#### IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEVADA

BARRY JAMES RIVES, M.D. and

LAPAROSCOPIC SURGERY OF NEVADA, LLC,

Appellants/Cross-Respondents,

VS.

TITINA FARRIS and PATRICK FARRIS.

Respondents/Cross-Appellants.

BARRY JAMES RIVES, M.D. and LAPAROSCOPIC SURGERY OF NEVADA, LLC,

Appellants,

VS.

TITINA FARRIS and PATRICK FARRIS.

Respondents.

No.: 80271

Electronically Filed

Appeal from the Eighth Judicial District Court, the Honorable Joanna S. Kishler Presiding Clerk of Supreme Court

Presiding

81052 No.:

Appeal from the Eighth Judicial District Court, the Honorable Joanna S. Kishner Presiding

#### RESPONDENTS/CROSS-APPELLANTS' APPENDIX, VOLUME 2

(Nos. 166–185)

Micah S. Echols, Esq. Nevada Bar No. 8437 **CLAGGETT & SYKES LAW FIRM** 4101 Meadows Lane, Suite 100 Las Vegas, Nevada 89107

Telephone: (702) 655-2346 Facsimile: (702) 655-3763 micah@claggettlaw.com

Kimball J. Jones, Esq. Nevada Bar No. 12982 Jacob G. Leavitt, Esq. Nevada Bar No. 12608 **BIGHORN LAW** 

2225 East Flamingo Road, Suite 300

Las Vegas, Nevada 89119 Telephone: (702) 505-8387 Facsimile: (702) 710-0999 kimball@bighornlaw.com jacob@bighornlaw.com

George F. Hand, Esq. Nevada Bar No. 8483 HAND & SULLIVAN, LLC 3442 North Buffalo Drive Las Vegas, Nevada 89129 Telephone: (702) 656-5814 ghand@handsullivan.com

Attorneys for Respondents/Cross-Appellants, Titina Farris and Patrick Farris

# INDEX TO RESPONDENTS/CROSS-APPELLANTS' ANSWERING APPENDIX

DOCUMENT DESCRIPTION		<u>LOCATION</u>
Transcript of January 7, 2019 Telephonic Conference (filed 09/24/2019)		Vol. 1–17
Plaintiffs' Motion to Strike Defendants' Rebuttal Witnesses Sarah Larsen, R.N., Bruce Adornato, M.D., and Scott Kush, and to Limit the Testimony of Lance Stone, DO and Kim Erlich, M.D., for Giving Improper "Rebuttal" Opinions, on Order Shortening Time (filed 09/19/2019)		Vol. 1, 18–39
Exhibits to Plaintiffs' Motion to Strike Defendants' Rebuttal Witnesses		
Exhibit	<b>Document Description</b>	
1	Defendants Barry J. Rives, M.D. and Laparoscopic Surgery of Nevada, LLC's Rebuttal Disclosure of Expert Witnesses and Reports (served 12/19/2018)	Vol. 1, 40–44
2	Sarah Larsen, R.N., M.S.N., F.N.P., C.L.C.P. Life Care Plan Report (dated 12/19/2018)	Vol. 1, 45–76
3	Scott J. Kush, M.D., JD, MPH Life Expectancy Report of (dated 12/19/2018)	Vol. 1, 77–109
4	Report of Bruce T. Adornato, M.D. (dated 12/18/2018)	Vol. 1, 110–128
5	Lance R. Stone, DO Report (dated 12/19/2018)	Vol. 1, 129–142
6	Kim S. Erlich M.D. Report (dated 11/26/2018)	Vol. 1, 143–158
7	Brian E. Juell M.D., F.A.C.S. Report (dated 12/16/2018)	Vol. 1, 159–162

	DOCUMENT DESCRIPTION	<b>LOCATION</b>
8	Bart J. Carter, M.D., F.A.C.S. Report (dated 12/19/2018)	Vol. 1, 163–165
Motion for Intention Negligen	of September 26, 2019 Hearing on Plaintiffs' or Sanctions Under Rule 37 for Defendants' al Concealment of Defendant Rives' History of ce and Litigation and Motion for Leave to Amend at to Add Claim for Punitive Damages on Order ag Time	Vol. 2, 166
Deposition	'Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Compel the on of Gregg Ripplinger, M.D. and Extend the Close very (9th Request) on an Order Shortening Time 27/2019)	Vol. 2, 167–173
Exhibit to Comp	to Plaintiffs' Opposition to Defendants' Motion el	
Exhibit	Document Description	
1	Notice Vacating the Deposition of Gregg Ripplinger, M.D.	Vol. 2, 174–177
Plaintiffs	' Trial Exhibits List	Vol. 2, 178–185
Plaintiffs	s' Trial Exhibits	
Exhibit	<b>Document Description</b>	
1	St. Rose Dominican San Martin Hospital Medical Records and Billing	Vol. 3, 186–355 Vol. 4, 356–505 Vol. 5, 506–655 Vol. 6, 656–818
6	CareMeridian Medical Records and Billing	Vol. 7, 819–845

	DOCUMENT DESCRIPTION	LOCATION
10	Video of Titina Farris taken by Lowell Pender on April 13, 2015 ( <i>See</i> Supreme Court Order Granting Motions, dated 11/10/2020, allowing Trial Exhibit 10 to be filed.	
Court's Tr	rial Exhibits List	Vol. 7, 846–848
Court's T	rial Exhibits	
Exhibits	Document Description	
1	Statement to Jury from Counsel (dated 10/14/2019)	Vol. 7, 849
2	Proposed Instruction Not Given (dated 10/16/2019)	Vol. 7, 850
3	Juror [Fossile, Badge No. 444] Question (dated 10/17/2019)	Vol. 7, 851
4	Juror [Fossile, Badge No. 444] Question (dated 10/17/2019)	Vol. 7, 852–853
5	Juror Collins [Badge No. 450] Question (dated 10/17/2019)	Vol. 7, 854
6	Verification (dated 10/18/2019)	Vol. 7, 855
7	October 7, 2019 Transcript of Pending Motions	Vol. 7, 856–937
8	Juror [Collins, Badge No. 450] Question (dated 10/21/2019)	Vol. 7, 938
9	Juror No. 9 [Peacock] Question (dated 10/21/2019)	Vol. 7, 939

