(702) 485-3300 FAX (702) 485-3301

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

NOAS 1 DIANA CLINE EBRON, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 10580 2 E-mail: diana@KGELegal.com JACQUELINE A. GILBERT, ESQ. 3 Nevada Bar No. 10593 E-mail: jackie@KGELegal.com 4 KAREN L. HANKS, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 09578 5 E-mail: karen@KGELegal.com KIM GILBERT EBRON (FKA HOWARD KIM & ASSOCIATES) 6 7625 Dean Martin Drive, Suite 110 Las Vegas, Nevada 89139 7 Telephone: (702) 485-3300 Facsimile: (702) 485-3301 8 Attorneys for SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC 9

**CLERK OF THE COURT** 

**Electronically Filed** Sep 22 2016 02:36 p.m. Tracie K. Lindeman Clerk of Supreme Court

#### DISTRICT COURT

CLARK COU	NTY, NEVADA
SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC, a Nevada limited liability company,	Case No. A-13-679329-0
Plaintiff,	Dept. No. XXVI
vs.	
FIRST HORIZON HOME LOANS, A DIVISION OF FIRST TENNESSEE BANK, A NATIONAL ASSOCIATION; ANA TORRES, an individual; DOES I through X; and ROE CORPORATIONS I through X, inclusive,	NOTICE OF APPEAL

Defendants.

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC, by and through its counsel of record, Kim Gilbert Ebron, hereby appeals from the following orders and judgments of the district court:

> 1. Order Granting First Horizon Home Loan's Motion for Summary Judgment and Denying SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion for Summary Judgment, entered on August 17, 2016, notice of entry of which was served on August 17, 2016; and

26

27

28

## KIM GILBERT EBRON 7625 DEAN MARTIN DRIVE, SUITE 110 LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89139 (702) 485-3300 FAX (702) 485-3301

2. Any and all orders made appealable thereby.

DATED this 16th day of September, 2016.

#### KIM GILBERT EBRON

/s/ Jacqueline A. Gilbert
DIANA CLINE EBRON, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No. 10580
JACQUELINE A. GILBERT, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No. 10593
KAREN L. HANKS, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No. 9578
7625 Dean Martin Drive, Suite 110
Las Vegas, Nevada 89139
Attorneys for SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC

## KIM GILBERT EBRON 7625 DEAN MARTIN DRIVE, SUTTE 110 LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89139 (702) 485-3300 FAX (702) 485-3301

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this 16th day of September 2016, pursuant to NRCP 5(b), I served via the Eighth Judicial District Court electronic filing system, the foregoing **NOTICE OF APPEAL**, to the following parties:

Select All Select None	
Email	Select
akermanlas@akerman.com	A (A
melanie.morgan@akerman.com	M M
Email	Select
eserve@alessikoenig.com	Ø 17
Email	Select
viqila@ballardspahr.com	23 (A
sempers@ballardspahr.com	
Email	Select
<u>lvdocket@ballardspahr.com</u>	e e
	Email akermanlas@akerman.com melanie.morgan@akerman.com  Email eserve@alessikoenig.com  Email vigila@ballardspahr.com sempers@ballardspahr.com

/s/Jacqueline A. Gilbert
An employee of Kim Gilbert Ebron

**CLERK OF THE COURT** 

(702) 485-3300 FAX (702) 485-3301

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

inclusive.

**ASTA** 1 DIANA CLINE EBRON, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 10580 2 E-mail: diana@KGELegal.com JACQUELINE A. GILBERT, ESQ. 3 Nevada Bar No. 10593 E-mail: jackie@KGELegal.com 4 KAREN L. HANKS, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 09578 5 E-mail: karen@KGELegal.com KIM GILBERT EBRON (FKA HOWARD KIM & ASSOCIATES) 6 7625 Dean Martin Drive, Suite 110 Las Vegas, Nevada 89139 7 Telephone: (702) 485-3300 Facsimile: (702) 485-3301 8 Attorneys for SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC 9

DISTRICT COURT

#### **CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA**

SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC, a Case No. A-13-679329-C Nevada limited liability company, Dept. No. XXVI Plaintiff. VS. CASE APPEAL STATEMENT FIRST HORIZON HOME LOANS, A DIVISION OF FIRST TENNESSEE BANK. A NATIONAL ASSOCIATION; ANA

Defendants.

TORRES, an individual; DOES I through X; and ROE CORPORATIONS I through X,

#### **CASE APPEAL STATEMENT**

- 1. Name of appellant filing this case appeal statement: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC (SFR).
- Identify the judge issuing the decision, judgment, or order appealed from:

The Honorable Gloria Sturman

Identify each appellant and the name and address of counsel for each appellant:

Appellant: SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Counsel: Jacqueline A. Gilbert, Esq. Diana Cline Ebron, Esq.

Zachary Clayton, Esq.

## KIM GILBERT EBRON 7625 DEAN MARTIN DRIVE, SUITE 110 LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89139

(702) 485-3300 FAX (702) 485-3301

26

27

28

1

KIM GILBERT EBRON 7625 Dean Martin Drive, Suite 110 Las Vegas, Nevada 89139

4. Identify each respondent and the name and address of appellate counsel, if known, for each respondent (if the name of a respondent's appellate counsel is unknown, indicate as much and provide the name and address of that respondent's trial counsel):

Respondent: First Horizon Home Loans, a Division of First Tennessee Bank, a National

Association

Trial Counsel: Melanie D. Morgan, Esq.

Akerman LLP

1160 Town Center Drive, Suite 330

Las Vegas, Nevada, 89144

5. Indicate whether any attorney identified above in response to question 3 or 4 is not licensed to practice law in Nevada and, if so, whether the district court granted that attorney permission to appear under <u>SCR 42</u> (attach a copy of any district court order granting such permission):

N/A

6. Indicate whether appellant was represented by appointed or retained counsel in the district court:

Retained

7. Indicate whether appellant is represented by appointed or retained counsel on appeal:

Retained

8. Indicate whether appellant was granted leave to proceed in forma pauperis, and the date of entry of the district court order granting such leave:

N/A

9. Indicate the date the proceedings commenced in the district court (e.g., date complaint, indictment, information, or petition was filed):

April 2, 2013

10. Provide a brief description of the nature of the action and result in the district court, including the type of judgment or order being appealed and the relief granted by the district court:

This is one of many appeals arising from a homeowners association's ("Association") non-judicial foreclosure sale pursuant to NRS 116. Here, both First Horizon (the "Bank") and

# KIM GILBERT EBRON

7625 DEAN MARTIN DRIVE, SUITE 110 LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89139 (702) 485-3300 FAX (702) 485-3301 1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

Association were proceeding with non-judicial foreclosure sales. The Bank foreclosed first, with the Property reverting to the Bank. However, the bank did not record its foreclosure deed, nor did it pay the Association the super-priority portion of the Association's lien that remained after the Bank sale prior to the Association holding its foreclosure sale, at which SFR purchased the Property. SFR filed the instant lawsuit seeking quiet title/declaratory relief, for unjust enrichment, and to obtain permanent injunctive relief against the Bank. The Association and Alessi & Koenig intervened, and joined SFR's motion.

The parties filed cross-motions for summary judgment. Following full briefing and a hearing, the district court granted the Bank's motion and denied SFR's and the joinders thereto, concluding that after title transferred to the Bank, the Association had to begin the foreclosure process anew on the super-priority portion of the lien. The resulting order voided the Association's sale, which the district court stayed pending appeal.

Indicate whether the case has previously been the subject of an appeal to or original writ proceeding in the Supreme Court and, if so, the caption and Supreme Court docket number of the prior proceeding:

N/A.

Indicate whether this appeal involves child custody or visitation:

N/A.

