gave to the Henderson Police in December of 2011 was true; correct? 3 Yes. Α Now, some months later, in September of All right. Q 5 2012, you have occasion to speak with more detectives; right? 6 Α Yes. And you gave them another statement? Q 8 Α Yes. Okay. Now, if you would, please tell the jury what 9 Q the living situation was on October 3rd, 2012. 10 First let me start with you're 19 years old at this 11 time; is that correct? 12 13 Α Yes. 14 Are you still living with your mother? Q Okay. 15 Α Yes. But this is going to be at the Center Street 16 Q Okay. 17 address? 18 Yes. Α And that's in Henderson? 19 Q 20 Yes. Α And so you've been living with your mom and 21 Q 22 sometimes Victoria for about two years now since leaving 23 Blankenship? 24 And 'Bazz was there -- Shabazz was there. Α Yeah.

Shabazz. Okay. I didn't mean to leave him out.

25

Q

Now, do you remember it being the case that when you moved that Taharah and Taquanda weren't able to come over as much? Yes.

Α

1

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

And you told that to the detective, also, Q Okay. didn't you?

Yes. Α

And first I'm going to ask about you. Q Okay. Did you miss seeing Taharah and Taquanda as much as you used to?

Α Yes.

Based on your interaction with the other Q people did they -- when I say other people I mean your mom, Shabazz and Victoria, did they also appear to miss not seeing Taharah and Taquanda as much as they used to?

Yes. Α

Now, your birthday is September 11th; right? Q

Yes. Α

Do you remember in 2012 whether Taharah and Taquanda Q were able to come over and hang out with you for your birthday?

I think they did. Α

Now, I want you to think carefully. Did you go and -- when I say you I mean did somebody from your house go and pick them up, or did somebody from Blankenship come and drop them off?

- A I think somebody dropped them off.
- Q Okay. Would you be able to say who it was? Do you know if it was Fred or if it was Miss Ann?
 - A Well, for my birthday that time I think it was Ann.
 - Q Okay. And your birthday is at the end of the summer, right, every year?
 - A Yes.
 - Q That summer did Taharah and Taquanda get to come over more often than they used to? Did they get to visit for longer periods of time while they weren't in school?
- 11 A Yes.

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

10

12

- Q Okay. And who was living at the Center Street address that summer?
- A It was me, my mom, and Shabazz. He would only be there sometimes. Most the time he would be at another friend's house.
- 17 | Q Okay. Did Victoria live there?
- 18 A No, she didn't live there.
- 19 Q Okay. Did she come to visit often?
- 20 A Yes.
- Q Okay. Did she make a special visit to make sure she got to see Taharah and Taquanda when they were available?
- 23 A Yes.
- Q All right. Mahlica, we had talked a little bit 25 about your age when we first started. Do you remember in 2012

```
when you were talking to the Metropolitan Police Department,
    do you remember the detective asking you if you knew the
    difference between telling the truth and telling a lie?
              Yes.
         Α
 5
                     And do you remember him asking you whether it
         Q
    was better to tell the truth or to tell a lie?
 6
 7
              Yes, I think so.
         Α
              Okay. And you agreed it was better to tell the
 8
         Q
    truth; is that fair?
              Yes, I think so.
10
         Α
              Did you think that was an odd question for him to
11
         Q
12
    ask you?
13
         Α
              Yes.
14
              MS. LUZAICH:
                            Objection. Relevance.
15
              THE WITNESS:
                             It was.
              THE COURT:
                          I'm sorry?
16
17
              MS. LUZAICH:
                             Relevance.
18
              THE COURT:
                           Sustained.
              MR. MacARTHUR:
                              All right.
19
              THE COURT:
                          I don't know if she can testify about
20
    what -- about his questions.
21
                              Well, I wasn't asking her --
22
              MR. MacARTHUR:
23
                          But you might be able to rephrase it.
              THE COURT:
24
                               Okay.
                                      I'm certainly not asking why
              MR. MacARTHUR:
25
    he asked it.
```

1 THE COURT: Okay. She can't know that. But I asked 2 MR. MacARTHUR: her if she thought it was odd that he asked her that. 3 Okay. You can answer that question. 4 THE COURT: 5 THE WITNESS: Yes, I did. 6 BY MR. MacARTHUR: 7 Okay. And why did you think that was odd? Q MS. LUZAICH: Objection. Relevance. 8 Sustained. 9 THE COURT: 10 BY MR. MacARTHUR: All right. Do you remember telling the police that 11 Q your relationship with your mother is more like a friendship 12 13 than a mother-daughter relationship? 14 Yes. Α 15 Okay. You remember saying that? Q 16 Α Yes. And why was that? Why do you consider your 17 Q Okay. 18 mother to be more your friend than your mother? Because some of the things that she's done or that 19 Α -- that she does is not really motherly, like sometimes advice 20 and choices and how she talks to us sometimes. 21 22 And in fact you told the police that she had 23 given you bad advice in the past? 24 Yeah. Α 25 Let's scoot over a bit, and talk about your Q Okay.

brother Shabazz. What is Shabazz like personalitywise? 1 He's funny. 2 Α Is he tall, short? 3 Q Tall -- tall-ish. 4 Α 5 Tall-ish. Okay. Is he stubborn? Q 6 Α Yes. You said he's funny. 7 Q 8 Yes. Α Okay. Is he honest? 9 Q Yeah, sometimes. 10 Α Okay. Now, again, thinking about September 2012, 11 Q 12 did Victoria ever tell you that your mother wasn't fit to get Taharah and Taquanda back? 13 14 MS. LUZAICH: Objection. Hearsay. 15 And it's not for the truth of the MR. MacARTHUR: matter asserted, Judge. 16 17 Well, then usually it's not relevant, THE COURT: 18 so --In this instance it's to find out MR. MacARTHUR: 19 whether or not Victoria said that to her, not whether Tina is 20 actually qualified to have her children back. 21 22 The objection is sustained. THE COURT: 23 BY MR. MacARTHUR: 24 Mahlica, do you remember telling the police Q Okay. 25 that Victoria had told you that your mom wasn't fit to get

Taharah and Taquanda back? 1 I think so. 2 Would it refresh your recollection to be able to 3 Q review the report -- or the statement? 5 Yeah, I quess. Α Okay. State, I'm going to be 6 MR. MacARTHUR: referring to page 12 in the voluntary statement, and this one, of course, is dated September 2012. 8 9 THE WITNESS: Oh. Okay. 10 BY MR. MacARTHUR: Okay. Did you have a chance to see that? 11 Q 12 Yes. Α Okay. Does that refresh your recollection as to 13 Q 14 what you may have told the Metro detective? 15 Α Yes. Okay. And didn't you in fact tell them that 16 Q Victoria had told you that your mother was not qualified to 17 18 get Taharah and Taquanda back? 19 MS. LUZAICH: Just for the record, that's like triple hearsay. 20 21 THE COURT: Sustained. 22 And none of it's for the truth, MR. MacARTHUR: 23 It's to find out whether she said that to the police. Judge. 24 I understand. THE COURT: 25 MS. LUZAICH: What's the relevance?

THE COURT: The objection is sustained. Usually 1 when you say it's not for the truth of the matter asserted, then I always know it's not relevant. MR. MacARTHUR: Well, it's relevant as to bias, 4 5 Judge. Okay. 6 THE COURT: 7 MR. MacARTHUR: A motive to --8 THE COURT: The objection's sustained. MR. MacARTHUR: Yes, ma'am. 9 10 BY MR. MacARTHUR: I'm just going to move this over here so it's not in 11 Q front of you. 12 All right. In September of 2012 the Metropolitan 13 Police detectives were asking you a few different questions 14 15 from what Henderson had asked you nine or ten months before; 16 is that correct? 17 Yes. Α 18 And the difference was is that now the Metro detectives were talking about some things that may have 19 happened between Fred and Taharah. Do you remember that? 20 21 Α Yes. 22 Isn't it in fact true that Taharah didn't 23 tell you about the abuse? 24 Yes. Α 25 She had actually told Victoria about the Q Okay.

1 abuse? 2 Yes. Α Okay. And Victoria told you? 3 Q 4 Α Yes. Now, they also asked you some more questions about 5 Q things that might have happened between Fred and Victoria; 6 right? 8 Yes. Α So -- just so we're clear, they'd asked you about 9 Q some things that may have happened between Fred and Taharah; 10 right? 11 12 Yes. Α And then they asked you some things about -- things 13 Q that may have happened between Victoria and Fred? 14 15 Α Yes. Now, in 2012, do you remember telling the Okay. 16 Q detectives that Victoria had told you Fred had raped her in 17 2008 at Walnut Street apartments? 18 19 Α Yes. Now, she specifically said 2008? Thinking 20 Q Okay. back to what Victoria said. 21 22 I don't really remember. 23 Would you agree with me that 2008 is not Q Okay. 24 2005? 25 Α Yes.

Okay. Would you agree with me that 2008 is not 1 Q 2011? 2 3 Yes. Α Do you remember telling the Metropolitan Police 4 detectives that Fred had never hurt you, touched you, or had 5 been inappropriate with you? 6 7 Α Yes. Do you remember the detectives saying that 8 Q Okay. sometimes talking about molestation or sex could be 10 embarrassing? 11 Α Yes. I don't want you to guess or be unsure. 12 Q remember them asking you that or talking about that? 13 14 Α Yes. And they asked you if you thought that would 15 Q Okay. be embarrassing. Do you remember that? 16 17 Α Yes. Do you remember them asking you, are you 18 Q Okay. 19 embarrassed? Right now? 20 Α Well, I'm talking about in 2012. 21 Q Do you No. 22 remember the detectives, after having brought up that talking 23 about this kind of stuff could be embarrassing, do you 24 remember them asking you if you were embarrassed?

25

Oh.

Α

Yes.

```
Do you remember them -- remember telling them
              Okay.
         Q
 1
    that no, you were not embarrassed?
 2
 3
         Α
              Yes.
              Do you remember telling them that you had never
         Q
 5
    witnessed anything happening between Victoria or Taharah and
 6
    Fred?
 7
              Yes.
         Α
              Okay. And that's the 2012 statement, not the 2011
 8
         Q
 9
    statement; right?
10
         Α
              Yes.
              Okay. Who is Rose Smith?
11
         Q
              She's a friend of the family.
12
         Α
13
              Okay. Do you get along with her?
         Q
14
         Α
              Yes.
15
              Is she nice?
         Q
16
         Α
              Yes.
17
                     And who is Rose closest to in the family, if
         Q
              Okay.
18
    you know?
19
              My oldest sister, Victoria.
         Α
              Okay. But all of you get along with her all right?
20
         Q
              Oh, yes.
21
         Α
22
              Did you ever tell Rose Smith that Fred had tried to
23
    force you to have sex with him on December 14th, 2011?
24
         Α
              No.
25
              You would remember if you'd ever said that to her;
         Q
```

right? 1 2 Α Yes. And that would be a big deal; right? 3 Q Yes. 4 Α Have you spoken to Rose recently? 5 Q 6 Yes. Α 7 How recently? Q Yesterday. 8 Α Okay. You guys still get along? 9 Q 10 Yes. Α MR. MacARTHUR: All right. Your Honor, there's 11 already a stipulation with regard to school records. 12 I'm going to be referring to Defense Proposed Exhibit V. 13 I'm going to move for admission. 14 15 MS. LUZAICH: No objection. THE COURT: Okay. So Exhibit V is admitted into 16 17 evidence. 18 (Defendant's Exhibit V admitted) Thank you, Your Honor. Permission 19 MR. MacARTHUR: 20 to publish. 21 THE COURT: You may. 22 BY MR. MacARTHUR: 23 I have here what appears to be a Mahlica, Q 24 transcript of your school grades. And I want to -- there's a 25 staple in here, but here at the top do you see your name in

the upper left-hand corner? 1 2 Α Yes. 3 And were you born in Reno, Nevada? Q 4 Α Yes. And that's your correct date of birth; is 5 Q that correct? 6 7 Yes. Α All right. And it appears that -- and Betsy, could 8 Q you get rid of that pink line for me, if you would. Thanks. Now, I want you to take a quick peek at that 10 Okay. and let me know whether you recognize this as -- or does this 11 seem familiar as to the grades you got while you were in grade 12 school? 13 14 Yes. Α 15 MR. MacARTHUR: Okay. Court's indulgence. THE COURT: 16 Sure. 17 BY MR. MacARTHUR: 18 Okay. Now, during direct examination you had talked Q about having gone to Utah; right? 19 20 Α Yes. And you came back in August of 2007. Does that --21 Q 22 yes, August of 2007. Does that sound right? 23 Α Yes. 24 Q And when you came back you moved into the Okay. 25 Blankenship house; is that correct?

```
1
         Α
              Yes.
              Where Fred and Lealer lived.
 2
         Q
 3
              Yes.
         Α
                     And you said that you moved out in August of
 4
         Q
              Okay.
    2010 to go to St. Andrews?
 5
 6
         Α
              Yes.
 7
         Q
              Okay. So what I want to do is I'm going to zoom in
    on the grades that you had while you were in the Blankenship
 8
            So first you've got -- school starts in the fall;
    house.
    right?
10
              Yes.
11
         Α
12
                     So you would go to school in say the fall of
         Q
              Okay.
    2008, and then that semester would end in January of 2009?
13
14
         Α
              Yes.
15
         Q
              And if you would, what was your GPA that semester,
    if you can see it?
16
              A 2.5.
17
         Α
              2.571?
18
         Q
              Yeah.
19
         Α
20
                     And then the next term goes from January to
         Q
              Okay.
           School gets out for the summer; right?
21
22
         Α
              Yes.
23
                     And you were still living at the Blankenship
         Q
              Okay.
24
    house?
25
         Α
              Yes.
```

And what was your GPA then? 1 Q 2.250. 2 Α Okay. Now, you did a little bit of summer school, 3 Q but then you resumed a full term; is that correct? 5 Α Yes. Okay. And it's starting to get a 6 MR. MacARTHUR: little blurry, and I don't know what exactly to do about that, I'm looking for an auto focus button. Kris, can you show him how to focus it. 9 THE COURT: MR. MacARTHUR: Got it, Judge. 10 Okay. Perfect. 11 THE COURT: MR. MacARTHUR: 12 Found it. Sorry about that, Kris. 13 BY MR. MacARTHUR: Okay. And so you went back to school in the fall 14 Q 15 2010; is that right? 16 Α Yes. And what was your GPA for that term? 17 Q 2.286. 18 Α Now, you moved out of the Blankenship house in 19 Q August; is that correct? Well, yeah, August 2010. 20 21 Α Yes. 22 So some of this school year you did living on 23 St. Andrews with your mom; right? 24 Yes. Α 25 Would you agree with me that 2.28 is less Q Okay.

115

1 than 2.57?
2 A
3 Q
4

5

6

8

9

10

12

13

14

- A Say that again. I'm not paying attention.
- Q It's withdrawn. Don't worry about it.

Now, your first semester living away from Blankenship house, the first one that you started and finished would have been starting January of -- I'm sorry. Okay. So we're still in 2010. I apologize if I was confusing. Maybe I just confused myself.

You haven't moved out of the Blankenship house yet; right?

- 11 A Right.
 - Q Okay. And so your last term that you complete in the Blankenship house is actually in June of 2010; is that correct?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q And what's your GPA?
- 17 A 2.000.
- Q And so after relocating to St. Andrews, you started school again in the fall; is that correct?
- 20 A Yes.
- Q Okay. And what was your GPA for that fall semester ending in January of 2011?
- 23 A 0.667.
- Q Okay. And there was one more semester that started in January of 2011 and concluded in June 2011; right?

1 Α Yes. And what was your GPA at the end of that semester? 2 Q 0.000. 3 Α And you've already testified that the Q 5 following year, which is going to be your senior year, that you did not go to school but one day; is that correct? 6 7 Α Yes. Mahlica, is it fair to say that your grades suffered 8 somewhat when you moved away from Fred and Lealer? But it wasn't because I moved away from them, 10 Α Yeah. though. 11 Okay. You testified in response to the State's 12 Q question that you had some difficulty in school as a result of 13 your anxiety disorder; right? 14 15 Α Yes. Do you remember whether you told that to the 16 Q Okay. Let me ask that question first. Did you relate to 17 school? anybody at the school that you were having anxiety problems 18 and that's why you weren't coming? 19 You mean anybody who worked at the school? 20 Α 21 Q Yes. 22 No. Α 23 Did you tell your mother that you were having Q Okay.

24

25

anxiety problems?

Α

Yes.

- Q Did you also tell your mother that you were having stomach issues?
 - A Yes.

- Q Okay. And if you would, please tell the jury what kind of stomach issues were you talking about?
 - A Just at that time?
- Q Yes. As best you can remember. During your senior year when you only went to school for one day what kind of stomach issues were you having?
- A I believe the doctor had said it was a peptic ulcer, I believe.
- Q Okay. And in fact didn't your mother try to get you in to see a stomach specialist?
- 14 A Yes.
 - Q Okay. Do you remember whether or not the school gave you additional time to re-enroll given that you were having stomach issues?
 - A I don't remember.
 - Q Okay. Let me ask it a different way. Do you remember whether or not the State -- I mean, the school just kicked you out or disenrolled you, or did they give you an opportunity to try to come back in and catch you back up?
 - A Yeah, at first they did. But then my mom just withdrew me after -- after some time.
 - Q Okay. To the best of your knowledge -- I'm only

asking if you know, I don't want you to guess -- did your 1 mother ever relate that you were having anxiety problems to the school, that you know of? MS. LUZAICH: Objection. Foundation. Speculation. 4 5 I think he's saying based upon what she THE COURT: 6 knows. 7 MR. MacARTHUR: Right. Does she know whether her mom did. 8 THE COURT: MR. MacARTHUR: Right. 10 THE COURT: You can answer that. No, I don't think she did. 11 THE WITNESS: No, she didn't, or, no, you don't know? 12 THE COURT: She didn't. 13 THE WITNESS: 14 BY MR. MacARTHUR: 15 Okay. I'm looking at this school record, Mahlica. Q Do you see this middle paragraph where it says "Comments"? 16 17 Α Yes. 18 I'd like you to read that to yourself. Let me see Q if there's a way to make this any better. 19 Since it's small on the monitor, I'm going to read 20 21 it to you, and I want you to tell me if I'm reading it 22 correctly. All right? 23 MS. LUZAICH: Objection. It's in evidence. The jury will have it. 24 25 Well, I'm publishing and its --MR. MacARTHUR:

MS. LUZAICH: If he reads it, he's testifying. 1 I don't understand why you want to read 2 THE COURT: 3 something into evidence that's already in evidence. MR. MacARTHUR: My only issue, Judge, is that --4 5 I mean, if there's something -- I don't THE COURT: want you to read the whole thing. If there's something 6 specific you want to go into --7 Okay, Judge. MR. MacARTHUR: 8 THE COURT: -- you can do that. 9 MR. MacARTHUR: It will only be the first two 10 The reason I'm concerned is that, even though I'm 11 sentences. publishing it, it's very small with regard to where the jury 12 13 is. 14 THE COURT: Go ahead. MR. MacARTHUR: 15 So just to facilitate the information I thought it'd be faster to read. 16 17 Go ahead. THE COURT: 18 MR. MacARTHUR: Okay. 19 BY MR. MacARTHUR: Mahlica, if you could read along. Under "Comments" 20 Q does it say, "Called home and spoke with mom. Mom states that 21 22 student has been having stomach issues. Mom is trying to get 23 in to stomach specialist." Do you see that? 24 Yes. Α And after that it talks about you only having 25 Okay.

been in school for one day; right? 2 Α Yes. And that you've lost credits in classes, but that 3 Q could be fixed if you get a doctor's note. See where that --4 5 Α Yes. It says that your mom might look into night 6 Q school or adult education for you; is that right? 8 Α Yes. And last but not least, they asked your mom 9 Q to let them know or give them an update because you're going 10 to be withdrawn soon. 11 12 Yes. Α 13 And your mother understood that? Q 14 Yes. Α Okay. Thank you, Your Honor. 15 MR. MacARTHUR: THE COURT: Any redirect? 16 MR. MacARTHUR: 17 I'm --18 THE COURT: Oh. You said thank you --I was thanking with the --19 MR. MacARTHUR: THE COURT: Okay. Sometimes when you say thank you 20 I think you're done. 21 But go ahead. 22 MR. MacARTHUR: It was for letting me publish. 23 I am almost done. 24 THE COURT: You may continue. 25

BY MR. MacARTHUR: Okay. I'm going to jump a little bit back in time 2 Q to May of 2005, when you moved to Utah. 3 Yes. 4 Α And that was when your mother was pregnant 5 Q with Joseph; is that correct? 6 7 Α Yes. And he was placed up for adoption. 8 Okav. Q 9 Α Yes. And there was a time in which you were taken away 10 Q from your mother by CPS, you and your siblings? 11 12 Α Yes. And this was in response to an incident where 13 Q they thought you guys were unattended; is that fair? 14 15 Α Yes. And who was looking after you guys while you 16 Q Okay. were in Utah? 17 She was like my mom's friend. 18 Her name was Heather. Α But she only looked in on you a couple of times; 19 Q right? 20 21 Α Yes. 22 Who was in charge while Miss Heather wasn't Q 23 there? 24 I can't really remember. Α 25 Do you remember whether you told us at preliminary Q

```
hearing that Victoria was in charge?
         Α
              Yeah.
              Okay. Does Victoria sort of act like a mother to
 3
         Q
    the younger kids?
 5
         Α
              Yes.
              Does she sometimes make decisions for the family?
 6
         0
 7
         Α
              Yes.
              And your mom let her or lets her do that?
 8
         Q
 9
              Yes.
         Α
              Would you say that your mother lets Victoria sort of
10
         Q
    run the household?
11
              MS. LUZAICH: Well, you know what, I'm sorry.
12
    Objection. Vague as to time.
13
                          Right. As to what that even means.
14
              THE COURT:
15
              MR. MacARTHUR: I'll tighten it up, Judge.
    BY MR. MacARTHUR:
16
              Now, when you came here to testify last it was in
17
         Q
    June of 2013; right?
18
19
         Α
              Yes.
              Okay. And now Victoria lives in California.
20
         Q
21
         Α
              Yes.
22
         Q
              She's got her own family and a baby?
23
         Α
              Yes.
                     I'm not asking you about after June of 2013.
24
         Q
              Okay.
25
    I'm really talking about once you, Shabazz, your mother, and
```

Victoria moved out of Blankenship until Victoria moved away. With that time period in mind from when you leave Blankenship in August of 2010 to whenever she moved out of where you live now, that time period, you with me --5 Yes. Α Okay. -- did your mom let Victoria sort of run the 6 Q household? Well, I wouldn't say run the household, but like 8 most of the time she would let -- 'cause my mom was always working, so she would put her in charge. 10 I understand. Do you remember Betsy Allen asking 11 Q you that question in June of last year at preliminary hearing? 12 13 Α Yes. Do you remember if you told her that your mom 14 Q Okay. let Victoria run the household? 15 I really don't remember. 16 Α Would it refresh your recollection to be able to see 17 Q 18 the transcript from the preliminary hearing? 19 Α Yeah. 20 THE COURT: What page? 21 MR. MacARTHUR: Page 109, State. 22 BY MR. MacARTHUR: 23 We were just talking about this last orange there. Q 24 Okay. Α

Do you see it?

