Electronically Filed 12/22/2017 4:12 PM Steven D. Grierson CLERK OF THE COURT

NOAS
BRANDON L. PHILLIPS, ESQ
Nevada Bar No. 12264
BRANDON L. PHILLIPS, ATTORNEY AT LAW, PLLC
1455 E. Tropicana Ave., Suite 750
Las Vegas, Nevada 89169
(702) 795-0097, (702) 795-0098 fax
blp@abetterlegalpractice.com
Attorney for Plaintiffs, Tae-Si Kim and Jin-Sung Hong

Electronically Filed
Jan 05 2018 10:38 a.m.
Elizabeth A. Brown
Clerk of Supreme Court

EIGHT JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT COUNTY OF CLARK, STATE OF NEVADA

TAE-SI KIM, an Individual, and JIN-SUNG HONG, an Individual.

CASE NO. A-17-756785-C

DEPT. NO. XXIV

Plaintiffs,

V.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

GIBSON LOWRY BURRIS, LLP, (now known as GIBSON LOWRY, LLP), a Nevada limited liability partnership; DICKINSON WRIGHT, PLLC, a Nevada Professional limited liability company; STEVE A. GIBSON, ESQ., an Individual; JODI DONETTA LOWRY, ESQ. an Individual; JONATHAN M.A. SALLS, ESQ., an Individual; ERIC DOBBERSTEIN, ESQ., an Individual; and MICHAEL G. VARTANIAN, ESQ., an Individual; and DOES I through X, inclusive, and ROE BUSINESS ENTITIES XI through XX, inclusive,

Defendants.

NOTICE OF APPEAL

Please take notice that Plaintiffs, TAE-SI KIM and JIN SUNG HONG as individuals, (hereinafter referred to as "Plaintiff") by and through their attorney, BRANDON L. PHILLIPS, ESQ., of the law firm of BRANDON L. PHILLIPS, ATTORNEY AT LAW, PLLC hereby appeal to the Supreme Court of Nevada and/or the Appeals Court of the State of Nevada from:

1. The Court's Order Granting Defendants' Motion to Dismiss;

16942205.1 **-1-**

	1
	2
	3
	4
	5
	6
	7
	8
	9
1	0
1	1
1	2
1	3
1	4
1	5
1	6
1	7
1	8
1	9
2	0
2	1
2	2
2	3
2	4
2	5
2	6
2	7
2	R

- The Court's Order Denying Plaintiffs' Motion to Reconsider Granting Defendants'
 Motion to Dimiss;
- 2. All rulings and interlocutory orders made appealable by any of the foregoing.

Dated this 22nd day of December, 2017.

BRANDON L. PHILLIPS, ATTORNEY AT LAW, PLLC

/s/ Brandon L. Phillips BRANDON L. PHILLIPS, ESQ Nevada Bar No. 12264 1455 E. Tropicana Ave., Suite 750 Las Vegas, Nevada 89119 (702) 795-0097, (702) 795-0098 fax blp@abetterlegalpractice.com Attorney for Plaintiffs

16942205.1 **-2-**

1 **PROOF OF SERVICE** 2 **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE** 3 Pursuant of NRCP 5(b), I hereby certify that I am an employee of BRANDON L. 4 PHILLIPS, ATTORNEY AT LAW, PLLC, and that on the 22nd day of December, 2017, I served 5 a true copy of the of the documents listed below by E-Service and in the U.S. Mail to the 6 following address: 7 **Notice of Appeal Document Served:** 8 Person(s) Served: 9 **Attorneys for Defendants** 10 Dickinson Wright, PLLC Jodi Donetta Lowry, Esq. 11 Jonathan M.A. Salls, Esq. 12 Eric Dobberstein, Esq. Michael G. Vartanian, Esq. 13 14 **Morris Law Group** Steve Morris, Esq. 15 Ryan M. Lower, Esq. 16 17 Via Facsimile: Mail 18 Personal Delivery Electronic Notice [x]19 20 21 _/s/ Brandon L. Phillips_ 22 An employee of BRANDON L. PHILLIPS, 23 ATTORNEY AT LAW, PLLC 24 25 26 27

-3-

16942205.1

28

CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-17-756785-C

Tae-Si Kim, Plaintiff(s)

ve

Gibson Lowry Burris LLP, Defendant(s)

\$ Location: Department 24
\$ Judicial Officer: Crockett, Jim
\$ Filed on: 06/12/2017
\$ Cross-Reference Case Number:

CASE INFORMATION

Case Type: Legal Malpractice

Case Flags: Appealed to Supreme Court

DATE CASE ASSIGNMENT

Current Case Assignment

Case Number Court Date Assigned Judicial Officer A-17-756785-C Department 24 06/12/2017 Crockett, Jim

PARTY INFORMATION

Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Phillips, Brandon L

Retained 702-795-0097(W)

Kim, Tae-Si
Phillips, Brandon L
Retained

702-795-0097(W)

Defendant Dickinson Wright PLLC

Removed: 10/17/2017

Dismissed

Dobberstein, Eric, ESQ

Removed: 10/17/2017

Dismissed

Donetta Lowry, Jodi, ESQ

Removed: 10/17/2017

Dismissed

Gibson Lowry Burris LLP Gibson, Steven A.