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

## KIM GILBERT EBRON 7625 DEAN MARTIN DRIVE, SUITE 110 LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89139 (702) 485-3300 FAX (702) 485-3301

### 13. If this is a civil case, indicate whether this appeal involves the possibility of settlement:

SFR is always willing to attempt to settle but has never been able to settle a case against a party represented by Akerman, LLP.

DATED this 16th day of September, 2016.

#### KIM GILBERT EBRON

/s/ Jacqueline A. Gilbert
DIANA CLINE EBRON, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No. 10580
JACQUELINE A. GILBERT, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No. 10593
KAREN L. HANKS, ESQ.
Nevada Bar No. 9578
7625 Dean Martin Drive, Suite 110
Las Vegas, Nevada 89139
Attorneys for SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC

## KIM GILBERT EBRON 7625 DEAN MARTIN DRIVE, SUTTE 110 LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89139 (702) 485-3300 FAX (702) 485-3301

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this 16th day of September 2016, pursuant to NRCP 5(b), I served via the Eighth Judicial District Court electronic filing system, the foregoing **CASE APPEAL STATEMENT**, to the following parties:

	Select All Select None		
kerman LLP			
Name	Email	Select	
Akerman Las Vegas Office	<u>akermanias@akerman.com</u>	<b>A</b> (2	
Melanie D. Morgan, Esq.	melanie.morgan@akerman.com	S M	
lessi & Koenig			
Name	Email	Select	
A&K eserve	eserve@alessikoenig.com	A P	
allard Spahr			
Name	Email	Select	
Abran Vigil	vigila@ballardspahr.com	ZI (Z	
Sylvia Semper	sempers@ballardspahr.com	ZJ N	
allard Spahr LLP			
Name	Email	Select	
Las Vegas Docketing	<u>lvdocket@ballardspahr.com</u>	M M	

/s/Jacqueline A. Gilbert
An employee of Kim Gilbert Ebron

## CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-13-679329-C

SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC, Plaintiff(s)

VS.

First Horizon Home Loans, Defendant(s)

Location:
Judicial Officer:
Filed on:
Cross-Reference Case
Number:

Department 26
Sturman, Gloria
04/02/2013
A679329

#### **CASE INFORMATION**

Case Type: **Title to Property**Subtype: **Quiet Title** 

Case Flags: Appealed to Supreme Court

Automatically Exempt from Arbitration

DATE CASE ASSIGNMENT

**Current Case Assignment** 

Case Number A-13-679329-C Court Department 26 Date Assigned 04/02/2013 Judicial Officer Sturman, Gloria

PARTY INFORMATION

Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Kim, Ho

**Kim, Howard C.** *Retained* 702-485-3300(W)

Defendant First Horizon Home Loans Morgan, Melanie D.

Retained 702-362-6666(W)

Torres, Ana

Intervenor Alessi & Koenig LLC

Lam, Huong Retained 702-222-4033(W)

Squire Village at Silver Springs Community Association

Lam, Huong Retained 702-222-4033(W)

DATE **E**VENTS & **O**RDERS OF THE COURT **INDEX** 04/02/2013 Notice of Lis Pendens Filed by: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Notice of Lis Pendens 04/02/2013 Complaint Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Complaint 04/02/2013 Case Opened 04/05/2013 (a) Summons Filed by: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Summons - First Horizon Home Loans, a Division of First Tennessee Bank

## CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-13-679329-C

	CASE No. A-13-679329-C
04/05/2013	Summons Issued Summons
04/22/2013	Affidavit of Service Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Affidavit of Service
05/13/2013	Answer Filed By: Defendant First Horizon Home Loans First Horizon Home Loans' Answer to Plaintiff's Complaint
06/14/2013	Affidavit of Service Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Affidavit of Service - Ana Torres
07/16/2013	Application for Entry of Default Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Application for Entry of Default against Ana Torres
08/26/2013	Joint Case Conference Report Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Joint Case Conference Report
08/27/2013	Amended Joint Case Conference Report Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Amended Joint Case Conference Report
09/09/2013	Scheduling Order  Scheduling Order
09/11/2013	Order Setting Civil Bench Trial  Order Setting Civil Bench Trial
09/19/2013	Notice of Change of Address  Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC  Notice of Change of Address and Notice of Change of Attorney
10/04/2013	Certificate of Service Filed by: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Certificate of Service
04/07/2014	Amended Order  Amended Order Setting Bench Trial
04/30/2014	Default Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Default Against Ana Torres
05/19/2014	Motion to Intervene Party: Intervenor Alessi & Koenig LLC Motion to Intervene
05/19/2014	Certificate of Service

#### CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-13-679329-C

CASE NO. A-13-679329-C		
	Filed by: Intervenor Alessi & Koenig LLC  Certificate of Service	
05/22/2014	Affidavit of Service Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Affidavit of Service	
06/09/2014	Notice of Withdrawal Filed By: Intervenor Alessi & Koenig LLC Notice of Withdrawal of Motion to Intervene	
06/19/2014	Motion to Intervene (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Sturman, Gloria)  Alessi & Koenig's, LLC, Motion to Intervene	
06/24/2014	Reporters Transcript  Recorder's Transcript of Proceedings: Motion to Intervene Thursday, June 19, 2014	
07/08/2014	Stipulation and Order Filed by: Defendant First Horizon Home Loans Stipulation and Order to Stay Litigation	
07/09/2014	Notice of Entry of Stipulation and Order Filed By: Defendant First Horizon Home Loans Notice of Entry of Stipulation and Order to Stay Litigation	
08/14/2014	CANCELED Calendar Call (11:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Sturman, Gloria)  Vacated - per Stipulation and Order	
08/21/2014	CANCELED Pre Trial Conference (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Sturman, Gloria) Vacated - Moot	
09/15/2014	CANCELED Bench Trial (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Sturman, Gloria)  Vacated - per Stipulation and Order	
11/04/2014	Status Check (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Sturman, Gloria)  Status Check: Stay	
11/20/2014	Supplemental Case Conference Report  First Supplemental Case Conference Report	
12/08/2014	Recorders Transcript of Hearing Party: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Recorder's Trabscript of Proceeding: Status Check Tuesday, November 4, 2014	
02/24/2015	Stipulation and Order Filed by: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Stipulation and Order to Extend Discovery Deadlines and Re-Set Trial Date	
02/26/2015	Notice of Entry of Stipulation and Order Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Notice of Entry of Stipulation and Order	
02/27/2015	Transcript of Proceedings  Transcript of Proceedings At Request of Court Re: Supreme Court Order Tuesday, December	

## CASE SUMMARY CASE No. A-13-679329-C

	CASE NO. A-13-0/9329-C
	9, 2014
03/06/2015	Order Setting Civil Bench Trial  Order Setting Bench Trial
05/28/2015	Notice of Association of Counsel Filed By: Defendant First Horizon Home Loans Notice of Association of Counsel
06/11/2015	Substitution of Attorney Filed by: Defendant First Horizon Home Loans Substitution of Counsel on behalf of First Horizon Home Loans
07/27/2015	Motion Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Motion for Pre-Trial Coordination on Order Shortening Time
08/07/2015	Opposition to Motion Filed By: Defendant First Horizon Home Loans Defendant's Response in Opposition to Plaintiff SFR Investment Pool 1, LLC's Motion For Pre-Trial Coordination on Order Shortening Time
08/11/2015	Motion to Coordinate (10:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Bare, Rob)  Plaintiff's Motion for Pre-Trial Coordination on Order Shortening Time
08/26/2015	Document Filed Filed by: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Proposed Case Management Order
10/01/2015	Joinder to Opposition to Motion  Filed by: Defendant First Horizon Home Loans  Joinder To Opposition and Notice of Opposition To SFR Investment Pool 1, LLC's Motion For Pre-Trial Coordination on Order Shortening Time
12/16/2015	Notice of Change of Address  Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC  Notice of Change of Address and Notice of Change of Firm Name
12/16/2015	Notice of Change of Address  Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC  Notice of Change of Address and Notice of Change of Firm Name
12/24/2015	Stipulation and Order Filed by: Defendant First Horizon Home Loans Stipulation and Order To Extend Discovery Deadlines (Second Request)
12/29/2015	Notice of Entry of Stipulation and Order Filed By: Defendant First Horizon Home Loans Notice of Entry of Stipulation and Order
01/22/2016	Notice of Entry of Stipulation and Order  Filed By: Defendant First Horizon Home Loans  Notice Of Entry Of Stipulation And Order To Extend Discovery Deadlines (Third Request)

## CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-13-679329-C

	CASE NO. A-13-679329-C
01/22/2016	Stipulation and Order Filed by: Defendant First Horizon Home Loans Stipulation And Order To Extend Discovery Deadlines (Third Request)
01/27/2016	Order Setting Civil Bench Trial  3rd Order Setting Bench Trial
02/25/2016	CANCELED Calendar Call (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Sturman, Gloria)  Vacated - per Stipulation and Order
03/02/2016	Motion for Summary Judgment  Filed By: Defendant First Horizon Home Loans  First Horizon Home Loan's Motion For Summary Judgment
03/02/2016	Motion for Summary Judgment Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion for Summary Judgment
03/03/2016	Notice of Hearing Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Notice of Hearing on SFR's Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion for Summary Judgment
03/21/2016	Opposition to Motion For Summary Judgment Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Opposition to First Horizon Home Loans' Motion for Summary Judgment
03/21/2016	Opposition to Motion  Filed By: Defendant First Horizon Home Loans  First Horizon Home Loan's Opposition to SFR Investment Pool 1 LLC 's Motion for Summary Judgment
03/21/2016	CANCELED Bench Trial (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Sturman, Gloria)  Vacated - per Stipulation and Order
03/29/2016	Reply Filed by: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Reply in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment
04/05/2016	Motion for Summary Judgment (9:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Sturman, Gloria)  First Horizon Home Loan's Motion For Summary Judgment
04/05/2016	Motion for Summary Judgment (9:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Sturman, Gloria)  SFR's Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion for Summary Judgment
04/05/2016	All Pending Motions (9:30 AM) (Judicial Officer: Sturman, Gloria)
06/21/2016	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Transcript of Proceedings First Horizon Home Loan's Motion for Summary Judgment; SFR's  Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion for Summary Judgment Tuesday, April 5, 2016
07/07/2016	Notice Notice of Status Check
07/14/2016	CANCELED Calendar Call (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Israel, Ronald J.)

## CASE SUMMARY CASE No. A-13-679329-C

	Vacated - per Judge
07/19/2016	Memorandum Filed By: Intervenor Alessi & Koenig LLC Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Declaration of Non-Monetary Status
	(NRS 107/SB 239)
08/08/2016	CANCELED Bench Trial (10:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Sturman, Gloria)  Vacated - per Judge
08/16/2016	Status Check (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Sturman, Gloria)  Status Check
08/17/2016	Order Filed By: Defendant First Horizon Home Loans Order Granting First Horizon Home Loan's Motion For Summary Judgment And Denying SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's Motion For Summary Judgment
08/17/2016	Summary Judgment (Judicial Officer: Sturman, Gloria) Debtors: SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC (Plaintiff) Creditors: First Horizon Home Loans (Defendant) Judgment: 08/17/2016, Docketed: 08/24/2016
08/19/2016	Notice of Entry of Order Filed By: Defendant First Horizon Home Loans Notice Of Entry Of Order Granting First Horizon Home Loan's Motion For Summary Judgment And Denying Sfr Investment Pool 1, Llc's Motion For Summary Judgment
09/13/2016	Recorders Transcript of Hearing  Transcript of Proceedings Status Check Tuesday, August 16, 2016
09/16/2016	Notice of Appeal Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Notice of Appeal
09/16/2016	Case Appeal Statement Filed By: Plaintiff SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC Case Appeal Statement

#### CIVIL COVER SHEET

A-13-679329-C XXVI

Clark County, Nevada

Case No. \_\_\_\_\_\_(Assigned by Clerk's Office)

I. Party Information			
Plaintiff(s) (name/address/phone): SFR INVESTMENTS POOL1, LLC  Attorney (name/address/phone): Howard C. Kim, Esq., Diana S. Cline, Esq., and Victoria L. Hightower; Howard Kim and Associates, 400 North Stephanie St., Suite 160, Henderson, Nevada 89014; (702) 485-3300		Defendant(s) (name/address/phone):  FIRST HORIZON HOME LOANS, A DIVISION OF FIRST TENNESSEE BANK, A NATIONAL ASSOCIATION; ANA TORRES, an individual; DOES I through X; and ROE CORPORATIONS I through X, inclusive Attorney (name/address/phone):	
II. Nature of Controversy (Please che applicable subcategory, if appropriate)	eck applicable bold	category and	Arbitration Requested
	Civi	il Cases	
Real Property		To	orts
□ Landlord/Tenant   □ Unlawful Detainer   ☑ Title to Property   □ Foreclosure   □ Liens   ☑ Quiet Title   □ Specific Performance   □ Condemnation/Eminent Domain   □ Other Real Property   □ Partition   □ Planning/Zoning	<ul><li>☐ Negligence – Au</li><li>☐ Negligence – Me</li><li>☐ Negligence – Pre</li></ul>	dical/Dental emises Liability Slip/Fall)	☐ Product Liability ☐ Product Liability/Motor Vehicle ☐ Other Torts/Product Liability ☐ Intentional Misconduct ☐ Torts/Defamation (Libel/Slander) ☐ Interfere with Contract Rights ☐ Employment Torts (Wrongful termination) ☐ Other Torts ☐ Anti-trust ☐ Fraud/Misrepresentation ☐ Insurance ☐ Legal Tort ☐ Unfair Competition
Probate		Other Civil	Filing Types
Estimated Estate Value:  Summary Administration  General Administration  Special Administration  Set Aside Estates  Trust/Conservatorships  Individual Trustee  Corporate Trustee  Other Probate	Insurance Commercia Commercia Other Cont Collection Employme Guarantee Sale Contr Uniform C Civil Petition for Foreclosure Other Admi	act c Construction Carrier al Instrument tracts/Acct/Judgment of Actions ent Contract act ommercial Code r Judicial Review	□ Appeal from Lower Court (also check applicable civil case box) □ Transfer from Justice Court □ Justice Court Civil Appeal □ Civil Writ □ Other Special Proceeding □ Compromise of Minor's Claim □ Conversion of Property □ Damage to Property □ Employment Security □ Enforcement of Judgment □ Foreign Judgment – Civil □ Other Personal Property □ Recovery of Property □ Stockholder Suit □ Other Civil Matters
III. Business Court Requested (Please check applicable category; for Clark or Washoe Counties only.)			
☐ NRS Chapters 78-88 ☐ Commodities (NRS 90) ☐ Securities (NRS 90)	☐ Investments (NR	S 104 Art. 8) Practices (NRS 598)	☐ Enhanced Case Mgmt/Business ☐ Other Business Court Matters
03/26/2013		/s/ Diana S. Cline	
Date	-	Signature of	initiating party or representative

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

AKERMAN LLP

1 ORDR MELANIE D. MORGAN, ESQ. 2 Nevada Bar No. 8215 CHRISTINE M. PARVAN, ESQ. 3 Nevada Bar No. 10711 AKERMAN LLP 4 1160 Town Center Drive, Suite 330 Las Vegas, Nevada 89144 5 Telephone: (702) 634-5000 (702) 380-8572 Facsimile: 6 Email: melanie.morgan@akerman.com Email: christine.parvan@akerman.com 7 Attorneys for First Horizon Home Loans 8 9 10 limited liability company, 11 12 13

Electronically Filed 08/17/2016 05:27:17 PM

**CLERK OF THE COURT** 

#### EIGHTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT

#### CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC, a Nevada

Plaintiff,

Defendants.

