Officer Blaine Martell. I ran and took a wide angle around this corner, and as I started to perceive the doorway, I noticed that the angle that I took to the door was actually somewhat blocked because there was a retaining wall there which facilitated a large dumpster. In between the dumpster and the retaining wall, there's about a 12 to 18-inch gap between that and the store itself.

So, obviously, I had to take a wide angle, and the reason that I did this was for my own safety, because I had observed a firearm inside and now I'm running to take containment. My presumption was that they were going to the rear of the store and possibly were going to exit, and I didn't want to just run up on someone that was armed and dangerous with a handgun. That's why I took a wide angle.

From this position, I immediately started to come towards the rear door, and the rear door kicked open at that time. Want me to keep going, ma'am?

- Q I'm actually going to -- we'll leave your red up there so you don't lose it.
- A Okay.

1

2

3

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

22

23

- Q But showing you State's 58, I'll set it below it, is -- behind the patrol car there, is that the wall area that you were discussing?
- A Yes. And I don't know how tall it is, ladies and gentlemen, but it is a block wall made out of cinder block, and I don't recall where the dumpster -- it was. I don't know if it was behind it or in front of it. But where the wall is miscolored where it's been painted over for graffiti abatement, the door is on the backside of that wall. If you see the top light on the back of the building, directly under that light is where the rear door is, which would --
- 18 Q Showing you 59, does that give you a better angle 19 to --
- A Yes, ladies and gentlemen. This is the rear exit door that both gentlemen ran out.
 - Q Sorry. And that's 60. Those are the rear exits of the building as well?
- A This is the only rear exit that I know of, ma'am.

 25 I don't know what this other door is.

```
Okay. And we'll go back to your map so you can
 1
         Q
    show us where you went next.
 2
              As the subjects exited --
 3
                          Is there a question?
 4
              THE COURT:
 5
              MS. KILLER: No, there's not -- if we clear it, it
 6
    clears the whole screen, correct?
 7
              MR. PESCI:
                          Yes.
              THE COURT:
 8
                          Sure.
 9
              MS. KILLER:
                           Okay, so --
                            It's okay if you want to clear it. I
10
              THE WITNESS:
11
    can --
              MS. KILLER: We'll just have everyone ignore the
12
13
    circle.
              THE WITNESS: Yes, ma'am. If you want, go ahead
14
15
    and clear it, and I'll fix it.
16
              MS. KILLER: Okay, thank you.
17
                           Okay. Sorry, ladies and gentlemen.
              THE WITNESS:
    Just for clarification, this was my angle that I came in.
18
    When the subjects came out the back door, the first subject
19
   that I observed was the shorter of the two, with the handgun
20
21
    in his right hand, with his face concealed. I immediately
    started to say, please drop the gun or I'm going to shoot. I
   gave my intent.
23
              Side by side with him was the taller male, and he
24
    appeared to be carrying something large. I don't know if it
25
```

was a bag, or a jacket, or something like that, but when I gave the verbal commands to drop the gun or I will shoot, I kept saying to get on the ground, get on the ground, get on the ground, the taller of the two males started to go to the ground.

I recall the taller of the two shed something off of his person, then run through the dirt area, and come to this wall, where he would later, within seconds, jump over this wall and run in a southbound direction down this sidewalk, and run southbound from the store itself, shedding clothing.

12 BY MS. KILLER:

- Q And Officer, I'm going to show you State's 64. Is that the wall we were just discussing?
- A It is, and where I'm going to mark this X, this is where the taller of the two gentlemen hopped over the wall, and then ran southbound in this direction here.
- Q And for the record, it appears to be brown-colored portion near the left edge of the photograph. Where did the shorter -- the individual you saw with the gun go?
- A I'm going to make a circle here, and you're going to see a white area that looks like a gate, which is actually what it is. It's a point of entry that actually goes inside this residential area. And after I'd given an order to drop the gun, go to the ground, the shorter male stood back up and

started running again with a handgun in his right hand, and I continued chasing through this gate, where he actually went through the gate and southbound down that street.