25

Q

1 Α Yes. Did that refresh your recollection as to what your 2 0 3 answer was? 4 Yes. Α Okay. And did your mom let Victoria run the 5 Q 6 household? 7 Α Yes. Mahlica, did you continue to have some 8 Okay. Q contact with Fred after you moved out of Blankenship over to St. Andrews? 10 11 Α Yes. Do you remember times where you called him 12 Okav. Q asking for money for school clothes? 13 14 No, I don't. Α Do you remember if he took you shopping for school 15 Q clothes once or twice after you moved out of Blankenship say 16 around eleventh grade? I want you to think about the summer 17 before eleventh grade started. 18 I don't really remember. 19 Α MR. MacARTHUR: Okay. Fair enough. 20 Court's indulgence. 21 22 Thank you very much for your testimony this 23 afternoon, Mahlica. I'm finished. 24 THE WITNESS: Okay. State may begin their redirect. 25 THE COURT:

Thank you. 1 MS. LUZAICH: 2 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 3 BY MS. LUZAICH: You okay, Mahlica? 4 Q 5 Yes. Α All right. Mr. MacArthur talked to you about the 6 Q statements that you gave to the Henderson Police Department in December 2011, and to Metro and CPS in October of 2012. Would 8 you agree with me? 10 Yes. Α Before you came to testify here today I didn't give 11 Q 12 you copies of any of these, did I? 13 Α No. So you haven't looked at them before you came 14 Q Okay. here to testify this week or last week or the week before; 15 16 correct? 17 No. Α 18 Now, when he was asking you questions Q All right. about the Henderson Police Department he started out asking 19 you a question saying something like, isn't it true that the 20 Henderson Police Department asked you if you knew why they 21 wanted to talk to you about Fred and Vicky and you said no. 22 23 Isn't it accurate that the Henderson Police 24 Department didn't ask you if they wanted to talk to you about 25 Fred and Vicky, they just said they wanted to talk to you

about Vicky after talking to her and you didn't know why? 1 2 Yes. Α And Mr. MacArthur also indicated that you never told 3 Q the Henderson Police Department that Vicky had told you 5 anything about what happened when she was 11. Do you remember that? And he showed you some pages. 6 7 MR. MacARTHUR: Objection, Your Honor. Mischaracterizes testimony. 8 MS. LUZAICH: Oh, I disagree. 9 Overruled. You can proceed. 10 THE COURT: 11 BY MS. LUZAICH: Would you agree he said that you -- he said that you 12 0 13 never told the police department in Henderson that Vicky talked to you about what happened when she was 11 when you 14 guys lived on Trish Lane; right? He showed you some pages 15 that didn't talk about that. 16 17 Α Yes. 18 Okay. Q MS. LUZAICH: May I approach? 19 20 THE COURT: You may. 21 BY MS. LUZAICH: 22 Showing you page 7 of the Henderson Police Q 23 Department statement. And would you agree here it says 24 Henderson Police Department on December 17th of 2011; right?

25

Yes.

Α

Q On page 7 does it say -- and question, would you agree that that's the detective asking you a question, and 'A' is you answering the question?

A Yes.

Q Does the detective say, "Do you ever remember Victoria saying anything to you guys when you were little, like 11 years old, when she was 11, about anything with Fred?" and you answered, "Yeah, actually she did say he used to touch her." Is that what that says?

A Yes.

Q And then he said, "And what [sic] that long time ago when she said that?" and did you answer, "Yes, I think that was like when we first -- when we first met them"?

A Okay.

Q Is that right? Is that what that says?

A Yes.

Q So she did talk to you about it way back when and you did tell Henderson about it; right?

A Yes.

Q Then again on page 15 again the Henderson Police Department asks you, "When your sister told you, you said, you told her -- sorry," he got a little confused, "you said she told you when you guys were little. Did she ever tell anyone else or did you ever tell anybody else?" You told them, "No"; right?

A Yes.

Q And did you tell them, "She told me she didn't want me to tell anybody else"?

A Yes.

Q And they asked -- cleared it up. "When you were little?" And you said, "Yes, 'cause she said no one would believe her. She thought she would be in trouble." That's what you told Henderson?

A Yes.

Q Okay. And also when you were talking to Henderson, he said, "When I asked you questions about Fred choking you, you didn't remember." You said that you didn't want to remember; right?

A Yes.

Q In -- when you talked to Henderson did the same thing happen? I'm looking at page 6. Wait. Page 5 and 6. Did they ask you that and you didn't say anything until they said, "Well, Vicky told us that he picked you up by the neck." Do you remember that?

A Yes.

Q And you told them that, yes, he did pick you up by the neck here. "And he's holding you" or "and he's holding you by your neck?" And you said, "Yes"; right?

A Yes.

Q And they said, "Could you breathe the whole time?"

And you said, "No." 2 Yes. Α So you don't like talking about these things, do 3 Q you? 4 5 No. Α Would you rather that nobody ask you any of these 6 Q questions and you not have to talk about it? 8 Α Yes. That statement that Mr. MacArthur showed you that 9 Q you wrote, you didn't recognize it until you saw it? This one 10 here, Honey. That's your handwriting; right? 11 12 Yes. Α Did somebody tell you to write that? 13 Q 14 MR. MacARTHUR: Objection. Leading. 15 Overruled. I'll allow her to answer. THE COURT: I really don't remember. THE WITNESS: 16 BY MS. LUZAICH: 17 That's fine. 18 Okay. Q You told the police that you were afraid to live 19 with Fred. Why? 20 Objection as to time frame. 21 MR. MacARTHUR: 22 THE COURT: I'm sorry. What? 23 Foundation. MR. MacARTHUR: Time frame. 24 MS. LUZAICH: It was in the interview he 25 specifically asked her about.

1 THE COURT: Go ahead. 2 I asked her about four interviews. MR. MacARTHUR: 3 You know what, maybe just give us some THE COURT: foundation regarding the time frame. 4 5 I'll come back to that. MS. LUZAICH: MR. MacARTHUR: Your Honor, in the event the State 6 cannot locate a specific document with that I would ask that it be stricken. What specific document? 9 THE COURT: MR. MacARTHUR: I can't specify. 10 I mean, you can just ask her when she --11 THE COURT: what was the time frame that she lived with him. I'm going 12 back through my notes so I can try and determine it, but it's 13 up to the parties. 14 15 You know what, and my notes indicate that she already testified to that on cross-examination. 16 17 Well, that's what I asked. MS. LUZAICH: Mr. --18 okay. Thank you. 19 BY MS. LUZAICH: Mr. MacArthur asked you, did you tell the police 20 Q that you were afraid to live with Fred. You did tell them 21 22 that; correct?

MR. MacARTHUR: Objection, Your Honor. Perhaps we should approach so that we're not editorializing.

THE COURT: You may. You may.

23

24

(Bench Conference) 1 Okay. Let me just make it clear. 2 THE COURT: 3 Sometimes it's hard for me to read my own handwriting. But in 2008 she told CPS she was afraid. 4 But --That she was not afraid. 5 MR. MacARTHUR: The testimony said she was not afraid. I was referencing --6 7 She didn't tell CPS she was afraid. THE COURT: MR. MacARTHUR: 8 Right. THE COURT: Although she said --9 MS. LUZAICH: Right. I'll rephrase my question. 10 THE COURT: -- she was afraid, but she didn't tell 11 them that she was afraid. 12 13 MR. MacARTHUR: Right. Right. MS. LUZAICH: I'll rephrase my question. 14 15 MR. MacARTHUR: All right. And so I'm assuming you want the 16 THE COURT: timeline of when they lived together. 17 18 MR. MacARTHUR: Right. First foundation. Now I know we're talking about CPS 2008. 19 THE COURT: Are you talking about CPS or the police? 20 I will rephrase my question entirely. 21 MS. LUZAICH: 22 Okay. THE COURT: Thanks. 23 MS. ALLEN: Before the next witness, we have to have 24 -- we have to have -- do something outside the presence. 25 THE COURT: Okay.

Okay. 1 MS. ALLEN: Thanks. Okay. 2 THE COURT: Perfect. 3 MR. MacARTHUR: Thank you, Your Honor. 4 BY MS. LUZAICH: 5 And, Mahlica, I am very sorry, and the defense. Q My handwritten notes were really bad. 6 7 Okay. You know what, I'm sorry. THE COURT: I have to stop you, because the jury has asked for a break. 8 MS. LUZAICH: 9 Oh. Okay. During this recess you're 10 THE COURT: Okay. admonished not to talk or converse amongst yourselves or with 11 anyone else on any subject connected with this trial, or read, 12 13 watch, or listen to any report or commentary on the trial or any person connected with this trial by any medium of 14 information, including, without limitation, newspapers, 15 television, the internet or radio, form or express any opinion 16 on any subject connected with this trial until the case is 17 18 finally submitted to you. We'll be in recess until the court marshal indicates 19 otherwise. 20 21 (Court recessed at 3:29 p.m., until 3:39 p.m.) 22 (Jury is not present) 23 The hearing is taking place outside the THE COURT: 24 presence of the jury panel. I just wanted to do it now so --25 MS. ALLEN: Yes.

-- we didn't have to excuse them again. 1 THE COURT: Actually, I had suggested that to 2 MS. ALLEN: Yes. Susan, because I thought it would make more sense. 3 So, Your Honor, it's my understanding the State is 4 5 putting Dr. Anita Gondy on the stand. 6 THE COURT: Okay. 7 She's actually here. MS. ALLEN: That's the OB-GYN? THE COURT: 8 MS. ALLEN: Correct. She actually was noticed as my 9 The State didn't notice her, so I would object, 10 witness. obviously, to them calling her. I know what the State's 11 argument would be to that. But more importantly, this is my 12 13 concern. Okay. Say it again. You noticed her as 14 THE COURT: a witness? 15 16 MS. ALLEN: Yes. 17 The State did not. THE COURT: 18 MS. ALLEN: The State did not. No. 19 THE COURT: Okay. MS. ALLEN: Sorry to object to their calling her. 20 But that's not really my concern. My concern is this. 21 They intend to put her on the stand and testify about Taharah and 22 23 Taguanda being seen back in June of 2012. She was taken in by 24 -- I've interviewed Dr. Gondy, and she continually referring 25 to the person there as her grandmother -- the girls'

grandmother. She doesn't have a very clear recollection that it wasn't the grandmother. But in fact I think it was Lealer Cooks who brought in the girls, and there were -- I believe Ms. Cooks made statements to Dr. Gondy. The patient, Taharah, did not say a word. If you ask Dr. Gondy under oath, I think if you just asked her, she would tell you Taharah actually did not say a word, everything that she gathered regarding Taharah's diagnosis would have come from Lealer Cooks.

I would object to the testimony of Dr. Gondy with regard to what she was told by Lealer Cooks. Firstly -- first off, I don't believe that it falls under the exception of the I think it's 51.115 --

THE COURT: How old -- how old was she at that time?

MS. ALLEN: Taharah?

THE COURT: Yeah.

MS. ALLEN: She was 12. She was 12 years old.

THE COURT: Okay.

MS. ALLEN: So I would object that this is not for the purposes of a medical diagnosis simply because it doesn't come from the patient itself, it comes from Ms. Cooks.

That being said, the bigger problem is this. Lealer Ann Cooks is the codefendant in this case. And admission of that statement implicates <u>Bruton</u>, it implicates Sixth Amendment confrontation clause issues. And under <u>Bruton</u> admission of a codefendant's statement in any way is a per se

violation.

1

2

3

5

6

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I know the State argues that there's an exception to the hearsay rule. And that may be true. The Court may find that in fact it is an exception under the medical diagnosis, because, you know, she was giving her information for the purposes of Taharah's exam. But constitutional authority trumps statutory provisions. And certainly the hearsay statutes and the exceptions thereto, those are statutory authority, they're not constitutional. The Sixth Amendment and due process and confrontation clause are constitutional issues. Admission of Lealer Ann Cooks's statement violates that right that my client has to confront and cross-examine the codefendant in this case. And those statements that she made would violate -- would significantly violate that. That would put me in a position of, oh, great, now do I have to put Lealer Cooks on the stand to explain why she made those statements to Dr. Gondy.

So that is due process and Sixth Amendment violation of my client's constitutional rights.

THE COURT: How about Taquanda?

MS. ALLEN: With regard to Taquanda?

THE COURT: If Dr. Gondy testified, do you have any question about Taquanda?

MS. ALLEN: Yeah. It would be the same objection.

But here's the thing. I know that Taquanda made statements to

her.

THE COURT: Okay.

MS. ALLEN: In Dr. Gondy's mind I don't know that she can differentiate the statements is the concern. And one of the reasons why I didn't put her on the stand was that in fact -- that exact reason. She doesn't have a clear recollection of things. She didn't take good notes. You can just tell by talking to her.

THE COURT: Ms. Luzaich?

MS. LUZAICH: It is not a <u>Bruton</u> violation. <u>Bruton</u> exists because in theory a defendant can't call a codefendant to testify. Lealer Cooks has pled guilty, she has been sentenced, she no longer has a Fifth Amendment right. So, I, or Ms. Allen, could call her to the stand and she can't invoke. So <u>Bruton</u> is out the door. Therefore, these are statements made for purposes of medical diagnosis. And when you look at 51.115 it just says, "Statements made for purposes of medical diagnosis or treatment and describing medical history or past or present symptoms, pain or sensation or the inception of, general character, or cause of external source thereof are not inadmissible under the hearsay rule."

It says nothing about if they come from the patient, if they come from the victim. It just says "statements made." So the fact that the statement comes from Lealer Cooks and not Taharah is completely irrelevant. 51.115 for the record,

Judge.

So the fact that on June 27th of 2012 Lealer Cooks brings Taharah to the doctor and tells the doctor that there are allegations of sexual abuse from a month earlier, which coincidentally Taharah and Taquanda will say, in May of 2012, one month earlier, they told Miss Ann that Fred was sexually abusing Taharah, and at first Miss Ann did nothing and then she said she was going to do something, and what does she do she takes her to the OB-GYN, whereupon a test is done, HPV is detected, which is a disease that -- a disease or whatever, a virus that you get -- can get by sexually transmitted diseases. And then they also talk to her about -- the doctor, about birth control for this 12-year-old on a followup visit.

So it's -- it's --

THE COURT: Okay. But I know there's that case that it does not fit within the hearsay exception if it's for purposes of trial, for purposes of I guess building a case.

Now, I know it's different because the State wasn't involved -- well, at least the District Attorney wasn't involved. But based upon what you're telling me it sounds like they were taken to Dr. Gondy because Miss Ann, correct, believed that there was sexual abuse going on.

MS. LUZAICH: Well, I mean, that along with heavy periods is what she's there for. Which is why she also has the ultrasound. But that -- that case doesn't apply to this.

```
Do you know what I'm talking about?
 1
              THE COURT:
                            Chavez.
                                     That doesn't --
 2
              MS. LUZAICH:
 3
              THE COURT:
                          Okay.
              MS. LUZAICH: -- apply to this. I mean, this has --
 4
   Miss Ann doesn't take her for any purpose other than to get
 5
    her examined. It's Miss Ann's boyfriend who she at the time
 6
    I'm told, believed, the boyfriend, not the kids.
                          Okay. And, again, I don't know if
              THE COURT:
 8
    Taquanda -- is she going to testify about Taquanda?
 9
              MS. LUZAICH: I wasn't going to ask her about
10
11
    Taquanda.
              THE COURT:
12
                          Okay.
13
                         Again, the situation is just a little
              MS. ALLEN:
    different I think with regard -- and --
14
15
                          Uh-huh.
              THE COURT:
              MS. ALLEN: -- I would object to her testifying
16
17
    about Taquanda, but the --
18
                          Okay. She says she's not going to.
              THE COURT:
19
    So --
                         Right, I understand. But --
20
              MS. ALLEN:
                          -- we're good with that.
21
              THE COURT:
22
                          -- the differentiation for me is that
              MS. ALLEN:
23
    Taquanda actually verbalized things to this doctor.
                                                          In fact,
24
    Taquanda said at the prelim, I think, she told the doctor she
25
    was being sexually abused at home or something to that effect,
```

and the doctor -- or not that she was being sexually abused, but something had happened and the doctor told her she should move out. I mean, that was the testimony, I believe, is from Taquanda.

But, nonetheless, I mean, you know, again, I -- this -- I don't believe it does fit within the 51.115, because I -- so now we're essentially saying that anybody that comes into a physician's office can make any statement whatsoever and now it's admissible hearsay. That's not it. In all honesty, again, I believe just having interviewed Dr. Gondy, she essentially -- she got a lot of things wrong, she really -- I mean, she got a lot of things wrong. But, nonetheless, that's not the point. Obviously it would be subject to cross-examination. It does invoke -- I would argue it does invoke Bruton, it does invoke the confrontation clause or putting a statement -- she's still a codefendant. She's still involved in this case.

MS. LUZAICH: Well, yes and no. She was charged separately. She's not a codefendant. And she doesn't have any more Fifth Amendment rights, and that's what <u>Bruton</u> is there to protect, that the codefendant in a case can't be called -- the B defendant can't be called by the A defendant, because the B defendant has Fifth Amendment rights. This isn't even a B defendant. She was charged separately, and she was charged with knowing about the abuse and failing to

protect. She pled guilty to knowing about the abuse and failing to protect, and she's currently on probation. She has no Fifth Amendment rights.

So I could call her as a witness or Miss Allen could call her as a witness. So there is no <u>Bruton</u> problem. And as far as whether she's right or wrong in information, I mean, that's what cross-examination is for. But on June 27th of 2012, when she generated notes, her notes said, possible sexual abuse suspected a month ago.

MS. ALLEN: Two things -- and just two things, Your Honor. For the record, she may not have been charged in this case. She was still charged with charges related to the facts and circumstances surrounding this case. So while she's not a B defendant in this particular case, she really is still a codefendant for the purposes of <u>Bruton</u>. There's no allegations against Lealer Ann Cooks. There were any -- they were different charges, but they don't involve separate sets of facts or circumstances. They all involve what we're talking about here. So she is a codefendant for the purposes of <u>Bruton</u>.

And secondly, there was an agreement -- I mean, Ms. Luzaich and I came to an agreement that Lealer was not going to testify. I mean, we did come to that agreement. She assured me she wasn't putting Lealer on the stand, and I told her we weren't putting her on the stand. So, I mean, that was

an agreement we made before trial.

And so now the fact that this doctor's coming in to testify, now I'm left with, okay, now do I have to put Lealer on the stand. Now she's been convicted. Now I have to explain the conviction. All of those things. So there's certainly problems and ramifications with that.

I apologize. Yes, probative versus prejudicial,
Your Honor. The prejudicial value of this -- the prejudicial
nature of this exceeds the probative value. They had Dr.
Mehta testify. Dr. Mehta testified to the fact that she had
an STD. I mean, that's what came in out of Dr. Gondy's
report, and that was the important part of it. At least I
assume that was the important part of it for the State.
According to everybody, Taharah's verbalized that she's been
sexually abused. To go into this I believe -- again, I -- you
know I stand by my argument with <u>Bruton</u> that it would be
highly prejudicial.

THE COURT: Okay. Do you want to add anything?

MS. LUZAICH: Well, the probative nature far

surpasses the prejudicial effect. Everybody -- their defense
is that they're making it up and that nobody tells anybody

about the abuse. And whenever anybody says, I told about the

abuse, they keep -- they try to find people that say, oh,

well, I didn't hear that. Here is somebody that was told.

Taharah didn't tell, but Miss Ann told in Taharah's presence.