Retained

702-541-7888(W)

Gibson, Steve A, ESQ

Salls, Jonathan M A, ESQ

Removed: 10/17/2017 Dismissed

Vartanian, Michael G, ESQ

Removed: 10/17/2017

Dismissed

DATE EVENTS & ORDERS OF THE COURT INDEX

06/12/2017

Complaint

Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si

Complaint

CASE SUMMARY CASE No. A-17-756785-C

	CASE NO. A-17-/56/85-C
06/12/2017	Initial Appearance Fee Disclosure Filed By: Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Initial Appearance Fee Disclosure (NRS Chapter 19)
06/16/2017	Summons Electronically Issued - Service Pending Party: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Summons
07/12/2017	Affidavit of Service Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Affidavit of Service
07/12/2017	Affidavit of Service Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Affidavit of Service
07/12/2017	Affidavit of Service Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Affidavit of Service
07/12/2017	Affidavit of Attempted Service Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Affidavit of Attempts
07/12/2017	Affidavit of Attempted Service Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Affidavit of Attempts
07/19/2017	Affidavit of Attempted Service Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Affitdavit of Attempts
07/21/2017	Affidavit of Service Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Affidavit of Service
07/21/2017	Affidavit of Service Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Affidavit of Service
08/08/2017	Motion to Dismiss Filed By: Defendant Dickinson Wright PLLC; Defendant Donetta Lowry, Jodi, ESQ; Defendant Salls, Jonathan M A, ESQ; Defendant Dobberstein, Eric, ESQ; Defendant Vartanian, Michael G, ESQ Dickinson Wright's Motion to Dismiss
08/08/2017	Initial Appearance Fee Disclosure Filed By: Defendant Donetta Lowry, Jodi, ESQ; Defendant Salls, Jonathan M A, ESQ; Defendant Dobberstein, Eric, ESQ; Defendant Vartanian, Michael G, ESQ Initial Appearance Fee Disclosure
09/07/2017	Opposition to Motion to Dismiss Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Plaintiffs' Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Dismiss

CASE SUMMARY CASE No. A-17-756785-C

09/14/2017	Affidavit of Attempted Service Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Affidavit of Attempts
09/14/2017	Affidavit of Attempted Service Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Affidavit of Attempts
09/19/2017	Reply in Support Filed By: Defendant Dickinson Wright PLLC; Defendant Donetta Lowry, Jodi, ESQ; Defendant Salls, Jonathan M A, ESQ; Defendant Dobberstein, Eric, ESQ; Defendant Vartanian, Michael G, ESQ Reply in Support of Dickinson Wright's Motion to Dismiss
09/26/2017	Motion to Dismiss (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Crockett, Jim) Defendants Dickinson Wright's Motion to Dismiss
09/29/2017	Amended Affidavit of Service Party: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Affidavit of Attempts
10/03/2017	Affidavit of Service Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Affidavit of Service
10/05/2017	Affidavit of Attempted Service Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Affidavit of Attempts
10/05/2017	Affidavit of Attempted Service Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Affidavit of Attempts
10/05/2017	Affidavit of Attempted Service Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Affidavit of Attempts
10/05/2017	Affidavit of Attempted Service Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Affidavit of Attempts
10/05/2017	Affidavit of Due Diligence Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Affidavit of Due Diligence
10/10/2017	Motion to Extend Time to Serve Party: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Motion to Extend Time for Service and For Publication Of Summons and Complaint; Affidavit of Brandon L. Phillips, Esq., In Support Thereof
10/17/2017	Order of Dismissal Without Prejudice (Judicial Officer: Crockett, Jim) Debtors: Tae-Si Kim (Plaintiff), Jin-Sung Hong (Plaintiff) Creditors: Dickinson Wright PLLC (Defendant), Jodi Donetta Lowry, ESQ. (Defendant), Jonathan M A Salls, ESQ. (Defendant), Eric Dobberstein, ESQ. (Defendant), Michael G

CASE SUMMARY CASE No. A-17-756785-C

	CASE NO. A-17-750785-C
	Vartanian, ESQ. (Defendant) Judgment: 10/17/2017, Docketed: 10/17/2017
10/17/2017	Order Granting Motion Filed By: Defendant Dickinson Wright PLLC; Defendant Donetta Lowry, Jodi, ESQ; Defendant Salls, Jonathan M A, ESQ; Defendant Dobberstein, Eric, ESQ; Defendant Vartanian, Michael G, ESQ Order Granting Dickinson Wright's Motion to Dismiss
10/17/2017	Notice of Entry Notice of Entry of Order
10/23/2017	Motion to Dismiss Filed By: Defendant Gibson Lowry Burris LLP Defendant Gibson Lowry Burris LLP's Motion to Dismiss
10/23/2017	Initial Appearance Fee Disclosure Filed By: Defendant Gibson Lowry Burris LLP Defendant Gibson Lowry Burris LLP's Initial Appearance Fee Disclosure
10/26/2017	Opposition to Motion Filed By: Defendant Dickinson Wright PLLC Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Extend Time for Service and for Publication of Summons and Complaint
11/06/2017	Motion to Reconsider Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Motion to Reconsider
11/13/2017	Notice of Change of Hearing Notice of Change of Hearing
11/14/2017	Motion (3:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Crockett, Jim) 11/14/2017, 12/05/2017 Plaintiffs' Motion to Extend Time for Service and For Publication Of Summons and Complaint; Affidavit of Brandon L. Phillips, Esq., In Support Thereof
11/22/2017	Notice of Non Opposition Filed By: Defendant Gibson Lowry Burris LLP Notice of Non-Opposition to Defendant Gibson Lowry Burris LLPs Motion to Dismiss
11/28/2017	Opposition to Motion Filed By: Defendant Dickinson Wright PLLC Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Reconsideration of Dismissal of Plaintiffs' Claims Against Dickinson Wright
12/05/2017	Motion to Dismiss (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Crockett, Jim) Defendant Gibson Lowry Burris LLP's Motion to Dismiss
12/05/2017	Motion For Reconsideration (9:00 AM) (Judicial Officer: Crockett, Jim) Plaintiffs' Motion to Reconsider Dismissal of Plaintiffs' Claims Against Dickinson Wright
12/12/2017	Order Denying Motion Filed By: Defendant Dickinson Wright PLLC Order Denying Plaintiffs' Motion to Reconsider Dismissal of Plaintiffs' Claims Against