MS. KILLER: And then if we could clear that.

THE WITNESS: Just to be clear, ladies and gentlemen, the taller male didn't just run off on his own, and then I stayed with the shorter male. This both happened at the same time, and it was very dynamic. They were both running at the same time.

However, they had slowed, and before I gave another order to drop the gun with my intent to shoot, I used preclusion, and I thought that they were actually going to give up at that time. Within seconds, the tall subject went down this sidewalk, what I recall, shedding clothes. The second subject came through that POE, or point of entry, which is the gate here, and started to run westbound on Stockbridge with me in hot pursuit.

BY MS. KILLER:

Q At that point, were other officers responding to the area to pursue both suspects?

A To answer that question, I could hear lights and siren -- or not -- I couldn't hear the lights. I could hear the sirens coming, they were getting louder, so I knew that I had help coming. And I was trying to be clear and concise on the radio to walk people in because he was still armed, and

also give a directional on the other subject, because I had no idea where he was going, and I did not know in fact if he was armed and dangerous as well. I still knew that my partner was at the front of the location, and I didn't know if he was behind me or if he was still out front.

Q Did you stay with the shorter individual with the gun that you've identified as the defendant on the far right of the table?

A Yes, ma'am, I did stick with the armed and dangerous subject.

Q And from this point, what happened and where did you go?

A As we came through this gate, I again said, drop the gun or I'm going to shoot you. He started to round this corner, and I started to take a wide angle again, because I didn't know -- through my training and experience as an officer, there's been a lot of ambushes lately. I didn't want to just run up around that corner. I then observed that male with the handgun in his right hand turn back in my location, and continue to run westbound, with me running behind him this way.

Q As you continued to pursue him, at any point, did he turn towards you with the weapon?

A Yes.

MS. KILLER: Can we clear?

THE WITNESS: As the subject went southbound through this point of entry through the gate, and began to go westbound on Stockbridge Street, the subject with the handgun in his right hand turned back and looked, and his hand and firearm came back in my direction. This is after twice where I've identified myself, ordered him to drop the weapon, and go to the ground. He still refused to drop the weapon; still possessed not only the means within his hand, but the ability to cause harm on me. BY MS. KILLER:

10

1

2

3

5

6

7

9

- When you say you identified yourself, do you mean 11 Q as a police officer? 12
- Yes, ma'am. 13 Α
- Okay. And when he turned around with the gun in 14 0 his hand, was the gun pointed at you? 15
- 16 It was in my direction. Yes, ma'am.
- 17 And at that point, did you feel that the suspect 18 could or would shoot at you?
- Absolutely. 19 Α
- 20 So, it caused you --
- 21 Objection, leading. MR. SANFT:
- 22 THE COURT: I didn't even hear a question.
- Oh, it's going to happen. 23 MR. SANFT:
- 24 THE COURT: You have a crystal ball?
- MR. SANFT: Psychic. Psychic, Your Honor. 25

THE COURT: I didn't hear your question.

MS. KILLER: I was actually stopping myself in the middle of a word to rephrase, so.

BY MS. KILLER:

- Q As a result of the situation and your impression of what he was going to do, did you raise your gun or fire upon him?
- A My gun was in fact raised with my finger on the trigger, running after him. I chose to use preclusion and prudency due to the fact that there was a vehicle moving down that street at the same time of that foot pursuit, and I observed a man standing in the roadway, and had I missed that subject with the firearm, I could have accidentally shot someone else. And being accountable for the round, I chose not to fire my weapon.
- Q That car you saw, can you describe it, if you remember any details about it?
- A I only recall a goldish-colored vehicle, and I recall a female that appeared to light-skinned. She could have been white, she could have been Hispanic, I don't know, but it appeared to be a white female to me in a goldish-brownish-colored car.
- Q Let's switch -- now showing you State's 44, does this map depict the entire housing development south of the store?

- A Yes, ladies and gentlemen, it does.
- Q Once the defendant had pointed the weapon at you, you told us you chose not to fire, did he then continue fleeing from you?
 - A Yes.
- Q Okay. Can you describe for us where your pursuit went from there?