So as far as Taharah's concerned, it was reported to somebody 1 of, you know, an authoritarian nature. So it is extraordinarily probative on several different levels. 3 Okay. Have you pretrialed her? 4 THE COURT: 5 I've spoken to her on the phone, yes. MS. LUZAICH: 6 THE COURT: Does she know the difference between the two children? I'm not asking her about Taquanda. 8 MS. LUZAICH: Okay. But, Ms. Allen seems to think 9 THE COURT: that she's going to be confused and talk about Taquanda when 10 she really means Taharah. Is that correct, or visa versa? 11 Well, I just -- there's -- I think 12 MS. ALLEN: there's going to be some confusion all around about some of 13 the things that she says, Your Honor. Without disclosing what 14 I know --15 16 THE COURT: Okay. -- that she told me, it could present a 17 MS. ALLEN: substantial problem during the trial at this point, because 18 it's a defense issue. 19 Sorry, Judge. 20 MR. MacARTHUR: 21 That's okay. You can confer. THE COURT: 22 (Pause in the proceedings) 23 MS. ALLEN: I mean, I can offer it to the Court in 24 camera if -- I mean -- or not in camera, but --25 MR. MacARTHUR: The equivalent.

```
MS. ALLEN: Ex parte, I guess.
 1
                              In short, Your Honor --
 2
              MR. MacARTHUR:
                          Because it's a defense -- it's a defense
 3
              MS. ALLEN:
    strategy. So I don't want to say it in open court, obviously.
 4
 5
              THE COURT: I don't think you have to do that. I
    don't think you have to do that.
 6
 7
              Anything else?
              MS. LUZAICH:
                            No.
 8
                          Okay. The objection's overruled. She's
 9
              THE COURT:
    only going to testify regarding Taharah; correct?
10
                            That's correct.
              MS. LUZAICH:
11
                          Okay. Is she your next witness?
12
              THE COURT:
13
              MS. LUZAICH:
                            She is. And she has an appointment at
14
    4:30.
            I have --
15
                         Well, let's --
              THE COURT:
              MS. LUZAICH: -- two more questions of Mahlica
16
    unless we can call her out of order.
17
18
              THE COURT:
                          Do you mind?
                              I don't mind.
19
              MR. MacARTHUR:
              THE COURT: Because I don't know how long it's going
20
    to take you with Mahlica.
21
22
              MR. MacARTHUR: I don't expect to have very many
23
    questions. I only have two questions, and if she has two.
24
    But given that Dr. Gondy has a 4:30 appointment --
25
              THE COURT:
                          Okay.
```

MR. MacARTHUR: -- I don't mind pushing pause on 1 Mahlica. 3 MS. LUZAICH: Thank you. All right. We can bring the panel in. THE COURT: 5 (Jury is present) Is there a stipulation to the presence? 6 THE COURT: 7 Yes, Your Honor. MS. ALLEN: 8 MS. LUZAICH: Yes. Okay. At this time, ladies and 9 THE COURT: gentlemen, we're going to take one witness out of order. 10 The State's going to call their next witness, and then we'll put 11 Mahlica back on the stand. So go ahead. 12 MS. LUZAICH: Thank you. The State calls Dr. Anita 13 14 Gondy. 15 ANITA GONDY, M.D., STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN Could you please state your full name, 16 THE CLERK: spelling your first and last name for the record. 17 18 Anita Gondy, A-N-I-T-A G-O-N-D-Y. THE WITNESS: Thank you. 19 THE CLERK: 20 DIRECT EXAMINATION 21 BY MS. LUZAICH: 22 Thank you. Good afternoon, ma'am. Can you tell the jury what do you do for a living. 23 24 I'm an OB-GYN. Α 25 What is an OB-GYN? Q

- A I deliver babies, take care of women, their menstrual problems, surgeries, menopause.
 - Q How long have you been an OB-GYN?
 - A Sixteen years in practice.
- Q Can you describe briefly for us what training and education you have that qualifies you to do that.
- A We go through medical school, and I did -- you got to go through residency program and then practice afterwards.
- Q Okay. I assume you went to college first. Where did you go to college?
- A I did my college and medical school and residence in India and I came here and did one year of internal medicine, then residency again in OB-GYN here. So that's --
 - Q When did you come here and begin your residencies?
- 15 A '91, September 5th, I came here. I started my
 16 residency '93, June --
- 17 Q And when you say here --
- 18 A -- July.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

19

- Q Oh. Sorry. When you say here do you mean Las Vegas?
- 21 A Las Vegas.
- 22 And you've been practicing as a OB-GYN ever since?
- A Board certified OB-GYN since 1998, January 5th.
- Q Okay. And what does your practice entail? You said surgeries, seeing women with menstrual problems. Do you see

mostly adult women? 2 Α Yes. Do you have any special training in seeing children? 3 Q 4 Α No. I'm going to direct your attention specifically to 5 Q June of 2012. Where were you working at that time? 6 7 In my office. Α Where's your office? 8 Q It's at 3160 Smoke Ranch Road. 9 Α Do you work by yourself or with anybody? 10 Q We have -- I have two other associates. 11 Α 12 Okay. Is your practice called something in Q particular? 13 The d/b/a is the OB-GYN Center. The OB-GYN Center. 14 15 Okay. And at the OB-GYN Center you said is you and Q two other physicians? 16 17 Α Yes. Are they also OB-GYNs? 18 Q 19 Yes. Α And do they also do what you do? 20 Q 21 Α Yes. 22 On June 27th of 2012 at the OB-GYN Center did you have occasion to see a patient that became known to you as 23 24 Taharah Duke? 25 Α Yes.

When you saw her how old was she? 1 Q Twelve. 2 Α 3 What was she brought to you for? Q As I saw the record, she came in with heavy 4 Α 5 menstrual cycles. Did she come alone or with anybody? 6 Q Her grandmother brought her. Α A woman? 8 Q 9 A woman. Α An older woman? 10 Q Not so old, yes. 11 Α 12 Now -- well, older than her, how is that, of adult Q 13 age? 14 Yes. Α And did the woman indicate what the -- have any kind 15 Q of paperwork regarding guardianship? 16 17 There was something scanned in the front office. Α The guardianship says Lealer Cook, I believe. 18 19 Lealer Cooks, maybe. Q 20 Yeah. Α And that paperwork was brought in by whoever brought 21 Q 22 Taharah? 23 Α Yes. 24 MS. LUZAICH: May I approach? 25 THE COURT: You may.

BY MS. LUZAICH:

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- Q Showing you what's been marked as State's Proposed Exhibit 1, do you recognize that photo?
 - A That's the lady that brought the kid.
- Q State's Proposed Exhibit 1 is the woman who brought Taharah?
 - A Yes.
 - Q Okay. Thank you.

When you said that Taharah was brought in by the woman with heavy menstrual bleeding do you get a history with every patient that you see?

- 12 A I do. I have a scribe. Also I have a MA, also.
 13 All three of us take histories.
- Q What is the purpose behind your getting a history of a patient?

A What the symptoms are and how long they've been and how they affect the life and whether they need to be treated, what kind of tests need to be ordered, what kind of followup needs to be done.

- Q Okay. And as part of the history did you learn something about Taharah and somebody else from this guardian?
- A Taharah has a sister that was also brought up I'm thinking the same day.
- Q Okay.
- 25 A But her --

THE COURT: Okay. We just --1 I'm not worried about the sister. 2 MS. LUZAICH: 3 THE COURT: Thank you. 4 BY MS. LUZAICH: Did the guardian tell you something about abuse? 5 Q 6 Α Yes. 7 What did the guardian tell you about abuse? Q She said she's suspecting somebody may be abusing 8 Α her so that's why she -- you know, she's working with somebody else with that. 10 11 Q Okay. So we didn't go into the detail on that. 12 13 Okay. So the guardian told you that there was --Q she was worried that Taharah had been abused. 14 Possibly. 15 Α Did she say specifically sexual abuse? 16 Q 17 Yes. Α 18 And did she tell you it had been approximately a Q month earlier that she had learned of that? 19 20 Don't know about that. Α Would it -- did you generate records at or near the 21 Q 22 time of your visit? 23 Α Right. And would it refresh your recollection to review 24 Q 25 records?

```
I don't remember the time and stuff.
 1
         Α
              Yeah.
              MS. LUZAICH: May I approach?
 2
              THE COURT:
                           You may.
 3
    BY MS. LUZAICH:
              What I'm showing you, does this appear to be records
 5
         Q
    generated by your office?
 6
 7
         Α
              Yes.
 8
              And are they for Taharah Duke?
         Q
 9
              Yes.
         Α
              From June 27th of 2012.
10
         Q
11
         Α
              Yes.
              And does it indicate --
12
         Q
13
              Month.
         Α
              -- when -- what does it --
14
         Q
15
              Month ago, yeah.
         Α
              One month ago.
16
         Q
17
              Uh-huh.
         Α
              Okay. Did you examine Taharah Duke?
18
         Q
19
              Yes.
         Α
              What kind of examination did you do?
20
         Q
              I did review the records a couple days ago.
21
         Α
                                                              She did
22
    have a pelvic exam --
23
              When a --
24
              -- speculum exam.
         Α
25
              When a pelvic exam is done how is it conducted?
                                   151
```

A We had a speculum exam and by manual exam, also, on this Taharah.

Q When you say a speculum exam, did you insert a speculum into her vaginal opening and look inside?

A Yes.

Q And did you also do some sort of swabs?

A I did take a pap smear. I did also take a gonorrhea chlamydia testing and a vaginal secretion swab.

Q Why did you do all of those?

A Because of her history they were suggesting.

Q The history of sexual abuse -- potential sexual abuse?

A Sexual abuse.

Q Did you ultimately get results back from those swabs?

A Yes.

Q And what were the results?

A Gonorrhea chlamydia test was negative, vaginal cultures were negative for trichomoniasis or anything else. We only saw HPV virus. I asked the pap smear to be further tested for HPV virus, which is a sexually transmitted virus for majority of the time. So we have the high-risk HPV positive on the pap smear.

Q Okay. And did they return to you for followup at all?

A She had an ultrasound after that and she came back after the ultrasound for the followup and the blood test and the ultrasound, too.

Q Okay. How many times did Taharah come back and see you; do you recall?

A I believe -- on ultrasound dates I don't see them. Usually ultrasound tech performs them the next day. So two times.

Q Okay. And when she came back who would she have been with?

A I have two charts, so I'm trying to remember. I think she is with her grandmother again.

Q Okay. So with an adult at least.

A Adult, yes.

Q And did the adult that was with her that's depicted in that picture talk to you about anything else as far as either treatment or future care for Taharah?

A No. We talked about the HPV. We talked about the vaccinations, she was interested in the vaccination as per my records. I don't remember, you know, the details, of course. And then we talked about the birth control option. She was interested in getting her started on something.

Q The guardian was interested in getting Taharah, the 12-year-old, started on birth control.

A Birth control. So we talked about that. And

because her menstrual cycles were heavy and she also wanted birth control so we ran through the options of hormonal methods, then they chose to have an Nexplanon, which is a rod that you place under the skin so it can control the menstrual 5 cycles, too. But I haven't seen them afterwards. So they didn't follow up with vaccines or 6 Okay. birth control? 8 No. Α Thank you. I would pass the witness. 9 MS. LUZAICH: THE COURT: 10 Cross. 11 CROSS-EXAMINATION 12 BY MS. ALLEN: Good afternoon, Dr. Gondy. How are you? 13 Q 14 Very good, thank you. Α 15 We spoke before. Is that correct? Q Right. 16 Α I came to your office? 17 Q 18 Yes. Α And I'm just going to ask you about the 19 Q medical records and some of the things we discussed when we 20 were in your office. 21 Okay? 22 Α Yes. 23 You -- do you have an independent recollection of Q 24 Like can you see her in your mind? Taharah Duke? 25 Α No.

Okay. It's been a while; is that correct? 1 Q It's been a while. 2 Α Okay. And the first time you saw her was June 27th 3 Q of 2012; is that right? 4 5 Yes. Α And she was with her grandmother? 6 Q 7 Α Yes. 8 And who else was there at that visit? Q 9 Can I see the record one more time? Because --Α 10 Sure. Q -- I usually write it, because like I say, I saw 11 Α 12 sister's records, too. So --Sure. Take a look at those. 13 Q First day she -- this child only came with her 14 15 grandmother. Okay. Was -- do you recall telling me there was 16 Q somebody else sitting there? 17 18 Second -- there was another person that came in Α afterwards, and that was the father, but it was for the other 19 child, as per my record. 20 21 Q Okay. 22 He came for the test results for the second child. Α 23 Okay. Q Older child. 24 Α 25 Okay. And do you remember -- you remember the Q 155

father being there; is that right? 1 2 Right. Α Okay. And you remember -- you described him as 3 Q wearing like sunglasses or glasses the whole time? 5 Α Yes. 6 Q Okay. African-American, little bit maybe about 35, 7 Α forties, a little bit taller, and maybe braids. 8 remember. Did he have -- short hair -- oh, short hair, long 10 Q hair, you can't remember. 11 I think it's braids. I'm not too sure. 12 Α 13 Okay. What was his skin tone? Was it dark? Q 14 Dark. Α Dark skin tone. Okay. And was he a bigger guy? 15 Q Not terribly big. Medium build. 16 Α Medium build. 17 Q 18 Yeah. Α And did he introduce himself to you? 19 Q Okay. 20 Α No. He did not. Okay. He just sat there with his 21 Q glasses on; is that correct? 23 Right. 24 Do you remember in our conversations that you Q Okay. -- when you spoke with Lealer she said that she was concerned 25 156

that the children's father couldn't take care of them; is that correct?

- A Father was taking care of Taharah.
- Q Uh-huh.

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

22

23

24

A And, but I met both of them in the room one time. Between those two children it's two visits. I'm not sure which visit when, but father was there.

- Q Right.
- A So I saw him, you know, briefly, yes.
- Q And it was your understanding from Lealer that there was concern the father -- because the father was taking care of them, maybe he wasn't really good at taking care them? Is that -- is that -- do you remember telling me that?

A The only thing I had remember, you know, about this person is a little bit, you know, behaves a little immaturely. That's all.

- Q He behaved immaturely?
- 18 A That's it.
- 19 Q Okay.
- A I don't know exactly what it was, but it was -21 that's what my mind says.
 - Q Okay. And was it -- did you get the impression that Lealer was suggesting that it was the father that had -- that was possibly suspected in the sexual abuse?
- 25 A No.

- Q You didn't. That wasn't your understanding?
- 2 A No.

1

3

4

7

8

10

- Q Do you remember telling me that when we spoke the last time?
- A No. No. I don't know who it was abusing her, but I know that's the father that came in.
 - Q Uh-huh.
 - A First time she came in without the person. But, like I said, I saw both children two times. The second time for the older children that possibly had another physical condition, he came for her test results himself.
- 12 Q Okay.
- 13 A So I saw grandmother and the father in the room 14 together.
- 15 Q And it was grandmother and what you believed to be 16 her son; is that correct?
- 17 A That's what I thought.
- Q Yeah. That was her son. Okay. That's what you thought, it was her son. And you referred to -- in our conversation you referred to it as her son.
- 21 A As father, yeah.
- Q Okay. And the father to the two girls.
- 23 A Right.
- Q Okay. You -- in your notes -- do you recall telling
 me that Taharah never said a word to you?

- Taharah. I don't remember whether they talked, but 1 Α the children didn't talk much. 2 Do you recall then also saying that you 3 Q thought she was maybe developmentally delayed? 4 One of them is. The other one is. The older one 5 Α 6 is. 7 The older one. Okay. And then you have in your Q 8 comments notes that you took, and things like irregular menses, the cramping, loss of appetite. You document something about a family history of breast cancer. And then 10 you in your notes you say the patient is a virgin. 11 Do you recall that in your notes? 12 13 No, I don't. Α MS. ALLEN: May I approach? 14 15 THE WITNESS: Yes. 16 THE COURT: You may. 17 BY MS. ALLEN: 18 And that's the --0 This is not my notes. This is actually my 19 Α No. scribe, I mean not my scribe, my -- sorry. 20
 - Q That's okay.

21

22

- A There's too many people. It's the ultrasound tech.
- 23 Q Oh. Okay. The ultrasound tech.
- 24 A So she took the history, patient is a virgin.
 - Q Okay. So this would have been --

As per the grandmother. Was saying, grandmother --1 Α I mean, the grandmother has breast cancer history she's 2 saying. Right. Q She's just -- for her notice, why did I order pelvic 5 Α ultrasound, and that's the reason why she's documenting. 6 7 Q I understand that. So the idea that No. No. No. -- so this could have come from -- Taharah had given the 8 information that she was the virgin? Whoever is -- Taharah was probably giving that 10 Α information. 11 Okay. So Taharah probably gave that information 12 Q that she --13 She's a young child. So, you know, we don't usually 14 Α order transvaginal ultrasounds. 15 16 Q Right. We don't usually do exams on them, either. 17 Α 18 MS. ALLEN: Okay. Court's indulgence for a moment. (Pause in the proceedings) 19 20 BY MS. ALLEN: Sorry, Dr. Gondy. 21 Q 22 That's okay. Α 23 I apologize. Q Court's indulgence one more time. 24 MS. ALLEN: Oh. 25 THE COURT: Sure.

BY MS. ALLEN: All right. Dr. Gondy, going back to Ms. Lealer 2 Cooks, and she -- again, the second time she came in she came in with her son; is that correct? 5 I think so. I'm confused between, like I said, two Α is it's -- are documented for two children. 6 7 Q Okay. So at one time at least I see them together, both of 8 them in the room that I know. Did you know that they were sisters? 10 Q They told me. So that's in my record, too. 11 Α Yeah. 12 Okay. Q I usually put down if there are relative in the 13 Α 14 office, I always put their name in there. 15 Okay. So you knew that they were sisters; is that Q 16 correct? Uh-huh. 17 Α 18 Q Yes? 19 Α Yes. Yes. Okay. And then Lealer was the grandmother --20 Q 21 Α Yes. 22 -- is that correct? Okay. And then she came in 23 with a male, 35 to 40, who was her -- you believed was her 24 son? 25 Right. Α

Okay. 1 Q 2 Α Yes. 3 Is that correct? Her son is not sitting over here; Q 4 is that correct? I don't -- I don't know. 5 Α You don't know. You don't remember? 6 Q 7 Similar build and similar, you know, with the Α glasses on and short braid, but I'm not sure. 8 Are you talking about the man in the middle? 9 Q 10 Α No. Okay. Mr. -- the one on the end does not have 11 Q glasses on; is that correct? 12 13 Correct. Α Okay. You don't remember what the son looked like? 14 Q I don't remember. 15 Α Okay. You described him as having dark skin. 16 Q Dark skinned. Similar build, similar tone, similar 17 Α hair. That's all I can say. 18 Do you remember telling -- do you remember telling 19 Q my investigator that he was really dark complected? 20 No, I don't. But that's -- I mean, I'm dark. 21 Α 22 I understand. 23 I consider him dark, too. 24 Q Do you remember saying something about him having 25 short hair?

- A Short hair, like short braids.
- 2 Q And I asked you if he had braids and you said no.
 - A I can't remember. Like today all I remember is he had braids.
 - Q No, I know. But Dr. -- hold on Dr. Gondy. We can't talk over one another. Do you remember me asking you if he had braids and you said no?
 - A I don't remember.
- 9 Q You said he had sunglasses on the whole time. Do 10 you recall that?
- 11 A Yes. He had glasses on.
- 12 Q And he acted very immaturely. Is that correct?
- 13 A Yes.

1

3

4

5

6

- Q Okay. And as you sit here today you believe it was somebody who was about 35?
- A I'm not good at that, really. Somewhere in the middle ages.
- 18 Q Somewhere -- so somewhere --
- 19 A Thirty to forties, yes.
- 20 Q So fifties, 55, 60?
- 21 A No. Thirties to forties.
- Q Definitely not that old.
- 23 A Yeah, somewhere.
- 24 Q You characterize this man as being the son of Lealer 25 Cooks.

```
MS. LUZAICH: Asked and answered. Four times.
 1
 2
              THE WITNESS:
                            Yes.
 3
              THE COURT:
                          Go ahead.
                                     You can answer.
    BY MS. ALLEN:
              You characterized this person as being the son of
 5
         Q
    Lealer Cooks; is that correct?
 6
 7
         Α
              Yes.
              Okay. And how old would you estimate Ms. Cooks was?
 8
              I don't know. Maybe fifties.
 9
         Α
              Okay. So it could -- if it was in fact you believed
10
         Q
    it was her son it couldn't be someone who was 45 or 50; is
11
    that right?
12
13
              Yeah.
                     No.
         Α
14
              Okay. Presumably she couldn't have had a child at
         Q
15
    five.
                   I said 30 to 40, somewhere along that line.
16
         Α
              No.
17
    yeah.
18
              MS. ALLEN:
                          Okay. Thank you, Your Honor.
                                                          I pass
    the witness.
19
                          Any redirect?
              THE COURT:
20
21
              MS. LUZAICH:
                            No, thank you.
22
              Thank you, Dr. Gondy.
23
              THE WITNESS: All right.
24
              THE COURT: Thank you very much for your testimony.
25
    You may step down. You are excused.
```

Thank you. 1 THE WITNESS: And we can call Mahlica back in here. 2 THE COURT: Mahlica, you do understand that you are still under 3 4 oath; correct? 5 (No audible response) THE WITNESS: 6 THE COURT: Okay. 7 MS. LUZAICH: May I? THE COURT: Uh-huh. 8 Thank you. 9 MS. LUZAICH: MAHLICA DUKE, STATE'S WITNESS, PREVIOUSLY SWORN 10 REDIRECT EXAMINATION (Continued) 11 12 BY MS. LUZAICH: And Mahlica, I apologize. My questions before we 13 Q took a break were really confusing so I'm going to start that 14 15 whole thing over. Mr. MacArthur asked you on cross-examination about a 16 conversation you had in 2008 with somebody from Child 17 18 Protective Services. Do you remember him asking you at least about that? And he showed you a paragraph that you read. 19 Is that ringing a bell for you? 20 21 Α Yes. 22 And he asked you if you told them in 2008, I 23 am not afraid of Fred, and you said, no, I did not tell them 24 that; correct? 25 Objection, Your Honor. Misstates MR. MacARTHUR:

her testimony. 1 MS. LUZAICH: Well, she said she didn't remember 2 telling them that. 3 4 THE COURT: Overruled. 5 MR. MacARTHUR: Okay. 6 THE COURT: Go ahead. 7 That part I don't disagree with. MR. MacARTHUR: That's what she said. 8 THE COURT: Okay. MS. LUZAICH: Okay. 9 Oh. THE COURT: Okay. 10 MR. MacARTHUR: Judge, she had a compound question. 11 I'm not objecting to the second part of it. I'm objecting 12 to the first part. She characterized the witness as having 13 14 said --Okay. The witness -- the objection is 15 THE COURT: overruled. Go ahead and ask your next question. 16 17 BY MS. LUZAICH: And after he asked you that or you said you didn't 18 Q remember saying that you had said something like you were or 19 are afraid of Fred. I just want to ask you why. Do you 20 understand? Why were you afraid of Fred? 21 22 MR. MacARTHUR: Are we still talking about 2008? 23 THE COURT: Yes. 24 MS. LUZAICH: Yes. 25

```
BY MS. LUZAICH:
              Mahlica, are you thinking?
 2
         Q
 3
         Α
              No.
              Do you just not want to answer my question?
 4
         Q
 5
              No, not really.
         Α
              How come you don't want to answer my question?
 6
         Q
              Well, I just don't.
 7
         Α
                          Okay. Mahlica, you need to answer her
 8
              THE COURT:
 9
    question. Do you understand it?
              THE WITNESS: Well, yeah, I understand it.
10
              THE COURT:
11
                           Okay.
    BY MS. LUZAICH:
12
              Are you afraid of something now?
13
                   I just -- well, the reason we were afraid of
14
         Α
              No.
    Fred was because he's given me a reason to be afraid of him.
15
16
    So --
17
              The things that he did to you?
         Q
18
              Yes.
         Α
                     That's fine. That's all you have to say.
19
         Q
              Okay.
              You have family here. You have your mother;
20
              You have Taharah and Taquanda.
21
    correct?
22
         Α
              Yes.
23
              You have Shabazz.
         Q
24
              Yes.
         Α
25
              Vicky is in California; right?
         Q
```

1 Α Yes. Do you have any other family here? 2 Q 3 Α No. Do you have any other family that you're aware of 4 Q anywhere that you have communication with? 5 6 Α No. 7 If you weren't with Mom, would you have somewhere to Q 8 go? 9 Probably not. Α Mr. MacArthur asked you questions about Shabazz. 10 Did Shabazz finish high school? 11 12 No, I don't think so. Α 13 Q Do you know the last grade he finished? I believe it was tenth. 14 Α Did he stop going to school before you stopped going 15 Q to school? 16 He stopped going after -- I believe it was 17 Α No. after me. 18 19 Was it close in time to you? Q Okay. 20 I think it was about a few months after I stopped Α 21 going. 22 Okay. Did Shabazz struggle in school? Yes, I think so. 23 Α 24 Did he have anything like an IEP, an Individual Q Education Program, do you know? 25

- A Yes, he did.
- Q He did. You said that you hadn't seen him in a couple weeks, that he lives with friends. Do you remember when is the last time that he actually lived with you and Mom?
- A Like briefly last year.
- Q When you say briefly, do you mean weeks, months, more, less?
 - A I think for a few months.
- Q Okay. Since you left Blankenship have you lived with your mom the whole time?
- 11 A Yes.