CASE SUMMARY CASE NO. A-17-756785-C

	Dickinson Wright	
12/12/2017	Order Denying Motion Filed By: Defendant Dickinson Wright PLLC Order Denying Motion to Extend Time for Service and Publication of Summons and Complaint	
12/12/2017	Notice of Entry Filed By: Defendant Dickinson Wright PLLC Notice of Entry of Order	
12/12/2017	Notice of Entry Filed By: Defendant Dickinson Wright PLLC Notice of Entry of Order	
12/22/2017	Notice of Appeal Filed By: Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si; Plaintiff Hong, Jin-Sung Notice of Appeal	

DATE FINANCIAL INFORMATION

Defendant Dickinson Wright PLLC Total Charges Total Payments and Credits Balance Due as of 12/27/2017	343.00 343.00 0.00
Defendant Gibson Lowry Burris LLP Total Charges Total Payments and Credits Balance Due as of 12/27/2017	223.00 223.00 0.00
Plaintiff Kim, Tae-Si Total Charges Total Payments and Credits Balance Due as of 12/27/2017	324.00 324.00 0.00

DISTRICT COURT CIVIL COVER SHEET

County, Nevada

Department 24

	Case No. (Assigned by Clerk's	Office)	
I. Party Information (provide both h	ome and mailing addresses if different)		
Plaintiff(s) (name/address/phone):		Defenda	nt(s) (name/address/phone):
Tae-Si Kim and Jin-Aung Hong			Gibson Lowry Burris, LLP
			Dickinson Wright, PLLC
Attorney (name/address/phone):		Attorney	(name/address/phone):
Brandon Phill			
1455 E. Tropicana			
Las Vegas, N	V 89119		
II. Nature of Controversy (please s	select the one most applicable filing type	below)	
Civil Case Filing Types	Ť		
Real Property Landlord/Tenant	Naglinana		Torts Other Torts
Unlawful Detainer	Negligence Auto		
Other Landlord/Tenant	Premises Liability		Product Liability Intentional Misconduct
Title to Property	Other Negligence		Employment Tort
Judicial Foreclosure	Malpractice		Insurance Tort
Other Title to Property	Medical/Dental		Other Tort
Other Real Property	Legal		
Condemnation/Eminent Domain	Accounting		
Other Real Property	Other Malpractice		
Probate	Construction Defect & Contr	act	Judicial Review/Appeal
Probate (select case type and estate value)	Construction Defect		Judicial Review
Summary Administration	Chapter 40		Foreclosure Mediation Case
General Administration	Other Construction Defect		Petition to Seal Records
Special Administration	Contract Case		Mental Competency
Set Aside	Uniform Commercial Code		Nevada State Agency Appeal
Trust/Conservatorship	Building and Construction		Department of Motor Vehicle
Other Probate	Insurance Carrier		Worker's Compensation
Estate Value	Commercial Instrument		Other Nevada State Agency
Over \$200,000	Collection of Accounts		Appeal Other
Between \$100,000 and \$200,000	Employment Contract		Appeal from Lower Court
Under \$100,000 or Unknown	Other Contract	- 1	Other Judicial Review/Appeal
Under \$2,500			
Civi	il Writ		Other Civil Filing
Civil Writ	_		Other Civil Filing
Writ of Habeas Corpus	Writ of Prohibition		Compromise of Minor's Claim
Writ of Mandamus	Other Civil Writ		Foreign Judgment
Writ of Quo Warrant			Other Civil Matters
	ourt filings should be filed using the	Business	s Court civil coversheet.
5/18/17			16/A200
Date		Signat	ture of initiating party or representative

See other side for family-related case filings.