	DOCUMENT DESCRIPTION	<b>LOCATION</b>
10	Juror [Crenshaw, Badge No. 455] Question (dated 10/21/2019)	Vol. 7, 940–941
11	Juror [Crenshaw, Badge No. 455] Question (dated 10/21/2019)	Vol. 7, 942
12	Juror [Crenshaw, Badge No. 455] Question (dated 10/21/2019)	Vol. 7, 943
13	Insurance Documents (dated 10/21/2019)	Vol. 7, 944–950
14	Juror [Crenshaw, Badge No. 455] Question (dated 10/21/2019)	Vol. 7, 951–952
15	Juror [Crenshaw, Badge No. 455] (dated 10/21/2019)	Vol. 7, 953–954
16	Juror No. 9 [Peacock] Question (dated 10/21/2019)	Vol. 7, 955–956
17	Juror [Root, Badge No. 361] Question (dated 10/21/2019)	Vol. 7, 957–958
18	Juror [Collins, Badge No. 450] Question (dated 10/21/2019)	Vol. 7, 959–960
19	Juror [Root, Badge No. 361] Question (dated 10/22/2019)	Vol. 7, 961
20	Juror [Fossile, Badge No. 444] Question (dated 10/22/2019)	Vol. 7, 962
21	Juror No. 9 [Peacock] Question (dated 10/22/2019)	Vol. 7, 963–964

	<b>DOCUMENT DESCRIPTION</b>	LOCATION
23	Juror No. 9 [Peacock] Question (dated 10/23/2019)	Vol. 7, 965
24	Juror [Crenshaw, Badge No. 455] Question (dated 10/23/2019)	Vol. 7, 966
25	Juror [Crenshaw, Badge No. 455] Question (dated 10/23/2019)	Vol. 7, 967
26	Juror [Root, Badge No. 361] Question (dated 10/23/2019)	Vol. 7, 968
27	Juror [Barrios, Badge No. 366] Question (dated 10/23/2019)	Vol. 7, 969
28	Juror No. 9 [Peacock] Question (dated 10/23/2019)	Vol. 7, 970–971
29	Juror No. 9 [Peacock] Question (dated 10/23/2019)	Vol. 7, 972
30	Juror [Fossile, Badge No. 444] Question (dated 10/23/2019)	Vol. 7, 973
31	Juror No. 9 [Peacock] Question (dated 10/23/2019)	Vol. 7, 974
32	Juror No. 9 [Peacock] Question (dated 10/24/2019)	Vol. 7, 975
33	Juror No. 9 [Peacock] Question (dated 10/24/2019)	Vol. 7, 976

	<b>DOCUMENT DESCRIPTION</b>	<b>LOCATION</b>
34	Juror [Fossile, Badge No. 444] Question (dated 10/24/2019)	Vol. 7, 977
35	Juror [Crenshaw, Badge No. 455] Question (dated 10/24/2019)	Vol. 7, 978
36	Juror [Barrios, Badge No. 366] Question (dated 10/28/2019)	Vol. 7, 979
37	Juror [Thomas, Badge 418] Question (dated 10/28/2019)	Vol. 7, 980
38	Juror No. 9 [Peacock] Question (dated 10/28/2019)	Vol. 7, 981
39	Juror [Collins, Badge No. 450] Question (dated 10/28/2019)	Vol. 7, 982
40	Juror No. 9 [Peacock] Question (dated 10/30/2019)	Vol. 7, 983
41	Juror [Collins, Badge No. 450] Question (dated 10/30/2019)	Vol. 7, 984
42	Juror [Crenshaw, Badge No. 455] Question (dated 10/30/2019)	Vol. 7, 985
43	Juror [Root, Badge No. 361] Question (dated 10/30/2019)	Vol. 7, 986
44	Juror [Crenshaw, Badge No. 455] Question (dated 10/31/2019)	Vol. 7, 987–988

	DOCUMENT DESCRIPTION	<b>LOCATION</b>
45	Juror [Fossile, Badge No. 444] Question (dated 10/31/2019)	Vol. 7, 989
46	Juror No. 9 [Peacock] Question (dated 10/31/2019)	Vol. 7, 990
Minutes of October 7, 2019 Hearing on All Pending Motions; and also addressed the supplemental pleadings filed October 4, 2019 by defense, and non-compliance issues		Vol. 7, 991–992
Minutes o	f October 14, 2019 Jury Trial – Day 1	Vol. 7, 993–994
Minutes o	f October 15, 2019 Jury Trial – Day 2	Vol. 7, 995
Minutes o	f October 16, 2019 Jury Trial – Day 3	Vol. 7, 996–997
Minutes of October 17, 2019 Jury Trial – Day 4		Vol. 7, 998
Minutes of October 18, 2019 Jury Trial – Day 5		Vol. 7, 999
October 18, 2019 Partial Transcript of Jury Trial – Day 5 (Testimony of Michael Hurwitz, M.D.) [filed 11/14/2019]		Vol. 8, 1000–1093
Defendants Barry Rives, M.D.'s and Laparoscopic Surgery of Nevada, LLC's Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Strike Defendants' Trial Briefs on Order Shortening Time (filed 10/21/2019)		Vol. 8, 1094–1098
Minutes of October 21, 2019 Jury Trial – Day 6		Vol. 8, 1099–1100
Minutes of October 22, 2019 Jury Trial – Day 7		Vol. 8, 1101–1102
	f October 22, 2019 Hearing on Plaintiffs' Motion Defendants' Trial Briefs on Order	Vol. 8, 1103
Minutes o	f October 23, 2019 Jury Trial – Day 8	Vol. 8, 1104–1105