A Through the gate, westbound on Stockbridge, he then went all the way to the end of the street and started to go southbound in between the house and the wall that borders to Lamb Boulevard, which is the long street in the map.

Then, I started to take a tactical angle on the north side of the street so I could -- we have a technique called cutting the pie. So, like I said, with the ambush, I didn't just run up through there. I tried to go across the street so I could actually see around a parked vehicle that was there, around a tree, and eventually, around the premise.

And it was at that time that I saw my partner,

Officer Blaine Martell, come to this area where I made that

dot. And the reason that I could see him was at the end of

Stockbridge, as it goes out onto Lamb Boulevard, you actually

can't ingress or egress onto it. There's actually a gate

there, and I don't know if it's locked or fixed or not, but

you can actually see through to the traffic, both pedestrian

and vehicle, and I knew he was there.

And at that time, I slowed it down. It's a tactic we use just to kind of walk in the rest of the officers with the air and a canine, set a perimeter, and give the directions on what I saw, and eventually, the subjects were taken into custody by assisting units.

- Q Okay. So, you were unable at that point to personally continue to pursue the suspect down Lamb Boulevard, but you later observed and learned that he was taken into custody by other officers?
 - A Yes, ladies and gentlemen, that's correct.
- 12 | Q When --
- MS. KILLER: Could we clear it? Sorry.
- 14 BY MS. KILLER:

1

2

3

5

6

7

10

11

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

- Q When he was taken into custody by other officers, did you later do -- I guess it would be a show-up. Did you go observe the suspects in custody?
- A Yes, ladies and gentlemen, I did. We conducted a show-up with both subjects that I've identified in court as the subjects that I saw prior to the violent incident in the Family Dollar, and also running from our position from the Family Dollar.
- 23 Q Did you view those people individually?
- 24 A Yes, I did.
- 25 Q The -- so both defendants -- you were shown -- both

suspects that the other officers detained, you went and 1 viewed individually? 2 3 Yes, ma'am. Α And those two people were the same two people you 4 0 5 saw enter and rob the Family Dollar? 6 Yes, ma'am. Α Okay, and are those the same two people you've 7 Q identified for us here in court today? 8 That is correct, ladies and gentlemen. Going back 9 Α to the second -- the second individual with the mask -- the 10 skull mask, as I believe you've described it, showing you 11 State's 84, is that the mask you -- is that the mask you saw 12 him wearing? 13 Yes, it is. 14 Α Court's indulgence. 15 MS. KILLER: 16 (Pause in the proceedings) 17 MS. KILLER: No further questions. 18 THE COURT: Cross? 19 CROSS-EXAMINATION 20 BY MR. SANFT: Investigator Walburn, your testimony was that you 21 Q were following the two individuals out of the store, chasing after both of them at the same time; is that correct? 23

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

And you're running across this dirt field as

24

25

Yes.

Α

they're both heading in the general direction of a development?

A For clarification, ladies and gentlemen, I didn't say dirt field. Actually, what it is, the majority of my running was done on pavement. There's a small dirt area at the egress point where the exit is at the back of the Family Dollar, and that's actually where the smaller of the two gentlemen with the firearm actually slowed down, and that's where the other subject looked to actually drop something. I don't -- like I said, I don't know if it was a clothing article, or if it was actually a bag, before he jumped over the wall. And then, after that, we were back on hardtop pavement as you get through the gate and into the residential area.

Q Okay. Just for clarification for the jury, I'm showing you what's been marked and admitted State's Exhibit number 44. Sir, this particular area right here, this is the area that we're -- oh, that's not it. This is the area that we're talking about. The two individuals came out of this direction of the building and headed in this direction towards this development; is that correct?

A May I mark on here, sir, for clarification?

Q Absolutely.

A Thank you, sir. Ladies and gentlemen, the shorter subject with the firearm came to this direction to the gate,

and then here. The taller gentleman side by side slowed down, then came here, over the wall, and then down this sidewalk, and I lost sight of him.