Electronically Filed

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

This matter came before the Court on September 26, 2017 for hearing on Defendants Dickinson Wright, PLLC, Jodi Donetta Lowry, Jonathan M.A. Salls, Eric Dobberstein, and Michael G. Vartanian's (collectively "Dickinson Wright") Motion to Dismiss. Brandon Phillips appeared for Plaintiffs. Ryan Lower appeared for Dickinson Wright. The Court, having considered the motion papers filed in support of and in opposition to Dickinson Wright's motion to dismiss, and having heard the argument of counsel, HEREBY FINDS:

- (1) The plaintiffs allege the defendants committed malpractice because they did not file a legal malpractice action in state court against attorney Charles Damus on or before September 2011, after that claim against Damus in a multi-party case in federal court had been dismissed on December 6, 2010 in a non-final and non-appealable order;
- (2) Under 28 U.S.C. § 1367(d), the statute of limitations against Damus was tolled until September 4, 2015 when the federal action was finally dismissed. Plaintiffs' claims against Damus could have been brought in state court at that time and thereafter, as Dickinson Wright clearly advised plaintiffs when the firm terminated its representation of them on July 30, 2015;
- (3) Based on Nevada's litigation tolling rule, plaintiffs' legal malpractice claim against Damus did not accrue until the conclusion of the federal action when their damages became certain;
- (4) Under the attorney judgment rule, Dickinson Wright's exercise of professional judgment as to when plaintiffs could re-file their claims against Damus in state court is not, as a matter of law, actionable in this case;
- (5) The plaintiffs' claims against Dickinson Wright are timebarred under NRS 11

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

(6) Plaintiffs included new allegations in their opposition (Opp.
2:27–3:11, 5:17–22, 8:11–9:2, 10:14–11:7) that were not alleged in the
complaint and an improper request for leave to amend (Opp. 12:4–9) that
did not comply with EDCR 2.30(a); nevertheless, the new allegations did
not plead any facts or legal theories that would overcome the deficiencies
in the complaint or require the Court to deny this motion.

Based on these FINDINGS, and good cause appearing IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that:

- (1) Dickinson Wright's Motion to Dismiss is GRANTED;
- (2) The action is DISMISSED, without prejudice; and
- (3) Plaintiffs' request for leave to amend is DENIED.

DATED: October 12, 2017

Approved by: BRANDON L. PHILLIPS, ATTORNEY AT LAW, PLLC

SIGNED

Brandon L. Phillips, NV Bar No. 12264 1455 E. Tropicana Ave., Suite 750 Las Vegas, Nevada 89169

Submitted by:

MORRIS LÁW GROUP

Steve Morris, NV Bar No. 1543 Rvan M. Lower, NV Bar No. 9108 411 E. Bonneville Ave., Ste. 360 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101

26

27

28

Attorneys for Defendants Dickinson Wright, PLLC,

Jodi Donetta Lowry, Jonathan M.A.

Salls, Eric Dobberstein, and Michael G. Vartanian

1 2 3 4 5	NEO Steve Morris, NV Bar No. 1543 Ryan M. Lower, NV Bar No. 9108 MORRIS LAW GROUP 411 E. Bonneville Ave., Ste. 360 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 Telephone: (702) 474-9400 Email: sm@morrislawgroup.com Email: rml@morrislawgroup.com	10/17/2017 1:57 PM Steven D. Grierson CLERK OF THE COURT		
7 8	Attorneys for Defendants Dickinson Wright, PLLC,			
9	Jodi Donetta Lowry, Jonathan M.A. Salls, Eric Dobberstein, and Michael G. Vartanian			
10		CT COLIDT		
11	DISTRICT COURT			
12	CLARK COU	JNTY, NEVADA		
13	TAE-SI KIM, an Individual, and JIN-) Case No. A-17-756785-C		
14	SUNG HONG, an Individual,)) Dept. No. XXIV		
15	Plaintiffs,))		
16))		
17	GIBSON LOWRY BURRIS, LLP, (now known as GIBSON LOWRY,) NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER)		
18	LLP), a Nevada limited liability partnership; DICKINSON WRIGHT,)		
19	PLLC, a Nevada Professional)		
20	limited liability company; STEVE A. GIBSON, ESQ., an Individual; JODI))		
21	DONETTA LOWRY, ESQ., an Individual; JONATHAN M.A.))		
22	SALLS, ESQ., an Individual; ERIC	,)		
23	DOBBERSTEIN, ESQ., an Individual; and MICHAEL G.))		
24	VARTANIAN, ESQ., an Individual;)		
25	and DOES I through X, inclusive, and ROE BUSINESS ENTITIES XI	<i>)</i>)		
26	through XX, inclusive,)		
27	Defendants.	,		
28				
	i l			

Electronically Filed

MORRIS LAW GROUP 411 E. BONNEVILLE AVE., STE. 360 · LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89101 702/474-9400 · FAX 702/474-9422

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that an Order Granting Dickinson Wright's Motion to Dismiss ("Order") was entered in this action on the 17th day of October, 2017. A copy of the Order is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

MORRIS LAW GROUP

By: Steve Morris, NV Bar No. 1543
Ryan M. Lower, NV Bar No. 9108
411 E. Bonneville Ave., Ste. 360
Las Vegas, Nevada 89101

Attorneys for Defendants Dickinson Wright, PLLC, Jodi Donetta Lowry, Jonathan M.A. Salls, Eric Dobberstein, and Michael G. Vartanian

MORRIS LAW GROUP 411 E. BONNEVILLE AVE., STE. 360 · LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89101 702/474-9400 · FAX 702/474-9422

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Pursuant to Nev. R. Civ. P. 5(b)(2)(D) and E.D.C.R. 8.05, I
certify that I am an employee of MORRIS LAW GROUP and that on the
date below, I caused the following document to be served via the Court's
Odyssey E-Filing system: NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER. The date and
time of the electronic proof of service is in place of the date and place of
deposit in the mail.