DOCUMENT DESCRIPTION	<u>LOCATION</u>
October 23, 2019 Partial Transcript of Jury Trial – Day 8 (Testimony of Michael Hurwitz, M.D.) (filed 11/14/2019)	Vol. 8, 1106–1153
Notice of Entry of Order on Plaintiffs' Motion to Strike Defendants' Fourth and Fifth Supplements to NRCP 16.1 Disclosures (filed 10/23/2019)	Vol. 9, 1154–1158
Minutes of October 24, 2019 Jury Trial – Day 9	Vol. 9, 1159
Minutes of October 28, 2019 Jury Trial – Day 10	Vol. 9, 1160–1161
Minutes of October 29, 2019 Jury Trial – Day 11	Vol. 9, 1162–1163
Minutes of October 30, 2019 Jury Trial – Day 12	Vol. 9, 1164–1165
Minutes of October 31, 2019 Jury Trial – Day 13	Vol. 9, 1166–1167
Minutes of November 1, 2019 Jury Trial – Day 14	Vol. 9, 1168
Second Amended Jury List (filed 11/01/2019)	Vol. 9, 1169
Minutes of November 7, 2019 Hearing on All Pending Motions	Vol. 9, 1170–1171
Minutes of November 13, 2019 Show Cause Hearing	Vol. 9, 1172
Minutes of November 14, 2019 Hearing on Plaintiffs' Renewed Motion to Strike	Vol. 9, 1173
Plaintiffs' Verified Memorandum of Costs and Disbursements (filed 11/19/2019)	Vol. 10, 1174–1340 Vol. 11, 1341–1507
Minutes of November 20, 2019 Hearing on Plaintiffs' Motion for Sanctions	Vol. 12, 1508
Defendants Barry J. Rives, M.D.'s and Laparoscopic Surgery of Nevada, LLC's Motion to Re-Tax and Settle Plaintiffs' Costs (filed 11/22/2019)	Vol. 12, 1509–1522

DOCUMENT DESCRIPTION		<b>LOCATION</b>
Plaintiffs' Opposition to Defendants Barry J. Rives, M.D.'s and Laparoscopic Surgery of Nevada, LLC's Motion to Re-Tax and Settle Plaintiffs' Costs (filed 11/26/2019)		Vol. 12, 1523–1533
	to Plaintiffs' Opposition to Defendants' Motion x and Settle Plaintiffs' Costs	
Exhibit	<b>Document Description</b>	
1	Judgment on Verdict (filed 11/14/2019)	Vol. 12, 1534–1538
2	Plaintiffs' Verified Memorandum of Costs and Disbursements (filed 11/19/2019)	Vol. 12, 1539–1547
Defendants Barry J. Rives, M.D.'s and Laparoscopic Surgery of Nevada, LLC's Reply to Plaintiffs' Opposition to Motion to Re-Tax and Settle Plaintiffs' Costs (filed 11/27/2019)		Vol. 12, 1548–1557
Minutes of January 7, 2020 hearing on Plaintiffs' Motion for Fees and Costs		Vol. 12, 1558
Plaintiffs' Supplemental Verified Memorandum of Costs and Disbursements (filed 01/21/2020)		Vol. 13, 1559–1685 Vol. 14, 1686–1813 Vol. 15, 1814–1941
Plaintiffs' Supplemental Opposition to Defendants Barry J. Rives, M.D.'s and Laparoscopic Surgery of Nevada, LLC's Motion to Re-Tax and Settle Plaintiffs' Costs (filed 01/21/2020)		Vol. 16, 1942–1956

	DOCUMENT DESCRIPTION	<u>LOCATION</u>
Exhibits to Plaintiffs' Supplemental Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Re-Tax and Settle Plaintiffs' Costs		
Exhibit	<b>Document Description</b>	
1(a)	Dr. Hurwitz's Report, Billing Rate and CV	Vol. 16, 1957–1969
1(b)	Proof of Payment Issued to Dr. Hurwitz Totaling \$11,000.00 for Fees	Vol. 16, 1970–1973
2(a)	Dr. Willer's Report, Billing Rate and CV	Vol. 16, 1974–1991
2(b)	Proof of Payment Issued to Dr. Willer Totaling 17,425.00 for Fees	Vol. 16, 1992–1995
3(a)	Dr. Barchuk's Report, Billing Rate and CV	Vol. 16, 1996–2063
3(b)	Proof of Payment Issued to Dr. Barchuk Totaling \$26,120.00 for Fees	Vol. 16, 2064–2068
4(a)	Dawn Cook's Life Care Plan Report, Billing Rate and CV	Vol. 16, 2069–2104 Vol. 17, 2105–2162
4(b)	Proof of Payment Issued to Dawn Cook Totaling \$17,957.03 for Fees	Vol. 17, 2163–2168
5(a)	Dr. Stein's Report, Billing Rate and CV	Vol. 17, 2169–2179
5(b)	Proof of Payment Issued to Dr. Stein Totaling \$19,710.00 for Fees	Vol. 17, 2180–2185
6	Proof of Payment Issued to Dr. Feingold Totaling \$2,000.00 for Fees	Vol. 17, 2186–2187

	<b>DOCUMENT DESCRIPTION</b>	<b>LOCATION</b>
7(a)	Dr. Clauretie's Report, Billing Rate and CV	Vol. 17, 2188–2206
7(b)	Proof of Payment Issued to Dr. Clauretie Totaling \$1,575.00 for Fees	Vol. 17, 2207–2208
8	Plaintiffs' Supplemental Memorandum of Costs and Disbursements (filed 01/21/2020)	Vol. 17, 2209–2267 Vol. 18, 2268–2429 Vol. 19, 2430–2592
Defendants Barry J. Rives, M.D.'s and Laparoscopic Surgery of Nevada, LLC's Supplemental Reply to Plaintiffs' Supplemental Opposition to Motion to Re-Tax and Settle Plaintiffs' Costs (filed 02/03/2020)		Vol. 20, 2593–2603
Minutes of February 11, 2020 Hearing on Defendants Barry J. Rives, M.D.'s and Laparoscopic Surgery of Nevada, LLC's Motion to Re-Tax and Settle Plaintiffs' Costs		Vol. 20, 2604
District Court Docket Case No. A-16-739464-C		Vol. 20, 2605–2614

### DISTRICT COURT CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

Malpractice - Medical/Dental COURT MINUTES September 26, 2019

A-16-739464-C Titina Farris, Plaintiff(s)

VS.