- Q All right. Now, the two individuals, you chose at some point to focus on one individual over the other; is that correct?
 - A Yes, sir, it is.

- Q All right. And the individual that you chose to focus on was the individual that I'm assuming you believed was the greater threat out of the two because a -- the presence of a firearm that you believed was in his hand?
 - A Yes, sir, that's correct.
- Q Okay. So, that particular individual is the one that you've marked here in State's Exhibit 44 that went down in this direction as you've marked; is that correct?
 - A Yes, sir.
- Q Now, when you are now focusing on one individual, it's fair to assume, of course, at that point, you've not necessarily disregarded, but you no longer have eyes on the other individual; is that correct?
- A That is correct.
- Q All right. So, the two individuals at this particular time, one's jumping over a wall, one's going around into this little egress area or whatever the case is; am I being correct so far?

- A It's a point of entry; an ingress into the community. An open gate, if you will.
 - Q All right. And in terms of the timing of the two individuals, as they're making their way into the development, would it be fair to say that they're roughly about the same time?
 - A Yes, they were both running together --
- 8 Q Okay.

1

3

5

6

9

10

11

12

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

- A -- at the same time.
- Q So, but you realized as the two individuals were coming around this direction that one of those individuals had a gun; is that correct?
- 13 A Yes, sir.
 - Q It's around this area that you realized that one of the individuals had a firearm?
 - A Yes, because I had close distance from where I was at the front with the vehicle to the back, and as I came up to take an angle of containment on the rear of the Family Dollar, they came out that door.
 - Q All right. And of course, at that particular point, you selected that individual as being the bigger threat out of the two, and put eyes on that individual?
- 23 A Yes, sir, that's correct.
- Q Okay. Now, your testimony as well is that as this is happening, you no longer have sight of the other

individual that's heading down this street; is that correct?

A Actually, to clarify what you're trying to say, sir

3 | --

Q Sure.

A -- because I'm still going in the same directional, which is first south and then west, I still have a peripheral on that subject going this direction.

Q You have a peripheral?

A Yes.

Q Okay. And your testimony is that as that's happening, you have a peripheral on the other person as you're staring at the person that you believe has a firearm in his hands?

A That is correct.

Q Okay. And your testimony here today is as that's happening, you're observing this individual taking his clothes off, running down the street?

A He actually started to shed his clothes, ladies and gentlemen, here in this parking lot before he got onto that sidewalk which goes down that street, and I don't know the name of it, I apologize, but he started to shed whatever he had on here, and I gave that information on the radio.

Q Okay. And so when you say "here," just for our clarification, it looks like it's the first side street here on the main street called Attleboro Street, so it would be

the first side street that you'd come to if you're heading in this direction; is that correct?

A No, actually, I think you're confused, sir. And just for clarification, I apologize if I misunderstand. What I'm trying to tell you is after the taller of the two gentlemen bound over the wall, he began to shed his clothing. They were layered. He then started to run southbound, and I think it says Attlebrook (phonetic). I can't see it very well.

- Q Attleboro.
- 11 A He then started to run southbound on that street.
- 12 Q Okay.

A At that point, when he continued southbound, this is happening within seconds. I'm focused now on the subject going westbound on Storybrook (phonetic). I gave the directional on the radio for the incoming assistance that was coming; air, canine, and marked units.

Q Okay. So, you're right, I am a little bit confused, so let me make sure I'm absolutely clear with you, sir.

A Yes, sir.

Q Your testimony now is that the individual -- the second individual that jumps over the wall in this direction sheds his clothing in this area, all of it, and then starts running down the street?

A No, sir, that's not what I'm saying. I saw him start to begin to shed his clothing, as if to rip off and over the head, and continue running southbound. I don't know how much clothing he shed --

Q Okay.

1

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

13

14

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

A -- but I did see him start to shed something on his upper torso.

Q All right.

A I don't know if it was something on his head, if it was clothing up, but that's what I saw.

11 Q All right, and I appreciate that distinction,
12 because I want to make sure --

A Thank you, sir.

Q I'm sorry?