TO:

Brandon L. Phillips, NV Bar No. 12264 BRANDON L. PHILLIPS, ATTORNEY AT LAW, PLLC 1455 E. Tropicana Ave., Suite 750 Las Vegas, Nevada 89169 blb@abetterlegalpractice.com

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

DATED this $\sqrt{14}$ day of October, 2017.

By: Paty Camer

EXHIBIT A

Electronically Filed 10/17/2017 9:52 AM

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

This matter came before the Court on September 26, 2017 for hearing on Defendants Dickinson Wright, PLLC, Jodi Donetta Lowry, Jonathan M.A. Salls, Eric Dobberstein, and Michael G. Vartanian's (collectively "Dickinson Wright") Motion to Dismiss. Brandon Phillips appeared for Plaintiffs. Ryan Lower appeared for Dickinson Wright. The Court, having considered the motion papers filed in support of and in opposition to Dickinson Wright's motion to dismiss, and having heard the argument of counsel, HEREBY FINDS:

- (1) The plaintiffs allege the defendants committed malpractice because they did not file a legal malpractice action in state court against attorney Charles Damus on or before September 2011, after that claim against Damus in a multi-party case in federal court had been dismissed on December 6, 2010 in a non-final and non-appealable order;
- (2) Under 28 U.S.C. § 1367(d), the statute of limitations against Damus was tolled until September 4, 2015 when the federal action was finally dismissed. Plaintiffs' claims against Damus could have been brought in state court at that time and thereafter, as Dickinson Wright clearly advised plaintiffs when the firm terminated its representation of them on July 30, 2015;
- (3) Based on Nevada's litigation tolling rule, plaintiffs' legal malpractice claim against Damus did not accrue until the conclusion of the federal action when their damages became certain;
- (4) Under the attorney judgment rule, Dickinson Wright's exercise of professional judgment as to when plaintiffs could re-file their claims against Damus in state court is not, as a matter of law, actionable in this case;
- (5) The plaintiffs' claims against Dickinson Wright are timebarred under NRS 11

28

1	(6) Plaintiffs included new allegations in their opposition (Opp.
2	2:27–3:11, 5:17–22, 8:11–9:2, 10:14–11:7) that were not alleged in the
3	complaint and an improper request for leave to amend (Opp. 12:4–9) that
4	did not comply with EDCR 2.30(a); nevertheless, the new allegations did
5	not plead any facts or legal theories that would overcome the deficiencies
6	in the complaint or require the Court to deny this motion.
7	Based on these FINDINGS, and good cause appearing IT IS
8	HEREBY ORDERED that:
9	(1) Dickinson Wright's Motion to Dismiss is GRANTED;
10	(2) The action is DISMISSED, without prejudice; and
11	(3) Plaintiffs' request for leave to amend is DENIED.
12	
13	DISTRICT COURT JUDGE
14	DATED: October 12, 2017
15	DATED: OGIOCOTI
16	Approved by: BRANDON L. PHILLIPS.
17	ATTORNEY AT LAW, PLLC
18	By: NOT SIGNED
19	Brandon L. Phillips, NV Bar No. 12264 1455 E. Tropicana Ave., Suite 750
20	Las Vegas, Nevada 89169
21	Submitted by:
22	MORRIS LAW GROUP
23	By: Steve Morris, NV Bar No. 1543
24	Kyan M. Lower, NV Bar No. 9108
25	411 E. Bonneville Ave., Ste. 360 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101
26	Attorneys for Defendants
27	Dickinson Wright, PLLC,
	Jodi Donetta Lowry, Jonathan M.A.

Salls, Eric Dobberstein, and

Michael G. Vartanian

Electronically Filed

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

This matter came before the Court on December 5, 2017 for hearing on Plaintiffs' Motion to Reconsider Dismissal of Plaintiffs' Claims against Dickinson Wright. Brandon Phillips appeared for Plaintiffs. Ryan Lower appeared for Dickinson Wright, PLLC, Jodi Donetta Lowry, Jonathan M.A. Salls, Eric Dobberstein, and Michael G. Vartanian (collectively "Dickinson Wright"). Jodi Donetta Lowry appeared for Gibson Lowry Burris LLP, a non-existent entity. The Court, having considered the motion papers filed in support of and in opposition to the motion, and having heard the argument of counsel, HEREBY FINDS:

- (1) Plaintiffs' motion fails to address 28 U.S.C. § 1367(d)—a dispositive part of the court's October 17, 2017 order—which renders reconsideration a moot point;
- (2) Plaintiffs' motion does not meet the standard for reconsideration;
- (3) Plaintiffs' motion does not present any newly discovery or substantially different evidence;
- (4) Plaintiffs' motion re-argues their prior opposition to the motion to dismiss and makes arguments they could have raised before; and
- (5) Plaintiffs fail to show that the dismissal order was clearly erroneous.

Based on these FINDINGS, and good cause appearing IT IS **HEREBY ORDERED that:**

(1) Plaintiffs' Motion to Reconsider Dismissal of Plaintiffs' Claims against Dickinson Wright is DENIED;

(2) Dickinson Wright's request for sanctions is DENIED.



