### IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEVADA

KENYA SPLOND,	D 1 134 0000	
Appellant,	Docket No. 82989	Electronically Filed Oct 15 2021 02:28 p.m.
v. STATE OF NEVADA,		Elizabeth A. Brown Clerk of Supreme Court
Respondent.		

## **APPELLANT'S**

### **APPENDIX Volume 3**

Monique McNeill, Esq.
Nevada Bar No. 9862
P.O. Box 2451
Las Vegas, Nevada 89125
Phone: (702) 497-9734
Email:Monique.mcneill@yahoo.com
Attorney for Appellant Splond

<u>Document</u> Appendix Vol. 1	<b>Volume.</b> 1, 2	<b>Page Nos.</b> 31-283
Appendix Vol. 2	2, 3	284-536
Appendix Vol. 3	3, 4	537-788
Appendix Vol. 4	4	789-884
Exhibits in Support of Supplemental Brief	5	1072-1095
Findings of Fact	5, 6	1245-1291
Minutes Dec. 16, 2019	5	1029
Minutes Feb. 2, 2021	5	1143
Notice of Appeal	6	1340-1342
Notice of Entry of Findings of Fact		1292-1339
Opening Brief	1	1-30
Pet. Reply in Support of Petition	5	1129-1142
Proper Person Petition for Writ Of Habeas Corpus	4, 5	937-1003
Respondent's Answering Brief	4	885-933
Respondent's Appendix	4	934-936
Second Supp. Brief in Support of Pet	. 5	1153-1197
State's Response to Pro Per Petition	5	1004-1028
State's Response to Pet. Supp. Brief	5	1096-1128
Supplemental Brief in Support of Pet	ition 5	1030-1071

<b>Document</b>	Volume.	Page Nos.
Transcript, Hearing Feb. 1, 2021	5	1144-1152
Transcript, Hearing April 15, 2021	5	1198-1244

# **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that this document was filed electronically with the Nevada Supreme Court on the 15<sup>th</sup> day of October, 2021. Electronic Service of the foregoing document shall be made in accordance with the Master Service List as follows:

AARON FORD MONIQUE MCNEILL

#### STEVEN WOLFSON

I further certify that I served a copy of this document by mailing a true and correct copy thereof, postage pre-paid, addressed to:

Kenya Splond

By: /S/ Monique McNeill

- 1 the Defendant to that indictment.
- 2 [Indictment read]
- 3 THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, this case is based
- 4 on the indictment which has been read to you by the clerk.
- 5 You should distinctly understand the indictment is simply
- 6 a charge and it is not in any sense evidence of the
- 7 allegations it contains.
- 8 The Defendant has pled not guilty to the
- 9 indictment. The State therefore has the burden of proving
- 10 each of the essential elements of the charges beyond a
- reasonable doubt. As the Defendant sits here now, he is
- 12 not guilty.
- The purpose of this trial is to determine whether
- the State will meet that burden. It is your primary
- responsibility as jurors to find and determine the facts.
- 16 Under our system of justice, you are the sole judge of the
- facts. You are to determine the facts from the testimony
- 18 you hear and the other evidence, including exhibits,
- introduced in court. It is up to you to determine if the
- inferences which you feel may be properly drawn from the
- 21 evidence.
- 22 At times I may sustain objections or direct that
- you disregard certain testimony or exhibits. You must not
- consider any evidence to which an objection has been

- sustained or which I have instructed you to disregard.
- 2 Anything you may have seen or heard outside the courtroom
- 3 is not evidence and must also be disregarded.
- 4 You must not be influenced in any degree by any
- 5 personal feeling of sympathy for or prejudice against the
- 6 State or the Defendant. Both sides are entitled to the
- 7 same fair and impartial consideration.
- 8 In considering the weight and value of the
- 9 testimony of any witness, you may take into consideration
- the appearance, attitude, and behavior of the witness; the
- interest of the witness in the outcome of the case, if
- any; the relation of the witness to the Defendant or the
- 13 State; the inclination of the witness to speak truthfully
- or not; and the probability or improbability of the
- witness's statements and all of the facts and
- 16 circumstances in evidence. Thus, you may give any piece
- of evidence just such weight as you believe it deserves.
- There are two kinds of evidence: Direct and
- circumstantial. Direct evidence is testimony by a witness
- about what that witness personally saw or heard or did.
- 21 Circumstantial evidence is testimony or exhibits which are
- 22 proof of a particular fact from which, if proven, you may
- infer the existence of a second fact.
- You may consider both direct and circumstantial

- evidence in deciding the case. The law permits you to
- 2 give equal weight to both. But it is for you to decide
- 3 how much weight to give to any particular piece of
- 4 evidence.
- 5 Opening statements and closing arguments of the
- 6 attorneys are intended to help you in understanding the
- 7 evidence and applying the law. But they are not evidence.
- 8 Until this case is submitted to you, you must not
- 9 discuss it with anyone, even with your fellow jurors.
- 10 After it is submitted to you, you must discuss it only in
- the jury room with your fellow jurors. It is important
- that you keep an open mind and not decide any issue in the
- case until the entire case has been submitted to you under
- instructions from me.
- 15 If you cannot hear a witness, please raise your
- hand as an indication. If you need to use the restroom or
- if you feel ill, please raise your hand as an indication.
- I usually try and take a break every 90 minutes or so. If
- 19 you'd like to bring a snack or a drink into the courtroom,
- that's okay as well. And we do have a refrigerator, if
- 21 you want to bring your lunch during the week, as we
- 22 progress.
- I may, during the trial, take notes of the
- 24 witnesses' testimony and you will see me working on my

- computer. You are not to make any inference from that
- 2 action. I'm required to prepare for legal arguments of
- 3 Counsel during the trial. And for that reason, I may take
- 4 notes and will work on my computer.
- 5 You will not have a transcript to consult at
- 6 close of the case. However, you will be furnished with
- 7 notepads and writing utensils and will be allowed to take
- 8 notes. Kevin will pass those out in just a minute.
- The trial will proceed in the following manner:
- The Deputy District Attorney will make an opening
- 11 statement, which is an outline to help you understand what
- 12 the State expects to prove. Next, the Defendant may, but
- does not have to make an opening statement. Opening
- statements are not evidence but serve as an introduction
- to the evidence which the party making the statement
- intends to prove.
- The State will then present its evidence and
- 18 Counsel for the Defendant may cross-examine the witnesses.
- 19 Following the State's case, the Defendant may present
- 20 evidence and the deputy to the District Attorney may
- cross-examine those witnesses. However, as I've said, the
- Defendant is not obligated to present any evidence.
- You will be given the opportunity to ask written
- questions of any of the witnesses called to testify in

- this case. You are not encouraged to ask large numbers of
- 2 questions, because that is the primary responsibility of
- 3 the parties. Questions may be asked only in the following
- 4 manner: After both sides have had the opportunity to ask
- 5 questions of a witness and before I let the witness leave
- 6 the room.
- If you would like to ask the questions, if you
- 8 would please write your question on the yellow pads that
- 9 are sitting on the bar in front of you. One question per
- sheet of paper. The marshal will then bring the questions
- 11 to me. I will make a determination with Counsel as to
- whether the question is legally appropriate. If the
- question is legally appropriate, I will then go ahead and
- ask it on your behalf.
- 15 You are not to -- you are not to place undue
- weight upon any question that is submitted by the jury.
- Nor are you to draw any inferences if I do not permit a
- question by the jury.
- 19 After all of the evidence has been presented, I
- will then instruct you on the law. After the instructions
- on the law have been read to you, each side has the
- opportunity to present oral argument.
- What is said in closing argument is not evidence.
- The arguments are designed to summarize and interpret the

- evidence. Since the State has the burden of proving the
- 2 Defendant quilty beyond a reasonable doubt, the State has
- 3 the right to open and close the arguments.
- 4 After the arguments have been completed, you will
- 5 retire to deliberate on your verdict. Let me remind you
- 6 that until this case is submitted, do not talk to each
- 7 other about it or about anyone who has anything to do with
- 8 it until the end of the case, when you go to the jury room
- 9 to decide on your verdict.
- 10 Do not talk with anyone else about this case or
- about anyone who has anything to do with it until the
- trial has ended and you've been discharged as jurors.
- "Anyone else" includes members of your family and your
- 14 friends. You may tell them you're a juror in a criminal
- case, but don't tell them anything else about it until
- 16 after I've discharged you.
- Do not let anyone talk to you about the case or
- about anyone who has anything to do with it. If someone
- should try to talk to you, please report it to me
- 20 immediately by contacting the marshal.
- Do not read any news stories or articles or
- listen to any radio or television reports about the case
- or about anyone who has anything to do with it. And do
- 24 not visit the scene of any of the incidents mentioned

- during the trial or undertake any investigation or
- 2 research on your own. Please do not do any posting or
- 3 communications on any social networking sites or do any
- 4 independent research, including Internet research.
- 5 How long do you anticipate your opening to be?
- 6 MR. PALAL: About 15 minutes, Your Honor.
- 7 THE COURT: Okay. So would you like to proceed now?
- 8 It's 11:30 or do you want me -- I'm gonna have to break it
- 9 by 1:45. So I would have to split the openings if we
- 10 break now.
- 11 MR. PALAL: Court's pleasure.
- 12 THE COURT: Okay. Ladies and gentlemen, we're gonna
- go ahead and break. I have a meeting I have to be at in
- 14 Summerlin at noon. So I'm gonna go there and I'll be back
- 15 here by 1:15.
- During this recess, you are admonished not to
- talk or converse among yourselves or with anyone else on
- any subject connected with this trial or read, watch, or
- 19 listen any report of or commentary on the trial or any
- 20 person connected with this trial by any means of
- 21 information including, without limitation: Social media,
- text, newspaper, television, the Internet, radio or form
- or express the opinion on any subject connected with the
- trial until the case is finally submitted to you.

- 1 If you need a letter for your employer to tell
- them where you're gonna be for the rest of the week, as
- you go out the door, let the marshal know. He will then
- 4 have a letter prepared for you. If you have a fax number
- 5 you want it to go to, or if you have an e-mail address you
- 6 want it to go to, my assistant can get those sent off for
- 7 you.
- 8 In addition, the marshal should have additional
- 9 parking information for you to move to the garage that is
- 10 closer to the courthouse. If you would like to move your
- car during the lunch hour, you may; okay? We'll see you
- 12 at 1:15.
- 13 You have a new door you go in and out of now.
- [Outside the presence of the jury]
- 15 THE COURT: Thank you. Counsel, is there anything
- outside the presence?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- 18 MR. PALAL: Nothing from the State.
- 19 THE COURT: I just wanted to confirm that I did ask
- 20 before I excused the additional jurors that there were no
- issues about the use of peremptory challenges. I don't
- know if I said it loud enough to hit the record or not.
- 23 Sometimes I forget to say it loud enough. Did we say it
- loud enough Jill?

- 1 THE CLERK: [Inaudible]
- THE COURT: Yeah. Just that it was on there.
- 3 Sometimes I do it at the bench with you guys and it
- 4 doesn't make the record.
- 5 Anything else outside the presence?
- 6 MR. PALAL: Nothing from the State.
- 7 THE COURT: How long do you anticipate your opening
- 8 is?
- 9 MR. CLAUS: Usually I reserve, Your Honor.
- 10 THE COURT: Okay.
- MR. CLAUS: But I haven't seen the State's, so --
- THE COURT: All right. So you're gonna play that by
- ear. I just didn't want to put you in the position of
- splitting them. And then so we'll have our first witness
- probably about 2:00-ish --
- MR. PALAL: Yes.
- 17 THE COURT: -- 1:45.
- MR. PALAL: Yep.
- THE COURT: Okay. We're a little behind schedule, but
- 20 not much.
- 21 MR. PALAL: All right.
- THE COURT: Okay?
- MR. PALAL: Thank you, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: See you after lunch.

- 1 [Recess at 11:31 a.m.; proceedings resumed at
- 2 1:25 p.m.]
- 3 [Outside the presence of the jury]
- 4 MR. CLAUS: I apologize for our tardiness. I thought
- 5 it was 1:15 -- 1:30.
- 6 THE COURT: Okay. Bring them in, Kevin.
- 7 THE BAILIFF: Yes, Your Honor.
- 8 THE COURT: [Inaudible]
- 9 THE BAILIFF: [Inaudible]
- 10 THE COURT: Bring in the jury, please.
- 11 [Discussion off the record]
- [In the presence of the jury]
- 13 THE BAILIFF: Jurors are present.
- 14 THE COURT: Good afternoon, ladies and gentlemen.
- 15 Counsel, stipulate presence of the jury?
- MR. PALAL: Yes, Your Honor.
- MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 18 THE COURT: You can be seated.
- Ladies and gentlemen, if you have it write any
- jury questions, I need you to write your seat number on
- 21 the sheet of paper that you submit. [Juror No. 1], you're
- number one. [Juror No. 7], you're number seven. So you
- can number yourselves in between. [Juror No. 8], you're
- number eight. And [Juror No. 14], you're number 14; okay?

- 1 You're opening statement.
- 2 MR. PALAL: Yes, Your Honor.
- Good afternoon ladies and gentlemen. As was
- 4 mentioned earlier, when reading our introduction, in this
- 5 case the State has charged the Defendant with a series of
- 6 burglaries and robberies occurring in late January and
- 7 early February of 2014.
- 8 Specifically, the Defendant is charged with three
- 9 events. Event number one, January 22nd, 2014, at a
- 10 Cricket Wireless. Event number two, January 28th, 2014,
- at a Metro PCS. And event three, February 2nd, 2014, at a
- 12 Star Mart.
- And, ladies and gentlemen, what the evidence will
- show in this case is that the Defendant entered all three
- of these establishments with a gun and robbed the three
- individual cashiers who were -- who were working that day
- in each respective establishment.
- First, I'm gonna talk to you about event number
- one, but I want to take a step back and let you know that,
- you know, one of the things with trial is that we don't
- 21 get the witnesses, necessarily, in the order we would
- like. So while these are the chronological events of the
- case, you may be hearing from witnesses in a
- 24 nonchronological order.

- 1 The first event occurs on January 22nd, 2014, at
- 2 the Cricket Wireless store. What you're gonna do is
- 3 you're gonna hear from Samuel Echeverria. And he will
- 4 testify that he saw the Defendant enter the store and he
- 5 waited -- the Defendant waited while Mr. Echeverria
- 6 attended to another customer.
- 7 And what you see at the bottom of the screen is a
- 8 video still of the -- of the robbery as it occurred.
- 9 The -- Mr. Echeverria will also say that the
- 10 Defendant asked for a specific battery. That
- 11 Mr. Echeverria went to go get the battery. And when he
- comes back, the Defendant then pulls out a gun and tells
- 13 him to take the money out of the register.
- And, you know, you'll also hear that there some
- 15 fingerprints taken from the door outside of the -- outside
- the Cricket Wireless store. And you'll hear from a crime
- scene analyst. And they'll tell but how they try and get
- fingerprints. And that those were the only fingerprints
- 19 taken were from the door. And that one set of
- 20 fingerprints belonged to the clerk and the other set of
- 21 fingerprints belonged to somebody unrelated to this case.
- They don't belong to of the Defendant.
- You're gonna hear about the second event. And
- you'll hear from Graciela Angles. And she'll justify that

- she saw the Defendant enter the store, asking to buy a
- cell phone. She'll say the Defendant asking for a
- 3 specific phone -- I believe it's the Galaxy Mega. That
- 4 she went to get the phone to ring the Defendant up and
- 5 that the Defendant pulled a gun out and told her to take
- all the money out of the register and give it to him.
- 7 And here, again, you'll also hear -- what you're
- 8 looking at is the crime -- video still of the events at
- 9 the Metro PCS.
- 10 You'll also hear that, yes, there were some
- fingerprints taken from the store. The only fingerprints
- taken from the store were from a display case. And they
- didn't belong to either the clerk or the Defendant.
- 14 You're -- the third event, you'll hear from
- 15 Brittany Slathar. She was the person who was acting as
- the cashier at the Star Mart. And she'll testify she saw
- the Defendant enter the store. He grabbed some candy and
- he went to the register where he asked for two Newport
- 19 cigarettes. Two packs of Newport cigarettes.
- She'll say that while she's ringing up the
- transaction, the Defendant pulls out of a gun out of his
- 22 sweatshirt, threatens her and tells her to give him the
- 23 money. She'll testify the Defendant's wearing a black
- sweatshirt, gloves and a spotted brown beanie.

- 1 And that's -- you'll hear that's important
- 2 information. Because minutes after this occurs, you're --
- and that's a still of the video of the actual robbery.
- 4 Minutes after this occurs, Officer Rowberry is driving,
- 5 responding to the scene, and he sees a gray sedan about a
- 6 half-mile away from the Star Mart.
- 7 And what he's gonna tell you is he saw the damage
- 8 to the back of the vehicle, it's the only car in
- 9 proximity. There was nobody on the street. And he
- decides to pull the car over. And when he pulls the car
- over, he'll tell you that he had -- it was a black female
- 12 driving.
- And he'll tell you that he asked the black female
- to roll down the rear window. And the reason why, he'll
- say, is because he was told that somebody just had a
- firearm in the area. He couldn't see into the back of the
- car. So for officer safety, he wanted to make sure if
- there's anybody in the back of the car, he could see them.
- And he'll tell you the person in the back of the
- 20 car was the Defendant. And as a result of -- after some
- 21 talking, asking the Defendant to show his hands and the
- Defendant refusing to comply, both the female in the front
- and the Defendant are -- are asked to exit the vehicle.
- And when the female front exits the vehicle, what

- you'll hear is, on the front seat are two Newport
- 2 cigarettes and a pack of gum. The same items taken from
- 3 the Star Mart.
- 4 You'll hear the back seat, where the Defendant
- was, is a black hoodie sweatshirt. The same clothing worn
- 6 by the person who robbed the Star Mart. You'll hear that
- 7 in the back seat is a grayish camouflage hoodie. The same
- 8 type -- I'm sorry. Beanie. The same type of beanie worn
- 9 by the person who robbed the Star Mart.
- 10 And you will hear in the back seat, where the
- 11 Defendant was found, found a small revolver. The same
- type of gun Brittany Slathar's gonna tell you was used
- when she was robbed.
- As a result of this event on February 2nd, you'll
- hear from Detective Kavon. Now, he's now retired, but he
- was working then. And he'll tell you that, now, they have
- developed a subject with a similar MO as the first two
- robberies, he decides to go back to the cashiers who were
- 19 robbed in event one and event two. And he presents to
- them what's -- what they often refer to as a six-pack.
- It's a photo array of six people.
- 22 And he asks Sam Echeverria -- he reads the
- instructions. And he asks them, you know, "Can you
- identify somebody?"

- And Mr. Echeverria, way back in 2014 says, "Yes,
- 2 that's the person. That's the person. That's the
- 3 Defendant."
- 4 And then, at a separate event, Detective Kavon
- 5 also goes back and backtracks with the cashier at the
- 6 Metro PCS. And she's given a photo array, six different
- 7 people. And she circles the Defendant.
- And what you'll hear from both of them, and what
- 9 you'll see from the six-pack instructions, is that they're
- asked to write the percentage of how sure they are that
- 11 this is the person that committed the robberies. And
- you'll hear from these two people, independently, they say
- that person that they circled that they -- the name that
- they signed, they are 100 percent sure that that is the
- person that robbed them with a firearm.
- Ladies and gentlemen, at the end of this case,
- the State expects that it will have proved its case beyond
- a reasonable doubt. And we'll ask you to find the
- 19 Defendant guilty of all charges. Thank you.
- THE COURT: Thank you. Would you like to make your
- 21 opening or wave?
- MR. CLAUS: I'll be reserving, please, Your Honor.
- 23 THE COURT: Okay. First witness.
- Would you like to invoke the exclusionary rule?

- 1 MR. CLAUS: Please, Your Honor.
- 2 THE COURT: If there's anyone in the courtroom who
- anticipates being called as a witness, please wait in the
- 4 hallway.
- 5 Mr. Marshal, if anybody should come into the
- 6 courtroom, please inquire whether a witness. If they are,
- 7 please ask them to wait in the hallway.
- 8 THE BAILIFF: Yes, Your Honor.
- 9 MR. LEXIS: State calls Samuel Echeverria.
- 10 SAMUEL ECHEVERRIA,
- 11 [having been called as a witness and being first duly
- sworn testified as follows:]
- 13 THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated.
- 14 Please state and spell your name for the record.
- 15 THE WITNESS: My name is Samuel Echeverria.
- 16 THE COURT: And if you could spell that, please.
- THE WITNESS: Oh, sorry. S-A-M-U-E-L. Last name's
- 18 E-C-H-E-V-E, double "R," I-A.
- 19 THE COURT: How you doing today, sir?
- THE WITNESS: Doing good, ma'am.
- 21 THE COURT: You will notice there are M&Ms in that
- dispenser. If would you like some while you're a witness,
- you may have some. There's also a pitcher of water there.
- 24 If you should need some coffee, let the marshal know.

- 1 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- 2 THE COURT: You may proceed.
- 3 DIRECT EXAMINATION OF SAMUEL ECHEVERRIA
- 4 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 5 Q Good afternoon, sir.
- 6 A Good afternoon.
- 7 Q On January 22nd, 2014, where were you working?
- 8 A I was working at Cricket Wireless on
- 9 4343 North Rancho Drive.
- 10 Q Were you working around 4:35 p.m.?
- 11 A Yes, I was.
- 12 Q And is that address, 4343 North Rancho Drive, is that
- in Clark County, Las Vegas, Nevada?
- 14 A Yes, it is.
- 15 Q Did anything unusual happen around that time?
- 16 A Yes, it did. A black male came in with a black
- 17 hoodie, a black baseball cap, black shirt, black shoes,
- regular blue jeans. First made himself to be a customer,
- 19 came in and robbed me at gunpoint.
- 20 Q Let's take it piece by piece, sir. When did you
- 21 first notice him coming in?
- 22 A Um, I would say about 20 minutes before it
- happened.
- Q Were you having a conversation with this man?

- 1 A No, I was not.
- 2 Q But you clearly saw him.
- 3 A Clearly saw him.
- 4 Q What was -- was he waiting for another customer?
- 5 A Yeah, he was waiting around for me to finish up
- 6 with the customers I was with.
- 7 Q And this happened over a period of 20 minutes, you
- 8 say?
- 9 A He was in the store waiting. And it didn't take
- 10 long for him to rob me.
- 11 Q So tell me, did he wait for this other person to
- 12 leave or was that person still in the store?
- 13 A That person left.
- 14 Q Immediately after that person leaving, what did he
- 15 do?
- A He came up to the register and asked me for a
- specific battery for his girlfriend. I told him I was
- gonna go check if I had it. I walked up to the front to
- see if I had it. I walked back behind the desk to grab
- the keys so I could unlock the holsters.
- 21 And when I was ringing him up for the battery, I
- was looking down as I was scanning it in. I looked up,
- and he pulled out a black gun and said, "Give me all the
- 24 money before I blow your brains out."

- 1 Q While you're going to get the battery, are you
- 2 conversing with this individual?
- 3 A Uh, a little small chitchat there. But don't
- 4 really remember what we talked about.
- 5 Q Are you continuing to see him in the face?
- 6 A Yes.
- 7 Q And how soon after did he pull out the gun, when you
- 8 went back behind the counter?
- 9 A He waited for me to scan in the battery in the
- 10 system.
- 11 Q When you saw that firearm, were you scared?
- 12 A Yes, I was.
- 13 Q Describe that firearm for me.
- 14 A It looked like a black revolver. Like a
- 15 six-shooter. I really don't know much about guns. But
- 16 I've seen them enough.
- 17 Q Did you comply with his demands?
- 18 A Yes, I did.
- 19 Q Sir, did you call the police?
- 20 A Yes, I did.
- Q Did they come?
- 22 A Yes, they did.
- 24 A Yes, they did.

- 1 Q Did they eventually show up some other time? Did a
- 2 detective approach you about a month later with a photo
- 3 lineup?
- 4 A Yes, a detective did.
- 5 MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, let the record reflect I'm
- 6 showing Defense Counsel State's Proposed Exhibit 9.
- 7 THE COURT: Proposed 9?
- 8 MR. LEXIS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 9 THE COURT: Thank you.
- MR. LEXIS: May I approach, Your Honor?
- 11 THE COURT: You may.
- 12 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 13 Q Sir, I'm showing you what has been marked as
- 14 State's Proposed Exhibit 9. Do you recognize that?
- 15 A Yes, I do.
- 16 Q Is that your handwriting at the bottom?
- 17 A Yes, it is.
- 18 Q Is there set of instructions at the top?
- 19 A Yes, there is.
- 20 Q And did either the police officer read that to you or
- 21 did you read it to yourself?
- 22 A Both.
- 23 Q He read it to you and then you read it yourself?
- 24 A Yes, I did.

- 1 Q Did you follow those instructions?
- 2 A Yes, I did.
- 3 Q Did you then look at the six-pack photo lineup?
- 4 A Yes, I did.
- 5 Q Would you please flip the page. Is there a circle on
- 6 that page?
- 7 A Yes, there is.
- 8 Q Did you make that circle?
- 9 A Yes, I did.
- 10 Q And did you write below that photo?
- 11 A Yes, my signature's there.
- 12 Q Did you also write on the first page?
- 13 A Yes, sir, I did.
- 14 Q And what did you write on the first page?
- 15 A I wrote that I was, basically, 100 percent
- accurate that this was the man that came in that night and
- 17 robbed me.
- 18 Q What is your exact wording, sir?
- 19 A I take -- "I took a look at the pictures. The
- number 2 fit the description on the photo. I'm
- 21 100 percent sure that that was the man that came in that
- night and robbed me at gunpoint."
- MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, State moves to admit
- 24 State's Proposed Exhibit 9.

- 1 THE COURT: Any objection to 9?
- 2 MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- 3 THE COURT: 9 be admitted.
- 4 [STATE'S EXHIBIT 9 ADMITTED]
- 5 MR. PALAL: Let the record reflect that I'm showing
- 6 Defense Counsel State's Proposed 1 through 5.
- 7 THE COURT: 1 through 5?
- 8 MR. LEXIS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 9 THE COURT: Thank you.
- 10 MR. LEXIS: May I approach, Your Honor?
- 11 THE COURT: You may.
- 12 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 13 Q Sir, I'm showing you what has been marked as
- 14 State's Proposed 1 through 5. Can you please flip through
- those photographs.
- Sir, are those all true and accurate representations
- of what the store looked like on that day?
- 18 A Yes, they are.
- MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, I move to admit State's 1
- through 5.
- THE COURT: Any objection?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: 1 through 5 will be admitted.
- [STATE'S EXHIBITS 1-5 ADMITTED]

- 1 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 2 Q Sir, prior to coming to court today, did you meet
- 3 with the District Attorneys involved in this case?
- 4 A Yes, I did.
- 5 Q And did -- during that meeting, did you go over
- 6 video?
- 7 A Yes, I did.
- 8 Q And was it a true and accurate rendition of what
- 9 happened on that day?
- 10 A Yes, it was.
- 11 MR. LEXIS: The record reflect that I'm showing
- 12 Defense Counsel State's Proposed 39.
- 13 [Discussion off the record]
- MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, may I approach?
- 15 THE COURT: Sure.
- 16 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 2 Sir, after you reviewed that video, did you sign the
- 18 CD?
- 19 A Yes, I did sign the CD.
- 20 Q Is that your signature?
- 21 A Yes, it is.
- MR. LEXIS: Judge, I move to admit State's Proposed 39
- and ask to play it.
- THE COURT: Any objection?

- 1 MR. CLAUS: Based on the representations of the State,
- 2 Your Honor, no.
- 3 THE COURT: Be admitted.
- 4 [STATE'S EXHIBIT 39 ADMITTED]
- 5 THE COURT: And you may publish.
- 6 MR. LEXIS: Thank you.
- 7 THE COURT: And, sir, it should come up on the screen
- 8 next to you here, if all the technology works.
- 9 MR. LEXIS: Mr. [Inaudible] could you start
- 10 [inaudible].
- 11 UNIDENTIFIED: Yeah, sorry. Give it a second to warm
- 12 up.
- [Video played]
- 14 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 15 Q Sir, can you describe for us who was behind that
- 16 counter.
- 17 A That is me, Sam Echeverria.
- 18 Q Okay. Can you describe for me who was standing up in
- that frame as well, to the right, in front of you?
- 20 A That is the -- the robber.
- Q What's going on right here, sir?
- 22 A I was finishing wrapping up the refund I just
- 23 did. He asked me for the battery. As I was doing it, at
- the same time, I walked to the front, to check if I had

- 1 the specific battery he demanded.
- 2 Q And you said earlier you're maintaining some
- 3 chitchat. Is that going on right now?
- A No, not until he walks -- right there.
- 5 Q Now it is?
- 6 A Yeah.
- 7 Q At this point, everyone left the store?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q It's just you and him?
- 10 A Only us two.
- 11 Q Is that you, sir?
- 12 A Yes, it is.
- 13 Q Is that the same man?
- 14 A Yes, it is.
- Q Why are you leaving again, sir?
- 16 A I walked to the back to grab the keys so I could
- walk back to the front to unlock the holster to take out
- 18 the battery.
- 19 Q What's going on now?
- 20 A Uh, I sat the battery down. So I'm ringing it
- 21 up. As I was scanning it in, I'm not really paying
- 22 attention. Then he walked up right there and he said,
- "Give me all the money before I blow your brains out."

24

- 1 MR. LEXIS: Can you pause it right there, please.
- 2 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 3 Q Sir, I saw you step back.
- 4 A Yeah.
- 5 Q With your arm did -- did you put your arms out?
- 6 A Yes, I did.
- 7 Q And why did you do that?
- 8 A Because I hesitated. I was afraid. In fear of
- 9 my life.
- 10 Q Did you see something at that point?
- 11 A Yeah, that's when I saw the gun.
- 12 Q What's going on now, sir?
- 13 A I popped open the register and gave him all the
- money.
- 15 Q Is that him putting the gun back in his pocket and
- 16 leaving with the cash?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q What are you doing now?
- 19 A Close the register. Waited for him to walk out
- the front door so I could start calling the cops.
- 21 Q You immediately called the cops?
- 22 A Yes, I did.
- 24 today?

- 1 A No, I do not.
- 2 Q This happened two years ago, sir?
- 3 A Yes, sir.
- 4 Q And did you make your photo lineup identification
- 5 about a month later?
- 6 A Yes, I did.
- 7 Q Sir, we're seeing another angle on the camera. You
- 8 recognize that?
- 9 A Yes, I do.
- 10 Q Who's that?
- 11 A That is me behind the register.
- 12 Q Okay. And who is in front of you?
- 13 A The same man that robbed me.
- Q What's going on, sir?
- 15 A That's when he demanded the money, he'll blow my
- brains out. I stepped back, opened the register, handed
- 17 him the money.
- MR. LEXIS: Let the record reflect I'm showing Defense
- 19 Counsel State Proposed 36.
- Your Honor, may I approach?
- THE COURT: You may.
- 22 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 23 Q Sir, I'm showing you what's been marked as
- State's Proposed 36. What is that?