15 A Oh, I said thank you.

Q Okay. And I want to make absolutely sure, your testimony here is that you had eyes on the other person at some point, and your peripheral vision was able to see the other person running down. At some point, you must have lost contact with him, correct?

A Yes, I lost contact with him probably in this area right here at the corner.

Q Okay.

MR. SANFT: Thank you. No further questions.

25 THE WITNESS: Thank you, sir.

Mr. Parris, any cross? 1 THE COURT: 2 MR. PARRIS: Yes, Your Honor. 3 CROSS-EXAMINATION 4 BY MR. PARRIS: 5 When you first saw the two gentlemen making the --6 looking around the Family Dollar, you were going -- I guess it would be eastbound on Lake Mead, correct? 8 Yes, sir, that's correct. What's the speed limit on Lake Mead on that stretch 9 of road, if you know? 10 I do not know, ladies and gentlemen. 11 12 And it sounded like you were going at -- well, how fast were you driving if you were called? 13 I'm actually glad you asked the question. 14 Α I have 15 been with my partner I want to say about two years. 16 actually don't drive the vehicle; I sit in the right front 17 passenger seat. And we had actually been coming off of Lamb and were turning from a red light on Lamb Boulevard eastbound 18 onto Lake Mead, so we just started to pick up speed as we 19 actually turned eastbound, going east on that street in front 20 21 of the Family Dollar when we observed the two gentlemen walking northbound into the store. 23 THE COURT: I think the question was do you know 24 how fast you were going. 25 THE WITNESS: Yeah, and I don't, Your Honor.

THE COURT: 1 Okay. 2 MR. PARRIS: Okay. 3 Thank you. THE WITNESS: 4 BY MR. PARRIS: 5 But just for clarification purposes, looking at 6 Exhibit 44, you indicated you had turned off of Lamb. 7 you going -- well, on this picture, were you coming from the right hand side or the lefthand side? Where you're marking, we actually -- if I can draw 9 Α here, sir? 10 11 Please. 0 12 Thank you. We came from here, and then started to 13 come eastbound down Lake Mead. So, you partner, he was driving the car, and he was 14 Q 15 accelerating as he was going toward the top of the map as it's oriented on this exhibit, correct? 16 17 Yes, sir, that's correct. Okay. And then, you indicated that you saw the two 18 Q gentlemen who were looking around the exterior of the Family 19 Dollar, correct? 20 21 That is correct. Α And then your partner pulled -- made a u-turn and 22 almost got into an accident, I believe is what you had 23 referenced, correct? 24

ROUGH DRAFT TRANSCRIPT

There was a vehicle that actually came out of a

25

Α

private drive that we had to slow down for, because they did not stop. It was actually a time when my partner was going to stop the vehicle, and I told him, no, we need to get back to the Family Dollar. He agreed, and we went back there and set up in front of the store.

- Q And when you say stop the vehicle, do you mean that he was going to stop the vehicle to avoid the accident, or to allow you and/or him to get out of the car to go to the Family Dollar?
- A No. What I'm trying to say is the vehicle violated a traffic violation. So, at first, he was actually going to initiate a car stop. However, we had observed the behavior at the Family Dollar. We chose to bypass the car stop, and go back to the parking lot, and park the vehicle, and observe the incident.
- Q Okay, I'm sorry. So, you were going to, for lack of a better term, pull over the guy who pulled out in front of you --
- 19 A Yes, sir.

- 20 Q -- while you were doing the u-turn?
- 21 | A Yes, sir.
 - Q Okay. And at that point in time -- excuse me.

 Shortly thereafter is when you returned -- well, regarding the u-turn, this is State's Exhibit 43. On this map -- on this map, can you show me -- or does this map show where the

car pulled out in front of you as your partner was completing the u-turn?

A It's hard to actually view here, but there are points that come out from this -- it looks like it says Meads Hardware. I don't know if that's a street or not, but if I'm going to draw a circle for you, sir, this is the area where we conducted the u-turn to come back to the store.

Q Okay. So, it's somewhere in the vicinity of what's listed on this exhibit as Mead's Hardware, or that building, that's generally where that car pulled in front of you?