1	DATED
2	Approved by:
3	BRANDON L. PHILLIPS, ATTORNEY AT LAW _D PLLC
4	By: Stall
5	Brandon L. Phillips, NV Bar No. 12264 1455 E. Tropicana Ave., Suite 750
6	Las Vegas, Nevada 89169
7	Submitted by:
8	MORRIS LAW GROUP
9	By: Marrie NV Par No. 1542
10	Kteve Morris, NV Bar No. 1543 Ryan M. Lower, NV Bar No. 9108
11	411 E. Bonneville Ave., Ste. 360 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101
12	Attorneys for Defendants
13	Dickinson Wright, PLLC,
14	Jodi Donetta Lowry, Jonathan M.A. Salls, Eric Dobberstein, and
15	Michael G. Vartanian
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

		Electronically Filed 12/12/2017 2:54 PM Steven D. Grierson	
1	NEO	CLERK OF THE COURT	
2	Steve Morris, NV Bar No. 1543 Ryan M. Lower, NV Bar No. 9108	Deun S. Drum	
3	MORRIS LAW GROUP		
4	411 E. Bonneville Ave., Ste. 360 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101		
5	Telephone: (702) 474-9400		
6	Email: sm@morrislawgroup.com Email: rml@morrislawgroup.com		
7	Attorneys for Defendants		
8	Dickinson Wright, PLLC,		
9	Jodi Donetta Lowry, Jonathan M.A. Salls, Eric Dobberstein, and		
10	Michael G. Vartanian		
11	DISTRICT COURT		
12	CLARK COU	UNTY, NEVADA	
13	TAE-SI KIM, an Individual, and JIN-) Case No. A-17-756785-C	
14	SUNG HONG, an Individual,) Dont No. YYIV	
15	Plaintiffs,) Dept. No. XXIV)	
16	v.)	
17	GIBSON LOWRY BURRIS, LLP,) NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER	
18	(now known as GIBSON LOWRY,)	
19	LLP), a Nevada limited liability partnership; DICKINSON WRIGHT,		
20	PLLC, a Nevada Professional limited liability company; STEVE A.)	
21	GIBSON, ESQ., an Individual; JODI)	
22	DONETTA LOWRY, ESQ., an Individual; JONATHAN M.A.)	
23	SALLS, ESQ., an Individual; ERIC))	
24	DOBBERSTEIN, ESQ., an Individual; and MICHAEL G.		
25	VARTANIAN, ESQ., an Individual;	<u>)</u>	
26	and DOES I through X, inclusive, and ROE BUSINESS ENTITIES XI		
27	through XX, inclusive,	ý hande sa	
28	Defendants.)	
		,	

MORRIS LAW GROUP 411 E. BONNEVILLE AVE., STE. 360 · LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89101 702/474-9400 · FAX 702/474-9422

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that an Order Denying Plaintiffs' Motion to Reconsider Dismissal of Plaintiffs' Claims Against Dickinson Wright was entered in this action on the 12th day of December, 2017. A copy of the Order is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

MORRIS LAW GROUP

By:

Steve Morris, NV Bar No. 1543 Ryan M. Lower, NV Bar No. 9108 411 E. Bonneville Ave., Ste. 360 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101

Attorneys for Defendants Dickinson Wright, PLLC, Jodi Donetta Lowry, Jonathan M.A. Salls, Eric Dobberstein, and Michael G. Vartanian

MORRIS LAW GROUP 411 E. Bonneville Ave., Ste. 360 - LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89101 702/474-9400 - FAX 702/474-9422

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Pursuant to Nev. R. Civ. P. 5(b)(2)(D) and E.D.C.R. 8.05, I
certify that I am an employee of MORRIS LAW GROUP and that on the
date below, I caused the following document to be served via the Court's
Odyssey E-Filing system: NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER. The date and
time of the electronic proof of service is in place of the date and place of
deposit in the mail.

TO:

Brandon L. Phillips, NV Bar No. 12264 BRANDON L. PHILLIPS, ATTORNEY AT LAW, PLLC 1455 E. Tropicana Ave., Suite 750 Las Vegas, Nevada 89169 blb@abetterlegalpractice.com

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

DATED this <u>//t*</u> day of December, 2017.

An employee of Morris Law Group

Exhibit A

ODM

Steve Morris, NV Bar No. 1543

Electronically Filed 12/12/2017 10:35 AM Steven D. Grierson CLERK OF THE COUP

ORDER DENYING PLAINTIFFS' **MOTION TO RECONSIDER DISMISSAL OF PLAINTIFFS' CLAIMS AGAINST DICKINSON**

This matter came before the Court on December 5, 2017 for hearing on Plaintiffs' Motion to Reconsider Dismissal of Plaintiffs' Claims against Dickinson Wright. Brandon Phillips appeared for Plaintiffs. Ryan Lower appeared for Dickinson Wright, PLLC, Jodi Donetta Lowry, Jonathan M.A. Salls, Eric Dobberstein, and Michael G. Vartanian (collectively "Dickinson Wright"). Jodi Donetta Lowry appeared for Gibson Lowry Burris LLP, a non-existent entity. The Court, having considered the motion papers filed in support of and in opposition to the motion, and having heard the argument of counsel, HEREBY FINDS:

- (1) Plaintiffs' motion fails to address 28 U.S.C. § 1367(d)—a dispositive part of the court's October 17, 2017 order—which renders reconsideration a moot point;
- (2) Plaintiffs' motion does not meet the standard for reconsideration;
- (3) Plaintiffs' motion does not present any newly discovery or substantially different evidence;
- (4) Plaintiffs' motion re-argues their prior opposition to the motion to dismiss and makes arguments they could have raised before; and
- (5) Plaintiffs fail to show that the dismissal order was clearly erroneous.