Barry Rives, M.D., Defendant(s)

September 26, 2019 10:00 AM Plaintiffs' Motion for Sanctions Under Rule 37 for Defendants'

Intentional Concealment of Defendant Rives' History of Negligence and Litigation and Motion for Leave to Amend Complaint to Add Claim for Punitive Damages on Order

**Shortening Time** 

HEARD BY: Kishner, Joanna S. COURTROOM: RJC Courtroom 12B

COURT CLERK: Botzenhart, Susan

**RECORDER:** Harrell, Sandra

REPORTER:

PARTIES PRESENT:

Aimee Lea Clark Newberry

Chad C. Couchot

Jacob G Leavitt

Kimball Jones

Attorney for Defendant

Attorney for Plaintiff

Attorney for Plaintiff

#### **JOURNAL ENTRIES**

Arguments by counsel regarding allegations of intentional concealment of defense, deposition of Dr. Rives, and Plaintiff's request for sanctions and punitive damages. Court stated its findings; and offered to set an evidentiary hearing for Dr. Rives to appear. Court noted punitive damages are not appropriate on a sanction basis based on what was provided to the Court at this juncture and applicable case law. Following statements by counsel regarding scheduling, Plaintiff's counsel estimated no more than an hour for the hearing. COURT ORDERED, matter SET for evidentiary hearing. Parties to notify the Court in advance by no later than noon on October 3, 2019, confirming whether or not they want the evidentiary hearing to go forward; and the Court will issue a ruling, if the evidentiary hearing does not go forward. Issues not addressed today may be addressed at time of Calendar Call.

10/07/19 8:30 A.M. EVIDENTIARY HEARING

10/08/19 9:00 A.M. CALENDAR CALL

10/14/19 9:00 A.M. TRIAL BY JURY (MED MAL #1)

Printed Date: 10/1/2019 Page 1 of 1 Minutes Date: September 26, 2019

Prepared by: Susan Botzenhart

Electronically Filed 9/27/2019 7:44 AM Steven D. Grierson CLERK OF THE COURT

1 **OPPS** KIMBALL JONES, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 12982 JACOB G. LEAVITT, ESQ. 3 Nevada Bar No.: 12608 **BIGHORN LAW** 4 716 S. Jones Blvd. Las Vegas, Nevada 89107 Phone: (702) 333-1111 6 Email: Kimball@BighornLaw.com Jacob@BighornLaw.com 7 8 GEORGE F. HAND, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 8483 9 HAND & SULLIVAN, LLC 3442 N. Buffalo Drive 10 Las Vegas, Nevada 89129 Phone: (702) 656-5814 11 Email: GHand@HandSullivan.com 12 Attorneys for Plaintiffs DISTRICT COURT 13 **CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA** 14 15 TITINA FARRIS and PATRICK FARRIS, CASE NO.: A-16-739464-C 16 Plaintiffs, DEPT. NO.: XXXI VS. 17 18 BARRY RIVES, M.D.; LAPAROSCOPIC SURGERY OF NEVADA, LLC et al., 19 Defendants. 20 21 PLAINTIFFS' OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO COMPEL THE DEPOSITION OF GREGG RIPPLINGER, M.D. AND EXTEND THE CLOSE OF 22 DISCOVERY (9TH REQUEST) ON AN ORDER SHORTENING TIME 23 COMES NOW Plaintiffs PATRICK FARRIS and TITINA FARRIS, by and through their 24 attorneys of record, KIMBALL JONES, ESQ. and JACOB G. LEAVITT, ESQ., with the Law Offices 25 of BIGHORN LAW and GEORGE F. HAND, ESQ., with the Law Offices of HAND & 26 27 SULLIVAN, LLC, and hereby submit this Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Compel the 28

Page 1 of 7

Case Number: A-16-739464-C

1 Deposition of Gregg Ripplinger, M.D. and Extend the Close of Discovery (9th Request) on an Order 2 Shortening Time. 3 This Opposition is made and based upon all of the pleadings and papers on file herein and the 4 attached Memorandum of Points and Authorities. 5 DATED this 27th day of September, 2019. 6 **BIGHORN LAW** 7 By: /s/ Kimball Jones 8 KIMBALL JONES, ESQ. Nevada Bar.: 12982 9 JACOB G. LEAVITT, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 12608 10 716 S. Jones Blvd. 11 Las Vegas, Nevada 89107 12 GEORGE F. HAND, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 8483 13 HAND & SULLIVAN, LLC 3442 N. Buffalo Drive 14 Las Vegas, Nevada 89129 15 Attorneys for Plaintiffs 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 Page 2 of 7

## 

#### **MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES**

#### I. <u>STATEMENT OF RELEVANT FACTS</u>

Plaintiff Titina Farris was a patient of Defendant Rives. Rives, while performing surgery on Plaintiff, negligently cut her colon in at least two, and possibly three, places. Thereafter, Rives failed to adequately repair the colon and/or sanitize the abdominal cavity. With feces actively in her abdomen, Plaintiff predictably went into septic shock and was transferred to the ICU. Nevertheless, Rives still failed to recommend any surgery to repair the punctured colon for eleven (11) days, during which time Plaintiff's organs began shutting down and her extremities suffered permanent impairment. Ultimately, Plaintiff developed critical care neuropathy, destroying all nerve function in her lower legs and feet, commonly referred to as bilateral drop foot.

On a preliminary note, it appears as if Defendants' Motion is moot. Defendants have vacated their Notice of Deposition of Dr. Ripplinger. <u>See Notice Vacating Deposition</u>, attached hereto as **Exhibit "1."** Furthermore, the Court has scheduled this Motion to be heard on October 15, 2019—one (1) day after the commencement of trial in this matter.