- 1 A That is him approaching with a gun in his hand.
- 2 Q Is that a true and accurate representation of what
- 3 occurred on that day?
- 4 A Absolutely.
- 5 MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, State moves to admit
- 6 State's Proposed 36.
- 7 THE COURT: Any objection?
- 8 MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- 9 THE COURT: Be admitted.
- [STATE'S EXHIBIT 36 ADMITTED]
- 11 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 12 Q Sir, I'm showing you State's Exhibit 9. Do you
- 13 recognize this, sir?
- 14 A Yes, I do.
- 15 Q And is the person in the number 2 spot right there --
- 16 A Yes, it is.
- 17 Q -- is that who you circled?
- 18 A Yes, I did.
- 19 Q Is that your signature underneath it?
- 20 A That's my signature.
- 21 Q Is that the person you stated on the first page --
- 22 A That is the person I stated --
- 23 Q -- that you're 100 percent --
- 24 A Yes, I did.

- 1 Q And to this day, you still maintain that you are
- 2 100 percent that guy in the number 2 spot is the person --
- 3 A Absolutely.
- 4 Q And you made this identification about less than a
- 5 month or a few days after -- a month and a few days after you
- 6 were robbed?
- 7 A Yes, I did.
- 8 MR. LEXIS: Nothing further, Your Honor.
- 9 THE COURT: Any cross-examination?
- 10 MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 11 CROSS-EXAMINATION OF SAMUEL ECHEVERRIA
- 12 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 13 Q Mr. Echeverria, you also wrote a voluntary statement
- for the police. You hand wrote one. Do you remember doing
- 15 that?
- 16 A Yes, I did.
- Q Okay. And do you remember that at the end of that
- voluntary statement you indicated that the individual who
- 19 robbed you turned and walked out the door using his hand to
- 20 open it?
- 21 A Yes, I did.
- 22 Q And, in fact, you remember the specific part of the
- door that he'd used to open -- the specific part of the door
- that he touched to open it; correct?

- 1 A Uh, not really, no more. I just do remember
- 2 him --
- 3 Q Not anymore, but at the time you remembered.
- 4 A Uh-huh.
- Okay. And at the time of the robbery, when you gave
- 6 the -- or I'm sorry -- directly after the robbery, when you
- gave your voluntary statement, you told the police where that
- 8 area was; correct?
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q And at the time, you identified it. The police went
- and they took fingerprints from that area of the door;
- 12 correct?
- 13 A Yes, they did.
- 14 Q And, to your knowledge, at that time, they didn't --
- they didn't get the wrong area of the door. That was the
- right area of the door. That was where you told them the
- 17 perpetrator's hands had been; correct?
- 18 A Correct.
- 19 Q Okay. Now, the person who robbed you, was he wearing
- any gloves?
- 21 A No.
- Q Okay. So that's why you -- and the police, did they
- ask you if he'd pressed on anything with his hands or did you
- 24 supply that to them yourself?

- 1 A I supplied that to them myself.
- Q Okay. So you did that expecting that based upon how
- 3 much they pressed on that glass that there should be
- 4 fingerprints there.
- 5 A Absolutely.
- 6 Q Now, after the individual robbed you left the store,
- 7 did anyone else come into the store?
- 8 A No.
- 9 Q In fact, you locked the doors.
- 10 A Yes, I did.
- 11 Q Okay. And during the space of time in which the
- 12 person was robbing you or you were interacting with that
- person, there was no else in the store; correct?
- 14 A No one else.
- 15 Q It was just you and the person who robbed you.
- 16 A Correct.
- 2 So from the time we look at this video that's been
- shown to you, to the time that you, literally, hand the person
- the cash, there's nobody else in the store, nobody else tries
- to come in; correct?
- 21 A Right.
- 22 Q After the person leaves, nobody else tries to come
- 23 in.
- 24 A Right.

- 1 Q Okay. And the hand print you identified was on the
- inside of the door; correct?
- 3 A Correct.
- 4 Q Now, prior to doing the six-pack lineup in February,
- 5 had the police asked you to conduct any sort of identification
- 6 prior to that point?
- 7 A No, that was the first time.
- 8 Q Had you given a description of the -- of the
- 9 individual who robbed you?
- 10 A When that lineup was handed to me, yes, I did
- 11 give my description.
- 12 Q Okay. Prior to you giving your description -- prior
- to you doing that lineup, had you given the police a
- 14 description?
- 15 A Yes, I did.
- 16 Q Okay. And that description was -- do you remember
- 17 what that description was?
- 18 A I told them it was a male. He was a black male,
- 19 black baseball cap, black hoodie, light blue jeans, black
- boots, had a lot of acne in his face.
- 21 Q Okay. Now, you had a chance to review the video
- before you testified today; is that correct?
- 23 A Yes, I did.
- Q Okay. And you had -- did you have a chance to look

- 1 at your handwritten voluntary statement?
- 2 A Yes, I did.
- 3 Q Were there any other statements that you gave to the
- 4 police in written or -- that were written or recorded?
- 5 A Not that I recall.
- 6 MR. CLAUS: Court's indulgence for just a moment.
- 7 THE COURT: Sure.
- 8 MR. CLAUS: Pass the witness, Your Honor.
- 9 THE COURT: Any redirect?
- 10 REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF SAMUEL ECHEVERRIA
- 11 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 12 Q Sir, were you working graveyard?
- 13 A Yes, I was working a graveyard.
- 14 Q This was about 4:45, 4:35 p.m.?
- 15 A It was.
- Q Was it a busy day?
- 17 A It was a busy day.
- 18 Q There was a lot of people in and out?
- 19 A Yes.
- MR. LEXIS: No further questions, Your Honor.
- 21 THE COURT: Anything further?
- 22 RECROSS-EXAMINATION OF SAMUEL ECHEVERRIA
- 23 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 24 Q So was it light out when this crime occurred?

```
Page 48
```

- 1 A Oh, um, I honestly don't remember at the --
- 2 Q Okay.
- 3 A I honestly --
- 4 Q The store was well -- I'm sorry. Go ahead. I didn't
- 5 mean to interrupt you. Were you saying?
- A I honestly don't remember, to be honest.
- 7 Q Okay. But the store was well lit; correct?
- 8 A Yes, it was.
- 9 Q Okay. Any -- any problems with seeing in the store?
- 10 A No.
- 11 Q Do you have corrective -- do you need any corrective
- 12 lenses? Any contact lenses?
- 13 A Yes, I do, but I see pretty good.
- Q Okay. Were they in that day?
- 15 A No.
- 16 Q They were not in that day. Were they in for seeing
- far away or for seeing close up?
- 18 A For seeing close up.
- 19 Q Okay. So -- and you got a good look at this person
- both far away and close up?
- 21 A Yes, I did.
- Q Okay.
- MR. CLAUS: Pass the witness.
- THE COURT: Any further direct examination? Any

- 1 questions from the jurors?
- 2 MR. LEXIS: Judge, I do have a couple --
- 3 THE COURT: Oh, okay. Sorry.
- 4 FURTHER REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF SAMUEL ECHEVERRIA
- 5 BY MR. LEXIS:
- Q Just showing you State's 59. Did his hair look like
- 7 that?
- 8 A It really did, but he did have a baseball cap on.
- 9 Q Okay. It was short?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 MR. LEXIS: Nothing further.
- 12 THE COURT: Anything else?
- MR. CLAUS: We'll pass the witness, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Thank you, sir. We appreciate your time.
- 15 Have a very nice afternoon. Thank you for our -- your
- 16 patience with us.
- 17 THE WITNESS: Thank you, ma'am.
- 18 THE COURT: Next witness.
- 19 MR. LEXIS: State calls Alisa Williams.
- 20 ALISA WILLIAMS,
- 21 [having been called as a witness and being first duly
- 22 sworn testified as follows:]
- THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated.
- 24 Please state and spell your name for the record.

#### IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEVADA

No. 72545

# **KENYA SPLOND**Appellant,

VS.

## STATE OF NEVADA Respondent.

Appeal from a Judgment of Conviction

Eighth Judicial District Court, Clark County

The Honorable Elizabeth Gonzalez, District Court

### **APPENDIX VOL 3**

T. AUGUSTUS CLAUS, ESQ. Legal Resource Group, LLC. Nevada Bar No. 10004 205 N. Stephanie St., Suite D221 Henderson, NV 89074 Telephone: (702) 463-4900

Fax: (702) 463-4800

Attorney for KENYA SPLOND

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

Transcript of Jury Trial Day 2	AA-000501-AA-000563
Transcript of Jury Trial Day 3	AA-000564-AA-000750

- 1 THE WITNESS: Alisa J. Williams.
- THE COURT: And could you spell your name, please.
- THE WITNESS: A-l-i-s-a.
- 4 THE COURT: Williams, the typical spelling?
- 5 THE WITNESS: Yes, Williams.
- 6 THE COURT: All right. Ma'am, there are M&Ms in that
- 7 dispenser next to you. There is water in the pitcher next
- 8 to you. If you should need some coffee, let the marshal
- 9 know.
- 10 You may proceed.
- 11 MR. PALAL: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 12 DIRECT EXAMINATION OF ALISA WILLIAMS
- 13 BY MR. PALAL:
- 14 Q Ms. Williams, do you remember being, or talking to
- the police about January 22nd, 2014?
- 16 A Not quite.
- 17 Q Yeah. Well, do you remember seeing somebody leave --
- saying -- saying that you saw somebody leave a Cricket store
- 19 January 22nd, 2014?
- 20 A Yes. Yes.
- 21 Q And what were you doing that day?
- 22 A I was getting out of work.
- Q Where did you work?
- 24 A At Wild Hair.

- 1 Q And is that in the same complex as the Cricket store?
- 2 A Next door.
- Q Right next door. All right. And did anything strike
- 4 you as unusual about the person leaving the Cricket store?
- 5 A No, he just ran and jumped into the back of a
- 6 car.
- 7 Q Okay. And could you -- was the person white? Asian?
- 8 Black?
- 9 A Black American.
- 10 Q Okay. And was he skinny or was he --
- 11 A Pretty skinny.
- 12 Q Okay. And then, did you happen -- can you describe
- the vehicle that the person went in to.
- 14 A It was a silver car. I don't know what kind of
- model it was, no. It was silver.
- 16 Q Was it a truck or a sedan?
- 17 A It was a silver car.
- 18 Q Okay.
- 19 A Yeah.
- Q It's a regular car, then?
- 21 A Yeah.
- 22 Q Not a truck.
- 23 A No.
- Q Not a SUV.

- 1 A No.
- 2 Q Okay. Do you recall if the windows were tinted at
- 3 all?
- 4 A I don't remember, no.
- 5 Q Did -- do you recall -- can you describe the person
- 6 who was driving the car.
- 7 A She's a light-skinned black female, young, and
- 8 she had white shades on.
- 9 Q Okay. And so the -- the African American male who
- 10 left -- who kind of -- who you said ran out of the Cricket
- 11 store, did he go into the front seat or the back seat?
- 12 A Jumped in the back seat.
- 13 Q At some point later -- at some point later, did a
- 14 detective come speak to you about this incident?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q And did he provide you a photo array of people to see
- if you could recognize that person?
- 18 A No.
- 19 Q You don't remember him doing that?
- 20 A I don't remember doing that, no.
- MR. PALAL: All right. Court's indulgence.
- Your Honor, for the record, I showed Defense
- Counsel State's Proposed Exhibit Number 41
- 24 May I approach the witness?

- 1 THE COURT: You may.
- 2 BY MR. PALAL:
- 3 Q Now I'm gonna show you what's been previously marked
- 4 as State's Proposed Exhibit Number 41. I'm gonna ask you to
- take a look at it. Is that your name on the top?
- 6 A Yes, it is.
- 7 Q Do you see your signature?
- 8 A Yes, I do.
- 9 Q Is that your writing?
- 10 A Yes, it is.
- 11 Q All right. Now, I'm gonna ask you to take a look at
- 12 the second page. Do you see your initial?
- 13 A Yes.
- 14 Q Okay.
- MR. PALAL: Your Honor, at this time the State's gonna
- move State's Exhibit 41 into evidence.
- 17 THE COURT: Any objection?
- MR. CLAUS: Not at this point, Your Honor.
- 19 THE COURT: 41 be admitted.
- 20 [STATE'S EXHIBIT 41 ADMITTED]
- 21 BY MR. PALAL:
- 22 Q Now, in fairness ma'am -- [inaudible]. In fairness,
- 23 ma'am, so do you now recall having -- being given a photo
- 24 array by detectives some time later?

- 1 A Not really, no.
- 2 Q But you do recognize your handwriting?
- 3 A Yeah. Yeah. Everything else, I remember, yeah.
- 4 Q Everything else you recognize.
- 5 A Yeah.
- Q And in fairness, when looking at the photo array, you
- 7 were not able to identify the person, were you?
- 8 A I just saw his scar on his face. That's all I
- 9 saw and had a hat on his head.
- 10 Q So you saw scars on his face, hat --
- 11 A On the -- on the jaw, cheek.
- 12 Q On the jaw.
- 13 A Yeah.
- 14 Q What kind of scars are you talking about?
- 15 A It was just a scar like a burn or something. I
- don't know. Like a knife cut or something. A burn. I
- don't know.
- 18 Q Could they be consistent with acne scars?
- 19 A No. No.
- Q Okay. And you weren't able to pick the person out of
- 21 the six-pack.
- 22 A Um --
- 23 Q I'm sorry. Out of the photo array.
- A Um, that second one looks like it may be. I'm

- 1 not sure. He had a scar on his face.
- 2 Q So the second one looks like it might be, but you
- aren't sure and you weren't sure back then.
- 4 A I just remember a scar on the face and a hat. He
- 5 had a hat over his head.
- 6 Q Okay.
- 7 A All right.
- 8 MR. PALAL: Okay. State will pass the witness.
- 9 THE COURT: Any examination?
- 10 CROSS-EXAMINATION OF ALISA WILLIAMS
- 11 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 12 Q As part of your -- as part of looking at the photo
- array, you told the detective you couldn't identify anyone; is
- 14 that correct?
- 15 A No, just remember the scar and the hat. That's
- all I remember. That's what he had on. That's it.
- 17 Q But as part of the photo array and the photo array
- that you'd been given, you told the officer, "I looked and the
- 19 photos and didn't recognize any of the people"; correct?
- 20 A Uh-huh.
- 21 Q And you didn't indicate that one looked closer than
- the others; correct?
- 23 A One looks closer on there, yeah.
- Q But you didn't indicate that to the officer; correct?

- 1 A No.
- Q Okay. And is this first time you're telling this to
- 3 someone today?
- 4 A Yeah.
- 5 Q And have you met with the District Attorneys prior to
- 6 testifying today?
- 7 A No.
- 8 Q How did you come to testify today, then?
- 9 A They called me yesterday -- well, last week.
- 10 Q Okay. And you were given a subpoena?
- 11 A No, he just called me, actually. I -- I had one
- 12 previous, couple years earlier, but nothing ever happened
- 13 of it.
- Q Okay. And when you talked with this person on the
- phone, did you talk about what you'd done on the photo array?
- 16 A No.
- Q Okay. So your testimony that number two kind of
- 18 looks like the scar guy is --
- 19 A Wait. If you bring up, I can show you which one
- 20 it is. I don't know --
- 21 Q I have an idea which one it is. What I'm just trying
- 22 to clarify is, this is the first time you've said that to
- anybody.
- 24 A Yeah.

- 1 Q Okay. Today in court. You didn't say it back then.
- 2 You didn't write it down. Is your memory better today than it
- 3 was three years ago?
- A Better today? No, not really.
- 5 Q Okay.
- 6 A It's been a long time.
- 7 Q Tends to be worse; yes?
- 8 A Yeah.
- 9 Q Okay. And as part of this photo array, you were also
- shown a photo arrays of women; correct?
- 11 A Yeah.
- 12 Q And you weren't able to identify anyone as that -- as
- part of that photo array; correct?
- 14 A No.
- Okay. Now, this vehicle that you said was -- the
- folks were getting into, there was nothing else that stood out
- about it to you; correct?
- 18 A No, just silver, newer model car. I don't know
- 19 what kind of car it was either, no.
- Q Okay.
- MR. CLAUS: Court's indulgence for just a moment,
- 22 please.
- THE COURT: Sure.
- 24 BY MR. CLAUS:

- 1 Q And at the time of this incident, you also gave a
- 2 written voluntary statement to the police.
- 3 A Yes.
- 4 Q Do you remember doing that?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 Q Okay. Have you had a chance to review that --
- 7 A No.
- 8 Q -- before you testified today?
- 9 A No. No.
- 10 Q Do you remember on that voluntary statement that you
- 11 didn't describe any damage to the vehicle.
- 12 A No.
- 13 Q Nothing else stood out -- stood out about the vehicle
- 14 to you?
- 15 A No.
- 16 Q Okay.
- 17 A It just parked in the opposite way the -- the
- 18 people go out of the parking lot. You know, not -- not
- 19 backed into -- it was backed into the parking lot,
- 20 actually.
- 21 Q Okay.
- 22 A Parking spot. That was it.
- MR. CLAUS: Thank you. Pass the witness, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Any redirect?

- 1 MR. PALAL: Briefly, Your Honor.
- 2 REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF ALISA WILLIAMS
- 3 BY MR. PALAL:
- 4 Q Mr. Claus referred to your voluntary statement that
- 5 you wrote immediately after the event.
- 6 A Yes.
- 7 Q And you haven't seen it since the 2/2014?
- 8 A Nope.
- 9 Q Do you recall if you told the police that the silver
- 10 car had tinted windows?
- 11 A No, I don't remember at all.
- 12 Q Would it refresh your recollection if I showed you
- the statement you wrote in 2014?
- 14 A Okay.
- MR. PALAL: Your Honor, may I approach the witness?
- 16 THE COURT: You may.
- 17 Anybody want it marked for record purposes?
- MR. PALAL: Not for the State, Your Honor.
- 19 MR. CLAUS: Just as part of the Court's record,
- 20 Your Honor, perhaps.
- THE COURT: We'll mark it as Court's one at the break.
- [COURT'S EXHIBIT 1 MARKED.]
- 23 BY MR. PALAL:
- Q Do you recognize your handwriting here?

- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q Is that your name on the top?
- 3 A Yes.
- 4 Q Can you just read quietly to yourself.
- 5 A 'Kay.
- Q And now, having -- and is this, in fact, a copy of
- 7 the written statement you wrote in 2014?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q And does it refresh your recollection as to whether
- or not you told the police officer that the silver car had
- 11 tinted windows?
- 12 A No, I don't remember that now, really.
- 13 Q Do you -- having seen this, do you -- did you see
- 14 that you wrote --
- 15 A Yeah.
- 16 Q -- "the car had tinted windows."
- 17 A Yeah.
- 18 Q So at that time, in 2014, you believe that the car --
- 19 A Yeah.
- 20 Q -- had tinted windows.
- 21 A Yeah.
- MR. PALAL: All right. State will pass the witness,
- 23 Your Honor
- THE COURT: Anything else, Mr. Claus?

- 1 MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- 2 THE COURT: Any questions from the jury?
- 3 Thank you, ma'am. We appreciate your time.
- 4 Thank you with your -- for your patience with us.
- 5 THE WITNESS: Okay.
- 6 THE COURT: Have a nice day.
- 7 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- 8 THE COURT: Next witness.
- 9 MR. PALAL: State calls --
- THE COURT: And we will need a copy of the statement
- to mark as Court's 1, at the break. So don't let it
- 12 leave.
- MR. LEXIS: State calls Brittany Slathar.
- 14 BRITTANY SLATHAR,
- 15 [having been called as a witness and being first duly
- sworn testified as follows:]
- 17 THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated and please
- 18 state and spell your name for the record.
- THE WITNESS: Brittany Slathar, B-R-I-T-T-A-N-Y,
- S-L-A-T-H-A-R.
- 21 THE COURT: And, ma'am, there is a dispenser with M&Ms
- in it, if you should need some. There's water in the
- 23 pitcher. I saw you brought some of your own. If you
- should need some coffee, let the marshal know.

- 1 THE WITNESS: Okay. Thank you.
- THE COURT: You may proceed, Counsel.
- 3 MR. LEXIS: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 4 DIRECT EXAMINATION OF BRITTANY SLATHAR
- 5 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 6 Q Ma'am, on February 2nd, 2014, were you working at
- 7 Star Mart?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q Was that around 2:45 in the morning?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q Is that here in Las Vegas, Clark County?
- 12 A Yes, it is.
- 13 Q And is that at 5001 North Rainbow?
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q What were you doing there?
- 16 A I was a cashier, graveyard.
- Q Did anything out of the ordinary happen around 2:45
- in the morning?
- 19 A Yes, a gentleman came in and robbed me at
- 20 gunpoint.
- Q Okay. Let's take it step by step, ma'am. When did
- you first notice this person and where were you?
- 23 A Oh, I was sitting at the tables on the -- in --
- like, on the side, doing crossword puzzles. It's really,

- like, dead on graveyard. And when someone walks in a
- 2 "ding" -- like a bell dings. And I saw him go to the gum.
- 3 And when he walked to the counter, I got up and walked to
- 4 the counter.
- 5 Q Do you know what kind of gum he got?
- 6 A Wrigley spearmint gum.
- 7 Q And was there anyone else at the store?
- 8 A No.
- 9 Q And then once he approached the register, is that
- when you approached the register?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q What happened next?
- 13 A I asked if he needed anything else. He said two
- packs of Newport 100s. So the cigarettes were behind me.
- 15 I turned around. I grabbed the cigarettes. And as I was
- ringing them up, he pulled the gun out and told me to give
- 17 him all the -- tell me give him all the money.
- I told him once I was in a transaction, I could
- not open my register. And I was just -- kept telling him
- I couldn't open it. He said, keep -- kept saying, "Give
- 21 me the money. Give me the money. I'm gonna kill you.
- You're gonna die." And I kept -- calling me names,
- telling me, "Give me the money dumb white bitch." Told me
- I was stupid. And just kept telling me, continuously,

- 1 "Give me the money. Give me the money."
- 2 Q And you did not open the register.
- 3 A No, I did not.
- 4 Q Okay. And why didn't you open the register?
- 5 A I didn't know that -- I was under the assumption
- I had to pay that money back. So I wasn't gonna give him
- 7 the money. So I didn't give it to him. And it was very
- 8 stupid.
- 9 Q When you saw this gun, ma'am, were you in fear?
- 10 A Yes. I actually stepped back because I was very
- 11 shocked and, you know, I was not expecting that.
- 12 Q Does it affect you to this day?
- 13 A Yes.
- 14 Q And was he getting frustrated when you kept telling
- 15 him this?
- 16 A Very.
- 17 Q And what was he doing?
- 18 A He just -- he was holding the gun on the counter,
- 19 pointing at me. And just was standing there and he would,
- like, hide the gun and then put it back. And he just kept
- 21 telling me, "Give me the money. Give me the money."
- Q Did he eventually leave?
- 23 A Yes, he told me that he'd be back. I was lucky.
- 24 And I -- he'd be back.

- 1 Q And did he grab anything?
- 2 A Yes, the cigarettes. Well, the gum was on the
- 3 counter. And I had put the cigarettes to the right of my
- 4 register to not -- try not to give them to him and he
- 5 eventually reached over the counter and grabbed them and
- 6 then he left.
- 7 Q What did you do?
- 8 A I turned around and I called Metro. And once I
- got off the phone with Metro, I went around and locked the
- front doors because he said he'd be back. So I had locked
- 11 the front door so he couldn't get back in. And so nobody
- 12 else could come in as well.
- 13 Q Did Metro immediately respond?
- 14 A Yeah, I had saw a car drive by with the lights on
- and then another bunch of cop pulled in shortly after.
- 16 Q Soon thereafter, did they take you to a certain
- 17 scene?
- 18 A Yes, they did.
- 19 Q And did they give you what's called a Show Up Witness
- 20 Instruction Sheet?
- 21 A Yes, they did.
- MR. LEXIS: Let the record reflect that I'm showing
- Defense Counsel State's Proposed Exhibit 19.
- Your Honor, may I approach?

- 1 THE COURT: You may.
- 2 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 3 Q Ma'am, I'm showing you what has been marked as
- 4 State's Proposed Exhibit 19.
- 5 A Uh-huh.
- O Do you recognize that, ma'am?
- 7 A Yeah, this is the form the police officer gave me
- 8 before I went to that location where the suspect was.
- 9 Q Is there instructions at the top?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q Did either the officer or you read those
- instructions?
- 13 A Yes, they told me to read them before.
- 14 Q And did you do that?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q And then did you make an identification?
- 17 A Yes, I did.
- 18 Q And what specifically did you put down?
- 19 A You want me to read this?
- 20 Q Yes.
- 21 A "The male in front of the police car was the man
- who robbed me at the -- robbed me at gunpoint. He was
- wearing blue jeans, red T-shirt, and black tennis shoes.
- When he came in the store he was wearing blue jeans, a

```
Page 67
```

- 1 black hooded sweatshirt and a beanie light, "slash, "dark
- 2 brown spots." It was a camouflage beanie.
- 3 Q And your identification was 100 percent?
- 4 A Yes. He was right in front of my face and I
- 5 can't -- you can't -- he didn't cover his face, so I saw
- 6 his face.
- 7 MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, the State moves to admit
- 8 State's Proposed Exhibit 19.
- 9 THE COURT: Any objection?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- 11 THE COURT: Be admitted.
- 12 [STATE'S EXHIBIT 19 ADMITTED]
- MR. LEXIS: Let the record reflect I'm showing Defense
- 14 Counsel State's Proposed 25.
- May I approach Your Honor?
- 16 THE COURT: You may.
- 17 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 18 Q Ma'am, I'm showing you what has been marked as
- 19 State's Proposed Exhibit 25.
- 20 A Okay.
- Q What is that?
- 22 A This is the property that he stole from the
- 23 store.
- Q Do you recognize that?

- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q And what is it?
- 3 A It is Wrigley spearmint gum and two packs of
- 4 Newport 100s. One open; one not.
- 5 Q And were those returned to the store?
- A Yes, they were.
- 7 MR. LEXIS: Your Honor I move to admit
- 8 State's Proposed Exhibit 25.
- 9 THE COURT: Any objection?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- 11 THE COURT: 25 be admitted.
- 12 [STATE'S EXHIBIT 25 ADMITTED]
- MR. LEXIS: Let the record reflect I'm showing Defense
- 14 Counsel State proposed 38.
- May I approach, Your Honor?
- 16 THE COURT: You may.
- 17 BY MR. LEXIS:
- Q Ma'am, I'm showing you what has been marked as
- 19 State's Proposed Exhibit 38. Do you recognize that photo
- 20 photograph?
- 21 A Yes, I do.
- Q Who was in that photograph?
- 23 A I am behind the register and he is in front of
- 24 me.

- 1 Q And at what point in the occurrence is this?
- 2 A In the middle of the robbery, when he has the gun
- in his hand and he's just telling me, "Give me the money,"
- 4 at some -- at some point.
- 5 MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, State moves to admit
- 6 State's Proposed 38.
- 7 THE COURT: Any objection?
- 8 MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- 9 MR. PALAL: Permission to publish, Your Honor?
- 10 THE COURT: 38 be admitted.
- 11 [STATE'S EXHIBIT 38 ADMITTED]
- 12 THE COURT: You may.
- 13 MR. LEXIS: Thank you.
- 14 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 15 Q Is this you on the right, ma'am?
- A Yes.
- 17 Q That's him on the left?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q And is the firearm in his hand?
- 20 A Yes, you can slightly see it, not very well. But
- 21 you can kind of see there's something in his hand.
- Q And describe for me that firearm.
- 23 A It was a black revolver. I knew it was a
- revolver, not a -- like a handgun. It had no clip. But

- it was a black revolver. It was very small.
- Q Ma'am, prior to this date, did you also recognize
- 3 this man?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q And how is that?
- 6 A He -- he had been in my store before, as a
- 7 customer.
- 8 Q So as soon as he walked in the store, did you
- 9 recognize him automatically --
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q -- from someone you previously dealt with?
- 12 A Yeah. I have a very good memory. I knew it
- was -- he was a previous customer.
- 14 Q Prior to this date, did you meet with the
- 15 District Attorney's office?
- 16 A Yes, I have.
- 17 Q At one point, did you go over the video?
- 18 A Uh --
- 19 Q Were you shown video of this --
- 20 A Oh, yes.
- 21 Q -- of this occurrence?
- 22 A Yes.
- MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, let the record reflect State's
- showing proposed Exhibit 40 to Defense Counsel.

- 1 May I approach Your Honor?
- 2 THE COURT: You may.
- 3 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 4 Q Ma'am, I'm showing you what has been marked as
- 5 State's Proposed Exhibit 40. Do you recognize that CD?
- A Yes, it's the video of the robbery.
- 7 Q Okay. After we showed you that video, did one of the
- 8 District Attorneys pop it out and have you sign that exact CD?
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q Is that your signature on that CD?
- 11 A Yes, it is.
- MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, State moves to admit
- 13 State's Proposed Exhibit 40.
- 14 THE COURT: Any objection?
- MR. CLAUS: Your Honor, can we lay a better foundation
- 16 for this, please?
- 17 THE COURT: What part of the foundation do you have a
- 18 problem with?
- 19 MR. CLAUS: Just if she viewed the entire video --
- THE COURT: Okay.
- 21 MR. CLAUS: -- and [inaudible] --
- 22 THE COURT: You could --
- 23 BY MR. LEXIS:
- Q Did we play this video in the entirety to you on --

- what's contained on this CD?
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q And did you particularly observe every aspect --
- 4 A Yes.
- Q -- of this?
- 6 A Yes.
- 7 MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, I move to admit.
- 8 MR. CLAUS: No objection.
- 9 THE COURT: Be admitted.
- [STATE'S EXHIBIT 40 ADMITTED]
- 11 THE COURT: You may publish.
- MR. LEXIS: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 13 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 14 Q Now, sir -- excuse me -- ma'am, do you see that
- person who robbed you in court today?
- 16 A Yes, I do.
- 17 Q Could you please point to him and identify for me the
- 18 color shirt he's wearing.
- 19 A He's right there in a white shirt.
- MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, let the record reflect the
- 21 witness has identified the Defendant.
- THE COURT: Record will so reflect.
- [Video played]
- 24

- 1 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 2 Q Ma'am, what are we looking at?
- 3 A You're looking at the store. I'm over -- I'm on
- 4 the right doing crossword puzzles. And this is the aisle
- 5 with the chips and the candy on it. It's not the entire
- 6 store, but most of it. You see the ding -- like the -- I
- 7 look up because I heard the ding from the door
- 8 Q And what's going on right now?
- A He's grabbing a pack of gum. It's a gum aisle,
- 10 candy aisle.
- 11 Q And is that the Wrigley gum that you identified
- 12 earlier?
- 13 A Yes, it is.
- Q What's going on now?
- 15 A He walks up to the counter. So I see him, so I
- 16 walk up to the counter as well.
- 17 Q You recognize that person, ma'am?
- 18 A Yes, that is me.
- 19 Q What are you doing?
- 20 A I am grabbing the pack of gum to ring it up. And
- 21 that's when he says he wants the two packs of Newports.
- So I turn around because they were behind me. And I grab
- the Newports and I start ringing them up.
- Q Same Newports as you identified earlier?