**FIRST HORIZON** HOME LOANS. DIVISION OF FIRST TENNESSEE BANK, N.A., a national association; ANA TORRES, an individual; DOES I through X; and ROE CORPORATIONS I through X, inclusive,

Case No.: A-13-679329-C

Dept. No. XXVI

ORDER GRANTING FIRST HORIZON LOAN'S **HOME** MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND DENYING SFR INVESTMENT POOL 1, LLC'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT

This matter came before the court on First Horizon Home Loans, a Division of First Tennessee Bank, N.A.'s (First Horizon) and SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's (SFR) cross motions for summary judgment, and Intervenors' oral joinder to SFR's motion. Following full briefing, the court heard argument of counsel on April 5, 2016. Steven Shevorski, Esq. appeared on behalf of First Horizon, Diana Cline Ebron, Esq. appeared on behalf of SFR, and Steve Loizzi, Esq. appeared on behalf of Intervenors Squire Village at Silver Springs Community Association (HOA) and Alessi & Koenig, LLC (Alessi). The Court, having considered the full briefing on the motions, the pleadings and papers on file herein, and argument of counsel, makes the following Findings of Facts and Conclusions of Law:1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Any findings of fact that are more appropriately conclusions of law shall be so deemed. Any conclusions of law that are more appropriately findings of fact shall be so deemed.

当 

#### FINDINGS OF FACT

- 1. Ana Torres borrowed \$136,9213 from First Horizon to acquire the property located at 5069 Midnight Oil Drive, Las Vegas, Nevada 89122, APN 161-26-111-017 in 2008. The loan was secured by a deed of trust recorded in the Official Records of the Clark County Recorder on July 25, 2008 as Instrument Number 20080725-0003028. Torres defaulted on the loan, and First Horizon recorded a notice of default and election to sale on October 30, 2012.
- 2. On February 1, 2013, the certificate of compliance with Nevada's Foreclosure Mediation Program was recorded. Thereafter, on February 7, 2013, First Horizon recorded a notice of sale setting the date for public auction of the property for February 26, 2013.
- 3. At the February 26, 2013 trustee's sale, First Horizon credit bid for the property and purchased it for \$151,283.09. First Horizon recorded its trustee's deed in the Official Records of the Clark County Recorder on March 7, 2013, as Instrument Number 20130307003168.
- 4. Alessi, the HOA's collection agent, recorded a notice of delinquent (lien) on February 22, 2012. Thereafter, Alessi recorded a notice of default and election to sell on April 20, 2012. Alessi did not record a notice of sale until February 5, 2013.
- 5. On March 6, 2013, after First Horizon purchased the property at its foreclosure, Alessi purported to sell the property to SFR for \$7,000. SFR recorded its trustee's deed in the Official Records of the Clark County Recorder on March 18, 2013 as Instrument Number 20130318003508.
- 6. At the time of the HOA foreclosure sale, First Horizon owned the property and was not in default on its obligation to pay the HOA's assessments.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

23

24

25

26

27

28

- 7. Alessi's NRCP 30(b)(6) witness testified as to Alessi's procedures where a lender forecloses and becomes owner prior to a homeowner's association foreclosure:
  - Q. Okay. If Alessi had known that the lender had foreclosed days before the HOA foreclosure sale, would it have moved forward with the sale?

Ms. Ebron: Calls for speculation, incomplete hypothetical.

Mr. Loizzi: Join. Go Ahead.

- A. I would answer the question that in general we would not.
- And why not. Q.
- A. Because there would have been a new – well, would have been a trustee's deed recorded by the bank and we would have known of the foreclosure and probably would have sought payment by the bank of the amounts due. We probably would have restarted the collection process if there had been a trustee's deed recorded into the bank's name. That is my recollection of our policy at that time.

(Deposition of David Alessi at 49:9-25 and 50:1).<sup>2</sup>

8. Section 7.7 of the HOA's CC&Rs required the HOA to give First Horizon, as owner, thirty days' written notice of any amount due and owing. Specifically, section 7.7 provides, in part:

> The failure of the Association to send a bill to a Member shall not relieve any Member of his liability for any Assessment or charge under this Declaration, but the Assessment Lien therefor shall not be foreclosed as set forth Section 7.10 below until the Member has been given not less than thirty (30) days written notice prior to such foreclosure that that the Assessment or any installation thereof is or will be due and of the amount owing.

- 9. The HOA did not provide First Horizon with written notice of the amount of its liability as owner, as required by section 7.7 of the CC&Rs.
- 10. First Horizon's February 26, 2013 foreclosure extinguished the sub priority piece of the HOA's lien. First Horizon received none of the statutory notices that the former owner, Torres, received.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The question that prompted Mr. Alessi to describe Alessi's collection policies where a new owner attains title was not objected to during the deposition.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

TEL 17

11. Alessi did not send, and First Horizon as homeowner did not receive, a notice of delinquent assessment. NRS 116.31162(1)(a). Alessi did not send, and First Horizon as homeowner did not receive, a notice of default and election to sell. NRS 116.31162(1)(b). Alessi did not send. and First Horizon as homeowner did not receive, a notice of sale. NRS 116.31165.

#### CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. Summary judgment is proper "when the pleadings and other evidence on file demonstrate that no 'genuine issue as to any material fact [remains] and that the moving party is entitled to judgment as a matter of law." Wood v. Safeway, (2005) 121 Nev. 724, 729; 121 P.3d 1026, 1029, NRCP 56(c). Materiality is dependent on the underlying substantive law, and includes only those factual disputes that could change the ultimate outcome of a case. *Id.*
- 2. CC&Rs are restrictive covenants. Horizons at Seven Hills Homeowners Association v. Ikon Holdings, LLC, 132 Nev. Adv. Opn. 35, pg. 14 (2016). As such, CC&Rs run with the land and provide a burden and a benefit of rights to the property owner. Boulder Oaks Cmty. Ass'n v. B & J Andrews, 169 P.3d 1155, 1160-1161 (Nev. 2007). The burden of this association's CC&Rs is the obligation to pay assessments. The benefit of the CC&Rs is that the HOA must comply with the notice provisions that govern how the HOA enforces its right to collect assessments.
- 3. In Shadow Wood Homeowners Assoc., et al. v. New York Comm. Bancorp., 132 Nev. Adv. Opn. 5, 11 (2016) the Nevada Supreme Court determined recitals regarding compliance are not irrebuttable conclusions. Specifically, the Court held trial courts retain equitable power to set aside a foreclosure sale equating foreclosures under NRS Chapter 116 to foreclosures under NRS Chapter 107. Shadow Wood Homeowners Assoc., 132 Nev. Adv. Opn. at 14-15. The Court stated, "The conclusive recital provisions in NRS 107.030(8) have never been argued to carry the preemptive effect that [Appellants] attribute to NRS 116.31166." Id. at 12-13. Thus, a foreclosure cannot stand where no default occurred despite the recitals in the deed. Id. at 11.
- 4. The HOA violated its own CC&Rs. First Horizon was not in default of any obligation to pay assessments. The HOA's CC&Rs mandate that First Horizon, as homeowner, be given notice of the amount of assessments owed and 30 days' notice in order to pay that amount prior to any foreclosure proceedings.