1

2

3

5

6

8

9

10

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

- Q Since you guys left Blankenship how much of the time has Shabazz lived with you and your mom?
 - A I believe for six months maybe. I don't really --
- Q Okay. Would you agree with me that you left Blankenship around three and a half years ago, more than three years, less than four years ago?
- A Yes.
- Q And of those three to four years did he live with you for a matter of months, as opposed to a matter of years?
- 21 MR. MacARTHUR: Objection, Your Honor. Leading.
- THE COURT: I'm going to allow her to answer.
- THE WITNESS: I think it was for -- for the first two years we moved out of Blankenship when we were at the St.
- 25 Andrews apartments he lived with us, and then he only stayed

with us for like six to seven months maybe at the Lakewood Cove apartments in Henderson.

BY MS. LUZAICH:

5

6

7

- Q Okay. When you came to this building for the preliminary hearing did you actually come here on multiple days?
 - A What do you mean?
- Q Okay. Remember there was a hearing in another court where you and your sisters and your mom testified?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q Did pretty much all of you testify on different 12 days?
- 13 A Yes.
- Q But did you come for a couple of the days because you weren't sure whether or not you were going to get to testify?
- 17 A Yes.
- Q And was Shabazz actually here one of those days?
- 19 A Yes.
- Q And then did Shabazz stop living with you after
 that? I mean, was that one of the short periods of time that
 Shabazz did live with you?
- A I think so. Actually, I think he was -- he might have been staying with some friends and we had to go get him,

 I believe.

While he is living with friends does he keep in 1 Q 2 regular contact with you? Yeah, he calls us. 3 Α But does he call you every day? Q 5 Α No. Does he have his own phone? 6 Q 7 Well, not really. He has to use other people's Α 8 phone. Okay. So you don't have a number of his own that Q you can call? 10 11 Α No. 12 And he calls you kind of when he feels like it? Q 13 Yeah, pretty much. Α Thank you, Mahlica. 14 MS. LUZAICH: 15 I pass the witness. 16 RECROSS-EXAMINATION 17 BY MR. MacARTHUR: 18 Hello again, Mahlica. Q 19 Hello. Α I've just got a few more questions with you and then 20 Q 21 we'll be done. 22 Α Okay. 23 During the State's -- we took a break; right? Q Okay. 24 Okay. Α And you remember that the State was questioning you 25 Q

before the break and after the break?

A Yes.

Q Okay. We call that a redirect. During the State's redirect do you remember her talking about Fred grabbing you by the neck and lifting you from the ground?

A Yes.

Q She was talking about you having told that to the Henderson Police Department; right?

A Yes.

Q Okay. Now, if you remember, isn't it in fact the case when Henderson asked you about things that Fred had done to you, first you didn't include anything about your neck; is that right?

A Yes.

Q Okay. Then Henderson told you that they had talked to Victoria; right?

A Yes.

Q And they told you some of the things that she had told them had happened to you; right?

A Yes.

Q Okay. And after they told you what Victoria had told them, then you told them about the neck thing; is that correct?

A Yeah, after they had brought it up.

Q Okay. And isn't that in fact the same thing that

happened with regard to the part of the statement pertaining to Victoria being molested when she was eleven? Did that make sense?

A No.

Q I'll ask it a different way. When you first talked to the Henderson Police Department, isn't it in fact true you didn't tell them anything about Victoria having been molested until she was 11 at first?

A Yes.

Q Okay. But then they reminded you -- I'm sorry. Withdrawn. They didn't remind you. They told you they had talked to Victoria; right?

A Yes.

Q And that she had given them certain information?

A Yes.

Q And then when they told you about that that's when you told them that Victoria said that Fred used to molest her when she was 11?

A Yes.

Q Okay. Now, I'm going to go back to my first questions earlier today. Remember I was talking to you about a CPS record from 2008?

A Yes.

Q Okay. And do you remember I gave you the document and let you read it to see if it refreshed your recollection

1 as to what it said? 2 Α Yes. And your testimony was that even though you 3 Q read it it didn't help you remember that conversation with 4 CPS; is that fair? 5 6 Α Yes. 7 Okay. But in fact the information in the document Q said that you were not afraid of living at Blankenship; is 8 that correct? Objection. Hearsay. Move to strike. 10 MS. LUZAICH: Well, Your Honor, the State 11 MR. MacARTHUR: 12 mischaracterized her --13 Overruled. You can answer. THE COURT: MR. MacARTHUR: Thank you, Your Honor. 14 15 And I'm sorry. My objection is the MS. LUZAICH: document is not something that was generated by her or --16 Do you guys want to approach the bench. 17 THE COURT: 18 (Bench Conference) Okay. All four lawyers are present. 19 THE COURT: The hearsay that he just asked her 20 MS. LUZAICH: 21 about is the CPS record from 2008. 22 THE COURT: Are you not asking her about the letter 23 that's already been admitted? 24 MR. MacARTHUR: Not the letter. 25 THE COURT: Okay.

The report generated by a CPS worker 1 MR. MacARTHUR: two years before that. 2 3 Okay. I misunderstood, then. I thought THE COURT: he was referring to the letter. Okay. So --5 MR. MacARTHUR: I understand that the State's objection is hearsay. However, after she read the letter, 6 which in here we know says she's not afraid, she admitted that she said that didn't help her refresh her recollection. But 8 9 then --But she doesn't remember saying that. 10 MS. LUZAICH: Just a second. 11 MR. MacARTHUR: Then you 12 characterized her as having said that she was afraid of living with him and that she didn't remember having said otherwise. 13 14 MS. LUZAICH: Because that's what she said. 15 My note said that she was afraid to tell THE COURT: them that she was afraid to live with him. Okay. 16 Why can't you just use the letter that's already been admitted? 17 18 MR. MacARTHUR: That's from a different year and a different interview. 19 Okay. All right. The objection's 20 THE COURT: 21 sustained. 22 MR. MacARTHUR: 23 (End of bench conference) 24 THE COURT: Go ahead. 25 Your Honor, we'll reserve for the MR. MacARTHUR:

```
CPS witness.
 2
              THE COURT:
                           Thank you.
    BY MR. MacARTHUR:
              Mahlica, does Miss Ann have a son?
 4
         Q
 5
              Yes.
         Α
              Okay. And what is his name?
 6
         Q
 7
              Markus.
         Α
              Markus. Do you know how old Markus is?
 8
         Q
              No, not anymore.
 9
         Α
              Could you approximate?
10
         Q
              Thirty-four maybe.
11
         Α
12
              Okay. Mid thirty-ish?
         Q
13
              Yeah.
         Α
              Okay. And is he white or black?
14
         Q
15
              Black.
         Α
              And as far as black people go, is he light skinned
16
         Q
17
    or dark skinned?
18
         Α
              Dark.
              Okay. Is he tall or short?
19
         Q
              Tall.
20
         Α
              And is he muscular, skinny, or in between?
21
         Q
22
         Α
              In between.
23
              Okay. And how do you know him?
         Q
              What do you mean?
24
         Α
25
              Well, I mean, you've met him before. How many times
         Q
                                   176
```

have you interacted with him or how many times have you seen him? 3 Multiple times. Α Did he used to come over to the Blankenship house? Q 5 Actually, he used to live there at one time. Α Yeah. And as best as you can, can you tell us when 6 Q Okay. he moved in? I believe it was 2008, maybe. 8 Α And how long did he live with you before he Q 2008. moved out? 10 I'm not really sure. 11 Did he live with you more than a year or less than a 12 year, could you say that? 13 It was probably more than a year. 14 Was he still living there when you and your 15 Q Okay. mom and Victoria and Shabazz moved to St. Andrews? 16 17 I don't think so. Α He had already -- he had already left by then? 18 Q 19 Yeah. Α When was the last time you had contact with 20 Q Okay. him? 21 I don't really remember. Maybe before he moved out. 22 23 Okay. And lastly, could you describe, what kind of Q hair did he have back then? 24 25 Do you know what a fade is? Α

1 Q Yeah. He had one of those. 2 Α Yeah. 3 He kind of had a fade. Q Yes. 4 Α 5 MR. MacARTHUR: Court's indulgence. Thank you, Mahlica. I'm done. 6 7 THE WITNESS: Okay. Can I just ask one question? 8 MS. LUZAICH: Go ahead. 9 THE COURT: 10 FURTHER REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MS. LUZAICH: 11 12 And I'm so sorry, Mahlica. What's a fade? It's like -- it's kind of hard to explain. 13 It's like when -- it's common in black guys, I guess. Like they 14 15 get their hair cut like really, really, really low, to the point where it's like you could still see the hair, but it's 16 really, really short. It's like kind of in between being bald 17 18 and having --Almost like the guy in the center that was just 19 Q asking you questions? 20 21 Α It's a little more than that. No. 22 But a little more than that. 23 Α It's kind of like that, but a little more hair than that. 24 25 Not braids. Q

1	А	No.				
2		MS. LUZAICH: Okay. Thank you.				
3		THE COURT: Anything else?				
4	FURTHER RECROSS-EXAMINATION					
5	BY MR. MacARTHUR:					
6	Q That was back in 2008; right?					
7	A Yes.					
8		MR. MacARTHUR: We're done, Judge.				
9		THE COURT: Okay. Thank you very much. You may				
10	step down.					
11		THE WITNESS: Okay.				
12		THE COURT: Oh. Wait. It looks like we have a				
13	question.	So if you just don't mind waiting here for just a				
14	moment.					
15		THE WITNESS: Okay.				
16		THE COURT: Okay. Can you all meet me in the				
17	hallway.					
18		(Hallway bench conference)				
19		THE COURT: Do the parties stipulate to the				
20	presence?					
21		MS. LUZAICH: Yes.				
22		MS. ALLEN: Yes, Your Honor.				
23		THE COURT: Okay. Mahlica, I just have a couple				
24	questions	for you.				
25		Where is your biological father?				
		179				

THE WITNESS: The last time I checked he was in Georgia.

THE COURT: Okay. And when is the last time you spoke to or, it says seen, but saw your father?

THE WITNESS: Ten years ago, I believe, or eleven years ago.

THE COURT: Okay. Any followup from the State?

MS. LUZAICH: No.

THE COURT: Any followup from the defense?

MR. MacARTHUR: No, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Okay. Thank you very much for your testimony here today. You may step down. You are excused from your subpoena.

We're going to conclude for the evening. During this recess you're admonished not to talk or converse amongst yourselves or with anyone else on any subject connected with this trial, or read, watch, or listen to any report or commentary on the trial or any person connected with this trial by any medium of information, including, without limitation, newspapers, television, Internet or radio, form or express any opinion on any subject connected with this trial until the case is finally submitted to you.

We'll start tomorrow morning at 9:00 o'clock.

Again, remember come right up to the fourteenth floor. The officer will meet you.

Thank you very much. We're in recess. (Court recessed at 4:41 p.m., until the following day, Friday, April 4, 2014, at 9:00 a.m.) * * * * *

INDEX

DIRECT

CROSS

REDIRECT

RECROSS

STATE'S WITNESSES				
Mahlica Duke	17	74	126/165/ 178	171/178/ 179
Anita Gondy, M.D.	145	154	1 / 0	119

* * *

DEFENDANT'S WITNESSES

<u>NAME</u>

Kamilah Bywaters 4 8 12 15

* * *

EXHIBITS

DESCRIPTION	ADMITTED
DEFENDANT'S EXHIBIT NO.	
A V	91 112

* * *

CERTIFICATION

I CERTIFY THAT THE FOREGOING IS A CORRECT TRANSCRIPT FROM THE AUDIO-VISUAL RECORDING OF THE PROCEEDINGS IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED MATTER.

AFFIRMATION

I AFFIRM THAT THIS TRANSCRIPT DOES NOT CONTAIN THE SOCIAL SECURITY OR TAX IDENTIFICATION NUMBER OF ANY PERSON OR ENTITY.

FLORENCE HOYT Las Vegas, Nevada 89146

FLORENCE M. HOYT, TRANSCRIBER

Unexac M. Hoyl

12/28/15

DATE

Alun J. Chum

CLERK OF THE COURT

TRAN

DISTRICT COURT
CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA
* * * * *

THE STATE OF NEVADA

Plaintiff . CASE NO. C-291374

vs.

DEPT. NO. XII

FREDERICK HARRIS, JR.

Defendant . Transcript of Proceedings

BEFORE THE HONORABLE MICHELLE LEAVITT, DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

JURY TRIAL - DAY 7

THURSDAY, APRIL 3, 2014

APPEARANCES:

FOR THE STATE: ELISSA LUZAICH

KRISTINA A. RHOADES

Deputy District Attorneys

FOR THE DEFENDANT: BETSY ALLEN, ESQ.

JONATHAN MacARTHUR, ESQ.

COURT RECORDER: TRANSCRIPTION BY:

KRISTINE CORNELIUS FLORENCE HOYT

District Court Las Vegas, Nevada 89146

Proceedings recorded by audio-visual recording, transcript produced by transcription service.

```
LAS VEGAS, NEVADA, THURSDAY, APRIL 3, 2014, 10:43 A.M.
 1
                      (Court was called to order)
 2
 3
                           (Jury is present)
                          Your Honor, can we approach for a
              MS. ALLEN:
 4
 5
    moment?
 6
              THE COURT:
                           Sure.
 7
                           Thank you.
              MS. ALLEN:
                           (Bench Conference)
 8
                          Let me get down here so I can hear.
 9
              THE COURT:
              MS. ALLEN:
                           Hmm?
10
                           I just want to be able to hear.
11
              THE COURT:
                               This is a good opportunity to
12
              MR. MacARTHUR:
13
    [inaudible] ex parte.
                          Just so you know, we had -- because
14
              MS. ALLEN:
    we're running so far behind, we had a witness that came in --
15
    two that came in from out of state. One of them is in the
16
    back over here. She's from D.C. and has to leave tomorrow.
17
18
              THE COURT:
                           Okay.
                          And she's in theology divinity school in
19
              MS. ALLEN:
             So -- and it's D.C., so it's a long way. So the
20
    Howard.
21
    State agreed to allow us to put two witnesses out of order.
22
    Obviously it's still their case in chief.
23
              THE COURT:
                          Okay.
24
                          One is this one, Kamilah Bywaters.
              MS. ALLEN:
                                                                The
25
    other one is my client's daughter, Shrday.
                                                 Shrday is
```

tomorrow. But we're going to put Kamilah on right now if 1 that's okay. 2 Okay. That's fine. 3 THE COURT: So could you just -- yeah, explain it to MS. ALLEN: 4 5 the jury. I will be -- and that's okay? 6 THE COURT: 7 Absolutely. MS. LUZAICH: Okay. That's fine. THE COURT: 8 Thank you. MS. ALLEN: 9 (End of bench conference) 10 Do I have a stipulation to the presence 11 THE COURT: 12 of the jury panel? MS. ALLEN: Yes, Your Honor. 13 14 MS. LUZAICH: Yes. 15 Okay. At this time, ladies and THE COURT: gentlemen, because of time constraints and schedules, I'm 16 going to allow the defense to call a witness out of order. 17 So 18 I just want to make sure you understand that this is a defense 19 witness. So, Ms. Allen, you --20 21 Yes, Your Honor. Kamilah Bywaters. MS. ALLEN: 22 Please remain standing and please raise THE CLERK: 23 your right hand. 24 KAMILAH BYWATERS, DEFENDANT'S WITNESS, SWORN 25 THE CLERK: Could you please state your full name

```
spelling your first and last name for the record.
 2
              THE WITNESS:
                            My name is Kamilah Bywaters.
                                                            And
 3
    spell it? K-A-M-I-L-A-H, Bywaters B-Y-W-A-T-E-R-S.
                          Thank you.
 4
              THE CLERK:
 5
                          May I proceed?
              MS. ALLEN:
                          You may.
 6
              THE COURT:
 7
                          Thank you.
              MS. ALLEN:
 8
                           DIRECT EXAMINATION
 9
    BY MS. ALLEN:
10
              Good morning, Ms. Bywaters. How are you?
         Q
              Well, Thank you.
11
         Α
              Okay. Where did you grow up?
12
         Q
13
              I grew up in Las Vegas.
         Α
              Do you currently live here?
14
         Q
15
              No, I do not.
         Α
              Where do you live?
16
         Q
17
              I live in Maryland.
         Α
              Okay. And what are you doing in the D.C. Maryland
18
         Q
19
    area?
              I'm a student at Howard University School of
20
         Α
    Divinity in Washington, D.C.
21
              Okay. Can you just give me briefly your educational
22
23
   background?
24
              I have a Masters in education and currently I'm a
         Α
25
   Masters of divinity, excuse me, candidate.
```

Okay. But you have an education degree; is that 1 Q 2 correct? 3 Yes, ma'am. Α Okay. Prior to leaving Las Vegas what did you do? Q 5 I was a special education teacher. Α Okay. And where did you teach? 6 Q 7 At Canyon Springs High School. Α Is that here in Las Vegas? 8 Q 9 Α Yes. Okay. Do you recall or remember someone by the name 10 Q of Victoria Duke? 11 12 Yes, ma'am. Α All right. And how do you remember here? 13 Q She was one of my students. 14 Α 15 Okay. How long -- do you recall how long she was Q one of your students? 16 17 I can't give you the definite answers -- the 18 definite time frame, because I worked there for about four I can't give you the exact time. 19 years. Okay. So you were a special education teacher; is 20 Q that right? 21 22 Yes, ma'am. Α Okay. Can you sort of explain to the jury what a 23 special education teacher actually does? 24 25 A special education teacher is responsible for the Α

- education of students with disabilities. So my job is to make sure that their educational requirements are met.
 - Q Okay. You, in part, teach; is that correct?
 - A Say that again.
 - Q You teach in part?
- A Yes, ma'am.
 - Q Okay. And then the other part of it is coordinating with other teachers --
- 9 A Right.

3

5

7

- 10 Q -- for the education of particular students.
- 11 A Right.
- 12 Q Okay.
- 13 A That happens, as well.
- 14 Q You recall that Victoria was in your special 15 education program?
- 16 A Yes, ma'am.
- 17 Q All right. During the time frame that you taught
 18 her do you recall her coming to you and talking to you about
 19 anything that was of concern to you?
- 20 A She did not talk to me about anything that was of 21 concern to me.
- Q Okay. Let me ask you this. Are you what's called a mandatory reporter?
- 24 A Yes, ma'am.
- 25 Q And can you get -- explain what that is.

- A As a teacher, a mandatory reporter, if I suspect or hear from a student that there is some type of abuse, then I'm mandated to report that.
- Q Okay. So if you see like someone with a black eye or a bruising that's unusual, you would have to report something like that.
 - A Absolutely.

1

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

- Q Okay. What would be the procedure for reporting something like that?
- A I would make the initial -- I would call CPS myself and then follow my schools protocol, let my administration know and special education coordinator.
- Q Okay. And who would the special education coordinator be when you were there? Do you remember?
- 15 A We had several.
- 16 Q You did. Okay.
- 17 A So I can't remember at that time.
- 18 Q Okay. Did you know Coach Hernandez Cooper?
- 19 | A Yes.
- 20 Q Okay. Did you work with him?
- 21 A Yes.
- Q All right. At any point in time during the time you were in Canyon Springs, and specifically with Victoria Duke, did you notify CPS about anything?
- 25 A No.

```
Okay. Did you ever see any marks, bruises, black
 1
         Q
    eyes, anything like that?
 2
 3
         Α
              No.
              Okay.
 4
         Q
                          Court's indulgence. Your Honor, I pass
 5
              MS. ALLEN:
    the witness.
 6
 7
              THE COURT:
                           Cross.
              MS. LUZAICH:
 8
                             Thank you.
 9
                           CROSS-EXAMINATION
    BY MS. LUZAICH:
10
11
              Good morning, Ms. Bywaters.
         Q
12
              Hi.
         Α
              We've never met before this morning; correct?
13
         Q
14
         Α
              Correct.
              And my investigator called you on the phone;
15
         Q
16
    correct?
17
         Α
              Correct.
              But you didn't call him back.
18
         Q
19
         Α
              Correct.
              When did you teach Victoria?
20
         Q
              I was a teacher at Canyon Springs around 2007.
21
         Α
22
    can't remember the exact specific dates I taught her as her
23
    teacher.
24
              So you were at Canyon Springs in 2007.
         Q
25
              Around that time.
         Α
```

1 Q Only in 2007?

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

18

19

22

- 2 A I was there about 2007 to 2011.
 - Q Okay. So for three or four years.
 - A About that.
 - Q And were you always the special education coordinator?
 - A I'm not a special education coordinator. I'm a special education teacher.
 - Q Oh, a teacher. Okay. So what did you teach?
 - A I taught several classes during that time. I taught math, reading and social skills, and there may have been some other classes that I've taught. But I was able to teach a variety of courses during that time.
 - Q What did you teach Victoria?
- 15 A I can't remember exactly what specific subjects I 16 taught her, because I taught a variety of subjects.
- Q What do you think you taught her?
 - A I would prefer not to do a think what I thought that I taught her in this.
- Q So you don't know when you taught her and you don't know what you taught her. How did she do in school?
 - A She had difficulties.
 - Q What kind of difficulties?
- A She was a student with a disability. So she had learning difficulties with her subjects.

- Q What was her specific disability?
- A I can't give you that information, because I don't know the specific disability.
 - Q Okay. Did you know the specific disability at the time that you taught her?
 - A Yes.
 - Q But you don't remember it now?
- A No.

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

16

17

18

19

- Q Okay. Was Victoria cognitively disabled?
- A I can't give you that information. I don't -- I can't give you that information. I don't remember. I'm sorry.
- Q Okay. And, I mean, absolutely no disrespect when I say this, but some times lay people may say somebody is slow.
- 15 Is that kind of how you might describe Victoria?
 - A I wouldn't call my students slow. I would say that she struggled with her education.
 - Q Okay. Did she struggle with every part of her education that you can recall?
 - A I would say that she struggled with her education.
- 21 Q Okay. I'm going to show you --
- MS. LUZAICH: May I approach, Judge?
- THE COURT: You may.
- MS. LUZAICH: Defense Exhibit -- is that a U?
- MS. ALLEN: I think, yeah.