Despite the procedural and logistical improbabilities of deposing Dr. Ripplinger after the commencement of trial in this matter, it appears that Defendants have yet to withdraw their instant Motion with the Court. As such, Plaintiffs presents their Opposition below.

Defendants' Notice of Deposition of Dr. Ripplinger was served on September 20, 2019, nearly sixty (60) days past the discovery deadline in this matter of July 24, 2019—and mere weeks before trial in this matter.

Defendants have claimed that a belief this Court would agree to continue the trial in this matter, led to the late notice of Dr. Ripplinger's deposition—but Defendants have failed to demonstrate why they delayed until mere weeks before trial to attempt to depose this witness. Defendants had ample opportunity to attempt to depose Dr. Ripplinger since the onset of discovery

in this matter—yet no attempt was made until the eve of trial. As there exists no "excusable neglect" for Defendants' failure to timely depose Dr. Ripplinger, Defendants' Motion to Compel is properly DENIED.

#### II. LEGAL ARGUMENT & ANALYSIS

A. DEFENDANTS HAVE FAILED TO SHOW ANY EXCUSABLE NEGLECT WHICH WOULD JUSTIFY A REOPENING OF DISCOVERY; THEREFORE, DEFENDANTS' MOTION SHOULD BE DENIED.

E.D.C.R. 2.25 states:

(a) Every motion... to extend time shall inform the court of any previous extensions granted and state the reasons for the extension requested. A request for extension made after the expiration of the specified period shall not be granted unless the moving party, attorney or other person demonstrates that the failure to act was the result of excusable neglect.

See E.D.C.R. 2.25(a). (Emphasis added).

E.D.C.R. 2.35 states:

(a) ....[m]otions to extend any date set by the discovery scheduling order must be in writing and supported by a showing of good cause for the extension and be received by the discovery commissioner within 20 days before the discovery cut-off date or any extension thereof. A request made beyond the period specified above shall not be granted unless the moving party, attorney or other person demonstrates that the failure to act was the result of excusable neglect.

See E.D.C.R. 2.35(a). (Emphasis added).

The phrase "excusable neglect," as used in E.D.C.R. 2.35 has not been defined by the Nevada Supreme Court. However, the meaning of the term excusable neglect appears to be well settled. For example, Black's Law Dictionary defines "excusable neglect" as follows:

A failure – which the law will excuse – to take some proper step at the proper time (esp. in neglecting to answer a lawsuit) not because of the party's own carelessness, inattention, or willful disregard of the court's process, but because of some unexpected or unavoidable hindrance or accident or because of reliance on the care and vigilance of the party's counsel or on a promise made by the adverse party.

See Black's Law Dictionary 1133 (9th ed.2009).

In *Moseley v. Eighth Judicial Dist. Court ex rel. County of Clark*, 124 Nev. 654, 188 P.3d 1136 (2008), the Court found that a party seeking relief under excusable neglect from NRCP 6(b)(2) "...is required to demonstrate that (1) it acted in good faith, (2) it exercised due diligence, (3) there is a reasonable basis for not complying within the specified time, and (4) the nonmoving party will not suffer prejudice. *Id.*, 124 Nev. at 667, 188 P.3d at 1145.

Defendants' Motion requests this Court to extend a discovery deadline which has already passed without **any** evidence of excusable neglect. Simply put, Defendants failed to notice Dr. Ripplinger's deposition. There is no "excusable neglect" when a party fails to exercise due diligence in deposing witnesses during the proscribed discovery period.

As Defendants' Motion is void of any arguments of "excusable neglect" and indeed, as Defendants cannot show that there was excusable neglect in their failure to depose Dr. Ripplinger, Defendants' Motion must be DENIED.

# B. THE COURT HAS ALREADY REJECTED A REQUEST TO CONTINUE TRIAL IN THIS MATTER—DEPOSITIONS CANNOT BE TIMELY CONDUCTED PRIOR TO TRIAL.

As Defendants' Motion notes, this Court declined to extend discovery and continue trial in this matter. Defendants cannot timely depose Dr. Ripplinger prior to the trial date in this matter. This fact is made even more forcefully as Defendants have already vacated the deposition of Dr. Ripplinger. There cannot be a re-notification of the deposition at this late juncture prior to the start of trial. As such, Defendants' Motion is properly DENIED.

//

27 || / / 28 || / /

#### 1 III. **CONCLUSION** 2 For the foregoing reasons, Plaintiffs respectfully requests that this Court DENY Defendants' 3 Motion to Compel the Deposition of Gregg Ripplinger, M.D. and Extend the Close of Discovery (9th 4 Request) on an Order Shortening Time. 5 DATED this 27th day of September, 2019. 6 **BIGHORN LAW** 7 By: /s/ Kimball Jones 8 KIMBALL JONES, ESQ. Nevada Bar.: 12982 9 JACOB G. LEAVITT, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 12608 10 716 S. Jones Blvd. Las Vegas, Nevada 89107 11 12 GEORGE F. HAND, ESQ. Nevada Bar No.: 8483 13 HAND & SULLIVAN, LLC 3442 N. Buffalo Drive 14 Las Vegas, Nevada 89129 15 Attorneys for Plaintiffs 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 Page 6 of 7

#### 1 **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE** 2 Pursuant to NRCP 5, NEFCR 9 and EDCR 8.05, I hereby certify that I am an employee of 3 BIGHORN LAW, and on the 27th day of September, 2019, I served the foregoing PLAINTIFFS' 4 OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO COMPEL THE DEPOSITION OF GREGG 5 RIPPLINGER, M.D. AND EXTEND THE CLOSE OF DISCOVERY (9TH REQUEST) ON AN 6 ORDER SHORTENING TIME as follows: 7 8 Electronic Service – By serving a copy thereof through the Court's electronic service system; and/or 9 ☐ U.S. Mail—By depositing a true copy thereof in the U.S. mail, first class postage 10 prepaid and addressed as listed below: 11 Kim Mandelbaum, Esq. 12 MANDELBAUM ELLERTON & ASSOCIATES 2012 Hamilton Lane 13 Las Vegas, Nevada 89106 14 & Thomas J. Doyle, Esq. 15 Chad C. Couchot, Esq. SCHUERING ZIMMERMAN & DOYLE, LLP 400 University Avenue Sacramento, California 95825 17 Attorneys for Defendants 18 19 /s/ Erickson Finch An employee of **BIGHORN LAW** 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28