A Yeah, that's what I recall, sir.

Q Okay. Then you indicated you set up directly in front of the Family Dollar Store, correct?

A Yes, sir.

Q And at that point in time when you were in front of the Family Dollar, when you next saw the gentleman, at that juncture, they were wearing their respective masks or facial coverings, correct?

A That is correct.

Q Now I'm going to fast-forward a little bit. There was a point in time when you ran around the side of the building and saw those two gentlemen who were wearing masks come out that back side door, correct?

A Correct.

Q And that's when they ran towards -- this is State's

- Exhibit 44 again. That's when they ran through this parking lot here toward -- well, yeah, that's when they ran toward

 Attleboro Street, correct?
 - A That is correct.
 - Q Now, at some point in time, you'd indicated that the taller of the two gentlemen was somewhere in the vicinity of this parking lot where he hopped the wall. You said he was taking off his clothing by his torso, correct?
 - A Yes.

4

6

9

- Q Okay, so that would be his -- either a shirt or a jacket, something along those lines?
- A Something in the upper body, yes. I don't know if it was from his head garment, I don't know if it was a jacket, but I saw something coming off as he ran southbound.
- Q But you're not sure what that was -- what he took

 off at that juncture, correct?
- 17 A No, sir, I do not know.
- 18 Q Your attention was drawn to the other individual, 19 correct?
- 20 A Yes, sir.
- 21 Q Now, when the other individual turned down -- I'm 22 sorry, I believe this street right here is Stockbridge; is 23 that what that street is?
- 24 A I do not recall.
- 25 Q When the other individual with -- that you said had

1 the handgun ran down the side street toward Lamb Boulevard,
2 he still had his facial covering on; his mask or whatever,
3 correct?

A I recall yes.

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

- Q Okay. So, you did not see that -- the gentleman with the firearm, you did not see him -- while you had him in your view, you didn't see him taking off clothing or shedding anything, correct?
 - A Not that I recall. No, sir.
- Q And regarding the taller of the two gentlemen who you did see take off some clothing in this parking lot, you're not sure what if -- what he did succeed in taking off either in that parking lot or further down once you've lost sight of him, correct?
 - A That is correct.
- Q Now, after you stopped personally pursuing the gentleman with the firearm, and you started -- I believe you said you were helping to set up a perimeter, you and your partner, correct?
- 20 A Yes, I was.
- Q After that point in time, you never saw the taller of the two individuals until you did the show-up
- 23 | identification, correct?
- 24 A That is correct.
- 25 Q And regarding the shorter of the two individuals,

you never saw him from the time that you stopped the pursuit until the time that you made the show-up identification, correct?

- A That is correct, sir.
- Q So, you have no independent knowledge as to what route they necessarily took once they were out of your view, correct?
- A That is correct, sir.
- 9 MR. PARRIS: Court's indulgence. Your Honor, I 10 have nothing further.
- 11 THE COURT: Thank you. Any redirect?
- 12 MS. KILLER: Just very, very, very briefly.
- 13 REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- 14 BY MS. KILLER:

4

5

6

7

8

22

23

24

25

- Officer, Mr. Sanft here had asked you a question regarding seeing the firearm in the suspect's hand who pointed it at you after you entered the housing area. You --I just want to clarify, you also saw him holding the firearm, the same person, when they were inside the Family Dollar, correct?
- 21 A Yes, ma'am, that is correct.
 - Q Okay. And because we have the map every which way, just for purposes of the record, you had been going southbound on Lamb, and made left turn to go eastbound on Lake Mead when you first observed them outside the Family

```
Dollar?
 1
              Yes, ma'am, that is what I recall.
 2
         Α
              MS. KILLER: Court's indulgence, I just need to
 3
    check really quick. No further questions.
 4
 5
              THE COURT: Any recross, Mr. Sanft?
 6
              MR. SANFT: No, Your Honor.
 7
              THE COURT: Any recross, Mr. Parris?
              MR. PARRIS: No, Your Honor, thank you.
 8
                          Thank you very much for your testimony
 9
              THE COURT:
   here today. You may step down. You are excused from your
10
    subpoena. Thank you for being here.
11
              THE WITNESS: Thank you, Judge. Thank you, ladies
12
13
    and gentlemen.
              THE COURT: At this time, we're going to conclude
14
15
    for the day. Can I have the attorneys approach so we just --
16
    I can't remember what start time I gave you.
17
              MR. SANFT:
              THE COURT: Did I say 9:00 o'clock? I can't
18
19
    remember.
20
                          (Bench conference)
21
              MR. SANFT:
                          I thought it was 9:00.
              THE COURT: I thought it was 9:00, but I couldn't
22
23
              If I tell them 9:00 o'clock, can everybody be here
    remember.
24
    at 9:00?
              MR. SANFT: Yeah. I'm sure these guys will be
25
```