TEL 17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

- 5. The HOA did not serve First Horizon with the notice required by Sec. 7.7 of the CC&Rs and instead proceeded immediately to foreclosure.
- 6. First Horizon's February 26, 2014 foreclosure extinguished its deed of trust causing the super-priority lien to be rendered moot. The HOA's foreclosure could not have extinguished First Horizon's deed of trust because it no longer encumbered the property following First Horizon's foreclosure.
- 7. The Due Process Clause of the U.S. Constitution requires that, "at a minimum, [the] deprivation of life, liberty, or property by adjudication be preceded by notice and an opportunity for hearing appropriate to the nature of the case." Mullane v. Central Hanover Bank & Trust Co., 339 U.S. 306, 314 (1950) An "elementary and fundamental requirement of due process ... is notice reasonably calculated, under all circumstances, to apprise interested parties of the pendency of the action and afford them an opportunity to present their objections." Tulsa Profil Collection Services, Inc. v. Pope, 458 U.S. 478, 484 (1988) (quoting Mullane, 339 U.S. at 314) (emphasis added).
- First Horizon, as homeowner, did not receive any of the notices required by NRS 8. Chapter 116. Alessi did not send, and First Horizon did not receive, a notice of delinquent assessment after First Horizon took title to the Property. NRS 116.31162(1)(a). Alessi did not send, and First Horizon did not receive, a notice of default and election to sell after First Horizon took title to the Property. NRS 116.31162(1)(b). Alessi did not send, and First Horizon did not receive, a notice of sale after First Horizon took title to the Property. NRS 116.31165. The HOA's sale is void because it should have re-noticed the foreclosure sale to First Horizon.
- Because First Horizon, after it took title to the Property, did not receive any foreclosure notices required by NRS Chapter 116, the statute is unconstitutional as-applied.
  - 10. The March 6, 2013, HOA foreclosure sale is void.
- 11. No genuine issues of material fact remain, and First Horizon is entitled to summary judgment as a matter of law. SFR's motion for summary judgment, and Alessi's and the HOA's joinder thereto, are denied with prejudice, in part. SFR's claim for unjust enrichment, only, is denied The 9th Cor. Opinion Bourne Soller Wells for Deco 18/12/16phaven having seed stayed, therefore does not I mpact this ruling.

## AKERMAN LLP

TEL

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

23

24

26

27

28

#### ORDER

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED that the August 8, 2016 bench trial is vacated.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that the March 6, 2013, HOA foreclosure sale is void, and the remedy for the voided sale is stayed pending appeal.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that the parties preserve the status quo with respect to the property, and SFR is not to transfer title to, sell or encumber the Property pending the resolution of any appeal.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that First Horizon's Motion for Summary Judgment is GRANTED. SFR's motion for summary judgment, along with Alessi's and the HOA's joinder thereto is **DENIED**, with prejudice. SFR's claim for unjust enrichment, only, is **DENIED**, without prejudice.

DATED and Done this day of August, 2016.

THE HONORABLE GLORIA STURMAN

DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

Approved as to content and form by:

Submitted by:

AKERMAN LLP

MELANIE D. MORGAN, ESQ.

Nevada Bar No. 8215

CHRISTINE M. PARVAN, ESQ.

Nevada Bar No. 10711

1160 Town Center Drive, Suite 330

Las Vegas, Nevada 89144 25

Attorneys for First Horizon Home Loans

HOWARD C. KIM, ESQ.

Nevada Bar No. 10386

KIM GILBERT EBRON

DIANA CLINE EBRON, ESQ.

Nevada Bar No. 10580

7625 Dean Martin Dr. Suite 110

Las Vegas, NV 89139

Attorneys for Plaintiff

Electronically Filed 08/19/2016 09:45:08 AM

**CLERK OF THE COURT** 

NEO

1

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

22

1160 Town Center Drive, Suite 330 LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89144 TEL.: (702) 634-5000 – FAX: (702) 380-8572

MELANIE D. MORGAN, ESQ. 2

Nevada Bar No. 8215

CHRISTINE M. PARVAN, ESQ.

Nevada Bar No. 10711

**AKERMAN LLP** 

4 1160 Town Center Drive, Suite 330

> Las Vegas, Nevada 89144 Telephone: (702) 634-5000 Facsimile: (702) 380-8572

Email: melanie.morgan@akerman.com Email: christine.parvan@akerman.com

Attorneys for First Horizon Home Loans

#### EIGHTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT

#### CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC, a Nevada limited liability company,

Plaintiff,

v.

FIRST HORIZON HOME LOANS. DIVISION OF FIRST TENNESSEE BANK, N.A., a national association; ANA TORRES, an individual; DOES I through X; and ROE CORPORATIONS I through X, inclusive, Defendants.

Case No.: A-13-679329-C

Dept. No. **XXVI** 

NOTICE **OF** ENTRY **OF ORDER** GRANTING FIRST HORIZON HOME LOAN'S **MOTION** FOR **SUMMARY** JUDGMENT AND **DENYING SFR INVESTMENT POOL 1, LLC'S MOTION** FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT

TO ALL PARTIES AND THEIR ATTORNEY OF RECORD:

20 ///

21 ///

/// 23

/// 24

/// 25

/// 26

/// 27

///

28

{39107328;1}

	3
	4
	5
	6
	7
	3 4 5 6 7 8 9
	9
	10
1100 10wn Center Drive, Suite 530 LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89144 TEL.: (702) 634-5000 – FAX: (702) 380-8572	11
alle 550 89144 32) 380.	12
AX: (7(	13
1100 10wn Center Drive, Suite 338 LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89144 : (702) 634-5000 – FAX: (702) 380	14
S VEG/ ( ) 634-5	15
LAS C:: (702	16
TE	17
	18
	19
	18 19 20
	21

23

24

25

26

27

28

1

2

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that an **ORDER GRANTING FIRST HORIZON HOME LOAN'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND DENYING SFR INVESTMENT POOL 1, LLC'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT** has been entered on the 17<sup>th</sup> day of August, 2016, in the above-captioned matter. A copy of said Order is attached hereto as Exhibit A. DATED this 19<sup>th</sup> day of August, 2016.

#### AKERMAN LLP

1160 Town Center Drive, Suite 330 Las Vegas, Nevada 89144 Attorneys for First Horizon Home Loans

{39107328;1}

AKERMAN LLP 1160 Town Center Drive, Suite 330 LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89144 EL.: (702) 634-5000 – FAX: (702) 380-85

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this 19<sup>th</sup> day of August, 2016 and pursuant to NRCP 5(b), I served through this Court's electronic service notification system ("Wiznet") a true and correct copy of the foregoing NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER GRANTING FIRST HORIZON HOME LOAN'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND DENYING SFR INVESTMENT POOL 1, LLC'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT addressed to:

Alessi & Koenig		
	Contact	Email
	A&K eserve	<u>eserve@alessikoenig.com</u>
Ballard Spahr		
	Contact	Email
	Abran Vigil	<u>vigila@ballardspahr.com</u>
	Sylvia Semper	sempers@ballardspahr.com
Ballard Spahr LLP		
	Contact	Email
	Las Vegas Docketing	<u>lvdocket@ballardspahr.com</u>
Kim Gilbert Ebron		
	Contact	Email
	Diana Cline Ebron	diana@kgelegal.com
	E-Service for Kim Gilbert Ebron	eservice@hkimlaw.com
	Michael L. Sturm	mike@kgelegal.com
	Tomas Valerio	staff@kgelegal.com

/s/ Doug J. Layne
An employee of AKERMAN LLP

{39107328;1}

## **EXHIBIT A**

## **EXHIBIT A**

AKERMAN LLP

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

**ORDR** MELANIE D. MORGAN, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 8215 CHRISTINE M. PARVAN, ESQ. Nevada Bar No. 10711 AKERMAN LLP 1160 Town Center Drive, Suite 330 Las Vegas, Nevada 89144 Telephone: (702) 634-5000 Facsimile: (702) 380-8572 Email: melanie.morgan@akerman.com Email: christine.parvan@akerman.com

Electronically Filed 08/17/2016 05:27:17 PM

**CLERK OF THE COURT** 

Attorneys for First Horizon Home Loans

#### EIGHTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT

#### CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC, a Nevada limited liability company,

Plaintiff,

v.