# EXHIBIT "1"

#### ELECTRONICALLY SERVED 9/23/2019 2:18 PM

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	[NTVD] THOMAS J. DOYLE Nevada Bar No. 1120 CHAD C. COUCHOT Nevada Bar No. 12946 AIMEE CLARK NEWBERRY Nevada Bar No. 11084 SCHUERING ZIMMERMAN & DOYLE, LLP 400 University Avenue Sacramento, California 95825-6502 (916) 567-0400 Fax: 568-0400 Email: calendar@szs.com  KIM MANDELBAUM Nevada Bar No. 318 MANDELBAUM ELLERTON & ASSOCIATES 2012 Hamilton Lane Las Vegas, Nevada 89106 (702) 367-1234 Email: filing@memlaw.net  Attorneys for Defendants BARRY RIVES, M.D. and LAPAROSCOPIC SURGERY OF NEVADA, LLC	OURT
15	CLARK COUNTY	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26	TITINA FARRIS and PATRICK FARRIS,  Plaintiffs,  vs.  BARRY RIVES, M.D.; LAPAROSCOPIC ) SURGERY OF NEVADA, LLC, et al.,  Defendants.  ///  ///  ///  ///	CASE NO. A-16-739464-C DEPT. NO. 31  NOTICE VACATING THE DEPOSITION OF GREGG RIPPLINGER, M.D.
	-1-	

Case Number: A-16-739464-C

# TO: ALL INTERESTED PARTIES

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that the deposition of GREGG RIPPLINGER, M.D., scheduled for 8:00 a.m., on the 9th day of October, 2019, at Litigation Services, located at 3770 Howard Hughes Parkway, Suite 300, Las Vegas, Nevada, is hereby vacated.

Dated: September 23, 2019

#### SCHUERING ZIMMERMAN & DOYLE, LLP

Ву

CHAD C. COUCHOT Nevada Bar No. 12946 400 University Avenue Sacramento, CA 95825-6502 (916) 567-0400

Attorneys for Defendants BARRY RIVES, M.D. and LAPAROSCOPIC SURGERY OF NEVADA, LLC

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE** 1 Pursuant to NRCP 5(b), I certify that on the 23rd day of September, 2019, service of 2 a true and correct copy of the foregoing: 3 NOTICE VACATING THE DEPOSITION OF GREGG RIPPLINGER, M.D. was served as indicated below: served on all parties electronically pursuant to mandatory NEFCR 4(b); 5 X served on all parties electronically pursuant to mandatory NEFCR 4(b), exhibits to 6 follow by U.S. Mail; by depositing in the United States Mail, first-class postage prepaid, enclosed; by facsimile transmission; or by personal service as indicated. 10 Phone/Fax/E-Mail Representing Attorney 11 **Plaintiffs** 702/656-5814 George F. Hand, Esq. 12 Fax: 702/656-9820 HAND & SULLIVAN, LLC hsadmin@handsullivan.com 3442 North Buffalo Drive 13 Las Vegas, NV 89129 14 702/333-1111 Kimball Jones, Esq. **Plaintiffs** Kimball@BighomLaw.com Jacob G. Leavitt, Esq. 15 Jacob@BighornLaw.com **BIGHORN LAW** 716 S. Jones Boulevard 16 Las Vegas, NV 89107 17 18 19 an employee of Schuering Zimmerman & 20 Dovle, LLP 1737-10881 21 22 23 24 25 26

	EX	(HIBIT(S) LIST	
Case No.: A	6-739464	Trial Date: 10/17/19 - 11/1/19	<b>.</b>
Dept. No.: XXXI		Judge: JOANNA S. KISHNER	
		court Clerk: Susan Botzenhart	
Titina fami	S <sub>PLAINTIFF,</sub>	Recorder: SANDRA HARRELL	
		Counsel for Plaintiff: Kimball Jones	
^	vs.	Jacob Leavitt, George Han	δ
Barry Rives	DEFENDANTS.	Counsel for Defendant: Thomas	
•		Doyle	
	TOTAL TOTAL F	REFORE THE COURT	

Plaintiff 's EXHIBITS (See Next page)

Exhibit Number	Exhibit Description		Date Offered	Objection	Date Admitted
					<del></del>
				1	
				ļ	
				ļ.	
<del>,</del>				<u> </u>	
					1
		1			
		1		<u> </u>	L

March 25, 2016

Printed March 4, 2019

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS - PLAINTIFFS' TRIAL EXHIBITS