ready to go. They probably have people outside right now. 1 THE COURT: Can everyone be here at 9:00? You just 2 have the [inaudible] left. 3 We've got a couple of things --4 MR. PESCI: THE COURT: 5 The girlfriend, right? 6 MR. PESCI: Well, no, we've got --7 MS. KILLER: Two or three more, don't we? 8 MR. PESCI: We have --9 THE COURT: Oh, okay, you have two or three more 10 witnesses? 11 MR. PESCI: Yeah. We have -- we have some people 12 that we don't know if we're going to get. 13 THE COURT: Oh. MR. PESCI: So, one count might disappear on Chad 14 15 Williams. We've been trying. Originally, he talked to an investigator, but we haven't been able to pin him down since, 16 so we're still trying to find out about that. We have Rafael 17 Ramirez, who was at Family Dollar, who sees Tonya's car. 18 have Cang Tran -- presumably, we have him. He's the male 19 20 inside the Las Vegas Nails. 21 THE COURT: Okay. MR. PESCI: We've been having problems getting a 22 hold of him, but we think we got him now. Then we have the 23 24 other officer from this incident, then we have the female, 25 and then we have potentially -- definitively, one more

```
detective, Detective Dave Miller, and maybe Detective Guyer
 1
    if we seek to introduce --
 3
              MS. KILLER: Parker.
 4
              MR. PESCI: -- Parker's statement. I'm not sure
 5
   we're going to introduce Parker's statement. If we don't,
   then we don't need that --
 7
              THE COURT:
                          Okay.
 8
              MR. PARRIS: You also --
              THE COURT: But can everyone be here at 9:00
 9
10
   o'clock?
11
              MR. SANFT:
                         Yeah.
             THE COURT: Sounds like you got a full day of
12
13
   witnesses.
             MR. PARRIS: Yes. Well, you --
14
             MR. SANFT: I don't know -- sorry.
15
16
             MR. PARRIS: Well, you also may have Detective
17
   Larsen -- Lorson, depending upon what Ms. Martin does.
             MR. PESCI: Correct. If Mr. Martin goes backwards,
18
   then we would call Lorson, but --
19
20
              THE COURT: She better not go backwards.
21
              MR. PESCI: I don't think that she's going to.
22
              THE COURT:
                         Was she in front of me?
             MR. PESCI: We've expressed how she needs to be on
23
24
   task in front of you, but I think we've told our first
   witness 10:00, but we can tell like Martell 9:00, so we can
25
```

```
1
    start at 9:00.
 2
                          Okay.
              THE COURT:
                          We'll figure something out.
 3
              MR. PESCI:
                          So, we can start at 9:00? Okay.
 4
              THE COURT:
 5
              MR. SANFT:
                          Thank you.
 6
              MR. PESCI:
                          Sorry, that was long-winded.
              THE COURT:
                          That's okay. Thank you.
              MR. PARRIS: The answer's 9:00.
 8
 9
                       (End of bench conference)
10
              THE COURT:
                          Okay. At this time, ladies and
    gentlemen, I just wanted to get a start time. We're going to
11
    start tomorrow morning at 9:00 o'clock.
12
13
              During this recess, you're admonished not to talk
14
    or converse amongst yourselves or with anyone else on any
15
    subject connected with this trial, or read, watch, or listen
16
   to any report of or commentary on the trial, or any person
17
    connected with this trial, by any medium of information,
    including, without limitation, newspapers, television, the
18
    internet, or radio, or form or express any opinion on any
19
20
    subject connected with this trial until the case is finally
21
    submitted to you.
22
              You're excused. We'll see you tomorrow morning at
    9:00 o'clock. Have a good night.
23
                           Thank you. All rise for the exiting
24
              THE MARSHAL:
   jury, please. Jurors.
25
```

```
(Outside the presence of the jurors)
 1
                      (Pause in the proceedings)
 2
                          Judge, if we could, before you leave --
 3
              MR. PESCI:
                          Oh, do we need -- sure.
              THE COURT:
 4
 5
              MR. PESCI:
                         Your J --
 6
                         One of your -- are you okay?
              THE COURT:
 7
                         It's about instructions. I don't think
              MR. PESCI:
    it's --
8
              MR. PARRIS: It's about jury instructions.
 9
10
              THE COURT:
                          Oh, okay.
                          I'll waive my client's presence.
11
              MR. PESCI:
                          Okay, okay.
12
              THE COURT:
13
              MR. PARRIS: I'll inform him later.
              MR. PESCI: Your JEA asked for our instructions
14
15
   yesterday during trial. Last night, I sent them to her and
   to defense counsel. They are proposed. I don't -- we, the
16
17
    State, have not received anything from the defense.
18
              MR. SANFT:
                          Yet.
                           To Mr. --
19
              MR. PARRIS:
                          I would ask, if there's anything, to
20
              MR. PESCI:
21
    give that to us. I know they need to review ours.
              MR. PARRIS: Yeah. To Mr. Pesci's credit, he sent
22
23
    those instructions at -- I believe it was 12:37 A.M.
24
              THE COURT: Just to be a show off?
25
              MR. SANFT:
                         No.
```

```
MR. PESCI: My youngest was sick. I was up and at
 1
 2
    'em.
                          Oh, darn it.
 3
              THE COURT:
              MR. PARRIS: Yes, just to be a show off.
 4
 5
                          And then I get that response.
              THE COURT:
 6
              MR. PARRIS:
                           Yeah.
 7
                          Mr. Pesci just got me.
              THE COURT:
              MR. PARRIS: That having been said, neither Mr.
 8
 9
   Sanft or I have had an opportunity to review since we've been
    in trial for most of the day, and we did have court
10
   appearances this morning. We will certainly do so tonight
11
12
   and supplement them as needed.
13
              THE COURT:
                          Okay.
              MR. PARRIS: Probably -- I would assume we would
14
15
   have everything submitted to Your Honor by lunch, but again,
   I don't know if how the witnesses testify in the afternoon
16
17
   might change things.
18
              THE COURT: Sounds like we have a full day from the
19
    State.
            I don't -- I don't think we'll be done with the State
20
    tomorrow.
21
              MR. PESCI: So, let's ask you that. We're --
22
                         Oh, we might be done with the State.
              MR. PESCI: But we're asking, do we need to be
23
24
   ready to close tomorrow?
              MR. PARRIS: I don't think we're going to get
25
```

```
there, Your Honor.
 1
              THE COURT: I think it would be really -- I don't -
              MR. PESCI: But if we tell you we're not ready
 3
    tomorrow, you're not going to be mad?
 4
                          Of course not, of course not.
 5
              THE COURT:
              MR. PARRIS: Thank you, Your Honor.
 6
              MS. KILLER: Thank you.
                       (Pause in the proceedings)
 8
              (Court recessed at 5:28 p.m., until Friday,
                    December 4, 2015, at 9:16 a.m.)
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

ATTEST: Pursuant to Rule 30(d) of the Nevada Rules of Appellate Procedure, I acknowledge that this is a rough draft transcript, expeditiously prepared, not proofread, corrected, or certified to be an accurate transcript.

Verbatim Digital Reporting, LLC Englewood, CO 80110 303-798-0890

AULTE LOND TRANSCRIES