**FIRST** HORIZON HOME LOANS. DIVISION OF FIRST TENNESSEE BANK, N.A., a national association; ANA TORRES, an individual; DOES I through X; and ROE CORPORATIONS I through X, inclusive, Defendants.

Case No.:

A-13-679329-C

Dept. No.

XXVI

ORDER GRANTING LOAN'S HOME FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND DENYING SFR INVESTMENT POOL 1, MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT

This matter came before the court on First Horizon Home Loans, a Division of First Tennessee Bank, N.A.'s (First Horizon) and SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC's (SFR) cross motions for summary judgment, and Intervenors' oral joinder to SFR's motion. Following full briefing, the court heard argument of counsel on April 5, 2016. Steven Shevorski, Esq. appeared on behalf of First Horizon, Diana Cline Ebron, Esq. appeared on behalf of SFR, and Steve Loizzi, Esq. appeared on behalf of Intervenors Squire Village at Silver Springs Community Association (HOA) and Alessi & Koenig, LLC (Alessi). The Court, having considered the full briefing on the motions, the pleadings and papers on file herein, and argument of counsel, makes the following Findings of Facts and Conclusions of Law:1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Any findings of fact that are more appropriately conclusions of law shall be so deemed. Any conclusions of law that are more appropriately findings of fact shall be so deemed.

를 

#### **FINDINGS OF FACT**

- 1. Ana Torres borrowed \$136,9213 from First Horizon to acquire the property located at 5069 Midnight Oil Drive, Las Vegas, Nevada 89122, APN 161-26-111-017 in 2008. The loan was secured by a deed of trust recorded in the Official Records of the Clark County Recorder on July 25, 2008 as Instrument Number 20080725-0003028. Torres defaulted on the loan, and First Horizon recorded a notice of default and election to sale on October 30, 2012.
- 2. On February 1, 2013, the certificate of compliance with Nevada's Foreclosure Mediation Program was recorded. Thereafter, on February 7, 2013, First Horizon recorded a notice of sale setting the date for public auction of the property for February 26, 2013.
- 3. At the February 26, 2013 trustee's sale, First Horizon credit bid for the property and purchased it for \$151,283.09. First Horizon recorded its trustee's deed in the Official Records of the Clark County Recorder on March 7, 2013, as Instrument Number 20130307003168.
- 4. Alessi, the HOA's collection agent, recorded a notice of delinquent (lien) on February 22, 2012. Thereafter, Alessi recorded a notice of default and election to sell on April 20, 2012. Alessi did not record a notice of sale until February 5, 2013.
- 5. On March 6, 2013, after First Horizon purchased the property at its foreclosure, Alessi purported to sell the property to SFR for \$7,000. SFR recorded its trustee's deed in the Official Records of the Clark County Recorder on March 18, 2013 as Instrument Number 20130318003508.
- 6. At the time of the HOA foreclosure sale, First Horizon owned the property and was not in default on its obligation to pay the HOA's assessments.

28

7. Alessi's NRCP 30(b)(6) witness testified as to Alessi's procedures where a lender 1 2 forecloses and becomes owner prior to a homeowner's association foreclosure: 3 Q. Okay. If Alessi had known that the lender had foreclosed days before the HOA foreclosure sale, would it have moved forward 4 with the sale? 5 Ms. Ebron: Calls for speculation, incomplete hypothetical. 6 Mr. Loizzi: Join. Go Ahead. 7 I would answer the question that in general we would not. Α. And why not. Q. 8 A. Because there would have been a new – well, would have been 9 a trustee's deed recorded by the bank and we would have known of the foreclosure and probably would have sought 10 payment by the bank of the amounts due. We probably would have restarted the collection process if there had been a 11 trustee's deed recorded into the bank's name. That is my recollection of our policy at that time. 12 (Deposition of David Alessi at 49:9-25 and 50:1).<sup>2</sup> 13 8. Section 7.7 of the HOA's CC&Rs required the HOA to give First Horizon, as owner, 14 thirty days' written notice of any amount due and owing. Specifically, section 7.7 provides, in part: 15 16 The failure of the Association to send a bill to a Member shall not relieve any Member of his liability for any Assessment or charge under this Declaration, but the Assessment Lien therefor shall not be 17 foreclosed as set forth Section 7.10 below until the Member has been given not less than thirty (30) days written notice prior to such 18 foreclosure that that the Assessment or any installation thereof is or 19 will be due and of the amount owing. The HOA did not provide First Horizon with written notice of the amount of its 9. 20 liability as owner, as required by section 7.7 of the CC&Rs. 21 10. First Horizon's February 26, 2013 foreclosure extinguished the sub priority piece of 22 the HOA's lien. First Horizon received none of the statutory notices that the former owner, Torres, 23 received. 24 25 26

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The question that prompted Mr. Alessi to describe Alessi's collection policies where a new owner attains title was not objected to during the deposition.

Alessi did not send, and First Horizon as homeowner did not receive, a notice of delinquent assessment. NRS 116.31162(1)(a). Alessi did not send, and First Horizon as homeowner did not receive, a notice of default and election to sell. NRS 116.31162(1)(b). Alessi did not send, and First Horizon as homeowner did not receive, a notice of sale. NRS 116.31165.

#### **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

- 1. Summary judgment is proper "when the pleadings and other evidence on file demonstrate that no 'genuine issue as to any material fact [remains] and that the moving party is entitled to judgment as a matter of law." *Wood v. Safeway*, (2005) 121 Nev. 724, 729; 121 P.3d 1026, 1029, NRCP 56(c). Materiality is dependent on the underlying substantive law, and includes only those factual disputes that could change the ultimate outcome of a case. *Id*.
- 2. CC&Rs are restrictive covenants. Horizons at Seven Hills Homeowners Association v. Ikon Holdings, LLC, 132 Nev. Adv. Opn. 35, pg. 14 (2016). As such, CC&Rs run with the land and provide a burden and a benefit of rights to the property owner. Boulder Oaks Cmty. Ass'n v. B & J Andrews, 169 P.3d 1155, 1160-1161 (Nev. 2007). The burden of this association's CC&Rs is the obligation to pay assessments. The benefit of the CC&Rs is that the HOA must comply with the notice provisions that govern how the HOA enforces its right to collect assessments.
- 3. In Shadow Wood Homeowners Assoc., et al. v. New York Comm. Bancorp., 132 Nev. Adv. Opn. 5, 11 (2016) the Nevada Supreme Court determined recitals regarding statutory compliance are not irrebuttable conclusions. Specifically, the Court held trial courts retain equitable power to set aside a foreclosure sale equating foreclosures under NRS Chapter 116 to foreclosures under NRS Chapter 107. Shadow Wood Homeowners Assoc., 132 Nev. Adv. Opn. at 14-15. The Court stated, "The conclusive recital provisions in NRS 107.030(8) have never been argued to carry the preemptive effect that [Appellants] attribute to NRS 116.31166." Id. at 12-13. Thus, a foreclosure cannot stand where no default occurred despite the recitals in the deed. Id. at 11.
- 4. The HOA violated its own CC&Rs. First Horizon was not in default of any obligation to pay assessments. The HOA's CC&Rs mandate that First Horizon, as homeowner, be given notice of the amount of assessments owed and 30 days' notice in order to pay that amount prior to any foreclosure proceedings.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