## TITINA FARRIS AND PATRICK FARRIS VS. BARRY RIVES, M.D. AND LAPAROSCOPIC SURGERY OF NEVADA, LLC

CASE NO.: A-16-739464-C

# PLAINTIFFS' COUNSEL – GEORGE HAND, ESQ.; KIMBALL JONES, ESQ; AND JACOB LEAVITT, ESQ.

# DEFENDANTS' COUNSEL – THOMAS J. DOYLE, ESQ. AND KIM MANDELBAUM, ESQ.

NO.	DESCRIPTION	DATE OFFERED	OBJECTION	DATE ACCEPTED	
1.	St. Rose Dominican San Martin Hospital Medical Records and Billing	10-14-19	5KP	10-14-19	13
2.	St. Rose Dominican Siena Hospital Billing		<del>RNED TO COUN</del>	<del> 50L                                    </del>	1
3.	Bess Chang, M.D. – Medical Neurology Medical Records and Billing	- 57 <b>U</b>	NED TO COUN	EL	-
4.	Elizabeth Hamilton, M.D. Medical Records and Billing	RES	JRNED TO COU	MSEL	
5.	Desert Valley Therapy Medical Records and Billing	" A Share I wanted	ORNED TO CCL	HVSII.	
6.	CareMeridian Medical Records and Billing	10-22-19	WES	10-22-19	1
7.	Steinberg Diagnostic Medical Imaging Medical Records and Billing Records	R.T.	TURNED TO CO	UNSEL	] [
8.	Diagnostic films taken at St. Rose  Dominican Hospital OSC	₹! <u></u> € §	RMID TO COU	VSCL	
9.	Photographs of Titina Farris	RE	FURNED TO CO	UNSEL	1
10.	Video of Titina Farris taken by Lowell Pender on April 13, 2015	10-28-101	yes	10-28-19	K
11.	Videos of Titina Farris, Patrick Farris, Addison Durham, Lowell Pender and Sky Prince	ंधकृष्	RNED TO COU	. † « · » » •	
12.	Marriage Certificate	OLT !	quen vo coun	CIND:	
13.	National Vital Statistics Reports United States Life Tables, 2015		TURNED TO CU		

14.	Bolton, CF, Neuromuscular Manifestations of Critical Illness, Muscle & Nerve 32: 140-163, 2005	KETURMED TO COUNSEL
15.	Govindarajan, R, Jones, D, Galvez, N, AANEM Case Study: Critical Illness Polyneuropathy, October 2014	RETURNED TO COUNSEL
16.	Lacomis, D, Electrophysiology of Neuromuscular Disorders in critical illness, Muscle & Nerve 47:452-463, 2013	W UNA HOTO TOURSEL
17.	Koch, S, et. al., Long-term recovery in critical illness myopathy is complete, contrary to polyneuropathy, Muscle & Nerve 50:431-436	
18.	Verena, N., N. Kornmann, Bert van Ramshorst, Anke B.Smits, Thomas L. Bollen, Djamila Boerma, Beware of false- negative CT scan for anastomotic leakage after colonic surgery, International Journal of Colorectal Disease (2014) 29:445-451	S OBMER OCCURETY

#### **EXHIBIT INDEX**

#### **EFENDANTS' TRIAL EXHIBITS**

CASE NO. A-16-739464-C

TITINA FARRIS &PATRICK FARRIS

BARRY RIVES, M.D. and LAPAROSCOPIC SURGERY OF NEVADA, LLC

PLAINTIFFS' COUNSEL: Kimball Jones Jacob Clavitt George Hand

DEFENSE COUNSEL: Thomas Doyle

No.	DESCRIPTION	DATE OFFERED	OBJECTION	DATE ADMITTED
A	Portions of medical records from Laparoscopic Surgery of Nevada	10-30-19	yes	Not Admitted
	Bates: A000001 - A-000042		<b>V</b> RETU	RNED TO COU
В	Medical records from St. Rose Dominican Hospital - San Martin Campus, for the admission on August 7, 2014.	%ET UR	IED TO COUNS	EL
	Bates: B-000001 - B-000143			
С	Medical records from Spring Valley Internal Medicine (Dr. Naomi Chaney).	RETURN	ED TO COUNS	EL.
	Bates: C-000001 - C-000111			
D	Medical records from Advanced Orthopedics and Sports Medicine (Dr. Randall Yee / Dr. Tomman Kuruvilla)	R. St. W.	JRNED TO COL	JNSEL
	Bates: D-000001 - D-000011			
E	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital - San Martin Campus- July 5, 2015 CT scan of chest, abdomen, and pelvis	₹£1.51	RNED TO COUN	ISEL
F	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital - San Martin Campus- July 9, 2015 CT scan of chest, abdomen, and pelvis	1 de 1 de 1	KNEG TO COU	ISEL
G	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital - San Martin Campus- July 15, 2015 CT scan of chest, abdomen, and pelvis		RNED TO COL	NSEL.
H	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Camps – July 4, 2015 (15:51:10) – XR Chest I View AP or PA	· (12)	ED TO COUNS	L

No.	DESCRIPTION	DATE OFFERED	OBJECTION	DATE ADMITTED
I	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Camps – July 4, 2015 (15:50:31) – XR Abdomen AP	RETUR	NED TO COUN	SEL
J	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Campus – July 4, 2015 (20:04:51) – XR Chest 1 View AP or PA	RETURN	IED TO COUNS	El
K	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Campus – July 4, 2015 (20:59:58) – XR Chest 1 View AP or PA	RETUR	NED TO COUNS	Et.
L	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Campus – July 4, 2015 (20:59:58) – XR Chest 1 View AP or PA	RETUR	NED TO COUN	SEL.
M	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Campus – July 6, 2015 (04:02:00) – XR Chest 1 View AP or PA	RETU	RNED TO COUN	ISEL
N	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Campus – July 7, 2015 (03:11:25) – XR Chest 1 View AP or PA	RETUR	NED TO COUN	SEL
0	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Campus – July 8, 2015 (03:23:09) – XR Chest 1 View AP or PA	KET()	RMED TO COUN	ISEL
P	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Campus – July 7, 2015 (03:11:25) – XR Chest 1 View AP or PA	RETU	RNED TO COU	NSEI
Q	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Camps – July 9, 2015 (15:50:31) – XR Abdomen AP+DECUB+OR ERECT	RETU	NED TO COUN	SEL
R	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Campus – July 8, 2015 (20:30:56) – XR Chest 1 View AP or PA	RETUR	RED TO COUN	EL
S	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Campus – July 10, 2015 (04:25:01) – XR Chest 1 View AP or PA	RETU	NED TO COUN	ISEL.
Т	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Campus – July 11, 2015 (03:57:39) – XR Chest 1 View AP or PA	RETU	RNED TO COU	NSEL.