- 1 A Yes, Newport 100s. And he pulls the gun, so I
- 2 step back.
- 3 MR. LEXIS: Will you pause it right there.
- 4 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 5 Q So at that point, when you see that gun, are you in
- 6 fear, ma'am?
- 7 A Immediately.
- 8 Q And is that why you step back?
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q And what are you doing -- what's the next thing
- 11 you're doing?
- 12 A I just -- I rang cigarettes and that's when he
- starts saying, "Give me the money." And that's when I
- start pleading with him that I can't open my drawer.
- 15 Q You're lying to him --
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 Q -- and acting like you can't --
- 18 A Yeah. And I put the cigarettes to the right to
- 19 try to not get him to take them. And he grabs the gum.
- 20 Q Is that you --
- 21 A And the gun's right there on the counter.
- 22 Q And you prevented him from taking it and he grabbed
- 23 them from you?
- 24 A Yep.

```
Page 75
```

- 1 Q Now, you're still playing at acting like you can't
- 2 open the register?
- 3 A Yes.
- 4 Q Is that a "yes," ma'am?
- 5 A Yes. And I turn -- I even turn my computer to
- 6 show him.
- 7 Q What's he saying to you at this point?
- 8 A "Open the register. I know you can open it.
- 9 Just open it. Give me the money." And then that's when
- 10 he gets frustrated and leaves, tells me he'll be back.
- 11 Q He threatened your life several times?
- 12 A Yes.
- Q What are you doing at this point now?
- 14 A I turn around to call Metro.
- 15 Q What are we watching here, ma'am?
- 16 A Another video of him at the register. Me ringing
- 17 him up. Just a different angle. And I'm grabbing the
- cigarettes, once again. And he, in just a second, pulls
- out the gun. And there it is. And he's shaking his head,
- "Give me the money."
- 21 Q Pointing that gun right at you?
- 22 A Yep. It's under his hand. He's wearing gloves.
- But it is pointed at me, yes.
- Q Is he continuing talking to you this entire time?

- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q What's he doing here?
- 3 A Grabbed the cigarettes from the other side of my
- 4 register. You can see he's getting frustrated, shaking
- 5 his head. You see he puts the gun back in his sweatshirt.
- 6 And then he points it at me again through the sweatshirt.
- 7 Q Were you able to give the police a general
- 8 description of where he left?
- 9 A Kind of. I -- there's a -- you can see a camera
- 10 up here. I can see different angles. And I could see
- which way he ran through the glass. But I don't know
- 12 exactly where he went, but I could tell you what direction
- 13 he went.
- 14 Q And did you relay that to 9-1-1?
- 15 A Yes, I did.
- 16 Q And you didn't go out to run after this guy?
- 17 A No.
- 18 Q So you basically just stayed there, waited for police
- 19 to arrive?
- 20 A Yes, I did.
- 21 Q And gave them a general description of where he was
- headed.
- 23 A Yes.
- Q And it was pretty much minutes later, after you did

- 1 the show up?
- 2 A Yeah. I mean, they came in. They talked to me
- and asked me what had happened. And then they told me
- 4 that they may or may not have a suspect somewhere close
- 5 by.
- 6 MR. LEXIS: May I approach, Your Honor?
- 7 THE COURT: You may.
- 8 MR. LEXIS: State's Proposed Exhibit 19.
- 9 THE CLERK: 19's already admitted.
- 10 MR. LEXIS: Yeah.
- 11 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 12 Q Now showing you [inaudible] State's Exhibit 19.
- 13 Could you tell me those instructions that were read.
- 14 A You want me to read it?
- 15 Q Yes.
- 16 A Okay. "In a moment I'm going to show you a
- person who is being detained. This person may or may not
- be a person who committed the crime now being
- investigated. The fact that this person is detained
- should not cause you to -- to believe or guess that he or
- she is guilty. You do not have to identify anyone. It is
- just as important to free innocent persons from suspicion
- as it is to identify those who are guilty.
- "Please keep in mind that clothing can be easily

- changed. Please do not talk to anyone, other than the
- police officers, while viewing this person. You must make
- 3 up your own mind and not be influenced by other witnesses,
- 4 if any.
- 5 "When you have viewed the person, please tell me
- 6 whether or not you can make identification. If you can,
- 7 tell me in your own words how sure you are of the
- 8 identification. Please do not indicate in any way to other
- 9 witnesses that you have or have not made identification.
- 10 Thank you."
- 11 Q You read those instructions before you made the
- identification; correct?
- 13 A Yes, before they even drove me over there.
- 14 Q And you were of the understanding that you didn't
- 15 have to pick anybody.
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 Q But yet, you identified this man as 100 percent?
- 18 A Yes, I knew right -- right when -- I knew
- 19 instantly.
- Q And to this day, are you certain 100 percent?
- 21 A Yes.
- MR. LEXIS: Nothing further, Your Honor.
- 23 THE COURT: Cross-examination?
- 24 /

- 1 CROSS-EXAMINATION OF BRITTANY SLATHAR
- 2 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 3 Q Ms. Slathar, there was a significant period of time
- 4 between when you originally given the admonition and when you
- 5 ultimately wrote what your feelings were about the
- 6 identification; correct?
- 7 A Yes.
- 8 Q About 25 -- 24 minutes.
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q Okay. And during that time period, were you at the
- scene or were you -- well, I'm sorry. Were you at the scene
- where the person was located or were you at the Star Mart?
- 13 A Star Mart.
- Q Okay. What was -- what was being waited for?
- 15 A They were waiting -- I was -- they were talking
- to me about -- asked me what had happened and they were
- waiting for something at the scene. They were waiting for
- something they were doing there. I don't -- I'm not sure.
- 19 Q Okay.
- 20 A I didn't ask questions. I was just -- they were
- 21 the cops. They were in charge.
- Q When you first showed up to the scene, did you tell
- anyone that you didn't believe that was the one who has robbed
- 24 you based upon the difference in his clothes?

- 1 A No. I -- he had changed his clothes, but I saw
- 2 his face.
- 3 Q Okay. So the police officers never told you that he
- 4 had changed his clothes --
- 5 A No --
- 6 Q -- you told them --
- 7 A -- I said that.
- 8 Q -- the officers.
- 9 MR. CLAUS: Court's indulgence.
- 10 Pass this witness, Your Honor.
- 11 THE COURT: Any redirect?
- MR. LEXIS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 13 THE COURT: Questions from the jury?
- MR. LEXIS: Judge, I have some more questions.
- 15 THE COURT: I know.
- MR. LEXIS: Oh, sorry.
- THE COURT: I'm doing two things at once while you're
- 18 walking.
- 19 MR. LEXIS: Sorry.
- THE COURT: It's okay.
- MR. LEXIS: The record reflect I'm showing Defense
- Counsel State's Proposed Exhibit 33.
- 23 May I approach Your Honor?

24

- 1 THE COURT: You may.
- 2 REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF BRITTANY SLATHAR
- 3 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 4 Q Ma'am, I'm showing you what has been marked as
- 5 State's Proposed Exhibit 33.
- 6 A Uh-huh.
- 7 Q Do you recognize that photograph?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q What is it?
- 10 A It is the man who robbed me on February 2nd.
- 11 Q True and accurate representation of what he looked
- 12 like?
- 13 A Yes.
- 14 Q Is that what he was wearing when you did your show
- 15 up?
- 16 A No -- yes, when he -- when he did the show up,
- yes, not when he robbed me.
- Q Okay. What was he wearing when he robbed you?
- 19 A He was wearing a black sweatshirt, blue jeans,
- and a camouflage beanie.
- MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, State moves to admit
- 22 State's Proposed 33.
- THE COURT: Any objection?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.

- 1 THE COURT: 33 will be admitted.
- 2 [STATE'S EXHIBIT 33 ADMITTED]
- 3 MR. LEXIS: Permission to publish, Your Honor.
- 4 THE COURT: You may.
- 5 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 6 Q So when you stated earlier he had on different
- 7 clothing to the officer, is this what you meant?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q That he had a red shirt on at the time --
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q -- that you did your show up?
- 12 A Yes.
- 13 Q And his hair, obviously, it was very
- 14 close-to-the-head cut.
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q Very different from what he has on today?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q Wasn't wearing glasses then either?
- 19 A No.
- 20 Q In addition, his goatee is very more pronounced now?
- 21 A Yes.
- MR. LEXIS: Nothing further, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Anything further, Mr. Claus?
- MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.

```
1 RECROSS-EXAMINATION OF BRITTANY SLATHAR
```

- 2 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 3 Q When you -- when you said the individual who robbed
- 4 you, he was wearing gloves; correct?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 Q Okay. Were they big thick leather gloves? Do you
- 7 remember specifically what --
- 8 A They just looked like -- they don't look leather.
- 9 They just look like black, I guess, cloth gloves. I mean,
- I wasn't really concentrating on the gloves. I was
- 11 concentrating on the gun.
- 12 Q Good enough. Thank you.
- MR. CLAUS: Pass the witness, Your Honor.
- 14 THE COURT: Counsel, can you approach? I have a
- 15 question from the jury.
- [Bench conference]
- 17 THE COURT: Ma'am, I have a question from the jurors.
- 18 THE WITNESS: Okay.
- THE COURT: Did you tell 9-1-1 or responding officers
- the direction you saw him go from your position within the
- 21 store?
- THE WITNESS: Yes, I did.
- 23 THE COURT: Does anybody want to follow up?

24

- 1 FURTHER REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF BRITTANY SLATHAR
- 2 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 3 Q Do you remember which direction, ma'am?
- 4 A To the left of my store. It was on Rainbow. I
- 5 don't really know, like, north, south, east, west, but I
- 6 could tell you he went left up Rainbow. Because if you go
- 7 right, there's a casino right there. So you can't really
- 8 go right. So he went left, out my doors.
- 9 Q Out your doors and to the left?
- 10 A Uh-huh.
- MR. LEXIS: Nothing further, Your Honor.
- 12 THE COURT: Anything further?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Thank you, ma'am. We appreciate your
- 15 time. Thank you for your patience. You may have a nice
- 16 afternoon.
- 17 THE WITNESS: You, too. Thank you.
- 18 THE COURT: Next witness.
- MR. PALAL: Your Honor, may we approach?
- 20 THE COURT: You can.
- [Bench conference]
- THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, we're gonna take a
- 23 break for personal convenience.
- During this recess, you are admonished not to

- talk or converse among yourselves or with anyone else on
- any subject connected with this trial or read, watch, or
- 3 listen to any report of commentary on the trial or any
- 4 person connected to this trial by any means of
- 5 information, including without limitation: Social media,
- 6 text, newspaper, television, Internet, radio or form or
- 7 express any opinion on any subject connected with the
- 8 trial until the case is finally submitted to you.
- 9 We give you about ten minutes. If anybody needs
- 10 coffee, please let the marshal know and he will be happy
- 11 to get you some.
- Hear that part, Kevin?
- 13 THE BAILIFF: Yes, I do, Judge.
- 14 THE COURT: Okay.
- THE BAILIFF: Folks, can you [inaudible] your chairs
- 16 [inaudible] Your Honor?
- 17 THE COURT: Yes, please.
- 18 [Outside the presence of the jury]
- 19 THE COURT: I ascribe to the Stu Bell Rule of trial.
- 20 So you run out of witnesses and I use those words.
- 21 So do you rest?
- MR. PALAL: Fair enough, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: With a smile on my face. But I'm always
- happy to give you a break for personal convenience.

- 1 MR. PALAL: Thank you. Appreciate it.
- 2 MR. CLAUS: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 3 THE COURT: How are we doing on time? We're moving at
- a faster clip than you'd thought, huh?
- 5 MR. PALAL: Much faster. We have one witness here.
- 6 We're just trying to -- he's gonna be -- he's gonna be
- 7 short. So we're trying just [inaudible] the rest.
- 8 THE COURT: Move them up. Got another two and a half
- 9 hours.
- 10 [Recess at 2:38 p.m.; proceedings resumed at
- 11 2:48 a.m.]
- [Outside the presence of the jury]
- 13 THE BAILIFF: Want me to get them, Judge?
- 14 THE COURT: Uh-huh. I'd really like to finish the
- 15 trial tomorrow.
- 16 THE CLERK: Mr. Palal?
- 17 MR. PALAL: Yes.
- THE CLERK: Do you guys have 19?
- THE COURT: In addition to 19, we need the statement
- that was used to refresh the recollection of Miss -- was
- 21 it Williams?
- MR. PALAL: Yes.
- THE COURT: Which we'll mark as Court's 1.
- [Discussion off the record]

- [In the presence of the jury]
- THE BAILIFF: Jurors are present.
- 3 THE COURT: Counsel, state the presence of the jury.
- 4 MR. PALAL: Yes, Your Honor.
- 5 MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 6 THE COURT: Your next witness.
- 7 MR. LEXIS: State calls Jeffrey Haberman.
- JEFFREY HABERMAN,
- 9 [having been called as a witness and being first duly
- 10 sworn testified as follows:]
- 11 THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated.
- 12 Please state and spell your name for the record.
- THE WITNESS: Jeffrey Bruce Haberman, J-E-F-F-R-E-Y,
- B-R-U-C-E, H-A-B, as in "bravo," E-R-M-A-N.
- 15 THE COURT: Sir, you will notice there is a dispenser
- of M&Ms there, if you should need them. There's water in
- the pitcher next to you. And if you'd like some coffee,
- 18 the marshal can assist you.
- 19 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- THE COURT: You may proceed.
- MR. LEXIS: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 22 DIRECT EXAMINATION OF JEFFREY HABERMAN
- 23 BY MR. LEXIS:
- Q Sir, do you own a 38-caliber Colt revolver?

- 1 A I did. It was stolen.
- 2 Q When was it stolen?
- 3 A October 2013.
- 4 Q And how was it stolen?
- 5 A Somebody broke into my home, stole the entire gun
- 6 safe.
- 7 MR. LEXIS: Let the record reflect that I'm showing
- 8 opposing Counsel State's Exhibit -- Proposed Exhibit 29
- 9 and 30.
- 10 May I approach, Your Honor?
- 11 THE COURT: You may.
- 12 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 2 Sir, I'm showing you what has been marked as
- 14 State's Proposed Exhibit 29.
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q Do you recognize that firearm?
- 17 A Yes, I do.
- 18 Q Does it appear to be your -- true and accurate
- representation of your firearm?
- 20 A Yes, it does. Colt Detective Special.
- 21 Q Showing you what has been marked as State's Proposed
- 22 Exhibit 30. Do you recognize that?
- 23 A Yes.
- 24 Q True and accurate representation --

- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q -- of what your firearm looks like?
- 3 A Yes, sir.
- 4 MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, I move to admit
- 5 State's Proposed 29 and 30.
- 6 THE COURT: Any objection to 29 and 30?
- 7 MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- 8 THE COURT: 29 and 30 be admitted.
- 9 [STATE'S EXHIBITS 29 AND 30 ADMITTED]
- 10 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 11 Q When did you buy this firearm, sir, or how did you
- 12 come in --
- 13 A Um, I inherited it from my father, basically.
- 14 Q Okay.
- 15 A He bought it in Los Angles.
- 16 Q And what did you do when you got it?
- 17 A Uh, registered in my name.
- MR. LEXIS: Let the record reflect I'm showing
- opposing Counsel State's Proposed 42.
- 20 May I approach?
- 21 THE COURT: You may.
- 22 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 23 Q Sir, I'm showing you a certified copy from the
- Metropolitan Police Department for a gun registration. Do you

- 1 recognize that document?
- 2 A Looks familiar. Yes, I do.
- 3 Q Does that include your name?
- 4 A Yes, it does.
- 5 Q What else does it include?
- A My mother's name, her address, my address, the
- 7 serial number of the gun, manufacturer, and model.
- 8 Q Is all that information true and correct?
- 9 A Yes, it is, sir.
- 10 Q The serial number?
- 11 A Um, yes, sir.
- MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, I move to admit
- 13 State's Proposed 42.
- 14 THE COURT: Any objection to 42?
- MR. CLAUS: Well, Your Honor, I think he only talked
- about the first page; correct? Not the second?
- 17 MR. LEXIS: Talked about the second page. The first
- page is a certified document from the Metropolitan Police
- 19 Department saying that it is true and accurate and it is
- 20 from Custodian of Record of Metro.
- 21 MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Be admitted.
- THE CLERK: Mr. Lexis, can you staple that?
- MR. LEXIS: Yes.

```
1 [STATE'S EXHIBIT 42 ADMITTED]
```

- 2 MR. LEXIS: May I publish, Your Honor?
- 3 THE COURT: You may.
- 4 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 5 Q Here I'm showing you the second page of State's 42.
- 6 That's your name? That's your serial number you're referring
- 7 to, sir?
- 8 A Yes, sir.
- 9 Q Sir, I'm showing you State's 29. Is that the firearm
- the gun registration was referring to?
- 11 A Yes, sir, it is.
- 12 Q Tell me exactly how it was stolen.
- 13 A I came home one day, the back door had been
- 14 pry -- my patio door had been pried open. Somebody
- 15 entered the house, stole the entire gun safe, ripped the
- 16 front -- I had a double dead bolt on the front door. That
- was ripped out of the door and then went right out.
- 18 There's still drag marks on the concrete from the safe.
- 19 Q You know a person named Kenny Splond?
- 20 A No, sir.
- 21 Q The man sitting at Counsel table, with the white
- 22 shirt and the striped tie.
- 23 A No, sir.
- 24 Q Have you ever seen that man before?

- 1 A I don't believe so.
- 2 Q Did you ever give that man permission to go in your
- 3 house?
- 4 A No, sir.
- 5 Q Did you ever give that man permission to borrow your
- 6 firearm?
- 7 A No, sir.
- 8 Q Did you ever give permission to any of his friends,
- 9 relatives, et cetera, to ever have your gun?
- 10 A No, sir.
- 11 Q Did you ever give permission for anyone to have this
- 12 gun at issue?
- 13 A No, sir.
- Q Did you ever fire this weapon, sir?
- 15 A No, sir.
- MR. LEXIS: Let the record reflect I'm showing
- opposing Counsel State's Proposed 28.
- 18 May I approach, Your Honor?
- 19 THE COURT: You may.
- 20 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 21 Q Sir, I'm showing you what has been marked as
- 22 State's Proposed 28. What is that a picture of?
- A My colt with four rounds in it.
- Q True and accurate representation of your firearm?

```
1 A Yes.
```

- MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, I move to admit
- 3 State's Proposed 28.
- 4 THE COURT: Any objection?
- 5 MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor. Foundation. I mean --
- 6 THE COURT: Overruled.
- 7 [STATE'S EXHIBIT 28 ADMITTED]
- 8 MR. LEXIS: May I publish, Your Honor?
- 9 THE COURT: You may.
- 10 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 11 Q Is that your firearm, sir?
- 12 A Yes, sir.
- 13 Q With rounds in the chamber?
- 14 A Yes, sir.
- 15 Q Did you keep rounds in the chamber?
- 16 A No, sir.
- 17 Q This gun was empty when it was stolen?
- 18 A Yes, sir.
- MR. LEXIS: Nothing further, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Cross-examination?
- 21 CROSS-EXAMINATION OF JEFFREY HABERMAN
- 22 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 23 Q Mr. Haberman, were you there when this photograph was
- 24 taken?

- 1 A No, sir.
- 2 Q Do you know when this photograph was taken?
- 3 A No, sir.
- 4 Q Do you know anything about the surrounding
- 5 circumstances of this photograph?
- 6 A No, sir.
- 7 Q Do you know anything about the ammunition that
- 8 purports to be in that gun?
- 9 A No, sir.
- 10 Q Do you know whether that's live or empty ammunition,
- 11 could be fired? I'm not asking you to speculate. I'm asking,
- if you know, sir.
- 13 A Three rounds, look like they're live. One round
- looks like it's been fired.
- 15 Q I'm not asking you to speculate, sir --
- 16 A No, sir --
- 17 Q -- I'm asking do you know.
- 18 A -- I'm looking at -- I'm looking at the photo of
- 19 the primer.
- 20 Q Yes, Your Honor -- yes, sir. I -- I guessed that.
- 21 What I'm asking you is not to speculate. I'm asking --
- 22 A I'm --
- A No, sir, I don't.

```
Page 95
```

- Q Okay. So you're guessing, based upon what you think
- 2 the character --
- 3 A Well, the primer --
- 4 MR. LEXIS: Judge, I'm gonna object to --
- 5 THE COURT: Mr. Claus, you have to let him finish.
- 6 MR. CLAUS: Yes.
- 7 THE COURT: Okay.
- 8 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 9 Q So you are guessing based upon that --
- 10 A No, sir -- well, actually, sir, when you fire a
- 11 center-fire cartridge, the primer will show an
- 12 indentation.
- 13 Q Under most circumstances; correct?
- 14 A Under all circumstances, sir.
- Q Okay.
- 16 A I used to sign off on an FFL in Los Angles.
- 17 Q But you don't know if there are bullets on the other
- ends of those cartridges; correct?
- 19 A No, sir, I don't.
- 20 Q You don't know anything about those cartridges;
- 21 correct?
- 22 A No.
- 23 Q So you don't know whether they're live, whether
- there's gun powder in them, you don't know anything about that

- photograph; correct?
- 2 A No, sir.
- 3 Q Okay.
- 4 MR. CLAUS: Repeat my objection to the admission of
- 5 this photograph.
- 6 THE COURT: I already ruled, Counsel. You may
- 7 proceed.
- 8 MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 9 Your Honor, at this point, all I'd ask for is an
- 10 admonition to the jury --
- 11 THE COURT: Counsel, if you would please proceed.
- MR. CLAUS: Pass witness.
- 13 THE COURT: Cross-examination -- or redirect?
- MR. LEXIS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 15 REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF JEFFREY HABERMAN
- 16 BY MR. LEXIS:
- Q What is FFL, sir?
- 18 A Federal Firearm License.
- 19 Q And how do you obtain that?
- 20 A I worked for somebody who had one. I worked in a
- gun store in Los Angles.
- Q Okay.
- MR. LEXIS: Nothing further.
- THE COURT: Anything else, Mr. Claus?

- 1 MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- 2 THE COURT: All right.
- Thank you, sir. We appreciate your time. Have a
- 4 very nice afternoon.
- 5 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- 6 THE COURT: Next witness.
- 7 MR. CLAUS: Your Honor, may I approach, please?
- 8 THE COURT: Yep.
- 9 [Bench conference]
- THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, Counsel and I have a
- brief legal issue to resolve and then we will get back to
- 12 you.
- During this recess, you are admonished not to
- talk or converse among yourselves or with anyone else on
- any subject connected with this trial or read, watch, or
- listen to any report of or commentary on the trial or any
- person connected to this trial by any means of
- information, including without limitation: Social media,
- 19 text, newspaper, television, Internet, radio or form or
- 20 express any opinion on any subject connected with the
- 21 trial until the case is finally submitted to you.
- Hopefully it will only take us about five
- 23 minutes. But if it takes you longer, you need a restroom
- break or something, please take advantage of the time.

- [Outside the presence of the jury]
- 2 THE COURT: The last time that I had one of those
- instructions, Mr. Claus, was in the Koony case. I'm gonna
- 4 look to see if I have it. But otherwise, I will need all
- of you to talk to me about the -- because I use it as a
- 6 limiting instruction, usually. And I understand sometimes
- 7 it's different. 'Cause, frequently, the bad acts are
- 8 admitted only for limited circumstances. So I'm looking
- 9 for it right now.
- 10 MR. PALAL: Your Honor --
- 11 THE COURT: Mind your witnesses, guys.
- MR. PALAL: Yeah, we're --
- 13 THE COURT: I'm not waiting for half hour, 45 minutes
- for somebody to drive for the lab from the other side of
- town.
- Okay. Here is the one I used last. And it's
- been a couple years. And it was under some different
- circumstances: "Evidence the Defendant committed offenses
- other than that for which he is on trial, if believed, was
- 20 not received and may not be considered by you to prove
- 21 that she is a person of bad character or prove she has a
- 22 disposition to commit crimes.
- "Such information was foreseen and may be
- considered by you only for the limited purpose of proving

- the Defendant's opportunity, attempt, mode, plan,
- 2 knowledge, identity or the absence of mistake or accident.
- 3 You must weigh this evidence in the same manner as you do
- 4 all other evidence in the case."
- 5 MR. CLAUS: Well, that doesn't quite work, Your Honor.
- 6 I -- I can --
- 7 THE COURT: Okay.
- 8 MR. CLAUS: -- get a different cut at it. But
- 9 essentially, Your Honor, all I'd be asking for is that
- 10 evidence of another crime, which the Defendant has not
- 11 committed, has been induced here at trial. That cannot
- 12 weigh into your deliberations --
- THE COURT: Write -- write yours down and then I will
- 14 type. How's that?
- MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- And, Your Honor, I can't remember, but did the
- 17 State include the standard instruction, whether or not the
- Defendant includes -- intends to testify?
- 19 THE COURT: It did.
- MR. CLAUS: Okay.
- 21 THE COURT: Yeah, I also have a voluntariness
- 22 instruction in here.
- How do you spell the last witness's name?
- MR. PALAL: That was --

- 1 MR. CLAUS: Haberman.
- 2 THE COURT: H-A-B-E-R-M-A-N?
- 3 MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 4 How about this, Your Honor --
- 5 THE COURT: To them?
- 6 MR. CLAUS: Oh, I have not. Here you go.
- 7 [Discussion off the record]
- 8 MR. PALAL: It's fine. I have no objection to that.
- 9 THE COURT: Okay. Here's what I started with, which
- is a little different, because I'm trying to make it
- 11 specific.
- MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: And I like that language you have. But I
- added, "Evidence that someone committed a burglary to whom
- Mr. Haberman was not received and may not be considered by
- 16 you to prove the Defendant had any involvement in that
- burglary. Such information was received and will be
- considered by you only for the limited purpose of proving
- the weapon was stolen. You must weigh this evidence in
- the same manner as you do all other evidence in the case."
- But I also want to add the line about "you may
- 22 not consider this for the guilt."
- MR. CLAUS: Okay. Thank you.
- THE COURT: So I'm trying to tailor it to the incident

```
for my limitation.
```

- 2 MR. CLAUS: Sorry. I tried to keep it a little more
- 3 general.
- 4 THE COURT: I know. But when it's a limiting
- 5 instruction, I try to make it as specific as possible.
- 6 MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 7 THE COURT: Wow, your handwriting's bad.
- 8 MR. PALAL: Should have been a doctor.
- 9 THE COURT: Uh -- you want me to say "guilt or
- innocence" or just "guilt"?
- MR. CLAUS: "Guilt," Your Honor.
- 12 THE COURT: So here's my amalgamated instruction:
- "Evidence was introduced by the State of other crimes that
- the Defendant is not charged with. Evidence that someone
- 15 committed a burglary at the home of Mr. Haberman was not
- received and may not be considered by you to prove the
- 17 Defendant had any involvement in that burglary.
- "Such information was received and may be
- considered by you only for the limited purpose of proving
- the weapon was stolen. That information cannot be used by
- 21 you in determining the guilt of the Defendant in this
- case. You must weigh this evidence in the same manner as
- you do all over evidence in this case."
- What do you think?

- 1 MR. CLAUS: [Inaudible], Your Honor. I like it.
- THE COURT: Is that okay?
- 3 MR. PALAL: Works for the State, Your Honor.
- 4 THE COURT: Okay. So I will read that to the jurors
- 5 as they come back in, once they sit down.
- 6 How we doing on witnesses?
- 7 Mr. Claus, here you go. Thank you for your
- 8 efforts. Good job.
- 9 MR. PALAL: We've called, literally, every witness --
- 10 even witnesses we weren't planning on calling -- just so
- they could fill the time. And they are all within
- 30 minutes, but nobody [inaudible]. We even called
- 13 Brittany Slathar to have her -- have her -- recall her for
- the sake of the jury's entertainment. And -- and she's --
- 15 THE COURT: I probably -- I probably wouldn't let you
- recall her for the sake of the jury's entertainment. So
- what's your plan?
- MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, the expert's on the way. It's
- my fault. I was in charge of getting all the witnesses,
- 20 and given the previous -- I thought we were gonna have
- 21 more, lengthier direct and cross of these people.
- 22 THE COURT: Okay.
- MR. PALAL: If -- if it's the Court's pleasure, we can
- do one of two things: We can beg of the Court to wait the

- expert to get here. She said [inaudible] should be here
- 2 in about 15 to 20 minutes or we could recess early today
- and, thus, given the pace we're going, we could get
- 4 through -- State's confident it would rest for either late
- 5 Wednesday --
- 6 THE COURT: I don't want to leave the jury sitting out
- 7 there in the hallway for half hour, 40 minutes while
- 8 people get here, park, come up the elevators. You know,
- 9 that's just wrong.
- 10 MR. PALAL: Okay.
- 11 THE COURT: So, Mr. Claus?
- MR. CLAUS: We're ready to proceed, Your Honor.
- 13 THE COURT: Okay. So I'm going to -- how many more
- 14 witnesses you got?
- MR. PALAL: In total?
- 16 THE COURT: Uh-huh.
- MR. PALAL: Court's indulgence. About -- about this
- amount of time or less than the -- the previous witnesses.
- THE COURT: So I'm gonna grant your request to recess
- early today with the understanding you're gonna finish
- 21 your evidence and close tomorrow.
- MR. PALAL: We'll finish our evidence tomorrow.
- THE COURT: Mr. Claus, do you have any additional
- instructions, other than this one we just talked about

- that you want to offer?
- 2 MR. CLAUS: At this point, Your Honor, I also had made
- an objection to the foundation that was being laid for
- just the handgun, the picture of the cartridges. I do
- 5 expound upon that, Your Honor.
- Again, this witness -- and the State knew this.
- 7 This witness knew nothing about that photograph, knew
- 8 nothing about the circumstances of it, couldn't verify
- 9 anything about the cartridges there. Simply, the witness
- was allowed to make some inferential leaps and testify as
- 11 to those matters.
- 12 THE COURT: We didn't do that on the State's
- questioning. He -- his only comments on the State's
- questioning was, "Do you recognize what's in this
- 15 picture?"
- "Yes, that's my handgun with ammunition in it."
- MR. CLAUS: Understood, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Under the circumstances, I think he can
- testify to that. That's why I overruled your objection.
- Now, I understand your comments about the state
- of the ammunition. And, certainly, that was different
- than what I usual have happen. Because I don't usual have
- 23 people with Federal Firearms Licenses here testifying
- about their own personal weapons, but things happen.

- 1 MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 2 THE COURT: So all right. So I'm gonna read this
- 3 instruction to the jury. I'm gonna let them go and have
- 4 them back here at 10:30 tomorrow, as long as you all tell
- 5 me you'll be done tomorrow.
- 6 MR. PALAL: State will be done tomorrow.
- 7 THE COURT: Okay. There is, in this package, a
- 8 voluntariness instruction. Mr. Claus, I currently have
- 9 not heard anybody testify about the statement. I don't
- 10 know if anybody's gonna testify about the statement. But
- 11 I'm gonna encourage you to think about it.
- MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 13 THE COURT: I lost my own marshal.
- MR. CLAUS: Your Honor, we're starting tomorrow at --
- 15 at 10:30.
- 16 THE COURT: 10:30 is the hope.
- MR. CLAUS: I've got a 10:00 o'clock murder
- arraignment. I'll try to get that taken care of very
- 19 quickly, Your Honor, in lower level.
- THE COURT: What department?
- MR. CLAUS: It's in lower level.
- THE COURT: You ready?
- MR. CLAUS: But I've asked for some leeway from the
- 24 Court, if necessary.