- 5. The HOA did not serve First Horizon with the notice required by Sec. 7.7 of the CC&Rs and instead proceeded immediately to foreclosure.
- 6. First Horizon's February 26, 2014 foreclosure extinguished its deed of trust causing the super-priority lien to be rendered moot. The HOA's foreclosure could not have extinguished First Horizon's deed of trust because it no longer encumbered the property following First Horizon's foreclosure.
- 7. The Due Process Clause of the U.S. Constitution requires that, "at a minimum, [the] deprivation of life, liberty, or property by adjudication be preceded by notice and an opportunity for hearing appropriate to the nature of the case." Mullane v. Central Hanover Bank & Trust Co., 339 U.S. 306, 314 (1950) An "elementary and fundamental requirement of due process ... is notice reasonably calculated, under all circumstances, to apprise interested parties of the pendency of the action and afford them an opportunity to present their objections." Tulsa Profil Collection Services, Inc. v. Pope, 458 U.S. 478, 484 (1988) (quoting Mullane, 339 U.S. at 314) (emphasis added).
- First Horizon, as homeowner, did not receive any of the notices required by NRS 8. Chapter 116. Alessi did not send, and First Horizon did not receive, a notice of delinquent assessment after First Horizon took title to the Property. NRS 116.31162(1)(a). Alessi did not send, and First Horizon did not receive, a notice of default and election to sell after First Horizon took title to the Property. NRS 116.31162(1)(b). Alessi did not send, and First Horizon did not receive, a notice of sale after First Horizon took title to the Property. NRS 116.31165. The HOA's sale is void because it should have re-noticed the foreclosure sale to First Horizon.
- Because First Horizon, after it took title to the Property, did not receive any foreclosure notices required by NRS Chapter 116, the statute is unconstitutional as-applied.
  - 10. The March 6, 2013, HOA foreclosure sale is void.
- 11. No genuine issues of material fact remain, and First Horizon is entitled to summary judgment as a matter of law. SFR's motion for summary judgment, and Alessi's and the HOA's joinder thereto, are denied with prejudice, in part. SFR's claim for unjust enrichment, only, is denied udice.

  14 Con. Opinion Bourne Sally Wells fars Occided 8/12/16phaven

  15 See of Stayed, therefore does not impact this ruling.

## AKERMAN LLP

5 6 7

8

9

10

1

2

3

4

18

19 20

23

24

25 26

27

28

#### ORDER

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED that the August 8, 2016 bench trial is vacated.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that the March 6, 2013, HOA foreclosure sale is void, and the remedy for the voided sale is stayed pending appeal.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that the parties preserve the status quo with respect to the property, and SFR is not to transfer title to, sell or encumber the Property pending the resolution of any appeal.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED that First Horizon's Motion for Summary Judgment is GRANTED. SFR's motion for summary judgment, along with Alessi's and the HOA's joinder thereto is **DENIED**, with prejudice. SFR's claim for unjust enrichment, only, is **DENIED**, without prejudice.

DATED and Done this day of August, 2016.

THE HONORABLE GLORIA STURMAN

DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

Submitted by: AKERMAN LLP

MELANIE D. MORGAN, ESQ.

Nevada Bar No. 8215

CHRISTINE M. PARVAN, ESQ.

Nevada Bar No. 10711

1160 Town Center Drive, Suite 330

Las Vegas, Nevada 89144

Attorneys for First Horizon Home Loans

Approved as to content and form by:

KIM GILBERT EBRON

HÓWARD C. KIM, ESQ.

Nevada Bar No. 10386

DIANA CLINE EBRON, ESQ.

Nevada Bar No. 10580

7625 Dean Martin Dr. Suite 110

Las Vegas, NV 89139

Attorneys for Plaintiff

A-13-679329-C SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC, Plaintiff(s) vs. First Horizon Home Loans, Defendant(s)

June 19, 2014 9:00 AM Motion to Intervene

HEARD BY: Sturman, Gloria COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 03H

COURT CLERK: Linda Denman

**RECORDER:** Kerry Esparza

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Cline, Diana S. Attorney

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- Court called ALESSI & KOENIG'S, LLC, MOTION TO INTERVENE. Ms. Cline, on behalf of plaintiff, advised Alessi & Koenig had filed a motion to withdraw as all the issues were resolved. Ms. Cline advised the parties are in discussion to extend Discovery but there is no stay. Court noted the bench trial is scheduled for September, 2014 and stated trial dates will stand unless and until the Court receives a formal notice to continue or stay. COURT ORDERED Motion to Intervene WITHDRAWN.

A-13-679329-C SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC, Plaintiff(s) vs.
First Horizon Home Loans, Defendant(s)

November 04, 2014 9:00 AM Status Check

HEARD BY: Sturman, Gloria COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 03H

COURT CLERK: Linda Denman

**RECORDER:** Kerry Esparza

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Cline, Diana S. Attorney

Jung, Rock KAttorneyLamb, MatthewAttorney

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- At STATUS CHECK: STAY, counsel requested stay be lifted and parties intend to continue settlement discussions and proceed in ordinary course. COURT ORDERED stay LIFTED.

PRINT DATE: 09/20/2016 Page 2 of 7 Minutes Date: June 19, 2014

Title to Property	COURT MINUTES	August 11, 2015
A 12 (70220 C	CED Inscribe De al 1 II C. Disinkiff(a)	
A-13-679329-C	SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC, Plaintiff(s)	
	VS.	
	First Horizon Home Loans, Defendant(s)	

August 11, 2015 10:30 AM Motion to Coordinate

HEARD BY: Bare, Rob COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 03C

COURT CLERK: Billie Jo Craig

**RECORDER:** Carrie Hansen

**REPORTER:** 

PARTIES PRESENT:

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

#### - PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR PRE-TRIAL COORDINATION ON ORDER SHORTENING TIME

Attorneys Edgar Smith, Richard Vilkin, Diana Cline, Karen Hanks present.

Sign-up sheets Left Side Filed in A662394: Robert Anderlik, Taylor Anello, Thomas N. Beckom,
Jonathan D. Blum, Darren Brenner, Michael Brooks, Diana Cline, Britannica Collins, Chelsea
Crowton, Peter Dunkley, Jessica Friedman, Charles Geisendorf, David Gluth, Karen Hanks, Joshua O.
Igeleke, Michael Li, Steven Loizzi Jr., Elizabeth Lowell, Erica D. Loyd, Matthew McAlonis, David J.
Merrill, Patrick Orme, Robin Perkins, Benjamin Petiprin (appeared telephonically), Edgar C. Smith,
Kevin S. Soderstrom, Ashlie Surer, Abe Vigil, Richard Vilkin, Shawn Walkenshaw, David Winterton.

Upon inquiry of the Court, Ms. Hanks advised the Motion was filed and heard in this Court as this Court had the lowest case number. Colloquy regarding coordinating the HOA cases as to Discovery, Trials, and witness availability. Counsel suggested a more specific Case Management Plan for a Special Discovery Master to deal with these cases as the various District Court Judges thoughts vary. Court noted he talked briefly with Chief Judge David Barker and Chief Civil Judge Betsy Gonzalez. The Court noted Court Administration would be interested in addressing this issue. Court inquired if Ms. Hanks would be the point of contact, and she advised she would. She provided her E-mail address:

PRINT DATE: 09/20/2016 Page 3 of 7 Minutes Date: June 19, 2014

#### A-13-679329-C

#### Karen@hkimlaw.com

Statement by Mr. Vilkin regarding having a meeting first to determine what counsel will agree on as to the Case Management Plan.