MS. LUZAICH: Okay. 1 MS. ALLEN: I have the same problem. 2 3 BY MS. LUZAICH: I'm going to show you Defense Exhibit U. Would you 4 5 agree that those are grades for Victoria Duke? Does that help if I move the piece of paper aside? 6 7 If -- this is her transcript. So this would be --Α this is an official transcript. 8 Okay. 9 Q These would be her grades. 10 Does that indicate that she graduated in December --11 Q or in 2011? At the very top does it say graduated June 2011? 12 Maybe on the second page, if not on the first. 13 Graduated -- it does say graduated June 9th of 2011. 14 15 And in the second semester of 2011 were all Q Okay. her grades Fs? 16 Second semester of 2011? I haven't seen this in so 17 Α long. Sorry. 18 Can you repeat what you were asking me, again? 19 Maybe I should show you what I was looking at. 20 Q Was this her grades for the spring semester 21 Here. 22 of 2011? 23 Α Yes. This is what it says. And they're all Fs? 24 Q 25 Α Yes.

You said that your job was to make sure that her 1 Q educational requirements were met? 2 3 Α Right. You're a mandatory reporter you indicated; correct? Yes, ma'am. 5 Α And if you are aware of any kind of abuse and you 6 don't report it as a mandatory reporter that's actually a crime; isn't that true? 9 I guess, yes. Α And you could be prosecuted for it if you don't 10 report something that is abuse reported to you? 11 That's my understanding. 12 Α 13 MS. LUZAICH: Thank you. I have no more questions. 14 THE COURT: Redirect. 15 Just briefly. MS. ALLEN: 16 REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MS. ALLEN: 17 18 Ms. Bywaters --Q 19 Yes. Α Is it a huge inconvenience for you to be here today? 20 Q 21 Α Yes. 22 Did you not call me back a number of times? 23 My investigator. I didn't call. 24 Α 25 Okay. It's okay. But you didn't really want to be

here did you? 2 Correct. Α Okay. You recall when I contacted you a few months 3 Q -- do you recall that we had a telephone conversation? 4 5 Α Yes. When I said the name Victoria Duke, did you 6 Q Okay. immediately respond to me that you knew her? 8 Α Yes. Okay. What kind of documents would you need --9 Q well, let me ask you this. Did I provide you with any 10 paperwork prior to coming in here today? 11 12 Α No. 13 Okay. Her grades, nothing; is that correct? Q No. 14 Α Okay. What kind of documents might you need in 15 Q order to answer the kind of questions the State was asking 16 17 about her cognitive development? You would have to get information from her 18 confidential file --19 20 Okay. Q -- in regards to specific information about that. 21 22 Would that be things like her IEP? Q 23 Yes. Α 24 Okay. Q 25 I don't have that information. Α

```
And you certainly don't have access to it anymore do
 1
         Q
    you?
 2
 3
                   I'm not a teacher anymore.
         Α
              No.
              Okay. At the top of her grades on the first sheet,
         Q
    there's something called an adjusted diploma. Do you know
 5
    what that is?
 6
              An adjusted diploma is for students who -- students
 7
         Α
    with disabilities are able to have an adjusted diploma.
 8
    what -- they don't have to meet the requirements for a regular
              So most students if they don't meet the regular
10
    diploma.
    requirements, like passing the proficiency, then they're still
11
    able to have a diploma.
12
              Okay. Do you recall, and this is only if you
13
         Q
    recall, but do you recall what her attendance was at any point
14
15
    let's say in 2011? Do recall if Victoria was attending
16
    school?
              I think there was a period when she was not
17
         Α
18
    attending.
              If she was not attending school would you have been
19
         Q
    able to tend to her educational needs?
20
21
         Α
              No.
22
              MS. ALLEN:
                          Thank you.
23
                          Any recross?
              THE COURT:
24
25
```

1 RECROSS-EXAMINATION BY MS. LUZAICH: Ms. Allen asked you about confidential student 3 Q All student records are confidential; right? records. 5 Yes, ma'am. Α Did you get any kind of release from her parents 6 0 before you spoke to the defense? I haven't given out any confidential information. 8 Α MS. ALLEN: Your Honor, I would object. 9 She's an adult. Victoria is an adult so she wouldn't -- I think that's 10 mischaracterizing --11 Okay. Well, she can rephrase it. 12 THE COURT: Did you get a consent from Victoria? 13 14 BY MS. LUZAICH: Did you get consent from anybody before you spoke 15 Q about a prior student to a defense attorney? 16 No, I did not. 17 Α 18 MS. LUZAICH: Thanks. Anything else? 19 THE COURT: No, Your Honor. 20 MS. ALLEN: Thank you very much for being 21 THE COURT: Okay. 22 here today. And thank you for the testimony that you did provide this jury panel. And you are excused from your 23

THE WITNESS: Thank you.

24

subpoena.

```
Do I leave this here?
 1
 2
              THE COURT: What is it that you have?
 3
             MS. LUZAICH: May I approach? I'll put it back up
 4
    there.
              THE COURT: Oh, no. It's an exhibit. You can hand
 5
   it to me. Thank you.
 6
 7
              MS. ALLEN: Thank you. Can I just have a moment?
    I'm finished as far as today.
 8
              THE COURT: Okay. So now we can go back to the
 9
10
    State?
              MS. ALLEN: We go back to the State, yes.
11
12
                          Okay. The State can call their next
              THE COURT:
13
    witness.
14
             MS. LUZAICH: Thank you. The State would call
   Mahlica Duke.
15
              THE CLERK: Please raise your right hand and face
16
   me, please. Thank you.
17
18
              THE COURT: Your other right hand.
              THE CLERK: Your other right hand.
19
              THE COURT: That's okay.
20
                 MAHLICA DUKE, STATE'S WITNESS, SWORN
21
22
              THE CLERK: Thank you. Please be seated. Could you
   please state your full name, spelling your first and last name
23
24
    for the record.
25
                            Mahlica Duke, M-A-H-L-I-C-A
              THE WITNESS:
```

```
THE CLERK:
                           Thank you.
 1
                             May I?
 2
              MS. LUZAICH:
              THE COURT:
 3
                           You may.
              MS. LUZAICH:
                             Thank you.
 4
 5
                           DIRECT EXAMINATION
    BY MS. LUZAICH:
 6
 7
              Hi, Mahlica.
         Q
 8
         Α
              Hello.
              Are you okay?
 9
         Q
10
         Α
              Mm-hmm.
              Is that a yes?
11
         Q
12
              Yeah.
         Α
              Remember, you've testified in court before, haven't
13
         Q
14
    you?
15
         Α
              Yes.
              And remember when we talked about it, we always have
16
         Q
17
    to answer out loud; right?
18
         Α
              Yes.
              And we always have to say, yes or you say no,
19
         Q
20
    because the nice lady in front of you have a yes button and a
    no button, but she does not have a uh-huh button.
21
                                                          Okay?
22
              Okay.
         Α
23
              All right. Also, if you could Mahlica, can you use
24
    an outside voice. Because everybody in the courtroom has to
               You know how loud I am, you're not as loud as I am,
25
    hear you.
```

```
are you?
 1
 2
         Α
              No.
              Okay. Mahlica, how old are you?
 3
         Q
              I'm 20.
 4
         Α
              When's your birthday?
 5
         Q
              9/11/93.
 6
         Α
 7
              Okay. Are you nervous?
         Q
              Is Victoria your sister?
 8
 9
              Yes.
         Α
              Did you know Victoria was here yesterday?
10
         Q
11
              Yes.
         Α
              And Victoria used that microphone, as well.
12
         Q
13
              Okay.
         Α
                     Because it helps everybody to be able to
14
              Okay?
         Q
    hear.
15
              Mahlica, you said Victoria's your sister.
16
                                                           Is she
17
    your older sister or younger sister?
18
         Α
              Older.
              How old is Victoria? Do you know?
19
         Q
              Twenty-one.
20
         Α
              Do you have other brothers and sisters?
21
         Q
22
         Α
              Yes.
23
              Tell me who your brothers and sisters are?
         Q
              They're Shabazz, he's my younger brother, he's 19.
24
         Α
25
              Can you spell Shabazz for our nice court reporter,
         Q
```

```
please?
 1
 2
              Yes. S-H-A-B-A-Z-Z.
         Α
              Okay. So Shabazz is 19. Who else?
 3
         Q
              Taharah, she's my younger sister. She's 14.
 4
         Α
                                                              And
 5
    then there's Taquanda, she's my -- she's also my younger
    sister and she's 13.
 6
 7
              Okay. And who's your mom?
         Q
              Tina.
 8
         Α
              Who do you live with now?
 9
         Q
              My mom.
10
         Α
              Anybody else?
11
         Q
12
              Oh. My two -- and my two younger sisters.
         Α
13
              Okay. Have you lived with your mom all your life?
         Q
14
              No.
         Α
15
              Have there been a few times that you have been kind
         Q
    of taken away from your mom?
16
17
         Α
              Yes.
              Who were you taken away from your mom by?
18
         Q
19
              CPS.
         Α
                     I'm going to talk to you about that, but
20
         Q
              Okay.
    first how far back can you remember in your life?
21
                                                        Where were
22
    you living the first time you can think about it in your life?
23
              With my mom and my dad.
         Α
24
              Where was that?
         Q
25
         Α
              I'm not sure.
```

Okay. At that time that you're thinking about when 1 Q you were living with your mom and your dad, which of your siblings were already here? It was my holder sister Victoria and my younger 5 brother Shabazz. Okay. So you remember as far back as before Taharah 6 and Taquanda were born? Is that a yes? 8 9 Α Yes. Okay. Do you know where you were when Taharah and 10 Q Taquanda were born? 11 12 Α Yes. Where was that? 13 When Taharah was born we were in Florida -- living 14 Α in Florida. And when Taquanda was born we were living in 15 16 Arizona. Okay. So did you guys move around a lot when you 17 Q 18 were young? 19 Yes. Α As you're moving around a lot when you were young, 20 Q did you go to school? 21 22 Α No. 23 When's the first time that you can remember going to Q 24 school?

25

Α

2005.

Q Okay. And in 2005 the first time that you can remember going to school, where were you living?

A At first we were -- at first we were living in Louisiana and then -- I went to school out there. And then we were living in Las Vegas and I had went to school out there, also.

Q Okay. So you said that you were living in Louisiana and went to school.

A Yes.

Q Do you remember what grade you were in when you went to school in Louisiana?

A Fifth.

Q Okay. When you were living in Louisiana and you were going to school, who did you live with?

A My mom.

Q Anybody else?

A Oh. My oldest sister Victoria and my younger brother Shabazz and my two younger sisters.

Q So is this a point in your life that you are already not living with your dad?

A Yes.

Q Okay. Do you know how old you were when you stopped living with your dad?

A I believe I was eight.

Q Okay. So pretty young.

A Yes.

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

- Q Okay. You mentioned that you were living in Louisiana and then you mentioned that you were living in Las Vegas. How did you come to go from Louisiana to Las Vegas? Can you remember that?
 - A Yes. Somebody had picked us up and drove us there.
- Q When somebody picked you up and drove you there, who did they pick up and drive?
- A It was my oldest sister, me and my younger brother and my two youngest sisters.
- 11 Q Okay. Where was your mom?
- 12 A She was in Las Vegas already.
- Q Okay. When your mom went to Las Vegas, did she go to Las Vegas from Louisiana?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q And did you guys stay in Louisiana?
- 17 A Yes.
- Q Do you know for how long your mom was gone before you went to Louisiana?
- 20 A I don't really remember how long. It wasn't that long.
- 22 Days, weeks, months.
- 23 A Days.
- Q Okay. And in those days that Mom was in or gone -25 had gone to Las Vegas, did you talk to her at all?

- A Maybe on the phone once.
- Q Okay. Who was it that came to Las -- I'm sorry -- 3 to Louisiana to pick you up? Do you know?

Maybe I should ask do you remember?

- A Not really.
- Q Okay. Do you know when your mom left Louisiana to go to Las Vegas, why did she do that?
 - A To go see her ex-boyfriend.
- Q Okay. A man?
- 10 A Yes.

4

5

6

8

- 11 Q Do you know what that man's name is?
- 12 A Yes.
- 13 Q What's the man's name?
- 14 A Fred Harris.
- 15 Q Before your mom left Louisiana to go to Las Vegas to 16 see Fred Harris, did you ever meet Fred Harris?
- 17 A Not then, no.
- 18 Q When did you meet Fred Harris?
- 19 A When we -- when we came to Las Vegas.
- Q Okay. Do you see that person here in court today?
- 21 A Yes.
- Q Can you describe where the person is sitting and an article of clothing that he's wearing?
- A He's sitting over here, and he's wearing -- he's wearing a gray shirt and a tie.

- Q Is he wearing a jacket or no jacket?
- 2 A No. He is not wearing a jacket.
 - MS. LUZAICH: May the record reflect identification of the defendant.
- 5 THE COURT: So reflected.
- 6 MS. LUZAICH: Thank you.

BY MS. LUZAICH:

1

3

4

- Q So when you left Louisiana and came to Las Vegas you don't remember who it was that brought you; correct?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q When you got to Las Vegas where did you and your 12 brothers and sisters go?
- 13 A We lived at Ann's house on Trish.
- Q Okay. When you say Ann, can you tell me who Ann is?
- 15 A Yeah. I guess -- I guess she was a friend of his at 16 the time. I don't know.
- Q Do you know when you got to Las Vegas did you kind of go directly to that place at Trish Lane?
- 19 A Yes.
- Q When you got to the -- is it a house or an apartment that was on Trish Lane?
- 22 A I think it was a house.
- Q Okay. So when you got to the house that we're talking about who was there?
- 25 A Just Ann and her daughter and her mother, too, at

```
the time.
              Do you remember what her daughter's name is?
 2
         Q
 3
         Α
              Yeah.
              What's her daughter's name?
         Q
 5
              Sha'karia.
         Α
              You said her mom -- Ann's mom was there. What's her
 6
         Q
   mom's name, do you remember?
                     It was -- I believe it was Claudia.
 8
         Α
              Yeah.
 9
                     What about your mom. Was your mom there?
         Q
              Okay.
              Yes.
10
         Α
                     And you mentioned Fred, the defendant, was
11
         Q
    Fred there?
12
                   I think he lives somewhere else.
13
              No.
         Α
              Okay. So did you meet him later?
14
         Q
15
         Α
              Yes.
                     Did you stay at the house on Trish Lane for a
16
         Q
              Okay.
17
    while?
18
              Mm-hmm.
         Α
              Is that a yes?
19
         Q
20
              Yes.
         Α
              You said that you think Fred lived somewhere else.
21
         Q
22
    Did there come a time that you saw him at the house on Trish
23
    Lane?
24
              Yes.
         Α
25
              Did you see him there a bunch?
         Q
```

```
Yes, some times.
 1
         Α
              Okay. While you were living at the house on Trish
 2
         Q
    Lane, did your mom -- what did your mom do?
              She worked.
         Α
              Do you remember where she worked?
 5
         Q
 6
         Α
              Yes.
 7
              Where'd she work?
         Q
              At Jason's Deli.
 8
         Α
              Okay. And did you guys start going to -- any of you
 9
         Q
    start going to school while you were there?
10
              Yes.
11
         Α
              What school did you go to? Do you remember?
12
         Q
              Mountain View Elementary.
13
         Α
              Do you remember what grade you were in when you were
14
         Q
15
    living at Trish Lane?
              I think it was the sixth.
16
         Α
17
              Okay. And did your older sister Victoria also go to
         Q
    school?
18
19
              Yes.
         Α
              Did Shabazz go to school?
20
         Q
21
         Α
              Yes.
22
              Were Taharah and Taquanda old enough to go to school
         Q
23
    yet?
24
              No.
         Α
25
                     So do you know what they did?
         Q
              Okay.
```

- They went to this daycare. Α Yeah.
- Did you meet anybody else while you were 2 Q Okay. living at the house on Trish Lane? 3
 - No, not that I can remember. Α
 - You said that you think that Fred lived Q Did there come a time that you went to a somewhere else. place that he lived during that same time frame?
 - A couple times, yes. Α
 - Okay. And when you went there who would go there? Q
- I can't really remember. 10 Α
- Like would it be you, and your brother and sisters? 11 Q
- Sometimes. 12 Yeah. Α
- 13 Did you ever go by yourself? Q Okay.
- 14 No. Α

4

5

6

8

9

- 15 So you would be with somebody? Q
- 16 Α Yes.
- 17 Did here come a time that Victoria told you Q 18 something about Fred's house -- or something that happened at Fred's house? 19
- 20 Α Yes.

Lane?

- Do you remember where you were when Victoria told 21 Q you that?
- 23 I was in the bedroom next to Sha'karia's. Α
- 24 Would that be the bedroom at the house at Trish Q 25

1 Α Yes. 2 And who was there when Victoria told you Q Okay. 3 that? What do you mean? 4 Α Like was it just you and Victoria or were the other 5 Q sisters there or your mom or Miss Ann or anybody else, or was 6 it just you and Victoria? I think there was somebody else there. I can't 8 remember who, but she was just telling me. When she was telling you was she upset? 10 Q Okay. She seemed scared. 11 Α Yeah. And was it something that concerned you, too? 12 Okay. Q 13 Α Yes. Do you know did Victoria tell somebody else about 14 Q 15 it? She tried. 16 Α Yeah. 17 Who did she tell? Q 18 Ann. Α Do you know that because you heard it or because you 19 Q 20 heard about it? 21 Α I heard it. 22 Okay. And when you heard it was Ann upset when 23 Victoria told her that? 24 Yes. Α 25 Did Ann tell anybody else that you are aware of? Q

- 1 Α Yes. Do you know who else she told? 2 Okay. Q 3 Yes. Α Who else did she tell? 4 Q 5 She told Fred. Α Okay. After all of that how was Victoria treated, 6 Q if at all? Well, they called her a liar and they really didn't 8 believe her and yeah, they just tried to make her look crazy 10 or something. Did that upset Victoria? 11 Q 12 Yes. Α 13 Did that upset you? Q 14 Mm-hmm. Α 15 Is that a yes? Q 16 Α Yes. Did you meet Fred's mom around that time? 17 Q I can't remember. 18 Α Okay. At this time that this is happening back in 19 Q 2005, did you know what relationship, if any, your mother had 20 to Fred? 21 Well, from what I saw I guess she -- it was like 22
- Okay. Did you know back then what relationship, if 24 Q 25

boyfriend and girlfriend or something.

any, Miss Ann had to Fred?

- A I really didn't -- I really didn't know. I always thought it was like friend or something, but it was kind of like they were more than friends.
- Q Okay. While you were living at the house on Trish Lane, how did Fred treat you and your brother and sisters?
 - A Okay. He was -- he was nice some times.
 - Q Okay. When he was nice sometimes what would he do?
 - A I don't really remember.
- Q Okay. If he was nice sometimes, the times that he wasn't being nice what do you remember? And right now I'm just talking about when you guys were living at Trish Lane.
- 12 A I don't -- I don't really --
- Q Just what ever you can remember. Nothing is standing our right now?
 - A No, it's not.
- Q Okay. Did there come a time that you guys actually left Las Vegas and the house on Trish Lane?
- 18 A Yes.

2

5

6

8

9

10

11

- 19 Q Do you know when that was?
- 20 A I believe it was during the summer of 2005, maybe.
- 21 Q Okay. Where'd you go?
- 22 A Utah.
- Q When you went to Utah do you know why you went at that time?
- 25 A My mother she was like -- she was going to give this

```
baby up for adoption, and there's this -- there was an
    adoption agency there that was going to help her.
 3
              Okay. So when you went to Utah who went?
         Q
              My whole family.
         Α
              Okay. So specifically, your mom, your brother and
 5
         Q
    your sisters and you?
 6
 7
         Α
              Yes.
              So nobody went with you guys?
 8
         Q
 9
         Α
              No.
                     When you went to Utah where did you guys go?
10
              Okay.
         Q
    Did you move into some place?
11
12
              It was an apartment.
         Α
13
              Were you all together?
         Q
14
              Yes.
         Α
              And did your mom actually have a baby up there?
15
         Q
16
         Α
              Yes.
17
              And did somebody take the baby?
         Q
18
              Yes.
         Α
              Did you guys go to school while you were living in
19
         Q
20
    Utah?
21
         Α
              Yes.
22
              Did there come a time that CPS took you from your
23
   mom while you were in Utah?
24
         Α
              Yes.
25
              Can you tell me about how that happened?
         Q
```

- A Well, mom, she had went to Las Vegas and she was coming back but I guess -- I forgot who actually called CPS. I think it was like a teacher or something, but I guess they thought mom had -- our mom had abandoned us. So that's when they came to get us.
 - Q Okay. Do you know why mom went to Las Vegas?
- A Yes.