- 1 THE COURT: Well, my problem is different. I've
- 2 got -- my criminal calendar's tomorrow and the CO and I
- are hoping that I'm gonna be able to do 10:30. He's
- 4 thinking 11:00, but I'm thinking 10:30. So we're gonna
- see what works out. We're gonna do our best 'cause I
- 6 can't do two things at once with a bunch of inmates.
- 7 MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 8 THE COURT: And sometimes I have to wait for the swap.
- 9 MR. CLAUS: One other question, Your Honor. I've
- been getting the State's witnesses as they've come today.
- 11 If we're gonna give them continuance to gather their
- witnesses together, I'd like to have a list of all those
- witnesses that they intend on calling tomorrow.
- THE COURT: Guys, can you tell him all the witnesses
- 15 you're gonna call tomorrow before we leave, just so he
- 16 knows?
- MR. PALAL: Sure. Right now -- right now or --
- THE COURT: No, before we leave. I'm gonna read this
- instruction to the State -- or read this instruction to
- the jurors before I let them go home.
- [Discussion off the record]
- [In the presence of the jury]
- THE BAILIFF: Jurors are present.
- THE COURT: Counsel, stipulate to the presence of the

- 1 jury.
- 2 MR. PALAL: Yes, Your Honor.
- 3 MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 4 THE COURT: You may be seated.
- 5 Ladies and gentlemen, I have an instruction to
- 6 read for you: Evidence was introduced by the State of
- 7 other crimes that the Defendant is not charged with.
- 8 Evidence that someone committed a burglary at the home of
- 9 Mr. Haberman was not received and may not be considered by
- 10 you to prove that Defendant had any involvement in that
- 11 burglary.
- 12 Such information was received and may be
- considered by you only for the limited purpose of proving
- the weapon was stolen. That information cannot be used by
- 15 you in determining the guilt of the Defendant in this
- case. You must weigh this evidence in the same manner as
- 17 you do all other evidence in this case.
- 18 Counsel, do we still have a scheduling problem?
- 19 MR. PALAL: Yes, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Okay. Ladies and gentlemen, we have a
- 21 slight scheduling problem. But the good news is we also
- 22 will be done a day early. It means that, based upon the
- pace at which we were proceeding today, we will done on
- 24 Thursday rather than Friday.

But I'm gonna also let you go rather than have 1 you sit here and wait while the witness travels and 2 doesn't get here for half an hour, 40 minutes. So if I 3 could see you tomorrow morning at 10:30, outside courtroom 4 14A. 5 During this recess, you are admonished not to 6 talk or converse among yourselves or with anyone else on 7 8 any subject connected with this trial or read, watch, or listen to any report of commentary on the trial or any 9 10 person connected with this trial by any means of information, including without limitation: Social media, 11 text, newspaper, television, Internet, radio or form or 12 express any opinion on any subject connected with the 13 14 trial until the case is finally submitted to you. So we'll see you tomorrow morning at 10:30. 15 16 Counsel, if you would remain, please. [Outside the presence of the jury] 17 THE COURT: Okay. Kevin, thank you. 18 So, Counsel -- you can sit down. I'm gonna print 19 20 for you the version of the instructions that I've been able to create. Except I think I just exited without 21 And so I'll have these for you. If you could 22 23 look at them quickly, tell me if you see anything obvious. Where do you want your limiting instruction in 24

- 1 your stack?
- 2 MR. CLAUS: Court's pleasure.
- 3 THE COURT: I'm gonna put it after the conspiracy and
- 4 before the stolen weapon.
- 5 Kevin?
- 6 THE BAILIFF: Yes, Your Honor.
- 7 THE COURT: Can you go grab me -- oh, it will only
- 8 print to that printer. Never mind. I'll take care of it.
- 9 I'll have the juror instructions for you in just a second.
- 10 [Recess at 3:23 p.m.; proceedings resumed at
- 3:28 p.m.]
- [Outside the presence of the jury]
- 13 THE COURT: This is yours. So I got to fix the
- caption. I got to fix the page formatting. See if you
- think there's anything else obvious missing. If you want
- to wait and tell me in the morning, that's okay.
- MR. CLAUS: I'd like to wait to tell you in the
- 18 morning, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: The problem is that if you tell me in the
- 20 morning, you got to tell me quick.
- MR. CLAUS: Well, what I'll try and do, Your Honor,
- 22 with your -- with your permission is I'll try to e-mail it
- 23 tonight.
- THE COURT: You know my assistant's e-mail?

- 1 MR. CLAUS: It's lawclerk11 --
- THE COURT: That'll work.
- MR. CLAUS: Or lawclerkdepartment11 or something like
- 4 that. It's the standard.
- 5 THE CLERK: DEPT11LC.
- 6 MR. CLAUS: There you go. It's -- it's --
- 7 THE COURT: Yeah. That's the law clerk e-mail. Yeah,
- 8 that one.
- 9 MR. CLAUS: All the law clerks have that same e-mail
- [inaudible].
- 11 THE COURT: They do.
- 12 Well, I'm gonna fix the caption right now before
- 13 I forget.
- MR. CLAUS: I'll come and get you all the changes
- before we start court at 10:30 tomorrow morning.
- THE COURT: Anything else?
- 17 MR. CLAUS: No, thank you.
- THE COURT: Don't let anybody else know that I gave
- 19 you a break 'cause I'm not supposed to be nice about this
- 20 being here on time.
- MR. CLAUS: I see, Your Honor.
- MR. PALAL: I will keep it a secret, Your Honor.
- MR. CLAUS: Having been on the receiving end of this
- 24 Stu Bell treatment, I was expecting --

THE COURT: You want the ID number in the caption? I

- 2 know some people don't like it in there.
- 3 MR. CLAUS: I prefer not to have it in there,
- 4 Your Honor.
- 5 THE COURT: I'm gonna take it out. I understand why
- 6 you don't want it in there and it's okay with me to take
- 7 it out.
- Okay. You guys can leave. I'm just gonna work
- 9 on this for a minute, since I'm at this computer. See if
- I can get these. I'll see you guys at 10:30 in the
- morning or soon thereafter as I can get done with my
- regular calendar, get the Defendant here, and be ready to
- 13 go.
- 14 PROCEEDING CONCLUDED AT 3:30 A.M.
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24

## CERTIFICATION

I CERTIFY THAT THE FOREGOING IS A CORRECT TRANSCRIPT FROM THE AUDIO-VISUAL RECORDING OF THE PROCEEDINGS IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED MATTER.

## AFFIRMATION

I AFFIRM THAT THIS TRANSCRIPT DOES NOT CONTAIN THE SOCIAL SECURITY OR TAX IDENTIFICATION NUMBER OF ANY PERSON OR ENTITY.

XLLISON SWANSON, USR NO. 13377 CERTIFIED SHORILIAND REPORTER FOR THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Electronically Filed 6 04/19/2017 01:48:28 PM

TRAN

DISTRICT COURT

**CLERK OF THE COURT** 

CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

THE STATE OF NEVADA,

Plaintiff, ) CASE NO. C-14-296374-1

VS.

DEPT. NO. XI

KENYA SPLOND, aka Kenny Splond, #1138461 KELLIE ERIN CHAPMAN, #1681308,

Defendants.

BEFORE THE HONORABLE ELIZABETH GONZALEZ,

DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

Wednesday, March 23, 2016

RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT OF JURY TRIAL - DAY 3

APPEARANCES:

For the Plaintiffs:

BINU PALAL CHAD LEXIS

For the Defendants:

Deputy District Attorneys

AUGUSTUS CLAUS

TRANSCRIBED BY: ALLISON SWANSON, CSR No. 13377

- 1 LAS VEGAS, NEVADA, WEDNESDAY, MARCH 23, 2016 10:46 A.M.
- 2 \*\*\*\*\*
- 3 [Outside the presence of the jury]
- 4 THE COURT: -- Court's Exhibit 4, yesterday.
- 5 MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor, I did. I spoke with the
- 6 State. There was some question about a voluntariness
- 7 instruction. I didn't see one included.
- 8 THE COURT: There is one. It is -- well, let's see
- 9 where it is. Maybe I'm wrong. Maybe it wasn't there.
- 10 Apparently you guys were right and I'm wrong.
- MR. CLAUS: I would never repeat that outside of this
- 12 courtroom, Your Honor.
- 13 THE COURT: Well, you know, it's on the record.
- MR. CLAUS: In any event, that being said, I've spoken
- with the State. They don't intend on introducing any of
- Mr. Swan's statements. So I don't think we need a
- 17 voluntariness instruction at this point.
- THE COURT: Okay.
- MR. PALAL: Your Honor, the other -- the other
- 20 question, we noticed that -- that you moved one
- instruction -- I mean, it's perfunctory --
- 22 THE COURT: Moved it?
- MR. PALAL: Removed it, which was "that any person who
- conspires to commit robbery is guilty of conspiracy to

- 1 commit robbery."
- 2 THE COURT: I didn't remove it on purpose.
- 3 MR. CLAUS: Well, I didn't -- I thought it was in
- 4 there.
- 5 MR. PALAL: Yeah, we didn't see it in there.
- 6 THE COURT: Hold on. Let's see. Unfortunately, I
- forgot to number the pages, so you'll have to tell me what
- 8 instruction it's behind, if you find it first.
- 9 MR. CLAUS: Here it is. It's after the -- the "use of
- 10 deadly weapon" instruction.
- MR. PALAL: Okay.
- MR. CLAUS: "Person who conspires to commit robbery is
- 13 guilty of conspiracy to commit robbery."
- MR. PALAL: Oh, perfect. All right. Thank you. It
- 15 actually was in there. That's our mistake.
- THE COURT: You okay?
- MR. PALAL: Yes. And then, beyond that, the State had
- 18 no --
- 19 THE COURT: Is there anything else that you guys
- wanted added? Changed? Language issues? Anything like
- 21 that before I give you a set that we're gonna use to
- [inaudible] jury instructions when we get to that point?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- MR. PALAL: Court's indulgence.

```
Page 9
                       This is what I call a "working set." I
           THE COURT:
 1
 2
       guess nobody else does it this way.
                       No, Your Honor.
 3
           MR. PALAL:
                       Okay. And I will print the working set
           THE COURT:
 4
       and then we'll settle them when we get a chance.
 5
                [Discussion off the record]
 6
 7
                [Recess at 10:49 a.m.; proceedings resumed at
           10:50 a.m.]
 8
                [Outside the presence of the jury]
 9
                [Discussion off the record]
10
           THE COURT: Are we then gonna be ready to go?
11
           MR. PALAL: Yes, Your Honor.
12
           THE COURT: All the jurors are here and ready?
13
           THE BAILIFF: Yes, Judge.
14
           THE COURT: Give us a minute.
15
           THE BAILIFF: Yes, Judge.
16
                [Discussion off the record]
17
18
                [In the presence of the jury]
                         Jurors are present.
19
           THE BAILIFF:
20
           THE COURT: Good morning ladies and gentlemen.
21
                Counsel, you can be seated.
22
                Ms. Clerk, if you'd please take the roll of the
```

23

24

jury.

THE CLERK: Yes, Your Honor.

```
1 [Jury roll call]
```

- 2 THE COURT: Counsel, stipulate the presence of the
- 3 jury.
- 4 MR. PALAL: Yes, Your Honor.
- 5 MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 6 THE COURT: Next witness.
- 7 MR. PALAL: Your Honor, the State calls
- 8 Joshua Rowberry to the stand.
- JOSHUA ROWBERRY,
- 10 [having been called as a witness and being first duly
- sworn testified as follows:]
- 12 THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated and please
- 13 state and spell your name for the record.
- THE WITNESS: Joshua Rowberry, J-O-S-H-U-A,
- R-O-W-B-E-R-R-Y.
- THE COURT: Sir, you will notice that there are M&Ms
- in the dispenser next to you, a pitcher of water up there.
- 18 And if you should need some coffee, let the marshal know.
- 19 You may proceed.
- MR. PALAL: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 21 DIRECT EXAMINATION OF JOSHUA ROWBERRY
- 22 BY MR. PALAL:
- 23 Q Mr. Rowberry, how are you employed?
- 24 A Las Vegas Metropolitan Police Department.

- 1 Q And in what capacity are you employed with Metro?
- 2 A Police officer.
- Q All right. And do you have a specific assignment?
- 4 A Patrol, northwest.
- 5 Q Do you have a specific shift?
- 6 A Graveyard.
- 7 Q And were you working graveyard this week?
- 8 A This week?
- 9 Q Yeah. This week?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q Were you working graveyard on February 2nd, 2014?
- 12 A Yes.
- On February 2nd, 2014, did you get a call regarding a
- 14 robbery?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q Where was that call?
- 17 A 5001 North Rainbow.
- 18 Q All right.
- MR. PALAL: Your Honor, may I approach the witness?
- THE COURT: You may.
- MR. PALAL: For the record, I've shown Defense Counsel
- 22 State's Proposed Exhibit Number 45.
- BY MR. PALAL:
- Q Officer Rowberry, can you take a look at what's

```
Page 12
       depicted as State's Proposed Exhibit Number 45. Do you
 1
       recognize -- do you recognize what's on this -- what's
 2
       depicted in this exhibit?
 3
                Yes.
           Α
 4
                What is depicted in this exhibit?
 5
           Q
                It's an aerial map of the address of the
 6
           Α
       community store.
 7
           Q
                And are you familiar with this particular area?
 8
                Yes.
 9
           Α
                Is this the area that you are on patrol on
10
           Q
       frequently?
11
12
           Α
                Yes.
13
                And does this fairly and accurately depict the
           Q
       area -- the area around 5001 North Rainbow Boulevard?
14
15
           Α
                Yes.
           MR. PALAL: Your Honor, at this time, the State's
16
       going to move into evidence State's Proposed Exhibit 45.
17
           THE COURT:
                       Any objection?
18
19
           MR. CLAUS:
                       No, Your Honor.
20
           THE COURT:
                       Be admitted.
21
                [STATE'S EXHIBIT 45 ADMITTED]
22
           MR. PALAL: Permission to publish?
```

23

24

THE COURT:

You may.

- 1 BY MR. PALAL:
- 2 Q Okay. Now, you said you were called out to
- 3 5001 North Rainbow; is that correct?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q And what's located at 5001 North Rainbow?
- 6 A It's a gas station.
- 7 Q Is that --
- 8 THE COURT: Hold on a second. Kevin, the witness
- 9 needs the mouse.
- 10 THE BAILIFF: Ah, yes.
- 11 THE COURT: Sir, we have new technology in this
- 12 courtroom. You don't draw on the monitor with your finger
- anywhere. You're supposed to try and use this mouse.
- And, unfortunately, somebody took my controller where I
- 15 can erase the marks.
- 16 THE CLERK: Click it first.
- 17 THE COURT: Okay.
- 18 BY MR. PALAL:
- 19 Q All right. So we'll try to work this out. Why don't
- we practice by circling 5001 North Rainbow.
- 21 THE COURT: I see a little mark.
- THE WITNESS: There it goes.
- MR. PALAL: And for the record, the witness has
- circled a round marking [inaudible] 5001 North Rainbow.

- 1 BY MR. PALAL:
- 2 Q All right, sir. Now, did you have any information,
- at that time, as to which direction the suspect was headed?
- 4 A North.
- 5 Q All right. And can you draw on the map the direction
- 6 that -- the information that you had that the Defendant was at
- 7 the -- the Defendant was headed.
- 8 All right. So that's an arrow facing to the top of
- 9 the screen on Rainbow.
- 10 A Correct.
- 11 Q Now, did you actually stop at 5001 North Rainbow?
- 12 A No.
- 13 Q Why not?
- 14 A The information that I was given, the suspect was
- 15 already -- left the store and was traveling northbound
- Rainbow. When a arrived in the area, he was no longer at
- the store, so I had proceeded to drive north on Rainbow to
- 18 begin looking for anybody in the area.
- 19 Q And do you recall approximately what time the armed
- 20 robbery was called in?
- 21 A At 2:57 a.m.
- 22 Q And what -- you recall what time that you got into
- this area?
- A It was probably 3:00 a.m.

- 1 Q So shortly thereafter.
- 2 A Uh-huh.
- 3 Q Is that a "yes"?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q All right. So when you're driving up North Rainbow,
- 6 are your -- are you driving in a patrol vehicle?
- 7 A Yes.
- 8 Q Are your lights and sirens on?
- 9 A No.
- 10 Q Do you see -- in that area, are you looking for
- 11 pedestrians?
- 12 A Yes.
- 13 Q Do you see any pedestrians?
- 14 A No.
- 15 Q Are you looking for other vehicles?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 Q Do you see other vehicles?
- 18 A I see one vehicle. It's north of -- ahead of me,
- 19 north -- I'm traveling north. It's a few -- a little ways
- 20 up ahead of me.
- 21 Q All right. And can you mark on the map the
- approximate area that you saw the vehicle.
- Now, when the report came in, were you told the --
- that the person who committed the robbery was leaving on foot

- 1 or by car?
- 2 A On foot.
- MR. CLAUS: Your Honor, I'm going to object to hearsay
- 4 at this point.
- 5 THE COURT: Overruled.
- 6 BY MR. PALAL:
- 7 Q I'm sorry. What was your answer?
- 8 A On foot.
- 9 Q Okay. On foot. Now, prior to the events that
- occurred on February 2nd, 2014, how long had you been a patrol
- 11 officer?
- 12 A At that time, five to six years.
- 13 Q Have you -- did you -- had you had an opportunity to
- respond to robberies, previous to this?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q In your training and experience, five years out there
- 17 responding to robberies, has -- have you ever had an
- experience where a getaway driver was parked away from where
- the actual robbery occurs?
- A Yes.
- 21 Q Is that something that happens frequently?
- 22 A Yes.
- the car north on Rainbow?

- 1 A It's the only vehicle in the area. It's in close
- 2 proximity to where the robbery occurred. And it's heading
- 3 northbound, away from where the robbery occurred.
- 4 MR. PALAL: Your Honor, may I approach the witness?
- 5 THE COURT: You may.
- 6 BY MR. PALAL:
- 7 Q I've shown opposing counsel and now I'm gonna show
- 8 the witness State's Proposed Exhibit 21. Sir, can you take a
- 9 look at this photo and tell us what it depicts? Do you
- 10 recognize what it depicts?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q What does it depict?
- 13 A It's the vehicle that I saw traveling northbound
- that pulled off of Rancho Santa Fe.
- 15 Q Does it fairly and accurately depict the video as --
- the automobile, as you saw it, on February 2nd, 2014?
- 17 A Yes.
- MR. PALAL: Your Honor, at this time the State's gonna
- move for State's Proposed Exhibit Number 21 to be entered
- into evidence.
- THE COURT: Any objection?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- 23 THE COURT: 21 be admitted.
- [STATE'S EXHIBIT 21 ADMITTED]

- 1 MR. PALAL: Your Honor, may I publish?
- 2 THE COURT: You may.
- 3 Can I take the marks off of the map?
- 4 MR. PALAL: Yes, please.
- 5 THE COURT: Okay. Where do I point this special
- 6 clicker, Jill?
- 7 THE CLERK: Just hit "trash."
- 8 THE COURT: I'm hitting "trash," but where do I point
- 9 it towards?
- 10 MR. PALAL: Oh, we got it.
- 11 THE CLERK: Sorry.
- 12 THE COURT: It's okay.
- 13 BY MR. PALAL:
- 14 Q I'm showing you what's now been admitted as
- 15 State's Proposed -- State's Exhibit 21. This is the vehicle
- we were talking about?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q And now, this vehicle, obviously, has some damage to
- the back; is that correct?
- 20 A Correct.
- 21 Q Now, in stopping the vehicle, did that -- why did you
- stop the vehicle?
- 23 A One, the vehicle leaving the area of the robbery;
- two, it drew my attention because of the -- the damage to

- the rear of the vehicle. I didn't know if any -- if it
- was just involved in an accident, if anything was falling
- 3 off this vehicle.
- 4 Q So you -- so you had stopped the vehicle for two
- 5 reasons, essentially.
- 6 A Yes.
- 7 Q Now, did you -- did you stop the vehicle immediately
- 8 upon seeing it or did you follow it for a while?
- 9 A I followed it a short distance, trying to see its
- 10 reaction to me being behind it. Maybe if it was gonna
- take off, if it was gonna pull over, do something else.
- 12 Q And now showing you, again, what's been admitted as
- 13 State's Exhibit 45. Can you tell -- can you show us on the
- map the route that the vehicle took.
- MR. PALAL: We don't have the cursor anymore,
- 16 Your Honor.
- 17 THE COURT: Click the mouse.
- 18 MR. PALAL: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 19 BY MR. PALAL:
- 20 Q So upon you following it, is it fair to say -- well,
- 21 strike that.
- For the record, you've marked going up Rainbow and
- 23 then taking a side street that leads to the corner of
- 24 Flora Spray and Fruit Flower Avenue; is that correct?

- 1 A Correct.
- 2 Q So upon you following the vehicle, the vehicle then
- 3 decide -- then pulls into a residential neighborhood?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q At that time, do you -- at some point during that
- time, do you decide to turn on your lights and sirens?
- 7 A Yes.
- 8 Q And do you turn on --
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q And do you -- does the car in front of you stop?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q All right. What do you do then?
- 13 A I exit my vehicle and approach this vehicle on
- the driver's side. When I get to the driver's side rear
- passenger door, the window was up, windows are tinted
- 16 dark.
- Q Could you see into the back window?
- 18 A No.
- 19 Q All right. So it was of note to you that the back
- 20 windows were darkly tinted.
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q Did you proceed to the -- proceed to the driver --
- 23 front driver's side of the vehicle?
- A No, I stayed at that spot right behind the rear

- door.
- 2 Q Why?
- 3 A For officer safety issues. I can't see in the
- 4 back seat. I don't know if anybody's back there.
- 5 Q And does the fact that you were just told an armed
- 6 robbery come into -- an armed robbery occurred come into play?
- 7 A Yes.
- 8 Q Does the person in the front seat roll down the
- 9 window or is the window up?
- 10 A The window was down. I don't remember if she
- 11 rolled it down while I was there or as I was walking up.
- 12 Q All right.
- MR. PALAL: Your Honor, may I approach the witness?
- 14 THE COURT: You may.
- MR. PALAL: I've shown opposing counsel and I'm now
- going to show the witness what's been marked as
- 17 State's Proposed Exhibit Number 4 -- 44.
- 18 BY MR. PALAL:
- 19 Q Sir, can you take a look at that. Do you recognize
- what is -- or whom is depicted in State's Exhibit 44?
- 21 A Yes.
- Q Does it fairly and accurately show the person -- show
- a person that you recognize?
- 24 A Yes.

- 1 MR. PALAL: Your Honor, at this time, State's gonna
- 2 move State's Proposed Exhibit 44 into evidence.
- 3 THE COURT: Any objection?
- 4 MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- 5 THE COURT: 44 be admitted.
- 6 [STATE'S EXHIBIT 44 ADMITTED]
- 7 MR. PALAL: Permission to publish?
- 8 THE COURT: You may.
- 9 See if I can throw these in the trash. So I got
- 10 to point them at the Elmo? Okay.
- 11 BY MR. PALAL:
- 12 Q Who's the person in State's Proposed --
- 13 State's Exhibit Number 44?
- 14 A It's the driver, Kelly Chapman.
- 15 Q And you're talking about the driver of the vehicle
- that we were talking about that --
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q Did you give Ms. Chapman any instructions?
- 19 A To roll the back window down.
- Q Did she comply?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q Did you notice anything in the back of the vehicle
- after she had rolled down the rear window?
- 24 A Yes.

- 1 Q What did you notice?
- 2 A There was a black male adult laying in the back
- 3 seat, covered up by a blanket, and breathing very heavily.
- 4 Q Could you see his hands?
- 5 A No.
- 6 Q Was that significant to you?
- 7 A Yes.
- 8 Q Why was that significant?
- 9 A I can't see his hands. I don't know if he's
- 10 armed with anything. So --
- 11 Q Do you give him any instructions?
- 12 A I gave him several instructions to "let me see
- 13 your hands." And he failed to comply to those commands of
- me asking him to show his hands.
- 15 Q By "failing to comply," do you mean he never showed
- 16 you his hands?
- 17 A Correct.
- 18 Q Do you see the person in the courtroom today that you
- gave the instructions on February 2nd, 2014?
- A Yes.
- 21 Q Can you please point that person out and describe an
- article of clothing they're wearing?
- 23 A He's sitting right here. Male with glasses, gray
- 24 shirt and tie.

- 1 MR. PALAL: Your Honor, may the record reflect that
- the witness has identified the Defendant?
- 3 THE COURT: The record will so reflect.
- 4 BY MR. PALAL:
- 5 Q Well, so now with -- so now there's no compliance in
- the back seat, what do you do?
- 7 A I -- I initiated code red on my channel.
- 8 Q What does a code red mean?
- 9 A [Inaudible] let's the area command or the other
- officers working in my area or my channel know that I have
- something going on, that I need the radio for myself. No
- one else can get on there and talk, except for me. And it
- also alerts them that I may need some help. So they start
- 14 heading towards me.
- 15 Q And by "they," you mean other officers?
- 16 A Right.
- 17 Q Do you do anything at this point?
- 18 A I pull out my firearm and keep both subjects,
- 19 driver and the passenger, in the -- in the vehicle. I
- step back and just keep initiating verbal commands to, you
- 21 know, "Don't move," and wait for other officers to arrive.
- 22 Q Do other officers ultimately arrive?
- 23 A Yes.
- Q At that point, do you give any instructions to the

- 1 occupants of the vehicle?
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q What instructions do you give?
- 4 A We have the driver step out of the vehicle and
- 5 walk back towards the officers, where she was taken into
- 6 custody. And then we initiate verbal commands to the
- 7 passenger of the vehicle to step out of the vehicle.
- 8 Q And did they comply?
- 9 A Yes.
- MR. PALAL: Your Honor, may I approach the witness?
- 11 THE COURT: You may.
- 12 BY MR. PALAL:
- 13 Q I'm gonna show you what's been previously marked as
- 14 State's Proposed Exhibit 20. Do you recognize what's depicted
- in the exhibit?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 Q Does it fairly and accurately depict the area?
- 18 A Yes.
- MR. PALAL: Your Honor, State's gonna move
- 20 State's Exhibit 20 into evidence.
- THE COURT: Any objection?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: 20 be admitted.
- [STATE'S EXHIBIT 20 ADMITTED]

- 1 MR. PALAL: Permission to publish?
- 2 THE COURT: You may.
- 3 BY MR. PALAL:
- 4 Q And just -- what is State's Exhibit 20 -- Exhibit 20
- 5 depict?
- A It's the cross streets of where the vehicle
- 7 finally came to rest.
- 8 Q So once the Defendant and Ms. Chapman exit the
- 9 vehicle, do you have -- are the doors open or closed?
- 10 A Open.
- 11 Q Do you have an ability to see what's inside the
- 12 vehicle?
- 13 A Yes.
- 14 Q And while Mr. Claus is looking at that, on the radio,
- were you informed of the contents that was taken from the
- store on the robbery?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q You recall what the contents were reported?
- 19 A Two packs of Newport cigarettes and a spearmint
- Wrigley's gum.
- MR. PALAL: Your Honor, may I approach the witness?
- THE COURT: You may.
- BY MR. PALAL:
- 24 Q I'm gonna show -- I've shown Defense Counsel, and I'm

- gonna show you what's been previously marked as
- 2 State's Proposed exhibits 31 -- well, let me do it the other
- 3 way -- 22, 23, 24, 26 and 31.
- THE COURT: 22 through 26 and 31?
- 5 MR. PALAL: Yes.
- 6 THE COURT: Okay.
- 7 BY MR. PALAL:
- 8 Q Officer, can you look through these exhibits. Do you
- 9 recognize what these photos depict?
- 10 A That's the inside of the vehicle after both
- 11 subjects were taken into custody.
- 12 Q Does it fairly and accurately depict the vehicle on
- 13 February 2nd, 2014?
- 14 A Yes.
- MR. PALAL: Your Honor, at this time, the State's
- gonna move the proposed -- move 22, 23, 24, 26 and 31 into
- 17 evidence.
- THE COURT: 22 through 24, 26 and 31. Any objection?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: They'll be admitted.
- [STATE'S EXHIBITS 22-24, 26, AND 31 ADMITTED]
- MR. PALAL: Permission to publish?
- THE COURT: You may.
- 24 /

- 1 BY MR. PALAL:
- 2 Q Showing you State's Exhibit 22, can you tell us what
- 3 this is.
- 4 A It's the driver's side rear door, looking into
- 5 the vehicle.
- 6 Q Now, it appears as though the front seat is angled
- 7 very far down. Is -- is that accurate?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q Did you move the front seat down at all?
- 10 A No.
- 11 Q Is that how -- when you stopped Ms. Chapman, is that
- the condition that the seat was in?
- 13 A Yes.
- 14 Q Did that strike you as unusual?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q Why?
- 17 A That she may have been laying down, waiting,
- where she didn't want to be seen in the vehicle.
- 19 Q I'm gonna show you, now, State's Exhibit 23. Can you
- tell us what we're looking at?
- 21 A It's the driver's seat of the vehicle. You
- can -- it's two packs of Newports and Wrigley's spearmint
- 23 gum.
- Q And what was the significance of that?

- 1 A The details of the call that was given by the
- 2 victim in this is that these were the items taken.
- 3 MR. PALAL: And then I'm gonna publish
- 4 State's Exhibit 24.
- 5 BY MR. PALAL:
- 6 Q Can you tell us what State's Exhibit 24 depicts?
- 7 A Same thing, driver's seat. Just the closer view
- 8 of the front seat and the evidence.
- 9 Q I'm gonna show you State's Exhibit 26. Can you tell
- 10 us what that depicts?
- 11 A It's the passenger's side rear door. And
- there's -- this is the floor of the back seat with a black
- 13 sweater.
- 14 Q And what was the significance of the black sweater?
- 15 A Description given of the male running northbound
- on foot was wearing a black sweater.
- 17 Q I'm gonna show you what's been -- State's Exhibit 31.
- Do you recognize what's in State's Exhibit 31?
- 19 A Yes.
- Q Can you tell us what it is?
- 21 A Passenger's side back seat, floor, and a
- 22 camouflage beanie.
- 23 Q Do you take the black sweatshirt out of the car?
- 24 A Yes.

- 1 Q Why?
- 2 A To look for anything else, see if there's
- 3 anything inside the sweater.
- 4 Q Do you photograph the black sweatshirt out of the
- 5 vehicle?
- A I didn't personally photograph it, no.
- 7 Q Okay. Did you see the black sweatshirt out of the
- 8 vehicle?
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q Okay. Did you notice anything inside the black
- sweatshirt when you pulled it out?
- 12 A Yes.
- Q What was inside -- what did you notice inside the
- 14 black sweatshirt?
- 15 A The handgun.
- 16 Q And by "the handgun," what do you mean?
- 17 A It was a revolver that was also stated in the
- details, when I was arriving, that the suspect was -- had
- 19 a -- had a handgun.
- 20 Q Did you take out the -- the, I guess, the camouflage
- beanie out of the vehicle?
- 22 A Yes.
- spearmint -- the spearmint gum out of the vehicle?