No.	DESCRIPTION	Date Offered	OBJECTION	DATE ADMITTED
U	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Campus – July 12, 2015 (03:55:06) – XR Chest 1 View AP or PA	RETURA	ED TO COUNS	EL.
V	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Camps – July 12, 2015 (09:16:42) – XR Abdomen AP+DECUB+OR ERECT	RETU	NED TO COUN	SEL.
w	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Campus – July 14, 2015 (03:39:35) – XR Chest 1 View AP or PA	RETU	INED TO COUP	SEL
х	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Camps – July 13, 2015 (11:44:12) – XR Abdomen AP	\$F.1	RNED TO COU	NSEL
Y	Imaging Study from St. Rose Dominican Hospital – San Martin Campus – July 15, 2015 (03:30:33) – XR Chest 1 View AP or PA	.5 E. 4£	RNED TO COL	INSEL
Z	Imaging Study from Steinberg Diagnostic Medical Imaging Centers – June 12, 2015- CT abdomen	RETUR	NED TO COUN	E
AA	Titina Farris' Responses to Defendants' First Set of Interrogatories	१८७४)	RNED TO COU	NSEL
ВВ	Patrick Farris' Responses to Defendants' First Set of Interrogatories	^ UTHRN	ED TO COUNS!	
CC	Bates: BB-000001 - BB-000009  Expert reports by Bart Carter, M.D., P.C.  Bates: CC-0000001 - CC-000012	RETUR	NED TO COUN	SEt.
DD	Expert reports by Brian E. Juell, M.D.  Bates: DD-000001 - DD-000008	RETURI	ED TO COUNS	£ #
EE	Expert reports by Lance Stone, D.O.  Bates: EE-000001 - EE-000006	शहरा	ІВМЕД ТО СОЦ	NSEL .
FF	Expert reports by Sarah Larsen, RN  Bates: FF-000001 - FF-000020	RETUR	ED TO COUNS	SEL

No.	DESCRIPTION	Date Offered	OBJECTION	DATE ADMITTED
GG	Expert reports by Bruce Adomato, M.D.	RETURN	ED TO COUNS	EL.
	Bates: GG-000001 - GG-000005			
нн	Expert reports by Kim Erlich, M.D.	, : mpg : \$1% <b>\1</b>	to to calkic	•
	Bates: HH-000001 - HH-000006	ETURNED TO COUNS		• 5 •
H	Expert reports by Scott Kush, M.D.			
	Bates: II-000001 - II-000019	RETURI	ED TO COUNS	E1.
JJ	Expert reports by Erik Volk			
	Bates: JJ-000001 - JJ-000025	RETUI	NED TO COUN	SEL
KK	Expert Reports by Michael Hurwitz, M.D.			
	Bates: KK-000001 - KK-000008	es; KK-000001 – KK-000008	NED TO COUN	COUNSE).
LL	Expert file of Michael Hurwitz, M.D.			
	Bates: LL-000001 - LL-000028	RETURNED TO	KNED TO COU	LUUNSE
MM	Expert fee schedule of Michael Hurwitz, M.D.	4ET UF	NED TO COUN	SE1
NN	Expert case list of Michael Hurwitz, M.D.		RNED TO COL	MSEL.
00	Expert Reports by Justin Willer, M.D.	RETI	RNED TO COL	NSCL
	Bates: OO-000001 - OO-000010			
PP	Expert file of Justin Willer, M.D.		4: www. 97/2 #2/2: 151	
	Bates: PP-000001 - PP-000003	KFIUK	NED TO COUN	341
QQ	Expert fee schedule of Justin Willer, M.D.	ET	RNED TO COL	INSEL
RR	Expert case list of Justin Willer, M.D.	Viel i	RMED TO CCL	MSSL.
SS	Expert Reports by Alan J. Stein, M.D.			ersa suscensi
	Bates: SS-000001 - SS-000008	.<.	DANED TO C	NUMBEL
TT	Expert fee schedule of Alan J. Stein, M.D.		THRMED TO CL	uws a.
UU	Expert case list of Alan J. Stein, M.D.		OT CHANGE	dounser.

No.	DESCRIPTION	DATE Offered	OBJECTION	DATE Admitted
vv	Expert Reports by Dawn Cook, R.N.	June 64 Section 64 Section 184		
	Bates: VV-000001 - VV-000085	RFTURI	KED TO COUNS	)
ww	Expert file of Dawn Cook, R.N.	DETHR	KED TO COUNS	EL
	Bates: WW-000001 - WW-000011			
ХХ	Expert fee schedule of Dawn Cook, R.N.	RETUR	MED TO COUN	SEL
YY	Expert case list of Dawn Cook, R.N.		15. UZA TA COM	LICE
	Bates: YY-000001 - YY-000003	RETE	RNED TO COU	
ZZ	Expert Reports by Terrence M. Clauretie	-, 1774-: 1	M. C. E. C.	OUNSEL
	Bates: ZZ-000001 - ZZ-000018	RETURNED TO C	KMED + O COUR	
AAA	Expert file of Terrence M. Clauretie	arthaned to coul	e	
	Bates: AAA-000001 - AAA-000066		HMED TO COUR	JUNGEL.
BBB	Expert fee schedule of Terrence M. Clauretie	RETU	RKED TO COU	IS&L
CCC	Expert case list of Terrence M. Clauretie	:	RMED TO COU	long a
	Bates: CCC-000001 - CCC-000024	73- 11	RANGE TO GOO.	( C) san first
DDD	Expert Reports by Alex Barchuk, M.D.	50	TURKED TO C	with the contract of the contr
	Bates: DDD-000001 - DDD-000032	fX1	SUMMED TO C	(1110)
EEE	Expert file of Alex Barchuk, M.D.			
	Bates: EEE-000001 - EEE-000060	JCD OT DEMAUTES		Jedoluk-
FFF	Expert fee schedule of Alex Barchuk, M.D.	RE	TURNED JO.CC	hrzer –
GGG	Expert case list of Alex Barchuk, M.D.	<u></u>		11. MP FT6
	Bates: GGG-000001 - GGG-000010	RFT	TAKED TO CO	JMDEL