2

5

6

7

8

- Q Why did your mom go to Las Vegas?
- 9 A To see Fred.
- 10 Q Do you remember when that was?
- 11 A No. Not really. Not specifically.
- Q Okay. Was there some sort of occasion that you were aware of that she came for?
 - A I think it was his birthday or something.
- Q Okay. Did you talk to her about going to Las Vegas
 or not going to Las Vegas?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q What'd you tell her?
- A Well, I told her I didn't think it was a good idea

 20 she should leave.
- 21 Q Okay. But she went?
- 22 A Yes.
- Q When she went to Las Vegas you guys were living in the apartment; right?
- 25 A Yes.

```
Was there anybody else there with you?
 1
         Q
 2
              No.
         Α
              Was there a lady named Miss Heather near by?
 3
         Q
              Yes.
 4
         Α
 5
              Tell me about Miss Heather.
                                             Who was she?
         Q
              She was a friend of my mom's and she lived next
 6
         Α
 7
    door.
              Did she help you guys at all?
 8
         Q
 9
              Yes.
         Α
              Did Victoria do most of it?
10
         Q
              Yes.
11
         Α
                     While your mom was gone did you guys actually
12
              Okay.
         Q
    go to school?
13
14
              Yes.
         Α
              Were Taharah and Taquanda old enough at this point
15
         Q
    to be in school?
16
17
              Well, Taharah was, but Taquanda she was going to
         Α
18
    another daycare.
              Okay. So you said somebody called CPS, maybe
19
         Q
    somebody at school you thought?
20
21
         Α
              Yes.
22
         Q
              And they came and took you guys?
23
              Yes.
         Α
24
              Did Mom come back from Las Vegas?
         Q
25
         Α
              Yes.
```

Where did you guys go? 1 Q We lived with our foster parents at the time. 2 Α Were you all together? 3 Q 4 No. Α Who was together, if anybody? 5 Q No. I was with Victoria, my two youngest sisters were 6 Α together and Shabazz went to a separate home. Okay. For how long were you guys in foster care? 8 Q I think it was about six months. 9 Α And during those six months would you get to see 10 Q each other? 11 12 Yes. Α 13 Would you get to see Mom, as well? Q 14 Yes. Α 15 Were you able to move back in with Mom? Q 16 Α Yes. 17 When you moved back in with Mom where did you guys Q live? 18 At the same place that we were living when we first 19 Α got there. 20 Did you continue to go to school? 21 Q Okay. 22 Α Yes. 23 And did you live there for awhile longer? Q 24 Yes. Α 25 How was it in Utah? Q

It was nice. 1 Α What was nice about it? 2 Q The people were friendly and they --3 Α Go ahead. 4 Q 5 -- and they have a nice climate. I don't know. Α Was it a small town where you guys were living? 6 Q 7 Yes. Α Like real different from Vegas? 8 Q Mm-hmm. Α Is that a yes? 10 Q 11 Α Oh. Yes. 12 While you were in Utah after CPS had taken you guys Q from your mom, do you know, did Mom continue to see Fred? 13 Well, since I wasn't there, I don't really know if 14 Α -- I didn't know if she actually saw him, but she did tell me 15 that she would talk to him on the phone while we were gone. 16 17 When you moved back in with Mom where you living up Q 18 there for a year still with Mom? Yeah, I think so. 19 Α During that year, do you know, did she leave town at 20 Q 21 all? 22 Α You mean when we were back with her? 23 Yes. Q 24 No, she didn't leave. Α 25 Oh, okay. Did Fred ever come up there? Q

1 Α No. Did you have any communication with Fred while you 2 Q 3 were in Utah? I think he called once and I answered the phone, but 5 that was it. Did there come a time that you left Utah? 6 Q Α Yes. 8 Do you remember when that was? Q The summer of 2007, I believe. 9 Α How did it come about that you left Utah? Describe 10 Q for me what happened. 11 It was -- it was at night and someone came to get 12 13 us. 14 When you say somebody came to get us, how did they Q 15 do that? Well, we were sleeping and our mom just woke us up 16 Α and we went out -- and she told us to go outside, and we went 17 outside and she told us to get in the car, and we got in the 18 19 car. 20 When you say we is that your brother and sisters and Q 21 you? 22 Α Yes. 23 Was there anybody in the car? Q 24 Yes. Α 25 Who was in the car? Q

Fred. 1 Α Did you know that Fred was coming to get you? 2 Q 3 Α No. Were you surprised that Fred came to get you? 4 Q 5 Yes. Α Did you want to come back to Las Vegas with Fred? 6 Q 7 Α No. Did you actually get in the car? 8 Q 9 Yes. Α And did all you guys come back to Vegas? 10 Q Yes. 11 Α 12 When you came back to Vegas -- or when you got to Q 13 Vegas, tell me what happened when you arrived? 14 We went to go stay at their new house, I guess, on Α Blankenship and he took Mom and Vicky to go stay somewhere 15 else. 16 17 When you say their new house on Blankenship, who is Q 18 they? 19 Fred and Ann. Α Okay. So when you got to the house on Blankenship, 20 Q do you remember the address? 21 22 Α Yes. 23 What is it? Q It's 966 Blankenship Avenue. 24 Α 25 That's here in Las Vegas; right? Q

1 A Yes.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

16

18

19

- Q Who was there at the house when you got there?
- A Ann was, I believe. Yeah, she was there.
 - Q Was anybody else living there?
- A I think when we first got there Fred had some of his sons living there when we first got there.
- Q Remember you talked about Ann's daughter Sha'karia when you were at Trish Lane, was she there when you got to Blankenship?
- 10 A Not at first.
- 11 Q Did there come a time that she did come?
- 12 A Yes.
- Q And when the time came that she came, did she come and live there or visit or what?
- 15 A She lived there.
 - Q For awhile or for ever?
- 17 A For awhile.
 - Q Okay. Now, you said that Fred took you guys to
 Blankenship and then took Mom and Vicky somewhere else. So
 who specifically went to Blankenship?
- 21 A It was me, my younger brother, and my two youngest 22 sisters.
- Q Did Fred ever say anything while you guys were
 driving or when you arrived at Blankenship about the fact that
 Vicky and Mom wouldn't be staying?

A I don't remember the exact conversation, but he -- all I know is that he just said they're going to be staying somewhere else.

- Q Were you surprised when he said that?
- A Yes.

1

5

6

8

9

12

13

14

15

16

- Q Did he say why they were going to be staying somewhere else?
 - A I don't remember.
 - Q Okay. Do you know where he took them?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q Where did he take them?
 - A He took them to this --
 - Q Actually, before you get there, when I say do you know where he took them, do you know because he told you or you found out later?
 - A I believe we found out like a little later, like a few days later, and he told us.
- Q Okay. Let' me ask it a better way then.
- 19 When's the next time you saw either Mom or Victoria?
- 20 A Maybe like a week after we moved in.
- Q Where did you see them?
- 22 A At this motel called the Siegel Suites.
- Q Okay. So I'm going to go back. When you get to the house at Blankenship, tell me about what happens when you get there? Fred you said takes Mom and Victoria. What about you

guys? What happens with you and Shabazz and Tahara and Taquanda when you get to Blankenship? We just -- we just stayed there. 3 Α Did you guys go to school while you were Q 5 there? 6 Α Yes. 7 Did you stay there for a long time? Q 8 Α Yes. Like years? 9 Q 10 Α Yes. Okay. You said it was the summer of 2007. Could it 11 Q have been August of 2007 when you got there? 12 13 Α Okay. 14 Okay. Let me ask it another way. Do you know when Q Victoria's birthday is? 15 16 Α Yes. When's Victoria's birthday? 17 Q It's July 31st. 18 Α 19 Q Did you celebrate Victoria's birthday in Utah or in Las Vegas? 20 Las Vegas I believe. 21 Α When you started -- you said you went to 22 school while you were living at Blankenship. What grade did 23 you start when you got back that school year? 24

25

Α

Eighth.

```
What school did you go to?
 1
         Q
 2
              West Prep Elementary.
         Α
              Would that be middle school?
 3
         Q
              Actually, I think it's a K through 12.
 4
         Α
 5
         Q
                   Okay. Now, Shabazz you said is your younger
              Oh.
              Is he a year younger than you, is that what you
 6
    brother.
    said?
 8
         Α
              Yes.
              Is he a grade younger than you?
         Q
10
              Yes.
         Α
              What school did Shabazz go to when you guys started
11
         Q
12
    school?
13
              Sedway, I believe.
         Α
              Okay. So he didn't go to the same school you did?
14
         Q
15
         Α
              No.
              Whose decision was that?
16
         Q
17
              Fred's.
         Α
18
              What about Tahara and Taquanda, where did they go to
         Q
    school?
19
              H.P. Fitzgerald.
20
         Α
              And that's a -- and I'm sorry. Sedway, is that a
21
         Q
22
    middle school?
23
              I think. I don't know.
         Α
              Fitzgerald, is that an elementary school?
24
         Q
25
         Α
              Yes.
```

But you said West Prep was K through 12, but only 1 Q 2 you went there? 3 Yes. Α Did you stay at West Prep while -- the whole Okay. 4 Q 5 time you lived at Blankenship? 6 Α No. What school did you change to? Q 8 Canyon Springs High School. Α When did you go to Canyon Springs? 9 Q It was 2009. 10 Α How about what grade? 11 Q 12 Ninth grade. Α 13 Did you go to Canyon Springs, ninth and tenth Q Okay. 14 and eleventh? 15 Yes. Α Did -- and I'm sorry. I keep calling you Victoria. 16 Q Do you call her Victoria or something else? 17 18 Something else. Α What do you call her? 19 Q Vicky. 20 Α Did Mom and Vicky remain away from 21 Okay. Q 22 Blankenship for a long time? 23 Yes. Α 24 Okay. Q so they didn't move in a week later or a month later or anything like that; right? 25

1 Α No. Would you see them much? 2 Q 3 Yes. Α How often would you get to see them? 4 Q 5 Probably once a week or something. Α How would you see them? 6 Q 7 Fred would drive us to see them. Α Where did Fred drive you to see them? 8 Q At first it was at the Siegel Suites and then they 9 Α had their own apartment. 10 Do you remember where the apartment was? 11 Q 12 Yes. Α Where is the apartment? 13 Q It was somewhere on Walnut Road. 14 Α 15 When you were living at the house on Q Okay. Blankenship, while it was just you and Shabazz, Tahara and 16 17 Taquanda, and Mom and Vicky were not there, how did Fred treat 18 you guys? All right sometimes. 19 If it was all right sometimes, how was it when it 20 was not all right? 21 22 Α Bad. 23 What was bad about it? Q I guess we would get in trouble a lot. 24 Α 25 Okay. If you got in trouble, what if anything, Q

1 | would he do?

3

5

8

9

10

25

2 Are you okay Mahlica? You're nodding your head.

- A I guess he would beat us.
- Q Okay. Now you say I guess he would beat us. Did Fred ever hurt you?
- 6 A Yes.
 - Q What did Fred do to hurt you?
 - A He would hit me with the belt some times.
 - Q When you say some times he would hit you with the belt, is that something that he did more than one time?
- 11 A Yes.
- Q Can you remember around when the first time that he did that was?
- 14 A No. I don't remember.
- Okay. Were you living in the house on Blankenship?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 Q Okay. So it's Blankenship, not Trish Lane; correct?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q And at the time, the first one at least that you can 20 remember. Was that when Mom and Vicky were living at Siegel 21 Suites, at Walnut, somewhere else?
- 22 A I believe they were at Walnut.
- Q Do you remember what grade you were in or what school you were going to?
 - A I think I was still going to West.

Q Okay. And you said he hit you with a belt. Where were you when he hit you with the belt?

A The bedroom we were staying in, me and my two younger sisters were staying in.

Q Okay. And what had happened before that? Were you doing something, was he doing something, right before he hit you with the belt?

A What do you mean?

1

3

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

25

Q Well, earlier you said that there were times that you would get in trouble and he would hit you with the belt. Did you only get hit with the belt if you were in trouble for something? Or were there other times?

A Most of the time, yes.

Q Okay. So for example, what did you get in trouble for that he'd hit you with the belt?

A I believe someone had taken something, and he thought I helped them take it, like stealing it.

Q Like what?

A I think it was a piece of candy or something.

Q From where?

A I don't remember.

Q I mean, from like Walmart, from someone's bedroom,
23 from --

24 A No, I think it was from the kitchen.

Q Oh. Okay. Did you help somebody steal candy from

the kitchen? 2 Α No. 3 Q Okay. You said he hit you with the belt. Where did he hit you, like what part of your body? 5 My backside. Α With pants on or pants not -- well, bottoms on or 6 Q bottoms not on? 8 Α Bottoms on. Did he leave marks? 9 Q No, not that time. 10 Α Okay. How did it make you feel? Did it hurt? 11 Q 12 Yes. Α 13 Did he say anything when he did it? Q I don't remember him saying anything. 14 Α 15 Q What was his demeanor like? Like what was his attitude like when he did it? 16 17 Angry. Α You said that time he didn't leave marks. 18 Was there Q another time that he did leave marks? 19 20 Yes. But I don't remember when that was. Α Where did he hit you that it left marks? 21 Q Okay. 22 Α My back. 23 Was that through clothes or just to skin? Q Through clothes. 24 Α 25 What kind of marks did it leave? Q

They were kind of like bruises or something or they 1 Α were reddish. I guess they were welts or something. 2 Okay. How'd that make you feel? 3 Q Upset. 4 Α 5 Did it hurt? Q 6 Α Yes. 7 Were there other occasions that he did that? Q Yes, but I don't remember them all. 8 Α Okay. Were there a lot of them? 9 Q A lot of what? 10 Α Occasions that he did that? 11 Q 12 Some times. Α Okay. What other things did you do that made him 13 Q hit you with a belt and leave bruises? 14 15 I don't remember. Α So nothing huge in your mind? 16 Q 17 Α No. Did he do anything else that hurt you? 18 Q Okay. Was there an occasion he did something to your neck? 19 MR. MacARTHUR: 20 Objection. Leading. 21 THE COURT: Sustained. 22 BY MS. LUZAICH: Besides the belt on your back or backside, did he do 23 Q 24 something that hurt you somewhere else? 25 Α Yes.

1	Q	Tell me about that. Where were you when that
2	happened?	
3	A	The kitchen.
4	Q	Was anybody else there or in the vicinity when that
5	happened?	
6	A	No.
7	Q	Where was Fred?
8	A	In the kitchen.
9	Q	And what did he do?
10		Are you okay, Mahlica?
11	A	Umm
12	Q	Mahlica, do you have panic attacks sometimes?
13		MR. MacARTHUR: Objection, Your Honor.
14		THE COURT: Sustained.
15		MS. LUZAICH: Can we approach?
16		THE COURT: Mahlica, are you okay?
17		THE WITNESS: Yes, I'm fine.
18		THE COURT: Okay. If you need a break will you let
19	me know?	
20		THE WITNESS: Yes.
21		THE COURT: Do you need a break?
22		THE WITNESS: No.
23		THE COURT: Are you sure?
24		THE WITNESS: Yes.
25		THE COURT: Okay. If you need a break just look
		48

over at me and we'll take a break. Okay? 2 THE WITNESS: Yes. He started to -- he started to choke me. 3 BY MS. LUZAICH: 5 Why did he start to choke you? Q Because somebody left the lights on in the kitchen, 6 Α and I was supposed to go check and see if they were all off. And you say you started to choke you. Describe for 8 Q me what he did as best you can? Well, well, first he -- first he reached over and he 10 Α hit me and then he started to choke me. 11 12 Where did he hit you? Q 13 On the face. Α What part of his body did he use to hit you? 14 Q His hand. 15 Α Was his hand open or closed or --16 Q I don't remember. 17 Α Okay. So he hit you in the face, and then what? 18 Q 19 He started to choke me. Α When he started to choke you how did he do that? 20 Q With what part of his body? 21 22 His hands. Α 23 Where did he put his hands? Q 24 Around my neck. Α 25 And when his hands were around your neck what did Q

they do, if anything? 2 They started squeezing my neck. When he did that how did you feel? 3 Q Scared. 4 Α Did he say anything while he was doing that? 5 Q I don't remember if he did. 6 Α 7 Okay. Was he yelling at you at the time? Q 8 Α Yes. 9 Do you know where your brother and sisters might Q have been? 10 They were in the -- they were in their rooms getting 11 Α ready for bed. 12 13 Okay. So it was late in the day. Q 14 Yes. Α 15 Do you know where -- well, was Miss Ann home? Q 16 Α Yes. 17 Do you know where Miss Ann was? Q 18 He was in her room. Α Was this at a time that Mom and Vicky were not 19 Q living there? 20 I think so. 21 Α 22 Now, when you guys were living -- and I'm sorry. Q 23 Did you see Fred or hear Fred do anything to hurt your brother 24 or your younger sisters while you were living at Blankenship? 25 Yes. Α

- Q Who did you either see or hear him hurt?
- A Sometimes it was Shabazz and sometimes it was Taharah, Taquanda and sometimes Vicky.
- Q Okay. And I'm going to jump ahead. Did there come a time that Mom and Vicky actually moved into the house on Blankenship?
 - A Yes.

2

3

5

6

7

8

- Q Do you remember when that was?
- 9 A No, not really.
- Q Was it in between your school years, like kind of over the summer at some point?
- 12 A Yes.
- Q Do you remember what grade you started after they were living in the house?
- 15 A Ninth grade.
- Q Okay. So I'm going to step back a second. You said that you saw or heard Fred hurt Shabazz. Was that one time or more than one time?
 - A More than once.
- 20 Q Was it always at Blankenship?
- 21 A Yes.
- Q What did you see him do to Shabazz at Blankenship?
- A He was punching him and yelling at him.
- Q Where were they when Fred was punching and yelling at Shabazz?

- A Well, first they were in the hallway, then in the garage.
 - Q When Fred punched him what did he punch him with?
 - A His hands.

5

6

8

18

- Q Where did he punch him?
- A His face, I guess. I didn't get to see everything, but I heard it.
 - Q Okay. Where were you that you were able to hear it?
- A In the bedroom.
- 10 Q Which bedroom?
- 11 A The one my sisters and I stayed in.
- Q Okay. When you say you didn't see everything but
 you heard it, did they move through the house as the fight -argument progressed?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q And so what part did you see?
- 17 A I just saw him yelling at him and hitting him.
 - Q Okay. And when he was hitting him, he was hitting him in the face; is that what you saw?
- 20 A Yes.
- Q All right. And then what did you hear after you couldn't see anymore?
- 23 A Him yelling and them fighting, I guess.
- Q Okay. Did you see Shabazz and Fred after it was all done, I mean, later, minutes or hours later.

1 A Minutes.

2

3

5

6

7

8

11

12

13

14

15

16

18

19

22

- Q Okay. And when you saw them afterwards did Fred have any bruises, marks, scratches, scrapes, anything on him?
 - A Say that again, I'm not paying attention.
 - Q Okay. Are you all right?
- A Yes.
 - Q When you saw them afterwards when you didn't hear anymore fighting or punching or hitting, did Fred have any marks on him, scratches, bruises, scrapes, anything like that?
- 10 A No.
 - Q When you saw Shabazz did Shabazz have any marks on him, scratches, bruises, anything like that?
 - A Well, I can't really remember if he did.
 - Q Okay. You said that was one occasion that you can remember. Tell me about another occasion that you remember seeing Fred do something to hurt Shabazz?
- 17 A I don't really remember.
 - Q Were there other locations in the house that you saw them -- Fred hit or hurt Shabazz?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 Q What other locations in the house?
 - A Sometimes it was in the kitchen and sometimes it was in the garage.
- Q What did you see him do?
- 25 A Can you repeat that?

- Q What did you see Fred do to him?
- A Well, when he got in trouble he would make him do push-ups and if he got them wrong like he would hit him with the belt and make him do it -- start all over and do it again.
- Q Okay. Did you ever see any marks, bruises, red marks, anything on Shabazz after Fred hurt him?
 - A I can't really remember.
- Q Okay. Did you ever hear Shabazz respond? Did he cry or anything like that when Fred was hurting him?
- 10 A Sometimes.
- 11 Q Did you ever see Fred hurt Taquanda?
- 12 A No, I didn't see it.
- 13 Q Did you ever hear Fred hurt Taquanda?
- 14 A Yes.

2

5

6

7

8

- 15 Q What did you hear?
- 16 A He would yell at her and then hit her with the belt.
- Q Where were Fred and Taquanda when you would hear that happen?
 - A I don't really remember.
- Q Okay. Were they in another room from you?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q And would the door be opened or closed?
- A Sometimes it would be opened and sometimes it would be closed.
- Q And how did you know that he hit her with a belt?

Because she would be crying. 1 Α Okay. Could you hear the belt? 2 Q 3 Α Yes. Would you ever -- did you ever see marks on Taquanda Q after he hit her with the belt? 5 I can't remember if I did. 6 If somebody gets hit on the butt with a belt can you Q see through their clothes? 8 9 Α No. Okay. So you could only see it if they showed it to 10 Q you? 11 12 Yes. Α Did Taquanda ever show you any injuries? 13 Q 14 No. Α Did Shabazz ever show you anything? 15 Q 16 Α No. Did you ever see him hurt -- Fred hurt Taharah? 17 Q 18 Yes. Α What did you see Fred do to Taharah? 19 Q 20 I see him hitting her and he was like pulling her Α 21 hair. 22 Were those the same occasion or different occasions? Q 23 It was different occasions. Α 24 When you saw him hitting her where were they? Q Okay. 25 The were in the hallway. Α

- Q Okay. And what did you see him doing specifically?
- A He was yelling at her and then he started hitting
 her in the face and then he started to pull her hair.
 - Q Okay. When he hit her in the face what did he hit her with?
- 6 A His fists.
 - Q When he was pulling her hair how did he do that?
 - A He just pulled her hair. He just grabbed it.
 - Q At the time -- your hair is pretty long right now; right?
- 11 A Yes.

5

8

9

- 12 Q Is it longer than mine?
- At the time was Taharah's hair long, was it short, or what?
- 15 A Well, it was in ponytails I think.
- Q Okay. So what did he pull? I mean, did he pull the ponytails?
- 18 A Yes.
- Q Okay. You said he was yelling at her. Do you know 20 what he was yelling?
- 21 A You mean what he was yelling at her for?
- Q Yes.
- 23 A She had gotten in trouble at school, I believe.
- Q Okay. Did you ever see him do anything else to Taharah?

1 A No.

2

4

5

- Q Did you ever hear him do anything else to Taharah?
- 3 A I can't really remember.
 - Q Okay. So we talked a second ago that there came a time when you were going into the ninth grade that Mom and Victoria or Vicky moved into the house on Blankenship. Did you see him do anything to Vicky when they moved into the house?
- 9 A What do you mean?
- 10 Q Or after they were living in the house. During the 11 time frame that they lived in the house did you ever see him 12 physically hurt Vicky?
- 13 A I didn't see it.
- 14 Q Did you hear it?
- 15 A Yes.
- Q What did you hear?
- 17 A He would be yelling at her and then I would hear the 18 belt.
- 19 Q And how would she respond, if at all?
- 20 A She would -- I guess she would be crying.
- 21 Q Did you hear that?
- 22 A Yes.
- Q Okay. Did you ever see any bruises or scrapes or scrapes or scratches or anything like that?
- 25 A No.

- Q Okay. Did you see that one time or more than one time or hear I should say?
 - A More than once.
- Q Okay. Did you ever see him or hear him hurt your mom?
- A I wouldn't see it and I wouldn't be around to hear it, but she did have a black eye once.
- Q Okay. Do you remember when that was, I mean, was that at a time that she was living in Blankenship or living somewhere else?
 - A I think she was living at Blankenship.
- 12 Q Okay. Was she working at the time?
- 13 A Yes.

2

3

5

6

8

10

11

14

15

- Q We had talked earlier about when you lived here in 2005, Mom worked at Jason's Deli. When you guys came back here in 2007, did Mom get a job?
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q Where did Mom work?
- 19 A She worked at Bally's Hotel and Casino.
- 20 Do you know what she did there?
- 21 | A She was a maid.
- Q Okay. Did there come a time that she stopped working there and then got a different job, if you remember?
- A Well, what do you mean? Because when we moved out she did.