- 1 A Yes.
- 2 MR. PALAL: Permission to approach the witness,
- 3 Your Honor?
- 4 THE COURT: You may.
- 5 BY MR. PALAL:
- Q I've shown opposing counsel and I'm now gonna show
- 7 you State's Proposed exhibit -- oh, I'm sorry.
- 8 State's Proposed exhibits 27 and 32. Can you take a look at
- 9 these exhibits and say -- see if you recognize them.
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q What do they depict?
- 12 A The black sweater that was laid out on the hood
- of the car and a camouflage beanie.
- Q And do they fairly and accurately depict the items
- after you had pulled them out of the vehicle?
- 16 A Yes.
- MR. PALAL: Your Honor at this time, State's going to
- move to admit 27 and 32.
- 19 THE COURT: Any objection?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: 27 and 32 be admitted.
- [STATE'S EXHIBITS 27 AND 32 ADMITTED]
- 23 BY MR. PALAL:
- Q Okay. I'm going to show you State's Exhibit 27. Is

- this the sweatshirt you had pulled out of the vehicle?
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q Now, I -- I have to -- I notice that it looks lighter
- 4 here than it did in the back of the car; is that fair?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 Q Do you recall what kind of lighting you used when
- 7 this photo was taken?
- 8 A Flashlights.
- 9 Q Was it dark outside?
- 10 A Extremely dark.
- 11 Q What time -- what time was this about?
- 12 A 3:00 -- after 3:00 a.m. 3:04, 3:03.
- 13 Q All right. And I'm gonna show you
- 14 State's Exhibit 32. Is this the camouflage hat that was
- 15 previously depicted inside the vehicle?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 Q Now, you had mentioned that you pulled out a firearm
- from the vehicle. I'm gonna show you what's been admitted as
- 19 State's Exhibit 29. Do you recognize what's depicted in
- 20 State's Exhibit 29?
- 21 A Yes.
- Q What is it?
- 23 A It's a revolver
- Q And it's the -- was it the revolver you found in the

- 1 sweatshirt?
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q Now, where exactly in the sweatshirt did you find the
- 4 revolver?
- 5 A It was in the pocket. In the front -- front
- 6 pockets of the hooded sweatshirt.
- 7 Q I'm gonna show you State's Exhibit 28. Do you
- 8 recognize what's depicted in State's Exhibit 28?
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q What is it?
- 11 A It's the same revolver showing that, out of six
- 12 possible rounds, there's four rounds in the -- in the
- 13 revolver.
- 14 Q I'm gonna show you State's Exhibit 30. Can you tell
- us what that is?
- 16 A It's the revolver, showing the manufacturer's
- 17 name on the barrel.
- 18 Q I'm gonna show you State's Exhibit 25. Can you tell
- 19 us what that is?
- 20 A The two packs of Newports and spearmint Wrigley
- 21 gum.
- Q And is that the Newports and spearmint gum that was
- in the front seat of the car?
- 24 A Yes.

- 1 Q Now, at -- during this time, is the Defendant
- 2 detained or is he free to roam about?
- 3 A He's detained.
- 4 MR. PALAL: Your Honor, may I approach the witness?
- 5 THE COURT: You may.
- 6 BY MR. PALAL:
- 7 Q So I'm gonna show you -- sir, I'm gonna show you
- 8 what's been previously marked as State's Proposed Exhibits 34
- 9 and 35. Can you take a look at them.
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q Do you recognize what's depicted in
- 12 State's Exhibits -- Proposed Exhibits 34 and 35?
- 13 A Yes.
- Q What do they depict?
- 15 A The suspect that was in the back seat of the
- 16 vehicle.
- 17 Q And --
- MR. PALAL: All right. Your Honor, at this time, the
- 19 State's gonna move State's Proposed exhibits 34 and 35
- 20 into evidence.
- THE COURT: Any objection?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- 23 THE COURT: 34 and 35 be admitted.
- [STATE'S EXHIBITS 34 AND 35 ADMITTED]

- 1 MR. PALAL: Permission to publish?
- THE COURT: You may.
- 3 BY MR. PALAL:
- 4 Q Showing you State's Exhibit 35. Can you tell us what
- 5 this is?
- 6 A The suspect that was taken into custody.
- 7 Q Is that suspect the same person in here, court today?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q Show you what's been previously admitted as
- 10 State's Exhibit 33. Can you tell us what that is?
- 11 A The same subject.
- 12 Q And the same person that's in the courtroom today?
- 13 A Yes.
- 14 Q I'm gonna show you State's Exhibit 34. Can you tell
- 15 us what this is?
- 16 A It's the back of the same subject.
- 17 Q Now, it looks, from the back -- from the photo, at
- 18 least -- there are some black dots on this shirt. Did you
- notice that on February 2nd, 2014?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q And what was the significance to you about the black
- dots on the back of the shirt?
- 23 A They were small fibers of cotton where would
- sometimes, you know, when you take off a hooded sweatshirt

- you might get those lint particles or whatever that's
- 2 still left on your shirt.
- 3 Q So to your observation, is it fair to say that, to
- 4 your observation, these are lint particles from the black
- 5 sweatshirt?
- 6 A Yes.
- 7 MR. PALAL: Court's indulgence.
- 8 Your Honor, the State would pass the witness.
- 9 THE COURT: Cross-examination?
- 10 CROSS-EXAMINATION OF JOSHUA ROWBERRY
- 11 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 12 Q These lint particles, Officer Rowberry, did you
- [inaudible] any of those?
- 14 A Did I maintain any of them?
- 15 Q Yes --
- 16 A No.
- 17 Q -- did you gather any of them? Did you maintain any
- of them?
- 19 A No.
- Q Did you document them here?
- 21 A I believe I documented them in my report.
- Q Okay. Did you take these photographs?
- 23 A I didn't personally take the photographs, no.
- MR. CLAUS: Court's indulgence.

- 1 THE COURT: Sure.
- 2 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 3 Q The -- and I want to be clear. The Wrigley spearmint
- 4 gum, the Newports, they were found inside the driver's seat?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 Q In the condition that the photographs show. They
- 7 weren't inside of a purse, they weren't anywhere else, other
- 8 than in that seat.
- 9 A Correct.
- 10 Q So they were being sat upon, essentially.
- 11 A Well, I don't believe they were being sat on.
- But when the driver exited the vehicle, if they were on
- the side of her, then when she got out, they fell over.
- MR. CLAUS: Court's indulgence.
- 15 Pass the witness, Your Honor.
- 16 THE COURT: Any redirect?
- MR. PALAL: No, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Any questions from the jurors? Nobody's
- 19 writing?
- Okay. Thank you, sir. We appreciate your time.
- 21 Have a nice afternoon.
- Next witness.
- 23 MR. LEXIS: State calls Officer Landers
- JEREMY LANDERS,

- 1 [having been called as a witness and being first duly
- 2 sworn testified as follows:]
- 3 THE CLERK: Please be seated.
- 4 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- THE CLERK: Please state and spell your name for the
- 6 record.
- 7 THE WITNESS: It's Officer Jeremy Landers,
- 3 J-E-R-E-M-Y, L-A-N-D-E-R-S.
- 9 THE COURT: Sir, you will notice there are M&Ms in the
- 10 dispenser there, if you should need some during the
- examination. And there is water in the pitcher. If you
- 12 need some coffee, let the marshal know.
- 13 THE WITNESS: Perfect.
- THE COURT: Please proceed.
- 15 THE WITNESS: Thank you, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Uh-huh.
- 17 DIRECT EXAMINATION OF JEREMY LANDERS
- 18 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 19 Q Where do you work, sir?
- 20 A I'm a police officer with Las Vegas Metropolitan
- 21 Police Department.
- 22 Q How long have you worked there?
- 23 A September will be 13 years.
- Q Were you working on February 2nd, 2014?

- 1 A I was, sir.
- 2 Q Were you dispatched to the area of
- 3 5001 North Rainbow, Clark County, Las Vegas, Nevada?
- 4 A Yes, I was.
- 5 Q What was the nature of the dispatch?
- 6 A It was a robbery with a deadly weapon at a
- 7 convenience store.
- 8 Q Is it the Star Mart?
- 9 A It is.
- 10 Q What happened upon arrival?
- 11 A I made contact with the victim, began to get her
- 12 statement. As I was getting her statement, I was apprised
- that Officer Rowberry had conducted a traffic stop on what
- 14 he deemed was a suspicious vehicle in the area, not too
- far away, that was possibly related.
- 16 Q Do you remember what time you arrived?
- 17 A I don't. It's -- it's indicated in the CAD
- 18 record. I'd be -- it's been some time. So I'd have to
- refresh my memory.
- Q Would it refresh my memory if I showed you your CAD?
- 21 A It would, sir.
- MR. LEXIS: May I approach, Your Honor?
- 23 THE COURT: You may.
- 24 Anybody like the CAD record marked for precision

- of the record only?
- 2 MR. CLAUS: Please, Your Honor, for the Court's
- 3 record, please.
- 4 MR. LEXIS: Would you like it marked now, Your Honor?
- 5 THE COURT: As Court's Exhibit.
- 6 THE CLERK: It will be Court's 5.
- 7 THE COURT: Okay.
- 8 [COURT'S EXHIBIT 5 MARKED.]
- THE COURT: And then make sure you give it back to her
- when you're finished.
- 11 MR. LEXIS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 12 THE COURT: Thank you.
- 13 MR. LEXIS: May I approach?
- 14 THE COURT: You may.
- 15 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 16 Q Officer, please read that to yourself. Don't say
- anything. Let me know when you're done.
- 18 A Okay.
- 19 Q Did that refresh your memory, officer?
- 20 A It does.
- Q What time did you arrive?
- 22 A 03:11 hours, as indicated by the CAD record. I
- was operating as marked patrol unit one "X-ray."
- 24 Q And soon thereafter, were you advised that a suspect

- 1 had been taken into custody?
- 2 A I was.
- 3 Q Is that when you took the victim to the location?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q Was she cooperative?
- 6 A Our victim? Yes.
- 7 Q Yes.
- 8 A Yes, she was.
- 9 Q Her name Brittany Slathar?
- 10 A Yes.
- MR. LEXIS: May I approach, Your Honor?
- THE COURT: You may.
- 13 BY MR. LEXIS:
- Q Sir, I'm showing you what has been marked as
- 15 State's Exhibit 10. What is that?
- 16 A This is a -- this is commonly known as a show up
- form or Show Up Witness Instructions.
- 18 Q Did you follow that procedure?
- 19 A I did.
- Q What did you do?
- 21 A Okay. A show up -- you may have seen it in the
- movies, on TV, that type of thing. It's generally
- conducted within a short time following a crime, where a
- suspect is -- potential suspect has been located and

- stopped, where we would transport our victim or witness to
- 2 that location to -- to make an identification whether or
- 3 not that is or is not the suspect that committed the
- 4 crime.
- 5 Q Are there instructions on that sheet --
- 6 THE COURT: Hold on a second, Counsel. I think the
- 7 exhibit you're referring to is Exhibit 19. Can you just
- 8 confirm that's what it says.
- 9 THE WITNESS: That is correct.
- 10 THE COURT: Thank you.
- 11 THE WITNESS: I had my glasses on --
- MR. LEXIS: Sorry, Your Honor.
- 13 THE WITNESS: -- I can actually read that.
- THE COURT: It's Dulce. She wants to make sure you're
- doing it right, Counsel.
- 16 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 17 Q And, sir, is there an admonishment on there?
- 18 A There is.
- 19 Q And was the victim advised of that admonishment?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q And can you please read that admonishment to the
- 22 jury.
- 23 A Yes. We would have filled out this top half and
- I would have admonished the victim, prior to actually

- going over to the location where the suspect was stopped.
- I would have read this verbatim. In fact, I did. And it
- goes as -- as, and I, quote, "In a moment I'm going to
- 4 show you a person who is being detained. This person may
- or may not be the person who committed the crime now being
- 6 investigated. The fact that this person is detained
- 7 should not cause you to believe or guess that he, " slash,
- 8 "she is guilty. You do not have to identify anyone. It
- 9 is just as important to free innocent persons from
- 10 suspicion as it is to identify those who are guilty.
- "Please keep in mind that clothing can easily be
- 12 changed. Please do not talk to anyone, other than the
- police officers, while viewing this person. You must make
- up your own mind and are not to be influenced by other
- 15 witnesses, if any.
- 16 "When you have viewed the person, please tell me
- whether or not you can make an identification. If you
- can, tell me in your own words how sure you are of your
- 19 identification. Please do not indicate in any way to
- 20 other witnesses that you have or have not made an
- 21 identification. Thank you."
- Q And she was advised of that prior to your arrival of
- 23 where the suspect was at?
- 24 A Correct, sir.

- 1 Q And tell me her demeanor and her reaction once she
- 2 saw this individual?
- 3 A She made a very rapid identification. And as
- 4 soon as she saw him, that -- that was the guy.
- 5 Q And did she also fill out that bottom part?
- 6 A She did.
- 7 Q And that's after she made the identification?
- 8 A Correct, sir.
- 9 Q And what did she state on that?
- 10 A Her statement is, "The male in front of the
- police car was the man who robbed me at gun point. He was
- wearing blue jeans a red T-shirt and black tennis shoes.
- When he came into the store, he was wearing blue jeans, a
- black hooded sweatshirt and a beanie, light," slash, "dark
- brown spots." I assume that was the beanie.
- MR. LEXIS: No further questions, Your Honor.
- 17 THE COURT: Cross-examination?
- 18 CROSS-EXAMINATION OF JEREMY LANDERS
- 19 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 20 Q You said that, initially, Ms. Slathar made a very
- 21 rapid identification. If there was -- was there any
- equivocation about the identity of individual?
- 23 A By "equivocation" you mean she -- did she wobble
- 24 at all?

- 1 Q Yes, because of the change of clothes.
- 2 A No.
- 3 Q And no officer would have told her that he could have
- 4 changed his clothes from the time that the robbery occurred?
- 5 A Actually, it says in the admonishment that the
- 6 clothes may have been changed.
- 7 Q Okay. Did you say that at the scene as well?
- 8 A No, I read her the admonishment, I drove her to
- 9 the scene, and let her make the decision from there.
- MR. CLAUS: Pass the witness, Your Honor.
- 11 THE COURT: Any further examination, Counsel?
- MR. LEXIS: No, Your Honor.
- 13 THE COURT: Any questions from the jurors?
- 14 Thank you, sir. We appreciate your time. Have a
- 15 nice afternoon.
- 16 THE WITNESS: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 17 THE COURT: Next witness.
- 18 Can you give the exhibit -- Court's Exhibit to
- 19 Dulce? Thank you.
- Who's our next witness?
- 21 MR. PALAL: Graciela Angles.
- 22 THE COURT: Thank you.
- GRACIELA ANGLES,
- [having been called as a witness and being first duly

- sworn testified as follows:]
- THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated and please
- 3 state and spell your name for the record.
- 4 THE WITNESS: Graciela Angles, G-R-A-C-I-E-L-A. Last
- 5 name, Angles, A-N-G-L-E-S.
- THE COURT: And, ma'am, there are some M&Ms in the
- 7 dispenser next to you, if you should need those. And then
- 8 if you would like, there's some water in the pitcher. And
- 9 if you would like some coffee, the marshal can help you
- 10 with that, too.
- 11 All right. You may proceed, Counsel.
- 12 DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GRACIELA ANGLES
- 13 BY MR. LEXIS:
- Q Good morning, ma'am.
- 15 A Morning.
- 16 Q On January 28, 2014, were you working at the
- 17 Metro PCS?
- 18 A Yes, I was.
- 19 Q Is that at 6663 Smoke Ranch?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q Is that here in Las Vegas, Clark County, Nevada?
- 22 A Yes.
- 23 Q Around 2:00 o'clock, did anything out of the ordinary
- happen?

- 1 A Yes, it did.
- 2 Q What happened?
- 3 A Uh, an African American guy came in and did a
- 4 robbery on the store, took money and took a phone.
- 5 Q Let's take it piece by piece, ma'am.
- 6 A Okay.
- 7 Q When you first saw him come in, did you notice
- 8 anything out of the ordinary?
- 9 A No.
- 10 Q What is the first thing you saw this man do?
- A Went to look at the phones and ask me about the
- 12 plans.
- 13 Q Asked you about the plans?
- 14 A Yes.
- MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, may the record reflect I'm
- showing opposing counsel State's Proposed 32, 14, 13, 12,
- 17 and 11.
- 18 May I approach, Your Honor?
- 19 THE COURT: 11 through 14 and 32.
- 20 MR. LEXIS: Correct, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: All right. You sure it's 32?
- THE CLERK: 32 [inaudible].
- MR. LEXIS: Looks like a three --
- 24 THE CLERK: [Inaudible]

- 1 MR. LEXIS: Is that a seven? 32?
- THE CLERK: 37, yeah.
- 3 MR. LEXIS: 37.
- THE COURT: That's Dulce's fault. Not yours, Counsel.
- 5 MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, it's fine.
- 6 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 7 Q Ma'am, please take a look through those photos. Are
- 8 those true and accurate representations of what the store
- 9 looked like on that day?
- 10 A Yes.
- MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, I move to admit these
- 12 exhibits.
- THE COURT: 11 through 14 and 37. Any objection?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- 15 THE COURT: Be admitted.
- 16 [STATE'S EXHIBITS 11-14 AND 37 ADMITTED]
- 17 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 18 Q Ma'am, I'm showing you State's Exhibit 11. What is
- that a picture of?
- 20 A Of the front of the store.
- 21 Q True and accurate representation?
- 22 A Yes.
- like a police vehicle to you?

- 1 A Yes, it is.
- Q [Inaudible] did this occur off the police got there?
- 3 A Yes.
- 4 Q And did they try to tape around the scene?
- 5 A Yes, they did.
- 6 Q Did they let anybody in and out?
- 7 A No.
- 8 Q I'm showing you State's Exhibit 12. What are we
- 9 looking at there?
- 10 A The inside of the store.
- 11 Q And where were you when the robbery took place?
- 12 A I was behind the counter.
- Q Showing you State's Exhibit 13. What is this a
- 14 picture of?
- 15 A It's behind the counter.
- 16 Q That's where you were?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q Showing you State's Exhibit 14. What is this a
- 19 picture of?
- 20 A That's a phone, a display. The Omega.
- 21 Q And what's the significance of this phone?
- 22 A [Inaudible]
- 23 Q Was he trying to buy this phone? Was he looking at
- this phone --

- 1 A Yes, he was.
- 2 Q -- what's the significance of this?
- 3 A It's a -- yeah, he was looking at that phone.
- 4 Q I'm showing you State's Exhibit 37. What is that a
- 5 picture of?
- 6 A While the robbery was taking place.
- 7 Q That's exactly where you were behind the counter?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q Where the register is?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q And in that picture is, does he appear to be holding
- 12 a firearm?
- 13 A Yes, it is.
- Q So ma'am, explain to us, after you see him come in,
- 15 he inquires about a phone, you say?
- 16 A Yes.
- Q What happens next?
- 18 A I explain to him about the plans. He asked me
- about a Galaxy S4, how much would be the total. I pull up
- the phone from the back. I scan it. I give him the
- 21 total. And then he asks me about a different phone, which
- it was the Omega. And I take the Galaxy S4 back, bring
- the Omega out and scan it and give him the total and ask
- him if he was gonna pay cash or debit.

- 1 Q So you have several facial interactions with this
- 2 person.
- 3 A Yes, I did.
- Q Okay. After that happened, what happened next?
- 5 A He actually pulled out the gun, asked me to step
- 6 back and give him the money.
- 7 Q Were you in fear?
- 8 A I gave him the money.
- 9 Q Were you in fear? Were you afraid?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q And so you complied with his demands?
- 12 A Yes.
- 13 Q And did you grab all the cash out of the draw?
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q And while you were doing this, was the gun pointed at
- 16 you?
- 17 A Yes, it was.
- 18 Q Appear to be a small gun?
- 19 A Yes, it was a small --
- Q What did he do?
- 21 A He just asked me to give him the money. He took
- the -- the Omega that was next to me and he took out.
- with Metro about a month later and show you some pictures?

- 1 A Yes, sir.
- 2 Q Is that a "yes"?
- 3 A Yes.
- 4 MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, let the record reflect I'm
- 5 showing opposing counsel State's Proposed Exhibit 16.
- 6 THE COURT: 16?
- 7 MR. LEXIS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 8 THE COURT: Thank you.
- 9 MR. LEXIS: May I approach, Your Honor?
- 10 THE COURT: You may.
- 11 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 12 Q Ma'am, I'm showing you State's Proposed 16. What is
- the first page of that?
- 14 A It's a -- array about the state -- about the
- picture that it was showed to me and there was writing
- where the police officer read to me.
- 17 Q Okay. Is there instructions on that first sheet?
- 18 A Yes, there is.
- 19 Q Before you were given the pictures, were you advised
- of the instructions?
- 21 A Yes, I was.
- Q And was that by the police officer or was that by you
- 23 reading that?
- A No, that was by the police officer.

- 1 Q After that admonishment was read to you, were you
- then shown the photographs?
- 3 A Yes, I was.
- Q Can you please turn it to page 2. Are those the
- 5 photographs you were shown?
- A Yes.
- 7 Q And what did you do?
- 8 A I circle number 2 and write my name under.
- 9 Q Did you then indicate on page 1 how sure you were?
- 10 A Yes, I did.
- 11 Q Can you please turn to page 1 and tell us what you
- 12 put.
- 13 A "I identified the number 2. I'm 100 percent sure
- that he robbed me at Smoke Ranch. Nothing is change.
- 15 It's still -- it's still the same. Only the difference is
- that he's not wearing a hat."
- MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, State moves to admit
- 18 State's Proposed Exhibit 16.
- THE COURT: Any objection to 16?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: 16 be admitted.
- [STATE'S EXHIBIT 16 ADMITTED]
- MR. LEXIS: Permission to publish, Your Honor?

24

- 1 THE COURT: You may.
- 2 BY MR. LEXIS:
- Q Ma'am, is this the instruction sheet?
- 4 A Yes, it is.
- 5 Q Is these the instructions that were read to you?
- 6 A Yes.
- 7 Q And you read those -- or somebody read those to you
- 8 before seeing the photographs?
- 9 A They read them to me.
- 10 Q Before seeing the photographs?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q Were you then shown the photographs?
- 13 A Yes, I was.
- 14 Q And is that the circle you put?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q And is that your writing underneath number 2?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q And to this day, do you still indicate, 100 percent,
- 19 number 2?
- 20 A Yes.
- Q Was his features similar in this picture as they were
- when he robbed you?
- 23 A Yes, they were.
- Q Was the hair short?

- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q Was the facial hair short?
- 3 A Yes.
- 4 Q Was he wearing glasses or not wearing glasses?
- 5 A He was not wearing glasses.
- 6 Q Was he wearing ordinary casual clothes or was he
- 7 wearing like I'm wearing?
- 8 A He was wearing casual clothes.
- 9 Q You see that person in court today?
- 10 A Yes, I do.
- 11 Q Can you please point to him and identify for me the
- 12 color shirt he's wearing.
- 13 A I'm sorry. What was that?
- 14 Q Can you please point to that person and identify for
- me the color shirt he is wearing.
- 16 A Gray.
- MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, let the record reflect the
- 18 witness has identified the Defendant.
- 19 THE COURT: The record will so reflect.
- 20 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 21 Q Ma'am, did you also go over a video that was taken
- during this incident at the District Attorney's office?
- 23 A Yes.
- Q After that video was shown to you, was the video then

- popped out, the CD, and did you sign it immediately?
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 MR. LEXIS: Let the record reflect I'm showing
- 4 opposing counsel State Proposed 43.
- 5 May I approach, Your Honor?
- 6 THE COURT: You may.
- 7 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 8 Q Ma'am, I'm showing you State's Proposed Exhibit 43.
- 9 Do you recognize that CD?
- 10 A Yes, I do.
- 11 Q Do you recognize the signature on that CD?
- 12 A Yes, I do.
- 13 Q Is that your signature?
- 14 A Yes, it is.
- MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, I move to admit
- 16 State's Proposed 43.
- MR. CLAUS: Your Honor, can we have further foundation
- 18 laid, please.
- THE COURT: Counsel, can you establish she watched the
- whole thing.
- MR. LEXIS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 22 BY MR. LEXIS:
- Q Did you watch all the video that is on this CD?
- 24 A Yes, I did.

```
Page 57
```

- 1 Q And does it truly and accurately depict what happened
- 2 on that day?
- 3 A Yes.
- 4 Q And what you saw on that day?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, I move to admit
- 7 State's Proposed --
- 8 THE COURT: Any additional objection?
- 9 MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- 10 THE COURT: Be admitted.
- 11 [STATE'S EXHIBIT 43 ADMITTED]
- 12 THE COURT: And which number was that?
- MR. CLAUS: 43, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Ma'am, it's gonna show up on this monitor
- 15 here.
- 16 THE WITNESS: [Inaudible]
- 17 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 18 Q Ma'am, can you tell us what we are looking at.
- 19 A I was looking at the computer. I was watching a
- 20 movie.
- 21 Q Is this the suspect coming in right now?
- 22 A Yes, it is.
- 23 Q And what is going on right now?
- 24 A He's asking me about the phones. I'm explaining

- to him the plans on the phones and what kind of promotions
- 2 we have going on.
- 3 Q What's going on right now?
- 4 A It's -- it's -- we're still talking about the
- 5 phones.
- 6 Q Still chitchat over the phones?
- 7 A About the phones, what's the difference between
- 8 them.
- 9 Q Where are you going?
- 10 A He's asking me about the total of the Galaxy S4.
- 11 So I went to get it so I can bring him up and give him the
- 12 total.
- 13 Q You have the phone now?
- 14 A Yes, I do.
- 15 Q What are you talking about now?
- 16 A I'm scanning the phone to bring -- to bring the
- 17 total up.
- 18 Q Is he still acting like he's trying to buy the phone?
- 19 A Yes.
- 20 Q Do you remember what this conversation is about? Or
- 21 the same thing?
- 22 A It's still about the same thing. About what kind
- of plan he wants
- Q What is he looking at over there?

- 1 A He's --
- 2 Q Do you have phones in those cases?
- 3 A We have phones. We have different type of phones
- 4 on that circle.
- 5 Q And next to him, is there a display?
- A Yes, there is. It's the Galaxy Mega.
- 7 Q That's the Galaxy Mega?
- 8 A That's the Galaxy Mega.
- 9 Q Are you the only employee in the store at the time?
- 10 A Yes, I was.
- 11 Q Is he the only customer in the store at this time?
- 12 A Yes, he was.
- 13 Q During the robbery, were you the only employee?
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q And was he the only customer?
- 16 A Yes.
- Q What's going on now, ma'am?
- 18 A He asked me what's different between the
- 19 Galaxy S4. So he -- the Galaxy S4 and the Mega. So I
- went to take the Galaxy S4 back and bring him the Mega
- 21 out.
- 22 Q The Mega's a bigger, better phone?
- Q During this exchange, are you looking at him several

- times in the face?
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q What's going on now, ma'am?
- A I'm putting the phone together to show it to him,
- so he could hold it and play with it. Display the phone
- 6 to him.
- 7 Q So you're taking it out to make it operational, out
- 8 of the box?
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q And he's waiting for you to do that?
- 11 A He -- yes.
- 12 Q What are you doing now, ma'am?
- 13 A I'm scanning the case to get him the total with
- the phone, the case, and the plan.
- 15 Q At this point, you've made the phone operational?
- 16 A Yes.
- Q What's going on right now, ma'am?
- 18 A I turn on the phone. I ask him if he was gonna
- 19 pay cash or debit. And he pulled out the gun.
- MR. LEXIS: Can you pause it right there?
- 21 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 22 Q So is he pointing the firearm at you?
- 23 A Yes.
- Q Was he pointing the firearm at you the entire time he

```
was demanding the money?
```

- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q And you were in fear?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q And you said you complied with his demands?
- 6 A I did comply with them.
- 7 Q What's going on right now?
- 8 A I'm giving him the money from the register.
- 9 Q You step back. Why you stepping back?
- 10 A He asked me to step back.
- 11 Q Did he immediately, then, leave the store?
- 12 A Yes, he did.
- Q What are you doing right now?
- 14 A I'm calling 9-1-1.
- 15 Q Did you immediately call 9-1-1?
- 16 A Yes, I did.
- Q And the phone you made operational, he took that as
- 18 well?
- 19 A Yes, he did.
- MR. LEXIS: No further questions, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Cross-examination?
- MR. CLAUS: Court's indulgence for just a moment,
- 23 please.
- THE COURT: Okay. Counsel, what was the exhibit

- 1 number of the video?
- 2 MR. PALAL: 43, Your Honor.
- 3 THE COURT: 43. Thank you.
- 4 MR. CLAUS: Your Honor, I'll pass this witness.
- 5 THE COURT: And may I have the jury questions, please.
- 6 Counsel, can you approach?
- 7 MR. CLAUS: Oh, actually, Your Honor, I'm sorry. I
- 8 did have one question of this witness, if I may.
- 9 THE COURT: Ask.
- 10 CROSS-EXAMINATION OF GRACIELA ANGLES
- 11 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 12 Q The firearm that was produced, do you remember if it
- was an automatic firearm?
- 14 A I honestly don't know.
- Q Okay.
- 16 A I don't know about firearms.
- 17 Q You don't know the difference between automatic or
- 18 revolver.
- 19 A No.
- MR. CLAUS: Okay. Thank you, Your Honor.
- 21 THE COURT: Counsel, can you approach? I have
- 22 questions from the jury.
- MR. LEXIS: Judge, may I follow up on that, too?
- THE COURT: After we ask the questions from the jury.