Based on these FINDINGS, and good cause appearing IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that:

(1) Plaintiffs' Motion to Reconsider Dismissal of Plaintiffs' Claims against Dickinson Wright is DENIED;

(2) Dickinson Wright's request for sanctions is DENIED.

1	
2	Approved by:
3	BRANDON L. PHILLIPS, ATTORNEY AT LAW _D PLLC
4	By: Stall
5	Brandon L. Phillips, NV Bar No. 12264
6	1455 E. Tropicana Ave., Suite 750 Las Vegas, Nevada 89169
7	Submitted by:
8	MORRIS LAW GROUP
9	By:
10	Kteve Morris, NV Bar No. 1543 Ryan M. Lower, NV Bar No. 9108
11	411 E. Bonneville Ave., Ste. 360 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101
12	
13	Attorneys for Defendants Dickinson Wright, PLLC,
14	Jodi Donetta Lowry, Jonathan M.A. Salls, Eric Dobberstein, and
15	Michael G. Vartanian
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	

DISTRICT COURT CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

A-17-756785-C Tae-Si Kim, Plaintiff(s)
vs.
Gibson Lowry Burris LLP, Defendant(s)

September 26, 2017 9:00 AM Motion to Dismiss

HEARD BY: Crockett, Jim COURTROOM: Phoenix Building Courtroom -

11th Floor

COURT CLERK: Katrina Hernandez

RECORDER:

REPORTER:

PARTIES

PRESENT: Phillips, Brandon L Attorney

JOURNAL ENTRIES

- Also present: Ryan Lower, Esq. on behalf of Defendants Vartanian, Dobberstein, Salls, Donetta Lowry, and Dickinson Wright.

Court noted the details of the case, arguments by Counsel, and its inclination. Court stated its findings, noting it is further inclined to deny Plaintiff's motion to amend in opposition because there is no proposed amended complaint. Arguments by Mr. Phillip's in opposition and arguments by Mr. Lower. COURT ORDERED, motion to dismiss GRANTED WITHOUT PREJUDICE. Court stated its findings and noted page 2 of Defendant's reply. Counsel to prepare the order, circulate for approval as to form and content, and submit it to the Court within TEN days per EDCR 7.21.

DISTRICT COURT CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

A-17-756785-C Tae-Si Kim, Plaintiff(s) vs.
Gibson Lowry Burris LLP, Defendant(s)

November 14, 2017 3:00 AM Motion

HEARD BY: Crockett, Jim COURTROOM: Phoenix Building Courtroom -

11th Floor

COURT CLERK: Katrina Hernandez

RECORDER:

REPORTER:

PARTIES PRESENT:

JOURNAL ENTRIES

- Court stated Plaintiff wants to enlarge time to serve Steven Gibson Esq. and noted the other Defendant is the law firm to which Steve Gibson Esq. belongs. Court reviewed the Complaint and noted it doesn't specifically state that Defendant was employed by the Gibson Lowry Law Firm, but noted the Legal directory does indicate such. Court commented on the Complaint and noted that it is possible that it will result of dismissal for the same reasons that granted dismissal of Dickinson Wright. Court also added that it struggles with the notion that Defendant has been at the same address and that the letter from Junes Legal says they were unable to serve. Court noted the motion to dismiss calendared for 12/5/17 and motion to reconsider dismissal against Dickinson Wright on 12/7/17. COURT ORDERED, matter CONTINUED to be heard in conjunction with the two other motions, and consolidated to be heard on 12/5/17 at 9:00 AM.

12/5/17 9:00 AM PLAINTIFF'S MOTION TO EXTEND TIME FOR SERVICE AND FOR PUBLICATION OF SUMMONS AND COMPLAINT; AFFIDAVIT OF BRANDON PHILLIPS ESQ IN SUPPORT THEREOF...DEFENDANT GIBSON LOWRY BURRIS LLP'S MOTION TO DISMISS...PLAINTIFF'S MOTION TO RECONSIDER DISMISSAL OF PLAINTIFFS' CLAIMS AGAINST DICKINSON WRIGHT

PRINT DATE: 12/27/2017 Page 2 of 3 Minutes Date: September 26, 2017

A-17-756785-C

*CLERK'S NOTE: Minute order sent via e-mail to: blp@abetterlegalpractice.com; rml@morrislawgroup.com; sgibson@gibsonlowry.com./KH 11-14-17

PRINT DATE: 12/27/2017 Page 3 of 3 Minutes Date: September 26, 2017



EIGHTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT CLERK'S OFFICE NOTICE OF DEFICIENCY ON APPEAL TO NEVADA SUPREME COURT

BRANDON L. PHILLIPS, ESQ. 1455 E. TROPICANA AVE., SUITE 750 LAS VEGAS, NV 89169

DATE: December 27, 2017 CASE: A-17-756785-C

RE CASE: TAE-SI KIM; JIN-SUNG HONG vs. GIBSON LOWRY BURRIS, LLP nka GIBSON LOWRY, LLP; DICKINSON WRIGHT, PLLC; STEVE A. GIBSON, ESQ.; JODI DONETTA LOWRY, ESQ.; JONATHAN M.A. SALLS, ESQ.; ERIC DOBBERSTEIN, ESQ.; MICHAEL G. VARTANIAN, ESQ.