Okay. So did she work at Bally's the whole time you 1 Q lived at -- or she lived at Blankenship? 2 3 Yes. Α So when you saw the black eye was that at a Okay. 5 time that you were living at Blankenship and she was working at Bally's? 6 7 Α Yes. Did you hear your -- Fred arguing with your mom 8 Q while you lived at Blankenship at all? 10 Α Yes. Did you hear, in general, what they argued about? 11 Q 12 What do you mean? Α I mean, was there a topic that they argued about? 13 Q Well, I can't remember what it was. 14 Α 15 Did they argue on more than one occasion? Q Okay. 16 Α Yes. 17 Did there come a time that you guys moved out of the Q 18 house on Blankenship? 19 Yes. Α When did you move out of the house on Blankenship? 20 Q It was -- it was during the summer, I believe, of 21 Α 22 2010. 23 Okay. Do you remember what grade you started when Q 24 you moved to another location?

I believe it was the eleventh grade.

Q Okay. When you moved out of the house on Blankenship who moved?

A It was my mom, me, my older sister Victoria, and Shabazz my younger brother.

- Q So Taharah and Taquanda stayed?
- 6 A Yes.

1

2

3

5

7

9

10

19

20

21

22

23

24

- Q Where did you guys go?
- 8 A The St. Andrews apartments.
 - Q Okay. And when you went to St. Andrews did you continue going to school?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q Did Shabazz go to school?
- 13 A Yes.
- Q Did Vicky go to school?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q Did Mom work?
- 17 A Yes.
- Q When you moved to St. Andrews where was Mom working?
 - A She was -- she still had the -- she still had the Bally's job, but -- and then she got hired at another place at the Cosmopolitan, and then she got fired from Bally's and then she just had the Cosmopolitan, and then she got fired from Cosmo, and then she -- and then she got a job at a pizza place.
 - Q Okay. While you were living at St. Andrews did you

```
meet a lady named Rose?
 1
 2
         Α
              Yes.
 3
         Q
              Do you know how you met Rose, I mean you, how did
    you meet Rose?
 5
              Well, I believe Vicky introduced me to her.
         Α
              Okay. And was Rose and Vicky -- were Rose and Vicky
 6
         Q
    friends?
 8
         Α
              Yes.
              Would you see Rose periodically?
 9
         Q
              Sometimes.
10
         Α
              Would somebody else see Rose more?
11
         Q
12
              Yeah.
         Α
13
              Who?
         Q
              Vicky would see her the most.
14
         Α
              Okay. When you would see Rose what would you guys
15
         Q
16
    do?
17
              We would just go to her house.
         Α
              When you would go to her house -- when you would go
18
         Q
    to her house who would go?
19
20
              Vicky went with me.
         Α
              Did Shabazz also go?
21
         Q
22
              I think he went once.
         Α
23
              Did Vicky go more than you did?
         Q
24
              Yes.
         Α
25
              Did -- does Rose have kids?
         Q
```

```
1
         Α
              Yes.
              And did you meet her kids, as well?
 2
         Q
 3
         Α
              Yes.
              Did Rose bring you guys stuff?
         Q
 5
              Yes.
         Α
              What'd she bring you that you remember?
 6
         Q
 7
              She bought us -- I believe she helped us get
         Α
    furniture and like plates and stuff.
 8
              Okay. So when you were moved into St. Andrews did
 9
         Q
    you guys have a lot of stuff?
10
              No, not really.
11
         Α
12
              Okay. Do you know how long you lived at St.
         Q
    Andrews?
13
              Two years, I think.
14
         Α
              Where did you go when you left St. Andrews?
15
         Q
              The Lakewood Cove apartments on Center Street.
16
         Α
                                                                 The
    ones that we live at now.
17
18
              Okay.
                     In Henderson?
         Q
19
         Α
              Yes.
              And you've been there ever since you left St.
20
         Q
    Andrews?
21
22
         Α
              Yes.
23
              Now, Mahlica, did you -- well, when you moved to St.
         Q
    Andrews did you still see Fred?
24
25
              Yes.
         Α
```

```
How would you still see Fred when you moved at St.
 1
         Q
    Andrews?
 3
         Α
              He would come over.
              How often would he come over?
         Q
 5
              Every two weeks probably.
         Α
              Okay. And when he came over who would be there?
 6
         Q
 7
              Most the time it would be like all of us.
         Α
              What would he do when he came over?
 8
         Q
 9
              He would bring Taharah and Taquanda. And sometimes
         Α
    he'd talk to Mom or he'd talk to Vicky.
10
                     Did he only come with Taharah and Taquanda?
11
         Q
              Okay.
12
         Α
              Yes.
13
              He never came by himself?
         Q
              I think there was a couple of times he came by
14
         Α
    himself.
15
              Okay. When he came by himself would he talk to Mom?
16
         Q
17
              Yes.
         Α
              Would they go somewhere?
18
         Q
19
              Yes.
         Α
              Where'd they go?
20
         Q
21
         Α
              Her room.
22
              When he came by himself were there times that he
23
    would talk to Victoria?
24
              Yes.
         Α
25
              Where -- would they go somewhere?
                                   63
```

1 Α Yes. Where'd they go? 2 Q 3 Her room. Α Were there times that when he brought Taharah and Q Taquanda that he would go somewhere with Mom? 5 I don't really remember. 6 Okay. Were there times that he would come over and Q Mom would not be home? Most of the time she would be there. 9 Α No. Okay. When you moved to Center Street would you 10 Q 11 still see Fred? 12 Yes. Α How often would you see Fred? 13 Q Maybe like once a month. 14 Α 15 Did he bring Taharah and Taquanda? Q Okay. 16 Α Yes. Did Miss Ann sometimes bring Taharah and Taquanda? 17 Q 18 I think she brought them twice. Α To Center Street or to both St. Andrews and Center 19 Q 20 Street? 21 Α Oh. Just to Center Street. 22 Were there times that Fred came to Center Street Q 23 without Taharah and Taquanda? 24 Yes. Α 25 And when he would come without Taharah and Taquanda Q

what would he do? He would go talk to Vicky or talk to Mom. 2 3 Q If he would go talk to Mom where would he go talk to Mom? 5 In her room. Α If he would go talk to Vicky where would he go talk 6 Q to Vicky? 8 In her room. Α Where would you be while that would happen? 9 Q Downstairs. 10 Α Once you moved out of the Blankenship house did Fred 11 Q hurt you again? So no more belts, no more choking. 12 13 No, not that I remember. Α And once you moved out of Blankenship did you ever 14 Q 15 see or hear him hurt Shabazz again? 16 Α No. Was there an occasion at Center Street where 17 Q 18 something happened with --Objection, Your Honor. Leading. 19 MR. MacARTHUR: 20 THE COURT: Sustained. I don't really remember. 21 THE WITNESS: BY MS. LUZAICH: 22 That's fine. I'm sorry, I lost my train of thought. 23 24 You had indicated that you were going to Canyon 25 Springs high school. Did you graduate?

```
1
         Α
              No.
              When did you stop going to high school?
 2
         Q
              October 26, 2011.
 3
         Α
              What grade were you in?
 4
         Q
              Eleventh, I think. Well, that's the grade I
 5
         Α
    finished.
 6
 7
         Q
              Okay. So you did finish eleventh grade?
 8
         Α
              Yes.
 9
              Did you start twelfth grade?
         Q
10
              No.
         Α
              You didn't start it?
11
         Q
12
                   I went to the school for one day.
         Α
                     Why did you not finish, or why did you not
13
         Q
              Okay.
14
    continue twelfth grade? Can you tell me?
15
              Do you have an issue with panic attacks, Mahlica?
              MR. MacARTHUR: Objection, Your Honor.
16
17
              THE COURT:
                           Sustained.
              Mahlica, are you okay? Is that a yes?
18
              THE WITNESS:
19
                             Yes.
                           Can you answer the question?
20
              THE COURT:
21
              THE WITNESS:
                             Yes.
22
              THE COURT:
                           Okay.
23
                             I had stopped going because of my
              THE WITNESS:
    anxiety disorder.
24
25
```

BY MS. LUZAICH:

- Q Okay. Was there a time that you were diagnosed with an anxiety disorder?
 - A Yes.
 - Q And when was that?
 - A When my family and I were living in Utah.
 - Q Okay. And did you actually see a doctor for that in Utah?
 - A Yes.

5

6

7

8

21

22

23

24

- 10 Q When you came back did your mom follow up with that?
- 11 A No.
- Q And what happened -- I mean, why in twelfth grade
 did the anxiety disorder come into effect? Okay. Let me ask
 it a different way.
- When you were in ninth, tenth and eleventh grade where you okay with -- are you all right?
- 17 A Yeah.
- Q Were you okay with the anxiety disorder?
- 19 A Well --
- 20 | Q Did it get worse?
 - A I think so because -- well, during my ninth and tenth grade year I was kind of -- I kind of couldn't really -- I couldn't really take days off from school because I was kind of being made to go to school, like forced, so I couldn't really do what I did now.

- Q What do you mean?
- A Well, I don't know how -- I don't really know how to explain it. It's just -- the anxiety -- I guess the anxiety disorder got worse and I've just -- really don't like going to school and being around a whole bunch of people.
- 6 Q Okay. So what do you do?
 - A What do you mean?
 - Q Do you work?
- 9 A No.

2

3

5

7

- 10 Q Are you looking for a job?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q Are you going to get a GED?
- 13 A Probably, yes.
- Q Okay. You're living with Mom; right?
- 15 A Yes.
- Q Taharah and Taquanda -- were you aware that in December of 2011, Vicky talked to some police?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q Did you talk to them that night too?
- 20 A Yes.
- Q Where were you when you talked to them?
- A We -- well, I had -- yeah. They had taken me to their car and they talked to me in their car.
- Q Okay. Did they come to the Center Street apartment in Henderson?

1 Α Yes. When they -- were they police detectives, or at 2 Q least a man detective? 3 Yes. Α 5 When he came to the apartment who was there? Q Well, at the time it was just me and Shabazz, 6 Α because Mom was at work. 8 That was my next question. Mom was working? Q 9 Yes. Α Was Vicky still living with you at that 10 Q Okay. point? 11 She had left. 12 No. Α 13 Where was she? Do you remember or do you know? Q She's living with Miss Rose. 14 Α 15 Okay. And when the police came and talked to you, Q you said they took you to you're -- or he took you to his car; 16 right? 17 18 Yes. Α What did he ask you about? 19 Q MR. MacARTHUR: Objection, Your Honor. Hearsay. 20 21 THE COURT: I'm sorry. MR. MacARTHUR: Well, I'm anticipating a hearsay. 22 23 It's an objection. She asked her what did the detective ask 24 you about. And I realize it's a question, but there's the 25 potential that she gives a longer answer. So I'm making --

```
perhaps I was premature, Judge. I apologize.
              THE COURT: All right. So the objection's
 2
 3
    overruled. You can proceed.
    BY MS. LUZAICH:
              What did the detective --
 5
         Q
                          Do you remember the question?
              THE COURT:
 6
                            Well they -- they asked me kind of
 7
              THE WITNESS:
    like the same questions you're asking me now.
 8
    BY MS. LUZAICH:
              Did they ask you about Fred?
10
         Q
11
         Α
              Yes.
12
              Okay. Did they ask you about living at the
         Q
    Blankenship house?
13
14
         Α
              Yes.
              When you talked to the detective did you tell him
15
         Q
    the truth about everything?
16
17
         Α
              Yes.
              About everything?
18
         Q
19
         Α
              Yes.
              Did Shabazz also talk to the Henderson police that
20
         Q
    night?
21
22
              Yes, I think so.
                     Did you become aware that Mom eventually
23
         Q
24
    talked to the Henderson police, as well?
25
         Α
              Yes.
```

Do you know whether or not child protective services 1 Q came, not to Blankenship, to you guys? Only if you know. 2 What do you mean, for Taharah and Taquanda? 3 Α In December 2011 or January of 2012. Q I don't really know when they came. 5 Α No. Did Vicky come back to where you were living 6 Q Okay. after that, like later after that? 8 Yes. Α And then did you see Taharah and Taquanda after Q that, as well? 10 11 Α Yes. 12 Did they stay with you guys that summer for a little Q bit, the summer coming up, the summer of 2012? 13 14 They didn't stay with us. Α No. Did they visit with you guys for a while? 15 Q 16 Α Yes. That's at the Henderson apartment? 17 Q 18 Yes. Α And did you become aware that the police became 19 Q involved again after -- later after that? 20 21 Α Yes. 22 Did you talk to the police again? Different police, Q 23 sorry. 24 Yes. Α

And if I'm confusing you, tell me.

25

Okay.

Q

I can ask

questions better. 1 Were there two different times that you talked to 2 3 police about Fred? 4 Yes. Α 5 You look confused. Q Well, what do you mean? Is this after they got --6 Α Maybe this is a good time to take a 7 THE COURT: 8 break. 9 MS. LUZAICH: Sure. Okay. During this recess you're 10 THE COURT: admonished not to talk or converse amongst yourselves or with 11 anyone else on any subject connected with this trial, or read, 12 watch, or listen to any report or commentary on the trial or 13 any person connected with this trial by any medium of 14 15 information, including, without limitation, newspapers, television, the Internet or radio, form or express any opinion 16 on any subject connected with this trial until the case is 17 18 finally submitted to you. We'll start again at 1:45. 19 Thank you. (Court recessed at 12:11 p.m., until 1:59 p.m.) 20 21 (Jury is present) 22 THE COURT: Do you the parties stipulate to the 23 presence of the jury panel? 24 MS. LUZAICH: Yes. 25 MS. ALLEN: Yes, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Okay. You can recall your witness and continue with your examination.

The record will reflect the witness is back in the courtroom. If you'll have a seat. And Ms. Luzaich is still going to continue to question you.

BY MS. LUZAICH:

1

2

3

5

7

9

10

- Q How are you doing Mahlica?
- 8 A Good.
 - Q Okay. Have you understood everything that I've asked you?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q Okay. Just wanted to make sure.
- When you had mentioned that you had anxiety disorder
 how will it come on you? Like can somebody know if you're
 having a problem?
 - A I don't know. I've never asked anyone that before.
- Q Okay. Let me ask it in a better way. How do you let me let when you have a problem?
- 19 A Nervous.
- Q Does anything happen to you that somebody else can see?
- 22 A I don't know.
- Q Okay. When you talked to the police in December 24 2011 --
- That was the Henderson Police Department, right,

```
that came to your apartment?
 1
 2
         Α
              Yes.
 3
              -- were you nervous when you talked to them?
         Q
 4
         Α
              Yes.
              When you talked to the police in September of -- or
 5
         Q
    October of 2012, that was child protective services and Metro;
 6
    is that right?
 8
         Α
              Yes.
 9
              Were you nervous when you talked to them, too?
         Q
10
         Α
              Yes.
              Are you nervous here?
11
         Q
12
              Kind of.
         Α
13
              Are you doing the best you can?
         Q
14
         Α
              Yes.
                             Thank you. I would pass the witness.
15
              MS. LUZAICH:
              THE COURT:
16
                           Cross.
17
                           CROSS-EXAMINATION
18
    BY MR. MacARTHUR:
              Good afternoon, Mahlica.
19
         Q
              Good afternoon.
20
         Α
              My name's Jonathan MacArthur. I'm an attorney, and
21
         Q
22
    I will be questioning you this afternoon.
23
              You all right?
24
              Yes.
         Α
25
                     Now, we've never met before have we?
              Okay.
         Q
```

1 Α No. What's your date of birth? What day were you 2 Q Okay. born? 3 September 11th, 1993. 4 Α Okay. And so you are 20 years old now? 5 Q Yes. 6 Α 7 And you turned 18 on September 11th, 2011? Q Yes, I believe so. 8 Α 9 Q Okay. Do sometimes people think you are younger than you are based on the way you look? Do sometimes people 10 think you're younger? 11 12 Α Yes. Okay. When they don't think you're 20 how old do 13 Q they think how you are -- that you are? 14 I usually get 16 or 15. 15 Α That's actually a pretty good thing. By the time 16 Q you get to be 40 you'll be happy that that's the case. 17 18 MS. LUZAICH: Objection. 19 Sustained. THE COURT: 20 BY MR. MacARTHUR: You've testified that you have brothers 21 All right. Q 22 and sisters; right? 23 Α Yes. And you have one brother; is that correct? 24 Q 25 Α Yes.

- 1 Q Is his name Shabazz?
 2 A Yes.
 - Q Where does Shabazz live?
 - A With some friends.
 - Q Okay. Well, what I meant is geographically. What city does he live in?
 - A Oh. Henderson.
 - Q Okay. So he lives here in the Las Vegas valley?
- 9 A Yes.

4

5

6

7

- 10 Q Okay. When did you see him last?
- 11 A Like two weeks ago, I believe.
- Q Okay. Do you remember coming to this building to testify at a preliminary hearing in June of last year?
- 14 A Yes.
- Q Okay. Do you know if Shabazz came to court also to testify? If you know.
- A Actually, I don't remember if he went or not.
- Q Okay. Earlier today before we went to lunch you remember the State was asking you questions until just a few minutes ago?
- 21 A Yes.
- Q Okay. Do you remember when the -- when Miss Lisa asked you about a time in which Fred put his hands on your throat?
- 25 A Yes.

- Okay. But you didn't remember that until the State Q reminded you; is that correct?
 - What do you mean? Α
- Okay. Is that something that you told us on your own, or is that something that you remembered after Lisa brought it up?
- I remembered it on my own. I just didn't want to talk about it.
- Okay. Now, you've had an opportunity to Q I see. give several statements that were recorded; is that correct?
- 11 Α Yes.

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

13

14

15

17

22

23

- Do you remember one of them being March 17th, 0 Okay. 2008, a statement you gave to CPS? Do you know if you did -may have given a statement to CPS back in 2008?
 - I don't remember if I did. Α
- Okay. Do you remember if you wrote a letter to CPS 16 Q in March 25th, 2010, while you were living at Blankenship?
- 18 I don't remember that, either. Α No.
- Okay. You do, however, remember giving a voluntary 19 Q statement to the Henderson police in December of 2011; right? 20
- 21 Α Yes.
 - And you do remember giving a voluntary statement to the Las Vegas Metropolitan Police Department in October 3rd, 2012? Do you remember that?
- 25 Α Yes.

Q Okay. I'm going to go chronologically so that we're not confused about what we're talking about. I'd like you to go back to 2005 when you first came here from Louisiana. Do you remember that?

A Yes.

Q Okay. Today, I believe earlier you testified that Victoria had told you back in 2005 that she was being molested by Fred. Do you remember saying that today?

A Yes.

Q Okay. All right. Now, I want you to think about your time at Blankenship from August of 2007 until you moved out of Blankenship. You were living there with Fred; is that correct?

A Yes.

Q And also you had Shabazz, Taquanda, and Taharah living there also; right?

A Yes.

Q And Lealer or Miss Ann was living there?

A Yes.

Q And you said for a period of time Sha'karia, Miss Ann's daughter, lived there?

A Yes.

Q Okay. And you said something about Fred had his son living there for a little while, too; is that correct?

A It was like his son -- his sons and their

girlfriends and their kids, I guess.

Q Okay. Is it fair to say this house was pretty full sometimes?

A Yes.

Q Okay. In fact, was there also a garage that had been converted into a bedroom?

A Yes.

Q Okay. And so when yourself and other people testify about having lived in the garage, is this a converted garage?

A Yes.

Q Okay. You had talked about some of the things that Fred would do when you guys got into trouble. Do you remember that topic?

A Yes.

Q Okay. Isn't it in fact true that if somebody were to be found breaking the rules that first they might have to do pushups or situps?

A Yes.

Q Okay. And is it also the case that if somebody broke the rules that they could be grounded or have something taken away from them?

A Yes.

Q Okay. And if you would, please tell the jury which one of those two things happens first. Does something get taken away and the person gets grounded first, or would the

pushups or situps happen first?

- A The pushups would happen first.
- Q Okay. And so if a person got into trouble again after pushups, then they might get grounded or have something taken away?
 - A Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

13

14

19

20

21

22

- Q Okay. And then if a person had already been grounded and had something taken away and they did something wrong again, is this where you might get a whuppin?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q And was this usually done with a belt?
- 12 A Yes.
 - Q And you said that in the times you were whupped you believe that you'd been hit on your backside?
- 15 A Yes.
- Q And you said that on one instance you believe that you had welts on your back?
- 18 A Yes.
 - Q Okay. Now, the State asked you did most of the time -- well, I'm going to rephrase, so I hope I don't get objected. But do you remember the State asking you a question about were you getting whuppins for a reason or no reason?
 - A What do you mean?
- Q Okay. Well, I guess my question is did something
 happen and then you would get a whuppin, or did sometimes you

just get a whuppin for no reason whatsoever. 2 Usually something happened. Okay. Now, you didn't always feel like the 3 Q something that happened was your fault. Is that fair? 5 Yes. Α But apparently Fred disagreed? 6 Q Okay. 7 Α Yes. Okay. Now, when you were living on Blankenship --8 Q and let's focus on 2008 -- Lealer lived there, as well? 10 Α Yes. And did you have name for Lealer? 11 Q We called her Ann. 12 Α Did you also sometimes call her Miss Ann? 13 Q 14 Yes. Α Did you call her Aunt Ann? 15 Q 16 Α No. 17 And how about Fred? Did you have a special Q Okay. name for him? 18 19 No. Α Did you ever tell people he was your dad? 20 Q 21 Α No. 22 Did he ever pretend like he was your dad? Q 23 What do you mean? Α 24 Did he ask you guys to call him dad? Q 25 Α No.

- Q Okay. And at the time in which you were living in Blankenship did you testify that your mother was living somewhere else with Victoria; is that correct?
 - A Yes, at first.
 - Q Do you know if that was an apartment on Walnut?
- A At first it was -- it wasn't -- it wasn't the apartment on Walnut, it was the Siegel Suites Motel.
- Q Okay. And so there was a period where they were in a hotel; right?
- 10 A Yes.

5

6

8

14

15

- 11 Q And there was a period where they lived with Miss 12 Dorothy briefly?
- 13 A Yes. I think she told me about that.
 - Q Okay. And is it fair to say they spent most of the time, if they weren't at Blankenship, living at the Walnut apartment?
- 17 A Yes.
- Q Okay. And do you remember that your mother was coming to visit at least once a week?
- 20 A She didn't come to where we were at, we came to 21 where she was at.
- Q Okay. So you would go over to the Walnut apartment more often than she came to Blankenship?
- 24 A Yes.
- 25 Q Okay. And how did you get to the Walnut apartment?

- Fred would drive us. Α
- Did Lealer ever drive you? Q
 - No, I don't think she did. Α
- Okay. Now, I know this might be difficult and I'm Q just asking you to do the best you can. I want you to think about May -- I'm sorry -- March of 2008 and before; okay? I'm not talking about anything after March of 2008, just things that may have happened before. Are you with me?
- Α Yes.