- 1 [Bench conference]
- THE COURT: I have a couple questions from the jurors.
- 3 THE WITNESS: Uh-huh.
- 4 THE COURT: Did you have to leave the floor at the
- store to get the phones or were they on the floor?
- 6 THE WITNESS: They are on the -- they are on the
- 7 store, they're on the floor.
- 8 THE COURT: And did you see him put away the gun to
- grab the phone with his right hand before exiting the
- 10 store?
- 11 THE WITNESS: No.
- 12 THE COURT: Okay. Thank you.
- 13 Counsel, would you like to follow up?
- MR. LEXIS: Court's indulgence.
- Nothing from the State, nothing further.
- 16 THE COURT: Anything else, Mr. Claus?
- MR. CLAUS: Just a moment, Your Honor. Pass the
- 18 witness, Your Honor.
- 19 THE COURT: Okay. Thank you. We appreciate your
- 20 time. Have a very nice afternoon.
- Ladies and gentlemen, at this time we're gonna
- take our lunch recess until 1:15.
- During this recess, you are admonished not to
- talk or converse among yourselves or with anyone else on

- any subject connected with this trial or read, watch, or
- listen to any report of commentary on the trial or any
- 3 person connected to this trial by any means of
- 4 information, including without limitation: Social media,
- 5 text, newspaper, television, Internet, radio or form or
- 6 express any opinion on any subject connected with the
- 7 trial until the case is finally submitted to you.
- 8 We'll see you at 1:15. If you could gather
- 9 outside 14A.
- 10 [Outside the presence of the jury]
- 11 THE COURT: Counsel, if you could come up here, one of
- 12 you. I don't care which one. You're the hander-outer.
- 13 There's two for each side.
- So this is now -- we're past your working set.
- 15 If it's okay, I'll go ahead and take one more shot at it,
- see if there's anything else that's missed. I've made the
- 17 corrections we talked about yesterday. I will then, if
- you tell me after lunch that these look good, I will then
- 19 number them and give you a new set that has the
- 20 handwritten numbers on it.
- MR. PALAL: All right. Thank you, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Okay? And I'm just trying to make sure
- 23 we've done our parts.
- Anything else before I see you guys at 1:00-ish?

```
1 MR. PALAL: Nothing from the State.
```

- 2 THE COURT: You guys at 1:00-ish.
- 3 MR. PALAL: Okay.
- 4 MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- 5 THE COURT: Okay.
- 6 MR. PALAL: Thank you.
- 7 THE COURT: Uh-huh.
- 8 [Recess at 11:58 a.m.; proceedings resumed at
- 9 1:09 p.m.]
- 10 [Outside the presence of the jury]
- [Discussion off the record]
- 12 THE COURT: So as soon as I have juries all here, I'm
- ready to go. Do you need the list of them?
- THE BAILIFF: Uh, you have a list of them?
- 15 THE COURT: I got a list.
- 16 THE BAILIFF: I'll take a list. [Inaudible]
- 17 THE COURT: Here you go. They should be in front of
- 18 14A.
- THE BAILIFF: I'll go see what I can [inaudible].
- THE COURT: There should be 14 of them.
- 21 THE BAILIFF: 14 of them?
- THE COURT: In front of 14A.
- THE BAILIFF: Yes, ma'am.
- 24 THE COURT: Thank you.

- Good afternoon, gentlemen. How are you?
- 2 MR. LEXIS: Not too bad. And you?
- 3 THE COURT: I'm great. So while we're doing that,
- 4 Mr. Splond, you understand that under the Constitution of
- 5 the United States and under the constitution of the
- 6 State of Nevada, you cannot be compelled to testify in
- 7 this case; correct?
- 8 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.
- 9 THE COURT: You may, at your own request, give up this
- right and take the witness stand and testify. If you do,
- you'll be subject to cross-examination by the
- 12 District Attorney. And anything you may say, be it on
- direct or cross-examination, will be subject to fair
- comment when the District Attorney speaks to the jury in
- 15 final argument. Do you understand that?
- THE DEFENDANT: Yes.
- 17 THE COURT: If you choose not to testify, the Court
- will not permit the District Attorney to make any comments
- to the jury because you've not testified. You understand
- 20 that?
- THE DEFENDANT: Yes.
- THE COURT: If you elect not to testify, the Court
- will instruct the jury that only if your attorney
- specifically request, generally, the law does not compel a

- 1 Defendant in a criminal case to take the stand and testify
- and no presumption may be raised, no inference of any kind
- may be drawn that from the failure for the Defendant to
- 4 testify. Do you have any questions about these rights?
- 5 THE DEFENDANT: No.
- THE COURT: Okay. You're further advised that if you
- 7 have a felony conviction, more than ten years has not
- 8 elapsed from the date you've been convicted or discharged
- from prison, parole, or probation, whichever's later, the
- 10 Defense has not stopped to preclude that coming before the
- jury, you elect to take the stand and testify, deputy's
- 12 attorney [inaudible] may [inaudible] ask you the
- following: Have you been convicted of a felony? What was
- the felony? When did it happen? However, they can't ask
- 15 you any questions about the details. You understand those
- 16 rights?
- 17 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.
- THE COURT: The jury instruction I did mention about
- the not testifying is in the packet currently. During
- lunch break, we did notice one error in the packet of
- 21 information. The two captions between the instructions
- and the verdict form did not match. We've corrected that.
- 23 So it would be "Kenny" on both the instructions and the
- verdict because that matches the amended indictment.

- 1 THE BAILIFF: Judge, [inaudible].
- 2 THE COURT: Great. Thank you.
- 3 [Discussion off the record]
- [In the presence of the jury]
- 5 THE BAILIFF: Jurors are present.
- 6 THE COURT: Thank you, Kevin.
- 7 THE BAILIFF: You're welcome, Judge.
- 8 THE COURT: Counsel, stipulate the presence of the
- 9 jury.
- 10 MR. PALAL: Yes, Your Honor.
- MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 12 THE COURT: You may be seated.
- Good afternoon, ladies and gentlemen.
- 14 You're next witness.
- MR. PALAL: State calls Crime Scene Analyst Spoor.
- MONTE SPOOR,
- 17 [having been called as a witness and being first duly
- sworn testified as follows:]
- 19 THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated.
- 20 Please state and spell your name for the record.
- THE WITNESS: It's Monte Spoor. First name,
- 22 M-O-N-T-E. Last name Spoor, S-P-O-O-R.
- THE COURT: Thank you, sir. Sir, you will notice
- there's a dispenser with M&Ms near you. There is a

- 1 pitcher of water. If you'd like some coffee --
- THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- 3 THE COURT: -- the marshal can help you with that,
- 4 too.
- 5 You may proceed.
- 6 DIRECT EXAMINATION OF MONTE SPOOR
- 7 BY MR. PALAL:
- 8 Q Sir, how are you employed?
- 9 A Employed with the Las Vegas Metropolitan Police
- 10 Department as a Senior Crime Scene Analyst and a
- 11 Quality Assistant.
- 12 Q Okay. And what does a crime scene analyst do?
- 13 A A crime scene analyst investigates crime scenes.
- 14 Q All right. And how long have you worked for
- 15 Las Vegas Metropolitan Police Department?
- 16 A Little over 26 years.
- 17 Q And is -- have you been working as a crime scene
- analyst for all of those 26 years?
- 19 A Yes, sir, I have.
- Q What kind of training, education, experience do you
- 21 have as a crime scene analyst?
- A A lot. Twelve-page SOQ, which you've problem
- seen. Twenty-six years of training, on-the-job training
- for that college. Before that, high school. Lots.

```
Page 70
```

- 1 Q What kind of degree -- what degree did you get in
- 2 college?
- 3 A I don't have a degree.
- 4 Q Okay.
- 5 A Yeah.
- 6 Q What did you study in college?
- 7 A I studied biology and criminal justice.
- 8 Q Okay. And what kind of -- do you take any kind of
- 9 continuing education?
- 10 A All the time. Yes, sir.
- 11 Q What types of continuing education?
- 12 A If you allow me, I can pull out my SOQ and --
- 13 Q Just --
- 14 A -- read out -- everything from crime scene
- investigations on basic, intermediate, and advanced
- levels; bloodstain on basic and intermediate levels;
- photography on basic, intermediate, and advanced levels;
- anything that pertains to my job in general.
- 19 Q Per se, you've had a lot of hours of training.
- 20 A Well over 1800.
- Q Hours of training?
- 22 A Hours of training, yeah.
- 23 Q All right. Were you operating in your capacity as a
- Senior Crime Scene Analyst on January 22nd, 2014?

- 1 A Yes, I was.
- 2 Q And where were you called out to?
- 3 A I was called out a robbery.
- 4 Q And do you -- what physical location were you called
- 5 out to?
- A It would have been 4343 North Rancho Drive.
- 7 Q And it seems to me that you are referring to
- 8 something in front of you --
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q -- what are you referring to?
- 11 A This is my report. Help me remember, since it
- was number of years back.
- 13 Q Now, on January 22nd -- I'm sorry. What was the
- 14 address that you're --
- 15 A 4343 North Rancho Boulevard, Number 104.
- 16 Q And is that here in Clark County, Nevada?
- 17 A Yes, sir, it is.
- Q When you get to a scene of a possible robbery, what
- 19 do you do?
- 20 A Basically, I make contact with the officers that
- 21 have previously arrived before me or the detectives that
- have previously arrived before me. Gather information
- about the scene, what had happened, how did it happen.
- 24 From there, I make my notes. And from there I conduct my

- 1 photography. And from there I do my processing.
- 2 Q And when you say "processing" what do you mean?
- 3 A Generally, processing for latent fingerprints,
- 4 the recovery there of any evidence that is left behind.
- Q And in this case, is that the procedure you took?
- 6 A Yes, sir, it was.
- 7 MR. PALAL: Your Honor, may I approach the witness?
- 8 THE COURT: You may.
- 9 BY MR. PALAL:
- 10 Q Sir, I'm gonna show you previously admitted Exhibits
- 11 1, 2, 3, 4, and 5. Can you take a look at those?
- 12 A Yes, sir.
- Q Do you recognize what's State's Exhibits 1 through 5
- 14 are?
- 15 A Yes, sir, I do.
- Q What are they?
- 17 A They're photographs of the location that I
- previously identified. They're the documentation portion
- 19 of my crime scene investigation.
- 20 Q All right. I'm also now going to show you
- 21 State's Proposed Exhibits 6 through 8. Can you please take a
- look at them. Do you recognize what's depicted in
- 23 State's Exhibits 6 through 8?
- A Yes, sir, I do.

- 1 Q What do they depict?
- 2 A They depict two latent fingerprint lifts
- 3 embodying the tape that is left on the interior sides of
- 4 the north facing doors to the business.
- 5 Q And do they fairly and accurately depict the door, as
- 6 you viewed it on January 22nd, 2014, after you had processed
- 7 it?
- 8 A Yes, sir.
- 9 MR. PALAL: All right. Your Honor, State's gonna move
- 10 State's Exhibits 7 through 9 into evidence.
- 11 THE COURT: Any objection?
- MR. PALAL: And I apologize. That's 6 through 8.
- THE COURT: 6 through 8? Any objection?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- 15 THE COURT: 6 through 8 will be admitted.
- 16 [STATE'S EXHIBITS 6-8 ADMITTED]
- MR. PALAL: Permission to publish the exhibits?
- 18 THE COURT: You may.
- 19 BY MR. PALAL:
- Q I'm showing you State's Exhibit 1. What is this?
- 21 A That's the north facing portion of the business
- that I responded to, suite number 104.
- 23 Q And is there a business next to it?
- 24 A Yes, sir, there are two business that adjoin it.

- 1 Q Can you tell us what the businesses that adjoin it
- 2 are.
- A Adjoining to the west would be a
- 4 Luscious Boutique and adjoining to the east or right would
- 5 be fresh -- or Baja Fresh, I think is what it was.
- 6 Q Thank you. I want to show you know what's been
- admitted as State's Exhibit 2. Can you tell us what this is.
- 8 A Yes, sir. You're looking at the exterior north
- 9 facing entry doors to suite number 104.
- 10 Q Now, there appears to be some yellow tape in front of
- 11 the door.
- 12 A Yes, sir.
- Q Can you tell us what that is?
- 14 A Yes, sir. More than likely, the first responding
- officers, once they arrived and then got the story,
- 16 cordoned off the area so that no one would enter an area
- 17 that may contain potential evidence.
- 18 Q I'm gonna show you State's Exhibit 3. Can you tell
- 19 us what this is.
- 20 A Yes, sir. Basically, you're looking from north
- 21 to south into the interior of the business. And at the
- very south end of the business is a north facing customer
- 23 service counter
- Q And why did you take a -- why did you document that

- 1 area?
- 2 A The suspect had removed money from the cash
- 3 register draw, which is located on the clerk side or on
- 4 the south side of that customer service counter.
- 5 Q I'm now showing you what's been admitted as
- 6 State's Exhibit 4. Can you tell us what we're looking at.
- 7 A Yes, sir. You're looking at the south side of
- 8 that customer service counter. And in particular, you're
- 9 looking at this area right here.
- 10 Q All right.
- 11 A Yeah, it's not drawing today.
- 12 THE COURT: Sir, you got to use the mouse, now.
- 13 THE WITNESS: Oh, gotta use the mouse now.
- 14 THE COURT: We have new technology.
- 15 THE WITNESS: Okay.
- 16 THE COURT: So click the mouse --
- 17 MR. PALAL: Yeah, click it once.
- 18 THE COURT: -- till you get a cursor.
- 19 THE WITNESS: There we go.
- THE COURT: And now draw.
- 21 THE WITNESS: Okay. So you're -- you're looking at
- this area right here. In particular, this, which is the
- cash register drawer.
- MR. PALAL: And for the record, you've drawn a circle

- around, I guess, the center of the photo.
- THE WITNESS: Kind of a "B."
- 3 BY MR. PALAL:
- 4 Q I'm now gonna show you what's been admitted as
- 5 State's Exhibit --
- 6 THE COURT: May I remove the marks?
- 7 MR. PALAL: Yes, please. Thank you, Your Honor.
- 8 BY MR. PALAL:
- 9 Q I'm now gonna show you what's been admitted as
- 10 State's Exhibit 5. Can you tell us what we're looking at.
- 11 A Yeah. Yes, sir. Now you're at the south end of
- the business and you're looking back north to the north
- entry doors.
- Q And so is this -- what is this a perspective from?
- 15 A This is a perspective from back where that
- 16 counter was located, looking back towards the north front
- of the business. When you saw that last picture, the
- first picture that we looked at, showed the north front.
- 19 This is the interior side of the business, looking back to
- 20 that direction.
- 21 Q Now, in the process -- in processing this scene, did
- you -- it obviously appears you took photos to document it.
- 23 A Yes, sir.
- Q Did you attempt to recover latent fingerprints?

- 1 A I did.
- 2 Q Where did you attempt to recover latent
- 3 fingerprints --
- 4 A Latent fingerprints --
- 5 Q -- fingerprints from. Sorry.
- 6 A Sorry.
- 7 Q I was just trying to get latent paint fingerprints
- 8 from.
- 9 A The cash register drawer itself and the interior
- of the two north facing doors.
- 11 Q Were you able to get any latent fingerprints from the
- 12 cash register area?
- 13 A No, sir, I was not.
- 14 Q Does that mean nobody touched the cash register area?
- 15 A No, sir, that doesn't.
- Q Were you able to develop latent fingerprints from the
- 17 door?
- 18 A Yes, sir, I was.
- 19 Q Can you tell us what latent -- can you tell us what
- latent fingerprints are.
- 21 A Latent fingerprints -- the word "latent" means
- "hidden, not visible to the naked eye." So when a person
- touches a surface, depending on the condition of the
- surface and what is being secreted on the palm or surfaces

- of the hands, it can leave an impression of the ridge
- detail that's on the palm or surfaces of our hands.
- 3 We have this ridge detail because if we didn't,
- 4 we went to pick something up, it'd slide right out of our
- 5 hands. It helps us grip and hold.
- So, basically, what the latent is, is it's
- 7 hidden. It's not visible to the naked eye. So in order
- 8 to render that visible, or to search for these hidden
- 9 prints, I use a powder and a glassine [phonetic] fiber
- 10 brush. And I apply this powder to these surfaces. And it
- 11 helps adhere to the substrate that's left behind from the
- palm or surfaces of our hands onto the surfaces in which
- we're processing. And that helps me see them.
- 14 Then once that I'm able to see them, I can
- recover them with a latent tape, like you saw in the
- photos previously shown. And that helps me pull them from
- 17 the surface. And to put them on to a contrasting
- 18 background. Because we use black powder, our contrasting
- 19 background is white. That enables us to see what we've
- 20 lifted. So we've taken something hidden and we've made it
- 21 visible.
- Q What are the factors in determining if a latent print
- has been left? Or what are the factors that cause a latent
- 24 print to be left?

- 1 A Factors that cause a latent print to be left is
- 2 somebody touched a surface with the palm or surfaces of
- 3 their hands or the plant or surfaces of their feet. That
- 4 leaves the distinguishable marks that we are looking for
- 5 to make identifications.
- If somebody were to lean up against something
- 7 with their arm, we would see that too, but it would be
- 8 more of a hair/pore structure. It doesn't give us a whole
- 9 lot of identification.
- 10 Q Are there factors regarding individuals and whether
- or not they would leave a mark?
- 12 A Oh, sure. You can touch something and because
- your fingerprints are individualized to you and you
- only -- even identical twins do not share the same
- 15 fingerprints. Share the same DNA, but they do not share
- the same fingerprints. Because you touch something, you
- could possibly leave that detail behind. And then again,
- 18 you may not.
- 19 Q And what are the factors in determining whether or
- 20 not -- what are the factors that go into whether a latent
- 21 print is left or not?
- 22 A There are many factors. The type of surface. Is
- 23 the surface smooth? Is it textured? Is it clean? Is it
- 24 dirty? Is the person secreting out of the pore structures

- of the palm or surfaces of their hands?
- 2 We secret 99 percent water or moisture,
- 3 perspiration. The other two -- the other one percent, it
- 4 could be fatty acids, lipids, amino acids, salts.
- 5 Everything our body produces, we push out of our pores.
- If you look at the little ridges on your fingers,
- you'll see if you're -- you're good enough and you have
- 8 nice little readers like me, you can actually see little
- 9 round pores on the top of those ridges. That's pores.
- 10 And those push out that stuff.
- We could also pick up other stuff. Say we're
- working on our car. We get a little oil on our hands and
- we touch something. We can leave that impression behind.
- 14 There's many factors that determine whether something is
- left and something isn't. You just don't know until you
- 16 process. The process helps you render that visible. And
- 17 you may not render anything visible.
- 18 Q So it's possible for somebody to touch something and
- 19 not render anything.
- 20 A That is correct.
- 21 Q And now, you talked about types of surfaces. And one
- thing you mentioned was clean or dirty surfaces.
- 23 A Yes.
- Q What -- can you tell us what that -- what are you

- 1 talking about specifically?
- 2 A Well, my experience -- say we have a window. Say
- 3 the window goes to the house or in the back yard. And you
- 4 look at that window and that window has a lot of alkali on
- 5 it because the sprinkler hits it. That would be
- 6 considered a dirty window. That might not necessarily be
- 7 able to allow the substrate from the hand to transfer.
- 8 Another instance would be, say you have a dusty
- 9 window. We touch that dusty window, but what happens is
- the dirt transfers to our hands and the substrate from our
- hands don't transfer to the surface. A clean surface, a
- 12 nice, smooth, clean surface, we can transfer our
- 13 substrate.
- But what if we're not secreting? What if we're
- in the sweating? What if we don't have the substrate on
- our hands? We might not leave anything at all. It's
- 17 really difficult to say somebody will or will not leave
- something. It's also difficult to say a surface is good
- or bad until you actual process that surface and see what
- it's rendering.
- 21 Q And are some people more inclined than others to
- leave fingerprints?
- 23 A Sure, if somebody's sweating. They're nervous or
- sweating, they might be more inclined. But then again, if

- they're sweating too much, we might not get a ridge
- 2 pattern. We might get a blob. If somebody is a good
- 3 secreter, like I like to say, but they're touching a
- surface that's been touched by ten people previously, we
- 5 might not get anything because we have a build up of
- substrate, where we can't isolate the substrate that we're
- 7 leaving behind.
- 8 There is, literally, a million and one factors on
- 9 why you can and can't leave prints. And each situation is
- 10 unique within itself.
- 11 Q Now, let's focus back on the event on
- January 22nd, 2014. You said you were able to develop some
- latent prints. I'm gonna show you what's been admitted as
- 14 State's Exhibit 6. Can you tell us what we're looking at.
- 15 A Basically, you're looking at the inside of the
- double north facing doors that allow access to that
- 17 business. So you have the -- let me do a little thing
- 18 here.
- So this would be -- let's just do this. This
- 20 would be the west side door. And this would be the east
- side door. Put a big "E" there. So located on the west
- side door -- and you can actually see all the fingerprint
- powder that was applied. You can see all this black
- that's all over these doors.

- 1 So basically, on the west side door I was able to
- 2 develop latent detail right there. And on the east side
- door, I was able to develop latent detail right there.
- 4 It's denoted by the two pieces of latent fingerprint tape
- 5 that are located on the actual detail that I was able to
- 6 render visible using my powder process that I explained
- 7 earlier.
- If you look at a closer photo, you're gonna see a
- 9 "1" and a "2." I'll denote each one of those fingerprints
- 10 as "latent fingerprint lift 1," "latent fingerprint lift
- 11 2."
- 12 Q All right. Now, you'd mentioned that there's dirt
- 13 that -- or not dirt but I guess -- what is the --
- 14 A Our black powder.
- 15 Q Back powder --
- 16 A Black processing powder.
- 17 Q Black processing powder on the door. Now, it appears
- there are portions where your tape's not at but that the black
- 19 powder is stuck to the door.
- 20 A Yes, sir.
- 21 Q What does that indicate?
- 22 A It indicates, basically, I'm very thorough. I
- 23 processed everything I could possible process if somebody
- were to make haste and go out those doors. But that

- doesn't mean that I'm gonna get that latent detail. For a
- 2 variety of reasons that I explained earlier. Might not be
- 3 secreters, might have had gloves on, might never have been
- 4 there. There's a variety of factors. Might not hit the
- 5 door in that area.
- You know, unless somebody tells me specifically,
- 7 "Hey, they hit the door in this area," I do everything.
- 8 Because I don't want to eliminate one little area. I want
- 9 to do it all and see what I come up with.
- 10 Q And the black powder, it sticks to moisture, is
- 11 that -- is that correct or --
- 12 A It will adhere to the substrate left behind.
- 13 Substrate can be anything that I described earlier. Could
- be moisture, could be acids, could be lipids. Could be
- 15 salts. It could be sebaceous oils which we pick up when
- we rub our heads. If we rub our hair, you'll feel the oil
- gets on your fingers. It could be a lot of different
- things. Could be the -- the car grease that you had on
- 19 your hand from working on your car.
- 20 Q And so the black powder on the door, there's --
- 21 that's -- it's sticking to the door because of substrates on
- the door.
- 23 A It can do that or it could also stick to the
- minor imperfections in the glass, too. You know, if you

- look at glass up close, sometimes glass looks like it has
- 2 scratches or striations. It will fill in those holes.
- But what we are looking for is that actual detail
- 4 that we see on the palm or surfaces of our hands. If I
- don't see that detail, it's not useful for me.
- Q And so where the black powder's on the door, where
- you don't have the tape, there is something there, but it's
- 8 not detailed enough for you to develop a latent print.
- 9 A Right. It could be substrate on top of substrate
- on top of substrate that has no detail. You're not seeing
- 11 those ridges. You're not seeing those furrows. You're
- not seeing that pattern detail. So it is useless,
- 13 basically.
- Q And fair to say that this is the ingress and egress
- of the business, the enter -- how you enter and how you exit
- 16 from the business.
- 17 A This is the customer.
- 18 Q Okay. Customer --
- 19 A Yes.
- 20 Q -- and --
- 21 A Because --
- 22 Q The way the customer enters and exits.
- 23 A Yes.
- Q And so in a business, you would expect to have a

- number of people coming in and coming out using the door.
- 2 A If they're successful.
- 3 Q At opening the door.
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q And -- or if the business is successful.
- A If the business is successful, yes.
- 7 Q All right. And that can affect -- it sounds like
- 8 that affects your ability to develop prints.
- 9 A That very well could be. If the -- if the
- 10 business doesn't clean the doors on a regular basis and
- 11 people are going in and out, touching the handles,
- touching the bars, touching the vertical metal, touching
- the glass, and nobody's cleaning that, you just get build
- ups of substrate on top of substrate on top of substrate.
- 15 So, basically, what you have is a bunch of blah. You
- don't have anything that's identifiable.
- 17 Q I'm going to show you State's Exhibit 7. You'd
- 18 mentioned you number your --
- MR. PALAL: Your Honor, can you clear it?
- 20 THE COURT: I'm trying to. I've got -- I'm learning,
- 21 too.
- 22 BY MR. PALAL:
- 23 Q All right. So you'd mentioned earlier that tape --
- you number your tape. Is this an example -- it's -- I'm

- sorry. Let me clear up the record -- State's Exhibit 7 depict
- an example of you numbering your tape?
- 3 A Yes, sir, it does.
- 4 Q And the tape there indicates what?
- 5 A I numbered this as latent print -- or "latent
- 6 lift 1," basically.
- 7 Q And that's an actual latent print you were able to
- 8 lift from the door.
- 9 A Yeah. You couldn't -- I don't know if you guys
- 10 have as great a view as I do, but -- let me see here. I
- 11 can -- I'm very computer savvy. I love computers, but
- this is frustrating. There we go. I got it.
- So you can kind of see one latent here. It's
- 14 rounded. And you can kind of see another latent here.
- 15 It's rounded. So if you look -- the first one, if you
- look above the rounded section, you'll see one. And the
- second one, if you look below it you'll see a rounded
- area. Those are the latents. You don't see them very
- well until they're pulled off that surface and put on a
- 20 contrasting background.
- 21 Q All right. I'm now gonna show you State's Exhibit 2.
- I mean -- I'm sorry. State's Exhibit 8.
- 23 A That is my "latent print lift number 2." I had
- two. One from the west door, one from the east door.

- 1 Both on the interior side.
- 2 This is a great example of applying powder and
- 3 not getting anything but blah. If you can look on the
- 4 vertical metal beams where it says "push," you can see
- 5 it's just -- it's convoluted.
- Q And also, it appears that the bottom right of the
- 7 photo, there seems to be a lot of -- a lot of powder there as
- 8 well?
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q And would that be more, I guess as you put it, blah?
- 11 A It could be that or can could be a wear in the
- 12 glass where the powder's adhering as well. So --
- 13 Q All right. What do you do with the latents when
- 14 you're done with -- when you've -- after you've put the tape
- on the door?
- 16 A The latents are recovered. They're put on a
- contrasting background, which in this case would be a
- latent print card. And on that latent print card, there's
- 19 some information that needs to be filled out: The event
- 20 number of the case; the person that's recovering the
- latent, which would be myself; the event number; and the
- location from which -- obviously, the location of where
- we're at; the victim's name; and the location of which or
- 24 where that latent was recovered from.

- 1 Q And can you tell us what the event number was for
- 2 this case?
- 3 A It was 1401222866.
- 4 Q And does each event -- does each Metro event assigned
- 5 its own number?
- 6 A Yes, each -- each call that Metro receives or
- 7 responds to is assigned an event number for that day. So
- 8 this was event number 2866 of that day.
- 9 MR. PALAL: Court's indulgence.
- 10 THE COURT: Sure.
- MR. PALAL: State will pass the witness, Your Honor.
- 12 THE COURT: Cross-examination?
- 13 CROSS-EXAMINATION OF MONTE SPOOR
- 14 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 15 Q Officer Spoor --
- 16 A Yes, sir.
- 17 Q -- you've had direct interaction with the employee,
- then, or were you interacting with other Metro officers to get
- 19 your direction on where to take the latent print?
- 20 A Interacting with Detective Pasos [phonetic].
- 21 Q And he told you where to get these prints from.
- 22 A Yes, sir.
- 23 Q And so based upon those interactions that you had
- 24 with the detective, you believe that the prints that you were

- able to develop at both the 1 and 2 tape locations were
- 2 relevant to the investigation.
- 3 A They would be relevant in that the information I
- 4 was given is the suspect came to enter -- entered and left
- 5 out those doors. Yes, sir.
- 6 Q And you preserved those for analysis?
- 7 A Yes, sir, I did.
- 8 MR. CLAUS: Okay. Thank you. No further questions.
- 9 MR. PALAL: Nothing --
- 10 THE COURT: Anything else from the State?
- MR. PALAL: No, Your Honor.
- 12 THE COURT: No questions from the jury?
- 13 Thank you very much, sir. We appreciate your
- 14 time. Have a nice afternoon.
- 15 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- 16 THE COURT: Next witness.
- MR. LEXIS: State calls Analyst Fletcher.
- THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, we are just trying
- this new technology for the first time. So we apologize
- for our hiccups as we try to make it work. We used to
- 21 have touch screens like Howard Cosell used 20 years ago.
- But those were, apparently, no longer the state of the art
- or even working very well.
- 24 SHAWN FLETCHER,

- 1 [having been called as a witness and being first duly
- 2 sworn testified as follows:]
- 3 THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated.
- 4 Please state and spell your name for the record.
- 5 THE WITNESS: It's Shawn Fletcher. It's S-H-A-W-N and
- F-L-E-T-C-H-E-R.
- 7 THE COURT: You will see there are some M&Ms in the
- 8 dispenser. There's water in the pitcher. If you would
- 9 like some coffee, the marshal can help you with that.
- 10 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- MR. LEXIS: May I proceed, Your Honor?
- 12 THE COURT: You may.
- 13 DIRECT EXAMINATION OF SHAWN FLETCHER
- 14 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 15 Q Where do you work, ma'am?
- 16 A I work for Las Vegas Metropolitan Police
- 17 Department as a Senior Crime Scene Analyst.
- 18 Q How long have you worked there?
- 19 A Nineteen and a half years.
- Q What do you do?
- 21 A I'm a Senior Crime Scene Analyst. The crime
- scene analyst respond to the crime scenes, usually at
- patrol officers' or detectives' request. We process the
- crime scenes, which means we do all the photography, all

- the evidence collection, and all the latent print
- 2 processing that needs to be done on the scene.
- Q What kind of training and experience have you
- 4 received over the years?
- 5 A I have a bachelor's degree in cardiac rehab and
- 6 nutrition and I have an associate's degree in criminal
- 7 justice. We go through a crime scene analyst academy when
- 8 we get hired. And then we have an extensive field
- 9 training program.
- We often get sent to classes and retraining in
- 11 photography; any type of crime scene processing; latent
- print processing, which is the fingerprint processing;
- death investigations; fire investigations; trauma
- investigations. And then a lot of it's on-the-job
- 15 training. We do a lot of in-house training. And then
- 16 every day, basically, crime scene after crime scene.
- 17 Q And what is a latent print?
- 18 A A latent print is basically a fingerprint that's
- 19 left behind on a surface. You secrete different things --
- 20 amino acids, fatty acids -- you touch your face, anything
- 21 that will get stuck to your finger that you can transfer
- onto a surface is going to leave a latent print.
- And "latent print" just means it's a hidden
- print. "Latent" means "hidden." So we need to usually do

- something to that print to make it visible so that we can
- 2 recover it.
- 3 Q Okay. What type of factors go into determining
- 4 whether or not you could recover a suitable print?
- 5 A Well, a lot of people have dry hands. So if your
- 6 hands are really dry, your probably not gonna have any of
- 7 that moisture. Most of the fingerprint is just water. So
- 8 it evaporates very quickly.
- 9 If you're touching your forehead a lot or your
- arms, you may get some oils on there. And, you know, you
- can leave behind oils. So any type of powder that we
- would use is gonna react with some of those moisture
- things.
- But there's a lot of things that can affect that.
- 15 If you have dry hands, you're probably not gonna leave a
- 16 print. If you have a rough surface, it's probably not
- gonna maintain a print either. People wear gloves, if
- you've got something over your hands, you're not gonna
- leave a print. If you're sweating too much, you might not
- leave a print because you're gonna have a lot of
- 21 distortion and we're just gonna kind of see the water
- 22 marks from the print.
- 23 Anything like that can kind of not help anybody
- leave prints. And sometimes people don't -- they just

- don't touch anything in the right way. If you don't grab
- 2 something and you're swiping or just pushing it you can
- 3 smudge prints. And then a lot of times if something's
- 4 handled quite often, you're gonna get prints on top of
- 5 prints on top of prints. And they can't do a whole lot
- 6 with that because it's hard to separate the prints.
- 7 Q So it's more difficult in, say, a commercial
- 8 establishment to find a print, given the amount of people that
- 9 go in and out?
- 10 A Yes, it's usually more difficult.
- 11 Q And let's say, for example, you're in a room of 12
- people, is it possible for all 12 people to leave a suitable
- 13 print?
- 14 A It's possible for all 12 people to leave a print.
- 15 It's possible that none of them would leave a print.
- 16 Q So it's also possible that none of them leave a
- 17 print.
- 18 A Correct.
- 19 Q Ma'am, were you dispatched on January 28th, 2014, to
- the Metro PCS store at 6663 Smoke Ranch?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q Is that here in Las Vegas, Nevada, Clark County?
- 23 A It is.
- Q I'm showing you what is marked as State's Exhibit 11.