NOTICE OF APPEAL FILED: December 22, 2017

YOUR APPEAL HAS BEEN SENT TO THE SUPREME COURT.

PLEASE NOTE: DOCUMENTS **NOT** TRANSMITTED HAVE BEEN MARKED:

- \$250 Supreme Court Filing Fee (Make Check Payable to the Supreme Court)**

 If the \$250 Supreme Court Filing Fee was not submitted along with the original Notice of Appeal, it must be mailed directly to the Supreme Court. The Supreme Court Filing Fee will not be forwarded by this office if submitted after the Notice of Appeal has been filed.
 \$24 − District Court Filing Fee (Make Check Payable to the District Court)**
 \$500 − Cost Bond on Appeal (Make Check Payable to the District Court)**
 NRAP 7: Bond For Costs On Appeal in Civil Cases
- - NRAP 3 (a)(1), Form 2
- □ Order
- ☐ Notice of Entry of Order

NEVADA RULES OF APPELLATE PROCEDURE 3 (a) (3) states:

"The district court clerk must file appellant's notice of appeal despite perceived deficiencies in the notice, including the failure to pay the district court or Supreme Court filing fee. The district court clerk shall apprise appellant of the deficiencies in writing, and shall transmit the notice of appeal to the Supreme Court in accordance with subdivision (e) of this Rule with a notation to the clerk of the Supreme Court setting forth the deficiencies. Despite any deficiencies in the notice of appeal, the clerk of the Supreme Court shall docket the appeal in accordance with Rule 12."

Please refer to Rule 3 for an explanation of any possible deficiencies.

^{**}Per District Court Administrative Order 2012-01, in regards to civil litigants, "...all Orders to Appear in Forma Pauperis expire one year from the date of issuance." You must reapply for in Forma Pauperis status.

Certification of Copy

State of Nevada
County of Clark

I, Steven D. Grierson, the Clerk of the Court of the Eighth Judicial District Court, Clark County, State of Nevada, does hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and correct copy of the hereinafter stated original document(s):

NOTICE OF APPEAL; DISTRICT COURT DOCKET ENTRIES; CIVIL COVER SHEET; ORDER GRANTING DICKINSON WRIGHT'S MOTION TO DISMISS; NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER; ORDER DENYING PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO RECONSIDER DISMISSAL OF PLAINTIFFS' CLAIMS AGAINST DICKINSON WRIGHT; NOTICE OF ENTRY OF ORDER; DISTRICT COURT MINUTES; NOTICE OF DEFICIENCY

TAE-SI KIM; JIN-SUNG HONG,

Plaintiff(s),

VS.

GIBSON LOWRY BURRIS, LLP nka GIBSON LOWRY, LLP; DICKINSON WRIGHT, PLLC; STEVE A. GIBSON, ESQ.; JODI DONETTA LOWRY, ESQ.; JONATHAN M.A. SALLS, ESQ.; ERIC DOBBERSTEIN, ESQ.; MICHAEL G. VARTANIAN, ESQ.,

Defendant(s),

now on file and of record in this office.

Case No: A-17-756785-C

Dept No: XXIV

IN WITNESS THEREOF, I have hereunto Set my hand and Affixed the seal of the Court at my office, Las Vegas, Nevada This 27 day of December 2017.

Steven D. Grierson, Clerk of the Court

Heather Ungermann, Deputy Clerk



EIGHTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT CLERK OF THE COURT

REGIONAL JUSTICE CENTER 200 LEWIS AVENUE, 3rd FI. LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89155-1160 (702) 671-4554

Steven D. Grierson Clerk of the Court Brandi J. Wendel Court Division Administrator

December 27, 2017

Elizabeth A. Brown Clerk of the Court 201 South Carson Street, Suite 201 Carson City, Nevada 89701-4702

RE: TAE-SI KIM; JIN-SUNG HONG vs. GIBSON LOWRY BURRIS, LLP nka GIBSON LOWRY, LLP; DICKINSON WRIGHT, PLLC; STEVE A. GIBSON, ESQ.; JODI DONETTA LOWRY, ESQ.; JONATHAN M.A. SALLS, ESQ.; ERIC DOBBERSTEIN, ESQ.; MICHAEL G. VARTANIAN, ESQ. D.C. CASE: A-17-756785-C

Dear Ms. Brown:

Please find enclosed a Notice of Appeal packet, filed December 27, 2017. Due to extenuating circumstances minutes from the date(s) listed below have not been included:

December 5, 2017

We do not currently have a time frame for when these minutes will be available.

If you have any questions regarding this matter, please contact me at (702) 671-0512.

Sincerely,

STEVEN D. GRIERSON, CLERK OF THE COURT

Heather Ungermann, Deputy Clerk