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

11

15

16

17

- Isn't it in fact true that at that time you 10 Q Okay. had only been spanked once by Fred? Do you know if that's 12 true?
- It was -- I believe it was like more often than 13 Α 14 that.
 - Do you remember an instance in which you were Q Okay. accused of lying about your grades and that resulted in getting a whuppin? Does that ring a bell?
 - No, it doesn't. Α
- Okay. Court's indulgence. 19 MR. MacARTHUR:
- (Pause in the proceedings) 20
- 21 BY MR. MacARTHUR:
- 22 Mahlica, do you remember a time in 2008 when 23 CPS or Child Protective Services came to talk to you in March 24 Do you remember that at all? of 2008?
- 25 I don't really remember that.

Okay. Do you think it might refresh your 1 Q recollection if I were to let you see a report from CPS where 2 they claim to have talked to you? THE COURT: Was it prepared by her? 4 5 MR. MacARTHUR: It was not prepared by her. just seeing if it refreshes her recollection as to what she 6 may have said. Okay. Will that report help refresh 8 THE COURT: your recollection? THE WITNESS: Yes. 10 (Pause in the proceedings) 11 Does she have to read the entire 12 THE COURT: document? 13 14 No, Your Honor. Just the top MR. MacARTHUR: 15 portion. THE COURT: Okay. And you showed her which part to 16 17 read? 18 MR. MacARTHUR: I did. 19 THE COURT: Okay. 20 BY MR. MacARTHUR: Mahlica, having read that, did that help 21 All right. 22 refresh your recollection at all as to whether you had this 23 conversation with somebody from CPS? 24 Yes. Α 25 And so do you now remember telling them that Q Okay.

at least in March of 2008 that you had only been spanked one 1 time after an incident about lying regarding grades? Do you remember that? I don't. Α 5 Okay. And that's fair. I'm not asking you what's Q in the document, I'm just asking you if having read the 6 document helps you remember. 8 Do you remember telling them that you had --THE COURT: You know what, Mr. -- your notes are 9 being shown. At least I can see them. 10 MR. MacARTHUR: Oh. Okay. Fortunately, nobody else 11 12 is on. THE COURT: My screen is on. 13 No. Yours is the only one. 14 MS. ALLEN: 15 Okay. I panicked for a minute. THE COURT: Oh. Because I could see your notes. I'm sorry. 16 17 MR. MacARTHUR: Good thing I didn't draw my usual 18 little drawings of the Judge. THE COURT: I knew you wouldn't want everyone to see 19 your notes. 20 Take the paper back from Mahlica. 21 MS. LUZAICH: 22 MR. MacARTHUR: Okay. 23 So sorry about that. THE COURT: 24 BY MR. MacARTHUR: 25 Do you remember telling CPS that you had All right.

no fear of living at the Blankenship address?

- A No, I don't remember.
- Q Well, rather going through line by line, were there things inside this document that you did remember when you read them?
 - A No, not really.
- Q Okay. Well, let me ask you this. In 2008, at least in March, were you doing school -- doing well in school?
- A Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

- 10 Q Okay. And did you tell -- did you like English as a 11 subject?
- 12 A Yeah.
- Q And back in 2008 were Lealer and Fred taking you to
 Circus Circus Casino and the amusement park that was there for
 fun? Do you remember going to Circus Circus?
 - A Yeah. I believe that was only one time, though.
- 17 Q Do you remember whether or not you were ever spanked 18 for lying about your grades?
- 19 A No, I don't remember.
- Q Okay. Do you remember whether or not Fred was fair with you and your siblings? Or was that your opinion back then?
- 23 A I don't really remember.
- Q Okay. Did Fred pay you for chores you guys did around the house, like cleaning up?

That was only if we asked. 1 Α Only if you asked. So sometimes you'd ask, 2 Q Okay. 3 hey, can we get an allowance for doing chores? Yes. 4 Α 5 Q And sometimes he actually gave you money because you asked? 6 7 Α Yes. Were you afraid to live with Lealer and Fred 8 Q Okay. back in 2008? 10 Yes. Α Do you think you told that to CPS? 11 Q Okay. 12 No. Α 13 Okay. So you don't think you told them that? Q 14 No. Α Okay. You said that Fred, and almost never Lealer, 15 Q was taking you and your siblings over to the Walnut apartment. 16 You remember just saying that a few minutes ago? 17 18 Α Yes. And when he took you to that apartment did he drop 19 Q you off, or did he stay with you guys for the entire visit? 20 He would just drop us off. 21 Α 22 And so he would leave and go back to 23 Blankenship? 24 Yes. Α 25 And so there were times in which you were able to Q 87

spend alone time say with your mom or Victoria?

A Yes.

Q Okay. All right. Do you remember a time in 2010 while you were still at the Blankenship house where your mother and Victoria moved out?

A What do you mean?

Q Okay. Before August of 2010 at the Blankenship house is it true that it was your mom and Victoria and you and Shabazz, Taquanda and Taharah, you guys all lived at the Blankenship house before August of 2010?

A Yes.

Q Okay. Do you remember a time in 2010 where your mother and Victoria moved out, but you and Shabazz, Taquanda and Taharah stayed at Blankenship?

A I don't understand the question.

Q Okay. You said your mother and Victoria lived at the Walnut apartments for a while; right?

A Yes.

Q Okay. Did there come a time in which they left the Walnut apartments and they moved in together with you guys at Blankenship?

A Yes.

Q Okay. And so you guys all lived together at Blankenship for a while. Do you remember that your mother moved out to an apartment called St. Andrews?

1 Α Yes. And when she moved to St. Andrews did she go 2 Okay. with just Victoria, or did she take you guys -- take somebody with us -- with her? 5 Well, it wasn't just Victoria. It was me and my Α younger brother, Shabazz. 6 7 Okay. So the four of you left together? Q 8 Yes. Α Tina, Victoria, you and Shabazz. 9 Q Okay. Now, was there a time before August of 2010 where 10 your mother wanted to move out and take you, but you didn't 11 12 want to go? Do you remember that? No, I don't. 13 Α Do you remember whether or not you wrote a 14 Q Okay. 15 letter to CPS? No, I don't remember. 16 Α Court's indulgence. 17 Q Do you think it would refresh your recollection if 18 you were able to see the letter you wrote? 19 20 Α Sure. Okay. And this is going to be 21 MR. MacARTHUR: Defense Proposed A, Your Honor. 22 23 THE COURT: Thank you. 24 BY MR. MacARTHUR: 25 And, Mahlica, if you would tell the jury, do you

```
recognize that letter?
 1
 2
         Α
              Yes.
 3
         Q
              And whose handwriting is it in?
              It's my own.
 4
         Α
 5
              Okay. And is that your signature at the bottom?
         Q
 6
         Α
              Yes.
 7
              And what date did you put for when it was drafted?
         Q
              3/25/10.
 8
         Α
              Okay. What I want you to do is take a look at it
 9
         Q
    and read what you wrote. And let me know when you've had a
10
    chance to see it.
11
12
              MS. LUZAICH:
                             Can I approach?
13
              THE COURT:
                           Of course.
14
    BY MR. MacARTHUR:
15
              Have you had a chance to look at it, Mahlica?
         Q
16
         Α
              Oh.
                   Yeah.
17
              Remember to speak in the microphone.
         Q
18
              THE COURT:
                          Have you had a chance to look at the
19
    letter?
20
                             Yeah, I had.
              THE WITNESS:
21
              THE COURT:
                           Okay.
22
    BY MR. MacARTHUR:
              And do you remember writing it now?
23
24
         Α
              Yes.
25
                               Okay.
                                      Permission to publish, Judge?
              MR. MacARTHUR:
```

THE COURT: Yeah. Any objection to Defense 1 Exhibit A being admitted into evidence? 2 MS. LUZAICH: 3 No. THE COURT: It's admitted. And you may now publish. 4 5 MR. MacARTHUR: Thank you, Judge. I'm sorry. I forgot to move for admission. 6 7 That's okay. That's okay. THE COURT: (Defendant's Exhibit A admitted) 8 9 BY MR. MacARTHUR: All right. Mahlica, if you would, tell the jury 10 0 what was going on when you wrote this letter. Why did you 11 write it? If you remember. 12 13 Do you remember what was going on at the time? No, not really. 14 Α 15 Okay. So you're not sure why you wrote the letter. Q Well, I remember, but I just don't remember the 16 Α situation. I don't remember everything that happened. 17 18 I understand. Tell the jury where you were going to Q school in March of 2010. 19 Canyon Springs. 20 Α 21 Canyon Springs High School? Q 22 Α Yes. 23 And what grade were you in? Q 24 Tenth. Α Okay. And you were 16 years old; is 25 Tenth grade. Q

```
that correct?
 1
 2
              Yes.
         Α
                     Later that year you were going to turn 17?
 3
         Q
 4
         Α
              Yes.
                     Mahlica, do you remember John Robinson, the
 5
         Q
    defendant's brother, Fred's brother?
 6
 7
              Yes.
         Α
              Okay. And how do you know him?
 8
         Q
              Actually, I think he was one of the people that
 9
         Α
    picked us up.
10
              From Louisiana?
11
         Q
12
              Yes.
         Α
              And drove you out?
13
         Q
14
         Α
              Yes.
              Okay. Did he also come to Fred's house on
15
         Q
    Blankenship regularly?
16
                    Sometimes.
17
              Yes.
         Α
18
              Okay. Do you remember whether or not he ever gave
         Q
    you guys money when you got good grades?
19
              No, I don't remember that.
20
         Α
                     Now we're going to move forward a little bit.
21
         Q
              Okay.
22
    You said that in August of 2010, your mother, Victoria, you,
23
    and Shabazz all moved to an apartment on St. Andrews?
24
              Yes.
         Α
25
                     Is that in North Las Vegas?
         Q
              Okay.
```

1 Α Yes. And you said that you remembered giving a 2 Okay. Q 3 statement to the Henderson Police Department on December 17th, 2011. Do you remember saying that? 5 Α Yes. And on December 17th, 2011, were you 18 years 6 Q Okay. 7 old? 8 Yes. Α Okay. And you had been living with your mother 9 Q and/or -- well, let me back up. When you first moved to St. 10 Andrews it was you, your mother, Victoria and Shabazz; right? 11 12 Α Yes. Okay. And when did Victoria move out? If you know. 13 Q I believe it was sometime during November maybe. 14 Α 15 I'm not really sure. Of what year 2010, or 2011? 16 Q 2011. 17 Α Okay. So she lived with you guys for about a year 18 Q after you went to St. Andrews before she moved out? 19 At the St. Andrews? Don't you mean the Lakewood 20 Α 21 Cove apartments. 22 I'm not quite sure. Is this the one in North Las Q 23 Vegas?

Because you said 2011. In 2011 that's where we

24

25

Α

were living.

No.

Okay. I don't mean to tell you where you were Q 1 living. You tell me where you were living. 2 3 Okay. Α You didn't move back into the Blankenship house; 4 0 5 right? 6 Α No. 7 Q I mean, you never moved back there with Fred? 8 No. Α Okay. And we know that you moved out of Blankenship 9 Q in August of 2010; right? 10 Yes. 11 Α So by the time you talked to the Henderson 12 Q Okay. Police Department in December of 2011 you'd been living with 13 your mother and Victoria for 14 months. Is that true? 14 15 Α Yes. Okay. And just now -- well, I don't mean just now, 16 Q but right before lunch the State had asked you if you 17 18 remembered giving that statement to the police; right? 19 Α Yes. And the State asked you if you told them the truth 20 Q about everything. Do you remember that? 21 22 Yes. Α 23 Q And you assured us that you did, that everything you 24 said to them was true; right? 25

Α

Yes.

- Q Okay. Now, when the police came to speak with you in December of 2011 they wanted to talk about some things that had happened to Victoria; right?
 - A Yes.

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

14

15

16

18

19

20

- Q Okay. Do you remember telling the police that you had no idea why they would want to talk to you about Fred and Victoria? Well, first let me ask you, do you know if you said that to them or not.
 - A I don't really member.
- Q Understood. Would it refresh your recollection if I were to provide you with a transcript of your conversation with the Henderson Police Department?
- 13 A Yeah.
 - MR. MacARTHUR: Okay. And, State, I'm going to be approaching with the voluntary statement from December 17th, 2011. Right now we're going to be on page 3.
- 17 BY MR. MacARTHUR:
 - Q All right. Why don't you take a second and look at what's transcribed there and let me know if it seems familiar. Do you recognize it as a conversation you had with the Henderson Police Department? I need you to answer out loud.
- 22 A Yes.
- Q Okay. And looking at page 3, does that refresh your recollection as to what the police were asking you?
- 25 A Yes.

Q Okay. And do you remember now telling them that you had no idea why they would want to talk to you about Victoria?

A Yes. But I only said that because I was confused. They had came at a really late time at night.

Q I understand. If you would, please turn to page 4.

Okay. Do you remember telling the police as far as you knew

Victoria and Fred had slept together?

A Yes.

Q Okay. And you didn't say that Fred had sexually assaulted her; right?

Let me put it another way. Did you tell the police that Fred had raped her. or did you say they had slept together?

Mahlica, if you don't recall, feel free to consult the page.

A Yes.

Q Okay. In fact did you also tell the Henderson Police Department that Victoria had told you about that two weeks prior, two weeks before December 17th, 2011?

A What do you mean?

Q Okay. The police are asking you about Victoria and Fred; right?

A Yes.

Q Okay. And you've informed them that Victoria and Fred had slept together; right?

1 A Yes. 2 Q Okay

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

12

13

14

15

16

20

21

22

23

24

- Q Okay. Didn't you also tell them that she had told you about this two weeks beforehand?
 - A You mean just --
- Q Yeah. Would it refresh your recollection to be able to look at your statement on page 4?

THE COURT: Is that a yes?

THE WITNESS: I'm still looking.

BY MR. MacARTHUR:

- Q Do you see that?
- 11 A Yes.
 - Q Okay. And so I want you to tell me if I'm reading this correctly. The detective asks you, okay -- well, let me back up a sentence. Your previous answer is, "Umm, well, she tells me that her and her friend have slept together before and that's pretty much it." That's what you said; right?
- 17 A Uh-huh.
- 18 Q I need you to answer out loud.
- 19 A Yes.
 - Q Okay. And then he asks you, "Okay. And when -when did she tell you that?" And your response is, "Umm, it's
 hard for me to remember, because it don't really pay attention
 to the dates, but I think a couple of weeks ago." Is that
 what you said?
- 25 A Yes.

- Q Okay. Do you remember telling the police that Fred had spanked you but he had never done anything else to you?
 - A Yes.

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

14

- Q Okay. Mahlica, back in 2011 do you know whether or not your mother received food stamp benefits?
 - A I think she did.
- Q Okay. Are you aware of any times in which Fred took money from her or the food stamps away from her?
- A I don't remember if it was food stamps, but he did get money from her.
- Q Okay. Was that for your two younger sisters that lived at -- still lived at Blankenship?
- 13 A Yes.
 - Q Do you remember telling the Henderson Police Department that Fred was nice to you?
- 16 A Yes.
- Q Okay. Do you remember telling them that he had never touched you inappropriately?
- 19 A Yes.
- 20 Q Do you remember telling them that he had never acted 21 perverted toward you?
- 22 A Yes.
- Q Do you remember telling them that nothing had happened at the Blankenship address that caused you and Shabazz to move out? If you remember.

- A Can you say that again?
- Q Sure. Do you remember if the police asked you questions about why your mom and Victoria, you, and Shabazz had moved out of Blankenship?
 - A Yes.

2

3

5

6

- Q Okay. Do you remember telling them that nothing had happened at Blankenship that caused the four of you to move out?
- 9 A Oh. Yes.
- Q Okay. Your mother had gotten enough money to where she could get her own place; right?
- 12 A Yes.
- Q Okay. It wasn't like you were trying to escape something.
- MS. LUZAICH: Well, objection. She can't testify to what her mother thought.
- 17 THE COURT: Sustained.
- MR. MacARTHUR: I'm only asking about her
- 19 impressions, Your Honor.
- THE COURT: Okay. You can testify about your
- 21 | knowledge, not about your mom's.
- THE WITNESS: No, not at the time.
- 23 BY MR. MacARTHUR:
- Q Okay. And in fact you told the police that nothing
- 25 | had happened at Blankenship that caused you and Shabazz to

move out? 2 Α No. 3 Q Now, the police were asking you about a specific time in which Frank -- I mean, sorry, not Frank --5 Fred had come to St. Andrews and seen Victoria; is that 6 correct? 7 Α Yes. Okav. Do you remember telling them that you didn't 8 Q see or hear anything going on, because you were asleep? 10 Α Yes. Isn't it in fact true that you don't know 11 Q 12 anything about whatever has happened with Fred or Victoria other than what Victoria has told you? 13 14 Yes. Α Did you in fact tell the police that you had never 15 Q seen Fred and Victoria doing anything weird together? 16 17 Α Yes. In fact, didn't you tell them that Fred, in your 18 Q experience, acts nice toward Victoria? 19 20 Α Yes. Did you also tell them with regard to the 21 Q 22 allegations being made by Victoria against Fred that you 23 believed Victoria because she was your sister? 24 Yes. Α 25 And everything in that statement that you Q Okay.

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEVADA 1 2 FREDERICK HARRIS, S.C. CASE NO. 69093 3 **Electronically Filed** Appellant, 4 Jun 17 2016 08:46 a.m. Tracie K. Lindeman VS. 5 Clerk of Supreme Court THE STATE OF NEVADA, 6 Respondent. 7 8 APPEAL FROM JUDGMENT OF CONVICTION 9 (JURY TRIAL) EIGHTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT THE HONORABLE JUDGE MICHELLE LEAVITT, PRESIDING 10 11 12 APPELLANT'S APPENDIX TO THE OPENING BRIEF **VOLUME XV** 13 14 15 ATTORNEY FOR APPELLANT ATTORNEY FOR RESPONDENT CHRISTOPHER R. ORAM, ESQ. STEVE WOLFSON Attorney at Law **District Attorney** 16 Nevada Bar No. 001565 Nevada Bar No. 004349 520 S. Fourth Street, 2nd Floor 200 Lewis Avenue 17 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 Las Vegas, Nevada 89101 Telephone: (702) 384-5563 18 ADAM PAUL LAXALT 19 Nevada Attorney General Nevada Bar No. 0003926 20 100 North Carson Street Carson City, Nevada 89701-4717 21 22 23 24 25 26 27

CHRISTOPHER R. ORAM, LTD. 520 SOUTH 4 TH STREET! SECOND FLOOR LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89101 Tel. 702.384-5563 Fax. 702.974-0623	1	8	RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT RE: EVIDENTIARY HEARING DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR A NEW TRIAL FEBRUARY 17, 2015	
	2		(FILED 12/30/2015)	995-998
	3	8	RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT RE: EVIDENTIARY HEARING DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR A NEW TRIAL JANUARY 5, 2015	
	5		(FILED 12/30/2015)	999-1012
	6	9	RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS JURY TRIAL DAY 1 (FILED 12/30/2015)	1013-1197
	7 8	10	RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS JURY TRIAL DAY 2 MARCH 26, 2014	
	9		(FILED 12/30/2015)	1198-1445
	10 11	11	RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS JURY TRIAL DAY 3 MARCH 27, 2014 (FILED 12/30/2015)	1446-1621
	12	12	RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS JURY TRIAL DAY 4 MARCH 31, 2014 (FILED 12/30/2015)	1622-1768
	13 14	13	RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS JURY TRIAL DAY 5 APRIL 1, 2014 (FILED 12/30/2015)	1769-1936
	15	1.4		1709-1930
	16 17	14	RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS JURY TRIAL DAY 6 APRIL 2, 2014 (FILED 12/30/2015)	1937-2138
	18	15	RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS JURY TRIAL DAY 7 APRIL 3, 2014 (FILED 12/30/2015)	2139-2321
	19	16	RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS	
	2021		JURY TRIAL DAY 8 APRIL 4, 2014 (FILED 12/30/2015)	2322-2575
	22	17	RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS JURY TRIAL DAY 9 APRIL 7, 2014 (FILED 12/30/2015)	2576-2766
	23	18	RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS	
	2425		JURY TRIAL DAY 10 APRIL 9, 2014 (FILED 12/30/2015)	2767-2943
	26	19	RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS JURY TRIAL DAY 11 APRIL 10, 2014 (FILED 12/30/2015)	2944-3123
	27	20	(FILED 12/30/2015) PECOPDED'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS	49 44 -3143
	28	20	RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS JURY TRIAL DAY 12 APRIL 11, 2014 (FILED 12/30/2015)	3124-3255

21 RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS 1 JURY TRIAL DAY 12 APRIL 15, 2014 (FILED 12/30/2015) 3266-3268 2 RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT RE: EVIDENTIARY 22 3 HEARING DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR NEW TRIAL (12/30/2015)3269-3289 4 23 RECORDER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS RE: 5 EVIDENTIARY HEARING DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR NEW TRIAL 6 (12/30/2015)3290-3349 7 REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF BINDOVER (FILED 08/08/2013) 787-815 8 REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF EXCERPT OF PROCEEDINGS 22-31 9 REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PRELIMINARY HEARING 32-79 10 REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PRELIMINARY HEARING 11 JUNE 20, 2013 80-93 520 SOUTH 4TH STREET | SECOND FLOOR 702.384-5563 | FAX. 702.974-0623 12 REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PRELIMINARY HEARING APRIL 29, 2013 CHRISTOPHER R. ORAM, LTD. 108-366 13 REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PRELIMINARY HEARING 14 MAY 7, 2013 367-542 15 REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PRELIMINARY HEARING JUNE 13, 2013 16 (FILED 07/31/2013) 543-653 TEL. 17 REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PRELIMINARY HEARING 6 JUNE 11, 2013 18 (FILED 07/31/2013) 654-786 19 SECOND AMENDED CRIMINAL COMPLAINT (FILED 07/19/2013) 94-107 20 STATE'S OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR 21 A NEW TRIAL (FILED 06/13/2014) 954-967 22 VERDICT 23 (FILED 04/15/2014) 936-946 24 25 26 27 28

CHRISTOPHER R. ORAM, LTD. 520 SOUTH 4TH STREET! SECOND FLOOR LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 89101 TEL. 702.384-5563 | FAx. 702.974-0623

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify and affirm that this document was filed electronically with the Nevada Supreme Court 17th day of June, 2016. Electronic Service of the foregoing document shall be made in accordance with the Master Service List as follows:

5 ADAM PAUL LAXALT Nevada Attorney General 6 STEVE OWENS 7 Chief Deputy District Attorney

CHRISTOPHER R. ORAM, ESQ.

BY:

/s/ Jessie Folkestad
An Employee of Christopher R. Oram, Esq.