Statements from Attorney Surur regarding coordination for Discovery procedures and noted her two cases where one was Dismissed and the other was pending a Motion to Dismiss where the Court had no jurisdiction.

Statements from Attorney Brooks, who had multiple cases, regarding setting deadlines for counsel to submit a plan to in-house counsel, which may take 2 to 3 weeks.

Attorney Brenner advised a Case Management Plan would first be needed as there are 10 different banks and in-house counsel. He would then be in a position to respond.

COURT ORDERED, Ms. Hanks to submit a Proposed Case Management Plan to counsel by 8/25/15. Counsel to respond by 9/29/15. Matter SET for Status Check: Proposed Case Management Plan to determine when a Continued Hearing on this Motion to Coordinate to be heard.

9/1/15 10:30 AM STATUS CHECK: PROPOSED CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN (IN A662394 ONLY)

PRINT DATE: 09/20/2016 Page 4 of 7 Minutes Date: June 19, 2014

A-13-679329-C SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC, Plaintiff(s) vs. First Horizon Home Loans, Defendant(s)

April 05, 2016 9:30 AM All Pending Motions

HEARD BY: Sturman, Gloria COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 03H

COURT CLERK: Linda Denman

**RECORDER:** Kerry Esparza

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** 

**PRESENT:** Cline, Diana S. Attorney

Loizzi, Steven Jr Attorney Shevorski, Steven G. Attorney

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- FIRST HORIZON HOME LOAN'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT . . . SFR'S INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT

Mr. Loizzi made an oral joinder to SFR's Motion for Summary Judgment. There being no objection, COURT ORDERED oral joinder SUBMITTED. Court disclosed the law clerk did not work on this case due to a conflict of interest. Counsel discussed the time line of events; specifically, that the Bank foreclosed on 2/26 and recorded on 3/7, and the HOA foreclosed on 3/6 and recorded on 3/18. Counsel argued whether proper notice was given to opposing sides. Following argument, COURT ORDERED First Horizon's Motion for Summary Judgment GRANTED; FINDING the Bank's foreclosure acted to extinguish the deed of trust causing the super-priority lien to be rendered moot. FURTHER FINDING, the HOA sale void as the HOA should have renoticed any foreclosure sale to the new owner. COURT FURTHER ORDERED SFR's Motion for Summary Judgment and oral joinder thereto DENIED. COURT FURTHER ORDERED bench trial VACATED.

Ms. Cline then inquired about SFR's unjust enrichment claim against the bank, which Mr. Shevorski objected saying unjust enrichment was not argued in the brief. COURT ORDERED unjust

PRINT DATE: 09/20/2016 Page 5 of 7 Minutes Date: June 19, 2014

#### A-13-679329-C

enrichment claim DENIED WITHOUT PREJUDICE to be determined at a later time. Counsel advised they would work together to preserve the status quo during any appeal that may be filed.

Mr. Shevorski to prepare proposed Order; opposing counsel to review as to form and content.

PRINT DATE: 09/20/2016 Page 6 of 7 Minutes Date: June 19, 2014

A-13-679329-C SFR Investments Pool 1, LLC, Plaintiff(s) vs.
First Horizon Home Loans, Defendant(s)

August 16, 2016 9:00 AM Status Check

HEARD BY: Sturman, Gloria COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 03H

COURT CLERK: Linda Denman

**RECORDER:** Kerry Esparza

**REPORTER:** 

**PARTIES** 

PRESENT: Bodoff, Rebekkah B. Attorney

Gilbert, Jacqueline Attorney Lam, Huong Attorney

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

- STATUS CHECK: STATUS OF CASE

Court noted that an Order was submitted yesterday but wanted to see if counsel had any argument to make regarding the Bourne Valley decision. After discussion, counsel asked the Court to sign the Order as submitted and the parties will proceed to the next level.

PRINT DATE: 09/20/2016 Page 7 of 7 Minutes Date: June 19, 2014



## EIGHTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT CLERK'S OFFICE NOTICE OF DEFICIENCY ON APPEAL TO NEVADA SUPREME COURT

DIANA CLINE EBRON, ESQ. 7625 DEAN MARTIN DRIVE, SUITE 110 LAS VEGAS, NV 89139

DATE: September 20, 2016 CASE: A-13-679329-C

**RE CASE:** SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC vs. FIRST HORIZON HOME LOANS, A DIVISION OF FIRST TENNESSEE BANK, A NATIONAL ASSOCIATION; ANA TORRES

NOTICE OF APPEAL FILED: September 16, 2016

YOUR APPEAL HAS BEEN SENT TO THE SUPREME COURT.

PLEASE NOTE: DOCUMENTS NOT TRANSMITTED HAVE BEEN MARKED:

- \$250 Supreme Court Filing Fee (Make Check Payable to the Supreme Court)\*\*

   If the \$250 Supreme Court Filing Fee was not submitted along with the original Notice of Appeal, it must be mailed directly to the Supreme Court. The Supreme Court Filing Fee will not be forwarded by this office if submitted after the Notice of Appeal has been filed.

   \$24 − District Court Filing Fee (Make Check Payable to the District Court)\*\*
   \$500 − Cost Bond on Appeal (Make Check Payable to the District Court)\*\*
   NRAP 7: Bond For Costs On Appeal in Civil Cases
- ☐ Case Appeal Statement
  - NRAP 3 (a)(1), Form 2
- □ Order
- ☐ Notice of Entry of Order

#### NEVADA RULES OF APPELLATE PROCEDURE 3 (a) (3) states:

"The district court clerk must file appellant's notice of appeal despite perceived deficiencies in the notice, including the failure to pay the district court or Supreme Court filing fee. The district court clerk shall apprise appellant of the deficiencies in writing, and shall transmit the notice of appeal to the Supreme Court in accordance with subdivision (e) of this Rule with a notation to the clerk of the Supreme Court setting forth the deficiencies. Despite any deficiencies in the notice of appeal, the clerk of the Supreme Court shall docket the appeal in accordance with Rule 12."

Please refer to Rule 3 for an explanation of any possible deficiencies.

<sup>\*\*</sup>Per District Court Administrative Order 2012-01, in regards to civil litigants, "...all Orders to Appear in Forma Pauperis expire one year from the date of issuance." You must reapply for in Forma Pauperis status.

### **Certification of Copy**

State of Nevada
County of Clark

I, Steven D. Grierson, the Clerk of the Court of the Eighth Judicial District Court, Clark County, State of Nevada, does hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and correct copy of the hereinafter stated original document(s):

NOTICE OF APPEAL; CASE APPEAL STATEMENT; DISTRICT COURT DOCKET ENTRIES; CIVIL COVER SHEET; ORDER GRANTING FIRST HORIZON HOME LOAN'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND DENYING SFR INVESTMENT POOL 1, LLC'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT; NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER GRANTING FIRST HORIZON HOME LOAN'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND DENYING SFR INVESTMENT POOL 1, LLC'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT; DISTRICT COURT MINUTES; NOTICE OF DEFICIENCY

SFR INVESTMENTS POOL 1, LLC.

Plaintiff(s),

VS.

FIRST HORIZON HOME LOANS, A DIVISION OF FIRST TENNESSEE BANK, A NATIONAL ASSOCIATION; ANA TORRES,

Defendant(s),

now on file and of record in this office.

Case No: A-13-679329-C

Dept No: XXVI

IN WITNESS THEREOF, I have hereunto Set my hand and Affixed the seal of the Court at my office, Las Vegas, Nevada This 20 day of September 2016.

Steven D. Grierson, Clerk of the Court

Chaunte Pleasant, Deputy Clerk