- What is that a picture of, ma'am?
- 2 A That's the front of the store. The west -- this
- is gonna be the west -- can you draw on this one?
- 4 THE COURT: You can. You have to use the mouse.
- 5 THE WITNESS: Oh, okay.
- THE COURT: It's new technology. So you're not the
- 7 only one having trouble today.
- 8 THE WITNESS: Well, the only door you see, that's the
- 9 west door.
- Oh, I see. How's that? Okay. This is the west
- 11 door. Right here. Oops. Okay. That's touchy.
- 12 BY MR. LEXIS:
- Q Okay. For the record, you put a circle over --
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q -- what you're saying is the west door?
- 16 A Correct.
- 17 Q Okay. Is that a Metro police car outside?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q And is that tape to preserve the area?
- 20 A That's correct. That's the crime scene tape.
- Q Ma'am, I'm showing you what is marked as
- 22 State's Exhibit 12. What is that a picture of?
- 23 A This is the inside of the store and the service
- counter and lobby area.

- 1 Q Is that also tape on there to preserve the area?
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q Did you examine these areas?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q What areas did you examine?
- A Normally, I look at everything. I'll usually get
- 7 some guidance from either the detective or the officer and
- 8 then also sometimes from the employees, as to the areas
- 9 that the suspect was in or touched or handled or anything
- 10 like that.
- 11 Q Any particular area you lifted a print off of?
- 12 A This -- lost it again. The demo phone at the end
- 13 of the --
- 14 Q I think you need to click it again, ma'am, for the --
- 15 A Oh, there we go. This demo phone right here, I
- 16 got prints on.
- 17 Q For the record, you're putting a circle over the demo
- 18 phone?
- 19 A Yes. It's attached to the countertop there.
- Q Okay. Ma'am, I'm showing you State's Exhibit 14.
- 21 What is that ma'am?
- 22 A That's just a close-up of the same phone.
- 23 Q At the exact location that you circled previously?
- 24 A Yes, except the south end of the service counter

- 1 there.
- 2 Q And I'm showing you State's Exhibit 13. What is this
- 3 a picture of, ma'am?
- 4 A This is from behind the counter. So this area
- 5 over here -- I'm not very good at this. The area at the
- far left, that's going to be where that phone is. And
- 7 this is just the -- you can see the cash drawer in the
- 8 middle there. That is the drawer that was disturbed.
- 9 Q So fair to say, where I'm pointing over here --
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q -- is where the demo phone was?
- 12 A Yes, it's right up on that top counter.
- 2 Showing you what is --
- 14 A Sorry.
- 15 Q -- excuse me.
- 16 A How are you doing that? Okay. I'm probably
- doing the wrong way. Okay.
- 18 Q Go ahead, ma'am. Now you can circle it for us.
- 19 A That phone is going to be right down here, but on
- the customer side of the counter.
- 21 Q All right. For the record, you're making a circle
- where that demo phone was.
- 23 A Yes.
- MR. LEXIS: Let the record reflect I'm showing

- opposing counsel State Proposed 15.
- 2 May I approach, Your Honor?
- 3 THE COURT: You may.
- 4 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 5 Q Ma'am, I'm showing you what has been marked as
- 6 State's Proposed Exhibit 15. What is it?
- 7 A This is the cell phone. This is the demo cell
- 8 phone.
- 9 Q True and accurate representation of what it looked
- 10 like on that day?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q And is that your stuff on there?
- 13 A It is.
- MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, I move to admit --
- 15 THE COURT: Any objection?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- 17 THE COURT: Be admitted.
- [STATE'S EXHIBIT 15 ADMITTED]
- MR. LEXIS: And this one published, Your Honor?
- THE COURT: You may.
- 21 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 22 Q And describe for us what that is.
- 23 A This is the phone. This is my fingerprint tape,
- all these different pieces that you see here, with the

- corresponding numbers. The way the process works is it's
- 2 a powder that I was using in this particular case. And
- 3 it's applied with a brush to the phone with the hopes that
- 4 the powder is gonna adhere to the moisture that's left
- 5 behind in the fingerprint.
- 6 Once we see that something -- that powder has
- adhered to that area, we use just a piece of tape. It's
- 8 basically Scotch Tape. But it's a forensic fingerprint
- 9 tape. And we will place that over the individual prints.
- 10 So in this particular case, I saw five specific
- areas that had fingerprints. And so they got numbered
- accordingly, just to keep it consistent with tracking and
- the photography, so they could identify them later. And
- once that tape gets adhered down, I take this picture,
- showing the locations of them. And then I will remove
- those individual pieces of tape and they get placed on a
- white fingerprint card.
- And the contrast, you'll be able to see my black
- fingerprint powder in the shape of the ridge detail of the
- fingerprint on the card. And that's how the fingerprints
- get lifted. That's how we call that we recovered them or
- 22 we lifted them.
- 23 Q This is the demo phone?
- 24 A Yes.

- 1 Q Safe to say many people have touched this phone?
- 2 A I would assume so, yes.
- 3 Q And how many prints were you able to lift off this
- 4 phone?
- 5 A I got five different lifts. So there may be a
- 6 couple prints on each lift. But there were five lifts.
- 7 Q So only five lifts?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q And when someone picks up the phone, does it also
- take into consideration a problem that might occur when --
- whether or not you're gonna find a print as far as how you
- 12 hold a phone?
- 13 A Yes, how you hold it. With these phones, you
- know, they're smart phones, so you're sliding and moving
- around on the screen. So that can obscure a lot of the
- prints or smear the prints. They're actual quite fragile,
- most of the time. So if I, you know, were to grab this
- phone right now and do something with it, I may be swiping
- and moving around and just smudging my own prints.
- In this particular case, you know, I -- I -- most
- of the front of the phone had prints on it. So there are
- prints there that were recovered. But they're -- you
- know, they may or may not be smudged or they may or may
- not be identifiable. And they may also be several prints

- on top of prints. And sometimes that's difficult.
- 2 Q And is that on top of the sweat factor or how dry
- 3 your hands are?
- 4 A Yes, all of that will come into play with that
- 5 too.
- 6 Q Including how dirty the phone is?
- 7 A Yes.
- 8 Q Including how the person touched the phone?
- 9 A Correct.
- 10 Q Including the surface factor?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q Just because you get a suitable print, is that always
- a good enough print for the expert to analyze?
- 14 A No.
- 15 Q And why do you say that?
- 16 A Well, the -- we will get, sometimes, just real
- tiny small portions of a print. And it may be nice and
- clear but it may not be enough to actually identify it to
- any specific person. If we get a nice, full, complete
- print, a lot of times that can be run through what we call
- our AFI system, which is our Automated Fingerprint System.
- And we can sometimes get a hit on a person that's
- already in the system. But that takes a really good,
- 24 pretty much a full print. So sometimes there's just not

- enough there to actually identify it to a specific person.
- 2 There's just not enough detail.
- 3 Q Did you try to recover any other prints, ma'am?
- 4 A I believe I printed the door.
- 5 Q And did that lead to anything?
- A No, it did not.
- 7 Q Does that surprise you?
- 8 A No.
- 9 Q Why do you say that?
- 10 A Well, in the businesses, quite frequently,
- 11 especially busy businesses like cell phone places, you
- 12 know, they're not cleaning the doors every five minutes.
- 13 The clerks are busy. So unless somebody's going out and
- cleaning these doors, a lot of times we have a really hard
- time getting prints on the doors because they're touched
- so often.
- 17 It also depends on the type of handle that's on
- the doors. The handles that are on the outside that, you
- know, when you pull open, you know, they're out in the
- weather all day. They're getting beat up by the sun. So
- those surfaces are usually not very good because they're
- worn and rough. That metal on door handles gets worn and
- 23 it gets pitted. So a lot of the door handles -- the push
- handles, the pull handles -- a lot of those aren't very

- 1 good.
- 2 People don't often push open the glass, but they
- 3 do. And where they do, that kind of gets -- happens in
- 4 the same spot every time, so you -- prints over prints
- 5 over prints. So the doors are just -- you know, they're
- 6 used all day long, in and out, and they're never cleaned.
- 7 MR. LEXIS: Thank you, ma'am. No further questions.
- 8 THE COURT: Cross-examination?
- 9 CROSS-EXAMINATION OF SHAWN FLETCHER
- 10 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 11 Q Ms. Fletcher, do you remember any of the specifics of
- the doors in this particular location?
- 13 A Specifics --
- 14 Q How the door handles were pitted? Were they worn?
- Were they --
- 16 A I don't recall.
- 17 Q -- you know [inaudible] any print?
- 18 A I don't recall specifically in this case, no.
- 19 Q And indeed, generally speaking, when prints are
- gathered from individuals that are being processed by Metro
- for one reason or another, glass is a preferred medium to have
- them place their palms or fingers upon to gain the best
- possible print; correct?
- A Yes. Glass can be very good, especially if it's

- 1 clean.
- 2 Q In fact, it is the preferred medium. It is what
- 3 Metro uses to gather prints; correct?
- 4 A They may. I don't go down there and do that part
- of the job. So not quite sure how they're recovering the
- 6 prints nowadays. But --
- 7 Q And you don't have any independent knowledge of the
- 8 crime scene investigation. You basically show up and then
- 9 print what you're told to print.
- 10 A Yeah, usually it's -- it's kind of a
- 11 collaborative effort. The detectives or the officers will
- tell us what they found out. They're usually there quite
- a bit before we get there. They'll do their investigation
- and they'll pass on whatever information they gleaned. A
- 15 lot of times I'm able to talk to the victims or to the
- 16 clerk and I may get a little bit more. And then sometimes
- 17 we have video.
- 18 And I don't believe I saw video in this
- 19 particular case. So I would have gained my information
- 20 either from the clerks or the detectives and the patrol
- 21 officer.
- 22 Q Do you remember, specifically, how you gained your
- 23 information in this case?
- 24 A I don't remember exactly, with this. I had, you

- 1 know, generally, again, it's the patrol officer who I'm
- 2 usually dealing with.
- 3 Q So if there was video in this case, is it possible
- 4 you might have gathered your information from that --
- 5 A It's possible, yes.
- 6 Q And based upon wherever you were getting this
- 7 information from, you decided that you needed to -- or it
- 8 was -- it was decided -- who makes the final decision of what
- you attempt to get latent prints from and what you don't?
- 10 A Oh, I do.
- 11 Q Okay.
- 12 A Yeah.
- 2 So you decided to get latent prints from the demo
- phone and from the doors; correct?
- 15 A Correct. I did not recover any from the door.
- 16 But I do believe I processed the door.
- 17 Q Okay.
- 18 MR. CLAUS: No further questions, Your Honor.
- 19 THE COURT: Anything else?
- MR. LEXIS: No, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: From the jury?
- Thank you, ma'am. We appreciate your time. Have
- 23 a good afternoon.
- Next witness.

- 1 MR. PALAL: Your Honor, State calls
- 2 Heather Gouldthorpe to the stand.
- 3 HEATHER GOULDTHORPE,
- 4 [having been called as a witness and being first duly
- 5 sworn testified as follows:]
- THE CLERK: Please be seated.
- 7 Please state and spell your name for the record.
- 8 THE WITNESS: My name's Heather Gouldthorpe. Heather,
- 9 H-E-A-T-H-E-R, and Gouldthorpe, G-O-U-L-D-T-H-O-R-P-E.
- THE COURT: And, ma'am, you will notice there are some
- 11 M&Ms in the dispenser next to you. There's water in the
- 12 pitcher. If you should need some coffee, let the marshal
- 13 know.
- 14 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- 15 THE COURT: You may proceed.
- 16 DIRECT EXAMINATION OF HEATHER GOULDTHORPE
- 17 BY MR. PALAL:
- 18 Q Ms. Gouldthorpe, how are you employed?
- 19 A I'm a forensic scientist in the Latent Print Unit
- 20 at the Las Vegas Metropolitan Police Department Forensic
- 21 Lab.
- 22 Q And do you -- do you have any education to have that
- 23 job?
- 24 A I have my bachelor's degree in sociology and my

- 1 master's degree in forensic science.
- 2 Q All right. Do you have any training for your job?
- 3 A Yes. I started out at the laboratory as a
- 4 Forensic Lab Technologist, where I learned the basics of
- fingerprint comparisons. I learn how to analyze latent
- 6 prints, enter them into our AFI system, which is our
- 7 Automated Fingerprint Identification System. Search that
- 8 system. And then also to recover latent prints from items
- 9 of evidence.
- I then went on to promote to Forensic Scientist
- 11 Trainee, where I spent a year studying how to do more
- complex comparisons, how to issue conclusions with the
- comparisons that I did, and how to render reports.
- 14 Q All right. And how long have you been working in
- 15 this capacity?
- 16 A I've been at the laboratory as a technologist
- for -- or since I was a technologist for, like, nine
- 18 years. Sorry.
- 19 Q Now, we've already heard testimony as to what a
- latent print is. Can you briefly tell us what a latent print
- 21 is.
- 22 A Yes. You'll notice the skin on the hands of
- 23 your -- the palms of your hands and the soles of your
- feet. It's a different type of skin than the rest of your

- skin. This is called friction ridge skin. Residue coats
- 2 these ridges. And if you happen to touch a surface, you
- 3 have the potential to leave behind a replication of those
- 4 ridges. And that often has to be either chemically or
- 5 powder processed to be visualized.
- 6 Q Now, to be clear, you're not the person that goes out
- 7 and processes the prints.
- 8 A No.
- 9 Q Ma'am, in your experience -- looking around this
- 10 courtroom, there's about 25 people in this courtroom. Would
- 11 you be surprised if everybody in this courtroom left a latent
- 12 print in this courtroom?
- 13 A Would I about surprised if they did?
- 14 Q If they did.
- 15 A If they did, yes.
- Q Would you be surprised if nobody left a latent print
- in this courtroom?
- 18 A No, I wouldn't be surprised at that either.
- 19 Q What makes you come to those conclusions?
- 20 A Not every time you touch a surface are you gonna
- leave behind a latent print. There's several factors to
- this. Part of it is the condition of your skin. Are your
- 23 hands dry? Are they oily? What type of -- how much
- residue is on that skin?

- 1 And then there's surface factors. What type
- 2 and -- surface are you touching? Is it textured? Is it
- 3 too small to recover something off of? And then how you
- 4 touch it. Do you just lightly touch it like you would
- 5 hold every day object or do you put your hand and move it
- 6 around so it's distorted?
- 7 And then there's also environmental factors. So
- 8 if you leave something out in the desert or in the heat of
- 9 the summer, obviously, the heat will dry up any water
- 10 residue that would be there. And latent prints and sweat
- and all that is primarily made of water. So --
- 12 Q Now, in -- while performing your job duties, were you
- assigned a packet of latent prints related to a robbery series
- 14 from requester named Jeffrey Smith?
- 15 A Yes, I was.
- 16 Q Now, what do you do when you get assigned prints to
- 17 examine?
- 18 A The first thing we do is we pull the evidence
- from our secured location. We move it into our custody to
- 20 maintain the chain of custody that we have. Then we
- inventory each packet to make sure that what is said that
- is in that packet is truly indeed in there. Then we
- 23 screen the latent prints to determine whether or not they
- are suitable for us to make a comparison with.

- 1 Q And did you go through that process for this case?
- 2 A I did.
- 3 Q Or for that particular packet?
- 4 A Correct.
- 5 Q And what were your conclusions or what did you do
- 6 when you got the packet? What -- were you able to draw any
- 7 conclusions from opening the packet of latent fingerprints?
- 8 A Which --
- 9 Q I'm sorry. It's for --
- 10 A -- which event is this --
- 11 Q I'm sorry. For lab case number 14-01721.
- 12 A May I refer to my report?
- 13 Q Yes.
- THE COURT: If that will assist you in refreshing your
- 15 recollection, please feel free to do so.
- THE WITNESS: Thank you. And that was 14-1 -- 01721?
- 17 BY MR. PALAL:
- 18 Q 01721, yes.
- 19 A Okay. In that packet, there were two lift cards.
- I've entered the prints that were in those, that were
- suitable, I entered those into our AFI system, which is
- our Automated Fingerprint Identification System. I then
- got a positive hit in our system.
- And what that is, is it's a searching tool. So

- there's a database of fingerprints that we search against.
- 2 And I entered the print. I manually encode it. So I tell
- 3 the system what to look for. I then get a candidate list
- 4 back and then I have to go one by one on each candidate
- 5 list and look at the candidate list.
- And in this particular case, I did get a
- 7 potential hit. What I do is then I take the ID number
- 8 that's assigned to that latent print or to that candidate
- 9 list. I take that ID number and then I go and pull the
- 10 prints.
- And then I get a hard copy of the latent print or
- the fingerprint exemplars and then I do a manual side by
- 13 side comparison. So I'm looking at ridge -- at the ridge
- detail in the latent prints and then I'm comparing that,
- 15 side by side, against the ridge detail in the exemplar
- print. And in this case, I did get identification.
- 17 Q And for whom did you get an identification for?
- 18 A Samuel Echeverria.
- 19 Q All right. Now, that was the first lift card. Was
- there a second lift card as well?
- 21 A There was, yes.
- 22 Q And did you try to -- did you analyze that
- 23 fingerprint? I'm sorry.
- 24 A I did. It did not belong to -- I excluded

- 1 Samuel Echeverria and I entered that into the AFI system
- 2 and I did not get a -- any -- I got a negative hit. So it
- 3 means I did not hit to any candidates on that list.
- 4 Q I am now going to turn your attention to lab case
- 5 number 14-07126. Did you go through a similar process in
- 6 analyzing fingerprints recovered for that lab case?
- 7 A I did.
- 8 Q And what were the results?
- 9 A Initially, there was no prints in there that were
- able to be put through our AFI system. So then I had
- 11 received a request to compare Kenny Splond against the
- 12 prints that were in that case.
- Q Did -- I'm sorry. Did any of the prints match
- 14 Mr. Splond?
- 15 A I excluded Kenny Splond from three of the five
- prints that were in there. Two of the five prints were
- 17 not suitable for comparison purposes.
- 18 Q And what is "not suitable for a comparison" mean?
- 19 A We have to have enough information in the latent
- 20 prints. So we need to have enough -- the quantity, the
- 21 quality, and the specificity of information has to be
- there. A lot of times they'll recover bits and pieces of
- ridge detail. And it's just not enough information for us
- to confidently carry on to our comparison process.

- 1 Q So even if somebody actually does leave a latent
- 2 print, that may not be good enough to compare.
- 3 A That's correct.
- 4 Q And people may touch items and not leave a latent
- 5 print.
- 6 A Correct.
- 7 MR. PALAL: Court's indulgence.
- 8 State will pass the witness.
- 9 THE COURT: Cross-examination?
- 10 MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 11 Court's indulgence.
- 12 CROSS-EXAMINATION OF HEATHER GOULDTHORPE
- 13 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 14 Q Ms. Gouldthorpe, in fact, in -- let's -- let's talk
- first about lab case number 14-01721. You said that there was
- 16 a candidate list that was generated there.
- 17 A That's correct.
- 18 Q Okay. And do you keep track of which candidates are
- 19 generated by AFIS?
- A No, we do not.
- 21 Q Do you remember who those candidates were?
- 22 A No, I do not.
- 23 Q Do you remember about how many people are in the
- candidate list that was generated by AFIS?

- 1 A The candidate list that we request is about 15
- 2 candidates.
- 3 Q Is that a duplicatable candidate list, then. So if
- 4 you wandered down to your lab and did the same search, would
- 5 AFIS then generate that same candidate list?
- 6 A Not to my knowledge. Given the fact that new --
- 7 new people enter the system every day. If somebody
- 8 searches it in a different way than I search it -- because
- 9 I am manually encoding it -- another analyst might
- 10 manually encode it slightly different than me to get a
- 11 different set of candidate -- candidates on that list.
- 12 Q I'm sorry. Maybe my question was imprecise. If you
- went down to your lab today and did the same search that you
- did on -- let's see here -- on or about February 5th of 2014,
- would it generate the same list of people or would it be a
- 16 bigger list of people, potentially?
- 17 A It would be the same number of candidates. The
- number of candidates is -- is something that we determined
- as a laboratory that we would search. Given that we have
- a new system, it's got new algorithms, so the list would
- 21 be different.
- Also, there's other people that enter the system
- since 2014, when I did this case, that could potentially
- 24 be on that candidate list.

- 1 Q Does anyone every leave that system, to your
- 2 knowledge?
- 3 A Not -- well, if they have their records sealed.
- 4 Then their records would be pulled out of there.
- 5 Q So that would be the only way?
- 6 A Correct.
- 7 Q My understanding of those was AFIS was a federal
- 8 database; is that incorrect?
- 9 A There are different levels. They have the local
- 10 level, which is controlled by the Las Vegas Metropolitan
- 11 Police Department. Then we have the state level, which
- is, basically, the State of Nevada and it's -- it's
- located within the Western Identification Network, which
- is the State of Nevada, the State of Idaho, Alaska,
- Oregon, Washington, and Utah. And then we have the
- 16 California State database that we can search. And then we
- do have the federal level that we can search through
- 18 IAFIS.
- In this particular case, at the time, we weren't
- searching IAFIS. So it was not a federal search at this
- 21 point.
- 22 Q So this was just a local search.
- 23 A This was just a local search.
- Q Okay. How do you make a determination which of the

- candidates you're going to compare manually?
- 2 A Well, like I said, on screen, I determine whether
- or not I get a positive hit or a negative hit. What I do
- 4 on screen is do an on-screen comparison. I see if I have
- 5 enough information on there that I think is a -- I can
- 6 call it a positive. Then I will pull that record to
- 7 manually compare.
- If I look and I don't see enough information to
- 9 say it was a positive hit, it would then be a negative
- 10 hit. And in this case, that I was -- the case I was
- 11 talking about, I did get a negative hit in the cases.
- 12 Q So the very first time you ran the search, the -- you
- didn't get any positive results?
- 14 A The first -- no, on one of the lift -- one of the
- 15 latent prints, when I ran it into the system, I got
- 16 negative results on that. And it was --
- 17 Q Okay.
- 18 A -- excluded from both Samuel Echeverria and
- 19 Kenny Splond.
- 20 Q Okay. There were -- there were two lift cards that
- 21 you ran reports for; correct?
- 22 A Correct. On this case, yes.
- 23 Q Okay. And both of those lift cards would have
- 24 generated separate candidate lists; correct?

- 1 A Correct.
- 2 Q And you didn't keep a listing of those candidates
- 3 that were generated.
- 4 A No, we didn't.
- 5 Q And you don't remember who those candidates were that
- 6 were generated.
- 7 A No, I didn't.
- 8 Q Okay. And to the extent that they were generated,
- 9 I'm talking about Q1 on the very first lift card --
- 10 A One?
- 11 Q -- okay?
- 12 A Right.
- 13 Q And, to your knowledge, there is no way of
- 14 regenerating those exact results today.
- 15 A No.
- 16 Q And as you sit here, you don't remember how many
- 17 positive results you got back for Q1.
- 18 A I identified it to Samuel Echeverria. That was
- 19 the positive result that I got. That was the one I ran,
- got a positive hit. And then I compared -- on lift card
- 21 Q1, there was actually three suitable latent prints on
- that card.
- I -- once I got that positive association, I then
- compared it, identified it to one of the fingers of

- 1 Samuel Echeverria. Sorry if I'm really blowing his name.
- 2 And then I also identified the other two latent prints in
- 3 that case to Samuel Echeverria.
- 4 Q With the belief that they'd been formed at the same
- 5 time; is that correct?
- 6 A Correct.
- 7 Q And then the third print, it was suitable for entry
- 8 into your AFIS database?
- 9 A The --
- 10 Q I'm sorry. The second print. Pardon me.
- 11 A The -- the second -- Q2?
- 12 Q I'm getting myself confused.
- 13 A Yes, it was. I excluded Samuel Echeverria, also
- excluded Kenny Splond. And then I did search it through
- our AFI system with negative results.
- 16 Q And not trying to confuse you, but do you remember
- that you actually ran the report two different times and
- generated two different -- well, two different reports of
- 19 examinations?
- 20 A Yes, I did.
- Q Okay. And so the first time that you ran it through
- the AFI system, obviously you felt it had enough points to be
- entered into the AFI system for a search?
- 24 A Correct.

- 1 Q What's a minimum criteria for an entry into the AFIS
- 2 database?
- 3 A It's the -- the minimum criteria? We have
- 4 guidelines that are set by our laboratory. It's something
- 5 that we came up with as a laboratory standard for us only.
- And our criteria was, at that time, 12 minutiae points and
- 7 distal determination of up and then we have to determine
- 8 whether or not it has either a focal point, which is
- 9 either a core, which is like the middle part of the print,
- or a delta area, which is basically a triangle area in the
- 11 print.
- 12 Q What is a minutiae point for the purposes of this
- 13 discussion?
- 14 A So our ridges, they're not straight up and down,
- 15 they're not horizontal. They do -- they have a flow to
- them. And when you trace that ridge out, it either does
- something. It either stops, which would be a ridge
- 18 ending, or it merges into another ridge or divides into
- 19 two ridges. And those would be bifurcations. Or it's a
- small ridge, so it has a short ridge. Those would be
- 21 minutiae points that we plot.
- 22 Q And so this second print had enough of those minutiae
- 23 points and enough -- I'm sorry. What was the secondary
- characteristic that made it eligible for entry into the AFIS

- 1 database?
- 2 A It has to -- we have to have distal orientation
- 3 known and a focal point. So either a core or delta or
- 4 something that we can have a focal point there.
- 5 Q So the first time that you wrote a report of your
- 6 examination, you just ran the print through your AFIS database
- 7 and you return a negative results.
- 8 A Correct.
- 9 Q Okay. But the second time you were specifically
- 10 requested to do an examination for Mr. Splond.
- 11 A Correct.
- 12 Q Okay. And that was approximately two months later,
- month and a half later; is that correct?
- 14 A I believe so. Something like that.
- 15 Q Would it help to refresh your recollection to show
- you a copy of your report or do you have it in front of you?
- 17 A I have the -- the second -- secondary report. I
- don't have the first report.
- 19 Q May I approach and see what you've got up there --
- THE COURT: You may.
- MR. CLAUS: -- as well, please? Thank you.
- Thank you, Your Honor.
- BY MR. CLAUS:
- 24 Q And so you were specifically requested to do a

- comparison with Mr. Splond. Was this an automated comparison
- or was this a manual comparison you did yourself?
- 3 A It's a manual comparison that I did.
- 4 Q Okay. And you had Mr. Splond's fingerprints.
- 5 A Yes.
- Q Okay. And you came to the conclusion that Mr. Splond
- 7 could be excluded from that fingerprint labeled "Q2."
- 8 A Correct.
- 9 Q So, to your knowledge, of all the fingerprints that
- were taken from your lab -- from -- from -- I suppose we could
- 11 say this would be -- do you know where these were taken from,
- 12 these -- these lifts?
- 13 A I have what was reported on the lift card. Every
- time we get a lift card in, it has a description of where
- it came from. And on there it says it was taken from the
- interior west side of the north facing glass entrance
- door.
- 18 Q Does it say whether these were taken from a
- 19 Cricket Wireless for from a Metro PCS?
- 20 A It does on the outside of the packet, which is
- contained in my notes, but I don't --
- 22 Q And --
- 23 A -- reflect that. If I look at my notes --
- Q Would you like to look at your notes to refresh your

- 1 recollection?
- 2 A Could I -- yeah.
- 3 Q Would it help you to do so?
- 4 A Thank you.
- 5 MR. CLAUS: Your Honor, with the State's permission,
- 6 we'll just enter into a stipulation that these lift cards
- 7 [inaudible] Cricket Wireless.
- 8 THE COURT: Right. You accept that stipulation?
- 9 MR. PALAL: Yes, Your Honor.
- 10 THE COURT: Okay. Both cards came from the Cricket.
- 11 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 12 Q Now, moving on, you also wrote in a -- a report of
- examination for latent prints, lab case number 14-01726. Can
- we just call it 726 for sake of brevity?
- 15 A Yes.
- Q Okay. And in that report, you had -- did you write
- two reports there as well?
- 18 A I did. The first report that I wrote, it was a
- 19 report that said that the latent prints in this packet
- were not suitable for an AFIS search. And if a manual
- comparison was needed at some point in time, to submit a
- request for that. And that happened. I was asked to
- 23 request -- to compare against Kenny Splond.
- Q Okay. And ultimately, you decided that three of

- those five prints were suitable for comparison purposes.
- 2 A That's correct.
- 3 Q Now, as part of that comparison, you go through and
- 4 you create notes, bench notes for yourself; correct?
- 5 A That's correct, yes.
- Q And in these bench notes, you document where these
- 7 lifts came from; is that correct?
- 8 A Right. What our -- what we do with the notes is,
- basically, we make a copy of the outside of the lift card.
- 10 So on the lift card, it documents where they came from,
- which is written by the crime scene analyst who recovers
- 12 the latent prints.
- And then it also has my documentation on there
- saying what I numbered it. Because I number them Q1, Q2,
- 15 Q3, Q4, and Q5, along with my initials. And then if I
- determine a latent print is suitable, I will make mark it
- with a designator. In this case it's a fingerprint. So
- it's an arch over the finger with the letter "A."
- 19 Q Okay. And showing you State's Exhibit Number 15,
- 20 this is -- have you seen this photograph before?
- 21 A I have not.
- 22 Q Okay. Directing your attention -- let's -- let's
- zoom in here a little bit. Generally speaking, even though
- you don't know the specifics of this photograph, what are we

- generally looking at here?
- 2 A From my knowledge, this is what the crime scene
- analysts take a picture of. So their 1, 2, 3, would be in
- 4 relation to what their lift cards would be. So when they
- 5 take off tape lift number 1, they put it on a card and
- 6 then that card is their "1." And then same with 2, 3, and
- 4 or how many ever is on that photograph. I see 1, 2, and
- 8 3 right there.
- 9 Q Well, and we can -- we can move it up, if that makes
- 10 it a little easier.
- 11 A Yeah. So all five of those, to my knowledge,
- would correspond to the lift cards that were turned into
- 13 the -- on this case.
- 14 Q All right. This seems to be [inaudible]. It's a
- wonderful thing, technology.
- Okay. Can you see all the numbers there?
- 17 A I do.
- 18 Q Actually, there we go. I think we can see all the
- 19 numbers there; right?
- 20 A Correct.
- Q Okay. So the idea is, is that when the crime scene
- analyst takes these latent fingerprints and put them on these
- tape, they're going to box them up, send them off to you. And
- then you're going to analyze them. And you're going to try to

- use the same numbering scheme that they did; correct?
- 2 A Correct.
- Q Okay. So wherever we see "1" on a piece of tape for
- 4 your purposes of your report, that's where you're going to be
- 5 talking about "Q1"; correct?
- 6 A Correct.
- Q Okay. And where you see "2" on the tape, it's going
- 8 to correspond to "Q2," and so on and so forth until we get
- g down to 5 on the -- on the number 5 on the tape on the screen.
- 10 And then in your report that's going to be "Q5"; correct?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q All right. So in your report, you found that there
- were no suitable latent prints for your comparison purposes in
- 2 and 3; correct?
- 15 A Correct.
- 16 Q So can you take a -- you have that little mouse in
- 17 front of you.
- 18 A Uh-huh.
- 19 Q Can you kind of --
- THE COURT: Ma'am, you're gonna have to click it to
- 21 try and get the indicator to come off, come up for you.
- There you go.
- MR. CLAUS: Brave new world.
- 24 BY MR. CLAUS:

- Q Okay. So can you show us where the Q2 and Q3 tapes
- 2 would be, then.
- 3 A This would be Q2. Sorry about that. And Q3.
- 4 Q You are very detail oriented. With that being said,
- 5 let's -- and, in fact, you have a diagram of that in your
- 6 notes. You tried to mirror that as well; correct?
- 7 A We try to correspond what their number 1 is to
- 8 our Q1, yes.
- 9 Q Okay. And in your notes, you actually say where that
- 10 lift came from; correct?
- 11 A Right. We have a copy of the lift card attached
- 12 to our notes.
- Q Okay. And what I'm -- what I'm -- I suppose what I'm
- trying to get at is even though you've got the numbers around
- the side, the latent print comes from somewhere on the phone;
- 16 correct?
- 17 A Correct.
- 18 Q And it doesn't necessarily correspond to exactly
- 19 where that tape is.
- 20 A Um --
- Q Well, no, that's -- that's badly phrased. That
- tape -- the tapes appear to be overlapping; right? So you
- actually, when you're doing your notes, would identify, based
- upon where that tape is and how it was photographed, where you

- think the latent prints were on the phone itself; correct?
- 2 A What we get is a -- it's basically an index card
- 3 looking -- it looks like an index card with the piece of
- 4 tape on it. And whatever images are contained, or latent
- 5 prints are contained in that tape area is what we look at.
- 6 Q That's good enough. And so what you did is, based
- 7 upon that, you -- you -- you tried to create a -- apology -- I
- 8 map, essentially, of where these latent prints were on the
- 9 phone itself; is that correct?
- 10 A Well, we don't necessarily do that. We just look
- at what's on that lift card. And we see what's in that
- tape area that they turned in. And then we determine
- whether or not there's information that -- on that latent
- to carry on to our comparison process.
- 15 Q Then maybe I'm not understanding. Maybe I can get a
- 16 little more specific for you.
- 17 MR. CLAUS: Splond 42, please.
- 18 Your Honor, may I approach the witness?
- 19 THE COURT: You may. Can I remove the marks off the
- 20 photo on the monitor?
- MR. CLAUS: Uh --
- THE COURT: No? Okay.
- MR. CLAUS: Let's leave them where they are, please,
- just right now, Your Honor.

- 1 /
- 2 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 3 Q Showing you a document. Does -- does this document
- 4 look to be your work product?
- 5 A Yes. And the diagram that you're showing me is
- on the back of that lift card. So it's something that the
- 7 crime scene analyst annotated on the back of their lift
- 8 cards.
- 9 Q Okay. So this is not something that you did, but it
- goes into your report to tell you where the fingerprints are
- 11 coming from.
- 12 A Correct. It's -- it's what the crime scene
- analyst -- it's part of their designations. And we
- 14 contain it within our notes as part of our note taking
- process to show what they collected in their notes.
- 16 Q Okay.
- 17 A Or what they turned into us.
- 18 Q And so to the extent that you wrote your report,
- then, the fingerprints -- the actual location of the latent
- 20 prints would correspond with the numbers in this page?
- 21 A Yeah.
- Q Okay. And did that comport with your own findings,
- when you were going through the tape?
- 24 A What --

- 1 Q As you were going through the tape to identify the
- 2 latent prints, did -- did the numbers that you've put here in
- 3 your report correspond with where the prints were located on
- 4 the phone, essentially?
- 5 A We don't really look at that. What we look at is
- 6 whether or not there's latent print evidence on that tape.
- 7 We don't necessarily -- we just document what's on the
- 8 cards, their diagrams, for purposes of note taking. But
- j it doesn't have any bearing on whether or not a latent
- 10 print is suitable or not suitable for comparison.
- 11 Q Okay. Then maybe come at this another way. Does
- 12 this document -- is this document, then, an accurate
- reflection of the information that you received about the
- location of the latent prints on the page?
- 15 A Yes. Yes, it was.
- 16 Q Okay.
- MR. CLAUS: Your Honor, I'm going to mark this as
- 18 Defense A.
- 19 THE COURT: Okay.
- 20 MR. CLAUS: Move for its admission.
- 21 MR. PALAL: No objection.
- THE COURT: Objection? Be admitted.
- 23 [DEFENDANT'S EXHIBIT A MARKED AND ADMITTED]
- MR. CLAUS: Permission to publish to the jury.

- 1 THE COURT: You may. I've erased the marks.
- 2 MR. CLAUS: I was wandering around [inaudible].
- 3 THE COURT: It's okay.
- 4 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 5 Q So now that we can look at the photograph together,
- 6 this -- this purports to be a sort of diagram of the Galaxy
- 7 phone, where the prints were taken off of; correct?
- 8 A Correct.
- 9 Q Okay. And we can see that the numbers now -- one,
- 10 two, three, four, five -- are now distributed around the
- 11 diagram of the phone itself; correct?
- 12 A Correct.
- 13 Q And so is it your understanding that these numbers --
- one, two, three, four, five -- are meant to correspond with
- approximately where the latent prints were found on the
- 16 device?
- 17 A That's correct.
- 18 Q Okay. Long way. You know what? I'm gonna leave
- that up there for us to talk. I'm gonna leave that up there
- for us to talk. Or perhaps with can do this: If I put this
- exhibit in front of you, can you take this exhibit and, to the
- best of your ability, try and transpose these numbers on to
- what we're looking at on [inaudible].
- 24 A Um --

```
1 Q I know, the [inaudible] --
```

- 2 THE COURT: You want her to write the numbers on the
- 3 screen?
- 4 MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 5 THE COURT: Okay.
- 6 THE WITNESS: Oh, sorry.
- 7 THE COURT: Hold on. Let me erase.
- 8 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 9 Q Thank you. Now, in your report -- so this -- this
- would also correspond to the Q1 through Q5 in your --
- 11 referenced in your report; correct?
- 12 A Correct.
- 13 Q All right. And in your report, you had indicated
- that Q1 was a suitable latent print and you compared that
- against the known prints of Mr. Splond and you excluded him as
- 16 a match; correct?
- 17 A I did, yes.
- Q Okay. Now, Q2 and Q3 -- 2 and 3 -- you said were the
- 19 unsuitable prints; correct?
- 20 A Correct.
- 21 Q Okay. But number 4, you identified as being a
- suitable print. And you also excluded Mr. Splond from number
- 23 4; is that correct?
- 24 A Correct.

- 1 Q All right. And Q5, you did a manual examination
- 2 there as well and excluded Mr. Splond from that print.
- 3 A Correct.
- 4 Q And that was a suitable print as well.
- 5 A It was.
- 6 Q Okay. Now, lots of reasons why you might not leave a
- fingerprint. But obviously, on this device, there were a
- 8 series of fingerprints that were taken off of this device.
- 9 A Correct.
- 10 Q And in your experience, if you're the last person to
- 11 speak -- to touch such a device and there's no one else that
- touches it after you, is it reasonable to expect that you
- might leave a print behind?
- 14 A Not necessarily. Like I said before, every time
- you touch something, you're not necessarily gonna leave
- 16 behind a latent print.
- 17 Q But if you do develop prints from that phone, so that
- there's not so much gunk on the phone that all the prints are
- obscured and you are the last person to touch this phone,
- 20 would it be reasonable to expect that you would be one of the
- 21 prints found?
- 22 A Like I said, not necessarily. If you think of it
- as like a door to your favorite restaurant. Anyone that
- touches that door from the time that restaurant door was

- cleaned to the time that somebody comes and processes it,
- 2 anyone that enters that door to your favorite restaurant
- 3 can potentially leave behind a latent print.
- 4 Q Is this a door to a restaurant?
- 5 A No, but it's --
- O Do you know how many people touched this device?
- 7 A I do not.
- 8 Q Okay. And you did, in fact, get fingerprints off of
- 9 it; correct?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q And you were able to make an examination from those
- 12 fingerprints.
- 13 A Correct.
- Q And so what you're telling the jury is that it's very
- reasonable that the last person to have touched a phone that
- has five different latent prints that have been pulled off of
- it, it's very reasonable, very probable that that person
- wouldn't have left a fingerprint.
- 19 A Can you say that again?
- 20 Q That it's very probable and very reasonable that
- 21 person would not have left a fingerprint.
- 22 A It's possible. It's not necessarily always --
- any time you touch a surface, you're not necessarily
- 24 always gonna leave behind a latent print.

- 1 Q Indeed, anything is possible. But is it probable?
- 2 A It's possible, but, like I said, any time you
- 3 touch a surface, not all the time will you leave behind a
- 4 latent print.
- 5 Q All right. Let's -- let's deal with some of the
- 6 technicals of it: You're familiar with how the fingerprints
- 7 are gathered by Metro.
- 8 A Correct.
- 9 Q And they use glass to do that; correct?
- 10 A How --
- 11 Q They use a glass device to gather the prints;
- 12 correct?
- 13 A The platens that are finger -- that are -- yes.
- Q Okay. In fact, glass is the preferred method for
- gathering fingerprints; correct?
- 16 A It's -- it's a -- definitely a suitable surface,
- 17 yes.
- 18 Q Not -- not -- perhaps not the perfect surface. Is
- there a perfect surface?
- 20 A No.
- 21 Q Okay. Does -- does glass rank up there as being one
- of the best surfaces to get fingerprints from?
- 23 A When you're talking about -- like, electronically
- taking your fingerprints, they do use glass plate --

- 1 platens to take those because glass is easibly (sic)
- cleanable. So when you do roll a surface, you can easily
- 3 clean it for the next person so you don't get overlap on
- 4 that. So --
- 5 Q And now-a-days they're not even having people put,
- 6 you know, the black -- the black ink on their fingers when
- 7 they take their fingerprints -- correct -- they're just
- 8 rolling them across the -- across the glass.
- 9 A Yeah.
- 10 Q Okay.
- 11 A For the most part.
- 12 Q Okay. Were you asked to compare these fingerprints
- to any anyone else?
- 14 A Outside of -- I was only requested to compare
- 15 them to Kenny Splond.
- 16 Q And again, both at the -- the Cricket and the Metro
- PCS, your results were negative.
- 18 A Correct.
- 19 Q Thank you.
- THE COURT: May I remove the marks?
- 21 MR. PALAL: Yes, Your Honor. May I --
- 22 THE COURT: Redirect.
- MR. PALAL: Thank you.
- 24 REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF HEATHER GOULDTHORPE

- 1 BY MR. PALAL:
- 2 Q All right. Ms. Gouldthorpe, Mr. Claus mentioned that
- 3 when Metro takes prints of people, they use glass. It seemed
- 4 to me that you wanted to say something about why the process
- of using glass. Do they clean the surface of glass after
- 6 taking fingerprints?
- 7 A Yes. Every time at the Fingerprint Bureau, when
- 8 they do take somebody's prints, what they do is they take
- 9 the prints and then afterwards, they'd use a glass cleaner
- and then they clean it. So then the next person that
- 11 comes behind them, they won't get overlap of latent -- of
- 12 prints in the system.
- 13 Q Now, it probably wouldn't be a good way to collect
- prints to just not clean it and just lay a print over print.
- 15 A No.
- 16 Q Now, are you aware of whether they put any kind of
- liquid or water on prints prior to taking the prints?
- 18 A Occasionally, I know -- because I'm one of those
- 19 people, I have really dry hands. So they put, like, a
- lotion on the hands to moisten them up before taking
- 21 prints.
- 22 Q And why -- why is that?
- 23 A Like I said, I'm one of those people, I have dry
- skin. I leave behind really bad latent prints. I know

- this because as part of our -- when we process evidence,
- 2 we have to make QC prints. And in order for me to get a
- 3 print that I can say will react positively, I have to
- 4 really load my fingers up.
- 5 So what that means is I have to either touch the
- 6 back of my hair line or rub my forehead, which is the
- oiliest part on my skin, to be able to produce a print
- 8 that would -- that I could process that I can recover a
- 9 latent from.
- 10 Q So even using Metro's equipment on a clean glass
- 11 surface, surface that -- that's cleaned after every use, when
- 12 you put your hand on there, you don't develop good latent
- 13 prints.
- 14 A Correct.
- One last thing, do you have to actually touch the
- item for you to leave a print or does hovering above it leave
- 17 a print?
- 18 A Well, you have to touch -- in order for the
- 19 latent be developed, you have to actually touch the print.
- 20 Because it's a -- you're actually leaving behind a
- replication of your skin. So in order to leave behind
- that replication, you have to actually touch the surface.
- 23 Q So to leave a latent print, just, generally, even
- beyond that, you have to touch the item.

- 1 A Yep.
- 2 Q So like -- because I've been looking at this Elmo a
- 3 lot. If I haven't touched it, I'm not gonna leave a print.
- 4 A Correct.
- 5 MR. PALAL: No further.
- 6 THE COURT: Redirect -- or recross?
- 7 MR. CLAUS: Please, Your Honor.
- 8 RECROSS-EXAMINATION OF HEATHER GOULDTHORPE
- 9 BY MR. CLAUS:
- 10 Q So you fingerprinted yourself and checked -- tried to
- 11 check your own fingerprints and had difficulty with that.
- 12 A I do.
- Okay. And is it in getting any fingerprints, getting
- suitable fingerprints, or getting perfect fingerprints?
- 15 A Getting any -- getting any latent to develop. If
- I just touch a surface, I know that I have -- I won't
- leave any prints that I can develop to positively call a
- latent print. So that's why I have to, myself, load my
- 19 fingers with oily sebaceous sweat, in order to develop a
- 20 latent print.
- 21 Q Now, this is an individual characteristic; correct?
- 22 A It is, yes.
- 23 Q Are you aware of any statistics of what pocket -- of
- what percentage of the population has this same difficulty?

- 1 A No.
- 2 Q And you perspire through your hands; correct?
- 3 A Correct.
- 4 Q All right. And you put oils out through your hands;
- 5 correct? And that is a universal characteristic.
- 6 A It is.
- 7 Q Okay. And when you're under stress, you'll perspire
- 8 more; correct?
- 9 A Correct.
- 10 Q And in order to leave a fingerprint, you don't have
- 11 to have held an item for five minutes, ten minutes, you can
- just touch it and that will leave a fingerprint; correct?
- 13 A Correct.
- MR. CLAUS: Pass the witness, Your Honor.
- MR. PALAL: Nothing from the State.
- 16 THE COURT: Anything further?
- 17 MR. PALAL: No, Your Honor. I apologize.
- THE COURT: Any questions from the jury?
- 19 Thank you, ma'am. We appreciate your time. Have
- 20 a very nice afternoon.
- Next witness.
- MR. LEXIS: State calls Detective Kavon.
- THE COURT: How long do you think he's gonna be?
- MR. PALAL: Twenty-five minutes.

- THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, we're gonna take an
- 2 afternoon recess before we start with a longer witness.
- 3 During this recess, you're admonished not to talk
- 4 or converse among yourselves, with anyone else on any
- 5 subject connected with this trial or read, watch or listen
- 6 to any person connected with this trial by any medium of
- 7 information including, without limitation: Social media,
- 8 text, newspaper, television, Internet, radio or form or
- 9 express any opinion on any subject connected with the
- trial until the case is finally submitted to you.
- See you in about ten minutes outside courtroom
- 12 14A.
- [Outside the presence of the jury]
- 14 THE COURT: By my count, as we all know, is not
- 15 necessarily accurate, this will be your seventh witness of
- the day. And yesterday you told me you had seven more
- witnesses.
- 18 MR. PALAL: That's correct.
- 19 THE COURT: And I can draw a conclusion from that.
- 20 MR. PALAL: Yes, you are.
- 21 THE COURT: Okay. So I have numbered the instructions
- for you. Who's my hander-outer?
- MR. PALAL: I got it, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Two per side. Now they have numbers on

- 1 them.
- 2 MR. PALAL: Thank you.
- 3 THE COURT: So these will be the set we settle from.
- 4 MR. CLAUS: Thank you.
- 5 THE COURT: You guys can have five minutes or so for
- 6 break.
- 7 MR. PALAL: Is the jury --
- 8 MR. CLAUS: Front or back?
- 9 MR. PALAL: Yeah, where's the -- is the jury in front
- 10 or back?
- 11 THE COURT: Jury should be out by 14A.
- 12 MR. PALAL: Okay.
- THE COURT: They're in the front. You guys are going
- in the back.
- 15 [Recess at 2:46 p.m.; proceedings resumed at
- 16 2:46 p.m.]
- [Outside the presence of the jury]
- [Discussion off the record]
- THE COURT: Do you have the machine that we're gonna
- give the jury to watch the videos?
- MR. PALAL: Yes.
- THE COURT: Your clean computer?
- MR. PALAL: Yes.
- THE COURT: So Mr. Claus, this is how I do it: Once

- we finish everything and I send the jury back, we then
- 2 have a clean laptop, typically provided by the DA's
- office. I have you check that laptop with them to make
- sure that it appears to you to be a clean laptop, before I
- send it back. And then we rely upon that laptop to be the
- 6 one the jury uses.
- 7 MR. CLAUS: Okay.
- 8 THE COURT: So if that's okay with you, that'll be the
- 9 process I follow.
- 10 MR. CLAUS: A-okay with me.
- 11 THE COURT: Great. It's so nice to talk to lawyers
- who actually are agreeable as to one close to the other
- ones that are talking to my people in the back hallway.
- MR. CLAUS: And I only try to disagree on the really
- important things, Your Honor.
- 16 THE COURT: Lovely. That's good.
- MR. CLAUS: Something's going on here.
- THE COURT: There's apparently some suspicious
- activity outside the building. So I will arrange for the
- jurors to be accompanied to the garage, if they stay late.
- Not sure what the suspicious activity is. But don't want
- to run [inaudible].
- MR. PALAL: Actually, that brings up with a good
- 24 point, Your Honor. How long do you have the -- do you

- 1 send the jurors home or do they -- give them time to
- 2 deliberate?
- 3 THE COURT: My general rule is -- and as it's a
- 4 general rule, that means sometimes I depart from it -- is
- I send jurors home by 6:30, whether they like it or not.
- 6 But I let them pick the time they come back.
- 7 MR. CLAUS: So we're gonna be sticking around till
- 8 6:30.
- 9 THE COURT: Well, probably not, but it's possible.
- [Discussion off the record]
- MR. PALAL: Your Honor, my submit of 25 minutes
- included cross, so --
- 13 THE COURT: I -- I've already said you guys are
- 14 getting done today. I've got the instructions ready to
- go. They're numbered; you got them. I'm ready to go at
- the next break to settle jury instructions and be gone.
- MR. PALAL: Okay. Perfect.
- 18 THE COURT: Unless you want to settle --
- 19 MR. PALAL: Thank you.
- 20 THE COURT: -- now. Have you looked at them?
- MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Okay. Has the State had the opportunity
- 23 to review the Court's proposed jury instructions numbered
- 24 1 through 30?

```
1 MR. PALAL: Yes, Your Honor.
```

- 2 THE COURT: Does the State object to the giving of
- 3 those instructions?
- 4 MR. PALAL: No, Your Honor.
- 5 THE COURT: Does the State have any additional
- 6 instructions to propose?
- 7 MR. PALAL: No, Your Honor.
- 8 THE COURT: Has the Defense had the opportunity to
- 9 look at the Court's proposed instructions numbered 1
- through 30?
- MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 12 THE COURT: Do you object to the giving of any of
- 13 those instructions?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Do you have any additional instructions to
- 16 propose at this time?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Have both of you had the opportunity to
- look at the proposed form of verdict that the clerk has
- 20 placed on a blue backer, in which --
- MR. CLAUS: Yes.
- THE COURT: -- has the same name as the instructions?
- Does anyone object to the verdict form?
- MR. CLAUS: No, Your Honor.

- 1 MR. PALAL: No, Your Honor.
- 2 THE COURT: Okay. You both want me to instruct the
- 3 jury before closing arguments.
- 4 MR. PALAL: Yes, Your Honor.
- 5 MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 6 THE COURT: Okay. So Kevin, I'm going to give these
- 7 to Dan to make the copies while we're hearing the last
- 8 witness.
- 9 THE BAILIFF: Okay.
- 10 THE COURT: I'll do it. You line them up.
- [Discussion off the record]
- 12 THE COURT: Is it okay with you guys if we give the
- jurors a verdict form too?
- 14 MR. PALAL: [Inaudible]
- 15 THE COURT: Sometimes we give them a verdict form and
- sometimes we don't. Do you want them to have a verdict
- 17 form or not?
- MR. CLAUS: A copy.
- 19 MR. PALAL: Oh, yes, please.
- 20 MR. CLAUS: Yeah.
- THE COURT: Here, Dan.
- MR. PALAL: Do some people actually request that jury
- instructions be read after closings?
- 24 THE COURT: The statute requires it.

- 1 MR. PALAL: I didn't know that.
- 2 THE COURT: This is why I ask it and nod my head so
- 3 you know the right answer.
- 4 MR. PALAL: Oh, okay. The statute mandates it after.
- 5 And we just --
- 6 THE COURT: Believe so.
- 7 MR. PALAL: -- we stipulate it to go before.
- THE COURT: Because we've all learned it, after isn't
- 9 the best time for you to explain the jury instructions.
- 10 MR. CLAUS: That would explain why some judges do it
- 11 after.
- 12 THE COURT: Those of us who were actually trial
- lawyers know why it's important the judge do it first.
- [In the presence of the jury]
- 15 THE BAILIFF: Jurors are present.
- THE COURT: Counsel, stipulate the presence of the
- jury.
- MR. CLAUS: Yes, Your Honor.
- 19 MR. LEXIS: Yes, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: You may be seated.
- Your next witness.
- MR. LEXIS: Detective Kavon.
- 23 MR. CLAUS: Detective who?
- MR. LEXIS: Kavon.

```
1 SCOTT KAVON,
```

- 2 [having been called as a witness and being first duly
- 3 sworn testified as follows:]
- 4 THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated.
- 5 Please state and spell your name for the record.
- THE WITNESS: My name is Scott Kavon, S-C-O-T-T,
- 7 K-A-V, as in "Victor," O-N.
- 8 THE COURT: Sir, you will notice there is a dispenser
- 9 with M&Ms next to you. There's a pitcher with water in
- it. And if you should need some coffee, let the marshal
- 11 know. He'd be happy to help you out.
- 12 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- 13 THE COURT: You may proceed.
- 14 DIRECT EXAMINATION OF SCOTT KAVON
- 15 BY MR. LEXIS:
- Q Where do you work, sir?
- 17 A I currently am retired.
- 18 Q Where did you work?
- 19 A I used to work with the Las Vegas Metropolitan
- 20 Police Department.
- 21 Q For how many years?
- 22 A I did a little less than 25 years with the police
- 23 department.
- Q And when did you retire?

- 1 A I retired a little less than eight months ago.
- 2 Approximately 236 days ago.
- 3 Q Sir, in 2014, what division were you assigned to?
- 4 A I was assigned to the robbery/homicide section,
- 5 concentrating in the Robbery Division. And I had been
- 6 assigned there for approximately ten years.
- 7 Q In early 2014, were you assigned to investigate a
- 8 string of robberies that occurred at the Cricket store at
- 9 4343 North Rancho, the Metro PCS store at 6663 Smoke Ranch,
- and the Star Mart at 5001 North Rainbow?
- 11 A Yes, I was.
- 12 Q And how were you assigned that?
- 13 A In the -- in the Las Vegas Metropolitan Police
- Department, in the robbery section, specific, the city or
- 15 Clark County, actually, is broken down into sections.
- Geographical areas, substations, for patrol cover those
- sections. And then the detectives are also assigned
- 18 sections of the city to work.
- I was assigned a northwest part of the valley, at
- that time, being the northwest substation encompasses that
- 21 area of town that you describe.
- Q Did each of those three robberies occur in the
- 23 northwest part of this valley?
- 24 A Yes, they did.

- 1 Q Here in Clark County, Las Vegas?
- 2 A Yes, they did.
- 3 Q And what did you do when you were assigned this
- 4 investigation?
- 5 A Initially, the calls are generated and uniformed
- officers respond. They take crime reports. They take
- 7 voluntary statements. They do a preliminary
- 8 investigation. From there, the case is assigned to a
- 9 detective. And in this instance, these cases were
- 10 assigned to me.
- I received these cases in a computer database,
- which we call a que, in the que, along with other cases
- from the northwest. And I begin to sort through them and
- investigate them. I look at them for commonalities and
- 15 things like that.
- 16 Q Were you able to obtain videos from these locations?
- 17 A I was. I reviewed the video for both the Cricket
- 18 store and the Metro PCS.
- 19 Q Did there come a time where you eventually were able
- to develop a suspect?
- 21 A Yes, there did. Ultimately, I looked at these
- three cases, in chronological order, as I received them, I
- 23 looked at them. And I noted that the -- the case was --
- 24 the case -- the suspect in these cases was very similar.

- 1 He had a similar method of operation or the way
- 2 he would conduct his crimes. He had a similar physical
- 3 description and physical build. It was distinctive
- 4 because the witnesses and victims in these crimes
- 5 described him as having some sort of scarring on his
- 6 cheeks, either pock mark or acne scarring or something
- 7 like that.
- 8 The suspect utilized a revolver in -- in two of
- 9 out of these three cases. And he also utilized a silver
- 10 car as a getaway car, silver four-door car. And in -- in
- 11 two -- two of the cases, witnesses saw a female driving
- 12 the getaway car away. So --
- MR. CLAUS: Objection. [Inaudible]
- 14 THE COURT: Overruled.
- 15 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 16 Q Go ahead.
- 17 A So ultimately, when I looked at all these cases
- 18 together, I noted that on the -- the Star Mart convenience
- 19 store that was robbed, uniformed officers had made two
- arrests in that case, arresting a Kenneth Splond or
- 21 Kenny Splond.
- 22 Q And you're aware that a firearm was used on all three
- 23 robberies?
- 24 A Yes, it was described as a revolver in at least

- 1 two of the robberies.
- 2 Q And so, after that third event, on February 2nd at
- 3 the Star Mart, Metro actually had a suspect in custody.
- 4 A That's correct.
- 5 Q Showing you what is State's Exhibit 33. You
- 6 recognize that photograph, sir?
- 7 A Yes, I do.
- 8 Q And who is that?
- 9 A That's a photograph of Kenny or Kenneth Splond.
- 10 Q You see that person in court today?
- 11 A Yes, I do.
- 12 Q Would you please point to him, identify for me the
- 13 colored shirt he is wearing.
- 14 A He's sitting there at the Defendant's table.
- 15 He's wearing a gray shirt with a gray tie.
- MR. LEXIS: Your Honor, let the record reflect the
- 17 detective has identified the Defendant.
- 18 THE COURT: Record will so reflect.
- 19 BY MR. LEXIS:
- 20 Q I'm also showing you states Exhibit 35. You
- recognize that photograph, sir?
- 22 A Yes, I do.
- 23 Q Is it the same person?
- 24 A That is also Kenny Splond, yes.

- 1 Q Can you describe for me his appearance, his facial
- 2 features.
- 3 A He's an African American or a black male. He
- 4 has -- he has short, dark, close-cropped hair in that
- 5 picture. He has a light mustache and maybe a little bit
- of a light beard that's going on. He appears to have some
- 7 sort of scarring on his cheeks and maybe his neck area
- 8 there.
- 9 Q What is he wearing?
- 10 A He's wearing an orange-ish colored shirt from --
- I mean, I can only see, obviously, from the -- from the
- 12 shoulders up. But with a -- possibly a darker shirt
- 13 underneath.
- 14 Q Is he wearing glasses?
- 15 A He is not wearing glasses, no.
- 16 Q You see the Defendant in court today?
- 17 A I do. I do.
- 18 Q Can you please describe me any characteristics, if
- any, that are different from this photograph.
- 20 A To me, his appearance is substantially different,
- sitting here in court today, as it is from back in
- January, February of 2014. His hair is much longer now
- and done up in some type of braid. He's wearing glasses
- right now. And it appears that he's grown out his facial

- 1 hair, his goatee, and it's got a little gray in it, just
- 2 like mine.
- 3 Q And what is he wearing?
- 4 A He's wearing a gray button down dress shirt with
- 5 a gray pattern tie or silver pattern tie.
- 6 Q Now that you had a suspect in custody, and after you
- 7 paired up those videos, what did you do next?
- 8 A What I always do in a case like this is I -- the
- 9 suspect's in custody. I review a photograph of the
- 10 suspect and then compare that to the video, to make sure
- 11 that it -- it's consistent.
- 12 If not -- if you're not able to make a complete
- identification from the video and the photograph, which in
- almost every case you're not, you at least want to make
- sure it's consistent with characteristics and build and
- 16 appearance and that sort of thing.
- 17 After I did that, I determined that it was time
- to create a photo lineup or photo array, as we call it.
- 19 Q And how many of these photo arrays have you
- 20 conducted, rough estimate?
- 21 A In the little less than 25 years as a detective
- and an officer in Metro, I've conducted hundreds and
- 23 hundreds of these photo arrays.
- 24 Q And can you explain for us how you go about getting

- 1 the photographs.
- 2 A Sure. Metro Police Department has a database, a
- 3 database of photos that are in this database. Hundreds
- 4 and hundreds and thousands of photographs are in this
- 5 database. These photographs are separated into categories
- 6 by race, by gender, that sort of thing, by age.
- 7 It's data inputted in when the photograph was
- 8 taken. You know, they put in the age of the person, their
- 9 name and their ID number and, you know, how tall they are
- and how much they weigh and that's all in the database.
- When we create a photo array or sometimes it's
- referred to as a six-pack, you go into this database and
- you input the information for the known person that you
- want included in there. In this case, I input the
- information for Kenny Splond. Then that pulls
- 16 Kenny Splond's picture out of the database.
- And then you also put in criteria of what you
- want to match with that. You -- you put in, obviously,
- 19 you wouldn't want to put in female with a male suspect.
- 20 So you eliminate all the females. You eliminate Caucasian
- or -- or white -- white people. You eliminate all sorts
- of various things. You make sure the ages are close and
- the height and weights are close.
- And when that computer program or that database